

Age-dependence of mortality from novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in highly exposed populations: New York transit workers and residents and Diamond Princess passengers.

Christopher T. Leffler, MD, MPH.^{1,2}

Matthew C. Hogan, MS, MPH.³

1. Department of Ophthalmology. Virginia Commonwealth University. Richmond, VA 23298.
chrislefflermd@gmail.com

2. Department of Ophthalmology. Hunter Holmes McGuire VA Medical Center, Richmond, VA.

3. School of Medicine, Virginia Commonwealth University.

This paper may be cited: Leffler CT, Hogan M. Age-dependence of mortality from novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19) in highly exposed populations: the Diamond Princess cruise ship and New York residents and transit workers. **May 13, 2020.**

The authors have no financial or other conflicts of interest.

Abstract.

Background. Populations heavily exposed to the novel coronavirus provide an opportunity to estimate the mortality from COVID-19 in different age groups.

Methods. The mortality reported by May 13 from COVID-19 among Diamond Princess cruise ship passengers, and New York residents and Metropolitan Transit Authority (MTA) workers was estimated based on publicly available information.

Results. The mortality among children (age 0 to 17 yrs) in New York City was 1 in 172,692. The mortality in New York state was 1 in 322,217 for ages 10-19 yrs., and 1 in 36,725 for ages 20-29 yrs. The mortality among New York transit workers was estimated to be 1 in 7,329 for ages 30-39 years; 1 in 1,075 for ages 40-49 yrs.; 1 in 343 for ages 50-59 yrs.; and 1 in 178 for ages 60-69 yrs. Among Diamond Princess passengers, the mortality was estimated to be 1 in 145 for ages 70-79, and 1 in 54 for ages 80-89.

Conclusions: Mortality among populations exposed to the novel coronavirus increases with age, ranging from about 1 in 170,000 below the age of 18 years, to 1 in 54 above the age of 80 years.

Introduction.

Certain confined, occupational and regional populations have had substantial exposure to the SARS-CoV-2 virus which causes the novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19). Such populations provide an opportunity to estimate the mortality which might occur after many members of a population have been exposed.

The COVID-19 outbreak occurring on the Diamond Princess cruise ship in February 2020 has resulted in the deaths of 14 passengers, and has provided a window into the effect of the virus in the elderly.¹ In the United States, the large populations of New York state and city, the epicenter of the national outbreak, provide an opportunity to estimate mortality in children and young adults. Finally, as of May 6, 2020, 109 New York Metropolitan Transit Authority (MTA) workers have died from coronavirus.²⁻⁴ This population provides an opportunity to estimate the mortality in older working adults, and has not been previously studied, to our knowledge.

Methods.

We estimated from publicly available sources the coronavirus-related mortality for each age group on the Diamond Princess cruise ship, in the United States (nationally), in New York City and state, and among New York Metropolitan Transit Authority workers.²⁻⁴

The age breakdown of New York City's population was determined by dividing the COVID-19 deaths by the mortality rates reported by the New York City Department of Health.⁵

The New York State population age breakdown was obtained from the census.⁶ The United States population, total and by decade, were tabulated.^{7,8}

Exact binomial 95% confidence intervals for proportions were determined, unless the denominator was over 10,000, in which case Poisson confidence intervals were determined. Only data available to the public were used. The study was approved by the VCU Office of Research Subjects Protection.

Results.

Mortality Among Younger New Yorkers.

Among children in New York City (ages 0 to 17 years), the coronavirus mortality was estimated to be 1 in 173,000, with a 95% CI of 1 in 360,000 to 1 in 94,000 (Tables 1-2).⁵ Nationally, infants under age 1 tended to have a higher mortality (1 in 947,500), compared with children age 1 to 14 (1 in 9,517,000) (Table 3).⁹

Table 1. Mortality from novel coronavirus (COVID-19) in New York City reported by May 11, 2020.

Age (years)	Deaths	Total in Age Group	Mortality
0-17	10	1,726,916	1 in 172,692
18-44	596	3,370,166	1 in 5,655
45-64	3,383	2,056,112	1 in 608
65-74	3,753	699,112	1 in 186
75 and over	7,356	546,976	1 in 74
All	15,101	8,398,507	1 in 556

New York City deaths reported as of May 11 at 6 PM.⁵

Table 2. Coronavirus Mortality Among Highly-Exposed Populations Reported by May 13, 2020 (New York Residents and Transit Workers, and the Diamond Princess).

Age (years)	Mortality Rate (estimate)	Mortality (95% CI)		Source
		Lower bound	Upper bound	
0-17	1 in 172,692	1 in 360,119	1 in 93,903	NYC residents
10-19	1 in 322,217	1 in 746,000	1 in 164,000	NY state residents.
20-29	1 in 36,725	1 in 46,612	1 in 29,341	
30-39	1 in 7,329	1 in 9,693*	1 in 1,364	New York transit (MTA) workers.
40-49	1 in 1,075	1 in 2,295	1 in 603	
50-59	1 in 343	1 in 477	1 in 265	
60-69	1 in 178	1 in 257	1 in 132	
70-79	1 in 145	1 in 189*	1 in 70	Diamond Princess
80 and over	1 in 54	1 in 76*	1 in 21	

*Larger datasets permit the lower bound for the mortality among exposed populations to be determined with greater certainty. Therefore, for the lower bound of the 95% confidence interval (CI) for ages 30-39, the lower bound of the CI for NY state residents age 30-39 is listed. For the lower bound of the 95% CI for exposed age 70-79, that of NY state residents age 70-79 is listed. For the lower bound of the 95% CI for exposed age 80 and over, the lower end of the CI for NYC residents age 75 and over is listed.

Table 3. Mortality from novel coronavirus (COVID-19) in the United States reported by the CDC by May 13, 2020.

Age (years)	Deaths	Total in Age Group	Mortality
0 (<1)	4	3,790,000	1 in 947,500
1-4	2	16,020,000	1 in 8,010,000
5-14	4	41,080,000	1 in 10,270,000
15-24	48	42,960,000	1 in 895,000
25-34	317	45,690,000	1 in 144,000
35-44	796	41,280,000	1 in 51,900
45-54	2,262	41,630,000	1 in 18,400
55-64	5,422	42,270,000	1 in 7,800
65-74	9,359	30,480,000	1 in 3,260
75-84	12,026	15,390,000	1 in 1,280
85 and over	13,776	6,550,000	1 in 475
All	44,016	330,709,369	1 in 7,510

United States coronavirus deaths reported to the CDC, from Feb 1, 2020 to May 6, 2020. This was the latest available information on the CDC website on May 13, 2020.⁹

In New York State, the coronavirus mortality reported by May 13 was estimated as 1 in 322,217 for ages 10-19 years; 1 in 36,725 for ages 20-29 years; and 1 in 8,617 for ages 30-39 years (Tables 2, 4).¹⁰

Table 4. Mortality from Novel Coronavirus in New York State by May 13, 2020.

Age (years)	Deaths	Total in Age Group	Mortality
0-9	4	2,319,777	1 in 579,944
10-19	8	2,577,734	1 in 322,217
20-29	76	2,791,112	1 in 36,725
30-39	294	2,533,284	1 in 8,617
40-49	788	2,814,656	1 in 3,572
50-59	2,122	2,657,336	1 in 1,252
60-69	4,321	1,839,471	1 in 425
70-79	5,768	1,062,198	1 in 184
80 and over	8623	782,534	1 in 91
Total	22,013	19,378,102	1 in 880

New York State coronavirus deaths reported by May 13, 2020.¹⁰

Adult Mortality and New York City Transit.

The New York MTA has 74,000 employees, most of whom are represented by the Transport Workers Union.¹¹ In total, 106 of the 109 MTA workers who had died of coronavirus as of May 6, 2020 were in the subways and buses division, which has 55,000 employees.¹²

Of the 68 New York City MTA workers who died of coronavirus, and whose ages could be determined from public sources, one was in his 30s (1.5%, 95% CI 0.04-7.9%), 9 were in their 40s (13.2%, 95% CI 6.2-23.6%), 29 were in their 50s (42.7%, 95% CI 30.7-55.2%), 25 were in their 60s (36.8%, 95% CI 25.4-49.3%), and 4 were in their 70s (5.9%, 95% CI 1.6-14.4%). None was younger than 39 or older than 73. The age-distribution of known deaths was applied to the 106 total deaths in the bus and subways division to estimate the numbers of deaths in each decade (Table 5).^{2-4,13}

The age distribution of MTA employees is: 18-25 years (1.7%), 26-35 years (16.0%), 36-54 years (53.1%), 55-62 years (22.8%), and over 63 years (6.4%).¹³ From this distribution, the number of the 55,000 bus and subway workers was calculated for each age decade (Table 5).

Among New York MTA workers during the pandemic, the mortality was estimated to be 1 in 7,329 for ages 30-39; 1 in 1,075 for ages 40-49; 1 in 343 for ages 50-59; 1 in 178 for ages 60-69 (Tables 2, 5).

Table 5. Mortality from Novel Coronavirus among New York

MTA (Transit) Workers by May 6, 2020.^{2-4,13}

Age (years)	Estimated Deaths	Total in Age Group	Mortality
18-19	0	240	--
20-29	0	4,240	--
30-39	1-2	11,425	1 in 7,329
40-49	14	15,080	1 in 1,075
50-59	45	15,520	1 in 343
60-69	39	6,931	1 in 178
70-79	6	1,274	1 in 204
Total	106	55,000	1 in 519

The Diamond Princess and Elderly Mortality.

The age ranges of the passengers on the Diamond Princess cruise ship at the time of the coronavirus outbreak have been published (Table 6).¹ A total of 14 of the 3711 passengers have died from coronavirus, as of May 13, 2020, including one woman in her 60s (Table 6).¹⁴

Seven Diamond Princess passengers in their 70s died of COVID-19.¹⁵⁻²⁰ For ages 70 to 79 years, the mortality was 1 in 145, with 95% confidence limits from 1 in 357, to 1 in 70 (Tables 2, 6). A lower bound for mortality in exposed populations from 70 to 79 years of age comes from the data of New York State, where the mortality was 1 in 184, with 95% confidence limits of 1 in 189 to 1 in 179 (Tables 2, 4).

Four Diamond Princess passengers in their 80s died of COVID-19.²¹⁻²² The mortality was for this age group was 1 in 54, (95% CI 1 in 196, to 1 in 21, Tables 2, 6). A lower bound for mortality in the exposed elderly is obtained from the data of New York City, where the observed mortality for ages 75 and over was 1 in 74, with 95% confidence limits of 1 in 76, to 1 in 72 (Tables 1-2).

The mortality for these age decades on the Diamond Princess might actually be higher, but the ages of 2 of the 14 passengers who died was not disclosed (Table 6).^{23,24}

Table 6. Mortality from Novel Coronavirus Among Diamond Princess Passengers.^{1,14-24}

Age (years)	Deaths	Total in Age Group
0-9	0	16
10-19	0	23
20-29	0	347
30-39	0	428
40-49	0	334
50-59	0	398
60-69	1	923
70-79	7	1,015
80-89	4	216
Unknown	2	--
Total	14	3,711

Discussion.

This study found that the mortality from coronavirus among highly exposed populations is heavily dependent on age, ranging from about 1 in 170,000 under age 18, to 1 in 54 for those in their 80s. It will be important for all people, especially older adults, to take precautions to avoid infection. The strength of this study is that our method did not require estimation of the prevalence of infection or case fatality ratios (since there is no consensus about these values yet). It should be emphasized that the tabulated mortality rates are *not* infection fatality rates (fractions of infected people who die). Rather, the listed mortality rates are the fraction of the entire population who died.

Children seem to be at a low risk of mortality from coronavirus, around 1 in 170,000 in New York City to date. However, the national data do suggest that infants may be at a higher risk of coronavirus-related mortality than other children. As schools have been closed during the pandemic, the exposure of children to the virus, even in New York, was in all likelihood less than that of the other groups studied (MTA workers, Diamond Princess passengers). Presumably, if schools reopen, the mortality among children will increase. Still, it is likely that the mortality among children will remain several orders of magnitude below that of older adults.

The mortality among young adults age 20-39 is fairly low, but still an important consideration for both individual and institutional decision-making. One New York MTA worker in his late 30s died of coronavirus. A second New York transit worker in his mid-30s died of coronavirus, though technically he was not an MTA employee, and therefore, did not factor in our analysis.² The New York state data confirms that these deaths of workers in their 30s were not unprecedented. It would be useful if localities (and national authorities) could release coronavirus demographic data broken down with more granularity. For instance, colleges would be most interested in the data from age 18-22 years.

This was the first study of the mortality among New York transit workers, to our knowledge. Analysis of this group helps to characterize the mortality among older working age adults. The first confirmed case of coronavirus infection in New York City was reported on March 1, 2020.²⁵ The MTA workers were forbidden to wear masks and gloves until March 8.^{26,27} On March 26, two MTA workers died from coronavirus—the first MTA workers to suffer this fate.²⁸ An announcement that the MTA would provide the workers with masks came on March 27.²⁹ On April 4, 2020, the MTA was able to obtain 250,000 N95 masks for the workers.³⁰ On April 15, the governor of New York announced an order to require that after a 3-day notification period, the public would be required to wear masks when unable to socially distance, such as on public transit.³¹ Therefore, there was a delay of 5 weeks between presence of the infection in the city and the MTA obtaining masks, and of 7 weeks until the public was required to wear masks when in transit.

Based on the New York transit worker data, the mortality risk among exposed populations continues to increase progressively in the 40s and 50s. The sole fatality on the USS Theodore Roosevelt, on which a coronavirus outbreak occurred, was a 41-year-old sailor.³²

In highly-exposed populations, the fraction of the population infected has been less than 100%. On some ships with outbreaks, all on board were tested. On the USS Theodore Roosevelt, 856 of 4845 sailors (17.7%) tested positive for the virus.³² On the Diamond Princess, 619 of 3,711 passengers (16.7%) tested positive for coronavirus, only half of whom were symptomatic.¹ Among New York MTA workers, a group which was not universally tested, over 6000 workers (8%) have either tested positive (over 2000), or entered quarantine (4000 workers).³³ In these populations, it is not known if those who tested negative were false negatives, were tested at the wrong time, had less exposure than their fellow passengers or workers, or were less susceptible to infection.

This study has a number of limitations. If the Diamond Princess passengers or MTA workers had not all been exposed to the virus, then the observed mortality underestimates the potential mortality. Also, there might be differences between the Diamond Princess population or the MTA workers and the population at large. The MTA workers were mostly minorities, and one could argue that they suffered excess mortality because of preexisting medical conditions. On the other hand, many of the most disabled are excluded from working or travelling at sea. Our study did not estimate the mortality among nursing home patients, which has been substantially higher than that of the general population.

References.

1. Russell TW, Hellewell J, Jarvis CI, Van-Zandvoort K, Abbott S, Ratnayake R, Flasche S, Eggo RM, Kucharski AJ, CMMID nCov working group. Estimating the infection and case fatality ratio for COVID-19 using age-adjusted data from the outbreak on the Diamond Princess cruise ship. medRxiv. 2020. Available from: <https://www.medrxiv.org/content/medrxiv/early/2020/03/08/2020.03.05.20031773.full.pdf> Accessed April 26, 2020.
2. Transport Workers Union Local 100. Available from: <http://www.twulocal100.org/> Accessed April 27, 2020.
3. New York Metropolitan Transport Authority. Honoring our fallen heroes. Available from: <https://new.mta.info/fallen-heroes> Accessed May 6, 2020.
4. Dignity Memorial Funeral Homes. Available from: dignitymemorial.com Accessed May 6, 2020.
5. New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene. Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Daily Data Summary. Available from: <https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/doh/downloads/pdf/imm/covid-19-daily-data-summary-deaths-05122020-1.pdf> Accessed May 13, 2020.
6. Estimated Population by Age, Sex, and Region, New York State. 2010. Available from: https://www.health.ny.gov/statistics/vital_statistics/2010/table01.htm Accessed May 5, 2020.
7. United States Population. Available from: <https://www.worldometers.info/world-population/us-population/> Accessed May 5, 2020.
8. Statista. Resident population of the United States by sex and age as of July 1, 2018. Available from: <https://www.statista.com/statistics/241488/population-of-the-us-by-sex-and-age/> Accessed April 26, 2020.
9. United States Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Provisional COVID-19 Death Counts by Sex, Age, and State. Available from: <https://data.cdc.gov/NCHS/Provisional-COVID-19-Death-Counts-by-Sex-Age-and-S/9bhg-hcku/data> Accessed May 13, 2020.
10. New York State Department of Health. Fatalities by Age Group. Available from: <https://covid19tracker.health.ny.gov/views/NYS-COVID19-Tracker/NYSDOHCOVID-19Tracker-Fatalities?%3Aembed=yes&%3Atoolbar=no&%3Atabs=n> Accessed May 13, 2020.

11. Kellerman C. Shared Sacrifice to Save the Subways. New York Daily News. July 28, 2017. Available from: <https://cbcny.org/advocacy/shared-sacrifice-save-subways> Accessed April 26, 2020.
12. Hutchinson B. Historic New York City subway shutdown for cleaning deemed 'successful'. ABC News. May 7, 2020. Available from: <https://abc7ny.com/historic-new-york-city-subway-shutdown-for-cleaning-deemed-successful/6159220/> Accessed May 13, 2020.
13. Martinez J. New York City bus drivers are being hit the hardest by deaths as COVID-19 devastates the MTA. Business Insider. April 9, 2020. Available from: <https://www.businessinsider.com/new-york-city-bus-drivers-most-deaths-covid-19-mta-2020-4>
14. Ministry of Health Labor and Welfare. "横浜港で検疫を行ったクルーズ船に関連した患者の死亡について" About death of patient associated with cruise ship quarantined in Yokohama Port. March 30, 2020. Available from: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/newpage_10599.html Accessed April 26, 2020.
15. Ministry of Health, Labour, and Welfare. "横浜港で検疫中のクルーズ船に関連した患者の死亡について" About death of patient related to cruise ship under quarantine at Yokohama Port. February 28, 2020. Available from: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/newpage_09850.html Accessed April 26, 2020.
16. Gallagher J. Coronavirus: British man who was on Diamond Princess ship dies in Japan. February 28, 2020. Available from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-51677846> Accessed April 26, 2020.
17. Martin S. Coronavirus: man evacuated from Diamond Princess becomes first Australian to die of Covid-19. February 29, 2020. Available from: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/mar/01/dutton-says-extending-travel-ban-not-possible-and-defends-coronavirus-response> Accessed April 26, 2020.
18. Mainichi. 70-year-old Canadian man who was on Diamond Princess cruise ship dies. March 21, 2020. Available from: <https://mainichi.jp/english/articles/20200321/p2q/00m/Ona/050000c> Accessed April 26, 2020.
19. Ministry of Health, Labor, and Welfare. 横浜港で検疫中のクルーズ船に関連した患者の死亡について About death of patient related to cruise ship under quarantine at Yokohama Port. March 23, 2020. Available from: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/newpage_10393.html Accessed April 26, 2020.
20. Ministry of Health, Labour, and Welfare. "横浜港で検疫を行ったクルーズ船に関連した患者の死亡について" About death of patient associated with cruise ship quarantined

in Yokohama Port. April 15, 2020d. Available from:

https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/newpage_10870.html Accessed April 26, 2020.

21. Buckland K. Third death from Japan cruise ship as health minister vows to set virus strategy. Reuters. February 22, 2020 [dated per Reuters calendar, rather than Japanese calendar]. Available from: <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-health-japan/third-death-from-japan-cruise-ship-as-health-minister-vows-to-set-virus-strategy-idUSKCN20H04R> Accessed April 26, 2020.

22. Lies E. Fourth passenger from cruise ship dies in Japan – NHK. Reuters. February 24, 2020. Available from: <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-health-japan-ship/fourth-passenger-from-cruise-ship-dies-in-japan-nhk-idUSKCN20J09C> Accessed April 26, 2020.

23. "クルーズ船の香港の男性が死亡 乗船者で7人目 : 朝日新聞デジタル". 朝日新聞デジタル (in Japanese) [Hong Kong man died on cruise ship 7th person on board] March 7, 2020. Available from: <https://www.asahi.com/articles/ASN3774W0N37ULBJ005.html> Accessed April 26, 2020.

24. Ministry of Health, Labour, and Welfare. "横浜港で検疫を行ったクルーズ船に関連した患者の死亡について" About death of patient associated with cruise ship quarantined in Yokohama Port. April 10, 2020c. Available from: https://www.mhlw.go.jp/stf/newpage_10802.html Accessed April 26, 2020.

25. West MG. First Case of Coronavirus Confirmed in New York State. Wall Street Journal. March 1, 2020. Available from: <https://www.wsj.com/articles/first-case-of-coronavirus-confirmed-in-new-york-state-11583111692> Accessed May 7, 2020.

26. Transit Worker's Union Local 100. MTA About-Face on Wearing Masks. March 9, 2020. Available from: <http://www.twulocal100.org/story/mta-about-face-wearing-masks> Accessed May 7, 2020.

27. Leffler CT, Ing E, McKeown CA, Pratt D, Grzybowski A. Final Country-wide Mortality from the Novel Coronavirus (COVID-19) Pandemic and Notes Regarding Mask Usage by the Public. April 4, 2020a. Available from: https://www.researchgate.net/publication/340438732_Country-wide_Mortality_from_the_Novel_Coronavirus_COVID-19_Pandemic_and_Notes_Regarding_Mask_Usage_by_the_Public Accessed April 27, 2020.

28. Guse C. Two NYC Transit workers die of coronavirus, first MTA employees to succumb to disease. New York Daily News. March 26, 2020. Available from: <https://www.nydailynews.com/coronavirus/ny-coronavirus-mta-employee-death-20200326-2aptlrky2rewpej33pbkeek57m-story.html> Accessed May 7, 2020.

29. Transit Worker's Union Local 100. Finally, Protective Masks Will Be Available for Frontline Transit Workers. March 27, 2020. Available from:

<http://www.twulocal100.org/story/finally-protective-masks-will-be-available-frontline-transit-workers> Accessed May 7, 2020.

30. Tracy T, McShane L. A tale of two agencies: NYC transit workers to receive nearly 250,000 N95 masks to protect against coronavirus; correction officers still fighting for PPE. New York Daily News. April 4, 2020. Available from:

<https://www.nydailynews.com/coronavirus/ny-transit-workers-masks-20200404-kndgzznwere6ziogl5kmlmpbbm-story.html> Accessed May 7, 2020.

31. Joseph E, Levenson E. New Yorkers must wear masks when unable to socially distance, Gov. Cuomo says. CNN. April 15, 2020. Available from:

<https://www.cnn.com/2020/04/15/us/new-york-facemasks/index.html> Accessed May 7, 2020.

32. Dyer A. What we could learn from the coronavirus outbreak on aircraft carrier Theodore Roosevelt. Los Angeles Times. April 26, 2020. Available from:

<https://www.latimes.com/california/story/2020-04-26/coronavirus-theodore-roosevelt-aircraft-carrier-outbreak> Accessed April 27, 2020.

33. Parks MA, Katersky A. New York City faces daunting and dangerous task of keeping MTA running during coronavirus crisis. ABC News. May 1, 2020. Available from: <https://abcnews.go.com/US/york-city-faces-daunting-dangerous-task-keeping-mta/story?id=70389382> Accessed May 6, 2020.