

Supplementary Material For: Assessing the Impact of Non-Pharmaceutical Interventions on COVID-19: A Combined CCE and Quantile Regression Approach

Kaibalyapati Mishra

July 15, 2024

As I examine the impact of NPIs on COVID-19 outcomes in India, focusing on infection and deaths, the independent variables representing NPIs include stringency measures (ψ_s), containment measures (ψ_c), economic support measures (ψ_e), and overall government support measures (ψ_o), which is an aggregated index of the other three. The dependent variables are the weekly infection rates (I_t) and weekly death rates (D_t). Government spending on these measures can be represented as:

$$G_t = \psi_s \cdot C_s + \psi_c \cdot C_c + \psi_e \cdot C_e$$

where C_s, C_c, C_e are the respective costs associated with each type of measure. We don't mention C_o here though we use it in empirical estimation because C_s, C_c, C_e combined is C_o . Households derive utility from both consumption and health levels. The utility function is specified as:

$$U(C_{in}, C_{out}, H) = \alpha \ln(C_{in}) + \beta \ln(C_{out}) + \gamma H$$

where C_{in} denotes indoor consumption, C_{out} denotes outdoor consumption, and H represents the health level of the household. The health level is influenced by the infection rate (I_t) and the death rate (D_t), with the formulation $H_t = H_0 - \delta I_t - \lambda D_t$. This setup captures the trade-off households face between maintaining consumption activities and protecting their health during the pandemic.

To account for the lag between the implementation of government policies and their observed effects, the model employs dynamic programming. The value function $V_t(S_t)$ is maximized over the policy actions ψ , considering both current utility and the expected future utility. The Bellman equation is given by:

$$V_t(S_t) = \max_{\psi} [\alpha \ln(C_{in}) + \beta \ln(C_{out}) + \gamma H + \beta \mathbb{E}[V_{t+1}(S_{t+1}) | S_t, \psi_t]]$$

The state transition incorporates the time lag τ , with the transition equation $S_{t+\tau} = f(S_t, \psi_t, \epsilon_t)$, where ϵ_t is a random error term.

The model defines the state transition probabilities to capture the impact of NPIs on infection and death rates. The probability of transitioning from one state S_t to another S_{t+1} is modeled as $\mathbb{P}(S_{t+1} | S_t, \psi_t) = \mathbb{P}(I_{t+1}, D_{t+1} | I_t, D_t, \psi_t)$. The infection dynamics are expressed as $I_{t+1} = I_t \cdot (1 + g(\psi_s, \psi_c, \epsilon_{I,t}))$, and the mortality dynamics are formulated as $D_{t+1} = D_t + h(\psi_s, \psi_c, \psi_e, \psi_o, \epsilon_{D,t})$.

The optimization problem faced by households is to choose the optimal levels of indoor and outdoor activities under the given NPIs to maximize their utility. This is represented as:

$$\max_{\{C_{in}, C_{out}\}} \{\alpha \ln(C_{in}) + \beta \ln(C_{out}) + \gamma (H_0 - \delta I_t - \lambda D_t)\}$$

This formulation integrates the trade-offs between consumption and health, considering the direct impact of NPIs on the infection and death rates, thus providing a comprehensive framework for analyzing the effectiveness of government interventions during the COVID-19 pandemic.

1 OxCGRT indices and variables of the study

Table 1: OxCGRT indices and variables of the study

OxCGRT Indicators				OxCGRT Indices			
ID	Name	Type	Targeted/general	GRI	CNI	STI	ESI
C1	School closing	Ordinal	Geographic	C1	x	x	x
C2	Workplace closing	Ordinal	Geographic	C2	x	x	x
C3	Cancel public events	Ordinal	Geographic	C3	x	x	x
C4	Restrictions on gathering size	Ordinal	Geographic	C4	x	x	x
C5	Close public transport	Ordinal	Geographic	C5	x	x	x
C6	Stay-at-home requirements	Ordinal	Geographic	C6	x	x	x
C7	Restrictions on internal movement	Ordinal	Geographic	C7	x	x	x
C8	Restrictions on international travel	Ordinal	No	C8	x	x	x
Economic response				E1	x		x
E1	Income support	Ordinal	Sectoral	E2	x		x
E2	Debt/contract relief for households	Ordinal	No	E3			
E3	Fiscal measures	Numerical	No	E4			
E4	Giving international support	Numerical	No	H1	x	x	x
Health systems				H2	x	x	
H1	Public information campaign	Ordinal	Geographic	H3	x	x	
H2	Testing policy	Ordinal	No	H4			
H3	Contact tracing	Ordinal	No	H5			
H4	Emergency investment in health care	Numerical	No	H6	x	x	
H5	Investment in COVID-19 vaccines	Numerical	No	H7	x	x	
H6	Facial coverings	Ordinal	Geographic	H8	x	x	
H7	Vaccination policy	Ordinal	Funding				
H8	Protection of elderly people	Ordinal	Geographic	k	16	14	9
							2

2 Diagnostic Test Results

Table 2: Summary statistics of variable quantiles

QUNTILES	Mean	p50	SD	Min	Max	Skewness	Kurtosis	VARIABLES	QUNTILES	Mean	p50	SD	Min	Max	Skewness	Kurtosis	VARIABLES
Q1	-0.005	0.100	0.395	-3.323	0.100	-4.505	25.173		Q1	2.755	3.046	1.779	0.100	4.605	-0.342	1.497	
Q2	3.370	3.578	1.520	0.121	5.597	-0.399	2.082		Q2	4.469	4.477	0.103	4.113	4.605	-0.481	2.635	
Q3	7.267	7.386	0.815	5.598	8.464	-0.345	1.940		Q3	4.186	4.240	0.247	3.478	4.552	-0.671	2.510	
Q4	9.123	9.132	0.358	8.470	9.715	-0.095	1.844		Q4	4.037	4.082	0.293	3.290	4.577	-0.307	2.062	
Q5	10.142	10.150	0.231	9.715	10.514	-0.132	1.824	LnDEATHS	Q5	3.964	4.050	0.394	2.631	4.577	-0.999	3.865	LnCONTAINMENT
Q6	10.814	10.820	0.163	10.515	11.078	-0.118	1.807		Q6	3.748	4.050	0.654	2.408	4.577	-0.786	2.040	
Q7	11.310	11.307	0.133	11.079	11.545	0.016	1.805		Q7	3.365	3.520	0.726	2.408	4.477	0.041	1.261	
Q8	11.795	11.784	0.151	11.545	12.069	0.107	1.808		Q8	3.380	3.561	0.698	2.408	4.577	-0.018	1.378	
Q9	12.349	12.345	0.165	12.070	12.655	0.104	1.861		Q9	3.069	2.631	0.641	2.408	4.561	0.816	2.026	
Q10	13.192	13.101	0.410	12.655	14.280	0.601	2.371		Q10	2.901	2.631	0.579	2.408	4.293	1.417	3.321	
Q1	1.632	0.100	2.824	-2.388	11.693	1.638	4.831		Q1	2.547	2.604	1.805	-0.265	4.531	-0.193	1.337	
Q2	7.994	8.149	2.034	2.208	12.698	-0.178	2.582		Q2	4.398	4.404	0.067	4.145	4.531	-0.454	2.848	
Q3	11.987	12.116	1.167	8.690	14.299	-0.406	2.593		Q3	4.200	4.235	0.175	3.758	4.485	-0.567	2.266	
Q4	13.716	13.714	0.675	11.740	15.310	-0.096	2.876		Q4	4.134	4.135	0.200	3.628	4.563	-0.102	2.224	
Q5	14.611	14.572	0.541	13.187	16.174	0.315	3.185	LnINFECTIONS	Q5	4.123	4.142	0.228	3.470	4.563	-0.533	2.945	LnSTRINGENCY
Q6	15.311	15.237	0.483	13.999	16.692	0.433	3.223		Q6	4.024	4.154	0.340	3.288	4.537	-0.628	1.942	
Q7	15.817	15.736	0.447	14.681	17.174	0.549	3.315		Q7	3.835	3.863	0.367	3.288	4.486	0.112	1.469	
Q8	16.222	16.164	0.449	15.133	17.765	0.836	4.137		Q8	3.853	3.876	0.354	3.145	4.548	-0.004	1.715	
Q9	16.668	16.619	0.450	15.658	18.313	1.316	5.974		Q9	3.693	3.524	0.327	3.145	4.537	0.802	2.396	
Q10	17.392	17.332	0.492	16.323	18.469	0.209	2.293		Q10	3.600	3.470	0.295	3.145	4.309	1.222	3.288	
Q1	2.499	2.543	1.819	-0.403	4.507	-0.156	1.307		Q1	1.941	0.100	2.060	0.100	4.317	0.240	1.079	
Q2	4.386	4.391	0.060	4.168	4.507	-0.451	2.833		Q2	4.295	4.317	0.060	4.135	4.317	-2.278	6.227	
Q3	4.212	4.238	0.150	3.847	4.466	-0.525	2.186		Q3	4.274	4.317	0.162	3.219	4.317	-5.086	30.957	
Q4	4.141	4.152	0.166	3.704	4.501	-0.230	2.421		Q4	4.101	4.317	0.364	2.526	4.317	-1.791	5.771	
Q5	4.115	4.136	0.202	3.491	4.501	-0.736	3.510	LnOVERALL	Q5	3.982	3.912	0.323	3.219	4.317	-0.855	3.257	LnECONOMIC
Q6	3.991	4.127	0.341	3.219	4.466	-0.764	2.121		Q6	3.606	3.912	0.762	0.100	4.317	-3.059	14.285	
Q7	3.788	3.831	0.391	3.154	4.430	-0.069	1.485		Q7	2.813	3.912	1.637	0.100	4.317	-0.971	2.116	
Q8	3.802	3.843	0.372	3.011	4.510	-0.115	1.743		Q8	2.917	3.219	1.461	0.100	4.317	-1.302	2.941	
Q9	3.621	3.459	0.349	3.011	4.513	0.761	2.396		Q9	2.210	3.219	1.647	0.100	4.605	-0.432	1.343	
Q10	3.512	3.357	0.332	3.011	4.279	1.155	3.108		Q10	1.601	0.100	1.700	0.100	4.605	0.333	1.287	

2.1 Results

Table 3: Results from quantile regression analysis with Deaths due to COVID-19 as dependent variable (Q1 to Q3)

<i>d.LnINFECTIONS</i>	Overall (1)	Stringency (2)	Containment (3)	Economic (4)
Q1				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.973** (0.0102)	0.867* (0.00672)	0.986* (0.0111)	1.064** (0.0211)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-1.428*** (0.0465)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-1.067*** (0.0358)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-1.471*** (0.0494)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.129*** (0.0182)
<i>Constant</i>	0.145* (0.0493)	-0.206* (0.0143)	0.148* (0.00853)	-6.240** (0.364)
Q2				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.922** (0.00466)	0.843* (0.00364)	0.928* (0.00558)	0.919** (0.0101)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-1.055*** (0.0204)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.845*** (0.0183)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-1.069*** (0.0239)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.244*** (0.0114)
<i>Constant</i>	0.113** (0.0330)	0.100* (0.0135)	0.114* (0.0317)	-3.176** (0.172)
Q3				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.898** (0.00492)	0.825* (0.00366)	0.905* (0.00560)	0.885** (0.0108)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.882*** (0.0214)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.670*** (0.0167)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.900*** (0.0241)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.183*** (0.0128)
<i>Constant</i>	0.0984** (0.0279)	0.0845 (0.0339)	0.0995** (0.0283)	-2.520** (0.188)
<i>N</i>	5148	5148	5148	5148

Standard errors in parentheses — * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 4: Results from quantile regression analysis with Deaths due to COVID-19 as dependent variable (Q4 to Q6)

<i>d.LnINFECTIONS</i>	Overall (1)	Stringency (2)	Containment (3)	Economic (4)
Q4				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.875** (0.00387)	0.817* (0.00298)	0.881* (0.00454)	0.844** (0.00948)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.726*** (0.0159)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.567*** (0.0123)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.747*** (0.0188)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.195*** (0.0122)
<i>Constant</i>	0.0852** (0.0161)	0.0750 (0.0319)	0.0866** (0.0251)	-1.673** (0.170)
Q5				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.866** (0.00326)	0.814* (0.00322)	0.871* (0.00360)	0.789** (0.0118)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.649*** (0.0129)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.489*** (0.0128)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.657*** (0.0144)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.219*** (0.0134)
<i>Constant</i>	0.0783** (0.0235)	0.0675 (0.0297)	0.0786** (0.0212)	-0.600* (0.212)
Q6				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.851** (0.00387)	0.805* (0.00340)	0.858* (0.00421)	0.760** (0.00182)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.577*** (0.0155)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.397*** (0.0124)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.568*** (0.0162)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.229*** (0.00719)
<i>Constant</i>	0.182** (0.0229)	0.0592 (0.0337)	0.0711 (0.0245)	0.0469** (0.0141)
<i>N</i>	5148	5148	5148	5148

Standard errors in parentheses — * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 5: Results from quantile regression analysis with Deaths due to COVID-19 as dependent variable (Q7 to Q10)

<i>d.LnINFECTIONS</i>	Overall (1)	Stringency (2)	Containment (3)	Economic (4)
Q7				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.836** (0.00400)	0.797* (0.00353)	0.837* (0.00465)	0.766** (0.00211)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.498*** (0.0159)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.326*** (0.0122)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.514*** (0.0184)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.206*** (0.00769)
<i>Constant</i>	0.238** (0.0239)	0.0774 (0.0285)	0.315* (0.0289)	0.0440 (0.0186)
Q8				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.814** (0.00437)	0.774* (0.00344)	0.818* (0.00476)	0.767** (0.00187)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.456*** (0.0192)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.273*** (0.0137)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.426*** (0.0182)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.165*** (0.00759)
<i>Constant</i>	0.536** (0.0692)	0.370* (0.0301)	0.373* (0.0339)	0.0398** (0.0107)
Q9				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.788** (0.00462)	0.766* (0.00302)	0.790* (0.00515)	0.772** (0.00211)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.316*** (0.0246)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.217*** (0.0144)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.324*** (0.0281)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.140*** (0.00850)
<i>Constant</i>	0.563** (0.0456)	0.484* (0.0371)	0.594* (0.0472)	0.0369** (0.0103)
Q10				
<i>LnINFECTIONS</i>	0.756** (0.00430)	0.752* (0.00293)	0.757* (0.00444)	0.759** (0.00158)
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.280*** (0.0373)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.176*** (0.0153)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.272*** (0.0426)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.0663*** (0.00543)
<i>Constant</i>	1.252** (0.183)	0.831* (0.0765)	1.220* (0.207)	0.310** (0.0200)
N	5148	5148	5148	5148

Standard errors in parentheses — * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 6: Results from quantile regression analysis with Infections of COVID-19 as dependent variable (Q1 to Q4)

<i>d.LnINFECTIONS</i>	Overall (5)	Stringency (6)	Containment (7)	Economic (8)
Q1				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	1.447*** (0.0881)	1.119*** (0.0918)	1.434*** (0.0905)	0.967*** (0.0687)
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>				0.00332 (0.120)
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>				
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				
<i>Constant</i>	-2.552** (0.200)	-2.272* (0.232)	-2.558** (0.206)	
Q2				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	2.422*** (0.0544)	1.997*** (0.0734)	2.501*** (0.0616)	2.183*** (0.0568)
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>				-0.118 (0.134)
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>				
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				
<i>Constant</i>	-0.977** (0.142)	-0.0997 (0.259)	-1.356** (0.165)	
Q3				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	3.074*** (0.0470)	-2.031*** (0.179)	3.087*** (0.0492)	-0.801*** (0.0435)
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>				15.53** (0.145)
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>				
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				
<i>Constant</i>	-0.207 (0.173)	20.40** (0.638)	-0.209 (0.185)	
Q4				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	3.369*** (0.0415)	-1.830*** (0.100)	3.364*** (0.0442)	-0.680*** (0.0232)
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>				16.22** (0.0690)
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>				
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				
<i>Constant</i>	-0.237 (0.168)	20.58** (0.323)	-0.236 (0.178)	
<i>N</i>	5148	5148	5148	5148

Standard errors in parentheses — * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 7: Results from quantile regression analysis with Infections of COVID-19 as dependent variable (Q5 to Q8)

<i>d.LnINFECTIONS</i>	Overall (5)	Stringency (6)	Containment (7)	Economic (8)
Q5				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	1.730 (1.537)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-1.508*** (0.0763)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			2.999*** (0.354)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.589*** (0.0197)
<i>_cons</i>	7.432 (6.372)	20.06** (0.248)	2.138 (1.483)	16.57** (0.0596)
Q6				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-0.882*** (0.186)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-1.279*** (0.0596)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-0.577* (0.232)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.534*** (0.0185)
<i>Constant</i>	18.77** (0.728)	19.73* (0.196)	17.59* (0.923)	16.89** (0.0569)
Q7				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-1.158*** (0.130)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-1.065*** (0.0471)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-1.005*** (0.154)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.465*** (0.0171)
<i>Constant</i>	20.24** (0.501)	19.45* (0.159)	19.72* (0.603)	17.09** (0.0533)
Q8				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-1.292*** (0.100)			
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>		-0.988*** (0.0406)		
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>			-1.144*** (0.114)	
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>				-0.412*** (0.0166)
<i>Constant</i>	21.10** (0.385)	19.55* (0.138)	20.60* (0.445)	17.35** (0.0511)
<i>N</i>	5148	5148	5148	5148

Standard errors in parentheses — * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$

Table 8: Results from quantile regression analysis with Infections of COVID-19 as dependent variable (Q9 to Q10)

<i>d.LnINFECTIONS</i>	Overall (5)	Stringency (6)	Containment (7)	Economic (8)
Q9				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-1.207*** (0.0793)	-0.970*** (0.0365)	-1.160*** (0.0891)	
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>				-0.434*** (0.0176)
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>				17.88** (0.0572)
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>	21.09** (0.304)	19.85* (0.126)	21.03* (0.344)	
<i>Constant</i>				
Q10				
<i>LnOVERALL</i>	-1.303*** (0.0766)	-0.916*** (0.0387)	-1.334*** (0.0798)	
<i>LnSTRINGENCY</i>				-0.349*** (0.0146)
<i>LnCONTAINMENT</i>				18.22** (0.0457)
<i>LnECONOMIC</i>	22.27** (0.293)	20.38* (0.135)	22.47* (0.308)	
<i>Constant</i>				
N	5148	5148	5148	5148

Standard errors in parentheses — * $p < 0.05$, ** $p < 0.01$, *** $p < 0.001$