1 Application of chaos and systems theories to explore health workforce re-organisation

- 2 following district splitting in Uganda
- Authors: Aloysius Mutebi¹, Moses Mukuru², Suzanne Kiwanuka¹, Fredrick Makumbi¹, Elizeus
 Rutebemberwa¹

5 Email addresses of co-authors

- 6 Moses Mukuru: <u>mukurumose@gmail.com</u>
- 7 Suzanne Kiwanuka: <u>skiwanuka@musph.ac.ug</u>
- 8 Fredrick Makumbi: <u>fmakumbi@musph.ac.ug</u>
- 9 Elizeus Rutebemberwa: <u>ellie@musph.ac.ug</u>

10 Affiliations

- 11 ¹Makerere University School of Public Health, Kampala, Uganda
- 12 ²Nottingham Trent University
- 13 * Corresponding author' email address: <u>amutebi@musph.ac.ug</u>
- 14 **Running Title**: Application of chaos and systems theories in health workforce re-organisation

15

16 Abstract

17 Background

18 District splitting (DS) began in 1962 and intensified in 1997 during implementation of 19 decentralization. This legislative process focuses on geographical demarcation. The health

- 20 system, organized along local government structures, was re-organized as a result of DS.
- However, this study explored how the health workforce, as a component of the local government
- 22 health system, re-organized following district splitting.

23 Methods

- 24 Conducted between June and December 2018, the qualitative study involved 22 key informant
- 25 interviews in eight districts, representing four broader regions (North, Western, Eastern and
- 26 Central) of Uganda. Participants included district political leaders, local government staff, district
- 27 service commission members, district health team officials, and district senior management. Data
- 28 was collected using an interview guide and four themes were identified for deductive thematic
- 29 analysis.

30 Results

Findings reveal that district splitting led to an involuntary division of the health system between 31 32 old and new districts, triggering multidirectional reorganization of the health workforce. Health workers were systematically allocated to districts based on the geographical location of their 33 health facilities during the splitting process. Subsequently, inter-district migration occurred 34 35 through health workforce secondment or appointment, while intra-health system migration involved vertical movement of health workers within districts during recruitment. This 36 37 reorganization resulted in workforce shortages in health facilities vacated by migrating health 38 workers.

39 **NOTE:** This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice. **CONCLUSIONS**

The study concludes that district splitting caused unintended consequences as a result of chaotic occurrences that led to reorganization of the health workforce in both new and old districts, and caused gaps in service delivery capabilities. Adopting a systems and chaos perspective, the study emphasizes the importance of considering frontline service delivery systems as subsystems of the overall district system when evaluating the impact of district splitting. Such an approach provides a comprehensive framework for understanding the disruptive effects of district splitting on health system organization and service delivery. Keywords: District Splitting, Health workforce, Chaos, Systems, Decentralisation, Uganda

74 **1.0 Introduction**

- 75 Decentralized administrative units are crucial for effective service delivery worldwide (Walker &
- Andrews, 2015). In Uganda, the current local government structures can be traced back to 1948, 76
- 77 with district demarcation beginning in 1959. District splitting and subsequent, creation of new
- 78 districts, is part of decentralization efforts to bring services closer to citizens (Ojambo, 2012).
- 79 Between 1990 and 2019, Uganda saw a rapid increase in districts from 39 to 140 (Green, 2008; 80 Mutebi et al., 2019). Despite its advantages in bringing services (e.g. outpatient health services,
- 81 maternal and child health services, inpatient health services etc) close to people, district splitting
- has also negatively impacted service delivery capabilities, especially in health, by disrupting 82
- health system structures and creating new administrative burdens (Kuuml & Jane, 2014). Despite 83
- claims that splitting enhances service proximity, studies conducted elsewhere appear to suggest 84
- 85 that it mainly serves political interests (Awortwi & Bert Helmsing, 2014). The consequences of
- such splits on health systems, particularly on workforce organization, remain underexplored. 86
- 87 In Uganda, health system decentralization paralleled political decentralization, devolving health
- 88 system functions to local governments (Ojambo, 2012). This shift empowered district service
- 89 commissions to manage human resources, including health workforce recruitment (Mangwi
- 90 Ayiasi et al., 2019; Mansour et al., 2022; Uganda government, 1997). The tiered district health
- 91 system, aligned with administrative structures, comprises various levels of health service
- 92 provisions and mandates which corresponds to the workforce structures.

93 The district health system structure and health workforce

- 94 The health workforce is intricately linked to the hierarchical decentralized political system, with 95 each administrative unit having attached to the tiered healthcare levels and staffing norms (Green, 2008; Ramadhan, 2014) See table 1. District splitting directly affects the subnational 96 97 health workforce structure and functionality, yet research primarily focuses on decentralization's 98 overall impacts (Bossert & Mitchell, 2011). This study aimed at using the chaos and systems 99 theories to explore how the health workforce as a building block of the district health system reorganised itself following district splitting in Uganda. 100
- 101 **Theoretical Framework:**

102 The study utilized Chaos and Systems theories to examine the impact of district splitting on the subnational health workforce. Systems theory views organizations as interconnected 103 subsystems, emphasizing holistic understanding (Chikere & Nwoka, 2015). Districts, comprising 104 105 various subsystems including health, experience destabilization and subsequent system responses post-split. 106

107 Chaos theory suggests that system responses are nonlinear and unpredictable, characterized by self-organization and feedback loops (Levy, 1994; Rickles et al., 2007). This leads to disruptions 108 and reorganization within health subsystems (Harrington & Voehl, 2016). Systems theory 109 informed the conceptualization of health workforce organization, while chaos theory analyzed 110 111 system response patterns post-split. The major components of chaos theory include; 112 interconnectedness, feedback loops, and self-organization, evident in informal feedback processes and meetings facilitating efficient task performance and results attainment. These were 113 114 applied to guide the analysis of the study.

Study design 115

- 116 This was a cross-sectional exploratory study that used qualitative research methods with both
- deductive and inductive thematic analysis. 117

118 Study sites

119 The study was conducted in four broader regions of Uganda i.e. Northern, Western, Eastern and Central. Within each of these regions, two districts were selected for inclusion into the study. 120 Table two shows the eight districts selected for the study i.e. four old districts that existed before 121 the split i.e. Lira, Pallisa, Mukono and Mbarara from which the new districts of Dokolo, Kibuku, 122 123 Buikwe and Ibanda were curved out during the 2010 split. At least two districts i.e., an old and 124 new were selected from each region hence representation from four regions of the country. The 125 selection criteria of the four old districts were based on the Ministry of Finance and Economic 126 Planning (MOFEP) and Development Social Economic Status (SES) (GoU, 2010; Heller et al., 2010; 127 Kavuma Richard, 2009) where upon two districts were perceived to be performing well and the other two perceived to be performing poorly. 128

129 Study participants

The study included a purposive sample of 22 participants: four elected district political leaders, five local government staff, four district service commission members, four district health team officials, and five district senior management members. Participants were selected based on their involvement in health workforce organization before and after district splitting, ensuring they were employed in the district during and after the split. Only those in leadership roles or governing committees responsible for health workforce organization were included, with equal representation from old and new districts. They were chosen for their strategic roles in health

137 workforce planning and management.

138 Data collection methods

139 Key informant interviews

140 Interviews were conducted in December 2018, and the information elicited covered respondent's experiences spanning fourteen years from 2005 to 2018. These were conducted with senior 141 district officials involved in the recruitment process during district splitting. Participants were 142 143 selected from various categories: District Service Commission (DSC) members (Administrative), 144 DSC technical members (Administrative), District Health Managers (Technical), District Technical 145 Leaders (Administrative local government), and District political leaders (Politicians). These 146 categories were chosen for their critical roles in district planning and health workforce 147 leadership. Participants from both old and new districts were included to enable comparison.

- 148 Experienced interviewers with master's degrees conducted the interviews using a specially 149 developed guide covering the major themes from the research questions. Each interview lasted
- about 45 minutes and was recorded digitally. Interviews took place at respondents' preferred
 locations, usually their workplaces. The study also involved reviewing documents to understand
- locations, usually their workplaces. The study also involved reviewing documents to understand
 local government policies and decentralization regarding DS. Key documents reviewed included
- the Public Service Standing Orders and the Human Resource for Health Policy in Uganda, which
- 154 informed recruitment and deployment processes.

155 Data analysis

156 Interview data were transcribed verbatim from audio recordings into Microsoft office word with

157 transcripts were coded deductively following the applied framework domains in Atlas.ti version

158 7 where the codebook was developed and the codes reflected the chaos theories as an analytic

- 159 framework, four themes were identified for deductive thematic analysis which included;:
- 160 Systemic assignment of health workers based on location during DS, inter-district health worker
- 161 migration (on secondment or appointment), intra-district health worker migration (within the

district), and health workforce shortages (due to vertical and horizontal migration). These themes were analyzed to provide interpretive explanations, comparing data between old and new districts and different healthcare system levels at the subnational level.

The first author and a social scientist independently reviewed and coded interviews using a deductive thematic approach based on the key themes and later inductively following emerging insights from the datasets. They discussed individual matrices, focusing on coding differences until when variations were resolved. This process enhanced the quality, depth, and interpretation of results.

Ethical considerations

The study was approved by the Institutional Review Board at Makerere University School of Public Health (HDREC 140) and the Uganda National Council of Science and Technology (SS 2678). Administrative clearances were obtained from district political and health sector leaders before conducting interviews. Respondents were informed about the study's objectives, procedures, risks, and benefits. Interviewers had no prior contact with respondents. Interviews were conducted only after obtaining written informed consent and a separate consent for recording. They were conducted in quiet, secure locations chosen by respondents, interviews ensured privacy and confidentiality. All identifying information was anonymized and replaced with pseudonyms.

Results 199

202

200 Overall, twenty-two respondents were selected from the eight districts with an average of three per district. The selection took into consideration the five types of cadre identified for interview. 201

Age group	Frequency	%age
<45	4	18.2
45-49	3	13.6
50-54	2	9.1
55-59	2	9.1
60-64	3	13.6
>64	8	36.4
Total	22	100

Out of the 22 respondents interviewed, those 64 years and above group (36.4%) had the highest 203 number of respondents followed by those below 45 years (18.2%), 45-49 years (13.6%) and 60-204

64 years (13.6%) respectively. Age was generally balanced between old and new districts with 205

almost equal numbers in each age group. There was only one female among the 22 respondents 206

207 interviewed, which could be a sign that the most dominant top leadership positions are held by 208 males. Using systems and chaos theory, the study examined the impacts of district splitting. Four 209 themes emerged: random health worker assignment, inter-district migration, intra-district

210 movement, and resulting shortages. Splitting the health system caused workforce reorganization,

random worker allocation, and exacerbated shortages. This affected all administrative levels, 211

212 disrupting operations and service delivery, and causing overall disruption, disorganization, and

delayed stability in both old and new districts. 213

214 Emergence of district health workforce management structures after reorganisation

215 Systemic assignment of health workers

District splitting occurred along geographical boundaries defined by the local government act. 216 Before splitting, health workers were attached to particular health facilities by the district health 217 officer and chief administrative officer. Post-splitting, health workers were systemically assigned 218 219 to new districts based on their location at the time of the split. Most workers remained at their 220 stations, with few moving to support new districts. Those who moved left gaps, prompting self-221 organization to fill them. Staff mostly stayed put, with only seconded workers relocating, some

222 later choosing to move permanently.

- 223 Most of our staff remained at their work stations after the districts split. It's only those that were seconded to support the new district that moved, though some 224
- 225 later made up their mind to move on to the new district (CAO 3).

226 Inter-district migration of health workers

227 During district splitting, old districts seconded health workers to new ones as per MOLG/PSC requirements. Both old and new districts began appointing staff to fill vacancies. Seconded staff, 228 229 officially sent by old districts to new ones, started work while recruitment progressed. This led 230 to gaps in old districts, necessitating redeployment. Meanwhile, seconded staff were free to apply 231 for relocation or higher positions. Old districts retained key personnel, often senior staff, 232 influencing new district staffing. Tensions arose when new districts rejected non-native staff, requiring higher authority intervention. Informal negotiations and lobbying formed to resolve 233 234 disputes, promoting self-organization. Over time, tensions eased through reconciliation, showcasing the interconnectedness and power of dialogue among involved parties. 235

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.08.29.24312785; this version posted August 30, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in

perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license .

We in the old district had the advantage of choosing who goes to the new district 236 especially when it came to setting it off, but still HWs who wanted to move due to 237 varying reasons, still moved on whether we accepted or not and we could not stop 238 239 them from moving. So those were struggles under the carpet that were agreed on 240 just like that (LC V Chair 1).

241 Seconding health workers was not an easy task because either district wanted 242 the best. I remember how the new district rejected the person we sent them and demanded for another person. To me a beggar has no choice. You either take 243 what is available or leave (CAO 3). 244

During the secondment process, friction arose as districts competed to attract senior or highly 245 246 qualified health workers. Some districts resisted releasing staff, while new districts offered 247 attractive terms of engagement/deployment, leading to unauthorized staff movements and chaos. 248 Individual decisions escalated, involving district leadership and triggering the "butterfly effect". In some instances, reconciliation efforts, with support from Health Service Commission (HSC) 249 250 members and local opinion leaders, restored order through reorganization and return to sanity 251 within the districts.

- 252 "You know time came when we competed for the good health workers we knew. 253 We had to offer better terms than our competitors so that the health worker is convinced to join our district. This is allowed in this new arrangement of 254 decentralisation" but in most cases there was a lot of unofficial agreements 255 256 between the administration and staff (CAO 2)
- We witnessed a lot of behind the screens moves as some health workers were 257 258 lobbying for movement to another district, and others were negotiating for 259 promotion even before being appointed. But because we are not technical, we let them do the negotiation and the technical personnel handled that (LC V Chair 2). 260

The secondment and appointment process received utmost attention across districts, with 261 District Service Commissions (DSCs) resisting any external influence. However, districts 262 prioritized qualified natives over "external" professionals with similar qualifications, causing 263 264 tension among leaders and necessitating crisis meetings. Feedback and consultations between 265 political and technical leadership arms, along with involvement of Health Service Commission 266 (HSC) or Public Service Commission (PSC), led to consensus on the way forward, restoring 267 normalcy.

- 268 Let me tell you, the decision to retain and refer HWs created a lot of tension with 269 a lot of lobbying by both district councillors, HWs and the technocrats. At one 270 point we were in a planning meeting and some members started accusing each 271 other of influencing the screening to the extent of almost exchanging blows (DSC Chair 3). 272
- You know these district councillors thought they could force me into appointing 273 people without the right qualifications, I refused and assured them I was not 274 275 willing to face the inspector general of government because of corrupt tendencies in the recruitment. I even asked them to put it in writing and I forward it to our 276 277 seniors in the ministry. That's when they all went silent (CAO 5).

In new districts, District Health Officers (DHOs) served in acting capacities after being seconded 278 279 from old districts or appointed by the public service commission to initiate district health offices.

280 Many seconded health workers assumed automatic recruitment leading to preferential treatment of health workers from old district which could have led to not following recommended 281 282 procedures when recruiting staff. This disorganized relations between workers and leaders, 283 impacting inter-district cooperation. Negotiations, mostly informal, resolved disagreements, but 284 in cases of irreconcilable differences, health workers returned to previous districts or sought 285 employment elsewhere.

286 "When I was seconded to the new district, I thought it was obvious they were going to recruit me because I had all the qualifications but surprisingly, I started 287 hearing talk from some colleagues that I was not a son of the soil. Meaning that 288 289 because I was not born in the district, the DSC had some other person they 290 preferred. I was only saved by the HSC representative who insisted that the person they had fronted did not qualify for the post." (DHO 2) 291

The final task of appointing and deploying after secondment faced disruptions and interference 292 293 from various leaders. District Service Commissions (DSCs) and District Health Officers (DHOs), 294 guided by acting Chief Administrative Officers (CAOs), were responsible. Interference affected 295 DHOs, as health workers requested deployment near their homes or towns. DHOs would occasionally hold informal meetings before releasing deployment schedules, involving district 296 297 leaders and technocrats to maintain good relations. Acting positions in new districts made 298 technical leaders vulnerable to political pressure, affecting decision-making. Appointments often 299 occurred in the presence of a Health Service Commission (HSC) member, providing support to 300 technical personnel.

In my district we had several qualified health workers who had been in the same 301 302 positions for several years without being promoted due to lack of opportunities. 303 We therefore considered them during the recruitment process and appointed them on probation in new positions as a way of motivation. (CAO 3). 304

Many seconded staff from old districts were appointed on probation in their new districts, while 305 some acting staff not meeting requirements were advised to return to their previous districts or 306 307 accept lower positions, causing distress and disorganization. Those seeking official transfers but 308 not accepted faced dilemmas, as returning to previous districts was often not feasible, forcing 309 them to seek employment elsewhere. There was different treatment/handling of health workers on a case by case basis which is reflective of lack or abuse of standard operating procedure for 310 311 managing human resource for health.

312 "I didn't like the way some of the seconded staff were treated by the DSC just 313 because they preferred candidates that were born in this district. We lost a 314 chance of getting very experienced and qualified staff because the DSC wanted 315 people born in the district "son of the soil". (DSC Sec 2)

316 Intra district migration of health workers

Following district splitting, health worker movement occurred within both old and new districts 317 318 due to gaps left by those on secondment or seeking new appointments elsewhere. Both districts 319 identified gaps, advertised vacancies, conducted interviews, and appointed new staff to fill the 320 gaps. Meanwhile, reorganization of available workforce ensured continued service delivery 321 despite gaps. District Health Officers (DHOs) redeployed staff to facilities with vacancies, facing challenges as some workers resisted relocation. Meetings between health workers and their 322 323 leadership were held to resolve disputes, sometimes involving Chief Administrative Officers 324 (CAOs). Redeployment occurred in all districts post-splitting to address workforce gaps. After

325 probationary appointments, district health offices reorganized staff at all levels to maintain 326 quality healthcare services.

327 Immediately after DS occurred, we had to do reallocation of health workers to fill
328 some of the key positions that had been created due to seconded staff. Then we
329 also reorganised the workforce after the final appointment of new staff (CAO 1).

330 Health workforce shortages

331 Throughout the various forms of reorganization, the existing health workforce was distributed across districts, creating gaps in each district, doubling the pre-splitting workload. Recruitment 332 efforts failed to fill all gaps, leading to further disruptions. Emergent gaps due to seconded or 333 unauthorized departures required reorganization and advertising of vacancies, exacerbating 334 understaffing and disrupting health facility operations. Districts already grappling with 335 336 understaffing pre-splitting faced worsened conditions. Filling vacancies awaited confirmation 337 from the Ministry of Finance, Planning, and Economic Development (MOFPED) on the wage bill. 338 Constant feedback meetings among affected district leaders facilitated secondments and redeployments, achieving workforce balance across districts before addressing persisting gaps 339 through advertisement and recruitment. 340

341 Discussion

This study aimed at using the chaos and systems theories to explore how the health workforce as 342 343 a building block of the district health system re-organised itself following district splitting in 344 Uganda. This qualitative study examines the reorganization of the health workforce following 345 district splitting in Uganda, revealing its impact on both new and old districts. It explores how 346 reorganization within and between districts results in multidirectional workforce arrangements, 347 such as systematic assignment of health workers, inter-district migration of health workers, intra district migration of health workers and health workforce shortages. Subsequently, these will be 348 elaborated on further in the sections that follow. The study offers fresh insights into the 349 350 interconnectedness of the health workforce and district systems, shedding light on the 351 complexities of their reorganization after district splitting.

The study also critiques broad discussions on decentralization, urging for a deeper understanding 352 353 of local government systems and their subsystems(Zaidi et al., 2019) to inform health worker allocation following district splitting. It stresses the importance of policymakers comprehension 354 of these subsystems' interactions and formations to address the positive and negative impacts of 355 district splitting effectively (Abimbola et al., 2019). Despite challenges like respondent recall, the 356 357 study utilizes triangulation of data sources to mitigate these issues, enhancing the reliability of its findings(Beesley et al., 2011; Durham et al., 2015). Detailed discussions about the results 358 359 following themes from the applied framework follows here next;

360 Systematic assignment of health workforce

Before district splitting, the decentralisation policy through the local government act gave 361 362 districts autonomous powers to advertise, interview and recruit health workers. These health workers were already stationed across health facilities in all the selected districts. However, after 363 the splitting, most health workers remained at their original workstations based the district 364 appointment and deployment plans under their local government demarcations. Many avoided 365 moving due to observed disruptions and chaotic scenarios. Some were content with their current 366 stations, while others were reluctant to undergo the rigorous process of switching districts, which 367 involved either secondment by the Chief Administrative Officer (CAO) or applying through the 368

369 standard District Service Commission procedures. Another study conducted in Kampala city 370 showed that those who have lived in rural areas were less likely to report wanting to 371 emigrate(Nguyen et al., 2008).

372 Inter-district migration of health workers

373 After district splitting, some health workers were seconded to new districts by Chief 374 Administrative Officers (CAOs) to kickstart operations, causing disruptions in the old districts. This led to gaps due to staff departures on secondment or appointment. New positions were 375 376 created at different levels in the health system structures of both new and old districts. However, 377 the movement of health workers between districts was not smooth, disrupting both subsystems and the entire district structure. Disagreements arose on how to share available human 378 379 resources, affecting recruitment components interconnected within the system. In other studies 380 it was noted that these disruptions triggered emergent behaviours and took time to reorganize, 381 mainly due to political and technical differences between districts(Chen et al., 2021; Nalukwago et al., 2019). 382

In this study, negotiations and rule bending occurred during secondments and appointments, 383 384 breaking some rules in order to facilitate recruitment. In a similar study the tension between rule 385 makers and breakers influenced the ecology of the field (Dzansi et al., 2016). Similar findings from another study showed that negotiations, bargaining, and conflicts between district leaders, 386 technocrats, and health workers ensued, leading to disorganization within and between 387 388 districts(Parrish, 2022). However, through feedback negotiations, the chaos was eventually 389 normalized into a reorganized state(Renn, 2022; Schein, 2004).

390 In this study, a lot of negotiations during this period of splitting brought out the 391 interconnectedness of different players and self-organization which made it possible for 392 agreements to be reached. This chaotic period highlights the dynamics between rule breakers and makers, shaping both tight and loose cultures within organizations(Lithwick, 2012). While chaos 393 394 presents challenges, it also leads to innovative solutions(Gelfand, 2019; Parrish, 2022). Studies in Kenya have shown recruitment strategies focusing on geographic areas to minimize staff 395 396 transfers(Adano, 2008).

397 Intra-district migration of health workers

398 The recruitment process faced internal and external disruptions, delaying the process in most 399 districts. Suspected ulterior motives among committee members led to delays, requiring 400 extensive discussions and informal meetings for resolution. Respondents considered these to be a result of political interference by different players which later resulted into several informal 401 meetings and consensus was reached by all concerned parties. Therefore, the formal process was 402 403 compromised, prompting management to adopt informal transparency measures, settling 404 disputes and allowing work to proceed. In another study it was seen that the decision-making in 405 behaviour change is often quantum rather than linear, with changes being conceptualized as deterministic processes (Kenneth Resnicow, 2008). It was also observed that small issues during 406 407 redeployment caused friction among leaders but were resolved through formal and informal 408 discussions, reaching consensus. Some behaviour change events may be linear, while others may 409 be complex and nonlinear, requiring a chaos lens for understanding(Ken Resnicow & Vaughan, 410 2011; Kenneth Resnicow, 2008).

Health workforce shortages 411

After the completion of secondment, appointment, and redeployment across all districts, new 412 413 gaps emerged due to unauthorized departures, requiring reorganization and advertising of medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.08.29.24312785; this version posted August 30, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in

perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license .

414 vacant posts. These unforeseen movements disrupted work at health facilities, worsening 415 understaffing and posing challenges in transferring recently deployed workers. Time constraints and financial implications compounded the urgency to fill vacancies before the end of the financial 416 year. The complex and chaotic nature of health worker behaviour change can be integrated into 417 418 public health interventions, offering insights into how individuals and organizations adapt(Gardner et al., 2021). Despite completing the recruitment process, new gaps arose from 419 unauthorized departures, further disrupting the system. A complementary approach is 420 suggested, encouraging the incorporation of nonlinear concepts into intervention design and 421 422 analysis(Bien, 2004; C'De Baca & Wilbourne, 2004; Miller, William R C'de Baca, 2001; Miller, 2004). The solutions of yesterday had now become the problems of today (Agyepong et al., 2012). 423 Support from Chief Administrative Officers (CAOs) is crucial for District Health Officers (DHOs) 424 425 during deployment to mitigate complaints and discontent among health workers.

The study underscores the implications for reconceptualizing workforce management in 426 427 decentralized settings post-district splitting to enhance service delivery efficiency at sub-national 428 levels, especially in human resource for health organization. It challenges the instrumentalist 429 view of district creation as merely bringing services closer to the population, revealing unintended chaos in health workforce distribution. By employing a chaos lens, the study 430 highlights non-linear disruptions and disorganization within the health workforce subsystems, 431 emphasizing the need for a more systematic approach to decentralization and district splitting to 432 achieve efficiency goals(Zanin & Martínez, 2022). 433

434

Strengths and limitations of the study 435

This paper is informed by district leaders and health workers perspectives of what happened 436 437 with the reorganisation processes after districts were split. Their views inform our conclusions about the effect of district splitting human resources for health management focusing on the 438 439 reorganisation processes. All findings are from people who were present and directly 440 participated in these processes, the study brings first-hand experiences of what transpired, while 441 the systems and chaos theories show us the unforeseen inefficiencies that occurred in the 442 reorganisation process after splits had occurred. Its conclusions can reliably be assumed in respect of other districts that have experienced district splitting. There could have been some 443 444 social-desirable bias given the area under study. It's possible that there was some recall bias given that the study was conducted some years after district splitting of 2010. It's also possible that 445 446 there was social desirability and not wanting to talk about bad things about the district and its 447 human resource by some respondents. Due to the cross-sectional nature of the research, it was 448 unable to observe and provide for analysis of trends over time. Findings from the few study 449 districts are hard to generalise as experiences may have varied in other districts hence impeding 450 generalisability.

451 Conclusions

452 District splitting affected all district systems right through the physical divide along geographical boundaries, through the whole district administrative structure, splitting the district councils, 453 district local government (all departments including health), DSCs etc. The health system was 454 455 generally affected as it aligns with the district local government structure from top to bottom, and is categorised into four sub systems. These subsystems are interconnected, interrelated, and 456 457 interdependent, working together to produce optimal outcomes while collectively striving to reorganize the health workforce to deliver quality healthcare. 458

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.08.29.24312785; this version posted August 30, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in

perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license .

459 We see how the formal system with linear thinking is disrupted and disorganised by political and technical interference before it can reorganise itself back to normal. Even when the districts think 460 461 they are done with the reorganisation, and gaps have been filled, then they realise that some 462 health workers left their stations without official release. Then the process of reorganisation 463 continues on, meaning that the solutions of yesterday become the problems of today.

464 Findings suggest that without considering the consequences of underlying patterns, interconnected actions, continuous feedback loops, and self-organizing mechanisms after 465 splitting, systems and subsystems do not perform as expected. Unexpected small errors can arise, 466 467 leading to a significant negative impact on the health workforce reorganization process.

The chaotic nature involves disorder, disruption and disorganisation of systems including the 468 469 health workforce. But then the process of reorganisation that follows chaotic happens, introduces 470 enabling conditions that include innovation, creativity and flexibility. These introduce an environment of understanding among the different district leaders and health workers. If these 471 are considered during the planning and implementation of district splitting processes, they are 472

- likely to benefit both parties and reduce the tension or chaos that is caused by the splitting. 473
- 474

475 **Declarations**

Ethical approval and consent to participate 476

This study has received ethical approval from Makerere University School of Public Health Higher 477

478 Degrees Research and Ethics Committee (HDREC) ref; HDREC 140. The final ethical clearance is

479 being processed from the Ugandan National Council for Sciences and Technology (UNCST) ref; SS

480 2678. Further administrative clearance was obtained from the management of all participating

481 health facilities and organisations where the study was conducted. Individual informed consent

482 was obtained from all prospective respondents.

483 **Consent for publication**

484 Consent to publish the findings of the study was obtained at the point of seeking consent to 485 participate. The participants' confidentiality and anonymity while reporting was assured.

486 Not applicable

487 Availability of data and materials

The datasets used and/or analysed during the current study are available from the corresponding 488 author upon reasonable request. 489

490 **Competing interests**

491 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

492 Funding

- 493 The study received no specific funding but support for field work facilitation was obtained from
- 494 the Department of Health Policy Planning and Management, School of Public Health, College of
- 495 Health Sciences, Makerere University Kampala, Uganda.

496

497

498 Author's contribution

AM conceived the study; ER and FM provided supervision support. MM guided the methods with
special attention to the theories and SK helped with conceptualisation of health systems. All
authors reviewed and approved the final manuscript.

502 Acknowledgements

- The author wishes to acknowledge the contribution of the data collection team and the reviewerswho provided useful insights that informed the revision of the manuscript.
- 505 Author's information

506 Affiliations

- 507 Department of Health Policy Planning and Management, School of Public Health, College of Health
 508 Sciences, Makerere University Kampala, Uganda.
- 509 Aloysius Mutebi, Elizeus Rutebemberwa
- 510 Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, School of Public Health, College of Health Sciences,
- 511 Makerere University Kampala, Uganda.
- 512 Fredrick Makumbi
- 513 Nottingham Trent University
- 514 Moses Mukuru
- 515 Corresponding author
- 516 Correspondences to Aloysius Mutebi
- 517 ORCID (0000-0002-6837-5488)
- 518
- 519

520 **References**

- Abimbola, S., Baatiema, L., & Bigdeli, M. (2019). The impacts of decentralization on health
 system equity, efficiency and resilience: A realist synthesis of the evidence. *Health Policy and Planning*, 34(8), 605–617. https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czz055
- Adano, U. (2008). The health worker recruitment and deployment process in Kenya: An
 emergency hiring program. *Human Resources for Health*. https://doi.org/10.1186/14784491-6-19
- Beesley, M., Cometto, G., & Pavignani, E. (2011). From drought to deluge: How information
 overload saturated absorption capacity in a disrupted health sector. *Health Policy and Planning*, *26*(6), 445–452. https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czq083
- Bien, T. H. (2004). Quantum Change and Psychotherapy. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 60(5),
 493–501. https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.20003
- C'De Baca, J., & Wilbourne, P. (2004). Quantum Change: Ten Years Later. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 60(5), 531–541. https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.20006
- Chen, J., Ssennyonjo, A., Wabwire-Mangen, F., Kim, J. H., Bell, G., & Hirschhorn, L. (2021). Does
 decentralization of health systems translate into decentralization of authority? A decision

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2024.08.29.24312785; this version posted August 30, 2024. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

536

537

538

539

540

541

542 543

544

545 546

547

548 549

550

551

552

553

554

555

556

557

558 559

560 561

562

563

564 565

566

567

568 569

570

571 572

573

574

575 576

577

578

579

580

581

perpetuity. It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license . space analysis of Ugandan healthcare facilities. *Health Policy and Planning*, 36(9), 1408– 1417. https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czab074 Durham, J., Pavignani, E., Beesley, M., & Hill, P. S. (2015). Human resources for health in six healthcare arenas under stress: A qualitative study. Human Resources for Health, 13(1), 1-12. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12960-015-0005-7 Dzansi, L. W., Chipunza, C., & Monnapula-Mapesela, M. (2016). Municipal Employees' Perceptions Of Political Interference In Human Resource Management Practices: Evidence From The Free State Province In South Africa. International Business & Economics Research Journal (IBER), 15(1), 15. https://doi.org/10.19030/iber.v15i1.9572 Gardner, B., Arden, M. A., Brown, D., Eves, F. F., Green, J., Hamilton, K., Hankonen, N., Inauen, J., Keller, J., Kwasnicka, D., Labudek, S., Marien, H., Masaryk, R., McCleary, N., Mullan, B. A., Neter, E., Orbell, S., Potthoff, S., & Lally, P. (2021). Developing habit-based health behaviour change interventions: twenty-one questions to guide future research. Psychology and *Health*, *0*(0), 1–23. https://doi.org/10.1080/08870446.2021.2003362 Gelfand, M. (2019). Rule Makers, Rule Breakers: Tight and Loose Cultures and the Secret Signals. Scribner. https://books.google.co.uk/books?hl=en&lr=&id=bLSkDwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA1&dq= Michele+Gelfand+(2019)+&ots=PBE3A28KtB&sig=awjkodUE5IBJvRZ9K51nD7bLFt4&redi r_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Michele Gelfand (2019)&f=false GoU. (2010). National Development Plan (2010/11-2014/15). In Republic of Uganda. Heller, P. S., Powell-Jackson, T., Hanson, K., McIntyre, D., Okwero Peter, Tandon, A., Sparkes, S., Mclaughlin, J., Hoogeveen, J. G., Cashin, C., Mossialos, E., & Zhang, L. (2010). Fiscal Space for Health in Uganda. *HNP Discussion Paper*, 25(47061), 1–94, World Bank Working Paper no. 186. https://doi.org/10.1596/978?0?8213-8290-5 Kavuma Richard. (2009). Explainer: Local government structures in Uganda | Katine | The Guardian. https://www.theguardian.com/katine/2009/dec/14/local-governmentexplainer Lithwick, D. (2012). The Best American Magazine Writing 2017. The American Society of Magazine Editors · 2017, 527. https://www.google.co.uk/books/edition/The_Best_American_Magazine_Writing_2017/Cl I4DwAAQBAJ?hl=en&gbpv=1&dq=Lithwick+(2012)&pg=PA527&printsec=frontcover Mangwi Ayiasi, R., Rutebemberwa, E., & Martineau, T. (2019). "posting policies don't change because there is peace or war": The staff deployment challenges for two large health employers during and after conflict in Northern Uganda. Human Resources for Health, 17(1), 1-10. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12960-019-0361-9 Mansour, W., Aryaija-Karemani, A., Martineau, T., Namakula, J., Mubiri, P., Ssengooba, F., & Raven, J. (2022). Management of human resources for health in health districts in Uganda: A decision space analysis. International Journal of Health Planning and Management, 37(2), 770-789. https://doi.org/10.1002/hpm.3359 Miller, William R C'de Baca, J. (2001). Quantum change: When epiphanies and sudden insights transform ordinary lives. American Psychological Association. https://psycnet.apa.org/record/2001-18640-000 Miller, W. R. (2004). The Phenomenon of Quantum Change. Journal of Clinical Psychology, 60(5), 453-460. https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.20000 Nalukwago, J., Crutzen, R., van den Borne, B., Bukuluki, P. M., Bufumbo, L., Burke, H. M. C., Field, S., Zikusooka, A., Fiedler, A. A., & Alaii, J. (2019). Gender norms associated with adolescent

- sexual behaviours in Uganda. *International Social Science Journal*, 69(231), 35–48.
 https://doi.org/10.1111/issj.12203
- Nguyen, L., Ropers, S., Nderitu, E., Zuyderduin, A., Luboga, S., & Hagopian, A. (2008). Intent to
 migrate among nursing students in Uganda: Measures of the brain drain in the next
 generation of health professionals. *Human Resources for Health*, *6*, 1–11.
 https://doi.org/10.1186/1478-4491-6-5
- Parrish, B. S. (2022). Dahlia Lithwick Things You Never Know About Her, Her Articles And Her
 New Book. Amazon Digital Services LLC Kdp.
- Renn, K. A. (2022). *Reimagining the Study of Higher Education: Generous Thinking, Chaos, and Order in a Low Consensus Field*. Published by Johns Hopkins University Press.
 https://www.ashe.ws/files/Past Presidents/Renn.pdf
- Resnicow, Ken, & Vaughan, R. (2011). A chaotic view of behavior change: A quantum leap for
 health promotion. *Models and Applications of Chaos Theory in Modern Sciences*, 7, 3–13.
 https://doi.org/10.1186/1479-Received
- Resnicow, Kenneth. (2008). Embracing Chaos and Complexity: A Quantum Change for Public
 Health. *Am J Public Health*, 1382–1389. https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2007.129460
- Schein, E. H. (2004). *Jossey-Bass*. A Wiley Imprint. http://www.untag smd.ac.id/files/Perpustakaan_Digital_2/ORGANIZATIONAL CULTURE Organizational
 Culture and Leadership, 3rd Edition.pdf
- Uganda government. (1997). Local Governments Act 1997 | Uganda Legal Information Institute.
 https://ulii.org/ug/legislation/consolidated-act/243
- Zaidi, S. A., Bigdeli, M., Langlois, E. V., Riaz, A., Orr, D. W., Idrees, N., & Bump, J. B. (2019). Health
 systems changes after decentralisation: Progress, challenges and dynamics in Pakistan. *BMJ Global Health*. https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjgh-2018-001013
- Zanin, M., & Martínez, J. H. (2022). Analyzing international events through the lens of statistical
 physics: The case of Ukraine. *Chaos*, *32*(5). https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0091628

608