Post-acute COVID-19 syndrome and its prolonged effects: An updated systematic review

Dr. Jahanzeb Malik¹, Dr. Syed Muhammad Jawad Zaidi², Dr. Raafe Iqbal³, Dr. Kashif Khan¹, Dr. Muhammad Ali¹, Dr. Abdul Sattar Rana¹, Dr. Ali Umer Waqar⁴, Dr. Uzma Ishaq⁵

- 1 Department of Cardiology, Rawalpindi Institute of Cardiology, Rawalpindi, 46000, Pakistan
- 2 Department of Medicine, Rawalpindi Medical University, Rawalpindi, 46000, Pakistan
- 3 Department of Cardiology, Pakistan Ordinance Factories Hospital, Wah, 47040, Pakistan
- 4 Department of Medicine, Shifa International Hospital, Islamabad, 44000, Pakistan
- 5 Department of Hematology, Foundation University Medical College, Rawalpindi, 46000, Pakistan

Corresponding author: Dr. Jahanzeb Malik, Senior Registrar, Department of Cardiology, Rawalpindi Institute of Cardiology, Rawalpindi, 46000, Pakistan.

email: heartdoc86@gmail.com

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has

and should not be used to guide clinical

Competing Interests: Authors have no competing interests to declare

Funding: Authors did not receive any specific funding for this article

Author contributions: JM; concept, literature search, first draft, final draft, methodology, analysis; SMJZ; literature review, study selection, first draft; RI; first and final draft; KK; first draft, supervision, methodology; MA; literature search, first draft; ASR; first draft, analysis, literature search; AUW; first and final draft, methodology; UI; supervision, concept; final draft, analysis.

Abstract

Objective: This systematic review aimed at estimating the demographics, clinical characteristics, and prevalence of post-acute COVID-19 symptoms in view of published literature that studied prolonged clinical manifestations after recovery from acute COVID-19 infection.

Methods: After protocol setting, relevant articles were searched on various databases including PubMed, Medline, the Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL), Embase, and Web of Sciences using MeSH keywords.

Results: Out of the 153 articles reviewed, 21 articles qualified for the final analysis. The most common persistent clinical manifestations were fatigue (54.11%), dyspnea (24.38%), alopecia (23.21%), hyperhidrosis (23.6%), insomnia (25.98%), anxiety (17.29%), and arthralgia (16.35%). In addition to these symptoms, new-onset hypertension, diabetes, neuropsychiatric disorders, and bladder incontinence were also reported.

Conclusion: Clinical features of post-acute COVID-19 infection can manifest even after 60 days of initial infection. Multidisciplinary care along with regular follow-up must be provided to such patients.

Introduction

Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-COV-2) presented as clustered cases of atypical pneumonia in the city of Wuhan in the Hubei province of China. In March 2020, coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) was declared as a pandemic by World Health Organization (WHO) and since then approximately 148 million people have been infected with the virus [1]. There is a well-established pool of scientific knowledge about the acute effects of COVID-19 and unprecedented efforts of the scientific community have now shifted towards the long-lasting sequelae of the disease, the real-world effects of which are yet to be seen [2-5].

Prolonged symptoms and signs are being reported in observational studies and case reports every day. Although such symptoms are usually experienced in survivors of critical illness, the post-acute effects of COVID-19 are equally being reported in patients with mild severity of disease who do not require hospitalization [6,7]. No established randomized controlled trials have assessed predictors of post-acute COVID-19 and many observational studies are underpowered with a small sample size to produce a significant effect model and a pooled prevalence on a global scale. Therefore, this systematic review was conducted for published research articles to estimate the incidence of abnormal manifestations after recovery from the acute COVID-19.

Methods

Protocol development and selection criteria

A protocol for the selection of articles and carrying out the systematic review of the literature was made after a consensus among the authors and subject experts but it was not deposited in a registry. Data was collected after protocol approval from the ethical review board of Foundation University Medical College (ID#FFH/ADC/021/21).

Search strategy and data extraction (selection and coding)

The main databases used for study selection were PubMed and Medline through LitCOVID [8], the Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature (CINAHL), Embase, and Web of Science. Articles published before 1st May 2021 were included in the search. We included randomized clinical trials, observational, cross-sectional, and cohort studies which were in the English language, and peer-reviewed published articles that reported signs and symptoms after at least two weeks from the recovery of acute COVID-19. Only studies with more than 50 participants were included. Post-acute COVID-19 syndrome was defined as symptomatology after two weeks of recovery from COVID-19. Pre-prints, case reports, editorials, and data notes were excluded. After the initial search and removal of duplicates, all the search was imported on EndNote version 20 (Clarivate AnalyticsTM). All the screening and inclusion of the articles were conducted by two independent reviewers (ASR, SMJZ) blinded to each other's decisions. Once the initial screening was finished, all the included studies were referenced in Mendeley. The two reviewers (ASR, SMJZ) reviewed full texts for final inclusion. Where there was a dispute, a third reviewer (MA) resolved it between them. The descriptive variables extracted were country, setting, follow-up time, sample size, mean age and percentage of gender, outcomes, symptoms, and signs, and names used for post-acute COVID-19 syndrome.

The search terms used in the search strategy were as follows: ((("long-haul" coronavirus disease OR post-acute COVID-19 OR "convalescent" COVID-19) OR prolonged coronavirus infection OR coronavirus disease [Mesh]) OR "severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2" chronic disease [Supplementary Concept]) OR recurrent OR lingering OR complications of "COVID-19" [Mesh] OR "betacoronavirus" [Mesh])) AND 2019/12 [PDAT]: 2030 [PDAT]))). The systematic review followed the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviewers and Meta-analysis (PRISMA) guidelines [9] and the PRISMA flowchart is demonstrated in **Figure 1**.

Risk of bias assessment

All included articles were assessed using the National Institute of Health quality assessment tool for clinical studies and Newcastle-Ottawa Scale (NOS) [10]. Scales are provided as **supplementary resources 1 and 2**. **Table 1** enumerates the quality status of the included studies.

Strategy for data synthesis

For statistical analysis, Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 26 (IBM Corp. Armonk, NY, USA) was used, and based on the distribution of quantitative variables, they were expressed as mean \pm standard deviation (SD) or median and interquartile range (IQR). Qualitative variables were presented as frequency (n) and percentages (%).

Results

A total of 21,741 titles and abstracts were screened for this review. Of these, 153 full texts were reviewed and according to the review protocol, 56 were excluded because of inappropriate sample size, 47 presented acute COVID-19 symptoms, 23 were case series, and 6 excluded as data notes. A total of 21 studies were included for final analysis and review and their general characteristics are shown in **Table 2**. Many studies assessed a specific long-term symptom after COVID-19 recovery and the PRISMA flowchart for study selection is presented in **Figure 1**. A total of 10 studies were from Europe and three from the United States. Others were from Mexico, Saudi Arabia, China, Australia, and Bangladesh. All studies included were on either previously hospitalized or non-hospitalized patients, and most of them had mild, moderate, and severe states of COVID-19 patients. Total follow-up time was more than one month in the majority of the studies and the number of the patient cohort was 54,730 participants with a median age of 54 years. Except for two studies, there was no stratification among gender differences between post-COVID-19 symptoms.

The general quality of the studies was assessed using the NIH quality assessment tool and Newcastle-Ottawa scale for observational studies and except one, all studies were graded in at least fair quality articles (**Table 1**). There were 35 post-acute symptoms and signs presented in the study cohort of these articles. They are stratified in **Table 3**. The most common manifestations were fatigue (54.11%), dyspnea (24.38%), alopecia (23.21%), hyperhidrosis (23.6%), insomnia (25.98%), anxiety (17.29%), and arthralgia (16.35%). Thirteen studies reported fatigue and anosmia, 15 dyspnea, 12 chest pain, and 11 non-productive coughs, and 5 studies showed more than one symptom. Apart from constitutional symptoms of COVID-19, personality and sleep disorders, bladder and bowel incontinence, new-onset hypertension, and diabetes were also seen in the included studies.

Discussion

The most important pathophysiological mechanism in acute COVID-19 is direct viral toxicity leading to endothelial damage and microvascular injury. This can cause immune system dysregulation and hyperinflammatory states, hypercoagulability, and downregulation of the angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 (ACE2) pathway [11]. In contrast to this, the post-acute effects of COVID-19 are an overlap of phylogenetic similarities with SARS-COV-1 and Middle-Eastern respiratory syndrome (MERS) viruses [12]. However, SARS-COV-2 has a higher affinity for ACE2 compared with SARS-COV-1, and this mechanism may be the contributing factor in the widespread transmission of SARS-COV-2. Furthermore, potential mechanisms behind post-acute symptoms and signs in COVID-19 recovered patients seem multifactorial: the pathophysiologic changes caused by the virus, inflammatory and immune-mediated cell damage, and sequelae of recovery from critical illness [13].

This systematic review demonstrated that 68% of patients have at least one post-acute symptom after recovery from COVID-19. A total of 21 studies were included in this review which fulfilled our inclusion criteria and overall 35 signs and symptoms of post-acute COVID-19 were identified in this cohort of patients (Table 3). The most common symptoms were fatigue, dyspnea, hyperhidrosis, dementia, depression, alopecia, and cough. The majority of presenting symptoms or signs were similar to the acute presentation of COVID-19. However, a possibility remains for other effects to be identified later on in this pandemic. In the following discussion, we will elaborate on the most common symptoms and signs of post-acute COVID-19 to understand each disease in more detail.

Overall, the most common symptom among all the included patients was the feeling of tiredness or fatigue (54.11%) [6,7,14-18]. It was present after three months' follow-up in critical COVID-19 patients admitted to intensive care units (ICUs) [15]. This phenomenon has been established in survivors of critical illness (post-ICU syndrome), even after years of recovery, where half the

patients report symptoms of chronic fatigue syndrome, including incapacitating fatigue, generalized body pain, neurocognitive disturbances, insomnia, and increased sympathetic drive [19]. Viruses like Epstein-Barr virus, cytomegalovirus, and herpes virus have been implicated in causing chronic fatigue syndrome and this review adds SARS-COV-2 as the causative agent of chronic fatigue [20].

Neuropsychiatric symptoms are also reported in some studies, including headache, insomnia, anxiety, depression, bladder and bowel incontinence, ageusia, migraine, and dementia [6,16,21-24]. Similar to chronic fatigue syndrome, the etiology, and pathophysiology of neuropsychiatric symptoms in COVID-19 are multifactorial and unclear. In a cohort of 355 patients in Bangladesh, and 143 patients in Italy, a cumulative 63% of the patients were screened positive in at least one of the domains evaluated for neuropsychiatric sequelae (depression, anxiety, insomnia, obsessive-compulsive disorders, etc.) [6,14]. Clinical depression and anxiety were reported in approximately 17% of patients following COVID-19 [6]. Memory loss in the form of dementia and ageusia is also reported in a few studies, including cognitive impairment with or without fluctuations [25]. All these symptoms could be related to the social stigma of contracting a potentially fatal illness, some effects of sedatives in critical COVID-19 patients with delirium, and hypercoagulability leading to cerebrovascular disease. In addition, post-recovery sleep disturbances can also precipitate psychiatric disorders [26]. Mental health assessment and mental health attention models are very important in the post-acute COVID-19 stage, as they can contribute to a better quality of life in this cohort. Telogen effluvium and alopecia are also reported in three studies, which is defined as temporary hair loss due to excessive shedding of Telogen hair after COVID-19. Although self-limiting, this condition can cause emotional distress in many patients [27].

Dyspnea (24.38%) and cough (17.17%) were the most prominent pulmonary symptoms in this review [28]. Several studies have demonstrated persistent high resolution computed tomography (HRCT) lung abnormalities after 60 days from the initial presentation [29]. In addition, previous studies have exhibited lung dysfunction in more than 50% of the patients compared to our study cohort [7,30]. A decreased diffusion capacity due to loss of lung volume is the most commonly reported pathophysiologic impairment in post-acute effects of COVID-19, which is directly related to the severity of acute illness [31,32]. This observation is consistent with SARS and MERS and seems to be the contributing factor in long-term pulmonary sequelae of COVID-19. There is the viral-dependent invasion of endothelial-epithelial barrier causing infiltration of monocytes and macrophages, leading to extravasation of protein-rich exudate filling the alveolar space. This is similar to acute respiratory distress syndrome (ARDS) [33]. There are reports of pulmonary vascular micro and macrothrombosis in 20% of the patients with critical COVID-19 pneumonia and the severity of the endothelial injury and widespread microangiopathy seen on lung histopathology is greater than that seen in ARDS from other viruses [34,35].

Several other constitutional symptoms are demonstrated in this review [36-41]. The most important of them are weight loss, new-onset diabetes and hypertension, expectoration, blurred vision, and dry eyes. Chest pain is reported in up to 10% of COVID-19 survivors at 60 days follow up, while ongoing palpitations were reported in 8.53% at 6-months follow up. Apart from acute coronary syndrome (ACS) and myocarditis, an increased incidence of takotsubo cardiomyopathy is being reported in this pandemic compared with the pre-pandemic period (7.8% vs. 1.5%, respectively) [42]. Mechanisms contributing to cardiovascular sequelae in post-acute COVID-19

seem to be downregulation of ACE2 and renin-angiotensin-aldosterone system (RAAS), cytokine storm-related deterioration of myocardial integrity, pericarditis, and arrhythmias [43].

This systematic review had several limitations. One is the small number of studies with underpowered sample size, creating a potential bias and variation in defined outcomes leading to the heterogeneity of the results. Many studies used a self-reporting method which can produce an interobserver bias and almost all studies enrolled COVID-19 patients in mild, moderate, and severe disease category with variable follow-up times references. This can produce heterogeneous results. There was a predefined assessment of symptoms in every study assessed, which can lead to unreported outcomes. One other limitation is that there is no definition of the effect of one severity of COVID-19 and its associated symptoms. A critical illness survivor can have prolonged symptoms while a patient with mild disease can recover early from the same problem. Hence, there is a need for prospective studies to determine if the post-acute COVID-19 effects are a continuation of SARS-COV-2 or complications of premorbid conditions.

Conclusion

The multiorgan sequelae of SARS-COV-2 infection beyond the acute infection are increasingly being recognized with an increasing clinical experience and pool of data becoming available rapidly on COVID-19. This updated systematic review of 21 studies and 54,730 patients is the largest cohort of patients with post-acute effects of COVID-19 evaluated to date. It demonstrated that post-acute effects of COVID-19 can persist even at six months and from the clinical point of view, medical professionals should look for the symptoms and signs in patients recovered from COVID-19. Necessary future research includes stratification of these post-acute effects with gender, age, and comorbid conditions in acute, subacute, and chronic phases of the disease. This will lead to a better

understanding of the delayed sequelae of COVID-19. Through this review, it is clear that acute care of COVID-19 does not conclude at hospital discharge, and interdisciplinary care is needed for comprehensive care of these patients at homes and outpatient clinics. Hence, healthcare systems must establish dedicated COVID-19 clinics, where specialists from various disciplines can provide unanimous care.

Figure 1. PRISMA flow chart

References

- 1. Max Roser, Hannah Ritchie, Esteban Ortiz-Ospina and Joe Hasell (2020) "Coronavirus Pandemic (COVID-19)". Published online at OurWorldInData.org. Retrieved from: 'https://ourworldindata.org/coronavirus' [Online Resource]
- 2. Malik J, Malik A, Javaid M, Zahid T, Ishaq U, Shoaib M. Thyroid function analysis in COVID-19: A retrospective study from a single center. PLoS One. 2021 Mar 30;16(3):e0249421. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0249421. PMID: 33784355; PMCID: PMC8009384.
- **3.** Malik J, Javaid M, Majedi O, Ishaq U, Zahid T. Paying in Blood: A Case of Thrombocytopenia in Covid-19. Cureus. 2020 Aug 16;12(8):e9791. doi: 10.7759/cureus.9791. PMID: 32953307; PMCID: PMC7491688.
- 4. Malik J, Javed N, Naeem H, Sattar RA, Ikram U. COVID-19 Associated Pneumonia and Pleural Effusion Masquerading as Heart Failure in Rheumatic Heart Disease. Eur J Case Rep Intern Med. 2020 Jul 10;7(8):001842. doi: 10.12890/2020_001842. PMID: 32789145; PMCID: PMC7417058.

- 5. Shafi AMA, Shaikh SA, Shirke MM, Iddawela S, Harky A. Cardiac manifestations in COVID-19 patients-A systematic review. J Card Surg. 2020 Aug;35(8):1988-2008. doi: 10.1111/jocs.14808. Epub 2020 Jul 11. PMID: 32652713; PMCID: PMC7404674.
- **6.** Mahmud R, Rahman MM, Rassel MA, Monayem FB, Sayeed SKJB, Islam MS, et al. Post-COVID-19 syndrome among symptomatic COVID-19 patients: A prospective cohort study in a tertiary care center of Bangladesh. PLoS One. 2021 Apr 8;16(4):e0249644. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0249644. PMID: 33831043; PMCID: PMC8031743.
- 7. Huang C, Huang L, Wang Y, Li X, Ren L, Gu X, et al. 6-month consequences of COVID-19 in patients discharged from hospital: a cohort study. Lancet. 2021 Jan 16;397(10270):220-232. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)32656-8. Epub 2021 Jan 8. PMID: 33428867; PMCID: PMC7833295.
- 8. Chen Q, Allot A, Lu Z. LitCovid: an open database of COVID-19 literature. Nucleic Acids Res. 2021 Jan 8;49(D1):D1534-D1540. doi: 10.1093/nar/gkaa952. PMID: 33166392; PMCID: PMC7778958.
- **9.** Shamseer L, Moher D, Clarke M, Ghersi D, Liberati A, Petticrew M, Shekelle P, Stewart LA; PRISMA-P Group. Preferred reporting items for systematic review and meta-analysis protocols (PRISMA-P) 2015: elaboration and explanation. BMJ. 2015 Jan 2;350:g7647. doi: 10.1136/bmj.g7647. Erratum in: BMJ. 2016 Jul 21;354:i4086. PMID: 25555855.
- 10. Ma LL, Wang YY, Yang ZH, Huang D, Weng H, Zeng XT. Methodological quality (risk of bias) assessment tools for primary and secondary medical studies: what are they and which is better? Mil Med Res. 2020 Feb 29;7(1):7. doi: 10.1186/s40779-020-00238-8. PMID: 32111253; PMCID: PMC7049186.
- **11.** Gupta A, Madhavan MV, Sehgal K, Nair N, Mahajan S, Sehrawat TS, et al. Extrapulmonary manifestations of COVID-19. Nat Med. 2020 Jul;26(7):1017-1032. doi: 10.1038/s41591-020-0968-3. Epub 2020 Jul 10. PMID: 32651579.

- **12.** Hu B, Guo H, Zhou P, Shi ZL. Characteristics of SARS-CoV-2 and COVID-19. Nat Rev Microbiol. 2021 Mar;19(3):141-154. doi: 10.1038/s41579-020-00459-7. Epub 2020 Oct 6. PMID: 33024307; PMCID: PMC7537588.
- **13.** Shang J, Ye G, Shi K, Wan Y, Luo C, Aihara H, et al. Structural basis of receptor recognition by SARS-CoV-2. Nature. 2020 May;581(7807):221-224. doi: 10.1038/s41586-020-2179-y. Epub 2020 Mar 30. PMID: 32225175; PMCID: PMC7328981.
- **14.** Carfì A, Bernabei R, Landi F; Gemelli Against COVID-19 Post-Acute Care Study Group. Persistent Symptoms in Patients After Acute COVID-19. JAMA. 2020 Aug 11;324(6):603-605. doi: 10.1001/jama.2020.12603. PMID: 32644129; PMCID: PMC7349096.
- **15.** Townsend L, Dowds J, O'Brien K, Sheill G, Dyer AH, O'Kelly B, et al. Persistent Poor Health Post-COVID-19 Is Not Associated with Respiratory Complications or Initial Disease Severity. Ann Am Thorac Soc. 2021 Jan 8. doi: 10.1513/AnnalsATS.202009-1175OC. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 33413026.
- **16.** Mandal S, Barnett J, Brill SE, Brown JS, Denneny EK, Hare SS, et al. 'Long-COVID': a cross-sectional study of persisting symptoms, biomarker and imaging abnormalities following hospitalisation for COVID-19. Thorax. 2020 Nov 10:thoraxjnl-2020-215818. doi: 10.1136/thoraxjnl-2020-215818. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 33172844; PMCID: PMC7661378.
- **17.** El Sayed S, Shokry D, Gomaa SM. Post-COVID-19 fatigue and anhedonia: A cross-sectional study and their correlation to post-recovery period. Neuropsychopharmacol Rep. 2021 Mar;41(1):50-55. doi: 10.1002/npr2.12154. Epub 2020 Dec 17. PMID: 33332756.
- **18.** Moreno-Pérez O, Merino E, Leon-Ramirez JM, Andres M, Ramos JM, Arenas-Jiménez J, et al. Post-acute COVID-19 syndrome. Incidence and risk factors: A Mediterranean cohort study. J Infect. 2021 Mar;82(3):378-383. doi: 10.1016/j.jinf.2021.01.004. Epub 2021 Jan 12. PMID: 33450302; PMCID: PMC7802523.

- 19. Moldofsky H, Patcai J. Chronic widespread musculoskeletal pain, fatigue, depression and disordered sleep in chronic post-SARS syndrome; a case-controlled study. BMC Neurol. 2011 Mar 24;11:37. doi: 10.1186/1471-2377-11-37. PMID: 21435231; PMCID: PMC3071317.
- **20.** Wostyn P. COVID-19 and chronic fatigue syndrome: Is the worst yet to come? Med Hypotheses. 2021 Jan;146:110469. doi: 10.1016/j.mehy.2020.110469. Epub 2021 Jan 2. PMID: 33401106; PMCID: PMC7836544.
- 21. Chopra V, Flanders SA, O'Malley M, Malani AN, Prescott HC. Sixty-Day Outcomes Among Patients Hospitalized With COVID-19. Ann Intern Med. 2021 Apr;174(4):576-578. doi: 10.7326/M20-5661. Epub 2020 Nov 11. PMID: 33175566; PMCID: PMC7707210.
- 22. Halpin SJ, McIvor C, Whyatt G, Adams A, Harvey O, McLean L, et al. Postdischarge symptoms and rehabilitation needs in survivors of COVID-19 infection: A cross-sectional evaluation. J Med Virol. 2021 Feb;93(2):1013-1022. doi: 10.1002/jmv.26368. Epub 2020 Aug 17. PMID: 32729939.
- **23.** Sudre CH, Murray B, Varsavsky T, Graham MS, Penfold RS, Bowyer RC, et al. Attributes and predictors of long COVID. Nat Med. 2021 Apr;27(4):626-631. doi: 10.1038/s41591-021-01292-y. Epub 2021 Mar 10. PMID: 33692530.
- **24.** Taquet M, Geddes JR, Husain M, Luciano S, Harrison PJ. 6-month neurological and psychiatric outcomes in 236 □ 379 survivors of COVID-19: a retrospective cohort study using electronic health records. Lancet Psychiatry. 2021 May;8(5):416-427. doi: 10.1016/S2215-0366(21)00084-5. Epub 2021 Apr 6. PMID: 33836148; PMCID: PMC8023694.
- **25.** Rogers JP, Chesney E, Oliver D, Pollak TA, McGuire P, Fusar-Poli P, et al. Psychiatric and neuropsychiatric presentations associated with severe coronavirus infections: a systematic review and meta-analysis with comparison to the COVID-19 pandemic. Lancet Psychiatry. 2020 Jul;7(7):611-627. doi: 10.1016/S2215-0366(20)30203-0. Epub 2020 May 18. PMID: 32437679; PMCID: PMC7234781.

- **26.** Bacaro V, Chiabudini M, Buonanno C, De Bartolo P, Riemann D, Mancini F, et al. Insomnia in the Italian Population During Covid-19 Outbreak: A Snapshot on One Major Risk Factor for Depression and Anxiety. Front Psychiatry. 2020 Dec 15;11:579107. doi: 10.3389/fpsyt.2020.579107. PMID: 33384625; PMCID: PMC7769843.
- 27. Xiong Q, Xu M, Li J, Liu Y, Zhang J, Xu Y, et al. Clinical sequelae of COVID-19 survivors in Wuhan, China: a single-centre longitudinal study. Clin Microbiol Infect. 2021 Jan;27(1):89-95. doi: 10.1016/j.cmi.2020.09.023. Epub 2020 Sep 23. PMID: 32979574; PMCID: PMC7510771.
- 28. Carvalho-Schneider C, Laurent E, Lemaignen A, Beaufils E, Bourbao-Tournois C, Laribi S, et al. Follow-up of adults with noncritical COVID-19 two months after symptom onset. Clin Microbiol Infect. 2021 Feb;27(2):258-263. doi: 10.1016/j.cmi.2020.09.052. Epub 2020 Oct 5. PMID: 33031948; PMCID: PMC7534895.
- 29. Balbi M, Conti C, Imeri G, Caroli A, Surace A, Corsi A, et al. Post-discharge chest CT findings and pulmonary function tests in severe COVID-19 patients. Eur J Radiol. 2021 May;138:109676. doi: 10.1016/j.ejrad.2021.109676. Epub 2021 Mar 20. PMID: 33798931; PMCID: PMC7980523.
- **30.** Zhao YM, Shang YM, Song WB, Li QQ, Xie H, Xu QF, et al. Follow-up study of the pulmonary function and related physiological characteristics of COVID-19 survivors three months after recovery. EClinicalMedicine. 2020 Aug;25:100463. doi: 10.1016/j.eclinm.2020.100463. Epub 2020 Jul 15. PMID: 32838236; PMCID: PMC7361108.
- **31.** Huang Y, Tan C, Wu J, Chen M, Wang Z, Luo Let al. Impact of coronavirus disease 2019 on pulmonary function in early convalescence phase. Respir Res. 2020 Jun 29;21(1):163. doi: 10.1186/s12931-020-01429-6. PMID: 32600344; PMCID: PMC7323373.

- **32.** Galván-Tejada CE, Herrera-García CF, Godina-González S, Villagrana-Bañuelos KE, Amaro JDL, Herrera-García K, et al. Persistence of COVID-19 Symptoms after Recovery in Mexican Population. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 2020 Dec 14;17(24):9367. doi: 10.3390/ijerph17249367. PMID: 33327641; PMCID: PMC7765113.
- **33.** Huppert LA, Matthay MA, Ware LB. Pathogenesis of Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome. Semin Respir Crit Care Med. 2019 Feb;40(1):31-39. doi: 10.1055/s-0039-1683996. Epub 2019 May 6. PMID: 31060086; PMCID: PMC7060969.
- **34.** Cui S, Chen S, Li X, Liu S, Wang F. Prevalence of venous thromboembolism in patients with severe novel coronavirus pneumonia. J Thromb Haemost. 2020 Jun;18(6):1421-1424. doi: 10.1111/jth.14830. Epub 2020 May 6. PMID: 32271988; PMCID: PMC7262324.
- 35. Tenforde MW, Kim SS, Lindsell CJ, Billig Rose E, Shapiro NI, Files DC, et al. Symptom Duration and Risk Factors for Delayed Return to Usual Health Among Outpatients with COVID-19 in a Multistate Health Care Systems Network United States, March-June 2020.

 MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2020 Jul 31;69(30):993-998. doi: 10.15585/mmwr.mm6930e1. PMID: 32730238; PMCID: PMC7392393.
- **36.** Kamal M, Abo Omirah M, Hussein A, Saeed H. Assessment and characterisation of post-COVID-19 manifestations. Int J Clin Pract. 2021 Mar;75(3):e13746. doi: 10.1111/ijcp.13746. Epub 2020 Nov 3. PMID: 32991035; PMCID: PMC7536922.
- 37. Garrigues E, Janvier P, Kherabi Y, Le Bot A, Hamon A, Gouze H, et al. Post-discharge persistent symptoms and health-related quality of life after hospitalization for COVID-19. J Infect. 2020 Dec;81(6):e4-e6. doi: 10.1016/j.jinf.2020.08.029. Epub 2020 Aug 25. PMID: 32853602; PMCID: PMC7445491.

- 38. Horvath L, Lim JWJ, Taylor JW, Saief T, Stuart R, Rimmer J, et al. Smell and taste loss in COVID-19 patients: assessment outcomes in a Victorian population. Acta Otolaryngol. 2021 Mar;141(3):299-302. doi: 10.1080/00016489.2020.1855366. Epub 2020 Dec 12. PMID: 33307905.
- **39.** Arnold DT, Hamilton FW, Milne A, Morley AJ, Viner J, Attwood M, et al. Patient outcomes after hospitalisation with COVID-19 and implications for follow-up: results from a prospective UK cohort. Thorax. 2020 Dec 3;76(4):399–401. doi: 10.1136/thoraxjnl-2020-216086. Epub ahead of print. PMID: 33273026; PMCID: PMC7716340.
- **40.** Osikomaiya B, Erinoso O, Wright KO, Odusola AO, Thomas B, Adeyemi O, et al. 'Long COVID': persistent COVID-19 symptoms in survivors managed in Lagos State, Nigeria. BMC Infect Dis. 2021 Mar 25;21(1):304. doi: 10.1186/s12879-020-05716-x. PMID: 33765941; PMCID: PMC7993075.
- **41.** Leth S, Gunst JD, Mathiasen V, Hansen K, Søgaard O, Østergaard L, et al. Persistent Symptoms in Patients Recovering From COVID-19 in Denmark. Open Forum Infect Dis. 2021 Jan 29;8(4):ofab042. doi: 10.1093/ofid/ofab042. PMID: 33875970; PMCID: PMC7928683.
- **42.** Jabri A, Kalra A, Kumar A, Alameh A, Adroja S, Bashir H, et al. Incidence of Stress Cardiomyopathy During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 Pandemic. JAMA Netw Open. 2020 Jul 1;3(7):e2014780. doi: 10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.14780. PMID: 32644140; PMCID: PMC7348683.
- **43.** Liu PP, Blet A, Smyth D, Li H. The Science Underlying COVID-19: Implications for the Cardiovascular System. Circulation. 2020 Jul 7;142(1):68-78. doi: 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.120.047549. Epub 2020 Apr 15. PMID: 32293910.

Tables

Judgement	Clinical studies							
	NIH quality	Newcastle-Ottawa						
	assessment tool; n	scale; n (%)						
	(%)							
Good	8 (38%)	10 (47.61%)						
Fair	12 (57.14%)	11 (52.38%)						
Poor	1 (4.76%)	0						

Table 1. Quality assessment of included articles according to NIH quality assessment tool and Newcastle-Ottawa scale for observational studies.

#	Author [ref]	Country	Setting	Follow-up	Study participants	Sample size	Age; mean ±	Males; %	Outcome variables
				(Mean)		(n)	SD/median		
							(IQR)		
1	Carfi et al.[14]	Italy	Single-centered	60.3 ± 13.6	Patients meeting the	143	56.5 ± 14.6	93 out of 143	Quality of life assessment
				days after onset	following criteria (no			(62.9%)	after acute COVID-19,

days, improvement Number in symptoms, and 2 symptoms.	of persistent
in symptoms, and 2 symptoms.	1
	Fever, fatigue,
negative test results for red eyes, cl	hest pain, cough,
SARS-CoV-2 virus 24 anosmia,	dysgeusia,
hours apart) myalgia, di	arrhea
2 Mandal et al. London, United Multi-centric (3 4-6 week after Patients 384 59.9 ± 16.1 62% Symptom	persistence
[16] Kingdom hospitals) discharge with abnormal blood including	breathlessness,
tests or imaging at cough, fat	igue, and, poor
discharge. sleep qual	lity. Laboratory
parameters	including TLC,
platlet cov	nt, Lymphocyte
count, D di	mers, LFTs, and
CRP levels	
3 Chopra et al.[21] United States Multi-centric (38 60 days post ICU/Hospitalized 488 62 (50-72) years 51.8% Mortality	and
hospitals) discharge COVID-19 patients rehospitaliz	cation, Primary
discharged between 16 care	follow-up,
March and 1 July 2020 New/worse	ned symptoms,
at 38 hospitals.	normal activity,
Emotional	impact,
Financial lo	oss/impact
4 El Sayed et Saudi Arabia Single centered After Patients of COVID-19 200 36.58 ± 9.85 114 out of Assessment	t of fatigue and
al.[17] discharge. after 2 consecutive 200 (57%) anhedonia	using validated
Duration not negative PCR tests scales.	
mentioned attending pulmonology	

					clinic for				
					follow-up				
5	Mahmud et al.	Dhaka,	Single centered	One month	Discharged COVID-19	355	39.8 ± 13.4	207 out of	The frequency and interval
	[6]	Bangladesh		after discharge	patients			355 (58.3%)	of a spectrum of post
									COVID-19 symptoms were
									assessed. These include
									post viral fatigue, persistent
									cough, insomnia, Circadian
									rhythm sleep disorders,
									headache, vertigo, Post-
									exertional dyspnea, rash,
									pneumonia, restless leg
									syndrome, chest pain,
									Adjustment disorder, Nasal
									blockage, Excessive
									sweating, Disturbance of
									memory, New-onset
									diabetes or hypertension,
									myalgias, and Precipitation
									of gout
6	Carvalho-	France	Single centered	Two months	Post COVID-19 patients	150	49 ± 15 years	44%	Persisting symptoms at Day
	Schneider et al.			after onset of	with or without clinical				30 and 60 which included
	[28]			symptoms.	signs of pneumonia but				Fever, dyspnea, chest pain,
					without a				abnormal auscultation, flu-
					need for oxygen therapy				like symptoms, digestive

					(mild/moderate disease)				disorders, weight loss,
									anosmia, palpitations,
									arthralgia, cutaneous rashes
7	Marwa et al. [36]	Egypt	Single centered	Duration not	Patients recovered from	287	32.3 ± 8.5	103 out of	Fatigue, anxiety, joint pain,
				mentioned	COVID-19			287 (35.8%)	continuous headache, chest
									pain, dementia, depression,
									dyspnea, blurred vision,
									tinnitus, intermittent fever,
									obsessive compulsive
									disorder
8	Galván-Tejada et	Mexico	Multi centeric	Duration not	Cases: Patients who had	141 cases	Means of 39.14	49%	Fever, myalgia, rhinorrhea
	al. [32]			mentioned	a laboratory-confirmed	and 78	years for females		or coryza, asthenia, cough,
					diagnosis of SARS-	controls.	and 39.01 for		cephalgia, red eyes,
					CoV-2, and in whom at	(Total 218)	males		odynophagia, nausea, vomit
					least fourteen days have		respectively		or
					passed				diarrhea, anosmia or
					since the appearance of				dysgeusia, stomach pain or
					symptoms.				discomfort, dyspnea, chills
					Controls: Patients with				
					no laboratory or				
					clinically proven				
					COVID-19 infection				
9	Moreno-Pérez et	Spain	Single centric	10-14 weeks	Hospitalized Patients	277	56.0 (42.0–67.5)	52.7%	Post- COVID syndrome.
	al.[18]			after discharge	who had laboratory				These include pneumonia,
					proven SARS-COV-2				fatigue, anosmia, dyspnea,

									persistent cough, headache fever, diarrhea, neurological
									symptoms, and laboratory
									features
10	Halpin et al. [22]	United Kingdom	Single centered	4 to 8 weeks	Hospitalized Patients	100	For ward	54%	Fatigue, Breathlessness,
				after discharge	who had laboratory		patients: 70.5		Neuropsychological
					proven SARS-COV-2		(20□93) For		symptoms, Speech and
					and were discharged		ICU patients:		swallowing problems,
					from hospital		58.5 (34 🗆 84)		weight loss/gain,
									bowel/bladder incontinence,
									Perceived health, quality of
									life, and Vocation change
									since COVID□19 illness.
11	Huang et al [7]	China	Single centered	Median follow	patients with laboratory	1733	57.0 (47.0–65.0)	52%	Fatigues, sleeping
				up days: 186	confirmed COVID-19				problems, hairloss,
				(175-199) days	who were				anosmia, palpitations, joint
					discharged between Jan				pain, decreased appetite,
					7, and				taste disorder, chest pain,
					May 29, 2020				myalgias, rashes,
									swallowing difficulty, Low
									grade fever, eGFR, and
									quality of life
12	Xiong et al. [27]	China	Single centered	Follow up time	All COVID-19 survivors	538	52.0	245 out of	Fatigue, swelling, myalgias,
				of more than 3	who were diagnosed		(41.0-62.0) years	538 (45.5%)	arthralgia, chills, limb
				months for	with COVID-19				edema, dizziness, chest

				each survivor	according to				pain, post activity polypnea,
				each survivor					
					WHO interim guidance				cough sputum, throat pain,
					and were				palpitations, discontinuous
					discharged from the				flushing, new onset
					hospital by 1 March				hypertension, depression,
					2020				anxiety, and alopecia
13	Tenforde et al.	United States	Single centered	14–21 days	adults aged ≥18 years	270	26% patients	130 out of	Risk Factors for Delayed
	[35]			after the test	who had a first positive		aged between	270 (48.14%)	Return to Usual Health
				date	RT-PCR test for SARS-		18–34 years,		Among COVID-19 patients
					CoV-2, and reported		32% aged		were evaluated. The
					persistence COVID-19		between		outcome variables included
					symptoms		35-49 years, and		age, comorbids, ethinicity,
							47% aged ≥50		gender
							years		
14	Taquet et al. [24]	United States	Multicentric,	14-90 days	Discharged COVID-19	44,779	49.3	45.1	New onset psychiatric
			electronic records		patients with no		(19.2)		illness
					previous psychiatric				disorders psychotic,
					illness				insomnia, mood disorders
									(depressive episodes)
									anxiety disorders (PTSD,
									panic disorder, adjustment
									disorder and generalized
									anxiety disorder).
15	Townsend et	Ireland	Single centered,	56 days to	Mild, moderate	128	49.5 ± 15 years	46.1%	Persistent fatigue
	i e	1	1	1	İ		1	l .	

					and Hospitalized				
					patients				
16	Garrigues et al.	France	Single centered	110.9 days	Discharged COVID-19	120	63.2 (15.7) years	75 out of 120	Cough, chest pain, fatigue,
	[37]				patients who were			(62.5%)	dyspnea, ageusia, anosmia,
					Hospitalized in ward or				hair loss, attention disorder,
					ICU				memory loss, sleep
									disorder
17	Horvath et al.	Australia	Multicentric,	83 days	Discharged COVID-19	102	45 (17-87) years	40%	Smell reduction, taste
	[38]		computed records		patients with mild to				change, cough, fever,
					moderate disease				headaches, worsening nasal
					intensity				blockage, runny nose,
									fatigue, sore throat.
18	Arnold et al.[39]	United Kingdom	Single centered	28 days	patients (≥18years	110	60 (46–73) years	56%	Fever, cough arthralgia,
					of age) admitted with				myalgias, chest pain,
					COVID-1				anosmia, diarrhea,
									abdominal pain, headache,
									insomnia, deranged blood
									tests, spirometry and chest
									C ray
19	Osikomaiya et al.	Nigeria	Multi- centered	Two weeks	Discharged COVID-19	274	41.8 ± 11.8 years	181 out of	Fever, fatigue, weight loss,
	[40]			after discharge	patients who were			274 (66.1%)	malaise, cough, dyspnea,
					Hospitalized in ward or				chest pain, anosmia, loss of
					ICU				appetite, dizziness,
									palpitations, insomnia
									vertigo, dysgeusia

20	Leth et al. [41]	Denmark	Single centered	12-week	Hospitalized COVID-19	71 patients	58 (48–73)	43%	Difficulty in concentration,
					that were discharged				paresthesia's, headache,
					after negative PCR				anosmia, taste impairment,
									cough dyspnea,
									expectoration, sore throat,
21	Sudre et al.[23]	United Kingdom	Multi-center	3 months	Mobile health app users	4,182	44 (28, 56)	28.5%	Number of symptoms,
					with PCR positive				duration of symptoms,
					COVID-19				quality of life,
					patients/negative				
					matched controls				

Table 2. General article characteristics and study population. Standard deviation (SD), interquartile range (IQR)

Clinical characteristics of post-	Studies (n)	Number of patients	Total number of	Prevalence;
acute COVID-19		with symptoms (n)	patients (n)	%
Fatigue	13	2412	4457	54.11%
Hyperhidrosis	1	127	538	23.6%
Migraine-like Headache	8	221	3006	0.03%
Vertigo	2	11	629	1.74%
Alopecia/Telogen effluvium	3	537	2313	23.21%

Dyspnea	15	790	3242	24.38%
Anosmia	13	497	3924	12.66%
Dry eyes	1	21	146	14.38%
Blurred vision	3	70	838	8.35%
Dysgeusia/Ageusia	7	293	3009	9.73%
Arthralgia	5	198	1211	16.35%
Myalgias	9	204	3527	5.78%
Adjustment disorder	1	2	355	0.56%
Anxiety	3	160	925	17.29%
Dementia	1	82	287	28.57%
Dizziness	3	123	2467	4.98%
Depression	2	117	825	14.18%
Cough	11	434	2527	17.17%
Expectoration	1	16	538	2.97%
Insomnia	6	725	2790	25.98%
Obsessive compulsive disorder	1	14	287	4.87%

New-onset hypertension	3	10	1180	0.84%
New-onset diabetes	2	3	642	0.46%
Palpitations	5	252	2952	8.53%
Discontinuous flushing	1	26	538	4.83%
Restless leg syndrome	1	2	355	0.56%
Pedal edema	1	14	538	2.6%
Memory disturbances	4	69	849	8.12%
Rash/Cutaneous signs	4	87	2417	3.59%
Chest pain	12	459	4422	10.37%
Sore throat/odynophagia	6	150	2886	5.19%
Bowel/bladder incontinence	1	8	100	8%
Tinnitus	1	48	287	16.72%
Weight loss	3	42	504	8.33%
Diarrhea/Vomiting/gastrointestinal	7	236	2911	8.1%
issues				
More than one symptom	5	456	1533	29.74%

Table 3. Post-acute COVID-19 signs and symptoms after recovery

