

Supplementary File A5: Table of included study characteristics

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author ¹ (year)		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison Groups ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical Framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	Pre / post Measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Alphert et al. (2021) ²⁸	"To assess perceived student engagement & educational value of a new remote clinical radiology learning environment" p113	[1] 2 nd & 3 rd year Medical students (on a Radiology rotation)	[1] Conventional placement comparator group. Completed the in person course (mostly observing) within 6 months prior to the pandemic (n=36)	[1] Not specified	Describing salient findings of images and working towards a diagnosis	Quantitative questionnaire	[1] Choice of 4 VRO specialties from: abdominal, breast, chest, emergency, musculoskeletal, neuroradiology & paediatric imaging	[1] Webex, broadcasting Picture archiving and communication systems (PACS) workstations	Student experience:	87.2% & 75% response rates in grp 1 (VRO) & 2 (in person). Educational value was comparable & interaction ratings were slightly higher in Grp 1: Perceived a more active role = 3.95(0.77), grp 2 =3.41(0.97) p=0.01. Reported less boredom = 1.93(0.47), grp 2 = 2.41(0.8) p=0.007 Confidence using the PACS was higher in grp 2 = 4.04(0.98), grp 1=2.3(1.16) p=0.0001	Remote clinical radiology education can achieve a similar experience in fewer contact hours. An advantage is the potential to standardise the education and provide a variety of images A disadvantage is the lack of a full PACS workstation and socialisation with colleagues	Not Stated
[2] USA		[2] 83	[2] Not mentioned	[2] VROs of curated cases Online didactic & small group sessions.			[2] Screen based	Perceived sense of involvement, technical limitations & educational value of the learning experience				
[3] Academic Radiology		[2] 83	[2] post-test measures compared	[3] 4 weeks								

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Bhashyam and Dyer (2020) ²⁹	To create a learning platform to allow PGY-1 residents to develop basic orthopaedic knowledge & skills for emergency care & progress from basic to more advanced surgical procedures.	[1] Post graduate year one medical residents on an orthopaedic rotation	[1] Single group	[1] 1 x chief resident 1x program director 2x program coordinators	Cognitive knowledge and skill development	Quantitative questionnaire	[1] Basic skills/hand, sport, trauma & arthroplasty. 11 surgical techniques outlined	[1] Zoom	Student satisfaction	100% were satisfied with the overall experience, module format, take home kits, helping their knowledge base & skill set. 92% felt it improved preparation for the operating room. Total cost per module per student is \$1745	Described a successful conversion of an in person placement to a virtual boot camp. This could be modified according to local policy, use with cadavers and VR when the technology becomes affordable	Not stated
[2] USA			[2] Post-test design					A central repository for pre-recorded lectures	Cost (total, start-up and recurring)			
[3] Journal of the American Academy of Orthopaedic Surgeons		[2] 12		[2] Problem based learning was encouraged, given the evidence for benefit to adult learners			[2] Readings, videos, lectures & case "walk throughs." Videoconference demos & informal feedback on surgical skills	[2] Screen based and use of home practice kits for surgical skills				
							[3] 4 weeks					
[1] Creagh et al. (2021) ³⁰	"To meet the academic needs of medical students while providing a safe environment during the pandemic. ...To improve the residents' ability to teach." p420	[1] 3 rd year Medical Students (on a radiology rotation)	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	Image interpretation	Quantitative methods to compare test scores and student evaluations	[1] Abdominal & spinal imaging. X-ray interpretation Women's health Interventional radiography.	[1] Aquifer (subscription based services)	Student performance assessed with the AMSER (or ACR STARS) exam.	Mean AMSER score was 75% (range 50–96%), matched the national average of 75%, t(40) = -0.14868, p = .88.	Student performance was in line with other courses on a national standardised examination.	Supported by HCA Healthcare
[2] USA			[2] Post-test design	[2] Founded on the principles of andragogy:	Patient care & safety			Zoom				No conflicts of interest
[3] Clinical Imaging		[2] 41		Giving greater control over students' own education.	Resource utilisation		[2] Reading materials, lectures, modules American College of Radiography (ACR) e-learning 'Hot seat' sessions OSCE style sessions Conferences / tumour board meetings Grand rounds presentations	Webex	Evaluations on the content and structure.	Positive feedback on the content, structure, engagement & time efficiency	The approach demonstrates the effectiveness of virtual radiology clerkships as viable alternatives to onsite rotations	
				Emphasis on problem-centred / experiential learning for relevance	Insight into the field			[2] Screen based		Improvement in knowledge, leadership skills, search patterns & presenting findings		
					Differential diagnosis							
					Presentation and teaching skills							
							[3] 4 weeks					

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country				Pedagogical framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] De Ponti et al. (2020) ³¹	"To assess medical students' perception on fully online training including simulated clinical scenarios during COVID-19 pandemic." p1	[1] 6 th year Medical students (Medicine & Surgery rotation)	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	Clinical history taking,	Quantitative questionnaire	[1] 21 simulated cases: 7 Cardiovascular & cerebrovascular cases	[1] Body Interact	Student satisfaction	115 (94%) response rate	The online training avoided interruption to placements and the majority of participants gave a positive response (although a proportion reported technical difficulties)	None
[2] Italy			[2] Post-test design	[2] Not mentioned	Clinical decision making: ordering physical examination, laboratory /imaging tests and interventions		6 Trauma cases 2 Pneumonia cases 2 Infective disorder in pregnancy 2 Gastrointestinal surgery cases 1 Nephrological case 1 Hypoglycaemia case	Microsoft Teams	Student feedback questionnaire	90% gave a positive evaluation 93% appreciated the format 77% rated the VR realistic for the initial assessment, the diagnostic activity (94%) & treatment options (81%). 84% considered it useful for future hybrid training. 28% had technical issues with online access.		
[3] BMC Medical Education		[2] 122						[2] Introduction (to the case & software), virtual patient based training, debriefing [3] 42 hours (21x 2hr)	[2] Screen based			
[1] Durfee et al. (2020) ³²	"Describe the design and the logistical challenges involved in structuring a virtual radiology clerkship and assess its efficacy." p1462	[1] Medical students in a radiology rotation	[1] Single group	[1] The clerkship directors from three hospitals	Patient and safety centred focus	Quantitative student scores and questionnaires	[1] 19 Aquifer modules (no detail of the cases provided)	[1] Aquifer	Student performance on the AMSER exam	AMSER scores averaged 85% (64-95%): comparable to the in person course.	The virtual radiology core clerkship was a successful educational experience for medical students. Students enjoyed the small group homerooms, although personal connections were challenging	None stated
[2] USA			[2] Post-test design	[2] Not mentioned	Image utilisation, interpretation and generation of a differential diagnoses		[2] Large group didactic lectures Small group homeroom activities: Topic of the day (flipped classroom) and an unknown case conference (readout session)	Zoom	Student feedback	50% response rate: 100% rated the course overall as good/excellent.		
[3] Academic Radiology		[2] 111						[2] Screen based		Suggested improvements commonly related to the didactic lectures		

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹		Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Fehl et al. (2022) ³³	To provide students an insight into general practice with its particularities regarding patient clientele, spatial conditions and economic and organisational structure despite the lack of physical presence" p2	[1] 4 th year Medical students (in GP practice)	[1] Conventional clerkship group (n=277)	[1] Not specified	Higher-order thinking	Mixed: Surveys generated quantitative & qualitative data which were analysed separately	[1]SOAP cases: gout, acute vertigo, sore throat, hypertension check-up, acute burning on urination, subacute chest pain, geriatric home visit meds review, vaccination, prolonged cough & acute back pain	[1] Student portal Email Video chat Telephone calls (optional) [2] Screen based Phone	Working enjoyment Learning gain Practical relevance Insight into GP work Usage behaviours (devices & chosen teaching formats). Open questions: 'What did they like about the virtual clerkship?' 'What could be improved?'	51.6% response rate for group 1 & 100% for group 2. Group 1: 87.9% enjoyed it 89.9% learned a lot, 76.8% gained practical insights 90.9% perceived high practical relevance. 65.6% welcomed this format into future clerkships. 89% laptop usage. Clinical cases, videos, visual diagnosis and communication with the GP teachers were valued the most. Students recommended an increase in clinical case content.	Students welcomed the digital clerkship. The flexible time management, structure & multifaceted learning content were valued. It rated comparably to face to face (FTF) learning overall, but online was considered better for teaching theoretical rather than practical skills FTF GP clerkships may benefit from complementing online teaching, in a blended approach.	None
[2] Germany		[2] 192	[2] Post-test comparison of student evaluations	[2] Principles of 'good online teaching' i.e. clear learning objectives matching the curriculum, synchronous /asynchronous teacher-student interaction, promotion of higher-order thinking & communication skills, encouragement of active & self-directed learning while promoting timely completion of tasks & effective time management	Communication skills		[2] 10 SOAP cases partly linked with physical examination videos / materials to learn about general practice. Visual diagnosis from images Live video chats with GP teachers					
[3] Medical Education Online							[3] 2 weeks					

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Included ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Ganji et al. (2022) ³⁴	To determine the effect of a virtual gynaecology clinic training programme on the knowledge and clinical skills of midwifery students	[1] Midwifery interns on a Gynaecology rotation	[1] Single group	[1] Research team and midwifery experts (faculty members & senior lecturers). Students were consulted via an educational needs interview	Knowledge Clinical skills in Interview & history taking Problem evaluation Clinical judgement Problem assessment/ management	Reports on the quantitative part of a mixed methods study	[1] 27 cases including genital infections, abnormal bleeding, menopause, ovarian cysts & abnormal smears	[1] Navid – Learning management system (LMS) WhatsApp Adobe connect [2] Screen based	Knowledge Skills: Modified Mini- CEX - rated over 4 virtual cases. Student satisfaction on a scale of 1-9	Knowledge scores pre & post learning were 10.0 ± 1.74 & 13.80 ± 1.43, p < 0.001. Post-training scores improved from satisfactory to excellent for clinical judgment, consultation efficiency & clinical competence. Interview scores increased but remained in the satisfactory range.	Training through virtual clinic promoted the knowledge & clinical skills of midwifery interns. A virtual clinic may be used in crisis situations & in combination with teaching under normal circumstances by strengthening the infrastructure & removing barriers.	Financially supported by the university. No conflict of interest
[2] Iran		[2] 47	[2] Repeated measures design	[2] ADDIE model: (Analysis Design Development Implementation Evaluation)			[2] Multiple choice Webinars, Videos Cases with questions regarding interview, diagnoses & treatment.					
[3] Nurse Education Today							[3] Not stated but 2 days were allocated for each of the 4 stages of the cases					
[1] Gomez et al (2021) ³⁵	To rapidly convert to an in-person diagnostic radiology elective to a remote learning experience.	[1] 2 nd , 3 rd & 4 th year Medical students (Radiology rotation)	[1] Single group	[1] Course directors	Knowledge Skills in identifying normal anatomy and common pathology	Mixed data in the survey responses	[1] Not specified	[1] Pacsbin (image library) Education websites & modules Zoom Nearpod PowerPoint Microsoft & Google forms Microsoft Teams Blackboard [2] Screen based	Learner achievement (via completion of quizzes) Final exam (modified to reflect the altered course content) Enrolment metrics Student feedback	100% pass rate Largely positive feedback & gratitude for the opportunity to continue learning Recommended more, small group learning, interactive / reflective content, trainee led teaching & shorter days	The current state of technology makes radiology particularly well suited for distance learning, & with the proper tools and approaches, effective remote radiology instruction can be achieved.	None mentioned
[2] USA			[2] Post-test design	[2] Not mentioned			[2] Interactive cases. Readouts & Hot seat cases Quizzes & jeopardy Website resources Zoom chats Q&A Narrated PowerPoint student submissions Journal club discussion					
[3] Academic Radiology		[2] 116					[3] 3 weeks					

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] He et al. (2021) ³⁶	To examine the effect of an online neurology course & whether it can cater for interns from different programs.	[1] Medical interns (on a neurology rotation)	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	Practical skills (New patient admission, physical exam & medical record writing).	Quantitative	[1] Nervous system, Cardiopulmonary resuscitation & Lumbar puncture	[1] Tencent class (live broadcast platform).	Final exam scores	100% response rate & consistent positive ratings	The neurology training course was effective and was highly rated by the interns.	Funding from: Central South University. National Natural Science Foundation of China. Huxiang High-Level Talent Gathering Project.
[2] China			[2] Post-test design with subgroup analysis by:	[2] Not mentioned	Theoretical knowledge		[2] Small private online courses (SPOC). Didactic, flipped classroom & case based learning. Videos of ward rounds, typical clinical cases & difficult case discussions. Interactive case discussions /conferences & reading	WeChat group (for shared files)	Student evaluation	99% recommended incorporating the course into future programmes.		
[3] Medical education online	Whether group size has an impact. To analyse how it can be refined.	[2] 92	Programme enrolment (3 groups) Intake (6 groups)				[2] Screen based	PowerPoint		No difference in test scores between programs (p < 0.05)		No conflicts of interest
							[3] 3 weeks			Students groups < 15 had a better learning experience (p < 0.05)		
										Interactive discussions & analysis were rated highest.		
[1] Holmberg et al. (2021) ³⁷	To deliver essential elements of the sub-internship virtually and to address limited teaching faculty availability	[1] 4 th year Medical students on an internal medicine sub-internship	[1] Single group	[1] Clerkship directors, course director, recent graduates of the in-person course (4 senior medical students - near peers)	Order-writing Communication Clinical reasoning Using medical literature Admitting a patient, cross overs & handoffs	Mixed data in the survey responses	[1] Not specified	[1] Zoom	Student experience	All self-rated competencies demonstrated significant improvement except the describing how to efficiently admit a patient (didn't reach statistical significance).	Our findings and our experiences with the virtual sub-internship suggest that a virtual sub-internship can be a high quality educational experience	None
[2] USA			[2] Repeated measures design	[2] Not mentioned			[2] Orientation & debrief. Student presentations Interactive lectures Small-group discussions Case-based faculty led/peer teaching Role-play Resident report	[2] Screen based	5 self-rated competencies	The extent to which the course accomplished its learning objectives		
[3] Academic Medicine		[2] 10			Independent learning		[3] 4 weeks			Open-ended responses indicated initial skepticism, but the course exceeded expectations.		

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison groups ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical Framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Joung and Kang (2022) ³⁸	Investigate the potential of VS-based education as an alternative for clinical psychiatric nurse training & consider how it can be optimised as an educational method	[1] 4 th year Nursing Students (Psychiatry rotation)	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	The transfer of intrinsic nursing values such as empathy.	Qualitative	[1] Schizophrenia, bipolar disorder, anxiety disorder and depressive disorder	[1] vSim for Nursing Video conferencing software	Focus Groups	3 key themes: 1. Students were glad that the patients were not real people 2. vSim serving as a bridge between the text & real world 3. Supplementations needed for vSims to replace clinical practice	vSim was recognised as a tool linking theory with actual clinical practical training. Students were able to repeat practice to solve problems and work in a safe environment but were unable to have real human experiences.	No funding or conflict of interest
[2] South Korea			[2] Post-test design	[2] Not mentioned			[2] vSim sessions, team conferences with an instructor	[2] Screen based				
[3] Issues in Mental Health Nursing		[2] 20					[3] 90 hours over 10 days					
[1] Kasai et al. (2021) ³⁹	To evaluate the feasibility & effectiveness of this approach. To identify the advantages & disadvantages of online-simulated clinical placement (sCP) from the medical students' perspectives	[1] 5 th year Medical students on a respiratory unit & general medicine rotation	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	History taking Diagnosis Select tests & interpret results Treatment planning Medical documentation & present the clinical course Perform safe, evidence based treatment Informed consent & patient education	Mixed	[1] General medicine outpatient cases & respiratory inpatient cases [2] Simulated electronic & health records (sEHR) electronic-Practice Based Learning (e-PBL) Online virtual medical interviews (VMI)	[1] Video conference system Learning management system (LMS) Microsoft excel [2] Screen based	Self-evaluation of clinical performance Semi structured focus groups	100% response rate Online sCP is an efficient learning method & useful for learning how to write medical records & summaries Clinical clerkship was more useful for learning associated with medical interviews, physical examination & humanistic qualities eg. professionalism	Online-sCP with sEHR, e-PBL, and online-VMI could be useful in learning some of the clinical skills acquired through clinical clerkship.	None
[2] Japan			[2] Repeated measures design	[2] Peer assisted learning applied to problem based learning								
[3] BMC Medical Education		[2] 43					[3] 4 weeks					

Citation	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical Frameworks ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Kubin et al. (2021) ⁴⁰	To develop an innovative revised plan for facilitation of clinical learning experiences in the virtual learning environment.	[1] Nursing students on a Paediatric Rotation	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	Nursing process	Mixed: Survey with Likert & open ended questions	[1] Various paediatric disorders. Child with diabetic ketoacidosis was used in the escape room	[1] vSim NurseThink vClinical	Student satisfaction.	100% response rate	Virtual activities can be as effective as in-person clinical learning methodologies. Integrating virtual activities into clinical curricula can be a viable option, especially in areas where clinical placement is limited	Not stated
[2] USA			[2] Post-test design	[2] International	Growth and development		[2] Virtual escape rooms, unfolding video case studies, & blended prioritisation simulations.	F.A. Davis' Paediatric Interactive Clinical Scenarios	Evaluations pf each clinical activity and the ability to meet course outcomes	Self-reported increases in clinical reasoning, prioritisation, communication and critical thinking skills.		
[3] Journal of Nursing Education		[2] Not stated (taught in small groups of 5-10)		[2] Simulation and Learning (INACSL) best practice guidelines	Assessment		Clinical judgment & reasoning skills	Virtual Healthcare Experience				
					Prioritisation & delegation		[3] Not stated	Flipgrid				
					Communication skills.			Google Forms & Sites				
								[2] Screen based				
[1] Luo et al. (2021) ⁴¹	To understand students' performance, learning effectiveness & satisfaction with their participation in distance learning. To compare outcomes between genders	[1] 4 th year Nursing students	[1] Single group	[1] Nursing educators from the University	Pass the 2020 Chinese Registered Nurse Licensure Exam	Quantitative	[1] Medical, surgical, obstetrics & gynaecology, paediatrics, fundamental nursing	[1]Videoconferencing platforms (Tencent Meeting & Ding Talk)	Theoretical knowledge	100% response rate	Distance learning combining webinars & virtual simulations could meet the learning requirements of senior nursing students in a safe environment in a flexible manner, & students could obtain theoretical knowledge & grow their clinical thinking ability	Funded by Wuhan University Teaching & Research reform Project. No conflicts of interest
[2] China		[2] 35	[2] Repeated measures design	[2] Outcome-Based Educational theory, which emphasises student centred learning	knowledge and clinical competence requirements specified in the National Standards		[2] Webinars (lectures & case based learning) & Virtual simulations	vSim	Clinical thinking ability	High levels of student engagement, satisfaction & theoretical knowledge.		
[3] Clinical Simulation in Nursing				National Standards for Nursing Undergraduates				[2] Screen based	Academic self-efficacy	Student satisfaction		
							[3] 3 months			Females outperformed males in all domains		

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison groups ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical Framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Martin-Delgado et al (2022) ⁴²	To explore final-year nursing experiences from completing their clinical training in a teaching role practicum during the pandemic.	[1] Final year Nursing students	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	Designing and developing evidence based educational materials aimed at meeting the learning needs of their peers.	Qualitative	[1] Covid 19 educational needs, including management of respiratory patients, mechanical ventilation, use of protection equipment	[1] Video conferencing software, Moodle (LMS)	Themes from student reflective journals (18 of the 34 students)	Three themes 1. Emotions due to not being able to complete their final placement & not to joining the workforce 2. Perceived benefits of a teaching role, 3. Recognising the teaching role as key to the profession & the importance of scientific evidence in clinical practice.	The online teaching practicum gave students the opportunity to develop education competencies.	No mention of conflicts of interest. No external funding
[2] Spain		[2] 34	[2] Post-test design	[2] Not stated			[2] Online training Mentoring sessions Design and development of educational material	[2] Screen based				
[3] Journal of Professional Nursing							[3] 3 months					
[1] Nguyen et al (2023) ⁴³	To transition an introductory anaesthesiology clerkship to an entirely virtual curriculum	[1] 3rd & 4th year Medical students (anaesthesiology)	[1] Single group	[1] Not stated, but past student surveys from placements were used for a needs assessment	Nine educational objectives were outlined, including information/ description, differential diagnosis, treatment prioritisation and planning	Mixed	[1] Preoperative evaluation, inhaled intravenous anaesthetics, airway management, anaphylaxis, malignant hyperthermia and unanticipated difficult airway	[1] Canvas (LMS) PowerPoint Simulation videos Zoom	Survey with Likert and open-text responses	79% response rate. Clerkship met / exceeded expectations in all areas. All students agreed / strongly agreed that the objectives were clear & achieved. Two students indicated that the assessment tools could align better with the curriculum & one wanted more didactics. One noted technical issues with Zoom	A compelling clerkship was executed, which was highly rated.	No disclosures or funding to report
[2] USA			[2] Post-test design	[2] Kerns 6 steps of curriculum development			[2] Didactics, assigned readings, case based learning discussions	[2] Screen based				
[3] MedEdPortal		[2] 28					[3] 2 weeks					

Citation	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest	
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹					
Country ²				Pedagogical framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²					
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³						
[1] Rahm et al. (2021) ⁴⁴	To enrich our understanding of how students perceive realistic multimodal game-like e-learning cases within a complete e-learning-based curriculum.	[1] Medical students in an internal medicine rotation	[1] Single group	[1] Medical students (who had already completed the internal medicine module) and physicians from different disciplines	Decision-making skills	Mixed: Quantitative survey with free text space for student feedback	[1] Cases based on routine encounters across different clinical settings	[1] articulate.com (bespoke creator tool)	Student evaluation	49.5 to 82.5% response rates to case evaluations & 25.8% end of term response	Solving and interpreting e-learning cases close to real-life settings promoted students' motivation during the COVID-19 pandemic and may partially have compensated for bedside teaching opportunities.	Funded by clinician-scientist-program of the German Internal Medicine Society (DGIM). No conflicts of interest	
[2] Germany			[2] Post-test design		Communication								
[3] PLOS One		[2] 198		[2] Not stated			Diagnostic thinking	[2] e-learning cases with quizzes & interaction modules with gamification	Moodle LMS				
[1] Redinger and Greene (2021) ⁴⁵	To describe the development, application & program evaluation of a virtual advanced emergency medicine (EM) curriculum developed rapidly in response to the COVID-19 pandemic.	[1] 4 th year Medical students on an EM rotation	[1] Traditional rotation from a previous cohort (n= 48)	[1] Not Specified	History, physical, diagnosis & case presentation	Mixed methods	[1] 12 most common chief complaints in clinic	[1] Microsoft Teams	Student performance (National Standardised EM Shelf Exam) – simplified to pass/fail	No difference between performance scores t(102) = 1.317 p = 0.174	Students demonstrated the same levels of knowledge in the virtual & traditional rotations	None	
[2] USA				[2] Kerns 6 step model for curriculum development	Common diagnostic studies,				MedEd Case X				Course evaluation (focus group)
[3] Western Journal of Emergency Medicine		[2] 104	[2] Post-test exam scores compared between groups		Management plans,		Knowledge, indications / constraints & basic procedural skills.	[2] Case series, radiology & ECG interpretation, textbooks, journal articles, podcasts, online board review, blog posts quizzes & a case presentation.	SAEM EM Curriculum				
					Emergency recognition & management		[3] 4 weeks	[2] Screen based					

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison groups ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²			pre / post measures ²	Pedagogical Frameworks ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²					Duration ³					
[1] Samuelli et al. (2020) ⁴⁶	To review a diagnostic pathology selective for undergrad medical Students. Including the design, operation, evaluation, & suggestions for further adjustments.	[1] 3 rd and 4 th year medical students (diagnostic pathology selective)	[1] Single group	[1] Course coordinator	Introduce surgical pathology	Quantitative Survey (with open text options)	[1] Principles of non-neoplastic (inflammatory) & neoplastic (benign/malignant) disorders, Dermatopathology, Breast pathology, Neoplastic neuropathology, Neoplastic thyroid pathology	[1] Zoom PowerPoint Moodle	Student experience (previous exposure to pathology), Level of interest & learning from the course, Evaluation / feedback	42% survey response rate, Participants new to diagnostic pathology instruction. Overall, the course was rated very favourably: 68% gave at least 3 out of 4 points for questions related to course interest, improved understanding of diseases & how strongly they would recommend the course. The key disadvantage as reported by 80% was tech issues accessing the slides	The course was a success and can be a model for future virtual pathology electives. Great effort should made to provide technical support to the students. The selective demonstrated value for students and provided much-needed exposure to diagnostic pathology in clinical practice.	None
[2] Israel			[2] Post-test measures	[2] Kerns 6 step framework for curriculum development	Reinforce the pathological basis for disease, including mechanisms & treatments		Advanced topics in diagnostic pathology (NUT carcinoma, thyroid pathology)	Whole slide image (WSI) viewers: (CaseViewer & Aperio ImageScope)				
[3] Annals of Diagnostic Pathology		[2] 59			Appreciate “the way a pathologist thinks,” & what they “mean” in their reports, as well as the significance of commonly described findings		[2] Self-assigned reading , lectures, slide reviews, diagnostic quiz	Library subscription (for assigned texts)				
							[3] 2 weeks	[2] Screen based				

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison groups ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²			pre / post measures ²	Pedagogical Framework ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²					Duration ³					
[1] Smith and Jones (2023) ⁴⁷	Provide an elective that enables students to make the current clinical world relevant, cover key content to assure intern preparedness & explore how COVID-19 changed one key area of medical practice.	[1] 4 th year Medical students	[1] Single group	[1] Academics and professional support (clinicians)	Clinical communication	Mixed	[1] Atrial fibrillation, depression, hypertension, prone ventilation, using protective equipment, lung ultrasound. COVID Global health, public health, child health, aged care, legal & ethical, general practice. Primary care, mental health & evidence-based practice.	[1] Microsoft Teams PowerPoint OSLER (logging of progress & assessment) National Prescribing Service (NPS) modules COVID online modules.	Evaluation survey with Likert responses and open-ended questions	32% response rate. Overall worked well, was well coordinated & a good option for a disrupted placement. The project options met their needs very well & were well supervised. More guidance asked for on COVID information & academic writing support for publication. Some found the OSLER and NPS modules a bit dry.	The COVID-19 elective was successful in meeting student learning needs & alleviated the concerns of students whose placements were disrupted.	No external funding and no competing interests
[2] Australia		[2] 250	[2] Post-test design	[2] Not mentioned	To author case studies of COVID approaches		[2] Podcasts, case studies, flipped classrooms, tutorials & modules	[2] Screen based				
[3] BMC Medical Education							[3] 6 weeks (200 hrs)					
[1] Steehler et al. (2021) ⁴⁸	To develop and evaluate a virtual otolaryngology elective created during COVID-19. To teach the basics of otolaryngology & increase exposure to the specialty	[1] 3 rd & 4 th Medical students (head & neck surgery rotation)	[1] Single group	[1] Faculty, residents and senior medical students	Pathophysiology	Mixed methods	[1] Rhinology, otology, facial plastic & reconstructive, laryngology, paediatric otolaryngology, imaging, & emergencies.	[1] Zoom	Test scores (pre & post for n=5) Student evaluation	92% reported increased understanding & interest in the field Increase in knowledge test scores (p=0.001).	An virtual otolaryngology elective format can be effective at providing an educational experience & garnering interest	None
[2] USA			[2] Repeated measures design (for n=5 pre & post knowledge test scores)	[2] Not mentioned	Workup		[2] Orientation, anatomy/examination & surgical videos, reading, lectures, case based learning, grand rounds & roundtable conversation	[2] Screen based				
[3] Otolaryngology - Head and Neck Surgery			[2] 12			Treatment of disease course otolaryngology practice & referral		[2] Screen based				
							[3] 1 week					

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved ¹			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical frameworks ²			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Taylor et al. (2021) ⁴⁹	To explore & discuss a simulated clinical placement, aimed at enhancing the learning experience to create effective, efficient clinicians	[1] 2st year Dietetics students	[1] Single group	[1] Not specified	Knowledge, communication & professional practice domains	Mixed methods	[1] Not specified, but simulated patient journeys	[1] 360 images	Student evaluation (questionnaire & focus group)	100% of the cohort passed the placement.	Despite some concerns / issues, a virtual placement can be a useful, rich experience for the student.	Funding not mentioned. No conflicts of interest
[2] UK		[2] 40	[2] Post-test design	[2] Controlled reflective processes underpinned the online workbook			[2] Statutory & mandatory training Virtual wards & mealtimes. Recordings, peer learning with structured activities, & an online workbook	Diet-COMMS	Web page metrics	360 images: Rated enjoyable & informative. Were accessed 1016 times		
[3] British Journal of Nursing				NHS & HCPC placement standards			[3] 2 weeks	COVCollaborate App	Student results			
[1] Villa et al. (2021) ⁵⁰	To create, implement & evaluate a virtual clerkship with a focus on social emergency medicine (EM) & professional development	[1] 4 th year Medical students on an EM Clerkship	[1] Single group	[1] Clerkship director, associate programme directors, medical education fellows and senior EM residents. Needs assessment of post graduate near peers.	Advanced medical Knowledge	Mixed methods	[1] Paediatric anaphylaxis, motorcycle trauma, hypothermia & abdominal aortic aneurysm Themes: language, incarceration, gender identity, race & homelessness	[1] Zoom	Pre & post knowledge tests	75% & 96% survey response rates: post-module & end-rotation	A virtual EM visiting clerkship is feasible, supports knowledge acquisition & is perceived as valuable by participants.	None
[2] USA			[2] Repeated measures design		Social determinants of health			Foundations of EM (online resource)	Survey evaluations:	Modest gains in knowledge scores (p=0.006, effect size: 0.68, 95% CI 0.12-1.24)		
[3] Western Journal of Emergency Medicine		[2] 26			Professional development			IDHEAL modules	Overall attitude to the course	89% strongly agreed: topics were important.	Virtual learning experiences may be valuable in the future as an adjunct to traditional in-person rotations.	
					Professional identity formation.			[2] Screen based	After each module x 5 (to determine the comfort with applying content to a clinical setting)	95% strongly agreed /agreed: rotation should be repeated		
					Framework for maximising online learning					Positive feedback for course design, but zoom fatigue was mentioned.		
							[2] Assignments (using websites & podcasts), small group didactic sessions, student led teaching, virtual escape rooms & book club.					
							[3] 2 weeks					

Citation:	Purpose / aim	Population:	Study Design:	VSP Design:	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical framework			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ²		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Weston & Zauche (2021) ⁵¹	To compare the Assessment Technologies Institute (ATI) scores of students who completed their practicum in person versus virtually	[1] 2 nd Semester prelicensure baccalaureate nursing students on a paediatric clinical course [2] 186	[1] In-person placement (clinic & simulation) comparator group (n=93) [2] Post-test measures	[1] Not specified [2] Not mentioned	Take a history Perform physical assessment Identify problems Prioritise interventions Integrate foundation knowledge	Quantitative	[1] Physical assessment, sickle cell, cystic fibrosis, infectious respiratory disease, head injury, cardiovascular disease [2] Prebrief, i-Human cases, debrief in groups & quizzes [3] 5 weeks	[1] Online conferencing (not specified) i-Human [2] Screen based	Scores on the ATI exam	No difference between the scores on the ATI exam between groups t(184)=0.700 (p=0.485)	Using the i-Human platform with prebriefing & debriefing, is an effective approach to simulating a pediatric clinical practice	Not stated
[2] USA												
[3] Archives of Pathology & Laboratory Medicine	To develop & implement a digital slide-based virtual surgical pathology elective in response to the temporary suspension of in person clinical rotations	[1] Medical students (Pathology rotation) [2] 43	[1] Single group [2] Post measures design	[1] Course director (and a needs assessment from student evaluations and rotation data over the proceeding 5 year period) [2] Kern's 6 step approach to curriculum development	Summarise the role of a general surgical pathologist. List the defining histologic features of several common pathologies. Demonstrate how to determine the pathologic stage for an oncologic resection Describe how to approach the assessment of a biopsy specimen	Quantitative	[1] Benign & Malignant neoplasms. Non-neoplastic, developmental & inflammatory processes [2] Reading (e-texts), e-lectures, virtual slides, quizzes, gross dissection videos, student led presentations [3] 3 weeks	[1] Zoom PowerPoint Blackboard (LMS) Inversus (Open EdX platform) Internal education web page: hosted the GI pathology module (designed using iSpring Suite 9) & videos. Leica Aperio & Roche iScan (for slide digitisation). Concentriq (for slide delivery). Amazon Web Cloud storage. [2] Screen based	Pass / fail assessment. Student evaluation survey	All students passed the assessment. 39.5% survey response rate. Learning objectives, patient variety, effective teaching / feedback, the value of technology & the quality of the educational experience were all highly rated	Provided a meaningful clinical experience in a time of online education need. Added benefits included increased medical student exposure to pathology as a medical specialty & demonstration of how digital slides can potentially improve standardisation of the pathology clerkship.	None

Citation	Purpose / aim	Population	Study Design	VSP Design	Desired capabilities	Methodology	Intervention:	Delivery:	Student focussed outcome measures	Key Findings	Conclusions/ Implications	Funding / Conflicts of interest
Author (year) ¹		Profession (specialist rotation) ¹	Comparison group ¹	Stakeholders Involved			Scenario(s) ¹	Software ¹				
Country ²				Pedagogical framework			Activities ²	Hardware ²				
Publication ³		Sample Size ²	pre / post measures ²				Duration ³					
[1] Zhou et al. (2020) ⁵⁵	To observe & analyse the application of Massive Open Online Course (MOOC) & micro video during the COVID-19 epidemic.	[1] Trainee nurses on an Emergency Department (ED) rotation	[1] in-person (traditional) placement comparator group (n=30)	[1] Nursing Skills Group, including a teaching supervisor, clinical nursing expert & a photographer	Theoretical & practical skills with COVID-19 prevention & protection level strategies	Quantitative	[1] Operation of specialised nursing skills involved in the ED	[1] The ED network training platform	Theoretical & practical exam scores	There was no significant difference in exam scores between groups	Combined mode of MOOC micro-video can present theoretical and practical courses in a unique way, & is a better alternative when face-to-face and practical courses can no longer be carried out.	None
[2] China							[2] MOOC & Micro Video course	MOOC (based on the textbook)	Student evaluation	100% survey response rate		
[3] Telemedicine and e-health		[2] 60	[2] Post-test measures	[2] Content was based on the syllabus of the Emergency & Critically Ill Nursing textbook			[3] 2 weeks	[2] Screen based		Overall satisfaction, degree of easy understanding, teacher evaluation & learning results group were higher in the experimental group, with statistical significance (p < 0.05)		