
Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16

Research Article

Long-term Coexistence of Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) with Antibody Response in Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Patients

Bin Wang^{#,1}, Li Wang^{#,1}, Xianggen Kong¹, Jin Geng¹, Di Xiao¹, Chunhong Ma²,
Xue-Mei Jiang^{1,*} & Pei-Hui Wang^{2,*}

¹Jinan Infectious Diseases Hospital of Shandong University, Jinan, Shandong 250021, China

²Advanced Medical Research Institute, Shandong University, Jinan, Shandong 250012, China

[#]These authors contributed equally to this work

^{*}To whom correspondence should be addressed: Xue-Mei Jiang, shdjxm@163.com; Pei-Hui Wang, wphlab@163.com

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

17 **Abstract**

18 Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 infection causing coronavirus
19 disease 2019 has spread worldwide. Whether antibodies are important for the adaptive
20 immune responses against SARS-CoV-2 infection needs to be determined. Here, 26
21 cases of COVID-19 in Jinan, China, were examined and shown to be mild or with
22 common clinical symptoms and no cases of severe symptoms were found among
23 these patients. A striking feature of some patients is that SARS-CoV-2 could exist in
24 patients who have virus-specific IgG antibodies for a very long period, with one case
25 for up to 36 days. One COVID-19 patient who did not produce any
26 SARS-CoV-2-bound IgG successfully cleared SARS-CoV-2 after 46 days of illness,
27 revealing that without antibody-mediated adaptive immunity, innate immunity may
28 still be powerful enough to eliminate SARS-CoV-2. Overall, this report may provide a
29 basis for further analysis of both innate and adaptive immunity in SARS-CoV-2
30 clearance, especially in non-severe cases. This study also has implications for
31 understanding the pathogenesis and treatment of SARS-CoV-2.

32

33 **Keywords:** SARS-CoV-2, COVID-19, adaptive immunity, innate immunity, IgG
34 antibody

35

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

36 The first severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2)
37 outbreak was reported in December 2019, and the virus has rapidly spread worldwide
38 within 3 months (Wu et al., 2020; Zhou et al., 2020; Zhu et al., 2020). The importance
39 of innate and adaptive immunity in the defense against SARS-CoV-1 needs to be
40 urgently determined (Thevarajan et al., 2020). To fulfill the pressing need, we
41 examined antibody generation and virus clearance in 26 patients with SARS-CoV-2
42 caused coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) in Jinan, China.

43

44 A total of 26 patients from 5 to 72 years old were determined to be SARS-CoV-2
45 RNA positive in sputum, stool, or nasopharyngeal swabs. The clinical characteristics
46 of the patients and chest CT scans were also examined. According to the “Fifth
47 Revised Trial Version of the Novel Coronavirus Pneumonia Diagnosis and Treatment
48 Guidance”
49 (<http://www.nhc.gov.cn/yzygj/s7652m/202002/41c3142b38b84ec4a748e60773cf9d4f>
50 [.shtml](#)), all of them are non-severe COVID-19 patients (**Table 1**).

51

52 Immunoglobulin G (IgG) antibodies act as an indicator of recent and past
53 infection while IgM antibodies indicate current infection. SARS-CoV-2-bound IgG
54 antibodies were detected in the serum of patients. For patients 3, 7, 22 and 24 (**Table**
55 **1**), SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid measurements has become negative before antibodies
56 were detected. Although IgG antibody testing was positive for the first trial in all 4
57 patients, we could not determine the exact role of IgG antibodies in SARS-CoV-2

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

58 clearance, because innate immunity is also sufficient to eliminate this virus (refer to
59 the case of patient 26). However, the results did reveals that the antibodies are
60 produced early and SARS-CoV-2 is cleared up, indicating that the immediate
61 production of antibodies may contribute to virus clearance.

62

63 Interestingly, we observed that specimens from patients 2, 13, and 16 who had
64 been confirmed to be IgG antibody positive still tested positive for SARS-CoV-2
65 nucleic acid for more than 30 days (**Table 1**), indicating that SARS-CoV-2 can coexist
66 with its specific antibodies in the human body for an unexpectedly long time (34-36
67 days). According to the data collected from patient 2, IgG antibodies can be produced
68 at least as early as the 7th day post illness. (**Table 1**). The average number of days for
69 SARS-CoV-2 bound IgG antibodies to be firstly detected in the 3 patients was 12.3;
70 thus, the early production of antibodies does not mean early elimination of this virus.
71 The production of specific antibodies is believed to be effective for virus clearance
72 (Jiang, 2020; Lu, 2020), but we could not reach such a conclusion from these cases.
73 We did not observe the a correlation between early adaptive immune responses and
74 better clinical outcomes. Perhaps the specificity and titer of antibodies are more
75 important. To our knowledge, to date, this is the longest period (34-36 days) to
76 observe the coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with its specific antibodies in COVID-19
77 patients. How this virus can circulate in the presence of specific antibodies for such a
78 long time is an interesting question. Whether SARS-CoV-2 can act as HCV that have
79 developed strategies to subvert humoral immunity and persists in the body is worth

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

80 further investigation (Elsner et al., 2015; Fafi-Kremer et al., 2012; Takaya et al.,
81 2019).

82

83 These 3 patients were all 23-39 year-old adults, which may suggest that young
84 adult individuals do not have obvious advantages in the early production of antibodies
85 and the clearance of SARS-CoV-2 compared to older persons (patients 10 and 21).

86

87 We observed that patient 26, a 5-10 year-old female, was SARS-CoV-2 nucleic
88 acid positive in a stool sample after 46 days of illness but became nucleic acid testing
89 negative in specimens of sputum, stool, and nasopharyngeal swabs on day 47 post
90 illness (**Table 1**). No SARS-CoV-2-specific antibodies were detected in the patient's
91 serum until the latest sample collection day, which was the 66th day post illness.
92 Although we did not collect data about virus-specific cellular immunity, it is known
93 that cellular immunity is generated concomitantly with humoral immunity, so we
94 could preliminarily exclude the potential role of cellular immunity in SARS-CoV-2
95 elimination in this case. Thus, from the data on patient 26, we may conclude that
96 innate immunity, the first line of host defense, can play an essential role in
97 SARS-CoV-2 clearance; moreover, innate immunity alone might be enough to clear
98 the virus. This case may also indicate that some individuals may not generate specific
99 antibodies after infection with SARS-CoV-2; thus, only testing SARS-CoV-2-specific
100 antibodies is not a good standard to determine infection, but combination with the
101 nucleic acid testing method may improve the accuracy of SARS-CoV-2 detection.

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

102

103 Patient 25, another 5-10 year-old female, was found to be IgG antibody positive
104 on the 10th day post illness, and the patient turned SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid negative
105 on 23rd day post illness (**Table 1**). We also observed that a 5-10 year-old female
106 patient (patient 7) produced IgG antibodies on the 14th day post illness, and this
107 patient turned SARS-CoV-2 nucleic acid negative on the 28th day post illness (**Table**
108 **1**). These 2 cases may reveal that children do not show any defects in antibody
109 production and SARS-CoV-2 elimination compared with adults.

110

111 Although a vaccine is believed to be the ultimate preventive measure against
112 SARS-CoV-2 spread, generating a broadly protective and universal vaccine can take a
113 long time (Lu, 2020). In this study, in the case of patient 26 (**Table 1**), we observed
114 that innate immunity alone may be enough to completely clear SARS-CoV-2 infection.
115 This is the first report that innate immunity plays such an essential role in the host
116 defense against SARS-CoV-2, which highlights the importance of innate immunity in
117 SARS-CoV-2 clearance. Further studies are required to determine which factors or
118 signaling pathways of innate immunity contribute to this process. Whether individuals
119 with such responses are still at risk for reinfection needs further exploration. Similar
120 to other RNA viruses, SARS-CoV-2 RNA should be detected by endosomal Toll-like
121 receptors (TLRs) and cytosolic RIG-I-like receptors or other RNA sensors that
122 activate NLRP3 signaling, leading to the production of IFNs, ISGs, and
123 proinflammatory cytokines (Kasumba and Grandvaux, 2019). Boosting innate

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

124 immune signaling pathways, such as TLR3 and RIG-I pathways, by drugs that mimic
125 viral RNA may contribute to SARS-CoV-2 clearance (Kasumba and Grandvaux,
126 2019). However, these immune stimulators also induce an inflammatory response that
127 may be harmful to patients, thus, antiviral immunity should be maximized, and
128 inflammatory responses must be minimized. The inflammatory response that is
129 responsible for the accumulation of cells and fluids contributes to SARS-CoV-2 induced
130 lung injury (Huang et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2020). As immune stimulators, viral
131 RNA mimics also induce an inflammatory response that may be harmful to patients;
132 thus a strategy in which antiviral immunity should be maximized and inflammatory
133 responses must be minimized, is challenging. Vaccine combined with innate immune
134 stimulators may be more effective for fast SARS-CoV-2 clearance. We propose that
135 the importance of innate immunity should be investigated further and that the titer and
136 specificity of SARS-CoV-2-specific antibodies are important and should be seriously
137 considered in vaccine development.

138

139 Our study is limited by the current reagents used in this study, which cannot be
140 used to determine the titer and specificity of human antibodies against SARS-CoV-2.
141 The titer of specific antibodies correlated with clinical outcomes remains to be
142 investigated. The long-term coexistence of IgG antibody with SARS-CoV-2 in the
143 human body raises the question of whether patients with antibodies are still at risk for
144 reinfection. Our follow-up studies may answer this question and would, therefore, be
145 beneficial to vaccine development. Second, we did not collect the earliest serum of

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

146 patients, and we could not determine on which day the SARS-CoV-2 bound IgG
147 antibodies generated. Thus, we could not observe the dynamic changes in IgG
148 antibodies during illness and recovery. Third, we lack severe patients as controls;
149 therefore, we do not know whether the adaptive immunity of severe patients can
150 respond earlier because of their strong immune response and whether they can clear
151 the virus faster after antibodies are produced. Despite that, our study provided several
152 novel pieces of information about the innate and adaptive immune response against
153 SARS-CoV-2: IgG antibodies can be generated as early as 7 days post illness but can
154 coexist with SARS-CoV-2 in patients long-term; without IgG antibodies, innate
155 immunity can also successfully clear SARS-CoV-2.

156

157

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

158 **Materials and Methods**

159 Specimens from sputum, stool, and nasopharyngeal swabs were collected
160 throughout the illness from January 30, 2020, to March 19, 2020. Viral RNA was
161 extracted from clinical specimens and real-time reverse transcription-PCR (rRT-PCR)
162 was performed to test the presence of SARS-CoV-2 using “Novel coronavirus
163 2019-nCoV nucleic acid detection kit” (Shanghai BioGerm Medical Biotechnology
164 Co.,Ltd, China). The serum was collected at distinctive time points, and
165 SARS-CoV-2-specific antibodies were detected using “New Coronavirus
166 (2019-nCoV) Antibody Detection Kit” (INNOVITA, China). This study was approved
167 by the ethics commissions of Jinan infectious disease hospital, Shandong, China.
168

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

169 **Acknowledgement**

170 This work was supported by grants from COVID-19 emergency tackling research

171 project of Shandong University (Grant No. 2020XGB03 to P.-H.W).

172

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

173 **References**

- 174 Elsner, R.A., Hastey, C.J., Olsen, K.J., and Baumgarth, N. (2015). Suppression of
175 Long-Lived Humoral Immunity Following *Borrelia burgdorferi* Infection. *PLoS*
176 *Pathog* *11*, e1004976.
- 177 Fafi-Kremer, S., Fauvelle, C., Felmlee, D.J., Zeisel, M.B., Lepiller, Q., Fofana, I.,
178 Heydmann, L., Stoll-Keller, F., and Baumert, T.F. (2012). Neutralizing antibodies
179 and pathogenesis of hepatitis C virus infection. *Viruses* *4*, 2016-2030.
- 180 Huang, C., Wang, Y., Li, X., Ren, L., Zhao, J., Hu, Y., Zhang, L., Fan, G., Xu, J., Gu,
181 X., *et al.* (2020). Clinical features of patients infected with 2019 novel
182 coronavirus in Wuhan, China. *Lancet* *395*, 497-506.
- 183 Jiang, S. (2020). Don't rush to deploy COVID-19 vaccines and drugs without
184 sufficient safety guarantees. *Nature* *579*, 321.
- 185 Kasumba, D.M., and Grandvaux, N. (2019). Therapeutic Targeting of RIG-I and
186 MDA5 Might Not Lead to the Same Rome. *Trends Pharmacol Sci* *40*, 116-127.
- 187 Lu, S. (2020). Timely development of vaccines against SARS-CoV-2. *Emerg*
188 *Microbes Infect* *9*, 542-544.
- 189 Takaya, A., Yamamoto, T., and Tokoyoda, K. (2019). Humoral Immunity vs.
190 *Salmonella*. *Front Immunol* *10*, 3155.
- 191 Thevarajan, I., Nguyen, T.H.O., Koutsakos, M., Druce, J., Caly, L., van de Sandt, C.E.,
192 Jia, X., Nicholson, S., Catton, M., Cowie, B., *et al.* (2020). Breadth of
193 concomitant immune responses prior to patient recovery: a case report of
194 non-severe COVID-19. *Nature Medicine*.

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

- 195 Wang, D., Hu, B., Hu, C., Zhu, F., Liu, X., Zhang, J., Wang, B., Xiang, H., Cheng, Z.,
196 Xiong, Y., *et al.* (2020). Clinical Characteristics of 138 Hospitalized Patients
197 With 2019 Novel Coronavirus-Infected Pneumonia in Wuhan, China. JAMA.
- 198 Wu, F., Zhao, S., Yu, B., Chen, Y.M., Wang, W., Song, Z.G., Hu, Y., Tao, Z.W., Tian,
199 J.H., Pei, Y.Y., *et al.* (2020). A new coronavirus associated with human
200 respiratory disease in China. Nature.
- 201 Zhou, P., Yang, X.L., Wang, X.G., Hu, B., Zhang, L., Zhang, W., Si, H.R., Zhu, Y., Li,
202 B., Huang, C.L., *et al.* (2020). A pneumonia outbreak associated with a new
203 coronavirus of probable bat origin. Nature.
- 204 Zhu, N., Zhang, D., Wang, W., Li, X., Yang, B., Song, J., Zhao, X., Huang, B., Shi, W.,
205 Lu, R., *et al.* (2020). A Novel Coronavirus from Patients with Pneumonia in
206 China, 2019. N Engl J Med 382, 727-733.
- 207
- 208

Long-term Coexistence of SARS-CoV-2 with Antibody Response

209 **Table 1 Clinical characteristics of the 26 hospitalized SARS-CoV-2 patients and**
 210 **corresponding timelines of IgG antibody production.**

Patients	Gender/Age (Y.)	Type	IgG P. (D.)	LDVP/specimens	Co-existence (D.)
1	F/18-60	C	22	22/NP	0
2	M/18-60	C	7	42/SP	35
3	F/18-60	C	23	18/NP	NA
4	F/18-60	C	16	32/ST	16
5	F/18-60	C	23	29/NP	6
6	F/18-60	C	21	21/ST	0
7	F/18-60	M	9	8/NP	NA
8	M/18-60	C	23	43/NP	20
9	M/18-60	C	10	23/NP	13
10	M/>60	C	9	19/SP&NP	10
11	M/18-60	C	17	20/NP	3
12	F/<18	M	14	28/ST	14
13	M/18-60	C	15	51/ST	36
14	F/18-60	C	10	25/SP	24
15	M/18-60	C	24	36/NP	12
16	F/18-60	C	15	49/NP	34
17	M/18-60	C	20	36/SP	16
18	M/18-60	M	17	24/NP	7
19	M/18-60	C	12	21/SP	9
20	F/18-60	C	18	20/NP	2
21	F/>60	C	14	20/NP	6
22	M/18-60	M	10	7/NP	NA
23	F/18-60	C	15	18/NP	3
24	F/18-60	C	18	17/NP	NA
25	F/<18	C	10	23/ST	13
26	F/<18	M	ND* (66 th)	46/ST	NA

211
 212 **Y:** year; **IgG P:** IgG positive; **LDVP:** Last day post-illness when SARS-CoV-2
 213 nucleic acid testing shows positive; **NP:** nasopharyngeal; **SP:** sputum; **ST:** stool. The
 214 severity of COVID-19 was judged according to the “Fifth Revised Trial Version of the
 215 Novel Coronavirus Pneumonia Diagnosis and Treatment Guidance”. **M:** mild type,
 216 the clinical symptoms were mild and no pneumonia was found in imaging. **C:**
 217 common type, with fever, respiratory tract and other symptoms, the manifestations of
 218 pneumonia can be seen on imaging. **NA:** not applicable; **ND:** not detectable. * IgG
 219 antibodies keep undetectable till 66th day post-illness for patient 26.

220

221