

1 **Improving early infant diagnosis for HIV-exposed infants using unmanned aerial**
2 **vehicles versus motorcycles for blood sample in Conakry, Guinea: a comparative**
3 **cost-effectiveness analysis.**

4
5 Maxime Inghels^{1,2}, Paul Mee¹, Oumou Hawa Diallo³, Mohamed Cissé⁴, David Nelson¹,
6 Frank Tanser⁵, Zahid Asghar⁶, Youssouf Koita⁷, Gabrièle Laborde-Balen⁸, Guillaume
7 Breton⁹.

8
9 **Running head:** Improving early diagnosis of HIV-exposed infant using UAV

10 **Word count** (abstract): 254

11 **Word count** (manuscript): 4,355

12
13 **Materials & Correspondence:**

14 Dr Maxime Inghels

15 Lincoln International Institute for Rural Health

16 University of Lincoln. Brayford Pool, Lincoln, Lincolnshire. LN6 7TS

¹ Lincoln International Institute for Rural Health, University of Lincoln, Lincoln, United Kingdom.

² Centre Population et Développement (UMR 196 Paris Descartes – IRD), SageSud (ERL INSERM 1244), Institut de Recherche pour le Développement, Paris, France.

³ Solthis, Conakry, Guinea.

⁴ Service de Dermatologie, Centre de Traitement Ambulatoire, Laboratoire de Biologie Moléculaire, CHU Donka, Conakry, Guinea.

⁵ Centre for Epidemic Response and Innovation, Stellenbosch University, Stellenbosch, South Africa.

⁶ School of Health and Social Care, University of Lincoln, Lincoln, United Kingdom.

⁷ Programme National de Lutte contre le VIH SIDA et les Hépatites (PNLSH), Conakry, Guinea

⁸ TransVIHMI, University of Montpellier, INSERM, Institut de Recherche pour le Développement, Montpellier, France.

⁹ NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.
Solthis, Paris, France.

17 tel: +44 (0)1522 88 6208

18 maxime.inghels@gmail.com

19

20 **Author contributions:** OHD, MC and GB conceived the study. MI, OHD, MC, GLB and
21 GB contributed to the study design and protocol development. MI, OHD, YK, GLB and GB
22 helped in obtaining the data. MI analysed the data and PM reviewed the analysis. MI, PM,
23 DN, FT and ZA contributed to the interpretation of the results. MI and PM had full access to
24 all the data and take responsibility for the integrity of the data as well as the accuracy of the
25 data analysis. MI wrote the first draft of the manuscript. All authors provided substantive
26 feedback on the manuscript and have read and approved the final version. MI is the
27 guarantor. The corresponding author attests that all listed authors meet authorship criteria and
28 that no others meeting the criteria have been omitted.

29 **Data and code availability:** Analyses were conducted using the software R version 4.0.2. (R
30 Core Team. Vienna, Austria). All the study data and code related to the analysis are publicly
31 available on the GitLab repository: https://gitlab.com/air-pop/air-pop_article.git

32 **Competing interest statement:** All authors declare: no support from any organisation for the
33 submitted work; no financial relationships with any organisation that might have an interest
34 in the submitted work in the previous three years, no other relationships or activities that
35 could appear to have influenced the submitted work. In addition, none of the authors have
36 current or previous professional affiliation with the funder.

37 **Transparency declaration:** the corresponding author confirms having access to all the data
38 in the study and had final responsibility for the decision to submit for publication. The
39 corresponding author affirms that the manuscript is an honest, accurate, and transparent
40 account of the study being reported; that no important aspects of the study have been omitted;

41 and that any discrepancies from the study as planned (and, if relevant, registered) have been
42 explained.

43 **Ethical approval:** The study and its associated surveys received an approval from the
44 National Health Research Ethics Committee of Guinea on the 27 December 2019 (Ref:
45 119/CNERS/19).

46 **Funding:** French National Agency for Research on AIDS (ANRS-MIE)

47

48 **Background:** Early infant diagnosis (EID) for HIV-exposed infants is essential due to high
49 mortality during the first months of their lives. In Conakry (Guinea) timely EID is difficult as
50 traffic congestion prevents the rapid transport of blood samples to the central laboratory. We
51 investigated the cost-effectiveness of transporting EID blood samples by unmanned aerial
52 vehicles (UAV), also known as drones.

53 **Methods and Findings:** We conducted a cost-effectiveness comparative analysis between
54 EID blood samples transportation by UAV compared to motorcycle using Monte Carlo
55 simulations. Incremental cost-effectiveness ratio (ICER) per life-year gained was computed
56 with local annual GDP per capita (US\$1,194) set as the threshold. Simulation models
57 included parameters such as consultation timing (e.g. time of arrival), motorcycle and UAV
58 characteristics, weather and traffic conditions. Sensitivity analyses were conducted. Over a 5-
59 year program and 778 HIV-exposed infants seen in consultation on average every year, the
60 UAV transport strategy was able to save 49.6 life-years [90% PI: -1.3 –100.5]. The UAV
61 strategy costs an additional of \$12.4 [10.2 –14.6] per infant tested compared to the
62 motorcycle one. With an ICER of \$979 per life-year gained, the UAV transportation strategy
63 was below the cost-effectiveness threshold. The ICER is primarily sensitive to weather-
64 related downtime, UAV loss risk, number of HIV-infected infants and travel time saved by
65 UAV.

66 **Conclusion:** The transportation of EID blood samples by UAVs in Conakry was found to be
67 cost effective in that context. EID blood samples transportation by UAV could be a cost-
68 effective strategy in other countries with traffic congestion and low rate of EID.

69

70 **Key words:** HIV; Paediatric testing; Guinea; UAV; Unmanned aerial vehicle; logistic

71 **What is already known on this topic**

- 72 • The cost-effectiveness of Unmanned aerial vehicles—UAV (drones) transportation
73 for blood products remains limited in the Global South.
74 • We aimed to investigate the cost-effectiveness of urgent blood sample transportation
75 for early HIV infant diagnosis (EID) by UAV compared to motorcycle in the region
76 of Conakry, Guinea.

77 **What this study adds**

- 78 • We found that UAV transportation for EID was faster, saved more lives than
79 motorcycles and was cost-effective (Incremental cost-effectiveness ratio: US\$979 per
80 life-year gained)
81 • The effectiveness of the drone strategy was primarily sensitive to weather-related
82 downtime, UAV loss risk, number of HIV-infected infants and travel time saved by
83 UAV.

84 **How this study might affect research, practice or policy**

- 85 • Our study suggests that the transportation of EID blood could be cost-effective in the
86 Conakry region. Other low- or middle-income cities experiencing important traffic
87 congestion with low EID could benefit from this strategy.

88

89 Introduction

90 Every year, more than 150,000 children are infected with HIV and one third of these new
91 infections occur in West and Central Africa (1). In this region, 58% of pregnant women
92 living with HIV are receiving antiretroviral therapy (ART) and the HIV mother to child
93 transmission rate exceeds 20% (1). Without ART initiation, new-born mortality is
94 particularly high, especially in the second and third months of life and more than half die
95 before their second birthday (2). Early infant HIV-diagnosis (EID) from 6 weeks of age is
96 recommended by the World Health Organisation (WHO) in order to initiate ART before 8
97 weeks of age for those HIV-infected and thus significantly improving their life expectancy
98 (3). However, only 27% HIV-exposed infants benefit from EID in West and Central
99 Africa (1).

100 Because of maternal HIV antibodies persistence in the blood of infants until the age of 12-18
101 months, polymerase chain reaction (PCR) tests are required to provide a diagnosis. The
102 recent development of point-of-care (POC) machines have considerably reduced PCR assay
103 time processing and increased the number of HIV-exposed infant receiving their test result
104 the same day as recommended by the WHO (3–5). For example, an observational study of
105 1793 children in Malawi showed that POC equipped sites reduced the time from sample to
106 result from 56 days to 1 day, and allowed ARV treatment of infected children before 60 days
107 in 91.1% of cases versus 41.9% with the standard strategy where blood sample are referred to
108 the central laboratory (5). However, because POC sites require specific laboratory equipment
109 and personnel, making POC cost-effective, in low HIV prevalence settings (resulting in a low
110 test volume) is currently challenging (6). For example, in Guinea, the low prevalence of HIV
111 (1.7%) and the decentralisation of prevention of mother-to-child HIV-transmission program
112 to more than 300 health facilities across the country make it difficult to justify POC
113 equipment in each site. In most African countries with low HIV prevalence, blood samples

114 are sent to central laboratories, but the long turnaround time needed for their transportation
115 and to send back the test result remains a major obstacle to timely EID (7,8). In addition,
116 once the results are available, it can take up to several months for caregivers to return for the
117 results(7,8), further delaying ART initiation among HIV-infected children and significantly
118 increasing their risk of death. Lost to follow-up of HIV-tested children who did not received
119 their results is also particularly high in non POC contexts and up to half of them never come
120 back for the results (9).

121 To reduce the time taken to transport medical samples and supplies to inaccessible places, the
122 use of unmanned aerial vehicles (UAV), also known as drones, has been explored in several
123 studies in low-income countries (10–15). For example, UAVs are supplying blood bags to 20
124 transfusion sites located in isolated rural areas in Rwanda (15). Whilst most studies show that
125 UAV transportation is faster but more expensive than through road (10,12,13,16), the cost-
126 effectiveness of this strategy (i.e. consideration of life-saving benefit) remains poorly
127 documented in low-income countries (17). In addition, UAV transportation focuses on the
128 rural environment (10–14,17,18), while urban areas with severe traffic congestion and
129 inadequate road networks could benefit from faster emergency delivery through UAV
130 (16,19).

131 The aim of this research was to assess the cost-effectiveness of EID blood sample
132 transportation by UAV compared to motorcycle in Conakry, the capital of Guinea, and its
133 suburbs.

134 **Methods**

135 **Study context**

136 Conakry is an equatorial urban city in West Africa with an estimated population of 2 million
137 (20). Conakry is located on the Camayenne peninsula which stretches out over a 40-

138 kilometres-long strip of land 0.2 and 6.5 kilometres wide (Figure 1). The economic activities
139 and main governmental buildings are concentrated at the tip of the peninsula accessible by a
140 single main road which creates bottlenecks at several points in the city (21).

141 [Figure 1 here]

142 *Figure 1. Map of public health centres and hospitals in Conakry and number of pregnant women*
143 *testing positive for HIV in 2021, Guinea.*

144 Note 1: black dots indicate the health centres included in our analysis.

145 Note 2: the map was generated using the Leaflet open library (<https://leafletjs.com/>) using
146 OpenStreetMap (www.openstreetmap.org/) background.

147

148 At present in the Conakry region, most blood samples collected in health centres for PCR
149 HIV-test are conveyed by road to the central laboratory which is embedded in the Donka
150 hospital (Figure 1). The central laboratory is equipped with GeneXpert® technology for POC
151 EID which allow to run several samples analysis at different starting time and provide a result
152 for each test in less than two hours. To date, the main obstacle to timely EID in Conakry is
153 the transportation of blood samples. A single van is allocated to the collection of blood
154 samples which currently visits centres when they reach enough blood samples to collect
155 which delay EID especially in centre with low volume of HIV-exposed children. In addition,
156 this vehicle is often stuck in traffic jams and struggles to quickly access the various health
157 centres in case of an emergency request.

158 The current plan to reduce these delays is to develop a transport system that collects blood
159 samples for EID as soon as they are available in the health centres, sends them to the central
160 laboratory for testing, and then returns the test result by telephone call to the health centres.
161 The goal in this is to minimise the time of each step thus increasing the number of HIV-
162 exposed infant receiving their result the same day and, if found to be HIV-infected, initiating
163 ART. In the current study, we consider two type of vehicles that are adapted for the urgent
164 transportation of blood samples: (i) a motorcycle, which is a cheaper and more flexible than a
165 van in urban congested environments, and (ii) a UAV.

166 **Study design**

167 We conducted a cost-effectiveness analysis of UAVs versus motorcycles for transporting
168 blood samples for paediatric HIV testing in the city of Conakry. The unit of cost-efficacy was
169 the cost for each additional year of life gained by the UAV strategy compared to the
170 motorcycle one. We considered the implementation of both transportation strategy for a 5-
171 year period.

172 We included all 33 public health centres providing postnatal care in Conakry and its suburbs
173 in our model. An average of 1,208 pregnant women have been tested positive for HIV in
174 these 33 facilities in 2021 (Extended data, Appendix 1). Considering the rate of HIV-exposed
175 infants receiving a PCR test at six weeks (22), our base case assumptions model assumes an
176 average number of 777 (min–max: 574–981) HIV-exposed infants seen in consultation at 6
177 weeks each year. Our study considered the different steps such as arrival of mothers in
178 postnatal services, waiting time before consultation, time to transport the blood sample to the
179 central laboratory, timing for test result delivery to mothers, timing of ART initiation and
180 child survival (Appendix 2)

181 **Parameter and assumptions**

182 We defined our models' assumptions based on existing published literature, local surveys or
183 observations and discussions with two UAV manufacturers (Table 1).

184

185 **Healthcare data.** Healthcare data were collected through local surveys or observations and
186 published literature. The mother's arrival time at the health centre was collected using data on
187 women's attendance at two health centres (one hospital and one health centre) in Conakry
188 (Appendix 3). Waiting times in the health centre before being seen in consultation was
189 obtained from 5 studies conducted in Sub-Saharan Africa (Appendix 4).

190 *Table 1. Main technical assumptions for the cost-effectiveness simulation model*

Parameters	Value	[min-max]	Distribution	Sources
Healthcare				
Mother-to-child transmission rate at 6 weeks	7.7%		Point estimate	PNLSH [‡]
HIV-exposed infant receiving PCR test at 6 weeks	64.4%	[47.5 –81.2]	Random point estimate	(22)
Arrival time at the health centre	9h00	[7h00 – 16h30]	Beta PERT	Field survey (Appendix 3)
Waiting time before being seen in consultation (min)	133.8	SD: 66.2	Normal with truncation of negative values	Literature review (Appendix 4)
Time required to perform a PCR test at the central laboratory (min)	105	[90 –120]	Random point estimate	Field observations with GeneXpert®
Work departure time of healthcare workers in postnatal services	16h30		Point estimate	Field observations
Mothers able to wait until healthcare workers leave	39.0%	[15.3 –69.0]	Random point estimate	Field survey (Appendix 5)
Maximum waiting times for mothers (min)	160	[3 –600]	Beta PERT	Field survey (Appendix 5)Field survey (Appendix
Number of days needed to return for the test results if not collected the same day	33	[0 –365]	Logarithm	Literature review (Appendix 6)
ART initiation acceptance rates	92.3%		Point estimate	(4)
Average age at ART initiation among children after one year	4.7	[1.0 –21.7]	Exponential	IeDEA data (Appendix 7)
UAV				
UAV price	\$11,562		Point estimate	DeltaQuad
Operational horizontal speed (Km/h)	65		Point estimate	DeltaQuad
Operational vertical speed (Km/h)	4.32		Point estimate	DeltaQuad
Flight altitude required (meters)	80		Point estimate	Field observations
Autonomy (min)	110		Point estimate	DeltaQuad
Maximal flight distance (km)	100		Point estimate	DeltaQuad
Preparation times—e.g. UAV deployment (min)	4		Point estimate	DeltaQuad and Field observations
Weather inoperability	2.6%		Point estimate	Meteoblue (Appendix 8)
UAV loss rates	0.0%	[0.00-0.01]	Point estimate	(23), Drone Volt, DeltaQuad
Motorcycle				
Motorcycle Price	\$3,238		Point estimate	CFAO motors Guinea
Lifespan (en Km)	55,000	[30,000 – 70,000]	Beta PERT	(10)
Breakdown rate (per 10,000km)	0.6		Point estimate	(10)
Minor accident rate (per 100,000km)	1.65		Point estimate	(10)
Major accident rate (per 100,000km)	0.43		Point estimate	(10)
Weather inoperability	0.2%		Point estimate	Meteoblue (Appendix 8)

191 CFAO: Corporation For Africa & Overseas; IeDEA; International epidemiology Databases to Evaluate AIDS; PCR: polymerase
 192 chain reaction ; SD: standard deviation; Solthis: *Solidarité Thérapeutique et Initiatives pour la Santé*; UAV : unmanned aerial
 193 vehicles
 194 [‡] routine data collected in Conakry, Guinea, by the National Program for HIV and hepatitis (*Programme National de Lutte contre*
 195 *Le VIH/Sida et les Hépatites*) in 2021 among 881 HIV-exposed children in public health centres and tested at 6 weeks (68 positive
 196 results)

197 Mothers were assumed to receive the results the same day if the lab test results were
198 delivered both (i) before the average work departure time of healthcare workers in postnatal
199 services, and (ii) before the maximum waiting time of the mothers. The maximum waiting
200 time of mothers were obtained by conducting a local survey among 82 women (Appendix 5).
201 When the test result was not received the same day, we created a probabilistic function to
202 estimate the number of days before returning to get the results using data from 5 studies
203 conducted in Sub-Saharan Africa (Appendix 6).

204 We assume that HIV-infected infants whose mothers do not receive the test results during the
205 first year do not initiate ART elsewhere. For infants not having initiated ART or whose
206 mothers were not aware of their status during the first year, we computed a probabilistic
207 function of initiating ART at a later age (Appendix 6).

208

209 **UAV and motorcycle parameters.** We obtained data inputs from two qualified UAV
210 manufacturers, DeltaQuad (badhoevedorp, North Holland, Netherland) and Drone Volt
211 (Villepinte, Seine-Saint-Denis, France), both having significant experiences of unmanned
212 aircraft system implementation in sub-Saharan Africa. UAV flight demonstrations were
213 carried out in Conakry during the study to collect UAV real-life data and identifying specific
214 challenges. UAV data was based on the *DeltaQuad Pro* produced by DeltaQuad
215 (<https://www.deltaquad.com/vtol-drones/map/>). The *DeltaQuad Pro* is a small UAV with
216 rotor-wing that allows vertical take-off and landing in limited space which is well adapted for
217 urban environment. Flight routes can be planned to allow fully autonomous flights which
218 reduce mishaps risks induced by human errors.

219 Motorcycle related data were collected from local dealerships such as CFAO motors
220 (Conarky, Guinea) and local market observations. The motorcycle model chosen was the
221 *Suzuki TF125* for its robustness and its ability to ride on rough or unpaved road.

222 **Travel time.** As we assumed both the UAV and the motorcycle were stationed at the central
223 laboratory, travel times represent a return journey. We assumed that a phone call would be
224 made from the laboratory to the health centre to inform the clinic about the test result and
225 save additional travel times for result delivery.

226 Travel times by motorcycles between the central laboratory and the health centres were
227 estimated using Google Maps data (maps.google.co.uk). These estimations account for travel
228 times variability depending on months, day, time slots and travel directions (Appendix 10).
229 After timing several travels by motorcycle between the central laboratory and the health
230 centres, we found that the Google Maps “optimistic” estimations were closest to real-life
231 travel times (Appendix 9). In case of breakdown or accident, we assume blood samples
232 delivered to the laboratory the same day but related results available the following day.

233 Travel times by UAV were estimated using vertical and horizontal speeds as well as
234 preparation times. We consider the UAV cruise speed to allow best speed/autonomy ratio.
235 Given the low weight of a blood sample and its associated container (less than 50 grams), we
236 considered its impact on the UAV speed negligible. All UAV assumptions were based on our
237 discussion with DeltaQuad, Drone Volt and from field observations during a pilot study.

238

239 **Weather conditions.** *Meteoblue* website (www.meteoblue.com) was used to collect wind
240 and rain data in Conakry to estimate weather operativity for UAV and motorcycle
241 transportation (Appendix 8). *Meteoblue* is a weather forecasting website created by the
242 University of Basel in Switzerland which can provide up to 40 years of historical hourly
243 weather data worldwide.

244 We considered light rain (<2.5 mm/h) as the limit of use for the UAV and moderate rain
245 (<7.6 mm/h) for the motorcycle. We ignored the wind strength; data shows that it has not
246 exceeded the maximum airworthiness limit of the UAV during the last 20 years. Since we

247 have considered a return journey, we assume that the slowing down of the UAV in case of a
248 headwind would be compensated during the reverse trajectory of the UAV.

249

250 **Survival.** Survival curves were computed according to the infant status: (i) HIV-exposed but
251 uninfected infant, (ii) HIV infected infant not initiating ART, (iii) HIV infected infant
252 initiating ART. Data from the IeDEA cohort of HIV-infected children in the West Africa (24)
253 and other existing literature were used to compute the different survival curves using double
254 Weibull distributions (Appendix 11).

255

256 **Costs.** We devised cost functions to calculate costs from the perspective of the healthcare
257 system (including all levels of government and donors) in 2021 US\$. Euros and CFA francs
258 costs identified have been converted to 2021 US\$. All costs have been adjusted for inflation
259 based on the year of data collection. For both UAV and motorcycle transportation strategy,
260 the costs included purchase price, maintenance, insurance, fuel consumption, staff salaries
261 and HIV-care related costs (for the full list, see Appendix 12). Training costs for the UAV
262 pilot and healthcare staff were considered for UAV. We assumed that the salary for a UAV
263 pilot in Conakry was equivalent to that for a dispatch rider employed by international NGOs
264 in Conakry.

265 Residual value of the motorcycle and the UAV after the 5-year program were omitted. We
266 assumed that the main UAV pilot will be trained at the UAV manufacturer site in the
267 Netherlands and all additional pilots are trained by the main pilot in addition to the online
268 course provided by the manufacturer to minimise international travel costs. We assumed that
269 health centre staff were trained during one half-day on loading and unloading the UAV as
270 well as security procedures. We exclude import duty and licensing costs for UAV as Guinea,

271 like many African country, waive licensing costs for equipment and vehicles used in public
272 health program. Because of the latter, we assumed that air navigation fees would be waived.
273 ART cost was determined from the ART regimens prescribed and their annual cost. In
274 Guinea, data from several paediatric HIV care specialists show that ART regimens prescribed
275 among children are: (i) AZT+3TC+LPV/r (80%), ABC+3TC+LPV/r (10%) and
276 AZT+3TC+EFV (10%) for children under three years of age, and (ii) ABC+3TC+EFV
277 (100%) for those between 3 and 10 years of age. For patients over 10 years of age, ART
278 regimens prescribed was determined using the 2016 report of the National STI/HIV/AIDS
279 Committee on the follow-up of patient living with HIV (25) ART regimen costs were based
280 on the price reference list published by the *Clinton Health Access Initiative* and other
281 available materials (26,27) Non-ART care related costs (e.g. tests, consultations, fixed costs)
282 was estimated from another study conducted in the sub-Saharan context (28).

283 **Analyses**

284 The cost-effectiveness analysis was conducted using Monte-Carlo simulations. Each
285 parameter was randomly drawn for each simulation depending on their distribution (Table 1).
286 The unit of cost-effectiveness was the cost for each additional year of life gained by the UAV
287 strategy compared to the motorcycle one. For each of the 10,000 simulations run for the base
288 case scenario, the total cost and the number of survival life-year obtained were computed.
289 Then, the differential costs between the UAV and the motorcycle transportation were divided
290 by the survival life-year differential to obtain the incremental cost-effectiveness ratio (ICER).
291 The threshold for cost-effectiveness per life-year gained was set at the gross domestic product
292 per capita in Guinea, i.e., \$1,194(29). A discount of 3% on both the costs and life-years
293 gained per year was applied (30).
294 Sensitivity analyses were performed to identify the parameters with the greatest influence on
295 the ICER.

296 Analyses were conducted using the software R version 4.0.2. (R Core Team. Vienna,
297 Austria).

298 **Role of the funding source**

299 The funder of the study had no role in the design of this study and did not have any role
300 during its execution, analyses, interpretation of the data, or decision to submit results.

301 **Patient and public involvement**

302 Patients or the public were not involved in the design, recruitment, conduct or dissemination
303 of this study.

304 **Results**

305 **Travel times.** We assumed that one UAV and one motorcycle were deployed as round-trips
306 time per day totalised on average 106 minutes [72-144] and 213 minutes [142-292] for the
307 UAV and motorcycle respectively—which represents an average of 3 missions a day. UAV
308 transport saved an average of 35.7 minutes in travel time and up to an average of 108.1
309 minutes for the most remote centres, over 50 kilometres from the laboratory (Appendix 10).
310 No time was gained by the UAV for the two centres located within 3 kilometres range.

311

312 **Health outcomes and survival.** A higher proportion test results were delivered to mothers
313 the same day with the UAV strategy (53.0% [90% prediction interval: 34.8 –71.1] vs 47.4%
314 [29.5 –65.4] for the motorcycle strategy). After considering the probabilities to return for the
315 results among mothers not receiving the results (see methods, Appendix 6 and 7), an average
316 reduction of 5.8 days for receiving the results was found for the UAV strategy (48.0 days
317 [30.8 –65.2] vs 53.8 days [36.3 –71.4] for motorcycle). These results correspond to a
318 reduction of 8.3 days for ART initiation (101.0 days [46.6 –155.5] vs 109.3 [52.7 –165.8] for

319 motorcycle). Over the 5-year period program, the UAV transport strategy was able to save an
320 additional 49.6 life-years [-1.3 –100.5] compared to the motorcycle strategy.

321

322 **Cost.** Excluding treatment and HIV care costs, median investment costs were \$95,141
323 [95,106 –95,175] and \$54,550 [Interquartile range: 53,282 –56,111] for the UAV and
324 motorcycle strategy respectively. Transport costs per blood sample were \$24.6 [23.5 –25.8]
325 by UAV and \$17.3 [16.9 –17.8] by motorcycle. When considering all costs (including ART
326 and care costs), the UAV strategy costs an additional of \$12.4 [10.2 –14.6] per infant tested
327 compared to the motorcycle strategy.

328

329 **Cost-effectiveness analysis.** With the base case assumptions, the overall incremental cost-
330 effectiveness ratio found was \$979 per life-year saved which was just below the threshold we
331 used for cost-effectiveness—i.e. \$1,194 (Figure 2). The cost-effectiveness of the UAV
332 transport strategy was superior in 64.8% of the 10,000 simulations performed. In 31.2% of
333 simulations, the UAV transport strategy was effective but too expensive and in 4.0% situation
334 it was less effective.

335 [Figure 2 here]

336 *Figure 2. Cost-effectiveness plane of blood sample transportation by UAV versus motorcycle.*

337 Note: Each blue dot represents a simulation. Error bars show 90% prediction intervals.

338

339 **Sensitivity analyses.** Sensitivity analyses of the main parameters showed that the cost-
340 effectiveness of the UAV versus the motorcycle was highly dependent on four factors: (i)
341 weather inoperability, (ii) the capacity of the UAV to be faster than the motorcycle, (iii) UAV
342 loss risk, (iv) number of children infected (i.e. mother-child transmission rate), and (v) UAV
343 purchase price (Figure 3). The UAV strategy stayed cost effective in the following situations:
344 weather inoperability of 5% or less, (ii) minimum average transportation time saved by UAV

345 of 27 minutes, (iii) UAV losses below 1 every 4,000 flight-hours, (iv) mother to child
346 transmission equal to 5.8% or more and (v) UAV price below \$15,483.

347 To allow generalisation of our result to other contexts, we ran a series of different scenarios
348 that all consider a similar number of HIV-exposed infants seen every year in each health
349 centre (Figure 4). Higher weather inoperability can be balanced with higher time saved by
350 UAV transportation if a minimum of HIV-infected infant benefit from the strategy. UAV
351 price reduction or increase have less effect on the cost-effectiveness of the UAV strategy in
352 case of high number of HIV-infected infant benefiting from the strategy.

353 [Figure 3 here]

354 *Figure 3 : Sensitivity analysis of key parameters.*

355 ¹ Including only centres at a certain distance mechanically reduces the number of children exposed to
356 HIV as fewer centres are included.

357 Note: the cost-effectiveness threshold is determined when the cost per life-year gained is equivalent to
358 the GDP per capita (i.e., \$1,194).

359

360 [Figure 4 here]

361 *Figure 4 : Cost-effectiveness of blood samples transportation by UAV depending on main parameters*

362 Note 1: Results obtained by modelling the overall cost and the number of life-years gained by the
363 average time saved using linear regressions.

364 Note 2: For comparison, in Conakry region, an estimated 777 HIV-exposed infants (with 60 HIV-
365 infected) were seen in postnatal consultations in 2021, 2.6% of UAV inoperability due to bad weather,
366 and the average time saved per UAV was estimated to be about 35.7 minutes.

367 **Discussion**

368 Our results showed that transporting blood samples for paediatric HIV testing by UAV in the
369 Conakry region was cost-effective when compared to transportation by motorcycle. The
370 UAV transport strategy has the potential to be cost-effective in other contexts, provided there
371 is sufficient time saved in transportation, enough HIV-infected infants benefit from the UAV
372 transportation, and weather conditions do not result in too many downtimes.

373 This is one of the first study to investigate the cost-effectiveness of UAV transportation in a
374 Global South country. UAV systems involved for medical purposes are quickly expanding in
375 Africa (31), and mostly focus on delivering health goods (e.g., blood products, vaccines) in
376 remote or isolated area. Our study confirms existing economic evaluations showing that UAV
377 transportation systems are significantly more expensive compared to traditional modes of
378 transportation(10,13,16). Nevertheless, our study is one of the first to demonstrate the
379 possibility of UAV transportation systems to save lives while remaining a cost-effective
380 strategy in a low-income context. Our results support the implementation of UAV
381 transportation systems, although our analysis focused on blood sample transportation for
382 paediatric HIV testing only. Therefore, the cost-effectiveness of UAV transportation for other
383 blood products should be evaluated.

384 Although our analysis focuses on the specific case of the Conakry region, evidence from our
385 study suggests that UAV transportation of blood samples for paediatric HIV testing is a
386 strategy that could be implemented in other relatable contexts. First, our base case
387 assumptions considered a mother to child transmission at six weeks of 7.7% where this rate is
388 higher in many countries, in particular in the Sub-Saharan region (32,33). As the cost-
389 effectiveness of the UAV strategy was particularly sensitive to the number HIV-infected
390 infants, this suggests that this strategy may be considered in similar Global South contexts
391 with high rates of mother-to-child HIV transmission. Second, the cost-effectiveness threshold

392 defined in our analysis is very low because Guinea is one of the world's poorest countries,
393 which suggests that the UAV strategy could be cost-effective in a similar context in other
394 low- or middle-income countries. Third, on average the UAV in our analysis flew on average
395 for 106 minutes per day due to the limited range of the UAV but also to the localisation of the
396 central laboratory, where the UAV was based, which does not take advantage of the full area
397 the UAV operation radius can cover. A similar study in a setting with a more centralised
398 laboratory or an inland rather than coastal location could increase the number of health
399 centres reached by the UAV and thus increase the number of HIV-exposed infants benefiting
400 from the intervention. Fourth, the UAV market and technology is not yet mature enough
401 which entails quick evolutions in prices drop and UAV technology development which are
402 likely to make the UAV more affordable and efficient (34). Thus, it is expected that UAV
403 will become a more affordable and effective solution for the transport of urgent blood
404 products in the foreseeable future.

405 The UAV strategy reduced by 8.3 days the mean time before ART initiation among infant
406 leading to 49.6 life-years saved. Our results showed that UAV cost-effectiveness could be
407 increased if a greater number of HIV-exposed children benefitted from this strategy. Such
408 improvement would be possible by increasing the currently low postnatal consultation rate
409 (64.4%) or by including a higher number of health centres in Conakry enabled by a higher
410 operational range of the UAV. The current development of hydrogen batteries has recently
411 made it possible to extend the flight times before recharge to more than 12 hours for a UAV
412 model similar to the one used in our simulations which suggested that micro UAV will soon
413 be able to reach more distant centres (35). In addition, considering the high down time in our
414 simulations (on average there was only 106 minutes of flight per day) UAV could be used for
415 other health related emergencies such as blood transportation for transfusion in the case of

416 obstetric haemorrhage which is the leading cause of maternal death in sub-Saharan Africa
417 (36).

418 The cost-effectiveness of the UAV strategy was highly dependent on weather conditions. In
419 the city of Conakry, these conditions seem rather favourable since only 2.6% of the UAV
420 trips were cancelled due to bad weather, well below the 10% threshold assumed by another
421 study in a nearby country (10). It is possible that this difference is due to specific local
422 weather contexts, the UAV's longer distance travel (increasing its exposure to areas with
423 frequent tropical rainfall), or the characteristics of the deployed UAV. Nevertheless, the
424 consideration of weather conditions remains an important factor in the viability of a UAV
425 transport strategy that is often omitted in other studies (11–13,16).

426

427 Our study fills several gaps within the existing literature on UAV in low-income countries.
428 First, it documents the potential of UAV use in congested urban environments which is a
429 persistent issue in developing countries (19,21). Like other studies, we found that use of a
430 UAV significantly decreases travel times in congested traffic environments (11,16), which
431 supports the UAV as a relevant solution for emergency transport in these contexts. Second, to
432 the best of our knowledge, our analysis is one the firsts to include lifesaving cost benefits of
433 UAV transportation in a low-income country (10,12,13,16). To date, we find a unique study
434 that have investigated the lifesaving cost benefits of using of UAV transportation in the
435 Global South. This study has investigated the use of UAV for improving tuberculosis
436 screening in remote region of Madagascar (17). However, their analysis has several
437 limitations, such as the omission of important factors such as weather conditions, the strong
438 assumptions in their model regarding the effect of the drone on the likelihood of being tested
439 for TB, and the absence of a description of the comparative transport in the standard of care.
440 In Germany, when considering the cost of each life-year saved, a study conducted found that

441 UAV-based delivery of defibrillation for out-of-hospital cardiac arrests was cost-effective
442 (37). Thus, our results add to the literature another piece of evidence that UAV can be cost-
443 effective for urgent medical transport, even in a resource-constrained environment.

444 Our analysis has some limitations. Data not available for the city of Conakry were assumed
445 from other studies conducted in the Sub-Saharan context and may not represent the local
446 context. We neglect the risk of crashing or losing the UAV in our base case assumptions,
447 although we did conduct sensitivity analysis on that parameter. The risk of loss or accident
448 for "small" UAVs remains poorly documented overall(10). Military UAV data suggested an
449 accident risk of less than 5/100,000 flight hours with human error explaining the majority of
450 these accidents (23). In all our simulations, the use of the UAV never exceeds 3,000 flight
451 hours over the 5 year program. In addition, many UAV models, including the one used in our
452 simulation, has autopilot systems allowing them to perform entire missions autonomously
453 without the need for manual remote control which would limit human errors. In addition,
454 several improvements are now available to limit flight accidents such as the equipment of
455 sensors to avoid unexpected obstacles during the flight (38).

456 As our results rely mainly on sub-Saharan African data, these results could be generalised to
457 other African settings with both high delay HIV paediatric results and traffic congestion—
458 two salient issues in many countries in West and central Africa (1,19). EID blood sample
459 transportation could be considered for major West African urban cities such as Abidjan or
460 Lagos—the higher GDP per capita of their related countries compared to Guinea could make
461 UAV an even more cost-effective solution for EID blood sample transportation.

462 As time to convey blood samples or results between sites and laboratories remains the main
463 factor of delayed ART initiation among HIV-infected infants in many African contexts(7,8),
464 there is an urgent need for innovative solutions to improve the turnaround times of
465 emergency transportation.

466 UAV blood sample transportation can improve EID and our simulation suggests that this
467 strategy is cost-effective in the Region of Conakry. UAV blood sample transportation for EID
468 could also be cost-effective in other contexts of high rates of mother to child transmission and
469 long turnaround time for urgent transportation.

470

471 **Acknowledgements**

472 The study received funding from the *Agence Nationale de Recherches sur le Sida et les*
473 *hépatites virales/ Maladies Infectieuses Emergentes*—ANRS-MIE (grant number: ANRS
474 12407).

475 In addition, we would like to thank the following persons for their valuable contribution. Dr
476 Valériane Leroy and Karen Malateste for providing survival data from IeDEA West Africa.
477 Mohamed Soumah for collecting data on travel time by motorcycle needed to validate
478 *Google Maps* estimations. Drone Volt for providing UAV related data. Prof. Mark Gussy for
479 their useful and meaningful comments on the manuscript.

480

481 **References**

- 482 1. UNAIDS data 2021. Geneva: Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS; 2021.
- 483 2. Newell ML, Coovadia H, Cortina-Borja M, Rollins N, Gaillard P, Dabis F. Mortality of
484 infected and uninfected infants born to HIV-infected mothers in Africa: a pooled
485 analysis. *The Lancet*. 2004 Oct 2;364(9441):1236–43.
- 486 3. World Health Organization. Guidelines: updated recommendations on HIV prevention,
487 infant diagnosis, antiretroviral initiation and monitoring [Internet]. Geneva: World Health
488 Organization; 2021 [cited 2021 Oct 28]. Available from:
489 <https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/340190>
- 490 4. Bianchi F, Cohn J, Sacks E, Bailey R, Lemaire JF, Machekano R, et al. Evaluation of a
491 routine point-of-care intervention for early infant diagnosis of HIV: an observational
492 study in eight African countries. *Lancet HIV*. 2019 Jun;6(6):e373–81.
- 493 5. Mwenda R, Fong Y, Magombo T, Saka E, Midiani D, Mwase C, et al. Significant Patient
494 Impact Observed Upon Implementation of Point-of-Care Early Infant Diagnosis
495 Technologies in an Observational Study in Malawi. *Clin Infect Dis Off Publ Infect Dis
496 Soc Am*. 2018 Sep 1;67(5):701–7.
- 497 6. Unicef. Key Considerations for Introducing New HIV Point-of-Care Diagnostic
498 Technologies in National Health Systems [Internet]. New York: United National
499 Children’s Fund; 2018 p. 48. Available from: [https://www.pedaids.org/wp-
500 content/uploads/2019/02/HIV-Point-of-Care-POC-Diagnostics-Training-Toolkit-.pdf](https://www.pedaids.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/HIV-Point-of-Care-POC-Diagnostics-Training-Toolkit-.pdf)
- 501 7. Manumbu S, Smart LR, Mwale A, Mate KS, Downs JA. Shortening Turnaround Times
502 for Newborn HIV Testing in Rural Tanzania: A Report from the Field. *PLoS Med*. 2015
503 Nov 3;12(11):e1001897.
- 504 8. Phiri NA, Lee HY, Chilenga L, Mtika C, Sinyiza F, Musopole O, et al. Early infant
505 diagnosis and outcomes in HIV-exposed infants at a central and a district hospital,
506 Northern Malawi. *Public Health Action*. 2017 Jun 21;7(2):83–9.
- 507 9. Sibanda EL, Weller IVD, Hakim JG, COWAN FM. The magnitude of loss to follow-up
508 of HIV-exposed infants along the prevention of mother-to-child HIV transmission
509 continuum of care: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *AIDS Lond*.
510 2013;27(17):2787–97.
- 511 10. Ochieng WO, Ye T, Scheel C, Lor A, Saindon J, Yee SL, et al. Uncrewed aircraft
512 systems versus motorcycles to deliver laboratory samples in west Africa: a comparative
513 economic study. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2020 Jan 1;8(1):e143–51.
- 514 11. Mateen FJ, Leung KHB, Vogel AC, Cissé AF, Chan TCY. A drone delivery network for
515 antiepileptic drugs: a framework and modelling case study in a low-income country.
516 *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg*. 2020 Apr 8;114(4):308–14.
- 517 12. Haidari LA, Brown ST, Ferguson M, Bancroft E, Spiker M, Wilcox A, et al. The
518 economic and operational value of using drones to transport vaccines. *Vaccine*. 2016 Jul
519 25;34(34):4062–7.

- 520 13. Philips N, Blauvelt C, Ziba M, Sherman J, Saka E, Bancroft E, et al. Costs Associated
521 with the Use of Unmanned Aerial Vehicles for Transportation of Laboratory Samples in
522 Malawi. Seattle: VillageReach; 2016.
- 523 14. Knoblauch AM, de la Rosa S, Sherman J, Blauvelt C, Matemba C, Maxim L, et al. Bi-
524 directional drones to strengthen healthcare provision: experiences and lessons from
525 Madagascar, Malawi and Senegal. *BMJ Glob Health*. 2019 Jul 30;4(4):e001541.
- 526 15. Nisingizwe MP, Ndishimye P, Swaibu K, Nshimiyimana L, Karame P, Dushimiyimana
527 V, et al. Effect of unmanned aerial vehicle (drone) delivery on blood product delivery
528 time and wastage in Rwanda: a retrospective, cross-sectional study and time series
529 analysis. *Lancet Glob Health*. 2022 Apr 1;10(4):e564–9.
- 530 16. Zailani MA, Azma RZ, Aniza I, Rahana AR, Ismail MS, Shahnaz IS, et al. Drone versus
531 ambulance for blood products transportation: an economic evaluation study. *BMC Health
532 Serv Res*. 2021 Dec 5;21(1):1308.
- 533 17. Bahrainwala L, Knoblauch AM, Andriamiadanarivo A, Diab MM, McKinney J, Small
534 PM, et al. Drones and digital adherence monitoring for community-based tuberculosis
535 control in remote Madagascar: A cost-effectiveness analysis. *PLOS ONE*. 2020 Jul
536 7;15(7):e0235572.
- 537 18. Amukele TK, Sokoll LJ, Pepper D, Howard DP, Street J. Can Unmanned Aerial Systems
538 (Drones) Be Used for the Routine Transport of Chemistry, Hematology, and Coagulation
539 Laboratory Specimens? *PLOS ONE*. 2015 Jul 29;10(7):e0134020.
- 540 19. Olagunju K. Evaluating traffic congestion in developing countries. A case study of
541 Nigeria. *J Chart Inst Logist Transp-Niger*. 2015;2(3):23–6.
- 542 20. Sidibe L, Ministère du Plan et de la Coopération Internationale, Institut National de la
543 Statistique, Bureau Central de Recensement. Rapport d'analyse des données du RGPH3:
544 Perspectives Démographiques [Internet]. Conakry: Bureau Central de Recensement; 2017
545 [cited 2021 Oct 18] p. 92. (Recensement Général de la Population et de l'Habitation).
546 Available from: [http://www.stat-
547 guinee.org/images/Documents/Publications/INS/rapports_enquetes/RGPH3/RGPH3_mor-
548 talite.pdf](http://www.stat-guinee.org/images/Documents/Publications/INS/rapports_enquetes/RGPH3/RGPH3_mortalite.pdf)
- 549 21. Sub-Saharan Africa Transport Policy Program. Poverty and urban mobility in Conakry
550 [Internet]. 2004. Report No.: Report 09/04/CK. Available from:
551 https://www.ssatp.org/sites/ssatp/files/publications/PapersNotes/Conakry_en.pdf
- 552 22. Wettstein C, Mugglin C, Egger M, Blaser N, Vizcaya LS, Estill J, et al. Missed
553 opportunities to prevent mother-to-child-transmission: systematic review and meta-
554 analysis. *AIDS Lond Engl*. 2012 Nov 28;26(18):2361–73.
- 555 23. Susini A. A Technocritical Review of Drones Crash Risk Probabilistic Consequences and
556 its Societal Acceptance. 7.
- 557 24. Iyun V, Technau KG, Vinikoor M, Yotebieng M, Vreeman R, Abuogi L, et al. Variations
558 in the characteristics and outcomes of children living with HIV following universal ART
559 in sub-Saharan Africa (2006–17): a retrospective cohort study. *Lancet HIV*. 2021 Jun
560 1;8(6):e353–62.

- 561 25. Comité National De Lutte Contre Les IST/VIH/Sida [Guinea]. Analyse des données de
562 survie à 12 mois des personnes sous traitement antirétroviral dans les sites de prise en
563 charge du VIH. Conakry; 2016. Report No.: Rapport 2016.
- 564 26. Clinton Health Access Initiative. 2016 antiretroviral (ARV) CHAI reference price list.
565 [Internet]. [cited 2021 Oct 31]. Available from: [https://3cdmh310dov3470e6x160esb-
566 wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/2016-CHAI-ARV-Reference-
567 Price-List_FINAL.pdf](https://3cdmh310dov3470e6x160esb-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/2016-CHAI-ARV-Reference-Price-List_FINAL.pdf)
- 568 27. Doherty K, Essajee S, Penazzato M, Holmes C, Resch S, Ciaranello A. Estimating age-
569 based antiretroviral therapy costs for HIV-infected children in resource-limited settings
570 based on World Health Organization weight-based dosing recommendations. *BMC*
571 *Health Serv Res.* 2014 Dec;14(1):201.
- 572 28. Larson BA, Bii M, Henly-Thomas S, McCoy K, Sawe F, Shaffer D, et al. ART treatment
573 costs and retention in care in Kenya: a cohort study in three rural outpatient clinics. *J Int*
574 *AIDS Soc.* 2013;16(1):18026.
- 575 29. The World Bank. GDP per capita (current US\$), Guinea, Data 2020 [Internet]. The
576 World Bank Website. [cited 2021 Nov 8]. Available from:
577 <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.PCAP.CD?locations=L3-GN>
- 578 30. Weinstein MC, Siegel JE, Gold MR, Kamlet MS, Russell LB. Recommendations of the
579 Panel on Cost-effectiveness in Health and Medicine. *JAMA.* 1996 Oct 16;276(15):1253–
580 8.
- 581 31. McCall B. Sub-Saharan Africa leads the way in medical drones. *The Lancet.* 2019 Jan
582 5;393(10166):17–8.
- 583 32. Astawesegn FH, Stulz V, Conroy E, Mannan H. Trends and effects of antiretroviral
584 therapy coverage during pregnancy on mother-to-child transmission of HIV in Sub-
585 Saharan Africa. Evidence from panel data analysis. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2022 Feb 8;22:134.
- 586 33. Bhatta M, Dutta N, Nandi S, Dutta S, Saha MK. Mother-to-child HIV transmission and
587 its correlates in India: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Pregnancy Childbirth.*
588 2020 Sep 4;20(1):509.
- 589 34. Sørensen LY, Jacobsen LT, Hansen JP. Low Cost and Flexible UAV Deployment of
590 Sensors. *Sensors* [Internet]. 2017 Jan 1 [cited 2022 Feb 2];17(1). Available from:
591 <https://europepmc.org/articles/PMC5298727>
- 592 35. Intelligent Energy showcases drone fuel cell modules in Japan. *Fuel Cells Bull.* 2019
593 Aug;2019(8):4–4.
- 594 36. Khan KS, Wojdyla D, Say L, Gülmezoglu AM, Van Look PF. WHO analysis of causes
595 of maternal death: a systematic review. *Lancet Lond Engl.* 2006 Apr 1;367(9516):1066–
596 74.
- 597 37. Bauer J, Moormann D, Strametz R, Groneberg DA. Development of unmanned aerial
598 vehicle (UAV) networks delivering early defibrillation for out-of-hospital cardiac arrests
599 (OHCA) in areas lacking timely access to emergency medical services (EMS) in
600 Germany: a comparative economic study. *BMJ Open.* 2021 Jan 1;11(1):e043791.

601 38. Lee J, Wang J, Crandall D, Šabanović S, Fox G. Real-Time, Cloud-Based Object
602 Detection for Unmanned Aerial Vehicles. In: 2017 First IEEE International Conference
603 on Robotic Computing (IRC). 2017. p. 36–43.

604

605

606 **Supporting information**

607 Appendix 1: Road and flight distance between health centres and central laboratory (Donka)

608 and number of HIV-positive pregnant women by health facility, 2021.

609 Appendix 2: Summary figure presenting main parameters and data sources

610 Appendix 3: Estimating time of arrival at the health centres

611 Appendix 4: Estimating waiting time before being seen in consultation

612 Appendix 5: Estimating maximum waiting times among mother present in waiting room

613 Appendix 6: Estimating the percentage of mother returning to receive the test results for their

614 child

615 Appendix 7: Estimating the probability of initiating ART after one year in infected children

616 Appendix 8: Estimating inoperability because of bad weather

617 Appendix 9: Estimating travel times by monocycles

618 Appendix 10: Travel time saved by UAV (vs motorcycle) depending on centre distance from

619 the central laboratory

620 Appendix 11: Survival probability functions for HIV-exposed infants

621 Appendix 12: Additional inputs related to costs for UAV and motorcycle transportation

622