

Supplementary Material

Title

Long-term outdoor air pollution and COVID-19 mortality in London: an individual-level analysis

Authors

Loes Charlton*, Chris Gale*, Jasper Morgan*, Myer Glickman*, Sean Beevers**, Anna L Hansell***¹, Vahé Nafilyan*¹,

Affiliations

* Office for National Statistics, Health Analysis and Pandemic Insights, Newport, NP10 8XG, UK;

** Environmental Research Group, School of Public Health, Imperial College London & MRC Centre for Environment and Health, Imperial College London;

*** Centre for Environmental Health and Sustainability, University of Leicester & NIHR Health Protection Research Unit in Environmental Exposures and Health at the University of Leicester & NIHR Health Protection Research Unit in Environmental Exposures and Health at the University of Leicester.

¹ Joint senior author

Abstract

Background: The risk of COVID-19 severity and mortality differs markedly by age, socio-demographic characteristics and pre-existing health status. Various studies have suggested that higher air pollution exposures also increase the likelihood of dying from COVID-19.

Objectives: To assess the association between long-term outdoor air pollution (NO₂, NO_x, PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5}) concentrations and the risk of death involving COVID-19, using a large individual-level dataset.

Methods: We used comprehensive individual-level data from the Office for National Statistics' Public Health Data Asset for September 2020 to January 2022 and London Air Quality Network modelled air pollution concentrations available for 2016. Using Cox proportional hazard regression models, we adjusted for potential confounders including age, sex, vaccination status, dominant virus variants, geographical factors (such as population density), ethnicity, area and household-level deprivation, and health comorbidities.

Results: There were 737,356 confirmed COVID-19 cases including 9,315 COVID-related deaths. When only adjusting for age, sex, and vaccination status, there was an increased risk of dying from COVID-19 with increased exposure to all air pollutants studied (NO₂: HR 1.07 [95% confidence interval: 1.04-1.12] per 10 µg/m³; NO_x: 1.05[1.02-1.09] per 20 µg/m³; PM₁₀: 1.32[1.15-1.51] per 10 µg/m³; PM_{2.5}: 1.29[1.12-1.49] per 5 µg/m³). However, after adjustment including ethnicity and socio-economic factors the HRs were close to unity (NO₂: 0.98[0.90-1.06]; NO_x: 0.99[0.94-1.04]; PM₁₀: 0.95[0.74-1.22]; PM_{2.5}: 0.90[0.67-1.20]). Additional adjustment for dominant variant or pre-existing health comorbidities did not alter the results.

Conclusions: Observed associations between long-term outdoor air pollution exposure and COVID-19 mortality in London are strongly confounded by geography, ethnicity and deprivation.

Supplementary material

Additional Material and Methods

Exposure details

The London Atmospheric Emissions Inventory (LAEI) model outputs were created using a dispersion modelling system incorporating ADMS dispersion model v5.2 (CERC, 2016) and road source model v5 (CERC, 2020), measured hourly meteorological data, empirically derived NO-NO₂-O₃ and PM relationships and emissions from the LAEI. The LAEI model has been instrumental in air quality decision making in London for schemes such as Congestion Charging and more recently for the London Mayor's Ultra Low Emissions Zone. The LAEI model gives annual mean air quality predictions of NO-NO₂-O₃, PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5} on a regular 20m x 20m grid. Data for this study was taken from the London Data Store (<https://data.london.gov.uk/dataset/london-atmospheric-emissions-inventory--laei--2016>).

Comparison with London measurements results in the following good model performance:

Model performance table. Values of the spearman correlation coefficient (r), root mean square error (RMSE), normalised mean gross error (NMGE) and normalised mean bias (NMB) for observed vs. modelled annual average concentrations for the year 2016.

Year	Pollutant	Number of monitoring sites (n)	Normalised mean bias (NMB)	Normalised mean gross error (NMGE)	Spearman correlation coefficient (r)
2016	NO ₂	97	-0.05	0.25	0.81
2016	NO _x	97	-0.01	0.17	0.80
2016	PM ₁₀	22	0.13	0.15	0.80
2016	PM _{2.5}	79	0.17	0.21	0.63

Adjusted deprivation calculation

For household deprivation, we calculated how many of the remaining three deprivation sub-domains (education, housing and employment) a household contained (1=not deprived, 2=deprived in one domain, 3=deprived in 2 domains, 4=deprived in all domains). We calculated an adjusted IMD by combining the standardised scores of the remaining 6 domains adjusting the original weighting to achieve a total of 100% (the excluded Health, Deprivation and Disability domain was weighted 13.5%, so we multiplied the remaining domain's weights by 100/86.5) (McLellan et al., 2019). We then converted this adjusted IMD to deciles (1=most deprived, 10=least deprived).

References

Cambridge Environmental Research Consultants Ltd (CERC). "ADMS 5, Air Quality Management System, User Guide, Version 5.2". November 2016. http://www.cerc.co.uk/environmental-software/assets/data/doc_userguides/CERC_ADMS_5_2_User_Guide.pdf.

Cambridge Environmental Research Consultants Ltd (CERC). "ADMS-Roads, Air Quality Management System, User Guide, Version 5.0". February 2020. http://www.cerc.co.uk/environmental-software/assets/data/doc_userguides/CERC_ADMS-Roads5.0_User_Guide.pdf.

D. McLennan, S. Noble, M. Noble, E. Plunkett, G. Wright and N. Gutacker, "The English indices of deprivation 2019: technical report," 2019.

Table S1. Correlation matrix across whole-cohort mean pollutant levels (Pearson's correlation coefficient).

	NO₂	NO_x	PM₁₀	PM_{2.5}
NO₂	1.00	0.99	0.97	0.97
NO_x	0.99	1.00	0.95	0.95
PM₁₀	0.97	0.95	1.00	0.98
PM_{2.5}	0.97	0.95	0.98	1.00

Table S2. ANOVA results comparing variable category means across the whole cohort for each pollutant. All F test results are displayed with df: F_{4, 737351}, with all p<0.001.

	Geography (Rural/urban)	Adjusted household deprivation	Adjusted IMD deciles	Ethnicity
NO₂	2261.54	23071.05	65419.67	5487.59
NO_x	1745.39	21121.99	56616.37	4556.06
PM₁₀	2596.34	24117.41	73883.59	5709.66
PM_{2.5}	2698.69	21612.59	62331.15	4825.11

Table S3. Hazard ratios (HRs) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) of each air pollution measure in the iterative models (equivalent to Figure 1). The variables included in the models from top to bottom are subsequently additive, e.g., age, age + sex, age + sex + vaccination, etc. The exception is the 'variant' model. This model is equal to the previous model plus stratification by the dominant virus variant. The subsequent models including 'health' do not include this stratification. All models including geographical variables are stratified by local authority.

NO₂	HR	95% CI low	95% CI high	p value
Age	1.10	1.06	1.15	0.0000
+ sex	1.10	1.06	1.15	0.0000
+ vaccination	1.07	1.03	1.12	0.0009
+ geographical	1.06	0.98	1.15	0.1537
+ ethnicity	1.03	0.95	1.12	0.4228
+ socio-economic	0.98	0.90	1.06	0.6023
+ variant	0.97	0.89	1.05	0.4609
+ non-respiratory health	0.97	0.90	1.06	0.5178
+ all health	0.96	0.89	1.05	0.3815

NO_x	HR	95% CI low	95% CI high	p value
age	1.07	1.04	1.10	0.0000
+ sex	1.07	1.04	1.11	0.0000
+ vaccination	1.05	1.02	1.09	0.0013
+ geographical	1.04	0.99	1.10	0.1332
+ ethnicity	1.03	0.97	1.08	0.3381
+ socio-economic	0.99	0.94	1.04	0.7046
+ variant	0.98	0.93	1.04	0.5691
+ non-respiratory health	0.99	0.93	1.04	0.5940
+ all health	0.98	0.93	1.03	0.4480

PM₁₀	HR	95% CI low	95% CI high	p value
age	1.46	1.28	1.67	0.0000
+ sex	1.48	1.30	1.70	0.0000
+ vaccination	1.32	1.15	1.51	0.0001
+ geographical	1.22	0.95	1.55	0.1167
+ ethnicity	1.12	0.88	1.44	0.3532
+ socio-economic	0.95	0.74	1.22	0.6901
+ variant	0.93	0.72	1.19	0.5397
+ non-respiratory health	0.94	0.73	1.20	0.6150
+ all health	0.92	0.72	1.17	0.4871

PM_{2.5}	HR	95% CI low	95% CI high	p value
age	1.40	1.21	1.61	0.0000
+ sex	1.42	1.23	1.63	0.0000
+ vaccination	1.29	1.12	1.49	0.0005
+ geographical	1.18	0.88	1.57	0.2728
+ ethnicity	1.07	0.80	1.43	0.6685
+ socio-economic	0.90	0.67	1.20	0.4681
+ variant	0.87	0.65	1.16	0.3451
+ non-respiratory health	0.89	0.66	1.19	0.4177

+ all health	0.85	0.63	1.13	0.2661
--------------	------	------	------	--------

Table S4. Log-likelihood ratio tests for added interaction terms. The full model is our primary model plus the interaction term: air pollution + age + sex + vaccination + geographical + ethnicity + deprivation + air pollution * interaction variable. The reduced model is our primary model: air pollution + age + sex + vaccination + geographical + ethnicity + deprivation. LL = log likelihood, LLRT = log-likelihood ratio test.

Pollutant	Interaction variable	LL full model	LL reduced model	LLRT statistic	LLRT p value
NO ₂	Age	-72985.9	-73004.0	36.2	0.0000
NO _x	Age	-72989.3	-72999.0	19.5	0.0001
PM ₁₀	Age	-72984.3	-73004.0	39.6	0.0000
PM _{2.5}	Age	-72988.5	-73003.9	30.8	0.0000
NO ₂	Household deprivation	-73003.9	-73004.0	0.1	0.9456
NO _x	Household deprivation	-73004.0	-72999.0	-9.9	1.0000
PM ₁₀	Household deprivation	-72999.9	-73004.0	8.4	0.0153
PM _{2.5}	Household deprivation	-73003.9	-73003.9	0.0	0.9946
NO ₂	Ethnicity	-73000.0	-73004.0	8.0	0.0184
NO _x	Ethnicity	-73000.6	-72999.0	-3.0	1.0000
PM ₁₀	Ethnicity	-72995.6	-73004.0	16.8	0.0002
PM _{2.5}	Ethnicity	-72986.6	-73003.9	34.6	0.0000
NO ₂	IMD decile	-73002.8	-73004.0	2.3	0.3118
NO _x	IMD decile	-73003.8	-72999.0	-9.6	1.0000
PM ₁₀	IMD decile	-73004.0	-73004.0	0.0	0.9880
PM _{2.5}	IMD decile	-73001.1	-73003.9	5.6	0.0604

Table S5. Analysis results stratified by age and ethnicity. Results displayed of our primary Cox proportional hazard model (air pollution + age + sex + vaccination + geographical + ethnicity + deprivation, leaving out the relevant stratified covariate). HR = Hazard ratio, CI = confidence interval.

Pollutant	Category	HR (95% CI)	p value	Group size
NO ₂	Age < 65 years	1.01 (0.83-1.22)	0.9350	668,149
NO _x	Age < 65 years	1.01 (0.90-1.14)	0.8761	
PM ₁₀	Age < 65 years	0.97 (0.54-1.75)	0.9154	
PM _{2.5}	Age < 65 years	0.88 (0.43-1.80)	0.7331	
NO ₂	Aged 65+ years	0.97 (0.89-1.06)	0.5115	69,207
NO _x	Aged 65+ years	0.98 (0.92-1.04)	0.5126	
PM ₁₀	Aged 65+ years	0.95 (0.72-1.24)	0.6872	
PM _{2.5}	Aged 65+ years	0.91 (0.66-1.25)	0.5589	
NO ₂	White ethnicity	0.99 (0.89-1.10)	0.8265	411,605
NO _x	White ethnicity	1.00 (0.93-1.07)	0.9087	
PM ₁₀	White ethnicity	0.95 (0.69-1.32)	0.7599	
PM _{2.5}	White ethnicity	0.89 (0.61-1.29)	0.5320	
NO ₂	South Asian ethnicity	1.06 (0.87-1.29)	0.5469	125,783
NO _x	South Asian ethnicity	1.02 (0.90-1.16)	0.7152	
PM ₁₀	South Asian ethnicity	1.34 (0.72-2.50)	0.3577	
PM _{2.5}	South Asian ethnicity	1.40 (0.66-2.95)	0.3829	
NO ₂	Black ethnicity	1.01 (0.82-1.25)	0.8958	91,279
NO _x	Black ethnicity	1.00 (0.88-1.15)	0.9749	
PM ₁₀	Black ethnicity	1.02 (0.54-1.96)	0.9433	
PM _{2.5}	Black ethnicity	1.03 (0.46-2.30)	0.9392	
NO ₂	Other ethnicity	0.88 (0.68-1.13)	0.3112	108,689
NO _x	Other ethnicity	0.93 (0.79-1.09)	0.3511	
PM ₁₀	Other ethnicity	0.79 (0.37-1.71)	0.5490	
PM _{2.5}	Other ethnicity	0.76 (0.30-1.90)	0.5549	

Figure S1. Hazard ratios (HRs) and 95% confidence intervals (CI) of each air pollution measure in the iterative models, calculated using postcodes derived from 2011-2013 primary care data. The variables included in the models from top to bottom are subsequently additive, e.g., age, age + sex, age + sex + vaccination, etc. The exception is the 'variant' model. This model is equal to the previous model plus stratification by the dominant virus variant. The subsequent models including 'health' do not include this stratification. All models including geographical variables are stratified by local authority. *p<0.05, **p<0.01, ***p<0.001.

