

- 1 **Full Title: Structured Expert Judgement Approach of the Health Impact of Various Chemicals and**
- 2 **Classes of Chemicals.**
- 3 **Short Title: SEJ Chemical Health Impact Assessment**
- 4
- 5 **Authors: Deniz Marti<sup>1</sup>, David Hanrahan<sup>2</sup>, Ernesto Sanchez-Triana<sup>3</sup>, Mona Wells<sup>4</sup>, Lilian Corra<sup>5</sup>,**
- 6 **Howard Hu<sup>6</sup>, Patrick N. Breyse<sup>7</sup>, Amalia Laborde<sup>8</sup>, Jack Caravanos<sup>9</sup>, Roberto Bertolini<sup>10</sup>, Kate**
- 7 **Porterfield<sup>11</sup>, Richard Fuller<sup>12</sup>.**

---

<sup>1</sup> University of Southern California, Los Angeles, California, United States of America

<sup>2</sup> Pure Earth, New York, NY, United States of America

<sup>3</sup> World Bank, Washington, DC, United States of America

<sup>4</sup> The Meadows Center for Water and the Environment, San Marcos, Texas, United States of America

<sup>5</sup> Global Alliance on Health and Pollution, Geneva, Switzerland

<sup>6</sup> University of Southern California's Keck School of Medicine, Los Angeles, California, United States of America

<sup>7</sup> Johns Hopkins' Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland, United States of America

<sup>8</sup> Republic University of Montevideo, Montevideo, Uruguay

<sup>9</sup> New York University School of Global Public Health, New York, New York, , United States of America

<sup>10</sup> SCHEER, European Commission DG Sante, Brussels, Belgium

<sup>11</sup> Pure Earth, New York, New York, United States of America

<sup>12</sup> Pure Earth, New York, New York, United States of America

8 **ABSTRACT**

9 ***Introduction***

10 Chemical contamination and pollution are an ongoing threat to human health and the environment.

11 The concern over the consequences of chemical exposures at the global level continues to grow.

12 Because resources are constrained, there is a need to prioritize interventions focused on the

13 greatest health impact. Data, especially related to chemical exposures, are rarely available for most

14 substances of concern, and alternate methods to evaluate their impact are needed.

15

16 ***Structured Expert Judgment (SEJ) Process***

17 A Structured Expert Judgment<sup>3</sup> process was performed to provide plausible estimates of health

18 impacts for 16 commonly found pollutants: asbestos, arsenic, benzene, chromium, cadmium,

19 dioxins, fluoride, highly hazardous pesticides (HHPs), lead, mercury, polycyclic-aromatic

20 hydrocarbons (PAHs), polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), Per- and Polyfluorinated Substances (PFAs),

21 phthalates, endocrine disrupting chemicals (EDCs), and brominated flame retardants (BRFs). This

22 process, undertaken by sector experts, weighed individual estimations of the probable global health

23 scale health impacts of each pollutant using objective estimates of the expert opinions' statistical

24 accuracy and informativeness.

25

26 ***Main Findings***

27 The foremost substances, in terms of mean projected annual total deaths, were lead, asbestos,

28 arsenic, and HHPs. Lead surpasses the others by a large margin, with an estimated median value of

29 1.7 million deaths annually. The three other substances averaged between 136,000 and 274,000

30 deaths per year. Of the 12 other chemicals evaluated, none reached an estimated annual death

31 count exceeding 100,000. These findings underscore the importance of prioritizing available

32 resources on reducing and remediating the impacts of these key pollutants.

33

4 Jan 2024

34 ***Range of Health Impacts***

35 Based on the evidence available, experts concluded some of the more notorious chemical pollutants,  
36 such as PCBs and dioxin, do not result in high levels of human health impact from a global scale  
37 perspective. However, the chemical toxicity of some compounds released in recent decades, such as  
38 Endocrine Disruptors and PFAs, cannot be ignored, even if current impacts are limited. Moreover,  
39 the impact of some chemicals may be disproportionately large in some geographic areas. Continued  
40 research and monitoring are essential; and a preventative approach is needed for chemicals.

41

42 ***Future Directions***

43 These results, and potential similar analyses of other chemicals, are provided as inputs to  
44 ongoing discussions about priority setting for global chemicals and pollution management.  
45 Furthermore, we suggest that this SEJ process be repeated periodically as new information becomes  
46 available.

47 **Introduction**

48 ***Chemical Pollution and Health***

49 Chemical contamination and pollution are growing threats to human health and the environment.<sup>1</sup>

50 In a pivotal acknowledgement, the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) recognized  
51 chemical pollution as a planetary crisis in 2021, placing it on a par with climate change and  
52 biodiversity loss.<sup>2</sup> This was followed by the decision of the United Nations Environment Assembly in  
53 March 2022 that a Science-Policy Panel (SPP) should be established to contribute further to the  
54 sound management of chemicals and waste and to prevent pollution.<sup>3</sup>

55

56 There are many potentially harmful chemicals already in use, and new chemicals are  
57 developed daily.<sup>4</sup> In 2020, the World Health Organization (WHO) published a list of the ‘Top Ten’  
58 chemicals of public health concern.<sup>5</sup> A great deal of work has been done to evaluate and mitigate  
59 the hazards and risks of individual chemicals by regulatory bodies in multiple jurisdictions.<sup>6,7</sup> Such  
60 research assesses the potential (hazard) and likelihood (risk) that harm might occur as a result of  
61 exposure to a chemical. However, the most important factor in terms of threats and setting priority  
62 for action is actual impact on the public. Impact describes the harm that is actually occurring, and  
63 can be estimated based on a combination of risk and exposure analysis.<sup>8</sup> While impact is often  
64 calculated in discrete circumstances, there is a lack of reliable and comparable information on large  
65 scale impacts.

66

67 The best available data on the overall health impacts of chemicals comes from the Global Burden of  
68 Disease (GBD). This database includes several chemicals as risk factors for disease and their global  
69 impacts, based on published health data.<sup>9</sup> However, coverage of chemical pollutants is limited  
70 because the necessary exposure data for many of the toxins are simply unavailable. Only  
71 occupational exposures are available for most chemicals, except lead. Therefore, an SEJ process can

72 effectively address this limitation and help overcome the lack of environmental exposure data for  
73 chemicals.<sup>10</sup> SEJ has been successfully applied in a range of relevant fields.<sup>11</sup>

74

#### 75 ***Information Gaps and Value of SEJ Process***

76 In order to address information gaps and to provide plausible estimates of global scale health

77 impacts for 16 commonly occurring pollutants, the SEJ process was used.

78

79 SEJ is a systematic and rigorous method for collecting and combining expert elicitations about the

80 information that is hard or impossible to obtain. It distinguishes from other expert elicitation

81 approaches in the sense that it incorporates a weighing system based on experts' performances. The

82 aggregation of expert elicitation involves assigning differentiated weights to each expert's

83 contribution, where these weights are calibrated based on the individual performance of the

84 experts. Such performance is assessed with respect to their statistical accuracy and informativeness.

85 First experts are asked to provide their best estimates for the variables (i.e., calibration variables)

86 within their expertise, for which true values are known. Based on their accuracy in their estimates

87 for those calibration variables, this procedure results in weights for each expert. These performance-

88 based weights that are derived from calibration processes then are used in generating a probability

89 distribution. This final combined elicitation is called decision maker (DM).

90

91 SEJ was selected to support the prioritization of chemical pollutants because of the lack of

92 comprehensive and reliable data on exposure and health impacts of many pollutants, despite the

93 widespread use of the chemicals and frequent (more or less reliable) accounts of damage or harm.

94 Much good research and analysis continues on these pollutants but the complexity of the effects

95 and the slow pace of peer-reviewed science means that plausible expert opinion has an important

96 role to play in helping to set priorities for investigation and intervention.

97

98 **Methodology and Implementation of SEJ Process**

99 The SEJ process involved nine experts who provided individual estimations of four numerical  
100 variables relating to death and disability impacts of each of 16 chemicals. This set of chemicals  
101 included metals and classes of chemicals as well as individual compounds. The selection of the  
102 chemicals to be assessed was based on a range of sources including WHO's "Chemicals of Public  
103 Health Concerns;"<sup>5</sup> relevant UN conventions;<sup>12,13,14</sup> and discussions among the project team. The  
104 experts were identified through discussions with recognized and respected researchers in these  
105 fields and they were then invited to participate. In the end, the number of nine experts who  
106 completed the whole process was close to the design ideal of ten contributors.

107

108 In the initial stage, each expert was asked separately to provide answers to a set of 17 calibration  
109 questions from the broad field of chemicals, pollution and health. These answers were subsequently  
110 used to weigh the study findings towards those respondents who provided the most accurate  
111 responses at calibration (details of the calibration and elicitation processes are provided in the  
112 Supplementary Materials).

113

114 In the following elicitation phase, experts were requested individually to provide their best  
115 estimates (at 5%, 50%, and 95% percentiles, see Supplementary Material for more detail) of  
116 premature deaths and Disability-Adjusted Life Years (DALYs) Lost (in year 2019) resulting from each  
117 of the 16 chemicals. The experts were also asked what percentage occurred in High-Income  
118 Countries (HICs) and in Low- and Middle-Income countries (LMICs). They were asked to suggest  
119 which countries were the most impacted (both LMICs and HICs) and whether the existing levels of  
120 science regarding dose-response relations and exposure levels were adequate.

121

122 The individual responses by each of the experts to all of the questions were then analyzed, taking  
123 into account the weightings derived from the calibration, and the integrated results presented  
124 (further details can be found in the Supplementary Materials).

125

## 126 **Key Findings**

127 The key findings can be summarized in the following charts and tables.

128

### 129 ***Fig 1. Premature Deaths, Performance Weighted (PW) 50% Decision Marker (DM):***

130

131 Figure 1 provides a visual representation of the estimated number of premature deaths associated with  
132 exposure to various environmental chemicals based on the performance-weighted decision maker's 50%  
133 percentile. The y-axis quantifies the number of premature deaths, while the x-axis lists the chemicals analyzed.  
134 As shown in the figure, Lead exposure remarkably accounts for the highest estimated number of premature  
135 deaths, overshadowing the impact of the other chemicals significantly. The subsequent levels of premature  
136 deaths associated with Asbestos exposure, although substantially lower than Lead. The remaining chemicals  
137 contribute to a lesser but non-negligible number of premature deaths. The tabulated form of the results is  
138 as follows:

139

140 ***Table 1. Premature Deaths (PW) by Chemical***

141

<b>Chemical</b>	<b>PW5%</b>	<b>PW50%</b>	<b>PW95%</b>
<b>Asbestos</b>	48,200	274,000	346,000
<b>Arsenic</b>	22	136,000	482,000
<b>Benzene</b>	2	3,472	6,998
<b>Cadmium</b>	3	8,327	48,900
<b>Chromium</b>	4	59,000	146,000

Dioxins	0	48	326
Fluoride	0	48	138
HHPs	142	252,000	484,000
Lead	945	1,660,000	3,230,000
Mercury	1	79,800	150,000
PAHs	9	89,900	148,000
PCBs	0	25	1,989
PFAs	0	9,460	50,000
Phthalates	0	10	14,700
EDCs	0	23,900	452,000
BFRs	0	8,591	48,600

142

143 *Note: Figures have been rounded to the nearest whole number*

144

145 ***Findings by Chemical***

146 *All estimates are performance-weighted estimates.*

147

148 ***Fig 2. The Impact of Different Chemical Exposures on Disability-Adjusted Life Years (50% Years)***

149 ***(DALYs)***

150

151

152 *Note: The chemicals causing greater than 5 million DALYs are highlighted with orange color.*

153

154 Figure 2 illustrates the health impact of various chemicals in terms of median DALYs. Lead shows the

155 highest impact, with a total of 40,500,000 DALYs. This is followed by HHPs, contributing to 9,460,000

156 DALYs. Additionally, the graph includes the DALYs associated with Fluoride and Asbestos, which are



157 4,320,000 and 4,230,000 respectively. These data provide a comparative overview of the health  
158 burdens posed by each chemical, highlighting the significant disparities in their impact.

159

160

### 161 **Asbestos (ASB)**

162 While banned in most HIC, asbestos is still mined and commonly used in many LICs as a  
163 building material and used with little personal protection.<sup>16</sup> An estimate of 274,000  
164 premature deaths, and 4,230,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to asbestos annually. Of these  
165 deaths, experts estimate 57% occur in HICs, and 43% in LMICs. 43% of experts agree that the  
166 current level of science regarding asbestos dose-response analysis is adequate; however,  
167 only 50% agree that the current level of science regarding asbestos exposure levels is  
168 adequate. Experts noted that there is inadequate data on exposures in LMICs, making the  
169 burden of disease potentially greater than current statistics indicate.

170

### 171 **Arsenic (AS)**

172 Arsenic is naturally present at high levels in the groundwater of several countries, and is  
173 used industrially as an alloying agent.<sup>17</sup> An estimate of 136,000 premature deaths, and  
174 987,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to arsenic poisoning annually. Of these deaths, experts  
175 estimate 12% occur in HICs, and 88% in LMICs. 66% of experts agree that the current level of  
176 science regarding arsenic dose-response analysis is adequate; however, 66% agree that the  
177 current level of science regarding arsenic exposure levels is inadequate, especially for LMICs.  
178 Additionally, experts stated a need for further research on arsenic's impact on  
179 cardiovascular disease.

180

### 181 **Benzene (BZ)**

4 Jan 2024

182 Benzene is produced through natural and human processes, and is used to produce  
183 lubricants, rubbers, dyes, and pesticides.<sup>18</sup> An estimate of 3,472 premature deaths, and  
184 98,800 lost DALYs, are attributed to benzene annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate  
185 31% occur in HICs, and 69% in LMICs. 100% of experts agree that the current level of science  
186 regarding benzene dose-response analysis is adequate; however, 80% agree that the current  
187 level of science regarding benzene exposure levels is inadequate.

188

### 189 **Cadmium (CD)**

190 Cadmium's primary use is in the production of batteries, alloys, coatings, and solar panels.<sup>19</sup>  
191 An estimate of 8,372 premature deaths, and 194,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to cadmium  
192 poisoning annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 2% occur in HICs, and 98% in LMICs.  
193 60% of experts agree that the current level of science regarding cadmium dose-response  
194 analysis is inadequate; and 80% agree that the current level of science regarding cadmium  
195 exposure levels is inadequate. Experts noted that there are inadequate data on cadmium  
196 exposures in LMICs, making the burden of disease potentially greater than current statistics  
197 indicate. Experts additionally stated that while the global production of cadmium at the  
198 present is relatively flat, future battery use may change this, and subsequent exposure  
199 rates.

200

### 201 **Chromium Hex (CR)**

202 Chromium is largely used in the production of stainless steel and several alloys.<sup>20</sup> An  
203 estimate of 59,000 premature deaths, and 2,930,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to  
204 hexavalent chromium exposure annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 8% occur in  
205 HICs, and 92% in LMICs. 58% of experts agree that the current level of science regarding  
206 chromium dose-response analysis is adequate; and 70% agree that the current level of  
207 science regarding chromium exposure levels is inadequate. Experts noted that data about

208 chromium's potential pathways are lacking, especially for LMICs, making the burden of  
209 disease potentially greater than current statistics indicate.

210

### 211 **Dioxins (DF)**

212 Dioxins are largely by-products of industrial practices, including smelting, chlorine bleaching,  
213 and the manufacturing of pesticides.<sup>21</sup> An estimate of less than 100 premature deaths, and  
214 901,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to dioxins annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate  
215 10% occur in HICs, and 90% in LMICs. 58% of experts agree that the current level of science  
216 regarding dioxins dose-response analysis is inadequate; and 71% agree that the current level  
217 of science regarding dioxins exposure levels is inadequate.

218

### 219 **Fluoride (FF)**

220 Fluoride's primary use is in water fluoridation to promote oral health and prevent tooth  
221 decay.<sup>22</sup> An estimate of less than 100 premature deaths, and 4,320,000 lost DALYs, are  
222 attributed to fluoride annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 15% occur in HICs, and  
223 85% in LMICs. 71% of experts agree that the current level of science regarding fluoride dose-  
224 response analysis is inadequate; and, 71% agree that the current level of science regarding  
225 fluoride exposure levels is inadequate.

226

### 227 **Highly Hazardous Pesticides (HHPs)**

228 HHPs are pesticides that cause disproportionate harm to the environment and human  
229 health.<sup>23</sup> An estimate of 252,000 premature deaths, and 9,460,000 lost DALYs, are attributed  
230 to HHPs. Of these deaths, experts estimate 15% occur in HICs, and 85% in LMICs. 57% of  
231 experts agree that the current level of science regarding HHPs dose-response analysis is  
232 adequate; however, 88% agree that the current level of science regarding HHPs exposure  
233 levels is inadequate.

234

235 **Lead (PB)**

236 Lead is used in a wide array of products, including paint, ceramics, pipes, cosmetics, spices,  
237 and batteries.<sup>24</sup> An estimate of 1,660,000 premature deaths, and 40,500,000 lost DALYs, are  
238 attributed to lead annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 5% occur in HICs, and 86% in  
239 LMICs. 86% of experts agree that the current level of science regarding lead dose-response  
240 analysis is adequate; and 71% agree that the current level of science regarding lead  
241 exposure levels is adequate.

242

243 **Mercury (HG)**

244 Mercury exists in many forms, and is a significant by-product of small-scale gold mining and  
245 other industrial processes.<sup>25</sup> An estimate of 79,800 premature deaths, and 2,950,000 lost  
246 DALYs, are attributed to mercury exposure annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 11%  
247 occur in HICs, and 88% in LMICs. 57% of experts agree that the current level of science  
248 regarding mercury dose-response analysis is adequate; however, 71% agree that the current  
249 level of science regarding mercury exposure levels is inadequate.

250

251 **Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons (PAHs)**

252 PAHs are formed by incomplete combustion of coal, oil, and gasoline, and are used in the  
253 production of dyes, plastics, and pesticides.<sup>26</sup> An estimate of 89,900 premature deaths, and  
254 1,848,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to PAHs annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate  
255 11% occur in HICs, and 85% in LMICs. 57% of experts agree that the current level of science  
256 regarding PAH dose-response analysis is adequate; however, 57% agree that the current  
257 level of science regarding PAH exposure levels is inadequate.

258

259 **Polychlorinated Biphenyls (PCBs)**

260 While the production of PCBs are banned in some countries, including the United States,  
261 their longevity allows PCBs to still be used in an array of industrial and commercial  
262 applications, including electrical equipment, plasticizers, and pigments.<sup>27</sup> An estimate of less  
263 than 100 premature deaths, and 288,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to PCBs annually. Of  
264 these deaths, experts estimate 39% occur in HICs, and 56% in LMICs. 71% of experts agree  
265 that the current level of science regarding PCB dose-response analysis is inadequate; and  
266 71% agree that the current level of science regarding PCB exposure levels is inadequate.

267

#### 268 **Polyfluorinated Substances (PFAs)**

269 PFAs are widely used in consumer products including nonstick cookware, water-repellent  
270 clothing, and stain-resistant consumer goods.<sup>28</sup> An estimate of 50,000 premature deaths,  
271 and 183,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to PFAs annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate  
272 less than one percent occur in HICs, and less than one percent in LMICs. 88% of experts  
273 agree that the current level of science regarding PFA dose-response analysis is inadequate;  
274 and 88% agree that the current level of science regarding PFA exposure levels is inadequate.

275

#### 276 **Phthalates (FH)**

277 Phthalates are mainly used as plasticizers, added to polyvinyl chloride plastics as a  
278 softener.<sup>29</sup> An estimate of less than 100 premature deaths, and 3,988 lost DALYs, are  
279 attributed to phthalates annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 53% occur in HICs, and  
280 43% in LMICs. 57% of experts agree that the current level of science regarding phthalates  
281 dose-response analysis is inadequate; and 100% agree that the current level of science  
282 regarding phthalates exposure levels is inadequate.

283

#### 284 **Endocrine Disrupting Chemicals (EDCs)**

285 ECDs are substances found in food, consumer products, as well as the environment, that  
286 disrupt hormonal systems.<sup>30</sup> An estimate of 23,900 premature deaths, and 647,000 lost  
287 DALYs, are attributed to EDCs annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 50% occur in HICs,  
288 and 50% in LMICs. 86% of experts agree that the current level of science regarding EDC  
289 dose-response analysis is inadequate; and 100% agree that the current level of science  
290 regarding EDC exposure levels is inadequate. Experts noted that there is inadequate data on  
291 exposures of EDCs, with their ultimate health impacts unclear.

292

### 293 **Brominated Flame Retardants (BFRs)**

294 BFRs are used as additives to consumer products to reduce fire-related injury and damage.<sup>31</sup>  
295 An estimate of 8,591 premature deaths, and 199,000 lost DALYs, are attributed to BFRs  
296 annually. Of these deaths, experts estimate 50% occur in HICs, and 50% in LMICs. 100% of  
297 experts agree that the current level of science regarding BFR dose-response analysis is  
298 inadequate; and 100% agree that the current level of science regarding BFR exposure levels  
299 is inadequate. Experts noted that there is inadequate data on exposures globally, making the  
300 burden of disease potentially greater than current statistics indicate.

301

302 A summary of the HICs and LMICs considered to be most impacted by each chemical, as well as their  
303 most severe pathways of exposure, can be found in the Supplementary Material.

304

### 305 ***Main findings***

306 The top four substances identified, in terms of mean estimated annual total deaths, were lead,  
307 asbestos, arsenic, and HHPs. Of these, the deaths attributed to lead were the highest by a large  
308 margin, at an estimated mean value of 1.7 million annually.

309

310 **Discussion**

311

312 This analysis estimates the impact of these chemicals on a global scale. It is critical to note,  
313 however, that these exposures are not equally distributed. As a result, certain communities may  
314 experience high exposures to some of the toxicants examined, even though the global estimates of  
315 impact are modest or low (e.g., asbestos in those countries still mining it or using it).<sup>32</sup> This study  
316 should be considered a tool for the prioritization of chemical pollutants only on a macro level, as the  
317 findings may not align with the concerns of specific towns and municipalities. Impact at local sites  
318 where toxins might cause substantial damage ought to be considered on their local evidence.  
319 Further information on countries impacted most by each chemical exposure can be found in the  
320 Supplementary Material.

321

322 In the absence of extensive empirical data on the impacts of the various substances, the judgements  
323 of the expert panel provide a reasonable basis for setting priorities for interventions to tackle the  
324 most hazardous chemicals from a global perspective.

325

326 A basic finding of the panel was that the most hazardous substances are traditional ones: lead,  
327 asbestos and arsenic, along with HHPs. This is clearly due in part to the very widespread use of these  
328 substances and their persistence in the environment. The prominence of these substances may  
329 reflect familiarity with their hazards, but considerable data exist on the scale of their impact.

330

331 Multilateral Environmental Agreements (MEAs) exist for only a few of these chemicals, notably  
332 mercury (Minamata Convention)<sup>13</sup> and HHPs (Stockholm Convention).<sup>14</sup> Others are the concern of  
333 the Global Chemicals Framework, or the Strategic Approach to International Chemicals Management  
334 (SAICM).<sup>33</sup>

335

4 Jan 2024

336 Some chemicals considered to have high political priority, such as PFAS and Phthalates, were not  
337 estimated to be among those chemicals with the highest impacts. Additionally, chemicals that have  
338 had considerable past attention (dioxins, PCBs) were similarly estimated as having low impacts. In  
339 this context, history has shown that chemicals for which risk is newly established gather a great deal  
340 of regulatory attention, and enforcement of these regulations can substantially mitigate exposure  
341 and impact. It is also worth noting that while regulatory action is more common in high-income  
342 countries, and chemical regulatory enforcement is typically lax in low and middle-income  
343 countries,<sup>34</sup> expert assessments were taken at a global level. Nevertheless, one would expect that  
344 strong attention to one particular class of chemicals would flow over into work at a global level.

345

346 The impact for lead is much higher than previous estimates from IHME but is considerably lower  
347 than a recent Lancet paper, which estimates 5.5 million deaths for 2019,<sup>35</sup> a datum point that was  
348 not provided to the experts as publication post-dated the elicitation process. It is worth noting that  
349 lead has only recently resurged as an issue of note, as international response to lead has been  
350 minimal since the phase out of lead in gasoline. The burden of disease estimates for lead indicates it  
351 to be larger than that of HIV/AIDS, malaria, etc.

352

353 The moral here is that old but well-known risks are still the largest we face. They have partly been  
354 forgotten as the world has turned its attention to plastics and PFAs. Prioritization of pollution control  
355 efforts within the UN system and other international aid efforts ought to be focused on those  
356 chemicals with the largest impact, and not only those chemicals that garner the most attention. The  
357 significant amount of action by industry and NGO groups on favorite chemicals issues will make this  
358 very difficult to put into practice. In view of the current knowledge gaps, it is important not to lose  
359 sight of the uncertainties expressed in Table 1. For example EDC's median value for premature  
360 deaths (23,900) does place it among the top risks but its 95% value (432,000) reminds us to keep an  
361 eye on it, as its risk level could change as more knowledge is gained.



362

363 Despite efforts such as this panel to quantify impacts from hazardous chemicals, many uncertainties  
364 persist, which should guide future research requirements. The logic of precautionary approaches to  
365 emerging chemicals concerns, and ought to be sound, followed regardless of expert opinion on  
366 impact.

367

368

### 369 **Supplemental Material**

370 The Supplementary Material includes: SEJ Methodology, calibration variables, expert information,  
371 and performance weights. Datasheets and sample elicitations are available upon request.

372

373

374 **Acknowledgements:** Special thanks to Roger Cooke at Resources for the Future ([cooke@rff.org](mailto:cooke@rff.org)) and  
375 Tina Nane at T.U. Delft ([g.f.nane@tudelft.nl](mailto:g.f.nane@tudelft.nl)) for their contributions to this manuscript.

376

### 377 **References**

- 378 1. Fuller, R., Landrigan, P. J., Balakrishnan, K., Bathan, G., Bose-O'Reilly, S., Brauer, M.,  
379 Caravanos, J., Chiles, T., Cohen, A., Corra, L., Cropper, M., Ferraro, G., Hanna, J., Hanrahan,  
380 D., Hu, H., Hunter, D., Janata, G., Kupka, R., Lanphear, B., ... Yan, C. (2022). Pollution and  
381 health: A progress update. *The Lancet Planetary Health*, 6(6).  
382 [https://doi.org/10.1016/s2542-5196\(22\)00090-0](https://doi.org/10.1016/s2542-5196(22)00090-0)
- 383 2. Making peace with nature [Internet]. United Nations Environment Programme; 2021 [cited  
384 2024 Jan 8]. Available from: <https://www.unep.org/resources/making-peace-nature>

- 385 3. Ad hoc open-ended Working Group on a science-policy panel on chemicals, waste and  
386 pollution prevention [Internet]. United Nations Environment Programme; 2022 [cited 2024  
387 Jan 8]. Available from: <https://www.unep.org/oewg-spp-chemicals-waste-pollution>
- 388 4. Chemical [Internet]. United Nations Environment Programme; 2023 [cited 2024 Jan 8].  
389 Available from: [https://www.unep.org/beatpollution/forms-](https://www.unep.org/beatpollution/forms-pollution/chemical#:~:text=Global%20chemical%20sales%20are%20projected,disruption%20and%20other%20grave%20illnesses.)  
390 [pollution/chemical#:~:text=Global%20chemical%20sales%20are%20projected,disruption%20and%20other%20grave%20illnesses.](https://www.unep.org/beatpollution/forms-pollution/chemical#:~:text=Global%20chemical%20sales%20are%20projected,disruption%20and%20other%20grave%20illnesses.)
- 391  
392 5. 10 chemicals of Public Health Concern [Internet]. World Health Organization; 2020 [cited  
393 2024 Jan 8]. Available from: [https://www.who.int/news-room/photo-story/photo-story-](https://www.who.int/news-room/photo-story/photo-story-detail/10-chemicals-of-public-health-concern)  
394 [detail/10-chemicals-of-public-health-concern](https://www.who.int/news-room/photo-story/photo-story-detail/10-chemicals-of-public-health-concern)
- 395 6. Chemicals, pesticides and toxics topics | US EPA [Internet]. Environmental Protection Agency  
396 ; 2023 [cited 2024 Jan 8]. Available from: [https://www.epa.gov/environmental-](https://www.epa.gov/environmental-topics/chemicals-pesticides-and-toxics-topics)  
397 [topics/chemicals-pesticides-and-toxics-topics](https://www.epa.gov/environmental-topics/chemicals-pesticides-and-toxics-topics)
- 398 7. Chemicals [Internet]. European Environment Agency; 2023 [cited 2024 Jan 8]. Available  
399 from: <https://www.eea.europa.eu/en/topics/in-depth/chemicals>
- 400 8. Fuller R, Hanrahan D, Sanchez-Triana E, Potočník J, Watson R. Guest editorial: Focusing on  
401 what matters most—impact. *Environmental Health Perspectives*. 2023;131(9).  
402 doi:10.1289/ehp12923
- 403 9. Global burden of disease (GBD) [Internet]. IHME; 2024 [cited 2024 Jan 24]. Available from:  
404 <https://www.healthdata.org/research-analysis/gbd>
- 405 10. Cooke RM. Experts in uncertainty. 1991; doi:10.1093/oso/9780195064650.001.0001
- 406 11. Structured expert judgment using the Classical Method [Internet]. Research Outreach; 2021  
407 [cited 2024 Jan 24]. Available from: [https://researchoutreach.org/articles/structured-expert-](https://researchoutreach.org/articles/structured-expert-judgment-using-classical-method/#:~:text=Throughout%20the%20three%20decades%20since,safety%2C%20environment%2C%20and%20ecology.)  
408 [judgment-using-classical-](https://researchoutreach.org/articles/structured-expert-judgment-using-classical-method/#:~:text=Throughout%20the%20three%20decades%20since,safety%2C%20environment%2C%20and%20ecology.)  
409 [method/#:~:text=Throughout%20the%20three%20decades%20since,safety%2C%20environ-](https://researchoutreach.org/articles/structured-expert-judgment-using-classical-method/#:~:text=Throughout%20the%20three%20decades%20since,safety%2C%20environment%2C%20and%20ecology.)  
410 [ment%2C%20and%20ecology.](https://researchoutreach.org/articles/structured-expert-judgment-using-classical-method/#:~:text=Throughout%20the%20three%20decades%20since,safety%2C%20environment%2C%20and%20ecology.)

4 Jan 2024

- 411 12. Basel Convention on the control of Transboundary Movements of Hazardous Wastes  
412 [Internet]. United Nations Environment Programme; 2011 [cited 2024 Jan 8]. Available from:  
413 [https://www.unep.org/resources/report/basel-convention-control-transboundary-](https://www.unep.org/resources/report/basel-convention-control-transboundary-movements-hazardous-wastes)  
414 [movements-hazardous-wastes](https://www.unep.org/resources/report/basel-convention-control-transboundary-movements-hazardous-wastes)
- 415 13. Minamata Convention on Mercury [Internet]. United Nations; 2013 [cited 2024 Jan 8].  
416 Available from: [https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg\\_no=XXVII-](https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=XXVII-17&chapter=27&clang=_en)  
417 [17&chapter=27&clang=\\_en](https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=IND&mtdsg_no=XXVII-17&chapter=27&clang=_en)
- 418 14. Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants (POPs) [Internet]. United Nations  
419 Environment Programme; 2001 [cited 2024 Jan 8]. Available from:  
420 [https://chm.pops.int/theconvention/overview/textoftheconvention/tabid/2232/default.asp](https://chm.pops.int/theconvention/overview/textoftheconvention/tabid/2232/default.aspx)  
421 [x](https://chm.pops.int/theconvention/overview/textoftheconvention/tabid/2232/default.aspx)
- 422 15. The strategic approach to International Chemicals Management (SAICM) [Internet]. United  
423 Nations Environment Programme; 2020 [cited 2024 Jan 8]. Available from:  
424 [https://www.unep.org/resources/factsheet/strategic-approach-international-chemicals-](https://www.unep.org/resources/factsheet/strategic-approach-international-chemicals-management-saicm)  
425 [management-saicm](https://www.unep.org/resources/factsheet/strategic-approach-international-chemicals-management-saicm)
- 426 16. Penn Medicine. (2024). *What is Asbestos?*. Pennmedicine.org.  
427 [https://www.pennmedicine.org/cancer/types-of-cancer/mesothelioma/causes-risks-](https://www.pennmedicine.org/cancer/types-of-cancer/mesothelioma/causes-risks-prevention/what-is-asbestos)  
428 [prevention/what-is-asbestos](https://www.pennmedicine.org/cancer/types-of-cancer/mesothelioma/causes-risks-prevention/what-is-asbestos)
- 429 17. Arsenic [Internet]. World Health Organization; 2022 [cited 2024 Jan 22]. Available from:  
430 [https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-](https://www.who.int/news-room/factsheets/detail/arsenic#:~:text=Arsenic%20is%20used%20industrially%20as,pesticides%2C%20feed%20additives%20and%20pharmaceutical)  
431 [sheets/detail/arsenic#:~:text=Arsenic%20is%20used%20industrially%20as,pesticides%2C%2](https://www.who.int/news-room/factsheets/detail/arsenic#:~:text=Arsenic%20is%20used%20industrially%20as,pesticides%2C%20feed%20additives%20and%20pharmaceutical)  
432 [Ofeed%20additives%20and%20pharmaceutical](https://www.who.int/news-room/factsheets/detail/arsenic#:~:text=Arsenic%20is%20used%20industrially%20as,pesticides%2C%20feed%20additives%20and%20pharmaceutical)
- 433 18. Benzene [Internet]. National Cancer Institute; 2022 [cited 2024 Jan 22]. Available from:  
434 <https://www.cancer.gov/about-cancer/causes-prevention/risk/substances/benzene>
- 435 19. Cadmium [Internet]. OSHA; 2024 [cited 2024 Jan 22]. Available from:  
436 <https://www.osha.gov/cadmium>

- 437 20. Chromium [Internet]. Royal Society of Chemistry; 2024 [cited 2024 Jan 22]. Available from:  
438 [https://www.rsc.org/periodic-](https://www.rsc.org/periodic-table/element/24/chromium#:~:text=Chromium%20is%20used%20to%20harden,polished%20mirror%20finish%20to%20steel.)  
439 [table/element/24/chromium#:~:text=Chromium%20is%20used%20to%20harden,polished%](https://www.rsc.org/periodic-table/element/24/chromium#:~:text=Chromium%20is%20used%20to%20harden,polished%20mirror%20finish%20to%20steel.)  
440 [20mirror%20finish%20to%20steel.](https://www.rsc.org/periodic-table/element/24/chromium#:~:text=Chromium%20is%20used%20to%20harden,polished%20mirror%20finish%20to%20steel.)
- 441 21. Dioxins [Internet]. World Health Organization; 2024 [cited 2024 Jan 22]. Available from:  
442 [https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/dioxins-and-their-effects-on-human-](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/dioxins-and-their-effects-on-human-health)  
443 [health](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/dioxins-and-their-effects-on-human-health)
- 444 22. Aoun A, Darwiche F, Hayek SA, Doumit J. The fluoride debate: The pros and cons of  
445 fluoridation. *Preventive Nutrition and Food Science*. 2018;23(3):171–80.  
446 doi:10.3746/pnf.2018.23.3.171
- 447 23. Highly hazardous pesticides (hhps) [Internet]. United Nations Environment Programme;  
448 2024 [cited 2024 Jan 22]. Available from: [https://www.unep.org/explore-topics/chemicals-](https://www.unep.org/explore-topics/chemicals-waste/what-we-do/emerging-issues/highly-hazardous-pesticides-hhps)  
449 [waste/what-we-do/emerging-issues/highly-hazardous-pesticides-hhps](https://www.unep.org/explore-topics/chemicals-waste/what-we-do/emerging-issues/highly-hazardous-pesticides-hhps)
- 450 24. Dignam T, Kaufmann RB, LeSturgeon L, Brown MJ. Control of lead sources in the United  
451 States, 1970-2017: Public health progress and current challenges to eliminating lead  
452 exposure. *Journal of Public Health Management and Practice*. 2019;25(1).  
453 doi:10.1097/phh.0000000000000889
- 454 25. Mercury and Health [Internet]. World Health Organization; 2017 [cited 2024 Jan 22].  
455 Available from: <https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/mercury-and-health>
- 456 26. Polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (pahs) factsheet [Internet]. Centers for Disease Control  
457 and Prevention; 2022 [cited 2024 Jan 24]. Available from:  
458 [https://www.cdc.gov/biomonitoring/PAHs\\_FactSheet.html](https://www.cdc.gov/biomonitoring/PAHs_FactSheet.html)
- 459 27. Polychlorinated Biphenyls [Internet]. Environmental Protection Agency; 2023 [cited 2024 Jan  
460 24]. Available from: <https://www.epa.gov/pcbs/learn-about-polychlorinated-biphenyls>
- 461 28. Perfluoroalkyl and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) [Internet]. U.S. Department of Health  
462 and Human Services; 2023 [cited 2024 Jan 24]. Available from:

- 463 <https://www.niehs.nih.gov/health/topics/agents/pfc#:~:text=They%20are%20ingredients%20in%20various,linked%20carbon%20and%20fluorine%20atoms>.
- 464
- 465 29. Wang Y, Qian H. Phthalates and their impacts on human health. *Healthcare*. 2021 May
- 466 18;9(5):603. doi:10.3390/healthcare9050603
- 467 30. Diamanti-Kandarakis E, Bourguignon J-P, Giudice LC, Hauser R, Prins GS, Soto AM, et al.
- 468 Endocrine-disrupting chemicals: An endocrine society scientific statement. *Endocrine*
- 469 *Reviews*. 2009 Jun 1;30(4):293–342. doi:10.1210/er.2009-0002
- 470 31. Birnbaum LS, Staskal DF. Brominated flame retardants: Cause for concern? *Environmental*
- 471 *Health Perspectives*. 2004 Jan;112(1):9–17. doi:10.1289/ehp.6559
- 472 32. Chen J, Wang C, Zhang J, Zhang T, Liang H, Mao S, et al. A comparative study of the disease
- 473 burden attributable to asbestos in Brazil, China, Kazakhstan, and Russia between 1990 and
- 474 2019. *BMC Public Health*. 2022 Nov 3;22(1). doi:10.1186/s12889-022-14437-6
- 475 33. Global best practices on emerging chemical policy issues of concern under SAICM [Internet].
- 476 SAICM; 2023 [cited 2024 Jan 8]. Available from:
- 477 [https://saicmknowledge.org/projects/global-best-practices-emerging-chemical-policy-](https://saicmknowledge.org/projects/global-best-practices-emerging-chemical-policy-issues-concern-under-saicm)
- 478 [issues-concern-under-saicm](https://saicmknowledge.org/projects/global-best-practices-emerging-chemical-policy-issues-concern-under-saicm)
- 479 34. Bouwman H. GEF guidance on emerging chemicals management ... [Internet]. Global
- 480 Environmental Facility; 2012 [cited 2024 Jan 24]. Available from:
- 481 [https://www.thegef.org/sites/default/files/publications/GEF\\_Guidance\\_on\\_Emerging\\_Chem](https://www.thegef.org/sites/default/files/publications/GEF_Guidance_on_Emerging_Chemicals-Full-Report_0.pdf)
- 482 [icals-Full-Report\\_0.pdf](https://www.thegef.org/sites/default/files/publications/GEF_Guidance_on_Emerging_Chemicals-Full-Report_0.pdf)
- 483 35. Larsen B, Sánchez-Triana E. Global health burden and cost of lead exposure in children and
- 484 adults: A health impact and economic modelling analysis. *The Lancet Planetary Health*.
- 485 2023;7(10). doi:10.1016/s2542-5196(23)00166-3
- 486 36. Eggstaff JW, Mazzuchi TA, Sarkani S. The effect of the number of seed variables on the
- 487 performance of Cooke's classical model. *Reliability Engineering & System Safety*.
- 488 2014;121:72–82. doi:10.1016/j.ress.2013.07.015

4 Jan 2024

- 489           37. Colson AR, Cooke RM. Cross validation for the classical model of structured expert judgment.  
490                    Reliability Engineering & System Safety. 2017;163:109–20.  
491                    doi:10.1016/j.res.2017.02.003
- 492           38. Cooke RM. Averaging quantiles, variance shrinkage, and overconfidence. FUTURES &  
493                    FORESIGHT SCIENCE. 2022;5(1). doi:10.1002/ffo2.139
- 494



