

Estimation of COVID-19 outbreak size in Italy based on international case exportations

Authors: Ashleigh R. Tuite, PhD MPH¹, Victoria Ng, PhD², Erin Rees, DVM³, and David Fisman, MD, MPH^{1*}

Affiliations:

1. Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario.
2. National Microbiology Laboratory, Public Health Agency of Canada, Guelph, Ontario, Canada.
3. National Microbiology Laboratory, Public Health Agency of Canada, Saint-Hyacinthe, Quebec, Canada

***Correspondence:** David N. Fisman, Division of Epidemiology, Dalla Lana School of Public Health, 155 College Street, Toronto, Ontario, Canada M5T 3M7. Email:

David.fisman@utoronto.ca.

Keywords: Covid-2019; Travel; Coronavirus; Pneumonia; Epidemic; Italy

Italy is currently experiencing an epidemic of COVID-19 which emerged in the Lombardy region ¹. During the interval between February 25-29, 2020, we identified 46 cases of COVID-19 reported in 21 countries in Europe, Africa, North America, and South America which were either in individuals with recent travel from Italy, or who had presumed infection by a traveler from Italy ². In six cases, in four of the affected countries (Switzerland, France, Austria, Croatia), land travel was a likely route of introduction, or was documented to have been the route of introduction².

We used air travel volume between Italian cities and cities in other countries as an index of connectedness, using data available from the International Air Transport Association (IATA) for February 2015 (2.61 million total departing international air passengers from Italy). We used the methods of Fraser et al³ to estimate the size of the underlying epidemic in Italy necessary in order for these cases to be observed with a reasonable probability. To estimate the time at risk of COVID-19 exposure for travelers departing Italy, we obtained data from the United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) for the proportion of international travelers that are non-residents of Italy (63%)⁴ and the average length of stay of tourists to Italy (3.4 days)⁵, and assumed the Italian epidemic began one month prior to February 29, 2020⁶. We also performed sensitivity analyses in which we included outbound travel to all countries regardless of reported case importations, inflated travel volumes by 35%, to account for the relative increase in flight numbers from 2015-2019, and excluded cases in bordering countries and which were documented to have been introduced by overland travel.

When all cases were considered we estimated a true outbreak size of 3971 cases (95% CI 2907-5297), as compared to a reported case count of 1128 on February 29, 2020, suggesting non-identification of 72% (61-79%) of cases. In sensitivity analyses, outbreak sizes varied from 1552 to 4533 cases (implying non-identification of 27-75% of cases) (**Table**).

We recently used similar methods to estimate a much larger epidemic size in Iran, with a far greater degree of under-reporting, based on many fewer exported cases. The reason for this difference relates to the relatively high volume of travel from Italy, relative to Iran⁷. In summary, we suggest that the numerous COVID-19 case exportations from Italy in recent days suggest an epidemic that is larger than official case counts suggest, and which is approximately on a par

with that currently occurring in South Korea, which reports 3526 cases (and fewer deaths) as of February 29, 2020².

Table: Estimated COVID-19 Outbreak Size, Italy, February 29, 2020.

Scenario	Estimate	95% CI	% Unreported*	Unreported Range (%)*
All cases	3971	2907-5297	0.72	61-79
All cases (adjusted to 2019)	2937	2150-3917	0.62	48-71
Exclude bordering countries and overland travel	4533	3238-6172	0.75	65-82
Exclude bordering countries and overland travel (adjusted to 2019)	3352	2395-4564	0.66	53-75
Include travel to all countries	2099	1500-2859	0.46	25-60
Include travel to all countries (adjusted to 2019)	1552	1109-2114	0.27	0-47

*Based on reported case count of 1128.

References

1. Day M. Covid-19: Italy confirms 11 deaths as cases spread from north. *BMJ* 2020;368:m757.

2. BNO News. Tracking coronavirus: Map, data and timeline. Available via the Internet at <https://bnonews.com/index.php/2020/02/the-latest-coronavirus-cases/>. Last accessed February 29, 2020. 2020.
3. Fraser C, Donnelly CA, Cauchemez S, et al. Pandemic potential of a strain of influenza A (H1N1): early findings. *Science* 2009;324:1557-61.
4. United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) : Tourism Statistics: Italy: Country-specific: Basic indicators (Compendium) 2014 - 2018 (12.2019). Available via the Internet at <https://www.e-unwto.org/doi/abs/10.5555/unwtotfb0380010020142018201912>. Last accessed February 29, 2020.
5. United Nations, Encyclopedia of the Nations: Average length of stay of visitors - Tourism indicators - UNCTAD Handbook of Statistics - Country Comparison. Available via the Internet at <https://www.nationsencyclopedia.com/WorldStats/UNCTAD-average-length-stay-visitors.html>. Last accessed February 29, 2020.
6. Goes de Jesus J, Sacchi C, Claro I, et al. First report of COVID-19 in South America; available via the Internet at <http://virological.org/t/first-report-of-covid-19-in-south-america/409>. Last accessed February 29, 2020. 2020.
7. Tuite AR, Bogoch I, Sherbo R, Watts A, Fisman DN, Khan K. Estimation of COVID-2019 burden and potential for international dissemination of infection from Iran. medRxiv 2020.