

1 **COVID-19 reinfection: A Rapid Systematic Review of Case Reports and Case Series**

2 Jingzhou Wang, M.D.¹, Christopher Kaperak, M.D.¹, Toshiro Sato, M.D., Ph.D.^{2,3}, Atsushi Sakuraba, M.D.,
3 Ph.D.⁴

- 4 1. Department of Internal Medicine, University of Chicago Medicine, Chicago, IL, USA.
5 2. Department of Organoid Medicine, Keio University School of Medicine, Tokyo, Japan.
6 3. Corona Virus Task Force, Keio University School of Medicine, Tokyo, Japan.
7 4. Section of Gastroenterology, Hepatology, and Nutrition, University of Chicago Medicine,
8 Chicago, IL, USA.

9
10 **Corresponding author:**

11 Atsushi Sakuraba, M.D., Ph.D.

12 Director of Clinical Trial/Research

13 Section of Gastroenterology, Hepatology, and Nutrition, The University of Chicago Medicine.

14 5841 S. Maryland Ave. MC 4076, Chicago, IL 60637

15 (Phone) 773-834-0687 (Fax) 773-834-1029

16 (E-mail) asakurab@medicine.bsd.uchicago.edu

17 **Sources of Support including grants, fellowships, and gifts of materials:** None

18 **Potential of conflicts of interest:** All authors have no conflicts of interest directly relevant to the content
19 of this article.

20 **Author contribution:** JW: Methodology (equal); Writing of original draft. CK: Methodology (equal);
21 Writing of original draft (equal). TS: Editing and approval of final draft. AS: Conceptualization;
22 Methodology; Writing, review and editing.

23 **Word count:** 890

24 **Key Words:** Coronavirus, COVID-19, Reinfection

25 **Abstract:**

26 The COVID-19 pandemic has infected millions of people worldwide and many countries have been
27 suffering from a large number of deaths. Acknowledging the ability of SARS-CoV-2 to mutate into
28 distinct strains as an RNA virus and investigating its potential to cause reinfection is important for future
29 health policy guidelines. It was thought that individuals who recovered from COVID-19 generate a
30 robust immune response and develop protective immunity, however, since the first case of documented
31 reinfection of COVID-19 in August 2020, there have been a number of cases with reinfection. Many
32 cases are lacking genomic data of the two infections and it remains unclear whether they were caused
33 by different strains. In the present study, we undertook a rapid systematic review to identify cases
34 infected with different genetic strains of SARS-CoV-2 confirmed by polymerase-chain reaction and viral
35 genome sequencing. A total of 17 cases of genetically confirmed COVID-19 reinfection were found. One
36 immunocompromised patient had mild symptoms with the first infection, but developed severe
37 symptoms resulting in death with the second infection. Overall, 68.8% (11/16) had similar severity,
38 18.8% (3/16) had worse symptoms, and 12.5% (2/16) had milder symptoms with the second episode.
39 Our case series shows that reinfection with different strains is possible and some cases may experience
40 more severe infections with the second episode. The findings also suggest that COVID-19 may continue
41 to circulate even after achieving herd immunity through natural infection or vaccination suggesting the
42 need for longer term transmission mitigation efforts.

43

44

45 Coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) has infected over 38 million individuals and claimed at least one
46 million lives across the globe since it originated in Wuhan, China in late 2019.(1) As an RNA virus that is
47 prone to mutations, SARS-CoV-2 has been reported to have heterogeneous genetic composition in
48 different geographical locations.(2) Since August 2020, several cases of COVID-19 reinfections have been
49 reported. The current study aims to summarize these cases to facilitate our understanding on the
50 degree of protective immunity.

51
52 Electronic databases (PubMed, MedRxiv, and Social Science Research Network) were searched from Jan
53 1st, 2020 to October 12th, 2020 using terms “SARS-CoV-2,” “CoV2,” “COVID-19,” and “reinfection”.
54 COVID-19 reinfection was defined as individuals infected with different genetic strains of SARS-CoV-2
55 confirmed by polymerase-chain reaction. Only studies with viral genome sequencing available for both
56 infectious events were included in this report to distinguish true re-infection and prolonged viral
57 shedding, as research has shown that a certain proportion of patients may continue to carry the virus
58 despite resolution of symptoms and prior negative PCR tests.(3) For this reason, six peer-reviewed
59 articles and two news articles from the stated date range describing either individual or small groups of
60 additional possible COVID-19 reinfections (totaling 31 individuals) were excluded. The present study was
61 a rapid systematic review of published case reports or case series, so approval of Institutional Review
62 Board (IRB) was not necessary.

63
64 A total of 17 cases of genetically confirmed COVID-19 reinfection have been reported in the literature to
65 date, which are summarized in **Table 1**. Reinfection has been reported in Asia, Europe, and North and
66 South America. Ages of reinfected individuals ranged between 24 and 89 years old. Mean interval
67 between the first and the second infection averaged 76 days (range 19-142). Only one reinfected patient
68 was immunocompromised (1/17, 5.8%). This patient was a female in her 80s undergoing chemotherapy

69 for a hematologic malignancy, who had mild symptoms with her first infection, but developed severe
70 symptoms resulting in death with her second infection.(4) Among the remaining 16 patients, the
71 proportion of patients having mild/asymptomatic infections were the same for the first and second
72 episodes (93.8%). Overall, 68.8% (11/16) had similar severity, 18.8% (3/16) had worse symptoms, and
73 12.5% (2/16) had milder symptoms with the second episode.

74

75 Individuals who recovered from COVID-19 were generally thought to generate a robust immune
76 response to clear the virus. However, it remains to be determined whether the initial infection confers a
77 protective immunity to subsequent infection(s). Recent research has suggested that positive COVID-19
78 antibody from initial infection may provide protection against reinfection in a majority of study
79 participants, but reinfection is still possible in certain individuals. (5) Reinfection with other human
80 coronaviruses is common, despite the presence of antibodies.(6) The current case series indicate that
81 COVID-19 reinfection is possible and the second infection may result in worse symptoms in nearly 20%
82 of patients and serious complications in those who are elderly and immunocompromised. Our data also
83 suggests that reinfection is not specific to any particular strain and multiple strains with different genetic
84 sequence have been shown to cause reinfection. Due to the emergence of the recently described spike
85 deletion variants from UK and South Africa, it is of interest whether second infections can occur in
86 people who have had COVID-19 during the “first wave” before these variants were prevalent.

87

88 Given the potential reporting bias and the current report only including studies with genomic data, there
89 are likely many more reinfection cases than have been currently described. However, the true
90 prevalence of COVID-19 reinfection may be difficult to estimate, considering that complete genomic
91 data is not available in most COVID-19 infections and many patients with milder symptoms were not
92 tested in the early phase of this pandemic. Additionally, people with asymptomatic reinfections are less

93 likely to be identified, so identifying true prevalence of COVID-19 reinfection is difficult without
94 population-based studies, which is a possible area for future research. Studies included in our analysis
95 reported certain key nucleotide difference between the sequenced viruses, but more recently new
96 variants have also been detected in areas of UK where cases are rising.(7) Some primary literature cited
97 in our study did not contain data on seroconversion, so it is difficult to comment on the connection
98 between immunity and presence of antibody, but one patient developed re-infection despite prior
99 positive antibody test (patient 5). Considering that the two strains belong to the same clade in some
100 reported cases, the possibility of accelerated mutation of the original strain or simultaneous infection
101 with more than one strain in addition to waning immunity should be also considered. It is also difficult to
102 differentiate between COVID-19 reinfection, relapse and PCR re-positivity in some cases and Yahav et al.
103 proposed reinfection as >90 days apart(8), but we restricted our inclusion criteria to only patients with
104 confirmed infection with different genetic strains. Two meta-analyses undertaken early in the pandemic
105 reported that reinfection or re-positivity were rare, but lacked cases with genomic data.(9, 10)
106
107 Our case series indicate that previous COVID-19 exposure does not confer total immunity and that a
108 second infection is possible. Therefore, individuals, regardless of history of prior infection, should
109 continue to participate in mitigating the spread of infection by practicing social distancing and mask
110 wearing. The findings also suggest that COVID-19 may continue to circulate in humans(11), even after
111 achieving herd immunity through natural infection or vaccination.

Table 1: Summary of COVID-19 Reinfection Cases with Confirmed Genomic Differences

Patient	Date reported	Age /sex	Immuno-compromised	Interval (days)	Symptom severity [†] (1st episode)	Symptom severity (2nd episode)	Negative PCR test in between infections	Seroconversion after initial infection	Seroconversion after second infection	Viral clade (1 st episode)	Viral clade (2 nd episode)	Recovered	Country	References [‡]
1	May-20	42M	No	51	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	Not performed	B.1.26	B. 1.26 but with several mutations	Yes	U.S.	Larson <i>et al</i> , 2020 [§]
2	Jun-20	25M	No	48	Mild	Moderate [†]	Yes	Not performed	Yes	20C	20C with 11 SNP mutations	Yes	U.S.	Tillett <i>et al</i> , 2020
3	Jun-20	51F	No	120	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	Not performed	B.1.1	A	Yes	Belgium	Van Elslande <i>et al</i> , 2020
4	Jul-20	60M	No	140	Moderate	Mild	Yes	Not performed	Yes	19B	20A	Yes	U.S.	Goldman <i>et al</i> , 2020
5	Jul-20	33M	No	142	Mild	Asymptomatic	Yes	Yes	Yes	D614 (V/19A;B.2)	G614 (G20A; B.1)	Yes	China	To <i>et al</i> , 2020
6	Jul-20	46M	No	68	Mild	Mild	Yes	Not performed	Yes	B1.p9	A.1.1	Yes	Ecuador	Pra do <i>et al</i> , 2020
7	Jul-20	89F	Yes	59	Mild	Severe [†]	Not performed	Not performed	No	N/A	10 SNP mutations	No	The Netherlands	Mulder <i>et al</i> , 2020
8	Jul-20	27M	No	66	Mild	Mild	Yes	Not performed	No	B.1	B; 8 SNP mutations	Yes	India	Shastri <i>et al</i> , 2020
9	Jul-20	31M	No	65	Asymptomatic	Mild [†]	Yes	Not performed	No	B.1.1	B.1.1; 9 SNP mutations	Yes	India	Shastri <i>et al</i> , 2020
10	Jul-20	27M	No	19	Asymptomatic	Mild [†]	Yes	Not performed	Not performed	B.1.1	B.1.1, 9 SNP mutation	Yes	India	Shastri <i>et al</i> , 2020
11	Jul-20	24F	No	55	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	No	B.1.1	B.1.1, 12 SNP mutations	Yes	India	Shastri <i>et al</i> , 2020
12	Aug-20	47F*	N/A	88	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	No	D614	G614	Yes	Qatar	Abu-Radda <i>et al</i> , 2020
13	Aug-20	27M*	N/A	46	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	Not performed	D614	G614	Yes	Qatar	Abu-Radda <i>et al</i> , 2020
14	Aug-20	42M*	N/A	71	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	Not performed	D614	G614	Yes	Qatar	Abu-Radda <i>et al</i> , 2020
15	Aug-20	27M*	N/A	55	Mild	Mild	Not performed	Not performed	Not performed	D614	G614	Yes	Qatar	Abu-Radda <i>et al</i> , 2020
16	Aug-20	25M	No	106	Asymptomatic	Asymptomatic	Yes	Not performed	Not performed	N/A	9 SNP mutations	Yes	India	Gupta <i>et al</i> , 2020
17	Sep-20	28F	No	107	Asymptomatic	Asymptomatic	Yes	Not performed	Not performed	N/A	10 SNP mutations	Yes	India	Gupta <i>et al</i> , 2020

Symptom severity were classified as follows: Severe: ICU admission; Moderate: supplemental oxygen with nasal cannula; Mild; no oxygen support but other COVID-19 symptoms (which may include cough, rhinorrhea, sore throat, shortness of breath, change in taste or smell, headache, nausea, vomiting, diarrhea, fever, chills, fatigue, myalgias)

* Only age range was reported in this study, so an average number is taken, i.e. 47 for range 45-49

† Worse symptoms at second infection compared to the first infection

‡ See full citations in the supplement.

References:

1. Medicine JHU. Coronavirus Resource Center. [web site] |. 2020. Available at: <https://coronavirus.jhu.edu/map.html>. Accessed Oct 12, 2020.
2. Islam MR, Hoque MN, Rahman MS, et al. Genome-wide analysis of SARS-CoV-2 virus strains circulating worldwide implicates heterogeneity. *Sci Rep*. 2020; 10:14004.
3. Lan L, Xu D, Ye G, et al. Positive RT-PCR Test Results in Patients Recovered From COVID-19. *JAMA*. 2020; 323:1502-1503.
4. Mulder M, van der Vegt D, Oude Munnink BB, et al. Reinfection of SARS-CoV-2 in an immunocompromised patient: a case report. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2020.
5. V Hall SF, A Charlett, A Atti, EJM Monk, R Simmons, E Wellington, MJ Cole, A Saei, B Oguti, K Munro, S Wallace, PD Kirwan, M Shrotri, A Vusirikala, S Rokadiya, M Kall, M Zambon, M Ramsay, T Brooks, SIREN Study Group, CS Brown, MA Chand, S Hopkins. Do antibody positive healthcare workers have lower SARS-CoV-2 infection rates than antibody negative healthcare workers? Large multi-centre prospective cohort study (the SIREN study), England: June to November 2020. *medRxiv*. 2021.
6. Galanti M and Shaman J. Direct Observation of Repeated Infections With Endemic Coronaviruses. *J Infect Dis*. 2020.
7. Wise J. Covid-19: New coronavirus variant is identified in UK. *BMJ*. 2020; 371:m4857.
8. Yahav D, Yelin D, Eckerle I, et al. Definitions for coronavirus disease 2019 reinfection, relapse and PCR re-positivity. *Clinical Microbiology and Infection*. 2020.
9. worldometer COVID-19 CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC [web site] |. Available at: <https://www.worldometers.info/coronavirus/>. Accessed October 2, 2020.
10. Azam M, Sulistiana R, Ratnawati M, et al. Recurrent SARS-CoV-2 RNA positivity after COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Scientific Reports*. 2020; 10.

11. To KK, Hung IF, Ip JD, et al. COVID-19 re-infection by a phylogenetically distinct SARS-coronavirus-2 strain confirmed by whole genome sequencing. *Clin Infect Dis*. 2020.