

1 **Title:** Mentoring Matters: Evaluating The Black Physicians of Canada Mentorship Program

2

3 **Authors:**

4 Chikaodili Obetta¹, Anjali Menezes (MBBS)², Nivetha Chandran³, Onaope Egbedeyi (BA)⁴,

5 Maryam Taghavi⁵, Modupe Tunde-Byass (MD)^{1,6}, Catherine Yu (MD)^{1,7,8}, Csilla Kalocsai

6 (MPhil, PhD)^{5,9}, Umberin Najeeb (MD, FCPS (Pak), FRCPC)¹, Rukia Swaleh (MD FRCPC)¹⁰,

7 Mireille Norris (MD)^{1,11}

8 1. University of Toronto, Temerty Faculty of Medicine, Toronto, ON, Canada

9 2. McMaster Education Research, Innovation and Theory, McMaster University, Hamilton,

10 ON, Canada

11 3. Rehabilitation Sciences Institute, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada

12 4. Western University, London, ON, Canada

13 5. Sunnybrook Research Institute, Toronto, ON, Canada

14 6. North York General Hospital, Toronto, ON, Canada

15 7. Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada

16 8. Li Ka Shing Knowledge Institute of St. Michael's Hospital, Toronto, ON, Canada

17 9. Department of Psychiatry, University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada

18 10. University of Alberta, Edmonton, AB, Canada

19 11. Division of Geriatric Medicine, Sunnybrook Health Sciences Centre, Toronto, ON,

20 Canada

21 **Corresponding author:**

22 Chikaodili Obetta

23 Email: chika.obetta@mail.utoronto.ca

24 **Abstract**

25 **Purpose:** Black individuals face significant barriers in medicine, contributing to their
26 underrepresentation as physicians and emphasizing the need for systemic change. From
27 admissions processes to program design, medical schools often uphold outdated racial practices
28 that disadvantage Black learners. Increased representation in medical schools benefits learners
29 and improves care for diverse patient populations. Mentorship has proven essential in fostering
30 success in higher education and can mitigate barriers to career progression. However, many
31 Black learners face barriers to accessing quality mentorship despite its proven benefits in
32 fostering equitable opportunities and career progression. The Scarborough Charter outlined
33 Canadian institutions committed to advancing Black inclusion in higher education through
34 mentorship and accountability measures. In alignment with this goal, the Black Physicians of
35 Canada (BPC) launched a racially concordant mentorship program. This study aimed to explore
36 participants' experiences and provide recommendations for future program iterations.

37
38 **Methods:** This study employed a convergent triangulation mixed methods design. Both
39 quantitative and qualitative data were collected. The Yukawa Mentorship Evaluation Tool was
40 used to measure program effectiveness. Descriptive analyses were conducted by a member of the
41 research team. Data was coded by two members of the research team and findings were audited
42 for consistency.

43
44 **Results:** A total of 51 participants (27 mentors, 24 mentees) completed the survey, and 13 (7
45 mentors, 6 mentees) participated in semi-structured interviews. Five themes emerged:

46 Mentorship Characteristics, Program Administration, Perceived Program Benefits, Barriers to
47 Mentorship, and Recommendations for Improvement.

48

49 **Conclusion:** The BPC mentorship program represents a historic step toward addressing unmet
50 needs of Black medical residents in Canada. Participants expressed high satisfaction and
51 highlighted areas for improvement. Racially concordant mentorship was seen as particularly
52 valuable in addressing unique challenges faced by Black learners. The findings from this study
53 provide critical insights into best practices for future mentorship programs, advancing diversity
54 and equity in medicine while supporting Black learners' success.

55

56

58

59 **Introduction**

60 Despite making up 4.3% of the Canadian population and 16.1% of the Racialized population,
61 Black people constitute only 1.5% of the Canadian physician workforce¹. While the Black
62 population is projected to double by 2041¹, the disproportionately low numbers of Black
63 physicians highlight significant barriers within the medical profession. Black learners face
64 emotional abuse, isolation, and high attrition rates during training, underscoring the need for
65 systemic change²⁻⁴.

66 Racial categorization historically served to justify colonialism and slavery, with modern racial
67 identities reflecting entrenched social hierarchies⁵. In medical schools, ostensibly race-neutral
68 structures continue to uphold these inequities, as racial bias influences admissions, curriculum
69 design, and support systems⁶. Addressing racism in medicine requires dismantling these
70 structures that sustain it, and actively building new structures to replace it⁶. Increasing
71 representation within medical education exposes learners to different cultures and experiences
72 that prepares them to meet the needs of the population they serve⁷ and having patient-provider
73 race concordance improves survival and reduces mortality in Black population⁸⁻¹⁰. While
74 cultural competency training has helped reduce racial disparities in healthcare¹¹, racially
75 concordant mentorship is said to be particularly effective in supporting Black medical trainees⁴.
76 Irrespective of the well documented positive impacts on patient outcomes, the need for our
77 medical training environments to be free from racism should never require justification.

78 Globally, mentorship has proven critical during high-stress periods, such as through career
79 progression, rigorous training, and academic challenges. A report conducted by the Higher

80 Education Funding Council of England¹² highlighted mentorship and peer support as key to
81 success across all higher education sectors. Within medicine specifically there is evidence of the
82 positive impact of mentorship on participant satisfaction, and on objective outcomes such as
83 promotion and retention^{13–15}. In our medical training system which, after pre-clerkship, remains
84 primarily apprenticeship-based¹⁶, mentors serve to help socialize and navigate our complex
85 academy.

86 Rooted in ancient traditions of guidance and protection¹⁷, mentorship is particularly crucial in
87 addressing racial disparities within medical training. Echoing the proverb “it takes a village to
88 raise a child”, strong support systems are viewed as vital for success in Black and African
89 communities. This encompasses support not only from parents but also from peers and elders,
90 ensuring the sharing of wisdom and guidance across generations. Mentorship programs
91 specifically designed for underrepresented minorities in medicine (URiM) have improved
92 academic and professional outcomes, provided more equitable training opportunities, fostered
93 career progression and acts as a protective factor against racial differentials^{15,18–20}. Given the
94 cultural emphasis on community support in Black communities, one might assume Black
95 learners have robust access to mentorship. However, many report barriers to accessing
96 mentorship, with a few studies noting participants who reported lacking access to quality
97 mentorship entirely^{4,21,22}.

98 In the Scarborough Charter²³, 58 Canadian higher education institutions publicly committed to
99 advancing Black inclusion and excellence in higher education in Canada. A key directive of this
100 charter is the development of mentorship programs for Black students and professionals, which
101 are structured to facilitate growth through support from mentors with similar backgrounds. The

102 charter emphasizes institutional accountability, with regular assessments and transparent
103 reporting on the success of these initiatives in promoting Black inclusion²³.

104 *Black Physicians of Canada Mentorship Program*

105 Recognizing a gap in racially concordant mentorship for Black residents, fellows, and early-
106 career physicians, Black Physicians of Canada (BPC) and the Black Residents Physicians of
107 Ontario (BRPO) conducted a Canada-wide needs assessment in 2020, which found that nearly
108 80% of Black residents lacked formal mentorship and desired guidance from mentors of similar
109 racial and professional backgrounds²¹. In response, BPC established the BPC mentorship
110 program in July 2021, a pioneering initiative in Canada, designed to support Black medical
111 learners and early career physicians through race-concordant mentorship. This program was
112 developed to address the specific needs of Black physicians, offering individual mentorship,
113 proactive support, and tailored communal education sessions to foster community and belonging.
114 Mentors and mentees were provided with a handbook outlining ground rules, which included 4
115 mandatory meetings throughout the year. Program-wide events over the year covered topics such
116 as transition to residency, dealing with microaggressions and the hidden curriculum, and
117 finances. Through mentors with similar racial backgrounds and lived experiences, Black
118 residents, fellows, and early-career physicians gained unique insights and guidance often absent
119 in traditional mentorship programs.

120 This study explores the experiences of mentors and mentees in the first iteration of the program,
121 identifying perceived facilitators and barriers to mentorship. The evaluation provides valuable
122 insights into the specific mentoring needs of Black residents and early career physicians,
123 highlighting the unique benefits of racially concordant mentorship programs in medical training.
124 Drawing on our findings, we make recommendations to guide the development and future

125 evaluation of similar programs, shaping what “effective” mentorship is and helping guide similar
126 programs to success.

127 **Materials and Methods**

128 **Study Design**

129 This study employed a convergent triangulation mixed methods design²⁴ to examine the
130 effectiveness of the BPC mentorship program. Quantitative survey data and qualitative semi-
131 structured interview data were collected concurrently. The surveys gathered data on socio-
132 demographics and self-reported effectiveness of the mentorship program using the Mentorship
133 Evaluation Tool (MET)²⁵. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with a subset of mentors
134 and mentees to explore their lived experiences in the BPC mentorship program. Our study design
135 enabled mentorship to be explored from different perspectives, which were then brought together
136 in a convergent mixed-methods approach to enhance our understanding of the mentorship
137 experience²⁶. All study procedures were approved by the Research Ethics Board at the
138 University of Toronto.

139

140 **Study Setting and Participants**

141 The BPC mentorship program had 58 mentor-mentee pairs in the program's first year,
142 comprising Black residents and early-career physicians matched by gender and specialty to a
143 mentor. All 116 program participants in this cohort were invited via email to participate in the
144 study. Survey respondents were subsequently invited for interviews, with all interviewees
145 completing the survey beforehand and receiving an honorarium for their participation.

146

147

148 **Data Collection and measures**

149 Questions for the survey and semi-structured interviews were developed based on responses
150 from a needs assessment survey²¹ and consultations with experts in mentorship, equity, medical
151 education, qualitative research (CY, UN, CK, MN, MTB, RS, AM). The survey comprised of 19
152 questions for mentors and 21 for mentees, assessing mentorship effectiveness using a seven-
153 point Likert scale (1 = Strongly Disagree to 7 = Strongly Agree) based on the Yukawa Mentor
154 Evaluation Tool (MET)²⁵. The interview guide was tailored for mentors and mentees, addressing
155 themes such as incentives, mentorship experiences, pairing process, facilitators and barriers to
156 mentorship, mentorship impact, and race-concordant mentorship's role in medicine. After
157 obtaining informed consent, semi-structured interviews were conducted over Zoom between
158 May 2023 and August 2023, with sessions averaging 45 minutes for mentees and 50 minutes for
159 mentors. All interviews were audio-recorded, transcribed verbatim, and de-identified before data
160 entry into NVivo 12.7.0 for qualitative analysis.

161

162 **Data Analysis**

163 Descriptive analyses were conducted by a member of the research team (MT) on the responses to
164 closed survey questions. Interview data were analysed using an inductive thematic analysis
165 approach²⁷. The inductive thematic approach involves a six-step approach: familiarising with
166 data, generating initial codes, searching for themes, reviewing themes, defining and naming
167 themes, and finally producing the report. Two research team members (CO and NC)
168 independently coded the data, with discrepancies resolved through discussions with a
169 multidisciplinary team, and findings were subsequently audited for consistency.

170

171 **Results**

172 Overall, 51 BPC program participants (27 mentors and 24 mentees) (**Table 1**) completed the
 173 survey, for an overall response rate of 44%. Semi-structured interviews were held with thirteen
 174 participants (seven mentors and six mentees).

175 **Table 1.** Demographic characteristics of Black mentors and mentees who completed surveys and
 176 interviews to explore their experiences in a race-concordant mentorship program

Characteristics	Mentors		Mentees	
	<i>n</i>	%	<i>n</i>	%
Gender				
Male	14	52	8	33
Female	13	48	16	67
Age Range				
20-29	0	0	2	8
30-39	4	15	15	63
40-49	13	48	7	29
50-59	9	33	0	0
>60	1	4	0	0
First Language				
English	24	89	22	92
French	3	11	1	4
Other	0	0	1	4
Continent/Region of Origin				

Africa	8	30	11	46
North America	15	56	10	42
Europe	0	0	1	4
Caribbean	3	11	2	8
Middle East	1	4	0	0
Specialty				
Medicine	6	22	8	33
Surgery	3	11	5	21
Family medicine	10	37	7	29
Psychiatry	1	4	1	4
Pediatrics	2	7	0	0
Radiology	1	2	2	8
Other	4	15	1	4
Medical School				
Dalhousie University Faculty of Medicine	3	15	1	4
McGill University Faculty of Medicine	1	5	0	0
McMaster University Michael G. DeGroote School of Medicine	2	10	0	0
Queen's University School of Medicine	0	0	1	4
University of Alberta Faculty of	0	0	1	4

Medicine and Dentistry

University of British Columbia	2	10	1	4
Faculty of Medicine				
University of Calgary Cumming	2	10	2	8
School of Medicine				
University of Manitoba Max Rady	1	5	1	4
College of Medicine				
University of Ottawa Faculty of	1	5	6	25
Medicine				
University of Toronto Faculty of	5	25	8	33
Medicine				
Université de Montréal Faculté de	1	5	1	4
Médecine				
Université de Sherbrooke Faculté	1	5	0	0
de Médecine et des Sciences de la				
Santé				
Western University Schulich	1	5	2	8
School of Medicine and Dentistry				
Training level				
Resident	0	0	13	54
Fellow	0	0	1	4
Practice Setting				
Academic physician	16	62	5	21

Community Physician	10	39	5	21
---------------------	----	----	---	----

177

178 Our findings can be summarized in five domains: (1) Mentorship Characteristics (2) Program

179 Administration (3) Perceived Program Benefits (4) Barriers to mentorship and (5)

180 Recommendations for Improvement. The content in each domain is summarised below, using

181 descriptive statistics from surveys and anonymized quotes from interviews to illustrate the

182 concepts.

183 **1) Mentorship characteristics**

184 Mentees valued honest feedback, expertise, and a growth mindset, while mentors emphasized

185 active listening. Both groups highlighted relationship quality and feedback as top indicators of

186 successful mentorship. Shared racial and gender identities strengthened connections, with

187 mentees finding essential guidance on navigating microaggressions and the emotional impact of

188 racism. Drawing from their own experiences, mentors offered vital support, fostering a sense of

189 belonging and confidence in mentees.

190 In survey responses, mentees highlighted: providing honest and constructive feedback (96.3%);

191 sharing relevant knowledge and expertise (92.6%); and having a growth mindset (85.2%), as

192 important factors. While mentors generally agreed on these most important characteristics, they

193 also highlighted exhibiting active listening skills (90.3%). When asked what metrics should be

194 measured to evaluate “good” mentorship, “relationship quality” was rated highest as a measure

195 of good mentorship by both mentees (100%) and mentors (93.6%). (81.5%) of mentees and

196 (80.1%) of mentors rated “quality of feedback received” as the second most important measure
197 of good mentorship.

198 The significance of shared identity, particularly in terms of race and gender, emerged as an
199 important factor in fostering a meaningful mentorship relationship amongst all participants. For
200 example, one mentee described “*The city I trained in didn't have very many people of colour or*
201 *Black female physicians, and so I was excited about the idea of having a Black woman as a*
202 *mentor. She was very helpful as someone who has three kids so she had been through residency*
203 *and being pregnant.*”

204 Black mentors with similar lived experiences played a pivotal role by providing valuable
205 resources, offering guidance during challenging rotations, and fostering a sense of belonging
206 that transcended the formal boundaries of mentorship. For example, one mentee describes the
207 one valuable encounter with their mentor “*I found her extremely helpful when I felt like I wasn't*
208 *treated very well on a rotation. She had a similar experience. She told me about what she had*
209 *felt she wished she had done differently. So, I was able to take those experiences that she had*
210 *and was willing to share with me, and make it so that I had a better kind of resolution.*”

211 Several mentors who have themselves benefitted from mentorship or have overcome systemic
212 career discrimination saw this mentorship program as a way to pay forward their knowledge and
213 experience. As one mentor reflected, “*There is an intrinsic benefit in terms of giving back and*
214 *seeing someone else succeed and you feel like you've hopefully played a small role in building*
215 *their confidence.*”

216 **2) Program administration**

217 Regular communication via email and reminders kept mentors and mentees engaged, while the
218 thoughtful pairing process matched participants with shared interests, creating stronger
219 connections. High event attendance highlighted participants' appreciation, despite some
220 challenges with virtual interactions. Overall, participants were satisfied with the program's
221 supportive structure and clear guidance.

222 According to survey responses, approximately 71% of mentees attended BPC mentorship events
223 over the program year, and approximately 76% of the mentees cited the usefulness of the
224 mentorship events. While 84% of the mentors attended the BPC mentorship events over the
225 program year, while 76% “agreed” or “strongly agreed” that the events were useful. Although in
226 interview responses, participants shared the challenges posed by virtual platforms in fostering
227 meaningful mentorship connections within the BPC program, suggesting the preference for
228 *“more tangible and impactful in-person interactions.”*

229 The manual mentor-mentee pairing process by the program organizers was hailed as a
230 thoughtful and impactful endeavor, with mentees expressing gratitude for being matched in
231 subspecialties that were not only professionally relevant but also personally resonant.
232 Participants expressed that the manual matching helped ease the typical challenge of participants
233 coordinating matching themselves, it ensured adequate follow-up and provided guidelines on
234 roles. For example, one mentor described how *“the program was well organized, in terms of*
235 *matching us and making sure that we understood our expectations, and I found that this*
236 *program was great.”*

237 **3) Perceived program benefits**

238 The BPC mentorship program fostered a supportive environment where mentors and mentees
239 connected through shared cultural experiences, creating a foundation of trust and openness. This
240 program allowed participants to discuss both career-related and personal challenges, including
241 those often unique to Black professionals in medicine, such as navigating microaggressions and
242 balancing well-being with professional demands. Many participants found this holistic approach
243 highly valuable, as it addressed aspects of their professional journeys that were rarely
244 acknowledged in other mentorship programs.

245 In survey responses, mentors highlighted “review of career goals” (80.1%), “building coping
246 skills, teamwork and collaborative skills” (57.7%) and “help navigate difficult circumstances
247 such as microaggression” (42.4%) are most helpful to mentees during the program. While
248 mentees highlighted “job prospects and recommendations” (91.7%), “sponsorship/networking”
249 (79.2%) and “psychosocial support from a fellow Black physician” (79.2%) and “help to
250 navigate microaggressions” (75.0%) as most important in their lives. Overall, 95% of the
251 mentees rated their overall satisfaction with the mentoring program positively, and no
252 participants disagreed with the statement.

253 Those who had prior experience with mentorship, compared their non-Black and Black mentors
254 and felt in the BPC program, it was easier and safer bringing up certain conversations in their
255 mentor-mentee relationship. For example, one mentor commented that *“Even though there's still
256 diversity even within a group of Black people, there is also a lot more in common. So it was
257 easier to break the ice, it was easier to start off the relationship.”*

258 A recurrent theme was appreciating the holistic nature of the program, extending beyond career
259 guidance to encompass the broader spectrum of life and academia. Many mentees commented

260 that their mentors were impactful in providing guidance on issues such as “*dealing with*
261 *microaggressions*”, “*addressing the emotional toll of racism*”, and “*navigating the complexities*
262 *of a medical career.*” As one mentee explained: “*What BPC has a unique take on is the aspect*
263 *of wellness from a minority person perspective and inclusion is definitely what is the key to*
264 *success of this program.*” While another mentee described “*...with the BPC program, I'm able*
265 *to discuss both career, life, and academic stuff, and it's more holistic. I feel I don't have to worry*
266 *too much in the background about what I'm saying, who I'm saying it to and what the*
267 *implications are on my career.*”

268 Some participants described their mentorship program experience as not only professionally
269 enriching but also “*personally affirming*”, and expressed an “*increased sense of belonging*” and
270 “*increased confidence.*” As one mentee shared: “*I think it has positively affected me in that I*
271 *now feel a little bit less of the imposter syndrome*”.

272 Participants shared how financial constraints significantly impacted the learning experience of
273 Black medical learners and highlighted the impact of the mentorship program on exploring
274 topics such as “*financial discussions around how to prepare for the financial burden of*
275 *residency*”, “*when transitioning to work, how to negotiate that contract*” and “*how to have a*
276 *career trajectory planned*” and how these discussions added a practical dimension to mentorship
277 relationships.

278 Some participants felt there was a lack of support from their institutions in providing access to
279 mentorship and overall guidance on dealing with negative experiences. For example, some
280 mentees shared that they had no previous formal mentorship prior to the BPC program, “*I didn't*
281 *have access to mentorship in the department that I was in, so the BPC program was an*

282 *opportunity to get a mentorship with an additional benefit of someone who's had these*
283 *challenges that people who have given me advice to up until this point did not have to face.”*
284 Another mentee described “*I think that the biggest contribution to the mentorship was that my*
285 *mentor really introduced me to the vast range and variety of career arrangements that are*
286 *possible within the field.”*

287 **4) Barriers to mentorship**

288 Key barriers included the demanding time commitment for mentors, the limitations of virtual
289 communication for distant mentor-mentee pairs, and the complex pressures of navigating racial
290 issues within the medical field.

291 Participants highlighted the Black tax experienced by Black physicians. A mentor expressed that
292 “*One of the biggest challenges was the significant time commitment expected from participants,*
293 *often compounding the challenges of an already demanding profession.”* Some participants
294 commented on the impact of geographical distance on the effectiveness of the mentorship. As a
295 nationwide program some mentor-mentee pairs were in different cities so had to rely on online
296 virtual methods of communication for the duration of the program. For example, one mentee
297 described “*I would say the geography was the only thing that didn't work for me and having to*
298 *do things virtually.”* Participants shared the challenges posed by virtual platforms in fostering
299 meaningful mentorship connections within the BPC program.

300 Many participants commented on the nuanced challenges faced by Black individuals pursuing
301 careers in medicine. For example, one mentor commented that “*with Black mentees, they have*
302 *the added element of the emotional toll of racism that impacts the wellness perspective”* while
303 another mentor described “*I think all levels need discussion on how race interferes or helps*

304 *their progress. For the non-Black mentees, this does not usually come up. They're not really*
305 *thinking about barriers in this way. They may only be thinking about the competitive nature, for*
306 *example of CARMS but they're not necessarily worrying about who's going to evaluate me for*
307 *the next block?"*

308 **5) Recommendations for improvement**

309 Looking toward future iterations of the BPC mentorship program, this section explores the
310 importance of continuous support and engagement as well as recommendations suggested by
311 participants.

312 Mentors expressed a desire to have more tailored and specific continuing professional
313 development and guidance on Racialized and Black mentorship techniques. For example, one
314 mentor commented that they would *“like to have vignettes and videos resources that recreate*
315 *navigating different mentorship scenarios, that will be valued.”* While another mentor
316 recommended *“printed information, like a booklet or brochure with information about topics*
317 *that would come up, to give ideas of what to reflect on, things mentees might want to discuss*
318 *and what sort of things in your experience you want to kind of take a deep dive into.”*

319 Participants expressed that networking with allies would be a valuable resource for mentorship,
320 particularly extending networking beyond the immediate community. As a mentor described *“A*
321 *lot of our students and learners do end up finding mentee mentorship through other allies. So*
322 *networking is key, and not just being focused on our community, but looking at a wider pool of*
323 *skills and talent and willingness.”*

324 Participants also made recommendations for improving the mentor-mentee matching. Some
325 participants suggested the incorporation of mentees' long-term career goals into the matching
326 process, to ensure a more tailored and effective mentorship relationship. As one mentee explains
327 *“One question that I think would be great is asking the mentees or prospective mentees where*
328 *they see their career going in the next five to ten years. And then matching the mentees' five-to-*
329 *ten-year plan to mentors so that somebody could help them get to that goal.”*

330 **Discussion**

331 In response to the growing recognition of the need for improved mentorship and training
332 experiences for underrepresented (UR) students in fields like medicine^{21,22,28}, the launch of the
333 Black Physicians of Canada's mentorship program marks a critical step toward addressing the
334 challenges and the need for mentorship among Black residents in Canada. Through
335 understanding the roles and functions of mentorship and the importance of shared identity in
336 mentorship, we can better support Black medical trainees.

337 Our study findings demonstrate that race-concordant mentorship is perceived as especially
338 important by participants as it alleviates the need to explain the context and nuances of their
339 lived experiences, creating an environment of safety and trust²⁹. Similar to previous research,
340 our participants described race-concordant mentorship as desirable as it addresses the unique
341 needs of racial minorities, including psychosocial support, financial difficulties, social guidance,
342 and emotional toll of racism³⁰⁻³². Consistent with previous research, our mentees reported that
343 having mentors of similar racial or ethnic backgrounds helped them envision their own potential
344 and increased confidence in their future careers²⁹. Our results align with previous studies that

345 emphasise mentorship as a crucial component in career development and improved training
346 experience³³.

347 Our study highlights key elements of effective mentoring relationships that can guide medical
348 education leaders and stakeholders in designing impactful mentoring programs for their trainees.

349 Our participants described mentor characteristics, mentor-mentee relationship quality and
350 feedback as critical factors for successful mentoring. Having a mentor who actively listens,
351 participates in the development and training of the mentee was an important factor that
352 increased satisfaction among the participants. An additional important factor was the facilitation
353 of dyad matching by program organizers rather than having mentees to choose their mentor
354 themselves as this reduced the burden of coordinating an “ideal match” prior to initiating a
355 mentoring relationship. Our participants emphasized that mentoring should be formalized and
356 well organized like any other activity in academic medicine³⁴. Optimal mentor-mentee
357 relationships can be facilitated by fostering professional and social networking opportunities³⁵.
358 Findings from the study also revealed that beyond race concordance, gender and medical
359 specialty concordance is perceived as especially important in increasing compatibility between
360 mentor-mentee pairs.

361 Our recommendations to all academic stakeholders and the public for implementing race-
362 concordant mentorship program in medical education include:

363 **1. Black Self-Determination and Centralized Black-Led Mentorship**

364 The growing number of Black medical students and residents highlights the urgent need for more
365 Black physician mentors. While programs like the BPC mentorship program and the Black
366 Physicians Association of Ontario’s mentorship pods have made progress in increasing the pool

367 of mentos available to Black learners, the demand for mentors outpaces supply. The
368 underrepresentation of Black physicians in Canada’s medical workforce, limits the pool of
369 mentors available to Black learners.

370 To mitigate this gap, we recommend centralized mentorship networks, group mentorship models,
371 and recognizing mentors through stipends, awards, or academic incentives. Hiring more Black
372 faculty and strengthening support systems for Black learners are essential to fostering diversity,
373 inclusion, and a sustainable mentorship pipeline in medicine.

374 **2. Development of evaluation frameworks and mentorship models specific to the Black** 375 **experience**

376 As we work towards creating safer learning environments and increasing mentorship
377 opportunities for Black learners, it is crucial to develop mentorship strategies that specifically
378 address their unique needs. Mentorship frameworks must be tailored to foster empowerment,
379 resilience, and a sense of belonging, ensuring that Black students thrive academically and
380 personally.

381 Building communities of practice is another key element for the ongoing development of Black
382 medical learners. Programs like the Community of Support at the University of Toronto
383 (number) have been successful in creating a collaborative environment for supporting
384 underrepresented undergraduate students pursuing medicine, but similar initiatives are lacking at
385 the postgraduate level. These communities will provide opportunities for mentors to refine their
386 skills, while allies will learn how to better support Black learners. This collaborative approach
387 will strengthen mentorship, and create inclusive, supportive learning environments for Black
388 learners, ultimately advancing diversity in medicine.

389 Mentorship programs must adopt trauma-informed, strength-based approaches that celebrate
390 cultural heritage and address systemic challenges. Robust evaluation frameworks are also needed
391 to measure psychosocial outcomes, such as belonging and community, alongside academic and
392 career progression.

393

394 **3. Real investments and long-term commitments to supporting Black excellence and** 395 **learner safety**

396 To support Black medical learners, institutions must establish formalized spaces for connection,
397 community-building, and shared experiences. These spaces combat isolation, enhance belonging,
398 and improve well-being. Feedback highlights the critical role of psychological safety, which is
399 often lacking in existing mentorship programs. Race-concordant mentorship, where mentors
400 share cultural or racial backgrounds with learners, fosters understanding, support, and reduces
401 imposter syndrome. Without safe spaces, Black learners face additional challenges navigating
402 medical education. Creating these environments not only prioritizes mental health but also
403 facilitates networking and mentorship, empowering learners to overcome unique obstacles. By
404 fostering community and psychological safety, institutions can ensure Black learners thrive in
405 their medical training.

406 The study has several limitations. Our sample only included Black physicians in the BPC
407 program, who may differ from other residents, fellows, and staff physicians not in the program.
408 Therefore, our results may not generalize to all Black residents, fellows, and staff physicians.
409 However, given that this was a Canada wide program with participants from 13 medical schools
410 across the country, they represent a diverse sample group. The use of virtual interviews and

411 surveys, though necessary due to logistical constraints, may have limited rapport and depth, with
412 in-person interactions potentially allowing richer discussion. An additional limitation is that
413 survey and interview participation were voluntary, and there may be potential for responder bias.
414 However, through a mixed methods approach this study provides further insights on the nuanced
415 experiences of Black physicians in Canada.

416 **Conclusion**

417 As more Black students enter medical institutions, it's essential to provide support that promotes
418 their retention and career success. Medicine's historical under representation has created systemic
419 barriers for marginalized groups. Resources like mentorship from physicians with shared
420 identities and experiences offer Black students the community and guidance necessary for
421 advancement. These study results will serve to inform best practices in race concordant
422 mentorship programs within medical education, tailored to address the unique challenges faced
423 by Black medical learners. An area of further study would be to determine the long-term effects
424 of race-concordant mentoring on academic, clinical and professional performance.

425 In conclusion, we draw on Black feminist visionary bell hooks³⁶ on the power of humanism and
426 trauma-informed pedagogy. Like patients, our learners thrive when seen as multidimensional
427 human beings, carrying the resilience of our ancestors. By drawing on the authority of
428 experience in our communities we transgress colonial educational practices, and education
429 becomes the practice of freedom.

430 **Acknowledgements and Disclosures**

431 *Acknowledgements*

432 The authors thank The Black Physicians of Canada (BPC) Research Group, Hadal El-Hadi MD
433 and Menal Huroy MD, all of whom provided valuable insight and constructive feedback on this
434 project at various stages of development.

435 *Funding*

436 This work was supported by The Black Physicians' Association of Ontario (BPAO) Grant,
437 Sunnybrook Hub for Applied Research in Education (SHARE) grant, University of Toronto -
438 The Comprehensive Research Experience for Medical Students (CREMS) Summer Research
439 Program and University of Toronto - Department of Medicine MEDS grant.

440 *Ethical Approval*

441 All study procedures were approved by the Research Ethics Board at the University of Toronto.

442 *Previous presentations*

443 The findings of this study have been previously presented in part at the 2024 International
444 Congress for Academic Medicine (ICAM).

445 *Disclosures*

446 The authors declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship,
447 and/or publication of this article.

449 **References**

- 450 1. Statistics Canada. *The Sociodemographic Diversity of the Black Populations in*
451 *Canada.*; 2024. Accessed November 18, 2024. [https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/daily-](https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/n1/daily-quotidien/241025/dq241025b-eng.htm)
452 quotidien/241025/dq241025b-eng.htm
- 453 2. Shenelle Wilson. Gaslighting of Black medical trainees makes residency
454 something to ‘survive.’ *STAT News*. 2022.
- 455 3. Mathieu J, Fotsing S, Akinbobola K, et al. The quest for greater equity: a national
456 cross-sectional study of the experiences of Black Canadian medical students. *CMAJ Open*.
457 2022;10(4):E937-E944. doi:10.9778/cmajo.20220192
- 458 4. Mpalirwa J, Lofters A, Nnorom O, Hanson MD. Patients, Pride, and Prejudice:
459 Exploring Black Ontarian Physicians’ Experiences of Racism and Discrimination. *Acad*
460 *Med*. 2020;95(11S Association of American Medical Colleges Learn Serve Lead:
461 Proceedings of the 59th Annual Research in Medical Education Presentations):S51-S57.
462 doi:10.1097/ACM.0000000000003648
- 463 5. Bonilla-Silva E. Rethinking racism: Toward a structural interpretation. *Am Sociol*
464 *Rev*. 1997;62(3):465-480. doi:10.2307/2657316
- 465 6. Tiako MJN, South EC, Ray V. Medical Schools as Racialized Organizations: A
466 Primer. *Ann Intern Med*. 2021;174(8):1143-1144. doi:10.7326/M21-0369
- 467 7. Saha S, Guiton G, Wimmers PF, Wilkerson LA. Student Body Racial and Ethnic
468 Composition and Diversity-Related Outcomes in US Medical Schools. *JAMA*.
469 2008;300(10):1135-1145. doi:10.1001/JAMA.300.10.1135
- 470 8. Snyder C, Frogner B, Skillman S. Facilitating Racial and Ethnic Diversity in the
471 Health Workforce. *J Allied Health*. 2018;47(1):58-65.

- 472 9. Alsan M, Garrick O, Graziani G. Does Diversity Matter for Health? Experimental
473 Evidence from Oakland. *American Economic Review*. 2019;109(12):4071-4111.
474 doi:10.1257/AER.20181446
- 475 10. Greenwood BN, Hardeman RR, Huang L, Sojourner A. Physician-patient racial
476 concordance and disparities in birthing mortality for newborns. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A*.
477 2020;117(35):21194-21200.
478 doi:10.1073/PNAS.1913405117/SUPPL_FILE/PNAS.1913405117.SAPP.PDF
- 479 11. Brach C, Fraserirector I. Can Cultural Competency Reduce Racial and Ethnic
480 Health Disparities? A Review and Conceptual Model. *Medical Care Research and*
481 *Review*. 2000;57(1_suppl):181-217. doi:10.1177/1077558700057001S09
- 482 12. Atkins Madeleine, Melville-Ross Tim. *Higher Education Funding Council for*
483 *England Annual Report and Accounts 2014-15*. HM Government; 2015.
- 484 13. Shen MR, Tzioumis E, Andersen E, et al. Impact of Mentoring on Academic
485 Career Success for Women in Medicine: A Systematic Review. *Acad Med*.
486 2022;97(3):444-458. doi:10.1097/ACM.0000000000004563
- 487 14. Farkas AH, Allenbaugh J, Bonifacino E, Turner R, Corbelli JA. Mentorship of US
488 Medical Students: a Systematic Review. *J Gen Intern Med*. 2019;34(11):2602-2609.
489 doi:10.1007/S11606-019-05256-4
- 490 15. Bonifacino E, Ufomata EO, Farkas AH, Turner R, Corbelli JA. Mentorship of
491 Underrepresented Physicians and Trainees in Academic Medicine: a Systematic Review. *J*
492 *Gen Intern Med*. 2021;36(4):1023. doi:10.1007/S11606-020-06478-7
- 493 16. Dornan T. Osler, Flexner, apprenticeship and “the new medical education.” *J R*
494 *Soc Med*. 2005;98(3):91. doi:10.1258/JRSM.98.3.91

- 495 17. Homer: The Odyssey by Robert Fitzgerald (Translated by): Poor Mass Market
496 Paperback (1963) Anchor Books Edition, 1963 | gearbooks. Accessed November 18,
497 2024. [https://www.abebooks.com/first-edition/Homer-Odyssey-Robert-Fitzgerald-](https://www.abebooks.com/first-edition/Homer-Odyssey-Robert-Fitzgerald-Translated-Anchor/2391014894/bd)
498 [Translated-Anchor/2391014894/bd](https://www.abebooks.com/first-edition/Homer-Odyssey-Robert-Fitzgerald-Translated-Anchor/2391014894/bd)
- 499 18. Nguyen M, Chaudhry SI, Desai MM, et al. Association of Sociodemographic
500 Characteristics With US Medical Student Attrition. *JAMA Intern Med.* 2022;182(9):917-
501 924. doi:10.1001/JAMAINTERNMED.2022.2194
- 502 19. Kaplan SE, Raj A, Carr PL, Terrin N, Breeze JL, Freund KM. Race/ethnicity and
503 success in academic medicine: Findings from a longitudinal multi-institutional study.
504 *Academic Medicine.* 2017;33(5):616-622. doi:10.1097/ACM.0000000000001968
- 505 20. General Medical Council. *Equality, Diversity and Inclusion.*; 2024.
- 506 21. Egbedeyi O, El-Hadi H, Madzima TR, Semalulu T, Tunde-Byass M, Swaleh R.
507 Assessing the need for Black mentorship within residency training in Canada. *CMAJ*
508 *Canadian Medical Association Journal.* 2022;194(42):E1455-E1459.
509 doi:10.1503/CMAJ.212124/TAB-RELATED-CONTENT
- 510 22. Osseo-Asare A, Balasuriya L, Huot SJ, et al. Minority Resident Physicians'
511 Views on the Role of Race/Ethnicity in Their Training Experiences in the Workplace.
512 *JAMA Netw Open.* 2018;1(5):e182723-e182723.
513 doi:10.1001/JAMANETWORKOPEN.2018.2723
- 514 23. *Scarborough Charter on Anti-Black Racism and Black Inclusion in Canadian*
515 *Higher Education: Principles, Actions and Accountabilities.*
- 516 24. Creswell JW, Clark VLP, Plano Clark VL. Designing and conducting mixed
517 methods. *Appl Linguist.* 2007;2nd:457. Accessed December 4, 2024.

- 518 <http://scholar.google.com/scholar?hl=en&btnG=Search&q=intitle:Designing+and+conducting+mixed+methods+research#0%5Cnhttp://doi.wiley.com/10.1111/j.1753-6405.2007.00096.x>
- 519
- 520
- 521 25. Yukawa M, Gansky SA, O'Sullivan P, Teherani A, Feldman MD. A new Mentor
- 522 Evaluation Tool: Evidence of validity. *PLoS One*. 2020;15(6).
- 523 doi:10.1371/JOURNAL.PONE.0234345
- 524 26. Hong QN, Fàbregues S, Bartlett G, et al. The Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool
- 525 (MMAT) version 2018 for information professionals and researchers.
- 526 <https://doi.org/10.3233/EFI-180221>. 2018;34(4):285-291. doi:10.3233/EFI-180221
- 527 27. Long DR, Strauss A, Corbin J. Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory
- 528 Procedures and Techniques. *The Modern Language Journal*. 1993;77(2):235.
- 529 doi:10.2307/328955
- 530 28. Estrada M, Hernandez PR, Schultz PW. A longitudinal study of how quality
- 531 mentorship and research experience integrate underrepresented minorities into STEM
- 532 careers. *CBE Life Sci Educ*. 2018;17(1). doi:10.1187/CBE.17-04-0066/ASSET/IMAGES/LARGE/CBE-17-AR9-G002.JPEG
- 533
- 534 29. Yehia BR, Cronholm PF, Wilson N, et al. Mentorship and pursuit of academic
- 535 medicine careers: A mixed methods study of residents from diverse backgrounds. *BMC*
- 536 *Med Educ*. 2014;14(1):1-8. doi:10.1186/1472-6920-14-26/TABLES/3
- 537 30. Kemzang J, Bekolo G, Jaunky S, et al. Mentoring for Admission and Retention of
- 538 Black Socio-Ethnic Minorities in Medicine: A Scoping Review.
- 539 <https://doi.org/10.1177/23821205241283805>. 2024;11. doi:10.1177/23821205241283805

- 540 31. Winer AG, Hyacinthe LM, Weiss JP, Esdaille AR, McNeil BK. Diversity, Equity,
541 and Inclusion: Advancing Curricular Development and Recruitment. *Curr Urol Rep*.
542 2023;24(4):201-204. doi:10.1007/S11934-023-01147-8/FIGURES/1
- 543 32. Rinderknecht FAB, Kouyate A, Teklu S, Hahn M. Antiracism in Action:
544 Development and Outcomes of a Mentorship Program for Premedical Students Who Are
545 Underrepresented or Historically Excluded in Medicine. *Prev Chronic Dis*. 2023;20.
546 doi:10.5888/PCD20.220362
- 547 33. Ramanan RA, Taylor WC, Davis RB, Phillips RS. Mentoring matters: Mentoring
548 and career preparation in internal medicine residency training. *J Gen Intern Med*.
549 2006;21(4):340-345. doi:10.1111/J.1525-1497.2006.00346.X/METRICS
- 550 34. Flint JH, Jahangir AA, Browner BD, Mehta S. The Value of Mentorship in
551 Orthopaedic Surgery Resident Education: The Residents' Perspective. *The Journal of*
552 *Bone and Joint Surgery-American Volume*. 2009;91(4):1017-1022.
553 doi:10.2106/JBJS.H.00934
- 554 35. Jackson VA, Palepu A, Szalacha L, Caswell C, Carr PL, Inui T. "Having the right
555 chemistry": a qualitative study of mentoring in academic medicine. *Acad Med*.
556 2003;78(3):328-334. doi:10.1097/00001888-200303000-00020
- 557 36. hooks bell. *Teaching to Transgress: Education as the Practice of Freedom*.
558 Routledge; 1994.
- 559 37. Community of Support . Accessed November 28, 2024.
560 <https://temertymedicine.utoronto.ca/community-support>