

Protective effect of Mediterranean type glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency against Plasmodium vivax malaria

Running title: **G6PD deficiency and vivax malaria**

Ghulam R. Awab^{1,2},

Fahima Aaram³,

Natsuda Jamornthanyawat⁴,

Kanokon Suwannasin⁴,

Watcharee Pagornrat⁴

James A Watson^{1,5},

Charles J Woodrow^{1,5},

Arjen Dondorp^{1,5},

Nicholas PJ Day^{1,5},

Mallika Imwong⁴,

Nicholas J. White^{1,5}

1. Mahidol-Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit (MORU), Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University, Bangkok, Thailand
2. Nangarhar Medical Faculty, Jalalabad, Afghanistan
3. Kabul Medical University, Kabul, Afghanistan
4. Department of Molecular Tropical Medicine and Genetics, Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University, Bangkok, Thailand
5. Centre for Tropical Medicine and Global Health, Nuffield Department of Medicine, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Abstract

X-linked glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase (G6PD) deficiency is the most common human enzymopathy. The severe Mediterranean variant (G6PD Med) is common across Europe and Asia, and is thought to confer protection against malaria but its effect is unclear. We fit a Bayesian statistical model to observed G6PD Med allele frequencies in 999 Pashtun patients with acute *Plasmodium vivax* malaria and 1408 population controls. G6PD Med was associated with a reduction in the incidence of symptomatic *P. vivax* malaria of 76% (95% CI 58-88) in hemizygous males and homozygous females combined, and of 55% (95% CI 38-68) in heterozygous females. Thus, in absence of very large population stratification (i.e. confounding) the G6PD Med genotype confers a very large and gene dose proportional protective effect against acute vivax malaria. The proportion of patients with vivax malaria at risk of haemolysis following 8-aminoquinoline radical cure is substantially overestimated by epidemiological studies in healthy subjects.

Keywords: glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency, G6PD, *Plasmodium vivax*, malaria, primaquine, enzymopathy.

The authors have no conflicts of interest

Financial support: Wellcome Trust: Major Overseas Programme-Thailand Unit Core Grant: 106698/B/14/Z

Correspondence: Professor NJ White, Mahidol-Oxford Tropical Medicine Research Unit (MORU), Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University, 420/6 Rajvithi Rd, Bangkok, 10400, Thailand. nickw@tropmedres.ac

1 Introduction

2 In red blood cells glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase (G6PD; EC 1.1.1.49) is the only source of
3 reduced nicotinamide adenine dinucleotide phosphate (NADPH) [1,2]. G6PD deficiency reflects
4 instability, not absence, of this enzyme which is essential for normal cellular function. Mammalian
5 red blood cells lack nuclei and the necessary protein synthetic pathway and so, unlike nucleated
6 cells, they cannot replenish degraded G6PD. In G6PD deficiency, the active enzyme content of
7 erythrocytes declines markedly as they age. NADPH is essential for maintenance of oxidant
8 defences. Thus, as G6PD deficient red cells age they become increasingly susceptible to oxidant
9 haemolysis. G6PD deficiency is the most common enzyme abnormality in humans. It is found across
10 the malaria endemic world with mutant gene prevalences up to 35% (average 8-10%) [3]. There are
11 over 200 different polymorphic variants, most of which result in enzyme deficiency, but the degree
12 of deficiency (from accelerated enzyme degradation) and thus vulnerability to oxidant haemolysis
13 varies substantially among the different genotypes. G6PD deficiency is X-linked so males are either
14 normal or fully deficient. Women display these two phenotypes (normal or homozygous deficiency)
15 as well as intermediate deficiency (heterozygotes). The heterozygote females are genetic mosaics as
16 a result of early embryonic random X-chromosome inactivation (Lyonisation). Their blood contains a
17 mixture of G6PD normal and G6PD deficient erythrocytes. Overall, at a population level, the
18 proportion averages 50:50 of each cell type, but there is inter-individual variation so in some
19 heterozygotes the large majority of erythrocytes are G6PD deficient. The high prevalences of G6PD
20 deficiency in tropical areas, particularly in Africa, and in areas where malaria was once endemic,
21 suggest that G6PD deficiency confers protection either against malaria or its adverse effects. But the
22 mechanism of protection and its extent are unclear. This has been a subject of controversy and
23 divergent opinion, with no clear conclusion. Claims have been made that there is no malaria
24 protective effect provided by G6PD deficiency, or that protective effects are seen in female
25 heterozygotes only, or in male hemizygotes only, or in both [4-11]. Most of the studies addressing

26 this question have focussed on falciparum malaria in Africa where the majority of evidence supports
27 a protective effect against severe malaria, particularly in female heterozygotes [10,11]. Whether
28 male hemizygotes and female homozygotes are protected is unclear with evidence both for and
29 against. A recent meta-analysis of 28 studies suggested a moderate protective effect against
30 uncomplicated falciparum malaria (OR: 0.77: 95% CI 0.59 to 1.02), but this estimate could be
31 affected by publication biases [4].

32 In 2002 Richard Carter and Kamini Mendis suggested that the evolutionary force selecting G6PD
33 deficiency could have been either *Plasmodium falciparum* or *Plasmodium vivax* [12]. Historically *P.*
34 *vivax* had a wider geographic distribution, although it has now been eradicated from North America,
35 Europe and Russia. Elsewhere in the Americas, the horn of Africa, Asia and Oceania *P. vivax* has
36 become the predominant cause of malaria in recent years. In general, the variants of G6PD
37 deficiency that are prevalent in these areas where *P. vivax* infections occur, or once occurred, are
38 more severe than the common (“A-”) variant prevalent in the sub-Saharan African populations (in
39 whom *P. vivax* malaria is rare and *P. falciparum* comprises the large majority of malaria infections),
40 and in peoples with their genetic origin there. The most severe of the commonly found G6PD
41 variants is the “Mediterranean” variant (“G6PD Med”). This results from a single C-T transition at
42 nucleotide position 563, causing a serine phenylalanine replacement at amino acid position 188.
43 G6PD Med is the predominant genotype in the Pashtun who live in Afghanistan, Pakistan and India
44 [13-15]. An earlier retrospective study conducted in Afghan refugees in North-Western Pakistan [14]
45 suggested that G6PD Med hemizygotes were protected against vivax malaria, but there were too
46 few observations to substantiate a trend to lower infection rates in female heterozygotes. To
47 characterise the possible protective effects of G6PD Med against *P. vivax* malaria, we conducted a
48 retrospective analysis of case-control data from clinical studies on vivax malaria, and epidemiological
49 studies of G6PD deficiency that we have conducted in Afghanistan over the past ten years. These
50 data were then combined in a meta-analysis using all previously published data on G6PD deficiency
51 in people of Pashtun ethnicity living in malaria endemic areas.

52

53 **Methods**

54 **Study Area and Participants**

55 In Afghanistan, malaria is confined to the northern plains, the Jalalabad basin and river valleys which
56 fringe the central mountains to the west and south (Figure 1). Malaria cases begin presenting in
57 May, peak in July and August, and then decline with few cases seen after November. These studies
58 were conducted over 10 years between 2009 and 2019.

59 The initial epidemiological study to assess the prevalence and genotypes of G6PD deficiency in
60 Afghanistan was undertaken in one urban centre in each of nine provinces: Jalalabad (Nangarhar
61 province), Mehtherlam (Laghman), Asadabad (Kunar), Maimana (Faryab), Taloqan (Takhar),
62 Imamsahib (Kunduz), Pulikhumri (Baghlan), Pulialam (Lowgar) and the capital, Kabul (Kabul province)
63 [15]. Provinces were chosen on the basis of practical accessibility combined with having a high risk of
64 vivax malaria (>1 case/1000 population/year), the exceptions being Kabul and Lowgar which have
65 low malaria transmission. This analysis is restricted to the Pashtun ethnic group who live in the
66 higher *P. vivax* transmission areas for two main reasons; the Pashtun comprise the majority of
67 people in the Eastern provinces where malaria incidence is highest, and G6PD variants other than
68 G6PD Med are rare in this ethnic group [13,14].

69 In the initial prevalence study in healthy subjects conducted in 2009 only males were studied [15]. A
70 convenience approach to sampling was used for reasons related to security. EDTA blood was
71 obtained from healthy male adults and children attending outpatient medical laboratories with non-
72 febrile illnesses or neighbouring vaccine administration who did not have malaria. Samples were
73 transferred to filter-paper blood spots and stored in plastic zip-lock bags with silica gel at room
74 temperature before transport to Bangkok for genotyping [15]. In later prospective studies conducted
75 in 2018 and 2019 subjects (both male and female) attending outpatients and those attending

76 immunisation centres were sampled in the same way from the same sites in Nangarhar province as
77 the clinical malaria studies (Figure 1).

78 **Clinical Studies**

79 Patients with symptomatic malaria presented to provincial malaria control centres adjacent to the
80 Pakistan border. Jalalabad, the capital city of Nangarhar province, is a referral centre for the whole
81 eastern region. Population movement takes place in both directions across this largely mountainous
82 area bordering Pakistan. The malaria treatment protocols have been reported previously [16].
83 Patients (aged >6 months) or older presenting with uncomplicated microscopy confirmed
84 symptomatic vivax malaria were enrolled if they, or their carer, gave fully informed written informed
85 consent. Inclusion criteria were mono-infection with *P. vivax*, axillary temperature $\geq 37.5^{\circ}\text{C}$ or
86 oral/rectal temperature $\geq 38^{\circ}\text{C}$, or history of fever in preceding 24 hours, and able to swallow oral
87 medication and comply with study requirements. Exclusion criteria were any clinical or laboratory
88 feature of severe malaria, significant comorbidity, known hypersensitivity to any study drugs, mixed
89 species *Plasmodium* infection and pregnancy or lactation. In the initial studies patients with
90 haemoglobin concentrations $\leq 8\text{g/dl}$ were excluded but in the later observational studies in 2019
91 anaemic patients were not excluded.

92 **Laboratory procedures**

93 Capillary blood was collected for haemoglobin measurement (HemoCue®), Giemsa-staining of thick
94 and thin blood films for parasite speciation and counts and G6PD testing. Before 2018 G6PD deficiency
95 screening used the G-6-PD OSMMR 2000 (R&D Diagnostics) and NADPH fluorescent spot test kit (10
96 minutes incubation). From 2018 the CareStart® rapid G6PD test was substituted. Dried blood spots
97 were stored for later genotyping [14,16]. Genomic DNA was extracted using the QIAamp® DNA Mini
98 Kit (QIAGEN, Germany). Eluted genomic DNA samples were frozen at -20°C until PCR amplification.
99 All samples were subjected to PCR-RFLP to assess the G6PD Mediterranean variant in exon 6, based
100 on the protocol of Samilchuk et al [18] with modifications including use of

101 primers [F14948](#) and [R15158](#) at 250 nM, a 2 µl volume of each genomic DNA template, and a final
102 reaction volume of 30 µl containing 20 mM Tris-HCl (pH 8.4), 50 mM KCl, 1 mM MgCl₂, 125 µM 4-
103 deoxynucleotide triphosphate (dNTPs), and 0.05 units Platinum®*Taq* DNA polymerase (Invitrogen,
104 Brazil). After pre-denaturation at 95°C for 5 min, 45 PCR cycles were performed involving
105 denaturation at 94°C for 1 min, annealing at 55°C for 1 min and extension at 72°C for 1 min, with
106 post-extension at 72°C for 7 min. 10 µl of each PCR product was digested with 10 units of the
107 restriction enzyme *MbolI* (New England Biolabs Inc.) at 37°C for 3 hours and visualized by 2%
108 agarose gel electrophoresis. A product pattern of 104+98+28 bp indicates the G6PD Med mutation,
109 whereas 202+28 bp indicates wild-type. All PCR products of samples with mutant type and 10% of
110 the wild type samples were purified subsequently and the DNA was sequenced (Macrogen, Korea).
111 Gene sequences of the PCR amplification products of *g6pd* (accession number: NM_001042351.2)
112 were confirmed using the NCBI's Blastn and Blastx programmes. Gene polymorphisms were assessed
113 by comparison with the reference sequences using BioEdit v7.2.5.

114 **Additional data included in the meta-analysis assessing the protective effect of G6PD deficiency**

115 A systematic literature review identified two other sources of relevant data in Pashtun subjects.
116 Bouma et al [13] described a phenotyping survey in male Afghan and Pakistani Pashtun refugee
117 schoolchildren (Safi and Mamund tribes, respectively). Leslie *et al* [14] described a *P. vivax* case
118 control study in which patients who had been enrolled in earlier clinical trials assessing vivax malaria
119 treatments were matched to community controls. This was also an Afghan refugee population. The
120 refugee villages were located close to Peshawar in the North-West frontier province of Pakistan
121 (Figure 1), close to the border with Afghanistan. The majority of individuals were also from the Safi
122 and Mamund tribes. This study relied mainly on phenotyping (except for heterozygous females). In
123 the meta-analysis the phenotyping of males was assumed to be 100% sensitive and specific for the
124 G6PD Med genotype. Thus for the study reported by Leslie et al, we included all data from males,
125 but for females we only included data from genotyped individuals (154 genotyped female controls
126 and 78 genotyped female cases) as phenotyping identifies only a minority of heterozygotes. The

127 inclusion and exclusion criteria for the vivax cases reported by Leslie *et al* were very similar to those
128 in our clinical studies in Eastern Afghanistan.

129 **Statistical analysis**

130 To estimate the degree of protection against vivax malaria and investigate a possible gene-dose
131 effect, we analyzed all the available data under a Bayesian statistical model that estimates the
132 relative risk reduction. We chose this model structure instead of a logistic regression with the allele
133 as the predictive variable and the case-control status as the outcome (the usual model choice for
134 genetic case-control studies) because we can assume that the protective effect in G6PD deficient
135 hemizygous males and homozygous females is the same (i.e. from a red cell perspective, they are
136 identical). Log-odds estimated from a logistic regression model are not collapsible, therefore this
137 assumption cannot be input into a logistic regression model. Our formulation, in terms of relative
138 reduction, allows for this assumption to be hard-wired into the model. It should be noted that this
139 assumption applies to the marginal effect of G6PD deficiency, i.e. females could be more or less
140 likely to have clinical vivax malaria relative to males, but the protective effect of hemizygote and
141 homozygote G6PD deficiency is assumed identical, conditional on having clinical vivax malaria.

142 The model assumed that Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium held in the studied population(s). We tested
143 this assumption by applying an exact test appropriate for X-linked biallelic markers in the control
144 populations ($p=0.9$ for the data reported here; $p=0.6$ for the combined data in the meta-analysis)
145 [19]. The unknown overall allele frequency of the Mediterranean variant of G6PD deficiency is
146 denoted p . The total number of healthy males (controls) sampled is denoted $N_{males}^{healthy}$; the total
147 number of *P. vivax* infected males (cases) is denoted N_{males}^{vivax} ; within these groups, the number of
148 hemizygote deficient males are denoted $N_{males}^{healthy,HemiD}$ and $N_{males}^{vivax,HemiD}$, respectively. The same
149 notation is used for the female subjects, except that the superscript *HetD* refers to heterozygous
150 deficient, *HomoD* refers to homozygous deficient, and *WT* refers to G6PD normal.

151 The likelihood of the observed data for the non-malaria controls is given by:

It is made available under a [CC-BY 4.0 International license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) .

$$N_{males}^{healthy,HemiD} \sim Binomial(N_{males}^{healthy}, p)$$

$$\{N_{females}^{healthy,HomoD}, N_{females}^{healthy,HetD}, N_{females}^{healthy,WT}\} \sim Multinomial(\theta_{controls})$$

152 Where $\theta_{controls} = \{p^2, 2p[1-p], 1-p^2-2p[1-p]\}$.

153 The likelihood of the observed data for the vivax malaria cases is given by:

$$N_{males}^{vivax,HemiD} \sim Binomial(N_{males}^{vivax}, \alpha p)$$

$$\{N_{females}^{vivax,HomoD}, N_{females}^{vivax,HetD}, N_{females}^{vivax,WT}\} \sim Multinomial(\theta_{cases})$$

154 Where $\theta_{cases} = \{\alpha p^2, \beta 2p[1-p], 1-\alpha p^2-\beta 2p[1-p]\}$.

155 The parameter α , such that $0 \leq \alpha \leq 1$, denotes the vivax malaria protective effect of hemi- and
156 homozygous deficiencies. A value of $\alpha=1$ implies no protective effect, and $\alpha=0$ implies a complete
157 protective effect. Thus $1-\alpha$ is the relative reduction in prevalence in hemi/homozygous G6PD
158 deficient *P. vivax* malaria cases compared to the controls. The parameter β , such that $0 \leq \beta \leq 1$,
159 denotes the protective effect of heterozygous G6PD deficiency with the same interpretation.

160 Weakly informative Bayesian priors were subjectively chosen as follows:

161 $\alpha \sim \text{Uniform}[0,1]$

162 $\beta \sim \text{Uniform}[0,1]$

163 $p \sim \text{Beta}(2,18)$

164 This model allows for an additive effect (i.e. the protective effect in heterozygous females is less
165 than in homo/hemi-zygotes), or an increased effect in heterozygotes (expected under a model of
166 balancing selection driven by heterozygous advantage). The Bayesian model was written in *stan* and
167 a reproducible implementation of the results in *rstan* is provided in the supplemental materials. Four
168 independent chains were run for 10^6 iterations, with the first half discarded for burn-in and second
169 half thinned every 200 iterations, to give a total of 10,000 samples for the posterior distribution.

170 Parameter estimates and uncertainty levels are reported as median posterior estimates with 95%
171 credible intervals (2.5% and 97.5% quantiles of the posterior distribution). Convergence of chains
172 was checked visually with trace plots.

173

174 **Ethical approval**

175 The clinical studies were approved by the Institutional Review Board of the Afghan Public Health
176 Institute, Ministry of Public Health, Afghanistan, the Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Tropical
177 Medicine, Mahidol University, Thailand, and the Oxford Tropical Research Ethics Committee, Oxford
178 University, UK. The clinical trial was registered with the clinical trials website
179 <http://www.clinicaltrials.gov/ct> under the identifier NCT01178021.

180

181 **Results**

182 **Retrospective case-control study**

183 In total 764 Pashtun patients presenting with acute vivax malaria (304 males, 460 females) and 699
184 Pashtun controls (342 males, 357 females) were studied; 236 healthy males came from the
185 epidemiology study reported previously [16] and the remaining control subjects came from the same
186 locations as the clinical malaria studies (Table 1; Figure 1). In the controls the allele frequency of
187 G6PD Med was estimated to be 7.8% (95% credible interval (CI), 6.3 to 9.5) under the assumption of
188 Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium. There was no evidence of departure from Hardy-Weinberg in the
189 controls ($p=0.9$). The proportions of G6PD Med male hemizygotes and female heterozygotes were
190 substantially lower in patients with acute vivax malaria than in people incidentally visiting clinics or
191 vaccination centres who did not have malaria (Table 1). Only 1.6% (5 out of 304) of males with vivax
192 malaria were hemizygotes (risk ratio; 95% confidence interval: 0.12 [0.08 to 0.51]) while in the
193 females with vivax malaria 7.0% (32 of 460) (RR 0.61 [0.39 to 0.95]) and 0.7% (3 of 460) were
194 heterozygotes and homozygotes respectively. Under the Bayesian model, assuming Hardy-Weinberg

195 equilibrium, these results suggest that G6PDd Med hemizygous males and homozygous females
196 have 68% protection (95% CI 39-85; i.e. relative reduction, given by $1-\alpha$ in the model) against acute
197 *P. vivax* malaria, and G6PDd Med heterozygous females have 51% protection (95% CI 28-67, given
198 by $1-\beta$ in the model).
199 Geometric mean (range) *P. vivax* parasite densities were very similar in patients with wild type G6PD
200 (2099; 80 to 67,000 parasites/uL; N=570) and female G6PD Med heterozygotes (2064; 310 to 26,110
201 parasites/uL; N=25) and were slightly lower in the six patients with quantitative parasite counts who
202 were G6PD Med hemizygotes or homozygotes (922; 150 to 3720 parasites/uL; p=0.14 from a logistic
203 regression).

204

205 **Effect of a haemoglobin exclusion criterion**

206 We compared distributions of haemoglobin concentrations in the clinical trials, in which patients
207 with moderate or severe anaemia (haemoglobin <8g/dL) were excluded, with those in the more
208 recent studies in which there was no anaemia exclusion criterion. This indicated that 9.6% (29 of
209 302) patients would have been excluded if the earlier study threshold had been applied. This would
210 have resulted in exclusion of a single female heterozygote. There was no significant difference in the
211 haemoglobin concentrations at presentation comparing G6PD Med hemizygotes or homozygotes,
212 heterozygotes, or wild type. This shows that exclusion of anaemic patients in the first part of the
213 study did not affect the interpretation of the protective effect of G6PD deficiency on vivax malaria.

214

215 **Meta-analysis**

216 These data were then combined with data from the two previously reported studies on the
217 prevalence of G6PD deficiency in the Pashtun ethnic group from Afghanistan. One was in healthy
218 subjects only [13] and the other included both vivax malaria patients and matched healthy control
219 subjects [14]. (Table 1). The meta-analysis of all three studies gave a slightly higher G6PD Med allele
220 frequency of 8.8% (95% CI, 7.6-10.1). The overall protective effect in male hemizygotes and female

221 homozygotes was estimated as 76% (95% CI, 58-88) and in female heterozygotes was 55% (95% CI,
222 38-68). The posterior distributions for these estimates from the meta-analysis are shown in Figure 2.
223 The posterior probability that the protective effect observed in female heterozygotes was less than
224 the protective effect observed in male hemizygotes and female homozygotes was 0.98, suggesting
225 that the protective effect is proportional to the gene-dose.

226 Discussion

227 The Mediterranean type glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency (G6PD Med) variant
228 prevalent in the Pashtun provided a strong and gene-dose related protective effect against
229 *Plasmodium vivax* malaria. This is a much greater protective effect than observed against *P.*
230 *falciparum* malaria elsewhere [4, 10]. It is probably explained by two factors. First the degree of
231 enzyme deficiency with G6PD Med is substantially greater than in the common African A- variant,
232 which has been the main genotype studied previously in falciparum malaria studies. Second, *P. vivax*
233 is generally more sensitive to oxidant effects than *P. falciparum*. Compared with *P. falciparum*,
234 asexual stages of *P. vivax* are also more sensitive to oxidant drugs (i.e. artemisinins and synthetic
235 peroxides and 8-aminoquinolines) [20,21]. *P. vivax* may therefore be more sensitive to the oxidant
236 stresses associated with G6PD deficiency. This large study from Afghanistan confirms earlier findings
237 from a case control study in Afghan Pashtun refugees, based mainly on phenotyping. This earlier
238 study showed clear evidence of protection against vivax malaria in male hemizygotes, but in the
239 smaller subgroup of genotyped female heterozygotes the uncertainty around the estimated effect
240 was large (adjusted odds ratio: 0.4, 95% CI 0.16 to 1.02) [14]. These earlier studies, and a smaller
241 series from Iran with phenotyping [22], are all consistent with the present series. Combined together
242 they show clearly that G6PD Med provides a substantial gene dose proportionate protection against
243 vivax malaria. The inference of the gene-dose effect in females assumes that hemizygote males and
244 homozygote females are phenotypically identical, and, as expected from the Hardy-Weinberg
245 equilibrium, there were few female homozygotes, so the majority of the protective signal in this

246 combined group is from the hemizygote males. In a survey conducted in periurban Manaus, in the
247 Amazon region of Western Brazil, where *P. vivax* is now the predominant (90%) cause of malaria,
248 there was also a very strong protective effect of G6PD Med against self-reported previous malaria
249 (AOR: 0.010) [23]. In comparison the protective effect of G6PD A- in the same location was an order
250 of magnitude weaker (AOR 0.119). This marked protective benefit of G6PD deficiency against *P.*
251 *vivax* infections is critically important for the assessment of population haemolytic risk associated
252 with giving 8-aminoquinoline antimalarials for the radical cure for vivax malaria. The proportion of
253 patients with vivax malaria at risk of serious haemolysis with G6PD Med in these studies is nearly
254 four times lower than would be predicted from gene frequencies in the healthy population.

255 G6PD Med is among the most severe of the polymorphic genetic G6PD variants. It is found
256 across the malaria endemic regions of the world, having evolved independently on several occasions
257 [15, 24]. There is also evidence for protection against vivax malaria from the moderate severity
258 G6PD Mahidol variant. A study from western Thailand found that *P. vivax* densities were lower in
259 hemizygote males and also in heterozygote females presenting to clinics with vivax malaria, but
260 there was no corresponding effect in falciparum malaria, and there was no apparent protective
261 effect against malaria illness [25]. However, a case-control study from Northern Myanmar in a
262 population with a high prevalence (25.2%) of the G6PD Mahidol variant gave adjusted odds ratios for
263 having acute vivax malaria of 0.213 (95%CI 0.093 to 0.487) for male 487A hemizygotes, and 0.248
264 (0.110 to 0.561) for female heterozygotes [26]. In a multi-site survey of G6PD deficiency in malaria
265 patients in Cambodia, where G6PD Viangchan predominates (WHO class 2 but quantitatively similar
266 to G6PD Mahidol), phenotypic severe deficiency (i.e. <10% of population normal) provided stronger
267 protection against *P. vivax* than *P. falciparum* infections (OR: 0.45 95%CI 0.32 to 0.64) [27].
268 Conversely Dewasurendra *et al* in Sri Lanka reported evidence of hemizygote protection from
269 malaria and lower parasite densities for *P. falciparum*, but not *P. vivax* [28].

270 A recent meta-analysis of 28 studies [4] addressing the question of whether G6PD deficiency
271 protects against malaria showed a moderate protective effect against uncomplicated falciparum

272 malaria (OR: 0.77: 95% CI 0.59 to 1.02). The degree of protection was similar in female
273 heterozygotes (OR 0.7 95% CI 0.57 to 0.87) and in male hemizygotes and female homozygotes (OR
274 0.7 95% CI 0.46 to 1.07) but did not reach statistical significance in the latter group. There was
275 evidence for publication bias towards significant findings in the uncomplicated malaria comparisons.
276 The same meta-analysis also concluded that there was no statistically significant protective effect in
277 severe malaria or in *Plasmodium vivax* malaria, although there were limited data to assess the
278 protective effects in *P. vivax* infections.

279 The degree of protection conferred by G6PD Med against *P. vivax* illness estimated in this
280 study is large; it is similar in magnitude to the well described protection conferred by Hb AS (sickle
281 cell heterozygotes) against falciparum malaria [29]. It is possible that G6PD deficiency confers no
282 significant protection against infection by *P. falciparum*, but protects only against life threatening
283 illness. This may reflect either inhibition of parasite multiplication or a different protective
284 mechanism. One consistent clinical feature of G6PD deficiency is an increased risk of anaemia in
285 acute infections as the deficient red cells haemolyse [10,11]. As severe anaemia (Hb <5g/dL) is one
286 of the criteria for defining severe malaria this results in a higher proportion of patients with G6PD
287 deficiency presenting with severe malarial anaemia, and therefore being diagnosed as having severe
288 malaria. This can bias genetic association studies [30]. It has been suggested that G6PD deficiency
289 may protect specifically against cerebral malaria, but a simpler explanation is that, in the context of
290 severe falciparum malaria, a rapid onset of moderate anaemia protects against life threatening
291 complications such as cerebral malaria [31,32].

292 There are several limitations to this study. It was not designed prospectively as a case-
293 control study. It combines results from a prospective epidemiology study conducted six years ago
294 and prospective clinical trials and sampling of controls from the same centres from 2018. For
295 security reasons careful matching of cases and controls (other than for location) was not possible.
296 We do not have additional genetic marker data that could be used to adjust for population
297 stratification. However, in the earlier study by Leslie et al [14], conducted in refugee camps in

298 Pakistan, careful matching was done, particularly with reference to tribe (within the Pashtun group)
299 and location, and that study's findings are consistent with the present investigation. Nevertheless, it
300 remains possible that uncharacterised variations between the different investigations and genetic
301 heterogeneity within the Pashtun group are confounders. As many of the controls had non-malaria
302 febrile illnesses it is possible, although unlikely, that the prevalence of G6PD deficiency is higher in
303 such patients to that in the general population. In the initial clinical studies reported here, and in the
304 earlier studies in Pashtun refugees [14], severe anaemia was an exclusion criterion. This could have
305 reduced the proportion of G6PD deficient patients, but there was no evidence for differences in
306 presenting haemoglobin concentrations between G6PD deficient and G6PD normal patients. This
307 study was confined to the G6PD Mediterranean genotype, so other G6PD polymorphisms were not
308 studied, but these are unusual in the Pashtun. If there were undetected G6PD deficient patients
309 then they would have diluted the apparent protective benefit. Potential confounders become
310 progressively more relevant as effects become smaller.

311 Overall, this study shows that the G6PD Mediterranean genotype confers a very large and
312 gene dose proportional protective effect against vivax malaria. If G6PD Med is approximately at an
313 equilibrium allele frequency in the Pashtun population (i.e. is under balancing selection), this implies
314 that it must be harmful, i.e. malaria alone cannot create balancing selection. The main risks
315 associated with G6PD deficiency are neonatal hyperbilirubinemia and haemolysis following oxidant
316 food and drugs while the benefit is protection from malaria. Importantly for malaria treatment, the
317 population risks associated with 8-aminoquinoline radical cure are greatly overestimated from G6PD
318 prevalences in the healthy population.

Acknowledgements

The investigators are grateful to the doctors, laboratory technicians, and malaria workers in the sites in Afghanistan, the Afghanistan National Malaria and Leishmania Control Program (NMLCP), the two provincial health directorates, and the senior management of the Ministry of Public Health and WHO-Afghanistan. We are also very grateful to the Molecular Tropical Medicine and Genetics laboratory staff in the Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University for their help with genotyping.

Funding

This work was supported by the Wellcome Trust. Dr Ghulam R. Awab was a Wellcome Trust tropical medicine training fellow. The studies were supported by the Wellcome Trust of Great Britain (Major Overseas Programme-Thailand Unit Core Grant: 106698/B/14/Z) and by the Wellcome Trust Principal Fellowship of NJ White.

References

1. Beutler E. G6PD deficiency. *Blood*. 1994; 84: 3613–36.
2. Luzzatto L, Arese P. Favism and Glucose-6-Phosphate Dehydrogenase Deficiency. *N Engl J Med*. 2018; 378: 60-71.
3. Howes RE, Piel FB, Patil AP, Nyangiri OA, Gething PW, Dewi M, Hogg MM, Battle KE, Padilla CD, Baird JK, Hay SI. G6PD deficiency prevalence and estimates of affected populations in malaria endemic countries: a geostatistical model-based map. *PLoS Med*. 2012; 9(11): e1001339.
4. Mbanefo EC, Ahmed AM, Titouna A, Elmaraezy A, Trang NT, Phuoc Long N, Hoang Anh N, Diem Nghi T, The Hung B, Van Hieu M, Ky Anh N, Huy NT, Hirayama K. Association of glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency and malaria: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Sci Rep*. 2017; 7: e45963.
5. Bienzle U, Ayeni O, Lucas AO, Luzzatto L. Glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase and malaria. Greater resistance of females heterozygous for enzyme deficiency and of males with non-deficient variant. *Lancet*. 1972; 1: 107–10.
6. Ruwende C, Khoo SC, Snow RW, Yates SN, Kwiatkowski D, Gupta S, Warn P, Allsopp CE, Gilbert SC, Peschu N, Newbold CI, Greenwood BM, Marsh K, Hill AV. Natural selection of hemi- and heterozygotes for G6PD deficiency in Africa by resistance to severe malaria. *Nature*. 1995; 376: 246–9.
7. Guindo A, Fairhurst RM, Doumbo OK, Wellem TE, Diallo DA. X-linked G6PD deficiency protects hemizygous males but not heterozygous females against severe malaria. *PLoS Med*. 2007;4:e66.
8. Mombo LE, Ntoumi F, Bisseye C, Ossari S, Lu CY, Nagel RL, Krishnamoorthy R. Human genetic polymorphisms and asymptomatic *Plasmodium falciparum* malaria in Gabonese school children. *Am J Trop Med Hyg*. 2003; 68: 186–90.
9. Lopera-Mesa TM, Doumbia S, Konaté D, Anderson JM, Doumbouya M, Keita AS, Diakité SA, Traoré K, Krause MA, Diouf A, Moretz SE, Tullo GS, Miura K, Gu W, Fay MP, Taylor SM, Long CA,

- Diakité M, Fairhurst RM. Effect of red blood cell variants on childhood malaria in Mali: a prospective cohort study. *Lancet Haematol*. 2015; 2: e140-9.
10. Uyoga S, Ndila CM, Macharia AW, Nyutu G, Shah S, Peshu N, Clarke GM, Kwiatkowski DP, Rockett KA, Williams TN; MalariaGEN Consortium. Glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency and the risk of malaria and other diseases in children in Kenya: a case-control and a cohort study. *Lancet Haematol*. 2015; 2: e437-44.
11. Clarke GM, Rockett K, Kivinen K, Hubbard C, Jeffreys AE, Rowlands K, Jallow M, Conway DJ, Bojang KA, Pinder M, Usen S, Sisay-Joof F, Sirugo G, Toure O, Thera MA, Konate S, Sissoko S, Niangaly A, Poudiougou B, Mangano VD, Bougouma EC, Sirima SB, Modiano D, Amenga-Etego LN, Ghansah A, Koram KA, Wilson MD, Enimil A, Evans J, Amodu OK, Olaniyan S, Apinjoh T, Mugri R, Ndi A, Ndila CM, Uyoga S, Macharia A, Peshu N, Williams TN, Manjurano A, Sepúlveda N, Clark TG, Riley E, Drakeley C, Reyburn H, Nyirongo V, Kachala D, Molyneux M, Dunstan SJ, Phu NH, Quyen NN, Thai CQ, Hien TT, Manning L, Laman M, Siba P, Karunajeewa H, Allen S, Allen A, Davis TM, Michon P, Mueller I, Molloy SF, Campino S, Kerasidou A, Cornelius VJ, Hart L, Shah SS, Band G, Spencer CC, Agbenyega T, Achidi E, Doumbo OK, Farrar J, Marsh K, Taylor T, Kwiatkowski DP; MalariaGEN Consortium. Characterisation of the opposing effects of G6PD deficiency on cerebral malaria and severe malarial anaemia. *Elife*. 2017; 6: e15085.
12. Carter R, Mendis KN. Evolutionary and historical aspects of the burden of malaria. *Clin Microbiol Rev*. 2002; 15: 564-94.
13. Bouma MJ, Goris M, Akhtar T, Khan N, Khan N, Kita E. Prevalence and clinical presentation of glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency in Pakistani Pathan and Afghan refugee communities in Pakistan; implications for the use of primaquine in regional malaria control programmes. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg*. 1995; 89: 62-64.
14. Leslie T, Bricen M, Mayan I, Mohammed N, Klinkenberg E, Hopkins Sibley C, Whitty CJM, Rowland M. The impact of phenotypic and genotypic G6PD deficiency on risk of *Plasmodium vivax*

- infection: A case-control study amongst Afghan refugees in Pakistan. *Plos Med.* 2010; 7; e1000283.
15. Jamornthanyawat N, Awab GR, Tanomsing N, Pukrittayakamee S, Yamin F, Dondorp AM, Day NP, White NJ, Woodrow CJ, Imwong M. A population survey of the glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase (G6PD) 563C>T (Mediterranean) mutation in Afghanistan. *PLoS One.* 2014; 9: e88605.
16. Awab GR, Imwong M, Bancone G, Jeeyapant A, Day NPJ, White NJ, Woodrow CJ. Chloroquine-Primaquine versus Chloroquine Alone to Treat Vivax Malaria in Afghanistan: An Open Randomized Superiority Trial. *Am J Trop Med Hyg.* 2017; 97:1782-1787.
17. Samilchuk E, D'Souza B, Al-Awadi S. Population study of common glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase mutations in Kuwait. *Hum Hered* 1999; 49: 41– 44.
18. Stan Development Team. 2018. The Stan Core Library, Version 2.18.0. <http://mc-stan.org>
19. Graffelman J, Weir BS. Testing for Hardy–Weinberg equilibrium at biallelic genetic markers on the X chromosome. *Heredity* 2016; **116**, 558–568.
20. Phyto AP, Jittamala P, Nosten FH, Pukrittayakamee S, Imwong M, White NJ, DuparcS, Macintyre F, Baker M, Möhrle JJ. Antimalarial activity of artefenomel (OZ439), a novel synthetic antimalarial endoperoxide, in patients with *Plasmodium falciparum* and *Plasmodium vivax* malaria: an open-label phase 2 trial. *Lancet Infect Dis.* 2016; 16: 61-69.
21. Pukrittayakamee S, Chantira A, Simpson JA, Vanijanonta S, Clemens R, Looareesuwan S, White NJ. Therapeutic responses to different antimalarial drugs in vivax malaria. *Antimicrob Agents Chemother.* 2000; 44: 1680-5.
22. Ebrahimipour M, Nateghpour M, Hajjaran H, Edrissian G, Jalali M, Raeisi A, Motevalli Haghi A, Farivar L, Khodadadi M, Rahimi-Froushani A. The Rate of *Plasmodium vivax* Infectivity within Glucose-6-Phosphate Dehydrogenase (G6PD) Deficient Individuals in Hormozgan Province, Iran. *Iran J Parasitol.* 2014; 9: 402-6.

23. Santana MS, Monteiro WM, Siqueira AM, Costa MF, Sampaio V, Lacerda MV, Alecrim MG. Glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficient variants are associated with reduced susceptibility to malaria in the Brazilian Amazon. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg.* 2013; 107: 301-6.
24. Kurdi-Haidar B, Mason PJ, Berrebi A, Ankra-Badu G, al-Ali A, Oppenheim A, Luzzatto L. Origin and spread of the glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase variant (G6PD-Mediterranean) in the Middle East. *Am J Hum Genet.* 1990; 47: 1013-9.
25. Louicharoen C, Patin E, Paul R, Nuchprayoon I, Witoonpanich B, Peerapittayamongkol C, Casademont I, Sura T, Laird NM, Singhasivanon P, Quintana-Murci L, Sakuntabhai A. Positively selected G6PD-Mahidol mutation reduces *Plasmodium vivax* density in southeast Asians. *Science.* 2009; 326: 1546–9.
26. Yi H, Li H, Liang L, Wu Y, Zhang L, Qiu W, Jiang W, Yang F, Li Q, Yang Z, Wang C, Cui L, He Y. The glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase Mahidol variant protects against uncomplicated *Plasmodium vivax* infection and reduces disease severity in a Kachin population from northeast Myanmar. *Infect Genet Evol.* 2019; 75: e103980.
27. Khim N, Benedet C, Kim S, Kheng S, Siv S, Leang R, Lek S, Muth S, Chea N, Chuor CM, Duong S, Kerleguer A, Tor P, Chim P, Canier L, Witkowski B, Taylor WR, Ménard D. G6PD deficiency in *Plasmodium falciparum* and *Plasmodium vivax* malaria-infected Cambodian patients. *Malar J.* 2013;12: 171.
28. Dewasurendra RL, Rockett KA, Fernando SD, Carter R, Kwiatkowski DP, Karunaweera ND; MalariaGEN Consortium. G6PD gene variants and its association with malaria in a Sri Lankan population. *Malar J.* 2015; 14: 93.
29. Williams TN, Mwangi TW, Wambua S, Alexander ND, Kortok M, Snow RW, Marsh K. Sickle cell trait and the risk of *Plasmodium falciparum* malaria and other childhood diseases. *J Infect Dis.* 2005; 192: 178-86.

30. Watson JA, Leopold SJ, Simpson JA, Day NP, Dondorp AM, White NJ. Collider bias and the apparent protective effect of glucose-6-phosphate dehydrogenase deficiency on cerebral malaria. *Elife*. 2019; 8: e43154.
31. White NJ. Anaemia and malaria. *Malar J*. 2018 ;17: e371.
32. Leopold SJ, Watson JA, Jeeyapant A, Simpson JA, Phu NH, Hien TT, Day NPJ, Dondorp AM, White NJ. Investigating causal pathways in severe falciparum malaria: A pooled retrospective analysis of clinical studies. *PLoS Med*. 2019; 16: e1002858.

Table

Table 1 Summary of all case-control data included in the meta-analysis. *Data from this report; 23 of 236 male controls from the earlier epidemiological study [15] and 5 of 106 male controls from the later studies were hemizygotes.

		General population (controls)				<i>P. vivax</i> malaria (cases)			
		Awab	Leslie	Bouma		Awab	Leslie	Bouma	
		et al*	et al [14]	et al [13]	Total	et al*	et al [14]	[13]	Total
males	hemizygous	28	31	25	84	5	2	0	7
	normal	314	285	214	813	299	155	0	454
females	homozygous	2	2	0	4	3	0	0	3
	heterozygous	50	26	0	76	32	6	0	38
	normal	305	126	0	431	425	72	0	497

Legends to Figures

Figure 1: Locations of the two vivax malaria clinical study sites in Eastern Afghanistan from the present study (red circles), and the approximate locations of the villages in the North-West frontier province of Pakistan where Afghan Pashtun refugees were enrolled in vivax malaria clinical trials and later included in case control studies [14] (blue circles)



Figure 2: Results from the meta-analysis assessing the protective effect of the Mediterranean variant of G6PD deficiency against *Plasmodium vivax* malaria. The posterior distributions of $1-\alpha$ (top: hemi/homozygotes) and $1-\beta$ (bottom: heterozygotes) are shown as percentages. These values represent the reduction in prevalence of clinical vivax malaria relative to G6PD normal individuals. The circles show the median estimates, with the 50% credible intervals shown by the thick blue lines and the 95% credible intervals shown by the thin blue lines.

hemi/homo-zygous



heterozygous



0 25 50 75 100
Reduction in prevalence of clinical vivax malaria (%)