- 1 Persistence of respiratory, enteric, and fecal
- 2 indicator viruses in fecal sludge from on-site
- 3 sanitation in Dakar, Senegal
- 4 Short Title: Viral RNA decay in fecal sludge from on-site sanitation

5 Lorelay Mendoza Grijalva^a, Alsane Seck^b, Laura Roldan-Hernandez^a, Katherine E. Graham^{a,c},

6 Alexandria B. Boehm^a, William A. Tarpeh^{a,d,*}

7

- 8 ^a Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Stanford University, Stanford, 94305, USA
- 9 **DELVIC Sanitation Initiatives, Dakar, 15542, Senegal**
- 10 ^c School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta,
- 11 Georgia, 30332, USA
- 12 ^dDepartment of Chemical Engineering, Stanford University, Stanford, 94305, USA
- 13 *Corresponding Author: wtarpeh@stanford.edu
- 14
- 15

17 Abstract

34 Keywords

- 35 Environmental surveillance
- 36 Fecal sludge treatment plant
- 37 Virus RNA decay
- 38 Wastewater-based epidemiology

39 Highlights

49 Graphical Abstract

54 Introduction

55 Wastewater-based epidemiology (WBE) emerged as a vital tool amid the COVID-19 pandemic, 56 offering actionable public health insights that supplement traditional disease surveillance. Its 57 pandemic response contributions include capturing asymptomatic carriers, identifying hotspots 58 requiring resource deployment (Kirby *et al.*, 2021; Diamond *et al.*, 2022), and illustrating the 59 regional spread of emerging variants (Izquierdo-Lara *et al.*, 2021; Boehm *et al.*, 2022). WBE has 60 since extended its scope to the surveillance of other infectious diseases caused by viruses 61 (CDC, 2022; Wolfe *et al.*, 2023). While advancements in WBE have focused on urban, high-62 income areas served by centralized, sewered treatment facilities thus far (Naughton et al., 63 2021), on-site sanitation technologies, such as septic tanks and pit latrines, predominant in Sub-64 Saharan Africa (72%), Central Asia (68%), and Latin America and the Caribbean (31%) (Greene 65 et al., 2021), are often overlooked. Despite serving 2.7 billion individuals, the potential to provide 66 community disease surveillance for populations reliant on non-sewered, on-site sanitation 67 systems has been highlighted (Capone et al. 2020; Li et al. 2023) but remains underexplored. 68 69 Conducting community health surveillance in non-sewered settings using fecal sludge presents 70 context-specific challenges, such as scale, representativeness, and the stability of viral targets 71 in on-site sanitation. Scale concerns arise because septic tanks and pit latrines typically serve 72 individual households, making community surveillance resource-intensive. Attaining 73 representativeness poses challenges in areas with limited sanitation infrastructure. Although 74 environmental sampling can detect pathogens, the samples collected may generally lack 75 information about the origin of flow inputs, the contributing population, and the environmental 76 conditions between excretion and sampling. These inconsistencies may adversely impact the 77 quality of measurements, thus challenging reproducibility and diminishing the ability to compare 78 results between sites or studies. The limited understanding of target stability also increases the

79 challenge of interpreting the data because on-site sanitation technologies may retain excreta for 80 extended periods (i.e., months to years) before disposal (Jensen *et al.*, 2009; Kumwenda, 2019; 81 Musaazi *et al.*, 2023).

82

83 Sampling from fecal sludge treatment plants (FSTPs) can begin to address these challenges; 84 FSTPs serve as centralized facilities that collect and treat fecal sludge from diverse areas, and 85 are common in urban and peri-urban areas (Atitaya Panuvatvanich, 2013; Sanitation Matters, 86 2013; Harada, Strande and Fujii, 2015). FSTPs receive sludge from trucks servicing on-site 87 systems, offering a pooled sample more representative than individual sanitation systems. 88 Factors like sewershed size, input frequency, and sources may be more feasibly estimated than 89 from surface water or soil samples, offering clearer understanding into the environmental 90 conditions affecting the integrity of the sampled wastewater. Leveraging existing waste 91 operations in non-sewered localities like Dakar, Senegal, presents promising opportunities to 92 survey community health. Compared to on-site sanitation systems alone, FSTPs serve a larger 93 population (scale) and encompass a known or consistent group of people (representative); 94 however, insights into the stability of viral targets within the community's waste stream are 95 unknown.

96

97 The stability of targets has been highlighted as an important research area within WBE (Capone 98 et al., 2021; Li et al., 2021), and determining the persistence of viral RNA in fecal sludge from 99 FSTPs is a sensible first step towards developing effective WBE programs in communities that 100 use on-site sanitation systems. While numerous studies have explored virus decay in 101 wastewater from sewered settings (Ahmed *et al.*, 2020; Bivins *et al.*, 2020; Fu *et al.*, 2022; 102 Roldan-Hernandez *et al.*, 2022), research on pathogen persistence within on-site sanitation 103 systems is limited. On-site systems, dealing with smaller volumes and potentially higher solids 104 content, may not consistently receive household greywater. Their characteristics can differ from

105 sewered wastewater, and wastewater composition is known to impact pathogen decay (Koné *et* 106 *al.*, 2007; Mehl *et al.*, 2011; Darimani *et al.*, 2015). Assessing their decay in context-specific 107 matrices, such as fecal sludge from aggregated on-site sanitation systems, is vital due to 108 potential variations in wastewater composition. Relying on decay values from other wastewater 109 sources may not represent the unique characteristics of these sanitation contexts. Determining 110 the decay rate of viral targets in fecal sludge may also offer insight into the maximum duration of 111 sludge residence in on-site systems that still allow for their detection using molecular methods. 112

113 In this study, we sought to assess the feasibility of utilizing FSTPs to implement WBE. We 114 focused on the stability of various viral genomic RNA targets in fecal sludge samples from a 115 centralized fecal sludge treatment facility in Dakar. We screened for key respiratory, enteric, and 116 fecal indicator viruses' genomic RNA, and then examined their persistence. Specifically, we 117 measured first-order decay kinetics of an exogenous respiratory virus, SARS-CoV-2 RNA; an 118 endogenous enteric virus, human norovirus (HuNoV) RNA; and two endogenous human fecal 119 indicator viruses, pepper mild mottle virus (PMMoV) and tomato brown rugose fruit virus 120 (ToBRFV) RNA in fecal sludge at three relevant temperature conditions (4 \degree C, 15 \degree C, and 30 121 ^oC). Collectively, these objectives contribute vital insights into fecal sludge sampling protocols in 122 non-sewered settings and shed light on virus RNA persistence across diverse waste matrices. 123 With the results of this study, we aim to advance understanding of monitoring infectious 124 diseases in non-sewered settings.

125

126

127 Methods

128 Experiment overview and setup

129 Untreated fecal sludge was sampled from collection trucks at the inlet of a mid-sized fecal 130 sludge treatment plant in Dakar, Senegal (Supplemental methods M1) and shipped to Stanford 131 University, California. Each fecal sludge sample was aliquoted into duplicate 50-mL conical 132 tubes. Tube racks were placed into three temperature-controlled rooms (4 ºC, 15 ºC, and 30 133 ºC), and covered in aluminum foil to prevent photodegradation. The total experiment duration 134 was 70 days, with samples taken throughout and analyzed for RNA of four target viruses 135 (Figure S1).

136 Site selection

137 In collaboration with Delvic Sanitation Initiatives, we identified six potential sampling sites in 138 Senegal, considering operational areas, ease of sampling, and proximity to shipping services 139 (Figure S2). Subsequently, we ranked and narrowed down these candidate regions based on 140 COVID-19 prevalence in October 2020, ultimately choosing the city of Dakar. From the four 141 FSTPs in Dakar, we selected the one with the largest "sewershed" population, serving 142 approximately 600,000 people (Table S1). Cambérène, our chosen FSTP, receives 600 m^3 of 143 fecal sludge daily from emptying trucks servicing on-site sanitation systems and contains two 144 parallel settling thickening tanks and 10 unpacked drying beds. The facility removes solids from 145 the sludge before pumping the remaining liquid to a neighboring activated sludge wastewater 146 treatment plant for further treatment (Figure S3).

147 Target selection and screening

148 Candidate viruses were chosen through a comprehensive evaluation, considering factors such 149 as relevance (e.g., COVID-19), regional importance, disease burden, knowledge gaps, logistical 150 feasibility, and novelty of the work (Table S2). SARS-CoV-2, specifically the N1 and N2 regions 151 of its genome, was selected due to its relevance to the COVID-19 pandemic. In 2017, diarrheal 152 diseases, caused by enteric bacterial and viral pathogens, resulted in 1.6 million deaths 153 globally, with children being the most affected (Dattani *et al.*, 2023). Diarrheal diseases also 154 rank among the top 5 causes of death in Senegal (*Senegal - CDC - Center for Global Health*, 155 2019). This prevalence motivated our selection of HuNoV, given its implications in a context 156 where diarrheal diseases pose a considerable threat to public health. 157 158 Pepper mild mottle virus (PMMoV), a commonly used microbial source tracker (MST) found 159 ubiquitously in feces, was included due to its use as a normalization basis for other WBE targets 160 (D'Aoust *et al.*, 2021; S. McClary-Gutierrez *et al.*, 2021; Wu *et al.*, 2022) and as an indirect 161 measurement of the fecal strength of wastewater (Rosario *et al.*, 2009; Symonds, Rosario and 162 Breitbart, 2019). Although studies exist on PMMoV persistence in wastewater influent and solids

163 (Roldan-Hernandez *et al.*, 2022; Burnet *et al.*, 2023; Li *et al.*, 2023), there is novelty in studying

164 PMMoV in on-site sanitation systems. Lastly, tomato brown rugose fruit virus (ToBRFV) was

165 selected because it is an emerging microbial source tracker like PMMoV (Natarajan *et al.*,

166 2023). ToBRFV is an RNA virus that infects tomatoes and peppers. Reports indicate its

167 detection in crops in over 35 countries (Zhang *et al.*, 2022), as well as its specificity and

168 abundance in human feces (Rothman and Whiteson, 2022; Natarajan *et al.*, 2023). This study

169 marks the first detection of ToBRFV in Senegal and the first study globally to document the

170 decay of ToBRFV RNA in any wastewater matrix based on a systematic literature search as of

171 October 2023 (Supplemental methods M2 and M3).

172

184 Sample collection and processing

185 Grab samples were collected on October 3rd, 2022 from a vacuum truck during discharge of 186 fecal sludge to Cambérène FSTP. Samples were manually composited; 3 L of samples were 187 taken at the beginning, 5 L of sample in the middle, and 3 L of sample at the end of the 188 discharge process. The sampling strategy was coordinated with vacuum truck operators and the 189 samples were mixed vigorously with a stirring rod or ladle and collected to minimize settling 190 (Figure S4). After collection in plastic bottles, sludge samples were enclosed in sealed plastic 191 bags, placed in a styrofoam cooler, and shipped to Stanford University within 24 hours.

192

193 Upon arrival at Stanford (within 6 days), the samples were analyzed for temperature (20 °C), pH

194 using a pH meter(Mettler Toledo, Columbus, -OH), and total solids using standard methods

195 (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, 2001); they were then stored at at 4 \degree C while the

196 remaining experimental setup was completed for up to 12 hours. Samples were then mixed and 197 aliquoted into duplicate 50 mL sterile conical tubes for each time point (Corning, Glendale, AZ); 198 each conical tube was spiked with heat-inactivated SARS-CoV-2 (Integrated DNA technologies, 199 Coralville, Iowa). First, a suspension of the SARS-CoV-2 stock was made by making a mix of 1 ²⁰⁰μL of stock per 1 mL of 1x tris-EDTA (TE) buffer. Then, 1 mL of the working stock was added to 201 each aliquot for a resulting spike of (2.08×10^6) gene copies per mL). Duplicate aliquots for each 202 time point were subsequently incubated in three temperature-controlled rooms (4, 15, and 30 203 C) to assess the effect of temperature on SARS-CoV-2, HuNoV, PMMoV, and ToBRFV RNA. 204 The samples were covered in foil to prevent potential photodegradation. Both replicate aliquots 205 were processed on day 0 (the day they were prepared), and on days 2,4,6,8,10,12,18,40,55, 206 and 70 were immediately centrifuged upon collection for sample dewatering.

207 RNA extraction and RT-ddPCR

208 We dewatered fecal sludge samples using a modified existing protocol and extracted them upon 209 day of collection (Topol *et al.*, 2021). After centrifugation at 24000 x q for 30 min at 4 °C, the 210 entire supernatant was decanted, taking care not to disturb the pellet, and all solids were 211 retained. 0.22 g of the dewatered sludge pellet were resuspended in a 2.9 mL solution of 212 DNA/RNA shield spiked with 1.5 μL of rehydrated bovine coronavirus (BCoV) vaccine (500,000 213 copies/mL in the solution) as an extraction control. The final concentration of dewatered solids 214 resuspended in the BCoV-spiked DNA/RNA shield was approximately 75 mg/mL. 215 Homogenization with four grinding balls (OPS Diagnostics, Lebanon, NJ) at 1,000 rpm for two 216 minutes (MP Biomedicals, Santa Ana, California) was followed by brief centrifugation at 4000 x 217 g for five minutes. RNA extraction, conducted the same day, used Qiagen Allprep Powerviral 218 Kits (Qiagen, Germantown, MD). Each sample was processed in duplicate from concentration 219 through quantification. One positive and two negative extraction controls per sampling timepoint

238 Data analysis

239 Data were exported as CSV files from ddPCR Quantasoft software and dimensional analysis to 240 convert concentrations per well to gene copies per gram of fecal sludge solids was conducted in 241 Microsoft Excel (version 16.71). The remainder of data processing, plotting, and model fitting 242 analyses were performed in R (version 4.1.2) using Rstudio (version 2022.07.1) (Supplemental 243 methods M5). For ddPCR data, the error bars are reported as standard deviations from total

- 244 error associated with technical replicates (merged wells). Experimental replicate concentrations
- 245 were averaged prior to plotting and model fitting, and errors were propagated for upper and
- 246 lower error bars separately (Supplemental methods M6).
- 247
- 248 The decay of all RNA targets in fecal sludge was analyzed using a first-order decay model
- 249 (Equation 1). The decay rate constant, *k,* was calculated by linearizing and determining the
- 250 slope (Equation 2). The time required to achieve a 90% (one log) reduction (T_{90}) was calculated
- 251 using Equation 3.
- 252
- Equation 1 253 Equation 1 $C_t = C_0 e^{-kt}$
- Equation 2 254 Equation 2 $ln(\frac{ct}{c_0}) = -kt$
- Equation 3 255 Equation 3 $T_{90} = \frac{-m(0.1)}{k}$
- 256

257 In these equations C_t is the concentration of virus RNA at time t , C_0 is the starting concentration 258 at time zero,and *k* is the first order decay rate constant.

259 Results and discussion

260 Quality assurance and quality control

- 261 We followed the Environmental Microbiology Minimum Information (EMMI) Guidelines
- 262 (Borchardt *et al.*, 2021) as closely as possible (Supplemental methods M7). Extraction and
- 263 ddPCR positive and negative controls were positive and negative, respectively, for all viral RNA
- 264 targets. BCoV recovery averaged 29%, and the limit of detection was determined by identifying
- 265 samples with three positive droplets. Samples meeting this threshold were considered positive.

266 Graphical analysis of viral RNA target concentration assessed the impact of template dilution 267 (both undiluted and 10x dilution were performed). RNA extracts were run at a tenfold dilution for 268 all targets, with undiluted plates selected for SARS-CoV-2 targets due to samples falling below 269 the limit of detection at a dilution factor of 10. Duplicate samples were averaged for plotting, 270 except when one data point was missing. Three sample replicates were excluded from analyses 271 due to lab processing loss. In such cases, the concentration value of the viable replicate was 272 used.

273 Overall detection of targets

274 Endogenous viruses PMMoV and ToBRFV are non-infectious to humans but their RNA is 275 abundant in human feces and found at similar orders of magnitude (6.6 x 10⁷ and 7.67 x 10⁷ 276 gc/g in initial samples, respectively, Figure 1A). They were found at concentrations almost 1.5 277 orders of magnitude higher than HuNoV (2.9 x 10^6 gc/g in initial samples). This difference in 278 abundance was expected because while all feces may contain fecal markers, not all individuals 279 are infected with HuNoV. Exogenous (spiked) SARS-CoV-2 N1 and N2 genes were consistently 280 detected at an average concentration of 3.51 x 10^4 gc/g in initial samples. All targets remained 281 detectable throughout the 70-day experiment (Figure 1B).

282

292 Persistence study

293 Despite the extended experiment duration, limited decay $\left($ <1 log₁₀ reduction) was observed for 294 all RNA targets across all temperature conditions. Table 1 provides details on the first-order 295 decay rate constants (hereafter referred to as "*k* values") and the time required to achieve a 296 90% reduction (T_{90}) in concentration for SARS-CoV-2 (N1 and N2 genes), HuNoV, PMMoV, and 297 ToBRFV. Positive *k* values were exclusively observed at 30º C (p < 0.05), ranging from 0.010 to

- 0.023 day-1 298 . However, at 4 and 15 ºC, *k* was negative (indicating increasing concentration over
- 299 time) for all RNA targets, although often not significantly different from zero (Table 1). Additional
- 300 linearized data for model fits can be found in supplemental table S6.
- 301
- 302 **Table 1.** First-order decay rate constants k for all targets and all temperatures in fecal sludge.
- 303 Negative k values indicate there was a positive slope (indicating $C > C_0$); T_{90} values were not
- 304 calculated for positive slopes. Asterisk (*) indicates k values significantly different from zero (p <
- 305 0.05).

306

307 **N1/N2 targets**

308 Exogenous SARS-CoV-2 RNA exhibited high persistence, with statistically significant decay 309 (k=0.023 and p<0.05 for N1 and N2) only observed at 30 °C, resulting in a T_{90} value of 3.3

310 months (Table 1). At 15 \degree C, minimal to negligible decay was observed. In fact, the RNA

311 concentrations remained stable $(k = -0.01 \text{ day}^1, p > 0.05)$. At 4 °C there was a slight positive

312 slope (Figure 2A and B) that was significantly different from 0 $(k = -0.01 \text{ day}^1 \text{ and } p < 0.05)$,

313 perhaps due to the small sample size (12 time points) of the study.

314

315 Our findings share several parallels with existing observations. So far, only one other 316 persistence study, conducted using river water and seawater at 4 and 20º C, also observed 317 negligible decay of SARS-CoV-2 RNA (Sala-Comorera *et al.*, 2021). Persistence studies in 318 wastewater influent report higher *k* values with substantially faster decay at higher 319 temperatures, ranging from $k = 0.05$ day⁻¹ at 4 ^oC to as high as 4.32 day⁻¹ at 20^oC (Weidhaas *et* 320 *al.*, 2021; Burnet *et al.*, 2023). However, a study by Roldan-Hernandez (2022), focusing on 321 persistence in primary settled solids from a centralized system in the US, observed a slower 322 decay with *k* values approaching levels comparable but higher than those in the present study $(1)(k = 0.024 \text{ day}^1 \text{ at } 4^{\circ}\text{C})$, and $k = 0.06 \text{ day}^1 \text{ at } 37^{\circ}\text{C}$). This convergence may be attributed to the

324 higher solids content shared by primary settled solids and fecal sludge (Table S5), underscoring 325 the potential influence of matrix composition on decay dynamics.

326

327 **HuNoV target**

328 No significant decay ($p > 0.05$) was observed for HuNoV RNA at any of the three temperature 329 conditions (Figure 2C). Few studies investigate the persistence of HuNoV RNA, and those that 330 do have focused on inactivation or detection in environmental waters—a justified emphasis 331 given its contribution to recreational waterborne illness (Viau, Lee and Boehm, 2011; Boehm, 332 Soller and Shanks, 2015; Wade *et al.*, 2018). Nevertheless, there is a lack of attention to 333 persistence in wastewaters, including fecal sludge. Our results align with other studies despite 334 differences in the water matrix. One recent study conducted in river water documented a range 335 of *k* values for HuNoV RNA, spanning from no significant decay to $k = 0.12$ day⁻¹ (Kennedy *et* 336 *al.*, 2023).

337 These persistence results are impactful for water, sanitation, and hygiene (WASH) initiatives 338 because the provision of universally safe sanitation directly influences disease burden (World 339 Health Organization and United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), 2017). For example, one 340 study conducted in Dhaka, Bangladesh revealed a 14% lower prevalence of diarrheal disease in 341 communities with access to safely managed sanitation compared to those without (Akter *et al.*, 342 2022). At present, the high persistence of HuNoV RNA in fecal sludge suggests a feasible 343 opportunity to collect public health data from on-site sanitation contexts. Although HuNoV RNA 344 remains detectable via molecular methods for longer than viable norovirus (Shaffer *et al.*, 2022), 345 future studies should elucidate exposure risks to sanitation workers and the potential impacts on 346 broader public health initiatives.

348 **Figure 2.** First-order decay curves of SARS-CoV-2 N1 (A), N2 (B), HuNoV (C), PMMoV (D) and 349 ToBRFV (E) RNA in fecal sludge. Temperature is indicated by open (4 °C), gray (15 °C), and 350 solid color (30 ºC) symbols with dotted, dashed, and solid lines, respectively. Colors and shapes 351 indicate target type consistent with Figure 1. Error bars depict standard deviations among 352 experimental duplicates (aliquots) and technical replicates (wells) for each target.

353

354 **PMMoV and ToBRFV targets**

355 Based on our literature review, we hypothesized minimal decay of PMMoV RNA; indeed, there 356 was no significant decay even at 30 $^{\circ}$ C ($k = -0.003$ day⁻¹, p > 0.05). Roldan-Hernandez *et al.* 357 (2022) found high persistence of endogenous PMMoV RNA in primary settled solids, with decay 358 rates varying between 0.01 and 0.09 day⁻¹ (Table 1). At 4 °C and 15 °C, RNA concentrations in 359 final samples after 70 days were slightly but statistically significantly higher than the initial 360 concentrations (Figure 2D). This observed variation is likely attributable to measurement 361 artifacts that reflect inherent variability across all sample processing stages. Burnet et al. (2023) 362 also observed increased PMMoV RNA concentrations at 4, 12, and 20 °C after 27 days. Other

363 hypotheses for these observations include potential changes in the composition (biotic or

364 abiotic) of the sample matrix during incubation, which might enhance the availability of RNA for

365 extraction and result in variable decay rate constants (Burnet *et al.*, 2023; Kennedy *et al.*, 2023).

366 Observing similar persistence as previous reports demonstrates PMMoV's utility as both a

367 microbial source tracker and a fecal strength control in various contexts.

368

369 ToBRFV RNA was overall highly persistent over 70 days at the lower temperatures of 4 and 15

370 °C. At 30 °C (Figure 2E), slight but significant decay was observed ($k = 0.012$ day⁻¹, T₉₀ = 6.2

371 months). Although the literature lacks comparative *k* values, our results describing faster decay

372 at higher temperatures are consistent with general trends for other targets (e.g., PMMoV). To

373 date, ToBRFV has been suggested as an MST tool due to its specificity to humans and

374 abundance in feces. In the broader context of WBE, particularly for on-site systems, PMMoV

375 and ToBRFV serve as highly resilient fecal indicator viruses.

376

377 **Implications**

378 The decay rate constants, on the whole, are quite modest; *k* values for all targets in our study 379 consistently show lower values than those reported for sewered wastewater influent and 380 wastewater solids. However, they are consistent with findings indicating that virus RNA exhibits 381 minimal decay in wastewater solids (Roldan-Hernandez *et al.*, 2022; Burnet *et al.*, 2023). The 382 limited decay observed implies that the targets remain detectable for an extended period. This 383 finding is encouraging for using FSTPs as a centralized point for sampling and identifying viral 384 targets and underscores the importance of understanding average time between collections in 385 non-sewered settings (Delaire *et al.*, 2021).

386

387 In some studies, nonlinear decay models, such as JM2 (Juneja, Huang and Marks, 2006), have 388 been proposed for pathogens and fecal indicators in wastewater, manure, and biosolids, as

389 observed by Mitchell (2015). This model accommodates shouldering (an initial delay in decay) 390 and tailing (decay slowing with time). Considering these features, our findings of exceptionally 391 low decay rates for endogenous viral RNA targets might be explained by capturing the tail end 392 of decay models seen in other studies, making our observed decay curve appear relatively flat. 393 Capturing the tail end is logical considering fecal sludge from emptying trucks exhibits a mixed 394 age profile due to variations in filling durations and emptying rates among on-site sanitation 395 systems (Conaway *et al.*, 2023). However, a prior study in Malawi found that sampling depth in 396 pit latrines (indirect measure of sludge age) did not strongly impact the detection of enteric 397 pathogens using molecular methods (Capone *et al.*, 2021), suggesting consistent detection 398 even in aged fecal sludge.

399

400 **Limitations**

401 Several limitations should be considered to contextualize the results of this study. First, this 402 study is limited to RNA persistence, not infectivity. Consequently, the findings do not necessarily 403 imply potential risks to sanitation workers, despite the significance of this concern. It is also 404 possible that by sampling at an FSTP where fecal sludge has been pumped out of containment, 405 we may have exposed the sample to aerobic conditions and thus disrupted ongoing anaerobic 406 processes. Additionally, the 4 to 5 days of sample shipment time may lead to differences 407 between our initial concentrations of endogenous viral RNA and the concentrations in feces 408 deposited into the pit latrines from which the sludge was collected. This lag allows for the 409 possibility of biological or chemical processes in the initial days before analysis, potentially 410 resulting in decay not captured in our study. Future research can estimate decay during 411 transport by introducing a known concentration of a tracer virus at the time of sampling and 412 measuring its concentration immediately upon sample receipt after shipment.

413 Because our study was conducted using a composited sample from one fecal sludge collection 414 truck, future work should also look at inter-shipment variability and seasonal variability of viral 415 targets in fecal sludge. This approach mirrors the methodology employed in studies within 416 sewered settings, where intraday variability in wastewater influent is commonly examined 417 (Ahmed *et al.*, 2021; Bivins *et al.*, 2021; Mendoza Grijalva *et al.*, 2022). Further decay 418 experiments are necessary for fecal sludges at temperatures exceeding 30°C, which are typical 419 in regions like sub-Saharan Africa and India. Additionally, experiments conducted at room 420 temperature (20°C) can address potential limitations in accessing temperature-controlled 421 facilities or incubators, which may vary both in the field and among different laboratories. While 422 our study indicates that refrigerating samples may not be necessary for accurate detection and 423 quantification of viruses, it is advisable to verify our findings. Valuable insights into workflow 424 optimization can be obtained through such investigations.

425 Conclusions

426 This study introduces an original approach to WBE in a non-sewered area in Dakar, Senegal. 427 We collected fecal sludge samples from a centralized facility that receives and consolidates 428 fecal sludges from nearby on-site sanitation systems. Our analysis identified the presence of 429 endogenous HuNoV, PMMoV, and ToBRFV RNA. Exogenous SARS-CoV-2 N1 and N2 RNA 430 exhibited modest decay at 30 °C (k = 0.023 day⁻¹, p < 0.05), corresponding to a T₉₀ value of 3.3 431 months. Endogenous ToBRFV RNA also showed modest decay at 30 °C (k = 0.012 day-1, p < 432 0.05), with a T₉₀ value of 6.2 months. No significant decay was observed for HuNoV or PMMoV 433 RNA at any temperature condition (4, 15, and 30 ºC) over the 70-day period. Our study presents 434 the first detection of ToBRFV as a novel microbial source tracker in Senegal wastewaters, and 435 the first persistence study of its nucleic acids in any water matrix. By providing novel first-order

436 decay rate constants, this study begins to address a significant knowledge gap concerning the 437 stability of viral RNA in fecal sludges.

438

439 Next steps for assessing the utility of sampling from FSTPs for community health surveillance 440 include examining correlations between clinical data and fecal sludge data from FSTPs, as has 441 been done with environmental surveillance studies (Rogawski McQuade *et al.*, 2023). Utilizing 442 FSTPs could streamline site selection for environmental surveillance studies because they are 443 already centralized and contained, which could facilitate data interpretation. Sampling directly 444 from on-site sanitation systems offers more control over obtaining fresh sludge due to sampling 445 depth (Capone *et al.*, 2021; Li *et al.*, 2023), while opting for older sludge at an FSTP may 446 provide a more representative sample of a wider community. Overall, results from our study 447 suggest the feasibility of utilizing FSTPs for WBE sampling and highlight their potential as a 448 valuable complement to current surveillance of wastewater and environmental waters. On-site 449 sanitation technologies constitute up to 72% of sanitation system usage in much of the global 450 south (Greene et al., 2021); our findings encourage researchers to leverage established fecal 451 sludge management infrastructure to develop community health surveillance programs. 452

453 Acknowledgments

454 Financial support for this study was generously provided by the Stanford Diversifying Academia, 455 Recruiting Excellence (DARE) Fellowship awarded to LMG, as well as grants from the Stanford 456 School of Engineering, the Dreyfus Foundation, the Stanford Center for Innovation in Global 457 Health (CIGH), and the Stanford Department of Chemical Engineering. We would also like to 458 acknowledge the team at Delvic Sanitation Initiatives for sample collection and Aravind

- 459 Natarajan for his technical assistance with the ToBRFV assay. Graphical abstract was created
- 460 using BioRender.

461 Supplementary materials

- 462 The supplementary materials document contains details about experimental design, literature
- 463 review process, and data processing.

464

466 References

- 467 Ahmed, W. *et al.* (2020) 'Decay of SARS-CoV-2 and surrogate murine hepatitis virus RNA in
- 468 untreated wastewater to inform application in wastewater-based epidemiology', *Environmental*
- 469 *Research*, 191, p. 110092. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2020.110092.
- 470 Ahmed, W. *et al.* (2021) 'Intraday variability of indicator and pathogenic viruses in 1-h and 24-h
- 471 composite wastewater samples: Implications for wastewater-based epidemiology',
- 472 *Environmental Research*, 193, p. 110531. Available at:
- 473 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2020.110531.
- 474 Akter, J. *et al.* (2022) 'Equity in access to safely managed sanitation and prevalence of diarrheal
- 475 diseases in Bangladesh: a national and sub-national analysis', *BMC Infectious Diseases*, 22(1),
- 476 p. 871. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1186/s12879-022-07884-4.
- 477 Atitaya Panuvatvanich (2013) 'Financial Feasibility Analysis for FSM Business in Thailand'.
- 478 Bivins, A. *et al.* (2020) 'Persistence of SARS-CoV-2 in Water and Wastewater', *Environmental*
- 479 *Science & Technology Letters*, 7(12), pp. 937–942. Available at:
- 480 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.0c00730.
- 481 Bivins, A. *et al.* (2021) 'Within- and between-Day Variability of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in Municipal
- 482 Wastewater during Periods of Varying COVID-19 Prevalence and Positivity', *ACS ES&T Water*,
- 483 p. acsestwater.1c00178. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/acsestwater.1c00178.
- 484 Boehm, A.B. *et al.* (2022) 'Regional Replacement of SARS-CoV-2 Variant Omicron BA.1 with
- 485 BA.2 as Observed through Wastewater Surveillance', *Environmental Science & Technology*
- 486 *Letters*, 9(6), pp. 575–580. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.2c00266.
- 487 Boehm, A.B., Soller, J.A. and Shanks, O.C. (2015) 'Human-Associated Fecal Quantitative
- 488 Polymerase Chain Reaction Measurements and Simulated Risk of Gastrointestinal Illness in
- 489 Recreational Waters Contaminated with Raw Sewage', *Environmental Science & Technology*
- 490 *Letters*, 2(10), pp. 270–275. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.5b00219.

- 491 Borchardt, M.A. *et al.* (2021) 'The Environmental Microbiology Minimum Information (EMMI)
- 492 Guidelines: qPCR and dPCR Quality and Reporting for Environmental Microbiology',
- 493 *Environmental Science & Technology*, 55(15), pp. 10210–10223. Available at:
- 494 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.1c01767.
- 495 Burnet, J.-B. *et al.* (2023) 'Persistence of endogenous RNA biomarkers of SARS-CoV-2 and
- 496 PMMoV in raw wastewater: Impact of temperature and implications for wastewater-based
- 497 epidemiology', *Science of The Total Environment*, 857, p. 159401. Available at:
- 498 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.159401.
- 499 Capone D *et al.* (2021) 'Impact of sampling depth on pathogen detection in pit latrines.', *PLoS*
- 500 *Negl Trop Dis*, 15(3), p. e0009176. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pntd.0009176.
- 501 CDC (2022) *National Wastewater Surveillance System*, *Centers for Disease Control and*
- 502 *Prevention*. Available at: https://www.cdc.gov/healthywater/surveillance/wastewater-
- 503 surveillance/wastewater-surveillance.html (Accessed: 10 January 2022).
- 504 Capone, Drew, David Berendes, Oliver Cumming, Jackie Knee, Rassul Nalá, Benjamin B. Risk,
- 505 Christine Stauber, Kevin Zhu, and Joe Brown. 2020. "Analysis of Fecal Sludges Reveals
- 506 Common Enteric Pathogens in Urban Maputo, Mozambique." *Environmental Science &*
- 507 *Technology Letters* 7 (12): 889–95. https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.0c00610.
- 508 Conaway, K. *et al.* (2023) 'On-site sanitation system emptying practices and influential factors in
- 509 Asian low- and middle-income countries: A systematic review', *Hygiene and Environmental*
- 510 *Health Advances*, 6, p. 100050. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heha.2023.100050.
- 511 D'Aoust, P.M. *et al.* (2021) 'Quantitative analysis of SARS-CoV-2 RNA from wastewater solids
- 512 in communities with low COVID-19 incidence and prevalence', *Water Research*, 188, p. 116560.
- 513 Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2020.116560.
- 514 Darimani, H.S. *et al.* (2015) 'Effect of Post-treatment Conditions on the Inactivation Rate of
- 515 Pathogenic Bacteria after the Composting Process', *Compost Science & Utilization*, 23(3), pp.
- 516 164–173. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1080/1065657X.2015.1015082.

- 517 Dattani, S. *et al.* (2023) 'Diarrheal Diseases', *Our World in Data* [Preprint]. Available at:
- 518 https://ourworldindata.org/diarrheal-diseases (Accessed: 5 December 2023).
- 519 Delaire, C. *et al.* (2021) 'How Much Will Safe Sanitation for all Cost? Evidence from Five Cities',
- 520 *Environmental Science & Technology*, 55(1), pp. 767–777. Available at:
- 521 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.0c06348.
- 522 Diamond, M.B. *et al.* (2022) 'Wastewater surveillance of pathogens can inform public health
- 523 responses', *Nature Medicine*, 28(10), pp. 1992–1995. Available at:
- 524 https://doi.org/10.1038/s41591-022-01940-x.
- 525 Fu, S. *et al.* (2022) 'The decay of coronavirus in sewage pipes and the development of a
- 526 predictive model for the estimation of SARS-CoV-2 infection cases based on wastewater
- 527 surveillance'. medRxiv, p. 2022.03.16.22272521. Available at:
- 528 https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.03.16.22272521.
- 529 Harada, H., Strande, L. and Fujii, S. (2015) 'Challenges and Opportunities of Faecal Sludge
- 530 Management for Global Sanitation', *Ischaemic heart disease* [Preprint].
- 531 Izquierdo-Lara, R. *et al.* (2021) 'Monitoring SARS-CoV-2 Circulation and Diversity through
- 532 Community Wastewater Sequencing, the Netherlands and Belgium', *Emerging Infectious*
- 533 *Diseases*, 27(5), pp. 1405–1415. Available at: https://doi.org/10.3201/eid2705.204410.
- 534 Jensen, P.K. *et al.* (2009) 'Survival of Ascaris eggs and hygienic quality of human excreta in
- 535 Vietnamese composting latrines', *Environmental Health*, 8(1), p. 57. Available at:
- 536 https://doi.org/10.1186/1476-069X-8-57.
- 537 Juneja, V.K., Huang, L. and Marks, H. (2006) 'Approaches for Modeling Thermal Inactivation of
- 538 Foodborne Pathogens', in *Advances in Microbial Food Safety*. American Chemical Society
- 539 (ACS Symposium Series, 931), pp. 235–251. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/bk-2006-
- 540 0931.ch016.
- 541 Kennedy, L.C. *et al.* (2023) 'Persistence of Human Norovirus (GII) in Surface Water: Decay
- 542 Rate Constants and Inactivation Mechanisms', *Environmental Science & Technology*, 57(9), pp.

- 543 3671–3679. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.est.2c09637.
- 544 Kirby, A.E. *et al.* (2021) 'Using Wastewater Surveillance Data to Support the COVID-19
- 545 Response United States, 2020–2021', *MMWR. Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report*,
- 546 70(36), pp. 1242–1244. Available at: https://doi.org/10.15585/mmwr.mm7036a2.
- 547 Koné, D. *et al.* (2007) 'Helminth eggs inactivation efficiency by faecal sludge dewatering and co-
- 548 composting in tropical climates', *Water Research*, 41(19), pp. 4397–4402. Available at:
- 549 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2007.06.024.
- 550 Kumwenda, S. (2019) 'Inactivation of pathogens in ecological sanitation latrines in Malawi: An
- 551 observational follow up study', *Malawi Medical Journal*, 31(1), pp. 12–18. Available at:
- 552 https://doi.org/10.4314/mmj.v31i1.3.
- 553 Li, Y. *et al.* (2023) 'Decay of enveloped SARS-CoV-2 and non-enveloped PMMoV RNA in raw
- 554 sewage from university dormitories', *Frontiers in Microbiology*, 14, p. 1144026. Available at:
- 555 https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2023.1144026.
- 556 Li D, Quon H, Ervin J, Jiang S, Rosso D, Van De Werfhorst LC, Steets B, and Holden PA. 2023.
- 557 "Modeled and Measured SARS-CoV-2 Virus in Septic Tank Systems for Wastewater
- 558 Surveillance." *J Water Health* 21 (9): 1242–56. https://doi.org/10.2166/wh.2023.128.
- 559 Mehl, J. *et al.* (2011) 'Pathogen destruction and solids decomposition in composting latrines:
- 560 study of fundamental mechanisms and user operation in rural Panama', *Journal of Water and*
- 561 *Health*, 9(1), pp. 187–199. Available at: https://doi.org/10.2166/wh.2010.138.
- 562 Mendoza Grijalva, L. *et al.* (2022) 'Diurnal Variability of SARS-CoV-2 RNA Concentrations in
- 563 Hourly Grab Samples of Wastewater Influent during Low COVID-19 Incidence', *ACS ES&T*
- 564 *Water*, p. acsestwater.2c00061. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/acsestwater.2c00061.
- 565 *MINISTÈRE DE LA SANTÉ ET DE L'ACTION SOCIALE |* (no date). Available at:
- 566 https://www.sante.gouv.sn/ (Accessed: 15 December 2023).
- 567 Mitchell, A. (2015) *Pathogen Specific Persistence Modeling Data*, *Global Water Pathogen*
- 568 *Project*. Michigan State University, UNESCO. Available at:

- 569 https://www.waterpathogens.org/book/pathogen-specific-persistence-modeling-data (Accessed:
- 570 5 December 2023).
- 571 Musaazi, I.G. *et al.* (2023) 'A systematic review and meta-analysis of pathogen reduction in
- 572 onsite sanitation systems', *Water Research X*, p. 100171. Available at:
- 573 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wroa.2023.100171.
- 574 Natarajan, A. *et al.* (2023) *Tomato brown rugose fruit virus Mo gene is a novel microbial source*
- 575 *tracking marker*. preprint. Microbiology. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1101/2023.01.09.523366.
- 576 Rogawski McQuade, E.T. *et al.* (2023) 'Real-time sewage surveillance for SARS-CoV-2 in
- 577 Dhaka, Bangladesh versus clinical COVID-19 surveillance: a longitudinal environmental
- 578 surveillance study (December, 2019–December, 2021)', *The Lancet Microbe*, 4(6), pp. e442–
- 579 e451. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/S2666-5247(23)00010-1.
- 580 Roldan-Hernandez, L. *et al.* (2022) *Persistence of endogenous SARS-CoV-2 and pepper mild*
- 581 *mottle virus RNA in wastewater settled solids*. preprint. Infectious Diseases (except HIV/AIDS).
- 582 Available at: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.01.06.22268855.
- 583 Rosario, K. *et al.* (2009) 'Pepper Mild Mottle Virus as an Indicator of Fecal Pollution', *Applied*
- 584 *and Environmental Microbiology*, 75(22), pp. 7261–7267. Available at:
- 585 https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00410-09.
- 586 Rothman, J.A. and Whiteson, K.L. (2022) 'Sequencing and Variant Detection of Eight Abundant
- 587 Plant-Infecting Tobamoviruses across Southern California Wastewater', *Microbiology Spectrum*,
- 588 10(6), p. e0305022. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1128/spectrum.03050-22.
- 589 Sala-Comorera, L. *et al.* (2021) 'Decay of infectious SARS-CoV-2 and surrogates in aquatic
- 590 environments', *Water Research*, 201, p. 117090. Available at:
- 591 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2021.117090.
- 592 Sanitation Matters (2013) 'Faecal Sludge Management in Africa. Developments, Research and
- 593 Innovation', March.
- 594 *Senegal CDC Center for Global Health* (2019). Available at:

- 595 https://www.cdc.gov/globalhealth/countries/senegal/default.htm (Accessed: 5 April 2023).
- 596 Shaffer, M. *et al.* (2022) 'Viable Norovirus Persistence in Water Microcosms', *Environmental*
- 597 *Science & Technology Letters*, 9(10), pp. 851–855. Available at:
- 598 https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.2c00553.
- 599 S. McClary-Gutierrez, J. *et al.* (2021) 'Standardizing data reporting in the research community to
- 600 enhance the utility of open data for SARS-CoV-2 wastewater surveillance', *Environmental*
- 601 *Science: Water Research & Technology*, 7(9), pp. 1545–1551. Available at:
- 602 https://doi.org/10.1039/D1EW00235J.
- 603 Symonds, E.M., Rosario, K. and Breitbart, M. (2019) 'Pepper mild mottle virus: Agricultural
- 604 menace turned effective tool for microbial water quality monitoring and assessing (waste)water
- 605 treatment technologies', *PLOS Pathogens*, 15(4), p. e1007639. Available at:
- 606 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.ppat.1007639.
- 607 Topol, A. *et al.* (2021) 'High Throughput pre-analytical processing of wastewater settled solids
- 608 for SARS-CoV-2 RNA analyses protocol...' Available at: https://www.protocols.io/view/high-
- 609 throughput-pre-analytical-processing-of-waste-b2kmqcu6/metadata (Accessed: 12 December
- 610 2023).
- 611 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (2001) 'Method 1684: Total, Fixed, and Volatile Solids in
- 612 Water, Solids, and Biosolids'. Available at:
- 613 https://nepis.epa.gov/Exe/ZyNET.exe/P1002CZ8.TXT?ZyActionD=ZyDocument&Client=EPA&In
- 614 dex=2000+Thru+2005&Docs=&Query=&Time=&EndTime=&SearchMethod=1&TocRestrict=n&
- 615 Toc=&TocEntry=&QField=&QFieldYear=&QFieldMonth=&QFieldDay=&IntQFieldOp=0&ExtQFie
- 616 ldOp=0&XmlQuery=&File=D%3A%5Czyfiles%5CIndex%20Data%5C00thru05%5CTxt%5C0000
- 617 0016%5CP1002CZ8.txt&User=ANONYMOUS&Password=anonymous&SortMethod=h%7C-
- 618 &MaximumDocuments=1&FuzzyDegree=0&ImageQuality=r75g8/r75g8/x150y150g16/i425&Dis
- 619 play=hpfr&DefSeekPage=x&SearchBack=ZyActionL&Back=ZyActionS&BackDesc=Results%20
- 620 page&MaximumPages=1&ZyEntry=1&SeekPage=x&ZyPURL#.

- 621 Viau, E.J., Lee, D. and Boehm, A.B. (2011) 'Swimmer Risk of Gastrointestinal Illness from
- 622 Exposure to Tropical Coastal Waters Impacted by Terrestrial Dry-Weather Runoff',
- 623 *Environmental Science & Technology*, 45(17), pp. 7158–7165. Available at:
- 624 https://doi.org/10.1021/es200984b.
- 625 Wade, T.J. *et al.* (2018) 'Asymptomatic norovirus infection associated with swimming at a
- 626 tropical beach: A prospective cohort study', *PLOS ONE*, 13(3), p. e0195056. Available at:
- 627 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0195056.
- 628 Weidhaas, J. *et al.* (2021) 'Correlation of SARS-CoV-2 RNA in wastewater with COVID-19
- 629 disease burden in sewersheds', *Science of The Total Environment*, 775, p. 145790. Available
- 630 at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.145790.
- 631 Wolfe, M.K. *et al.* (2023) 'Wastewater Detection of Emerging Arbovirus Infections: Case Study
- 632 of Dengue in the United States', *Environmental Science & Technology Letters* [Preprint].
- 633 Available at: https://doi.org/10.1021/acs.estlett.3c00769.
- 634 World Health Organization and United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) (2017) *Progress on*
- 635 *drinking water, sanitation and hygiene: 2017 update and SDG baselines*. Geneva: World Health
- 636 Organization. Available at: https://iris.who.int/handle/10665/258617 (Accessed: 15 December
- 637 2023).
- 638 Wu, F. *et al.* (2022) 'SARS-CoV-2 RNA concentrations in wastewater foreshadow dynamics and
- 639 clinical presentation of new COVID-19 cases', *Science of The Total Environment*, 805, p.
- 640 150121. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.150121.
- 641 Zhang, S. *et al.* (2022) 'Tomato brown rugose fruit virus: An emerging and rapidly spreading
- 642 plant RNA virus that threatens tomato production worldwide', *Molecular Plant Pathology*, 23(9),
- 643 pp. 1262–1277. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1111/mpp.13229.