

1 **High Variability in Nicotine Analog Contents, Misleading Labeling, and Artificial Sweetener in**  
2 **New E-Cigarette Products Marketed as "FDA-Exempt"**

3  
4 Hanno C. Erythropel, PhD<sup>1\*</sup>, Sairam V. Jabba, DVM, PhD<sup>2\*</sup>, Peter Silinski, PhD<sup>3</sup>, Paul T. Anastas,  
5 PhD<sup>1</sup>, Suchitra Krishnan-Sarin, PhD<sup>4</sup>, Julie B. Zimmerman, PhD<sup>1</sup>, Sven E. Jordt, PhD<sup>2</sup>

- 6  
7 1. Department of Chemical and Environmental Engineering, Yale University, New Haven, CT  
8 2. Department of Chemistry, Duke University School of Medicine, Durham, NC  
9 3. Department of Anesthesiology, Duke University School of Medicine, Durham, NC  
10 4. Department of Psychiatry, Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT

11  
12 \* These authors contributed equally.

13  
14 Date of submission: April 14, 2024  
15 Word count: 596 including headers

16  
17 Corresponding author: Sven E. Jordt, Ph.D., Associate Professor  
18 Department of Anesthesiology  
19 Duke University School of Medicine  
20 3 Genome Ct.  
21 Durham, NC 27710, USA  
22 [sven.jordt@duke.edu](mailto:sven.jordt@duke.edu)

23 ABSTRACT

24 The recent introduction of electronic cigarette products containing a synthetic nicotine analog,  
25 6-methyl nicotine (6MN), challenges FDA's tobacco regulatory authority. A similar strategy is  
26 pursued by vendors of recently introduced e-cigarette liquids containing nicotinamide (NA),  
27 marketed as 'Nixotine' or 'Nixamide'. Compared to nicotine, 6MN is pharmacologically more  
28 potent at nicotinic receptors, and more toxic, raising concerns about increased addictiveness  
29 and adverse effects.

30 Here, combinations of gas chromatography, high performance liquid chromatography and mass  
31 spectrometry were used to determine nicotine analogs, flavor and sweetener contents of e-  
32 cigarette liquids of the brands "SpreeBar" and ECBlend "Nixotine" products. All SpreeBar  
33 products, labelled as containing 5% 6-methyl nicotine, contained only 0.61-0.64%  
34 6-methylnicotine, while "Nixotine" samples contained 7-46% less of the declared nicotinamide  
35 contents. Although "Nixotine" product labels did not list 6MN as an ingredient, small amounts  
36 of 6-methyl nicotine were detected. All 'SpreeBar' samples contained the artificial sweetener  
37 neotame (0.20-0.86µg/mg).

38 Results identified significant discrepancies between declared and measured constituents of e-  
39 cigarette products containing nicotine alternatives. The discrepancy is misleading for  
40 consumers and raises concerns about production errors. 'SpreeBar' products also contained  
41 neotame, a high-intensity sweetener with high heat stability, likely increasing appeal to young  
42 and first-time users. Novel e-cigarette products with misleading labels containing nicotine  
43 analogs instead of nicotine on the US market is concerning and should be urgently addressed by  
44 lawmakers and regulators.

## 45 INTRODUCTION

46 In March 2022 the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) received authorization to  
47 regulate tobacco products containing synthetic nicotine. The recent introduction of ‘SpreeBar’,  
48 an electronic cigarette (e-cigarette) containing a synthetic nicotine analog, 6-methyl nicotine  
49 (6MN) marketed as ‘Metatine’, challenges this authority (Figure). The vendor claims that FDA  
50 lacks authority over 6MN, since it differs chemically from nicotine, enabling marketing with  
51 youth-appealing flavors and exempt from tobacco product taxes.<sup>1</sup> A similar strategy is pursued  
52 by vendors of recently introduced e-cigarette liquids containing nicotinamide (NA), marketed as  
53 ‘Nixotin’/‘Nixodine’/‘Nixamide’/‘Nic-Safe’ claimed to be “carefully designed to target the same  
54 nicotinic acetylcholine receptors that traditional nicotine stimulates.” (Figure)<sup>2</sup> ‘SpreeBar’  
55 products are labeled as containing 5% 6MN, similar to nicotine content in Juul e-cigarettes  
56 (Figure). Compared to nicotine, 6MN is pharmacologically more potent at nicotinic receptors,  
57 and more toxic with a significantly lower LD<sub>50</sub>.<sup>1</sup> This raises concerns about increased  
58 addictiveness and adverse effects of such nicotine replacement products. This study aimed to  
59 characterize and quantify constituents of ‘SpreeBar’ and ‘Nixotine’ products to assess product  
60 consistency and risk.

61

## 62 METHODS

63 All available ‘SpreeBar’ flavors and 2 flavors of ‘Nixotine’ e-cigarette liquids at varying  
64 concentrations (Table) were purchased between 11/2023-2/2024 from online retailers  
65 (VaporFi, WestsideVapor; ECBlend, respectively). E-liquids were characterized via untargeted  
66 GC/MS analysis and all detected compounds were identified using the NIST database. Nicotine,

67 nicotine analogs, synthetic cooling agents, artificial sweeteners, and other flavorants/additives  
68 were validated using commercial standards and quantified by GC/FID. Chiral HPLC/MS/MS was  
69 carried out to determine 6MN racemic purity, and non-chiral HPLC/MS/MS to quantify  
70 sweeteners using established methods<sup>3</sup> (see Supplemental Materials).

71

## 72 RESULTS

73 No product contained nicotine. 6MN was detected in ‘SpreeBar’, and both 6MN and NA  
74 in ‘Nixotine’ products. However, ‘SpreeBar’ samples, labelled to contain 5% 6MN, had  
75 measured concentrations of only 0.61-0.64% 6MN (-87-88% less), while ‘Nixotine’ samples  
76 contained 7-46% less of the declared NA contents with discrepancies largest in the products  
77 with the highest labelled concentrations. Although ‘Nixotine’ product labels did not list 6MN as  
78 an ingredient, small amounts of 6MN were detected (Table). Chiral chromatography revealed  
79 that ‘SpreeBar’ contained only the (S)-6MN enantiomer. In addition to flavor-specific flavorants  
80 (Supplementary Table S1), all ‘SpreeBar’ samples contained the artificial sweetener neotame  
81 (0.20-0.86µg/mg) and the synthetic cooling agent WS-23 (4.34-16.39µg/mg; Table). ‘Nixotine’  
82 products did neither contain sweeteners nor cooling agents.

83

## 84 DISCUSSION

85 Results identified significant discrepancies between declared and measured  
86 constituents of e-cigarette products marketed as “PMTA-exempt”, claimed to be outside of  
87 FDA’s tobacco regulatory authority. While the significantly lower contents of 6MN (>87% lower)  
88 in ‘SpreeBar’ products may alleviate toxicological concerns, the discrepancy is misleading for

89 consumers and raises concerns about production errors. ‘Nixotine’ products contained both NA  
90 and 6MN, with only the latter known to be a nicotinic receptor agonist.<sup>1,4</sup> While the mixture,  
91 sold as ‘Nixodine’, may result in stimulant activity, the presence of 6MN is undeclared on the  
92 product label, misleading users and regulators.

93         Along with several youth-appealing flavorants, ‘SpreeBar’ products also contained  
94 neotame, a high-intensity sweetener, and WS-23, an odorless synthetic coolant. Neotame is  
95 7,000-13,000x sweeter than sucrose and FDA-approved for use in food,<sup>5</sup> has high heat stability,  
96 but has not been identified in US-marketed e-cigarettes to date. WS-23 is ubiquitous in  
97 disposable e-cigarettes.<sup>6</sup> The presence of both compound classes is of particular concern as  
98 they increase appeal especially to young and first-time users, yet their inhalational safety  
99 remains unknown.

100         Taken together, the appearance of novel e-cigarette products with misleading labels  
101 containing nicotine analogs instead of nicotine on the US market is concerning and should be  
102 urgently addressed by lawmakers and regulators. FDA should be empowered to regulate them  
103 as tobacco products or designate them as drugs.

104

## 105 **Acknowledgements**

106 **Author contributions:** Drs Erythropel and Jabba contributed equally. Drs Erythropel, Jabba and  
107 Jordt had full access to all of the data in the study and take responsibility for the integrity of the  
108 data and the accuracy of the data analysis.

109 **Concept and design:** Erythropel, Jabba, Zimmerman, Jordt.

110 **Acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data:** Jabba, Erythropel, Silinski, Krishnan-Sarin,

111 Jordt.

112 **Drafting of the manuscript:** Erythropel, Jabba, Jordt.

113 Critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content: Anastas, Zimmerman,

114 Krishnan-Sarin, Jordt.

115 **Statistical analysis:** Jabba, Erythropel, Jordt.

116 **Supervision:** Jordt, Zimmerman.

117 **Conflict of Interest Disclosures:** The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

118 **Funding/Support:** This work was supported by cooperative agreement U54DA036151 (Yale

119 Tobacco Center of Regulatory Science) from the National Institute on Drug Abuse (NIDA) of the

120 National Institutes of Health (NIH) and the Center for Tobacco Products of the US Food and

121 Drug Administration (FDA).

122 **Role of the Funder/Sponsor:** The sponsors had no role in the design and conduct of the study;

123 collection, management, analysis, and interpretation of the data; preparation, review, or

124 approval of the manuscript; and decision to submit the manuscript for publication.

125 **Disclaimer:** The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily

126 represent the views of the NIH or the FDA.

127

128

129

130 **References**

- 131 1. Jordt SE, Jabba SV, Zettler PJ, Berman ML. Spree Bar, a vaping system delivering a synthetic nicotine  
132 analogue, marketed in the USA as 'PMTA exempt'. *Tobacco Control*. 2024:Published Online First: 18  
133 March 2024. doi:10.1136/tc-2023-058469
- 134 2. ECBlend. Create Your Own Nicotine Flavor. Accessed 03/24/2024, 2024. <https://perma.cc/6FY3-RLYL>
- 135 3. Erythropel HC, Kong G, deWinter TM, et al. Presence of High-Intensity Sweeteners in Popular  
136 Cigarillos of Varying Flavor Profiles. *JAMA*. 2018;320(13):1380-1383. doi:10.1001/jama.2018.11187
- 137 4. Köppen A, Klein J, Schmidt BH, van der Staay FJ, Löffelholz K. Effects of nicotinamide on central  
138 cholinergic transmission and on spatial learning in rats. *Pharmacol Biochem Behav*. Apr  
139 1996;53(4):783-90. doi:10.1016/0091-3057(95)02118-3
- 140 5. US Food and Drug Administration. Aspartame and Other Sweeteners in Food. Accessed 4/8/2024,  
141 <https://www.fda.gov/food/food-additives-petitions/aspartame-and-other-sweeteners-food>
- 142 6. Jabba SV, Erythropel HC, Torres DG, et al. Synthetic Cooling Agents in US-marketed E-cigarette Refill  
143 Liquids and Popular Disposable E-cigarettes: Chemical Analysis and Risk Assessment. *Nicotine &*  
144 *Tobacco Research*. 2022;24(7):1037-1046. doi:10.1093/ntr/ntac046

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156 FIGURE LEGEND

157 **(A)** Chemical structure of (S)-nicotine and nicotine analogues (S)-6-methyl nicotine and nicotinamide;  
158 the red star indicates the chiral center **(B)** Photo of side of cardboard packaging of 2 different ‘SpreeBar’  
159 flavor pods, labelled “5%”, stating “Contains proprietary Metatine”, which is the trademark name for 6-  
160 methyl nicotine (bottom right); **(C)** Front and back of ‘Nixotine’ refill bottle, indicating only the presence  
161 of nicotinamide but not 6-methyl nicotine; indication of other ingredients (“Kosher USP Propylene Glycol  
162 (PG), Kosher USP Palm Vegetable Glycerin (VG), Natural and Artificial flavors”); and warning only about  
163 nicotinamide.



**Table:** Labeled and quantified nicotine analog contents in ‘SpreeBar’ and ‘Nixotine’ products, calculated discrepancy, and measured solvent ratio (propylene glycol to glycerol), artificial sweetener neotame content, synthetic coolant WS-23 content, and whether other flavor compounds could be detected (see eAppendix for details). 6MN – 6-methyl nicotine; NA – nicotinamide; n.d. – not detected; PG – propylene glycol; GL – glycerol. Values shown as Mean (SE), all N ≥ 3.

Product	Label nicotine alternative content	Measured nicotine alternative content [µg/mg]		Discrepancy in label and content (6MN for ‘Spree Bar’, NA for ‘Nixotine’)	Measured PG/VG ratio	Measured Neotame content in [µg/mg]	Measured WS-23 content in [µg/mg]	Other flavor compounds detected
		6MN	NA					
<b>‘SpreeBar’ products (labeled to contain 6MN)</b>								
Blood Orange Peach	5% = 50 µg/mg	6.42 (0.07)	n.d.	-87%	60/40	0.56 (0.03)	4.44 (0.04)	Yes
Blue Razz Ice		6.12 (0.05)	n.d.	-88%	60/40	0.86 (0.12)	16.39 (0.11)	
Creamy Melon		6.07 (0.17)	n.d.	-88%	60/40	0.21 (0.01)	5.74 (0.15)	
Pineapple Coconut		6.10 (0.04)	n.d.	-88%	60/40	0.60 (0.03)	4.47 (0.03)	
Rainbowfruit		6.23 (0.03)	n.d.	-88%	60/40	0.65 (0.02)	4.34 (0.07)	
Strawberry Apple Melon		6.41 (0.08)	n.d.	-87%	60/40	0.20 (0.02)	14.01 (0.18)	
Strawberry Mango		6.16 (0.11)	n.d.	-88%	60/40	0.25 (0.01)	9.81 (0.07)	
Sweet Spearmint		6.16 (0.07)	n.d.	-88%	55/45	0.56 (0.01)	16.18 (0.17)	
Watermelon Grape		6.28 (0.06)	n.d.	-87%	60/40	0.51 (0.11)	4.81 (0.05)	
<b>‘Nixotine’ products (labeled to contain NA)</b>								
Unflavored	0 mg/mL	n.d.	n.d.		40/60	n.d.	n.d.	No
Unflavored	12 mg/mL	0.09 (0.01)	9.74 (0.05)	-7% <sup>a</sup>	45/55	n.d.	n.d.	
Unflavored	24 mg/mL	0.13 (0.01)	14.44 (0.00)	-31% <sup>a</sup>	45/55	n.d.	n.d.	
Unflavored	36 mg/mL	0.15 (0.01)	16.63 (0.06)	-46% <sup>a</sup>	40/60	n.d.	n.d.	
Cherry	0 mg/mL	n.d.	n.d.		25/75	n.d.	n.d.	Yes
Cherry	12 mg/mL	0.06 (0.01)	8.32 (0.07)	-18% <sup>a</sup>	30/70	n.d.	n.d.	
Cherry	24 mg/mL	0.10 (0.01)	12.95 (0.04)	-35% <sup>a</sup>	25/75	n.d.	n.d.	
Cherry	36 mg/mL	0.11 (0.02)	16.47 (0.08)	-46% <sup>a</sup>	30/70	n.d.	n.d.	

<sup>a</sup> For ‘Nixotine’ products, µg/mg was converted to µg/mL using an estimated density of 1.15-1.2 g/mL based on measured PG/VG values (see eAppendix).

## Figure

