1 Title: No Evidence for Temperature-Dependence of the COVID-19 Epidemic 2 Running Title: Temperature-independence of COVID-19 Epidemic 3 **Keywords:** COVID-19, epidemic, temperature, exponential rate, R0 **Authors:** Tahira Jamil^{1,2}, Intikhab Alam¹, Takashi Gojobori¹, and Carlos M. Duarte^{1,2} 4 5 6 **Affiliations:** 7 1. Computational Bioscience Research Center (CBRC), King Abdullah University of Science 8 and Technology, Thuwal 23955, Saudi Arabia 9 2. Red Sea Research Centre (RSRC), King Abdullah University of Science and Technology, 10 Thuwal 23955, Saudi Arabia 11 12 1. Abstract 13 The pandemic of the COVID-19 disease extended from China across the north-temperate 14 zone, and more recently to the tropics and southern hemisphere. We find no evidence that 15 spread rates decline with temperatures above 20 °C, suggesting that the COVID-19 disease is 16 unlikely to behave as a seasonal respiratory virus. 17 18 19 20 21 2. Introduction 22 On 30 January the WHO declared the novel coronavirus (COVID-19) outbreak a 23 public health emergency of international concern (http://www.euro.who.int/en/home). The 24 epidemic spread gradually from Wuhan province in China, to other Asian nations, the middle 25 east and Europe. By early March the epidemic was mostly concentrated in territories

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

extending between 30° N and 50 °N (Sajadi et al., 2020), now in late winter, leading to the suggestion, echoed by the global media, that the epidemic is likely to be temperaturedependent. This supported speculation of possible decline in severity with the advent of warmer spring and summer temperatures in north-temperate latitudes (Sajadi et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2020), comparable to many viruses affecting human respiratory systems, including SARS (Tan et al., 2005; Gaunt et al., 2010). However, recent (updated up to March 26, 2020; cf. Methods) data revealed the spread of the epidemic across territories experiencing warm temperatures in the tropics (e.g. Indonesia, Singapore, Brazil) and southern hemisphere as well (e.g. Australia, Argentina). The current distribution of the epidemic challenges, therefore, the inference that SARS-CoV-2 may behave as a seasonal respiratory virus based on previous statistical analyses from earlier realized distributions. Here we examine the relationship between the apparent exponential rate of SARS-CoV-2 spread (γ) and the Basic Reproductive number of infection (R0) and the average daily temperature (T_{avg}) across nations and Chinese provinces where epidemics, with at least 100 case reported, have been reported (data updated up to 26 March, 2020). 3. Methods Novel Coronavirus (COVID-19) Cases Data The Novel Coronavirus (COVID-19) daily data are confirmed cases for affected countries and provinces of China reported between 31st December 2019 to 26th March 2020. The data was collected from the reports released by WHO, European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (ECDC), and John Hopkin CSSA. Data include confirmed and a cumulative total of COVID-19 cases in affected countries/provinces. Average ambient temperature

- The average temperatures of all the affected countries were collected
- from https://www.timeanddate.com/. The monthly mean temperature of February and the
- 53 three-weeks mean temperature of March of capital cities for the various nations were used as
- reference temperatures for the country.
- 56 Statistical Analysis

- 57 The number of COVID-19 incidences follows the expected exponential growth,
- although rates are only robust when cases exceed 100 persons for any country or province.
- 59 Hence, we fitted the exponential model to each country and each province of China. We
- 60 calculated exponential rate parameters for the countries where the COVID-19 incident has at
- least a 10-day growth period, and the total number of cases was at least 100.
- 62 $N = ae^{\gamma} Days$, $\gamma > 0$
- 63 $log N = \alpha + \gamma Days$.
- Where N is the cumulative number of diagnosed persons and Days is the number of days and
- 65 γ is the exponential rate (100 x γ = % increase per day).
- To calculate the effect of temperature on the exponential rate parameter, we first
- 68 regressed the exponential rate parameters retrieved from the exponential model on Temp and
- $69 \quad Temp^2$

66

$$\gamma \sim Temp + Temp^2$$

- 70 If the squared term is significant, it provides evidence of nonlinearity.
- 71 The thermal performance of COVID-19 was characterized by fitting spread rate estimate or
- 72 growth parameter (γ) and temperature to the Gaussian function;

$$\gamma = ae^{\left[-0.5\left(\frac{(Temp-opt)}{tol}\right)^2\right]}$$

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

Temp is the average temperature (in °C) that best encompasses the growth period of COVID-19 cases since its first incidence in a country/region of China. Where, a (amplitude) is the coefficient related to maximum of spread rate of countries, the optimum (opt) on the temperature gradient is where the maximum of spread rate is attained and the tolerance (tol) gives the width of the response curve. This model has non-linear form, and the model parameters opt and tol occur nonlinearly in the model function. Parameter of thermal performance curve was estimated by fitting Gaussian model to the growth rate and temperature of infected countries. The initial values for the Gaussian parameters opt, tol and a were obtained directly using maximum-likelihood polynomial regression for the Gaussian function. Estimated the basic reproductive number (R0) for COVID-19 from China and other countries using the Statistical exponential growth model method adopting serial interval from an average of SARS (mean=8.4 days, SD=3.8 days) and MERS (mean=7.6 days, SD=3.4 days). All analyses were performed using R statistical computing software. 4. Results Our results show that evidence for a temperature-dependence of the transmission reported in previous papers was likely to be an artifact, reflecting the pathways of spread, and that there is no evidence for thermal dependence of the transmission across the -10 to 31°C T_{avg} range across the affected regions. This suggests little basis to expect evidence for the virus to behave as a seasonal respiratory virus. Epidemiological data consisting in the rate of increase in accumulated diagnosed cases among nations (global) shows γ ranging from 5.6 % day⁻¹ to 34.8 % day⁻¹ (except Turkey; Figure S1), with an average of $22.39 \pm 0.94 \%$ day⁻¹ (Figure 1, Figure S1), and apparent R0 of 1.90 \pm 0.07 (Figure 1, Table A1). Surprisingly, γ and R0 across Chinese

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123 124 provinces (mean \pm SE = 4.1 \pm 0.1 % day⁻¹ and 1.09 \pm 0.01) were well below those of other nations (mean \pm SE = 22.39 \pm 0.94 % day⁻¹ and 1.90 \pm 0.07), possibly because much faster confinement of the Chinese population did not allow for the potential exponential rates under uncontrolled conditions to be realized. The broad variability in realized γ and R0 between nations (global) and provinces (China) largely reflects differences in detection likelihood along with the timing and rigour of adoption of confinement measures. The relationship between γ and R0 and T_{avg} shows no evidence for a reduced spread rate with warming (Figure 1), unlike analyses based on previous data. A number of nations with $T_{avg} > 20$ °C, including subtropical and tropical (Brazil, Qatar, Saudi Arabia and Indonesia), and southern-hemisphere (Peru, Chile, Argentina) nations (Figure 2), support γ and R0 above the median values of 23.8% day⁻¹ and 1.75, respectively (Figure 1). However, the same analysis conducted one weeks ago (15th March), did provide some evidence for low γ and R0 for $T_{\rm avg}\!>\!20$ °C (Figure S2). Our updated results (Figure 1) show, however, that this apparent temperature-dependence was confounded with a prevailing zonal pattern of spread across the north-temperate zone, possibly reflecting the main patterns of human mobility, which delayed arrival of the epidemics to the southern hemisphere and the tropics. 5. Discussion These results suggest that, contrary to prior assessments, the spread rate of the COVID-19 pandemic is temperature-independent, suggesting that there is little hope for relief as temperatures in the northern hemisphere increase, and that poor nations with weak health systems in tropical regions, such as African, are at great risk. Data sources: The data on COVID-19 is available publicly across many sources; where downloadable data files are updated daily few are listed below; World health organization (https://www.who.int/emergencies/diseases/novel-coronavirus-2019/situation-reports/) Johns Hopkins CSSE (https://data.humdata.org/dataset/novel-coronavirus-2019-ncov-cases)

125 [Accessed March 25, 2020] 126 European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control (https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/download-todays-data-geographic-127 distribution-covid-19-cases-worldwide) [Accessed March 26, 2020]. 128 129 130 **Author Contribution** 131 132 CMD and TJ conceived and designed the research, TJ conducted the analysis, TJ and CMD 133 wrote the first draft and all co-authors contributed to improving the paper and approved the 134 submission. 135 **Funding** 136 This research was supported by funding provided by the King Abdullah University of 137 Science and Technology to the CBRC. 138 139 140 References 141 Gaunt, E.R., Hardie, A., Claas, E.C., Simmonds, P., and Templeton, K.E. (2010). 142 Epidemiology and clinical presentations of the four human coronaviruses 229E, HKU1, 143 NL63, and OC43 detected over 3 years using a novel multiplex real-time PCR method. 144 Journal of clinical microbiology 48, 2940-2947. 145 Sajadi, M.M., Habibzadeh, P., Vintzileos, A., Shokouhi, S., Miralles-Wilhelm, F., and 146 Amoroso, A. (2020). Temperature and latitude analysis to predict potential spread and 147 seasonality for COVID-19. Available at SSRN 3550308. 148 Tan, J., Mu, L., Huang, J., Yu, S., Chen, B., and Yin, J. (2005). An initial investigation of the 149 association between the SARS outbreak and weather: with the view of the 150 environmental temperature and its variation. Journal of Epidemiology & Community 151 Health 59, 186-192. 152 Wang, M., Jiang, A., Gong, L., Luo, L., Guo, W., Li, C., Zheng, J., Li, C., Yang, B., and 153 Zeng, J. (2020). Temperature significant change COVID-19 Transmission in 429 154 cities. medRxiv. 155 156 157 158 159

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

Figure legends **Figure 1.** The relationship between the apparent exponential rate of SARS-CoV-2 spread (B) and the Basic Reproductive number of infection (R_0) and the average daily temperature (T_{avg}) across nations and Chinese provinces where > 100 cases of COVID-19 have been reported (data last accessed 26 March, Figure S1). Green symbols represent provinces in China while red symbols represent other nations. Neither the double exponential function with temperature nor the Gaussian function provided a significant (p < 0.05) fir for either γ or R0 with temperature. **Figure 2.** Distribution of the apparent exponential rate of SARS-CoV-2 spread (γ) and the Basic Reproductive number of infection (R0) and the average daily temperature (T_{avg}) across nations where > 100 cases of COVID-19 have been reported (data last accessed 26 March). **Appendix Figure S1.** The apparent average (± SE) exponential rate of SARS-CoV-2 spread (γ) , the average (and 95% confidence limits) of Basic Reproductive number of infection (R0) and the average daily temperature (T_{avg}) total case and number of days since the first case reported across nations and Chinese provinces where epidemics, with at least 100 case reported, have been reported (data updated through 26 March, 2020). **Appendix Figure S2.** The relationship between the apparent exponential rate of SARS-CoV-2 spread (γ) and the Basic Reproductive number of infection (R0) and the average daily

- temperature (T_{avg}) across nations and Chinese provinces where > 100 cases of COVID-19
- have been reported, as of Figure 1, but with data updated only until 15th March. The Gaussian
- function with temperature provided a significant fit for γ with temperature.



