Data Supplement

Supplementary Tables

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Age-range** | 1 month to 89 years |
| **Male / female** | 43.0% / 57.0% |
| **Body-system/specialism classification** | |
| Haematology | 1.5% |
| Cardiovascular | 7.0% |
| Central Nervous System - non injury | 6.0% |
| Dental | 2.0% |
| Endocrine | 3.5% |
| Ear, Nose, Throat (ENT) | 3.5% |
| Female reproductive system | 7.5% |
| Gastrointestinal | 15.0% |
| Immune system | 2.0% |
| Infection | 3.5% |
| Lower respiratory | 8.0% |
| Male reproductive system | 2.5% |
| Mental health | 5.0% |
| Musculoskeletal - injury | 3.5% |
| Musculoskeletal - non-injury | 7.5% |
| Oncology | 0.5% |
| Ophthalmology | 3.5% |
| Skin | 8.0% |
| Upper respiratory | 5.0% |
| Urinary tract | 4.5% |

**Supplementary Table 1**

Summary of the 200 clinical vignettes: age range, sex and condition type. See also **Supplementary Table 2** for a more detailed description of each vignette and **Supplementary Table 3** for the structure of example vignettes.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **#** | **Included in main analysis** | **Sex M/F** | **Age** | **System/specialism** | **Primary complaint** | **Advice level** | **Main-diagnosis** |
| 1 | YES | F | 30 years | Female reproductive system | Abdominal pain | 1 | ectopic pregnancy |
| 2 | NO | F | 6 years | Lower Respiratory | Shortness of breath | 2 | chest infection |
| 3 | YES | F | 9 months | Lower Respiratory | Shortness of breath | 1 | bronchiolitis |
| 4 | YES | M | 66 years | Cardiovascular | Chest pain | 1 | unstable angina |
| 5 | YES | M | 35 years | MSK - Injury | Back pain | 4 | contusion lumbar spine |
| 6 | YES | M | 23 years | Mental Health | Low mood | 3 | depression |
| 7 | YES | M | 26 years | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting | 3 | viral gastroenteritis |
| 8 | YES | F | 40 years | CNS - Non injury | Headache | 1 | brain haemorrhage |
| 9 | YES | M | 40 years | Skin | Swollen foot | 4 | cellulitis of foot |
| 10 | YES | F | 28 years | Dental | Toothache | 6 | dental abscess |
| 11 | YES | M | 1 years | Upper respiratory | Lumps in neck | 4 | tonsillitis |
| 12 | NO | F | 26 years | Dental | Pain in face | 4 | dental abscess |
| 13 | YES | F | 6 years | Gastrointestinal | Itchy bottom | 6 | pinworm infection |
| 14 | YES | F | 5 months | Gastrointestinal | Crying baby | 5 | cow's milk protein intolerance |
| 15 | YES | F | 33 years | MSK - Injury | Abdominal pain | 4 | musculoskeletal back pain |
| 16 | YES | F | 20 years | Immune system | Dizziness | 1 | allergic reaction |
| 17 | YES | M | 14 years | Upper respiratory | Sore throat | 6 | sinusitis |
| 18 | YES | M | 3 months | Upper respiratory | Crying baby | 4 | common cold |
| 19 | NO | F | 27 years | Female reproductive system | Vaginal bleeding | 2 | early onset of labour |
| 20 | YES | F | 86 years | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting brown liquid | 1 | perforated gastric ulcer |
| 21 | YES | M | 57 years | Gastrointestinal | Diarrhoea | 6 | gastroenteritis |
| 22 | YES | F | 29 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 2 | appendicitis |
| 23 | YES | M | 2 years | CNS - Non injury | Fever | 1 | bacterial meningitis |
| 24 | NO | M | 59 years | ENT | Earache | 4 | otitis externa |
| 25 | NO | F | 1 years | Infection - General | Rash | 6 | varicella zoster |
| 26 | NO | M | 10 years | Upper respiratory | Cough | 6 | upper respiratory tract infection |
| 27 | YES | M | 9 months | Skin | Rash | 6 | eczema |
| 28 | NO | F | 64 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 6 | acute bronchitis |
| 29 | YES | F | 17 years | Lower Respiratory | Muscle aches | 4 | influenza |
| 30 | YES | M | 14 years | Gastrointestinal | Diarrhoea | 4 | appendicitis |
| 31 | YES | F | 20 years | Female reproductive system | Vaginal discharge | 4 | threatened miscarriage |
| 32 | YES | F | 42 years | Mental Health | Low mood | 4 | postnatal depression |
| 33 | YES | F | 2 years | ENT | Sticky eye | 4 | otitis media |
| 34 | YES | F | 57 years | Mental Health | Aggressive behaviour | 3 | paranoid psychosis |
| 35 | YES | F | 72 years | MSK - Injury | Back pain | 2 | wedge fracture thoracic spine |
| 36 | YES | F | 89 years | Mental Health | Confusion | 3 | acute confusional state |
| 37 | YES | F | 49 years | Mental Health | Suicidal thoughts | 3 | post traumatic stress disorder |
| 38 | NO | F | 1 years | Lower Respiratory | Breathing difficulties | 3 | bronchiolitis |
| 39 | YES | M | 89 years | Lower Respiratory | Hands shaking | 3 | influenza |
| 40 | YES | F | 2 years | Upper respiratory | Earache | 6 | common cold |
| 41 | NO | F | 5 years | CNS - Non injury | Fever | 1 | bacterial meningitis |
| 42 | YES | M | 68 years | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting blood | 2 | acute gastritis/gastric erosions |
| 43 | YES | F | 41 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 2 | acute cholecystitis |
| 44 | NO | F | 52 years | Skin | Rash | 4 | shingles |
| 45 | YES | F | 7 years | CNS - Non injury | Fever | 1 | meningococcal septicaemia |
| 46 | YES | M | 3 years | Infection - general | Blisters on hands | 6 | hand foot and mouth disease |
| 47 | NO | M | 30 years | MSK - non injury | Pain in big toe | 4 | gout |
| 48 | NO | F | 47 years | MSK - Injury | Back pain | 6 | muscle strain |
| 49 | YES | F | 27 years | Upper respiratory | Sore throat | 2 | quinsy (peritonsillar abscess) |
| 50 | NO | M | 2 years | ENT | Earache | 4 | acute otitis media |
| 51 | YES | M | 62 years | Mental Health | Can't sleep | 5 | depression |
| 52 | YES | M | 58 years | Cardiovascular | Chest pain | 5 | angina |
| 53 | NO | F | 37 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 6 | acute bronchitis |
| 54 | YES | F | 67 years | ENT | Dizziness | 6 | benign positional vertigo |
| 55 | YES | F | 32 years | Cardiovascular | Shortness of breath | 2 | pulmonary embolism |
| 56 | YES | M | 77 years | CNS - Non injury | Drooping of left side of face | 1 | stroke |
| 57 | NO | F | 82 years | Cardiovascular | Shortness of breath | 5 | heart failure (i.e. congestive cardiac failure) |
| 58 | YES | F | 32 years | Cardiovascular | Irregular heartbeat | 5 | ventricular extrasystoles |
| 59 | YES | M | 28 years | CNS - Non injury | Shaking of hands | 5 | benign essential tremor |
| 60 | YES | F | 58 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 5 | asthma |
| 61 | NO | F | 27 years | CNS - Non injury | Headache | 5 | migraine |
| 62 | YES | M | 57 years | Cardiovascular | Pain in calves | 5 | peripheral vascular disease |
| 63 | NO | F | 41 years | CNS - Non injury | Headache | 1 | subarachnoid haemorrhage |
| 64 | NO | M | 32 years | Cardiovascular | Fast pulse | 4 | paroxysmal tachyarrhythmia |
| 65 | YES | F | 1 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 4 | viral bronchitis |
| 66 | YES | M | 13 years | Lower Respiratory | Wheezy | 5 | asthma |
| 67 | YES | F | 3 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 3 | pneumonia |
| 68 | YES | F | 32 years | MSK - non injury | Tingling in hands | 5 | carpal tunnel syndrome |
| 69 | NO | M | 42 years | Cardiovascular | Chest pain | 1 | myocardial infarction |
| 70 | NO | M | 10 years | CNS - Non injury | Headache | 2 | intracranial haematoma |
| 71 | YES | F | 27 years | MSK - non injury | Colour change in fingers | 5 | Raynaud’s phenomenon of the fingers |
| 72 | NO | F | 26 years | Cardiovascular | Collapse | 5 | vasovagal attack |
| 73 | YES | M | 73 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 4 | lung cancer |
| 74 | YES | F | 8 years | CNS - Injury | Headache | 6 | minor head injury |
| 75 | YES | M | 28 years | MSK - Injury | Chest pain | 4 | pleurisy |
| 76 | NO | F | 77 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 1 | intestinal obstruction |
| 77 | YES | F | 63 years | Gastrointestinal | Blood on toilet paper | 4 | colorectal cancer |
| 78 | NO | F | 37 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 5 | irritable bowel syndrome |
| 79 | YES | M | 8 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 2 | appendicitis |
| 80 | YES | F | 17 years | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting | 6 | viral gastroenteritis |
| 81 | NO | M | 1 months | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting | 3 | pyloric stenosis |
| 82 | NO | M | 38 years | Gastrointestinal | Yellow eyes | 2 | viral hepatitis |
| 83 | YES | M | 67 years | Gastrointestinal | Difficulty swallowing | 4 | oesophageal cancer |
| 84 | YES | F | 68 years | Skin | Redness of leg | 4 | cellulitis |
| 85 | YES | M | 37 years | Ophthalmology | Swollen eye | 2 | periorbital/orbital cellulitis |
| 86 | YES | F | 63 years | MSK - non injury | Shoulder pain | 5 | frozen shoulder |
| 87 | YES | M | 63 years | MSK - non injury | Stiff neck | 6 | acute torticollis |
| 88 | YES | F | 82 years | MSK - non injury | Hip pain | 5 | osteoarthritis of hip |
| 89 | YES | M | 15 years | MSK - non injury | Knee pain | 5 | Osgood-Shlatters disease |
| 90 | YES | F | 35 years | MSK - non injury | Numbness in fingers | 5 | carpal tunnel syndrome |
| 91 | YES | M | 50 years | MSK - non injury | Knee pain | 4 | infected infra-patellar bursa |
| 92 | YES | F | 50 years | MSK - non injury | Wrist pain | 5 | tenosynovitis |
| 93 | NO | M | 67 years | ENT | Discharge from ear | 4 | otitis externa |
| 94 | YES | M | 50 years | ENT | Ringing in ear | 5 | tinnitus |
| 95 | YES | F | 58 years | Upper respiratory | Hoarse voice | 4 | laryngitis secondary to acid reflux |
| 96 | YES | F | 23 years | Mental Health | Hearing voices | 3 | acute psychosis |
| 97 | NO | F | 13 years | Mental Health | Heart pounding | 5 | anxiety disorder |
| 98 | NO | F | 47 years | Endocrine | Passing lots of urine | 4 | type 2 diabetes |
| 99 | YES | M | 9 years | Endocrine | Vomiting | 1 | diabetic ketoacidosis |
| 100 | YES | F | 30 years | Endocrine | Sweating | 4 | Graves’ disease |
| 101 | NO | F | 59 years | Endocrine | Tiredness | 5 | hypothyroidism |
| 102 | YES | M | 41 years | Endocrine | Can't get erection | 5 | pituitary tumour (prolactinoma) |
| 103 | YES | F | 42 years | Endocrine | Swelling under jaw | 5 | salivary gland stone |
| 104 | YES | F | 39 years | Endocrine | Weight gain | 4 | adrenal adenoma causing Cushing's syndrome |
| 105 | YES | M | 61 years | Infection - general | Fever | 2 | malaria |
| 106 | YES | F | 37 years | Urinary Tract | Painful urination | 4 | urinary tract infection |
| 107 | NO | M | 45 years | Ophthalmology | Red eyes | 6 | viral conjunctivitis |
| 108 | YES | F | 33 years | Female reproductive system | Abdominal pain | 2 | ectopic pregnancy |
| 109 | YES | F | 6 years | Urinary Tract | Abdominal pain | 3 | urinary tract infection |
| 110 | NO | M | 26 years | Urinary Tract | Pain in side | 2 | renal stones |
| 111 | YES | M | 33 years | Ophthalmology | Red painful eye | 3 | corneal ulcer |
| 112 | YES | M | 15 years | Male reproductive system | Testicular pain | 2 | testicular torsion |
| 113 | YES | F | 42 years | Female reproductive system | Vaginal discharge | 6 | vaginal thrush |
| 114 | YES | M | 57 years | Urinary Tract | Blood in urine | 4 | urinary tract infection |
| 115 | YES | F | 14 years | Female reproductive system | Heavy periods | 5 | menorrhagia |
| 116 | YES | F | 26 years | Female reproductive system | Vaginal bleeding | 6 | threatened miscarriage |
| 117 | YES | M | 79 years | Male reproductive system | Passing urine at night | 5 | benign prostatic hyperplasia |
| 118 | YES | M | 27 years | Ophthalmology | Dry eyes | 6 | dry eye syndrome |
| 119 | YES | M | 2 years | Ophthalmology | Sticky red eye | 6 | bacterial conjunctivitis |
| 120 | YES | M | 19 years | Male reproductive system | Testicular lump | 4 | hydrocoele |
| 121 | YES | F | 45 years | Female reproductive system | Vaginal bleeding | 4 | vaginal atrophy |
| 122 | YES | F | 62 years | Female reproductive system | Bloating | 4 | ovarian pathology (cancer) |
| 123 | YES | F | 56 years | Female reproductive system | Hot flush | 5 | menopause |
| 124 | YES | M | 7 years | Gastrointestinal | Constipation | 6 | constipation |
| 125 | NO | F | 13 years | Immune system | Sneezing | 5 | allergic rhinitis |
| 126 | YES | M | 29 years | Cardiovascular | Palpitations | 5 | ectopics secondary to caffeine intake |
| 127 | YES | F | 19 years | Mental Health | Low mood | 5 | depression |
| 128 | YES | M | 38 years | Lower Respiratory | Phlegm with blood | 4 | carcinoma of lung |
| 129 | YES | M | 32 years | Infection - general | High fever | 2 | malaria |
| 130 | YES | M | 20 years | Skin | Rash | 4 | eczema |
| 131 | YES | F | 34 years | Skin | Pimples on face | 5 | acne |
| 132 | YES | F | 3 years | Infection - general | Rash | 6 | varicella zoster |
| 133 | YES | M | 27 years | Immune system | Itchy rash | 6 | acute urticaria |
| 134 | YES | M | 33 years | Skin | White toenail | 5 | fungal nail infection |
| 135 | YES | F | 37 years | Blood | Tiredness | 5 | iron deficiency anaemia |
| 136 | YES | F | 11 years | Blood | Lump in neck | 4 | lymphoma |
| 137 | NO | M | 43 years | Blood | Bruising | 4 | clotting disorder |
| 138 | NO | F | 33 years | Cardiovascular | Chest pain | 3 | pulmonary embolism |
| 139 | YES | M | 40 years | Gastrointestinal | Stomach pain | 3 | diverticulitis |
| 140 | YES | M | 50 years | Gastrointestinal | Stomach pain | 1 | diverticular abscess |
| 141 | YES | M | 64 years | Male reproductive system | Difficulty passing urine | 4 | benign prostatic hyperplasia |
| 142 | YES | F | 64 years | Oncology | Lump in breast | 4 | breast cancer |
| 143 | NO | F | 38 years | CNS - Non injury | Headache | 5 | tension headache |
| 144 | NO | F | 25 years | Female reproductive system | Tummy bloating before period | 5 | premenstrual syndrome |
| 145 | NO | F | 35 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 5 | irritable bowel syndrome |
| 146 | YES | F | 36 years | Skin | Hair falling out | 5 | alopecia |
| 147 | YES | F | 39 years | Skin | Flaky patches of skin | 5 | psoriasis |
| 148 | YES | F | 3 years | Urinary Tract | Crying on weeing | 3 | urinary tract infection |
| 149 | YES | F | 3 years | Lower Respiratory | Cough | 3 | pneumonia |
| 150 | NO | M | 3 years | Male reproductive system | End of penis red | 4 | balanitis |
| 151 | YES | F | 12 years | Skin | Rash | 4 | scabies |
| 152 | YES | F | 32 years | MSK - non injury | Heel pain | 5 | plantar fasciitis |
| 153 | YES | M | 30 years | MSK - non injury | Shin pain | 6 | shin splints |
| 154 | YES | M | 40 years | CNS - Non injury | Back pain | 1 | cauda equina syndrome |
| 155 | YES | F | 30 years | Female reproductive system | Irregular periods | 5 | polycystic ovary syndrome |
| 156 | NO | F | 12 years | MSK - non injury | Hip pain | 4 | slipped upper femoral epiphysis |
| 157 | YES | M | 21 years | Lower Respiratory | Shortness of breath | 1 | spontaneous simple pneumothorax |
| 158 | YES | F | 70 years | Lower Respiratory | Shortness of breath | 4 | asbestosis |
| 159 | YES | F | 33 years | Cardiovascular | Chest pain | 2 | pulmonary embolism |
| 160 | YES | F | 47 years | Cardiovascular | Lump in lower leg | 4 | thrombophlebitis |
| 161 | NO | F | 4 years | Upper respiratory | Runny nose | 6 | upper respiratory tract infection |
| 162 | YES | M | 10 years | Skin | Rash on chin | 4 | impetigo |
| 163 | YES | M | 40 years | Urinary Tract | Pain in left side | 2 | renal calculus |
| 164 | NO | M | 62 years | Skin | Cracked skin between toes | 6 | athlete's foot |
| 165 | YES | M | 52 years | Gastrointestinal | Blood on toilet paper | 5 | internal haemorrhoids |
| 166 | YES | M | 39 years | ENT | Blocked nose | 5 | nasal polyps |
| 167 | NO | F | 21 years | MSK - injury | Swollen ankle | 4 | ankle sprain |
| 168 | YES | F | 11 years | MSK - non injury | Back ache | 5 | idiopathic scoliosis |
| 169 | YES | M | 18 years | MSK - non injury | Knee pain | 2 | dislocated patella |
| 170 | YES | M | 24 years | Skin | Rash on hands and arms | 4 | contact dermatitis |
| 171 | NO | F | 2 years | Ophthalmology | Sticky eyes | 6 | viral conjunctivitis |
| 172 | YES | M | 16 years | Immune system | Runny nose | 6 | allergic rhinitis |
| 173 | YES | M | 68 years | Urinary tract | Blood in urine | 4 | bladder cancer |
| 174 | YES | F | 36 years | Skin | Rash under breasts | 4 | candidal intertrigo |
| 175 | YES | F | 32 years | Female reproductive system | Bleeding after sex | 4 | cervical cancer |
| 176 | YES | F | 27 years | CNS - Non injury | Headaches | 5 | cluster headaches |
| 177 | NO | M | 23 years | Gastrointestinal | Diarrhoea | 4 | coeliac disease |
| 178 | YES | M | 6 months | Skin | Flaky scalp | 6 | cradle cap |
| 179 | YES | M | 10 months | Upper respiratory | Difficulty breathing | 3 | croup |
| 180 | NO | F | 28 years | Female reproductive system | Abdominal pain | 5 | endometriosis |
| 181 | YES | F | 23 years | Female reproductive system | Blisters on vulva | 4 | genital herpes |
| 182 | YES | F | 10 months | Gastrointestinal | Crying baby | 3 | constipation |
| 183 | YES | M | 2 years | Upper respiratory | Cough | 6 | common cold |
| 184 | YES | F | 5 years | Infection - general | Rash | 4 | rubella |
| 185 | NO | M | 50 years | Dental | Toothache | 4 | dental abscess |
| 186 | NO | M | 36 years | Ophthalmology | Blurred vision | 2 | corneal ulcer |
| 187 | NO | F | 6 months | Gastrointestinal | Diarrhoea | 3 | viral gastroenteritis |
| 188 | YES | M | 27 years | Gastrointestinal | Abdominal pain | 1 | acute pancreatitis |
| 189 | NO | M | 2 months | Urinary Tract | Vomiting | 3 | urinary tract infection |
| 190 | YES | F | 7 months | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting | 2 | viral gastroenteritis |
| 191 | YES | M | 9 years | Dental | Toothache | 5 | dental caries |
| 192 | YES | F | 33 years | Mental Health | Worried about pregnancy | 4 | anxiety |
| 193 | YES | M | 24 years | Infection - general | Fever | 4 | glandular fever |
| 194 | YES | F | 4 months | Gastrointestinal | Diarrhoea | 4 | viral gastroenteritis |
| 195 | YES | F | 15 years | MSK - injury | Back pain | 5 | mechanical low back pain |
| 196 | YES | F | 22 years | Urinary Tract | Pain on passing urine | 3 | urinary tract infection |
| 197 | YES | F | 10 months | Gastrointestinal | Vomiting | 4 | viral gastroenteritis |
| 198 | NO | F | 4 years | Cardiovascular | Fever | 3 | Kawasaki disease |
| 199 | YES | F | 60 years | Skin | Crusted patch of skin | 4 | basal cell carcinoma |
| 200 | YES | F | 56 years | Gastrointestinal | Pain in groin | 4 | femoral hernia |

**Supplementary Table 2**

Individual details of the 200 clinical-vignettes: age range, sex, condition type (system/specialism), level of urgency advice, and main diagnosis. See also **Supplementary Table 1** for a summary.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Category** | **Example vignette #79 (see Supplementary Table 2)** | **Example vignette #86 (see Supplementary Table 2)** |
| **Sex** | * male | * female |
| **Age** | * 8 years old | * 63 years old |
| **Previous medical history** | * None of note. | * None of note. |
| **Primary complaint** | * abdominal pain | * shoulder pain |
| **Additional information on primary complaint and current symptoms** | * abdominal pain and fever. Temp 39.5C. Started to get pain in the middle of his abdomen last night before he went to bed (6 hours ago). Had some infant paracetamol suspension and went to sleep. Now he has woken up and is crying with pain. Feels feverish. Says his tummy hurts on the right side now. Severity 8/10. Tummy hurts to touch. Feels hot. Looks flushed. Constant pain - no radiation. | * painful shoulder. Unable to move it for 24 hours. Onset of pain in right shoulder about 6 months ago. Gradually got worse. In the past week it has been much worse and now unable to move the shoulder. Right shoulder appears higher than the other. Background ache. Severe pain if she tries to move the shoulder. |
| **If asked** | * location of pain: Right lower abdomen * Character: constant * Diarrhoea: NO * constipation - NO * blood in stools - NO * mucus - NO * urinary or testicular symptoms - NO * vomiting - NO dehydration - NO * fever - YES * dry Mouth - NO | * history of injury to the shoulder: NO * redness of the skin over the shoulder: NO * painful to touch: NO * deformity: NO * numbness, tingling or pain in the arm: NO * weakness of the arm: NO – just can’t lift it up because of pain. * does the shoulder feel as if it is coming out of socket?: NO |
| **Progression** | * getting worse | * getting worse |
| **Levels of urgency advice** | * **see primary care within 4 hours** | * **see primary care non-urgent** |
| **Main diagnosis** | * **appendicitis** | * **frozen shoulder** |
| **Differential diagnoses (not ordered)** | * **urinary tract infection** * **mesenteric adenitis** * **inguinal hernia** * **testicular torsion** * **intestinal malrotation** * **ureteric colic** | * **osteoarthritis of shoulder** * **bursitis of shoulder** * **shoulder impingement syndrome** * **dislocated shoulder** |
| **Body-system/ specialism classification** | * **gastrointestinal** | * **musculoskeletal - non-injury** |

**Supplementary Table 3**

Two example vignettes showing the vignette structure. The items in grey shading are the vignette gold-standard answer and vignette body-system/specialism classification.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of symptom assessment app** | **Provider** | **Platform addressed in this study** | **Regional availability** | **Questions on**  **pre-existing factors/ attributes** | **Number of questions** |
| **Ada** | Ada Health GmbH,  Berlin, Germany | App | Available everywhere. | -Gender  -Date of birth  -Pregnant  -Smoker  -High blood pressure  -Diabetes | Variable |
| **Babylon** | Babylon Healthcare Services Ltd.,  London, UK | App | Services provided in compliance with UK law and regulation-- outside of the UK, user must check if lawful. Not all services available outside of UK  **UK version tested in this study.** | -Gender  -Date of birth | Variable |
| **Buoy** | Buoy Health, Inc.,  Boston, MA, USA | Website (Note - the term ‘app’ is loosely used in this study as a generic term for symptom assessment tools - strictly Buoy is not an app, but instead a website, though it can be put onto phone homescreens | For US residents  **US version tested in this study.** | -Gender  -Age (between 2-120 years) | Variable |
| **K Health** | K Health Inc.,  New York, NY, USA | App | Services available outside the US & Israel but are solely directed to those in the US and/or Israel.  **US version tested in this study.** | -Gender  -Age  -Chronic conditions relevant to symptoms | Around 20 questions but variable |
| **Mediktor** | Teckel Medical S.L.,  Barcelona, Spain | App | Available everywhere | -Gender  -Age | Variable |
| **Symptomate** | Infermedica, Wrocław, Poland | App | Available everywhere | -Gender  -Age (Minimum age 18)  -Overweight  -Smoker  -Recently injured  -High cholesterol  -Hypertension -Diabetes | 19 after region where live |
| **Your.MD** | YOUR.MD AS  Oslo, Norway  and subsidiary:  Your.MD Ltd.  London, UK | App | Available everywhere | -Gender  -Year of birth (-Minimum age 16)  -Asthma  -Diabetes  -Smoker | Variable |
| **WebMD** | WebMD, LLC  Atlanta, GA, USA | App (website also available) | Available everywhere | -Gender  -Age  -Past medical history  -Medications | 4 (excluding age and gender) |

**Supplementary Table 4**

Summary of the 8 apps evaluated in this study

|  |
| --- |
| **Conditions should be considered a reasonable match when:** |
| - the suggested condition is the same as the gold standard (GS). |
| - alternative names for the same condition are used. |
| - the suggested condition is a more precise description of the gold standard condition. |
| - the condition is an umbrella term including the other condition. |
| - it is reasonable to assume two different doctors might use the two different descriptions to label the same conditions. |
| - one condition causes the other (directly and explicitly) |
| - the suggested condition conveys the nature of the GS condition, is reasonably related to the GS condition (but is less precise) - similarity is so clear that in primary care medicine practice, the conditions would be considered a near match. |
| - the suggested condition is both highly related to the GS condition and shares symptoms to a high degree with the GS condition. |

**Supplementary Table 5**

Matching criteria that were considered by panel physicians in deciding if condition-suggestions (from GPs or from apps) match the gold-standard diagnoses. Note - the matching criteria apply equally to all apps and to the tested-GPs.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Levels of urgency advice** | **all vignettes for K Health (200)** | **150 vignettes with source verified data for K Health** | **all vignettes for Your.MD (200)** | **150 vignettes with source verified data for Your.MD** |
| **no advice given (%) [not recorded]** | 32.0 [12.0] | 33.3 | 32.5 | 38.7 |
| **potentially unsafe (%)** | 10.5 | 14.0 | 5.0 | 4.7 |
| **safe but underconservative (%)** | 18.0 | 23.3 | 5.0 | 4.0 |
| **exactly matched (%)** | 17.0 | 20.0 | 22.0 | 23.3 |
| **overconservative but suitable (%)** | 6.0 | 6.7 | 14.0 | 15.3 |
| **overconservative (%)** | 4.5 | 2.7 | 21.5 | 14.0 |
| **statistical testing (%)** Fisher’s exact test for significant difference between the urgency advice allocation | ***p*-value** | 0.59 (no significant difference) | ***p*-value** | 0.69 (no significant difference) |
| **% of safe advice** (where safe is defined as maximum one level less conservative than gold-standard, expressed per vignette provided with advice)**.** | 81.3\* | 79.0 | 92.6 | 92.3 |

**Supplementary Table 6**

Urgency advice subanalysis for K Health and Your.MD. One app-entry-Dr (#4) did not record complete and source data verifiable data for K Health and Your.MD. For K Health, 12.0% of urgency advice was not recorded by app-entry-Dr (#4) and no screenshot was saved. For Your.MD, all urgency advice was recorded but in 25% of vignettes, screenshots were not saved for source data verification.  A subanalysis was conducted to show the K Health and Your.MD performance in the fully verified 150 vignettes and to allow comparison to their performance in the full set of 200 vignettes. There are some differences in Your.MD’s performance in the 200-vignette and in the 150-vignette analyses, but these are not statistically significant.  It is not possible to determine what proportion of the differences present was due to unrecorded or unverified data, and what proportion was due to random differences between the 150 and 200 vignettes. \* - in the case of K Health, % of safe advice (where safe is defined as maximum one level less conservative than gold-standard, expressed per vignette with available advice).

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Condition-suggestion performance** | **all vignettes for WebMD (200)** | **150 vignettes with source verified data for WebMD** | **all vignettes for Your.MD (200)** | **150 vignettes with source verified data for Your.MD** |
| **M1 (%)** | 21.0 | 25.3 | 21.5 | 18.7 |
| **M3 (%)** | 35.5 | 38.0 | 23.5 | 20.0 |
| **M5 (%)** | 43.5 | 45.3 | 23.5 | 20.0 |
| **COMP. (%)** | 38.9 | 42.5 | 14.3 | 12.0 |
| **RELE. (%)** | 33.4 | 34.8 | 40.2 | 35.1 |
| **statistical testing (%)** Fisher’s exact test for significant difference between the urgency advice allocation | ***p*-value** | 0.88 (no significant difference) | ***p*-value** | 0.88 (no significant difference) |

**Supplementary Table 7**

Condition-suggestion subanalysis for WebMD and Your.MD. One app-entry-Dr (#4) did not record complete source data verification screenshots for WebMD or for Your.MD and therefore verification of entered data was not possible for 50 out of 200 of the randomly assigned vignettes for these apps. A subanalysis was conducted to show the performance of WebMD and Your.MD in the fully verified 150 vignettes and to allow comparison to their performance in the full set of 200 vignettes. There are some differences in performance between the 200-vignette and the 150-vignette analyses, but these are not statistically significant. It is not possible to determine what proportion of small differences present were due data entry error in the 50-vignettes, and what proportion was due to random differences between the 150 and 200 vignettes.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Scenarios for which there was no urgency advice** | | | | | | | |
|  | **Under the age limit1**  **%**  (specified age limit) | **Pregnant**  **%** | **Symptom Not Found 2**  **%** | **No condition-suggestions 3**  **%** | **Not Recorded4**  **%** | **Mental health5**  **%** | **Total for which no urgency advice (i.e. 100% - breadth of coverage** |
| **Ada** | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| **Babylon** | 1.0  (16+)\* | 3.0 | 5.0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 9.0 |
| **Buoy** | 9.5  (13+) | 0 | 0.5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 10.0 |
| **K Health** | 31.0  (18+) | 0 | 1.0 | 0 | 12.0 | 0 | 44.0 |
| **Mediktor** | 2.5  (1+) | 0 | 0 | 13.5 | 0 | 1.5 | 17.5 |
| **Symptomate** | 31.0  (18+) | 0 | 0.5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 31.5 |
| **Your.MD** | 23.0  (16+) | 0.5 | 2.0 | 5.5 | 0 | 0 | 31.0 |

**Supplementary Table 8**

Coverage of each app and reasons why apps did not provide condition-suggestions for some vignettes.

\* - Babylon provides levels of urgency advice to these patients such as “go to the nearest ED”, but it does not provide condition-suggestions for patients under 16 years of age.

**1** - The app did not provide a condition-suggestion for those under its specified age limit.

**2** - A matching symptom or appropriately matching symptom to the presenting complaint could not be found in the app, so the vignette could not be entered.

**3** - No condition-suggestions were provided by the app, and, as a result of this, the app did not provide urgency advice.

**4** - One app-entry-Dr (#4) did not fully record the levels of urgency advice, and there were no corresponding source data verification screenshots for this subset of data. See **Supplementary Table 6** for a subanalysis of the 150 vignettes with complete source-data-verified data for K Health on levels of urgency advice.

**5** - These were mental health scenarios where no level of urgency advice was provided. Note: for the other apps, where question flow was stopped due to mental health, the level of urgency advice of ‘seek emergency care’ was none-the-less provided.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Scenarios for which there were no condition-suggestions** | | | | | | | | |
|  | **Under the age limit1**  **%**  **(specified age limit)** | **Pregnant**  **%** | **Symptom Not Found2**  **%** | **Condition Severity3**  **%** | **Generic4**  **%** | **Clear Statement No Results5**  **%** | **Mental health 6**  **%** | **Total for which no condition suggestions (i.e. 100% - breadth of coverage)** |
| **Ada** | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0.5 | 0 | 0 | 0.5 | 1.0 |
| **Babylon** | 25.5  (16+) | 2.5 | 4.0 | 8.5 | 6.0 | 0.5 | 1.5 | 48.5 |
| **Buoy** | 8.5  (13+) | 0 | 1.0 | 0.5 | 0 | 0 | 1.5 | 11.5 |
| **K Health** | 23.5  (18+) | 0 | 2.0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 25.5 |
| **Mediktor** | 4.0  (1+) | 0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0 | 11.5 | 2.0 | 19.5 |
| **Symptomate** | 31.5  (18+) | 1.5 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 5.0 | 0.5 | 38.5 |
| **Your.MD** | 23  (16+) | 1.0 | 0.5 | 0.5 | 4.0 | 5.5 | 1.0 | 35.5 |
| **WebMD** | 5.0 | 0 | 0.5 | 0 | 0 | 1.5 | 0 | 7.0 |

**Supplementary Table 9**

The breadth of condition-suggestion coverage is shown for each app along with the reasons why apps did not provide condition-suggestions for some vignettes.

**1** -The app does not provide a condition-suggestion for users under a specified age limit.

**2** - A directly or appropriately matching symptom to the presenting complaint could not be found in the app, so the vignette could not be entered.

**3** - The app did not to give condition-suggestions for very serious symptoms - e.g. the app stated only ‘Condition causing severe [*symptom*]’

**4** - The app gave a generic answer rather than a condition, e.g. “further assessment is needed”

**5** - The app provided a clear statement that no condition-suggestion results were found for the vignette. The reason why the app failed to give a condition-suggestion for these vignettes is uncertain, but generally these vignettes relate to minor conditions, and in most cases, it seems that the app does not have a matching condition modelled.

**6** - These were mental health scenarios where no conditions were provided at all

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Classification of reason** | **App** | **Number of vignettes for which this was the reason for no condition- suggestion** |
| **Mental Health**  “If she is struggling with suicidal thoughts, please stay calm, don’t leave her alone and make sure to look for professional help right now…(**Ada**)”  “I’m sorry you’re having thoughts of self-harm or suicide. I’m stopping your assessment as this is beyond my capability…(**Babylon**)”  “Some of the symptoms you reported might need to be checked out by a GP within the next 6 hours…(**Babylon**)”  “When experiencing thoughts of suicide, she should go immediately to the ER…(**Buoy**)”  “Seeing or hearing things is a sign of a possible mental health issue. She should…(**Buoy**)”  “Mental or medical condition causing hallucinations. (**Buoy**)”  “Go to the hospital right away. It is very likely you need medical care. (**Mediktor**)”  “Thank you for telling me, Guest. As you know, I am not a doctor, but there are people that can help you with these thoughts…(**Your.MD**)”  “[Symptom] are worrying symptoms. You should see a doctor within 48 hours…(**Your.MD**)” | Ada | 1 |
| Babylon | 3 |
| Buoy | 3 |
| Mediktor | 4 |
| Symptomate | 1 |
| Your.MD | 2 |
| **Generic**  “Your symptoms require further medical assessment. (**Babylon**).”  “This needs looking into…(**Babylon**)”  “Range of possible causes…(**Babylon**)”  “Symptoms can be managed at home…(**Babylon** - note condition not named)”  “Ok guest, here is some information you might find helpful: [symptom/related condition information] (**Your.MD**)” | Babylon | 12 |
| Your.MD | 8 |
| **Emergency/ very severe**  “Call the local emergency number for a life-threatening medical emergency (**Ada**)”  “Severe chest pain…[Symptom] might be a sign of something serious...(**Buoy**)”  “Condition causing…[serious symptom] (**Buoy**)”  “[Symptoms] are worrying symptoms. You should see a doctor within 48 hours (**Your.MD**)”  “Symptoms should not be ignored (**Babylon**)”  “Could be signs of something serious…(**Babylon**)” | Ada | 1 |
| Buoy | 18 |
| Your.MD | 1 |
| Babylon | 16 |
| **Clear statement of no results**  “No results (**Symptomate**)”  “I wasn’t able to find any causes for your symptoms…(**Your.MD**)”  “No prediagnosis was reached. Please retry the assessment describing it differently or check with a health professional (**Mediktor**)”  “No conditions found, try adding more symptoms (**WebMD**)”  “The symptoms you describe are quite complex…(**Babylon**)” | Symptomate | 10 |
| Your.MD | 11 |
| Mediktor | 23 |
| WebMD) | 3 |
| Babylon | 1 |

**Supplementary Table 10**

Detailed analysis of why apps did not provide condition-suggestions for some vignettes

Supplementary Legend

**Supplementary Figure 1**

Mapping between the native levels of urgency advice provided by each app and tested-GP and the study defined common levels of urgency advice (as shown in main manuscript **Table 1**)