

LLIN Evaluation in Uganda Project (LLINEUP2) – Effect of long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs) treated with pyrethroid plus pyriproxyfen vs LLINs treated with pyrethroid plus piperonyl butoxide in Uganda: a cluster-randomised trial

Samuel Gonahasa^{1,7*}, Jane Frances Namuganga¹, Martha J Nassali¹, Catherine Maiteki Sebuguzi^{1,2}, Isaiah Nabende¹, Adrienne Epstein³, Katherine Snyman^{1,4,5}, Joaniter I Nankabirwa^{1,6}, Jimmy Opigo², Martin J Donnelly^{7,8}, Grant Dorsey³, Moses R Kanya^{1,6}, Sarah G Staedke^{5,9}

¹ Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration, Uganda

² National Malaria Control Division, Ministry of Health, Uganda

³ Department of Medicine, University of California San Francisco, USA

⁴ Department of Global Health and Development, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine

⁵ Department of Clinical Research, London School of Hygiene & Tropical Medicine, UK

⁶ Department of Medicine, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda

⁷ Department of Vector Biology, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, Liverpool, UK

⁸ Wellcome Sanger Institute, Hinxton, UK

⁹ Department of Clinical Sciences, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, Liverpool, UK

Corresponding author: Samuel Gonahasa, Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration, PO Box 7475, Kampala, Uganda; Email: samuelgonahasa@gmail.com; Tel: +256 (0) 772 833471

Samuel Gonahasa MBChB MSc

PhD Fellow/Investigator,
Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
samuelgonahasa@gmail.com

Jane F Namuganga MD MHS

Project Coordinator
Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
inamuganga@idrc-uganda.org

Martha J Nassali MBChB MPH

Survey Coordinator
Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
mnassali@idrc-uganda.org

Catherine Maiteki-Sebuguzi MBChB MSc

Principal Medical Officer Policy and Strategy
National Malaria Control Division
Uganda Ministry of Health, Kampala, Uganda
cmaiteki@gmail.com

Isaiah Nabende BSc

Data Manager
Infectious Disease Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
inabende@idrc-uganda.org

Adrienne Epstein PhD

Post-Doctoral Research Associate
Department of Medicine
University of California, San Francisco
San Francisco, CA 94110 USA
adrienne.epstein@ucsf.edu

Katherine Snyman MPH

PhD student, LSHTM
Research Associate
Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
Katherine.snyman@lshtm.ac.uk

Joaniter I Nankabirwa MBChB PhD

Lecturer
Clinical Epidemiology Unit, Makerere
University College of Health Sciences,
Kampala, Uganda
Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
jnankabirwa@yahoo.co.uk

Jimmy Opigo MBChB MPH

Assistant Commissioner Health Services
Manager, National Malaria Control Division
Uganda Ministry of Health, Kampala, Uganda
opigojimmy@gmail.com

Martin J Donnelly PhD ScD

Professor of Evolutionary Genetics
Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine
Pembroke Place, Liverpool L3 5QA, UK
martin.donnelly@lstmed.ac.uk

Grant Dorsey MD MPH PhD

Professor of Medicine
Department of Medicine
University of California, San Francisco
San Francisco, CA 94110 USA
grant.dorsey@ucsf.edu

Moses R Kamya MBChB MMed MPH PhD

Professor of Medicine
Department of Medicine,
Makerere University College of Health
Sciences
Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
2C Nakasero Hill Road, Kampala, Uganda
mkamya@infocom.co.ug

Sarah G Staedke MD PhD

Professor of Malaria & Global Health
Department of Vector Biology
Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine
Liverpool UK
sarah.staedke@lstmed.ac.uk

1 **Abstract**

2 **Background.** We embedded a pragmatic, cluster-randomised trial into Uganda’s national campaign
3 to distribute long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs) in 2020–2021, comparing LLINs treated with
4 pyrethroids plus the synergist piperonyl butoxide (PBO), to LLINs treated with pyrethroids plus
5 pyriproxyfen, an insect growth regulator.

6 **Methods.** Target communities surrounding public health facilities (clusters, n=64), covering 32 high-
7 burden districts not receiving indoor residual spraying, were included. Clusters were randomised 1:1
8 in blocks of two by district to receive: (1) pyrethroid-PBO LLINs (PermaNet 3.0, n=32) or (2)
9 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs (Royal Guard, n=32). LLINs were delivered from 7 November 2020 to
10 26 March 2021 and malaria outcome data were collected until 31 March 2023. Estimates of malaria
11 incidence in residents of all ages (the primary outcome) were generated for each cluster from
12 enhanced health facility surveillance data. At 12- (24 November 2021 to 1 April 2022) and 24-months
13 (23 November 2022 to 21 March 2023) post-LLIN distribution, cross-sectional community surveys
14 were conducted in randomly selected households (at least 50 per cluster, 3,200 per survey).

15 **Findings.** In the two years following LLIN distribution, 186,364 episodes of malaria were diagnosed in
16 cluster residents during 398,931 person-years of follow-up. Malaria incidence after 24-months was
17 lower than at baseline in both arms (pyrethroid-PBO: 465 vs 676 episodes per 1000 person-years;
18 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen: 469 vs 674 episodes per 1000 person-years); but the difference between
19 the arms was not statistically significant (incidence rate ratio 1.06, 95% confidence interval [CI] 0.91–
20 1.22, p=0.47). Two years post-distribution, ownership of at least one LLIN for every two household
21 residents was low in both arms (41.1% pyrethroid-PBO vs 38.6% pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen). Parasite
22 prevalence in children aged 2-10 years was no different between the arms in either survey and
23 similar results were observed for prevalence of anaemia in children aged 2-4 years.

24 **Interpretation.** The effectiveness of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs and pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs was no
25 different in Uganda, but two years after mass distribution, LLIN coverage was inadequate.

26

27

28 **Funding.** US National Institutes for Health, Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation

29

30 **Trial registration**

31 NCT04566510. Registered 28 September 2020, <https://clinicaltrials.gov/ct2/show/NCT04566510>

32

33 **Keywords**

34 malaria, long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs), insecticide treated nets (ITNs), piperonyl butoxide,

35 PermaNet 3.0, pyriproxyfen, Royal Guard, cluster-randomised trial, Uganda

36

37 **Word count = 4,782**

38 Introduction

39 Between 2000 and 2015, intensified efforts to control malaria substantially reduced malaria case
40 incidence and parasite prevalence across Africa, with the majority of cases averted attributed to the
41 distribution of long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs) [1]. More recently, however, progress on malaria
42 control has stalled. Globally, malaria cases increased from 230 million in 2015 to 247 million in 2021,
43 with 95% of cases reported from Africa [2]. Four African countries, including Uganda, accounted for
44 nearly half of all cases worldwide in 2021. In Uganda, implementation of malaria control
45 interventions including repeated national LLIN distribution campaigns, case management with
46 effective artemisinin-based combination therapy, and indoor residual spraying (IRS) of insecticides in
47 selected high-transmission districts reduced the malaria burden, with parasite prevalence by
48 microscopy in children under-five decreasing from 45% in 2009 to 9% in 2018-2019 [3]. Progress in
49 malaria control in Uganda has been difficult to sustain, however, despite ongoing implementation of
50 effective control interventions [4, 5].

51

52 In Uganda, and across Africa, LLINs are the most widely-used malaria prevention tool [6]. As
53 recommended by the World Health Organization (WHO), the Ugandan Ministry of Health distributes
54 LLINs through mass campaigns approximately every three years, aiming for universal coverage [7].
55 Currently, LLINs rely on pyrethroid insecticides, but resistance to pyrethroids has spread rapidly in
56 malaria vectors, threatening the effectiveness of LLINs [2, 8]. The causal mechanisms of pyrethroid
57 resistance are complex, but point mutations in the voltage-gated sodium channel where pyrethroids
58 bind ('knock down resistance'), and alterations in enzymes that metabolize pyrethroids, commonly
59 cytochrome P450s, are key features [9, 10].

60

61 To combat emerging resistance, next generation LLINs that incorporate a second chemical in
62 addition to pyrethroids have been developed. One such net includes piperonyl butoxide (PBO), a
63 synergist which inhibits P450 enzymes, overcoming metabolic resistance mechanisms in mosquitoes,

64 and partially restoring susceptibility to pyrethroids [11, 12]. Supported by evidence from trials
65 conducted in Tanzania and Uganda [13-15], demonstrating the superiority of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs
66 over pyrethroid-only LLINs, the WHO endorsed deployment of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs in areas where
67 malaria vectors exhibit pyrethroid resistance. The WHO's recommendation was conditional due to
68 uncertainty about the cost-effectiveness and durability of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs [16, 17]. Another
69 new type of LLIN combines pyrethroids with pyriproxyfen, an insect growth regulator which acts as a
70 sterilising agent, reducing the vector population density and lifespan of adult mosquitoes.
71 Pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs are promising, but trials comparing these nets to pyrethroid-only
72 LLINs in Burkina Faso and Tanzania have produced mixed results [18, 19]. Additional studies
73 evaluating the effectiveness of nets incorporating pyriproxyfen are needed.

74

75 In 2020-2021, two next generation LLINs including pyrethroid-PBO LLINs and pyrethroid-
76 pyriproxyfen LLINs were distributed in Uganda, providing an opportunity to evaluate the
77 effectiveness of these LLINs in a 'real-world' setting. With support from the Ministry of Health,
78 donors, and partners, a large cluster-randomised trial (LLINEUP2) was embedded within this national
79 distribution campaign, allowing us to rigorously compare the impact of these LLINs on
80 epidemiological indicators. We aimed to test the hypothesis that malaria incidence would be lower
81 in intervention clusters (randomised to receive pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs) than in control
82 clusters (randomised to receive pyrethroid-PBO LLINs). Malaria surveillance data at health facilities
83 were collected between 17 October 2020 and 31 March 2023, and cross-sectional community survey
84 data between 24 November 2021 to 1 April 2022 (12-months) and 23 November 2022 to 21 March
85 2023 (24-months) post-LLIN distribution.

86

87 **Methods**

88 ***Study setting***

89 Districts with high malaria burden were selected to participate in the study (figure 1) if they were
90 not receiving IRS and were scheduled to receive pyrethroid-PBO LLINs. A cluster was defined as the
91 target area surrounding public health facilities with enhanced malaria surveillance, known as Malaria
92 Reference Centres (MRCs) [20]. MRCs are high-volume, level III or IV health centres with an
93 estimated outpatient department attendance of 1,000–3,000 patients per month and a functional
94 laboratory. To avoid contamination, MRCs within the same district were selected from different sub-
95 counties. Overall, 64 clusters located in 32 districts were included in the trial.

96

97 ***Assignment of interventions***

98 **Cluster definition**

99 The unit of randomisation (cluster) was the ‘target area’ surrounding each MRC. Target areas had an
100 estimated population of at least 1,200 residents and included the MRC’s village plus adjacent villages
101 without another health facility, located within the same sub-county as the MRC village, and with
102 similar malaria incidence as the MRC village. All households within the target areas were mapped
103 and enumerated to determine the population and to generate a sampling frame for community
104 surveys.

105

106 **Cluster randomisation**

107 Clusters were randomised in a 1:1 ratio to receive either pyrethroid-PBO LLINs (PermaNet 3.0,
108 Vestergaard Sàrl, Switzerland), or pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs (Royal Guard, Disease Control
109 Technologies, USA). Randomisation was carried out by a member of the study team based outside of
110 Uganda at the University of California, San Francisco, who had no direct links to the net distribution
111 team at the Ministry of Health in Uganda. To improve comparability between arms, MRCs were
112 selected in each district for allocation to the intervention and control arm in a matched pair-wise
113 fashion. Clusters were randomised in blocks of two, with each block representing a district

114 containing two clusters, using the 'runiform' command in STATA version 14.2 (StataCorp, Texas,
115 USA).

116

117 **LLIN distribution**

118 LLINs were delivered free-of-charge through a mass distribution campaign led by the Ugandan
119 Ministry of Health and partners from 7 November 2020 to 26 March 2021. Members of the research
120 team engaged with Uganda's national committees that coordinated the campaign, to ensure that
121 LLINs were allocated according to the randomisation scheme. For each cluster we used a 'fried egg'
122 approach (figure 1); LLINs were delivered to the entire sub-county, including the MRC and several
123 other villages beyond the MRC target area ('egg white'), while outcomes were measured in the MRC
124 target areas ('egg yolk'). Nets were distributed from house-to-house, targeting all households within
125 the subcounty and aiming for population level coverage of at least 85%.

126

127 ***Health facility-based surveillance***

128 At each MRC, individual-level data for all patients recorded into standardised outpatient department
129 registers were entered into an Access database by on-site data entry officers. Primary data captured
130 included location of residence (parish and village), age, gender, temperature, history of fever, type
131 of malaria test done, malaria test results, diagnoses given, and any treatments prescribed. Data from
132 each MRC was submitted to the research team monthly using a secure on-line system. Data
133 captured from 1 November 2019 to 31 March 2023 was used to generate estimates of malaria
134 incidence.

135

136 ***Cross-sectional surveys***

137 Cross-sectional community surveys were conducted 12-months (24 November 2021 to 1 April 2022)
138 and 24-months (23 November 2022 to 21 March 2023) after nets were distributed. A study team,
139 consisting of a clinician and research assistant carried out the surveys. Households were randomly

140 selected from the enumeration lists for each cluster and screened until 50 households with at least
141 one child aged 2–10 years was enrolled from each cluster (with a total of 64 clusters, leading to at
142 least 3,200 households per survey). If an enrolled household had no children of appropriate age,
143 they were included in the household survey only, but did not take part in the clinical survey.
144 Households were included if at least one adult aged 18 years or older was present, the adult was
145 usually resident and slept in the household on the night before the survey, and the adult provided
146 informed consent. Households were excluded if the house had been destroyed or could not be
147 found, the house was vacant, or no adult resident was home on more than three occasions.

148

149 A household questionnaire adapted from prior surveys, including the national Malaria Indicator
150 Survey, was administered to the head of the household (or their designate), after obtaining their
151 consent, using a hand-held tablet computer. Information was gathered on the characteristics of
152 households and residents, proxy indicators of wealth including ownership of assets, and ownership
153 and use of LLINs in the households.

154

155 All children aged 2–10 years from enrolled households were eligible for the clinical survey if they
156 were usually resident and present in the household on the night before the survey, their parent or
157 guardian provided informed consent, and the child provided assent if they were aged 8 years or
158 older. Children not home on day of survey were excluded. The clinical surveys included
159 measurement of temperature, subjective fever, and a finger-prick blood sample for preparation of
160 thick blood smears, and haemoglobin measurement (in children aged 2–4 years).

161

162 Participants with a temperature of $\geq 38.0^{\circ}\text{C}$, or who reported fever in the past 48h, had a rapid
163 diagnostic test (RDT) done (Bioline Malaria Ag P.f/Pan, Abbott Diagnostics, Inc). Participants with a
164 positive RDT were treated with artemether-lumefantrine, or referred if they had evidence of severe

165 disease. Any participants with a haemoglobin <7.0 g/dL or other concerning clinical symptoms were
166 referred for further management.

167

168 ***Laboratory procedures***

169 Thick blood smears obtained in the cross-sectional surveys were dried and transported to the
170 Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration Molecular Research Laboratory in Kampala within seven
171 days for processing and reading. Slides were stained with 3% Giemsa for 30 minutes and read by
172 experienced laboratory technologists. Parasite densities were calculated by counting the number of
173 asexual parasites, per 200 leukocytes (or per 500, if the count was less than 10 parasites per 200
174 leukocytes), assuming a leukocyte count of 8,000/ μ l. A thick blood smear was considered negative
175 when the examination of 100 high power fields did not reveal asexual parasites. For quality control,
176 all slides were read by a second microscopist and a third reviewer settled discrepant readings,
177 defined as (1) positive versus a negative thick blood smear, (2) parasite density differing by \geq 25%.
178 Haemoglobin measurements were made using a portable HemoCue analyzer (HemoCue, Ängelholm,
179 Sweden).

180

181 ***Outcome measures***

182 The primary outcome of the trial was cumulative incidence of symptomatic malaria cases in cluster
183 residents of all ages captured at the MRCs over the 24 months following LLIN distribution. The total
184 number of malaria cases for each cluster was determined from the number of laboratory-confirmed
185 malaria cases diagnosed at the MRC in patients residing within the target area, over the two-year
186 follow-up period, correcting for cluster residents with suspected malaria seen at the MRC who did
187 not undergo laboratory testing, and for patients with laboratory-confirmed malaria whose village of
188 residence was unknown (due to missing data). The population of the MRC target area determined in
189 the enumeration surveys was used as the denominator for incidence calculations for each cluster
190 with a constant growth factor of 0.29% per month, derived from the UN Department of Economic

191 and Social Affairs Population Division World Population Prospects data
192 (<https://population.un.org/wpp/>), which estimated an annual growth rate of 3.46% in 2019 (divided
193 by 12 for the monthly rate of 0.29%).

194

195 Secondary outcomes for the cross-sectional community surveys included LLIN ownership (the
196 proportion of households that owned at least one LLIN), adequate LLIN coverage (the proportion of
197 households that owned at least one LLIN for every two occupants), LLIN use (the proportion of
198 household residents who reported sleeping under an LLIN the previous night), prevalence of
199 parasitaemia (in children aged 2–10 years), and prevalence of anaemia (in children aged 2–4 years).

200

201 ***Sample size calculations***

202 Our sample size of 32 clusters per arm was calculated to detect a 26% difference (incidence rate
203 ratio [IRR] = 0.74) in malaria incidence between the two study arms over the 24 months following
204 LLIN distribution (the primary endpoint of the study), given a power of 80% and a two-sided
205 significance level of 0.05, assuming an incidence of 332 malaria cases per 1,000 person-years in the
206 control arm and a coefficient of variation of 0.42, which was calculated from the 14 MRCs where
207 estimates of malaria incidence over 6 months were available at the time of protocol development.

208

209 For the cross-sectional community surveys, we planned to sample all eligible children aged 2–10
210 years from 50 households in the 64 clusters in each survey. Assuming an average of 1.8 children
211 aged 2–10 years per household, we estimated that 5,760 children from 3,200 households would be
212 included. Assuming a coefficient of variation of 0.40, across a wide range of prevalence measures in
213 the control arm (10–70%), our sample size allowed us to detect a 25–28% difference in the
214 prevalence measure of interest, equivalent to a prevalence ratio of 0.72–0.75, given a power of 80%
215 and a two-sided significance level of 0.05.

216

217 ***Analytical issues***

218 All analyses were conducted using an intention-to-treat approach. We compared cluster-level
219 estimates of the incidence of malaria between the intervention (pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs) and
220 the control arm (pyrethroid-PBO LLINs) using a mixed effects Poisson regression model with a
221 random effect at the district level (each district included two clusters, randomised to one of the two
222 study arms) and adjustment for log-transformed estimates of the baseline malaria incidence (three
223 months prior to the intervention) for each cluster. The effect of the intervention was expressed as an
224 incidence rate ratio (incidence in the intervention arm/incidence in the control arm).

225

226 For the cross-sectional surveys, separate analyses were conducted 12- and 24-month following LLIN
227 distribution. Houses were classified as ‘modern’ (synthetic walls and roofs, eaves closed or absent)
228 or ‘traditional’ (all other construction). We compared individual level estimates of the prevalence of
229 parasitaemia and anaemia between the intervention (pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs) and the control
230 arm (pyrethroid-PBO LLINs) using a mixed effects logistic regression model with random effects at
231 the level of the cluster and household. We compared household-level estimates of LLIN ownership,
232 coverage, and use with a mixed effects logistic regression model with a random effect at the level of
233 the cluster. Effects of the intervention were expressed as odds ratios (odds in the intervention
234 arm/odds in the control arm).

235

236 ***Research ethics approval and participant consent***

237 The research included in this trial was conducted under two study protocols. The Implementation
238 Project Pilot Study covered enumeration of the target areas and estimation of malaria incidence
239 using health facility surveillance data. This project was approved by the Makerere University School
240 of Medicine Research & Ethics Committee (SOMREC, Ref 2019-087), the Ugandan National Council of
241 Science and Technology (UNCST, Ref HS 2659), and the University of California, San Francisco Human
242 Research Protection Program Institutional Review Board (UCSF Ref 19-27957).

243

244 The LLINEUP2 trial protocol provided approval for the full trial, including the cross-sectional surveys,
245 and was approved by the Makerere University School of Medicine Research & Ethics Committee
246 (SOMREC Ref 2020-193), Ugandan National Council for Science and Technology (UNCST Ref
247 HS1097ES), the University of California San Francisco Human Research Protection Program
248 Institutional Review Board (UCSF Ref 20-31769), and the London School of Hygiene & Tropical
249 Medicine Ethics Committee (LSHTM Ref 22615). Prior to enrolment into the clinical surveys, written
250 informed consent was obtained from a parent or guardian for all children aged less than 18 years
251 and the child provided assent if they were aged 8 years or older.

252

253 **Results**

254 ***Characteristics of clusters, households, and residents***

255 Of the 64 clusters (figure 2), 32 were randomised to receive pyrethroid-PBO LLINs, and 32 to receive
256 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs. At baseline, the median estimated population of the clusters (MRC
257 target areas) was 3,070 (range 1,084—5,915) in the pyrethroid-PBO LLIN arm, and 2,493 (range
258 756—8,663) in the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLIN arm.

259

260 Cross-sectional community surveys were carried out in all clusters (table 1) at 12-months (24
261 November 2021 to 1 April 2022) and 24-months (23 November 2022 to 21 March 2023) post-LLIN
262 distribution. Characteristics of households enrolled in both surveys were similar across study arms
263 (12-months: n=3,518, median 53 per cluster, range 50–78; 24-months: n=3,372, median 52 per
264 cluster, range 50–64). In both surveys, over half of households had three or more persons per
265 sleeping room (55.8%) and were constructed of traditional materials (57.1%). Overall, 7,781 bed nets
266 were surveyed at 12-months, and 6,306 at 24-months (table 1). Most nets (86.1%) were obtained in

267 the most recent universal coverage campaign (UCC), and nearly all nets (96.1%) were obtained for
268 free.

269

270 In total, 16,189 household residents were surveyed at 12-months, and 16,706 at 24-months (table
271 1); over half of residents were women (54.5%). In both surveys, the age distribution of residents was
272 similar across the study arms. Children aged 2-10 years enrolled in the clinical survey (figure 2) were
273 tested for parasitaemia (12-months: n=4,893, median 73 per cluster, range 54-122; 24-months:
274 n=4,519, median 68 per cluster, range 50-94). Children aged 2-4 years were tested for anaemia (12-
275 months: n=2,087, median 31 per cluster, range 17-48; 24-months: n=1,908, median 30 per cluster,
276 range 14-48).

277

278 ***LLIN delivery***

279 LLINs were delivered in the study area by the Ministry of Health and partners from 7th November
280 2020 to 26th March 2021. In total, 1,329,273 LLINs were allocated for distribution to the sub-counties
281 surrounding each cluster, including 632,359 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs and 696,914 pyrethroid-
282 PBO LLINs. A cross-sectional survey was conducted in April-May 2021 in 12 clusters from 12 selected
283 districts to evaluate the impact of the LLIN distribution campaign. As previously reported,[21] 1-5
284 months after LLIN distribution, household LLIN ownership was high. Of 634 households surveyed,
285 609 (96.1%) owned at least one LLIN. However, only 360 (56.8%) households owned at least one
286 UCC LLIN for every 2 residents, while 374 (59.0%) were adequately covered by LLINs of any type.

287

288 ***Impact on primary outcome: malaria incidence***

289 In the three months prior to completion of LLIN distribution (baseline), 32,384 episodes of malaria
290 were diagnosed in residents of the clusters (MRC target areas) over 47,945 person-years of follow-up
291 (table 2, figure 3). The baseline incidence of malaria in the two study arms was similar (676 episodes

292 per 1,000 person-years in the pyrethroid-PBO LLIN arm, and 674 episodes per person-year in the
293 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLIN arm). In the first 4 months following LLIN distribution, malaria
294 incidence decreased in both study arms, but began to increase again 5-months post-distribution
295 (figure 3). Overall, in the two years after LLIN distribution, 186,364 episodes of malaria were
296 diagnosed in cluster residents during 398,931 person-years of follow-up (table 2). The incidence of
297 malaria post-LLIN distribution was lower than baseline in both study arms (465 episodes per 1000
298 person-years in the pyrethroid-PBO arm, and 469 episodes per person-year in the pyrethroid-
299 pyriproxyfen arm), but the difference between the two arms was not statistically significant
300 (incidence rate ratio (IRR) 1.06, 95% confidence interval (CI) 0.91–1.22, $p=0.47$).

301

302 ***Impact on secondary outcomes: LLIN ownership, coverage and use***

303 Trends in LLIN ownership, coverage and use were similar in both study arms at 12-months and 24-
304 months (table 3). Most households reported owning at least one LLIN at 12-months (91.9%
305 pyrethroid-PBO vs 89.9% pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen), but ownership dropped at 24-months in both
306 study arms (82.5% pyrethroid-PBO vs 80.0% pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen). In contrast, adequate
307 coverage of LLINs (one LLIN for every two residents) was low at 12-months (59.9% pyrethroid-PBO vs
308 56.6% pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen) and fell even further at 24-months (41.1% pyrethroid-PBO vs 38.6%
309 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen). Similarly, although most household residents reported sleeping under a
310 LLIN the previous night (74.2% pyrethroid-PBO vs 76.1% pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen); reported use of
311 LLINs dropped at 24-months (63.6% pyrethroid-PBO vs 61.6% pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen).

312

313 ***Impact on secondary outcomes: parasite prevalence and anaemia prevalence***

314 Parasite prevalence in children aged 2-10 years was no different in the two study arms at 12-months
315 and 24-months post-LLIN distribution (table 3). Parasite prevalence at 12-months was 21.6% in the
316 pyrethroid-PBO arm vs 26.4% in the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen arm (odds ratio [OR] 1.49 [95% CI:

317 0.88–2.51], $p=0.14$). Similar results were observed at the 24-month timepoint (26.1% in the
318 pyrethroid-PBO arm vs 29.5% in the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen arm (OR 1.29 [95% CI: 0.81–2.05],
319 $p=0.29$). The prevalence of anaemia (haemoglobin < 11 g/dL) in children aged 2-4 years decreased
320 substantially between 12-months and 24-months, but there was no difference between the study
321 arms at the two timepoints (table 3). Anaemia prevalence at 12-months was 36.2% in the
322 pyrethroid-PBO arm vs 34.0% in the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen arm (OR 0.88 [95% CI: 0.57–1.34],
323 $p=0.44$). At 24-months, prevalence anaemia dropped to 19.7% in the pyrethroid-PBO arm vs 19.0%
324 in the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen arm (OR 0.95 [95% CI: 0.62–1.46], $p=0.81$).

325

326 ***Costing of LLINs***

327 We originally planned to conduct a cost-effectiveness analysis of the two LLINs studied, but given
328 the lack of difference in LLIN effectiveness, we limited our assessment to a costing exercise. When
329 the study LLINs were purchased (in 2019), the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs (Royal Guard, \$2.28
330 USD per net) were slightly less expensive than the pyrethroid-PBO LLINs (PermaNet 3.0, \$2.51 USD
331 per net). As of April 2023, market prices of the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs were \$0.77 USD lower
332 per net than pyrethroid-PBO LLINs (\$2.30 USD for Royal Guard vs \$3.07 USD for PermaNet 3.0) [22].

333

334 **Discussion**

335 In this pragmatic, cluster-randomised trial embedded into Uganda's 2020–2021 LLIN distribution
336 campaign, we compared the impact of two next generation LLINs on malaria incidence across 32
337 districts in Uganda. Despite a marked reduction in malaria incidence following LLIN distribution in
338 both study arms, there was no difference in malaria incidence among residents of all ages, parasite
339 prevalence among children 2-10 years of age, or anaemia prevalence among children 2-4 years of
340 age from clusters that received pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs compared to those that received
341 pyrethroid-PBO LLINs. Given the lack of difference in effectiveness of the two LLINs studied, we did

342 not conduct a cost-effectiveness analysis as originally planned. Faced with similar effectiveness, the
343 choice of LLIN should be guided by price and other factors. Importantly, LLINs will only be effective if
344 coverage is high, and nets are used. Two years post-distribution, we found only around 40% of
345 households were adequately covered by LLINs, while just over 60% of residents reported sleeping
346 under a LLIN the previous night.

347

348 Pyrethroid-PBO LLINs were superior to pyrethroid-only LLINs in two trials conducted in east Africa,
349 including the original LLINEUP trial in Uganda [13-15]. A Cochrane systematic review incorporating
350 both trials concluded that pyrethroid-PBO LLINs reduced parasite prevalence compared to
351 pyrethroid-only LLINs up to 21–25 months post-distribution (OR 0.79 [95% CI 0.67–0.95]), in areas
352 with highly pyrethroid-resistant mosquitoes (defined as < 30% mosquito mortality in discriminating
353 dose assays) [12]. Based on this evidence, the WHO issued a conditional recommendation in 2022
354 supporting the deployment of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs instead of pyrethroid-only LLINs ‘in areas with
355 ongoing malaria transmission where the principal malaria vector(s) exhibit pyrethroid resistance’
356 [16]. However, pyrethroid-PBO LLINs have several potential limitations. Widespread pyrethroid
357 resistance has been reported in Uganda [23, 24], and across Africa, with both knock-down and
358 metabolic resistance described across several settings [11]. PBO is a synergist, not an insecticide, and
359 can only restore sensitivity to pyrethroid insecticides if resistance is due to specific metabolic
360 mechanisms. Moreover, PBO may fail to overcome high-level pyrethroid resistance [25]. Questions
361 about the bioefficacy, durability, and lifespan of PBO-pyrethroid LLINs have also been raised [12, 16],
362 given concerns about the rapid degradation of PBO from nets raised by studies conducted in Kenya
363 and Tanzania [26, 27]. In Uganda, an evaluation of nets distributed in the first LLINEUP trial found
364 that while the pyrethroid content of LLINs was relatively stable, the PBO content fell significantly
365 over two years; by 55% in Olyset Plus and 58% in PermaNet 3.0 [17]. The bioefficacy of the
366 pyrethroid-PBO nets also declined over time with only 46% and 79% of mosquitoes knocked down
367 by Olyset Plus and PermaNet 3.0, respectively, after 25 months [17]. The WHO has highlighted the

368 need for further research on the effectiveness of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs, specifically in areas of lower
369 transmission intensity and where pyrethroid resistance is not driven by cytochrome P450
370 metabolism, as well as on the durability and cost-effectiveness of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs [16].

371

372 Treating LLINs with a combination of insecticides with different modes of action may improve
373 efficacy and help to prevent or delay the spread of insecticide resistance. Pyriproxyfen is an insect
374 growth regulator, which has traditionally been used as a larvicide [28], but also acts as a sterilising
375 agent, reducing the fecundity (egg laying), fertility (production of viable offspring), and longevity of
376 adult mosquitoes [29]. Pyriproxyfen has a different mechanism of action than pyrethroids, is
377 effective at very low concentrations, and is safe in humans [28]. In a step-wedge, cluster-randomised
378 trial conducted in Burkina Faso, pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs (Olyset Duo) were associated with
379 lower clinical incidence in children aged 6–59 months, and lower entomological inoculation rates
380 than pyrethroid-only LLINs (Olyset Net) [18]. More recently, a cluster-randomised trial conducted in
381 Tanzania evaluated three next generation LLINs, including LLINs treated with pyrethroid-
382 pyriproxyfen, pyrethroid-PBO, and pyrethroid-chlorfenapyr (a novel pyrrole insecticide), comparing
383 their effect on parasite prevalence measured by RDT in children aged 6 months to 14 years, as
384 compared to pyrethroid-only LLINs [19]. In this trial, parasite prevalence at 24 months post-
385 distribution in the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLIN arm was no different than in the pyrethroid-PBO
386 control arm (37.5% vs 45.8%, adjusted OR 0.79 [95% CI 0.54–1.17]). Similarly, a cluster-randomised
387 trial conducted in Benin studied pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen and pyrethroid-chlorfenapyr LLINs, as
388 compared to pyrethroid-only LLINs, evaluating their effect on malaria incidence in children aged 6
389 months to 10 years [30]. This study also found no difference between the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen
390 and pyrethroid-only LLINs over 2 years following distribution (0.84 vs 1.03 malaria cases per child-
391 year, hazard ratio 0.86 [95% CI 0.65-1.14]). In both trials, only the pyrethroid-chlorfenapyr LLINs
392 were superior to the pyrethroid-only LLINs after two years [19, 30].

393

394 In March 2023, the WHO updated the guidelines on use of LLINs, supported by the recent results of
395 the trials in Tanzania and Benin, offering a conditional recommendation for the deployment of
396 pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs instead of pyrethroid-only LLINs in areas with pyrethroid resistance,
397 and highlighting concerns about the cost-effectiveness of the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs [16]. In
398 addition, the WHO issued a conditional recommendation against the deployment of pyrethroid-
399 pyriproxyfen LLINs instead of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs, noting that the evidence favours pyrethroid-PBO
400 LLINs which were also deemed more cost-effective than pyriproxyfen LLINs. The LLINEUP2 trial adds
401 to the evidence of the effectiveness of pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs, but calls into question the
402 recent WHO recommendations, given that the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs (Royal Guard, Disease
403 Control Technologies, USA) were less expensive than pyrethroid-PBO (PermaNet 3.0, Vestergaard
404 Sàrl, Switzerland) LLINs in our trial (\$2.30 USD for Royal Guard vs \$3.07 USD for PermaNet 3.0) [22],
405 with similar effectiveness. LLIN prices fluctuate, however, so this finding should not be generalised;
406 whichever net has a lower market price on a given day will be the most cost-effective.

407

408 Malaria incidence was the primary outcome measure of the LLINEUP2 trial, which was a strength of
409 the study. Incidence of malaria, defined as the number of symptomatic cases of malaria occurring in
410 a population at risk over time, is considered the gold standard for assessing malaria burden.
411 However, cluster-randomised trials aiming to measure malaria incidence can be very expensive and
412 logistically challenging. In this trial, we leveraged a platform of enhanced health facility-based
413 malaria surveillance, which was built and supported by the Ugandan Malaria Surveillance Project
414 [31]. Although routinely collected health facility-based data are often limited by incomplete
415 reporting and lack of laboratory-confirmation, our enhanced health facility-based surveillance
416 system acts as an intervention, improving data quality, ensuring nearly all cases of malaria are
417 laboratory-confirmed, and improving case management. Moreover, by defining target areas around
418 MRCs, collecting data on village of residence of malaria, and enumerating the target area
419 populations to determine denominators, we estimated longitudinal measures of malaria incidence at

420 an unprecedented scale across Uganda, at relatively low cost. Embedding large-scale, cluster-
421 randomised trials into Uganda's national LLIN distribution campaigns has provided an innovative,
422 robust method to effectively evaluate next generation LLINs at scale, an exercise which would
423 otherwise be very costly. This design provides a new paradigm for trials evaluating the 'real-world'
424 effectiveness of malaria control interventions.

425

426 This study had several limitations. First, due to resource limitations, entomologic surveillance and
427 assessments of LLIN bioefficacy and durability were not conducted. Second, we were not able to
428 survey the clusters prior to LLIN distribution, again due to lack of resources, and thus have no
429 baseline measures of LLIN coverage, parasite prevalence or anaemia. However, MRC surveillance
430 activities were ongoing for at least three months prior to LLIN distribution, providing baseline
431 measures of malaria incidence for all clusters. Third, although no difference in prevalence of
432 anaemia in children aged 2-4 years was observed between the pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen and
433 pyrethroid-PBO arms at the 12- and 24-month timepoints, anaemia prevalence dropped markedly in
434 both arms between the two surveys (pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen 34.0% to 19.0%; pyrethroid-PBO
435 36.2% to 19.7%). Reasons for this change are unclear but likely relate to variation around the
436 threshold cut-off for anaemia (haemoglobin < 11 g/dL) and the complex aetiology of anaemia.
437 Although malaria is a major cause of anaemia in endemic areas, other factors contribute including
438 nutritional status, helminths and other infections, and health system factors.

439

440 Our results suggest that pyriproxyfen-pyrethroid LLINs could be an effective alternative to
441 pyrethroid-PBO LLINs in Uganda. Rotation of insecticides, including deployment of LLINs treated with
442 different insecticides, has been recommended as a strategy to manage insecticide resistance [32].
443 Supported by the recent trials in Tanzania and Benin, the WHO has also issued new guidelines on
444 LLINs treated with chlorfenapyr, offering a strong recommendation for the deployment of
445 pyrethroid-chlorfenapyr LLINs instead of pyrethroid-only LLINs, and a conditional recommendation

446 for deployment of pyrethroid-chlorfenapyr LLINs instead of pyrethroid-PBO LLINs in areas where
447 malaria vectors are resistant to pyrethroids. However, the evidence supporting these new
448 recommendations is limited and further research on the effectiveness, durability and lifespan of next
449 generation LLINs is needed. To address the continuing challenge of insecticide resistance, we are
450 conducting another cluster-randomised trial (LLINEUP3) embedded with the 2023 universal coverage
451 campaign in collaboration with the Ugandan MOH. This study is comparing the effectiveness of
452 pyrethroid-chlorfenapyr LLINs versus pyrethroid-PBO LLINs in 24 clusters located in 20 districts in
453 Uganda.

454 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

455 We would like to thank Emmanuel Arinaitwe, James Kapisi, Chris Ebong, Bridget Nzarubara, Faith
456 Kagoya, Emmanuel Bakashaba, Isiko Joseph, Paul Oketch, Benjamin Guma, Jolly Job Odongo, Daniel
457 Ochuli, Geoffrey Omia, Leuben Patrick Okello, Geoff Lavoy, Peter Mutungi, Nicholas Wendo, Yasin
458 Kisambira, Catherine Pitt and the administration of the Infectious Diseases Research Collaboration
459 for all their contributions. We would also like to acknowledge and thank the members of the Uganda
460 National Malaria Control Division and the Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine for logistical and
461 other support rendered as we carried out the data collection and analysis. We are grateful to the
462 district administration, health and political leadership teams for all their support and guidance
463 during community engagement in the 32 districts of the study area.

464

465 **AUTHORS' CONTRIBUTIONS**

466 SGS, GD, MRK, MJD, SG, CMS, JIN and JO conceived and designed the study. SGS, GD, MRK, JIN, SG,
467 JFN and CMS developed the procedures and drafted the protocol. SG, JFN, MJN, KS and IN collected
468 the data, with oversight from SGS and MRK. IN and GD managed the data. GD, SG, KS, and SGS
469 analysed the data. JIN, AE, MJD and MRK advised on the analysis. SG, JFN, MJN, DG and SGS drafted
470 the manuscript. All authors reviewed the manuscript, provided input and approved the final version
471 for publication.

472

473 **DECLARATION OF INTERESTS**

474 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

475

476 **FUNDING STATEMENT**

477 This project was funded primarily by the US National Institutes for health, with additional funding
478 from the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation. The content of the manuscript is solely the
479 responsibility of the authors.

480

481 **DATA SHARING STATEMENT**

482 De-identified participant data and a data dictionary defining each field in the set will be made
483 publicly available at the time of publication on the ClinEpiDB website (<https://clinepidb.org>). A link
484 to the statistical analysis for the primary outcome has also been provided on the ClinEpiDB website
485 (https://clinepidb.org/ce/app/workspace/analyses/DS_624583e93e/5My0liA/visualizations/1fd2ff57-954e-4c58-bf39-ebb113cc5a70).

487

489 REFERENCES

- 490 1) Bhatt S, Weiss DJ, Cameron E, Bisanzio D, Mappin B, Dalrymple U, et al. The effect of malaria
491 control on Plasmodium falciparum in Africa between 2000 and 2015. *Nature*.
492 2015;526(7572):207-11. doi: 10.1038/nature15535. PubMed PMID: 26375008.
- 493 2) World Health Organization. World Malaria Report 2022. Geneva: World Health Organization,
494 2022 Contract No.: ISBN 978-92-4-006490-4.
- 495 3) Uganda National Malaria Control Division (NMCD), Uganda Bureau of Statistics (UBOS), ICF.
496 Uganda Malaria Indicator Survey 2018-19. Kampala, Uganda, and Rockville, Maryland, USA 2020.
- 497 4) Namuganga JF, Epstein A, Nankabirwa JI, Mpimbaza A, Kiggundu M, Sserwanga A, et al. The
498 impact of stopping and starting indoor residual spraying on malaria burden in Uganda. *Nat*
499 *Commun*. 2021;12(1):2635. Epub 2021/05/13. doi: 10.1038/s41467-021-22896-5. PubMed
500 PMID: 33976132; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPC8113470.
- 501 5) Epstein A, Maiteki-Sebuguzi C, Namuganga JN, Nankabirwa JI, Gonahasa S, J. O, et al. Resurgence
502 of malaria in Uganda despite sustained indoor residual spraying and repeated long lasting
503 insecticidal net distributions. *PLOS Global Public Health*. 2022. doi:
504 <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pgph.0000676>.
- 505 6) Pryce J, Richardson M, Lengeler C. Insecticide-treated nets for preventing malaria. *Cochrane*
506 *Database Syst Rev*. 2018;11:CD000363. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD000363.pub3. PubMed PMID:
507 30398672.
- 508 7) World Health Organization. Achieving and maintaining universal coverage with long-lasting
509 insecticidal nets for malaria control Geneva: World Health Organisation, Global Malaria
510 Programme, 2017 Contract No.: WHO/HTM/GMP/2017.20.
- 511 8) Ranson H, Lissenden N. Insecticide Resistance in African Anopheles Mosquitoes: A Worsening
512 Situation that Needs Urgent Action to Maintain Malaria Control. *Trends Parasitol*.
513 2016;32(3):187-96. doi: 10.1016/j.pt.2015.11.010. PubMed PMID: 26826784.
- 514 9) Weetman D, Wilding CS, Neafsey DE, Muller P, Ochomo E, Isaacs AT, et al. Candidate-gene based
515 GWAS identifies reproducible DNA markers for metabolic pyrethroid resistance from standing
516 genetic variation in East African Anopheles gambiae. *Scientific reports*. 2018;8(1):2920. doi:
517 10.1038/s41598-018-21265-5. PubMed PMID: 29440767; PubMed Central PMCID:
518 PMCPMC5811533.
- 519 10) Njoroge H, Van't Hof A, Oruni A, Pipini D, Nagi SC, Lynd A, et al. Identification of a rapidly-
520 spreading triple mutant for high-level metabolic insecticide resistance in Anopheles gambiae
521 provides a real-time molecular diagnostic for antimalarial intervention deployment. *Molecular*
522 *ecology*. 2022;31(16):4307-18. Epub 2022/07/02. doi: 10.1111/mec.16591. PubMed PMID:
523 35775282; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC9424592.

- 524 11) Lynd A, Gonahasa S, Staedke SG, Oruni A, Maiteki-Sebuguzi C, Hancock PA, et al. LLIN Evaluation
525 in Uganda Project (LLINEUP)-effects of a vector control trial on Plasmodium infection prevalence
526 and genotypic markers of insecticide resistance in Anopheles vectors from 48 districts of
527 Uganda. *Scientific reports*. 2024;14(1):14488. Epub 20240624. doi: 10.1038/s41598-024-65050-
528 z. PubMed PMID: 38914669; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC11196729.
- 529 12) Gleave K, Lissenden N, Chaplin M, Choi L, Ranson H. Piperonyl butoxide (PBO) combined with
530 pyrethroids in insecticide-treated nets to prevent malaria in Africa. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*.
531 2021;5(5):Cd012776. Epub 2021/05/25. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD012776.pub3. PubMed PMID:
532 34027998; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC8142305.
- 533 13) Protopopoff N, Moshia JF, Lukole E, Charlwood JD, Wright A, Mwalimu CD, et al. Effectiveness of
534 a long-lasting piperonyl butoxide-treated insecticidal net and indoor residual spray
535 interventions, separately and together, against malaria transmitted by pyrethroid-resistant
536 mosquitoes: a cluster, randomised controlled, two-by-two factorial design trial. *Lancet*.
537 2018;391(10130):1577-88. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(18)30427-6. PubMed PMID: 29655496;
538 PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC5910376.
- 539 14) Staedke SG, Gonahasa S, Dorsey G, Kamya MR, Maiteki-Sebuguzi C, Lynd A, et al. Effect of long-
540 lasting insecticidal nets with and without piperonyl butoxide on malaria indicators in Uganda
541 (LLINEUP): a pragmatic, cluster-randomised trial embedded in a national LLIN distribution
542 campaign. *Lancet*. 2020;395(10232):1292-303. Epub 2020/04/20. doi: 10.1016/S0140-
543 6736(20)30214-2. PubMed PMID: 32305094; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC7181182.
- 544 15) Maiteki-Sebuguzi C, Gonahasa S, Kamya MR, Katureebe A, Bagala I, Lynd A, et al. Effect of long-
545 lasting insecticidal nets with and without piperonyl butoxide on malaria indicators in Uganda
546 (LLINEUP): final results of a cluster-randomised trial embedded in a national distribution
547 campaign. *Lancet Infect Dis*. 2023;23(2):247-58. Epub 2022/09/30. doi: 10.1016/S1473-
548 3099(22)00469-8. PubMed PMID: 36174592.
- 549 16) World Health Organization. Guidelines for malaria. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2023 14
550 March 2023. Report No.: Contract No.: WHO/UCN/GMP/2023.01.
- 551 17) Mehan F, Katureebe A, Tuhaise V, Mugote M, Oruni A, Onyige I, et al. LLIN evaluation in Uganda
552 project (LLINEUP): The fabric integrity, chemical content and bioefficacy of long-lasting
553 insecticidal nets treated with and without piperonyl butoxide across two years of operational
554 use in Uganda. *Curr Res Parasitol Vector Borne Dis*. 2022;2:100092. Epub 2022/06/24. doi:
555 10.1016/j.crpvbd.2022.100092. PubMed PMID: 35734077; PubMed Central PMCID:
556 PMCPMC9207544.
- 557 18) Tiono AB, Ouedraogo A, Ouattara D, Bougouma EC, Coulibaly S, Diarra A, et al. Efficacy of Olyset
558 Duo, a bednet containing pyriproxyfen and permethrin, versus a permethrin-only net against
559 clinical malaria in an area with highly pyrethroid-resistant vectors in rural Burkina Faso: a cluster-
560 randomised controlled trial. *Lancet*. 2018;392(10147):569-80. Epub 2018/08/15. doi:
561 10.1016/S0140-6736(18)31711-2. PubMed PMID: 30104047.

- 562 19) Mosha JF, Kulkarni MA, Lukole E, Matowo NS, Pitt C, Messenger LA, et al. Effectiveness and cost-
563 effectiveness against malaria of three types of dual-active-ingredient long-lasting insecticidal
564 nets (LLINs) compared with pyrethroid-only LLINs in Tanzania: a four-arm, cluster-randomised
565 trial. *Lancet*. 2022;399(10331):1227-41. Epub 2022/03/28. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(21)02499-
566 5. PubMed PMID: 35339225; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC971961.
- 567 20) Nankabirwa JI, Rek J, Arinaitwe E, Namuganga JF, Nsobya SL, Asua V, et al. East Africa
568 International Center of Excellence for Malaria Research: Summary of Key Research Findings. *Am*
569 *J Trop Med Hyg*. 2022;107(4_Suppl):21-32. Epub 2022/10/14. doi: 10.4269/ajtmh.21-1285.
570 PubMed PMID: 36228916; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC9294681.
- 571 21) Okiring J, Gonahasa S, Nassali M, Namuganga JF, Bagala I, Maiteki-Sebuguzi C, et al. LLIN
572 Evaluation in Uganda Project (LLINEUP2)-Factors associated with coverage and use of longlasting
573 insecticidal nets following the 2020-21 national mass distribution campaign: a cross-sectional
574 survey of 12 districts. *Malar J*. 2022;21(1):293. Epub 2022/10/20. doi: 10.1186/s12936-022-
575 04302-7. PubMed PMID: 36261818; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC9580445.
- 576 22) The Global Fund to Fight AIDS TB and Malaria. Workbook: Price & Quality Reporting Transaction
577 Summary (theglobalfund.org). 2023.
- 578 23) Mawejje HD, Wilding CS, Rippon EJ, Hughes A, Weetman D, Donnelly MJ. Insecticide resistance
579 monitoring of field-collected *Anopheles gambiae* s.l. populations from Jinja, eastern Uganda,
580 identifies high levels of pyrethroid resistance. *Medical and veterinary entomology*.
581 2013;27(3):276-83. doi: 10.1111/j.1365-2915.2012.01055.x. PubMed PMID: 23046446; PubMed
582 Central PMCID: PMC3543752.
- 583 24) Mawejje HD, Weetman D, Epstein A, Lynd A, Opigo J, Maiteki-Sebuguzi C, et al. Characterizing
584 pyrethroid resistance and mechanisms in *Anopheles gambiae* (s.s.) and *Anopheles arabiensis*
585 from 11 districts in Uganda. *Curr Res Parasitol Vector Borne Dis*. 2023;3:100106. Epub
586 2023/01/03. doi: 10.1016/j.crvpbd.2022.100106. PubMed PMID: 36590346; PubMed Central
587 PMCID: PMC9798136.
- 588 25) Riveron JM, Huijben S, Tchapga W, Tchouakui M, Wondji MJ, Tchoupo M, et al. Escalation of
589 Pyrethroid Resistance in the Malaria Vector *Anopheles funestus* Induces a Loss of Efficacy of
590 Piperonyl Butoxide-Based Insecticide-Treated Nets in Mozambique. *J Infect Dis*.
591 2019;220(3):467-75. doi: 10.1093/infdis/jiz139. PubMed PMID: 30923819; PubMed Central
592 PMCID: PMC6603977.
- 593 26) Gichuki PM, Kamau L, Njagi K, Karoki S, Muigai N, Matoke-Muhia D, et al. Bioefficacy and
594 durability of Olyset(®) Plus, a permethrin and piperonyl butoxide-treated insecticidal net in a 3-
595 year long trial in Kenya. *Infectious diseases of poverty*. 2021;10(1):135. Epub 2021/12/22. doi:
596 10.1186/s40249-021-00916-2. PubMed PMID: 34930459; PubMed Central PMCID:
597 PMC971082.
- 598 27) Lukole E, Cook J, Mosha JF, Messenger LA, Rowland M, Kleinschmidt I, et al. Protective efficacy
599 of holed and aging PBO-pyrethroid synergist-treated nets on malaria infection prevalence in
600 north-western Tanzania. *PLOS Glob Public Health*. 2022;2(10):e0000453. Epub 2023/03/25. doi:

- 601 10.1371/journal.pgph.0000453. PubMed PMID: 36962517; PubMed Central PMCID:
602 PMCPMC10022078.
- 603 28) World Health Organization. World Health Organization: Report of the Fourth WHOPES Working
604 Group Meeting In Review of IR3535; KBR3023; (RS)-Methoprene 20% EC, Pyriproxifen 05% GR;
605 and Lamda-cyhalothrin 25% CS. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization, 2001.
- 606 29) Lwetoijera DW, Harris C, Kiware SS, Killeen GF, Dongus S, Devine GJ, et al. Comprehensive
607 sterilization of malaria vectors using pyriproxyfen: a step closer to malaria elimination. *Am J Trop*
608 *Med Hyg.* 2014;90(5):852-5. Epub 2014/03/19. doi: 10.4269/ajtmh.13-0550. PubMed PMID:
609 24639296; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC4015577.
- 610 30) Accrombessi M, Cook J, Dangbenon E, Yovogan B, Akpovi H, Sovi A, et al. Efficacy of
611 pyriproxyfen-pyrethroid long-lasting insecticidal nets (LLINs) and chlorfenapyr-pyrethroid LLINs
612 compared with pyrethroid-only LLINs for malaria control in Benin: a cluster-randomised,
613 superiority trial. *Lancet.* 2023;401(10375):435-46. Epub 2023/01/28. doi: 10.1016/S0140-
614 6736(22)02319-4. PubMed PMID: 36706778.
- 615 31) Epstein A, Namuganga JF, Kanya EV, Nankabirwa JI, Bhatt S, Rodriguez-Barraquer I, et al.
616 Estimating malaria incidence from routine health facility-based surveillance data in Uganda.
617 *Malar J.* 2020;19(1):445. doi: 10.1186/s12936-020-03514-z. PubMed PMID: 33267886; PubMed
618 Central PMCID: PMCPMC7709253.
- 619 32) World Health Organization. Global plan for insecticide resistance management in malaria
620 vectors. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization, 2012.
- 621

622 **FIGURE LEGEND**

623

624 **Figure 1: Map of study area:** The study included 64 clusters across 32 districts; 2 clusters per district,
625 one per study arm. A cluster was defined as a malaria reference centre and its target area.

626

627 **Figure 2: Trial profile.** LLIN=long-lasting insecticidal net. BS=blood smear. Hb=haemoglobin.

628

629 **Figure 3: Malaria incidence per 1000 person-years.** LLINs were distributed in waves over a period of
630 5 months. Malaria incidence measures cater for the staggered distribution of LLINs across the sites.

631

632

633

634

Table 1. Cluster-level characteristics of households, bed nets and household residents from cross-sectional surveys

Variable	Characteristic	12-month surveys		24-month surveys	
		pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs
Number of households surveyed		1771	1747	1690	1682
Measure of crowding, mean (SD)	≥ 3 persons / sleeping rooms	55.9% (15.4%)	57.4% (17.9%)	55.9% (14.6%)	53.1% (13.7%)
Socioeconomic index in terciles, mean (SD)	— Poorest	31.7% (22.3%)	35.6% (25.2%)	33.1% (21.9%)	33.6% (22.3%)
	— Poor	34.1% (13.7%)	33.4% (17.5%)	32.6% (14.0%)	35.4% (14.0%)
	— Least poor	34.2% (23.3%)	31.0% (22.4%)	34.2% (25.1%)	31.0% (21.7%)
Household construction, mean (SD) ^a	— Traditional	59.5% (32.7%)	62.2% (32.8%)	50.9% (30.7%)	56.5% (29.4%)
	— Modern	40.5% (32.7%)	37.8% (32.8%)	49.1% (30.7%)	43.5% (29.4%)
Number of bed nets surveyed		3991	3790	3211	3095
Where bed net was obtained, mean (SD)	— Most recent universal coverage campaign	92.4% (8.5%)	89.1% (14.2%)	87.1% (10.9%)	80.1% (18.4%)
	— Prior universal coverage campaign	2.2% (4.8%)	2.0% (5.2%)	1.4% (2.5%)	3.2% (5.9%)
	— Other	5.4% (5.5%)	8.9% (10.4%)	11.4% (9.3%)	16.8% (14.3%)
Bed net obtained for free, mean (SD)		97.7% (2.7%)	96.9% (3.4%)	95.4% (5.1%)	94.1% (6.0%)
Number of residents surveyed		8249	7940	8400	8306
Female gender, mean (SD)		55.6% (3.9%)	54.8% (3.8%)	54.6% (3.2%)	54.2% (3.1%)
Age categories, mean (SD)	< 5 years	19.5% (3.8%)	18.6% (3.6%)	19.1% (3.8%)	18.6% (4.2%)
	5-15 years	33.9% (4.1%)	34.2% (5.0%)	33.6% (3.9%)	33.9% (4.5%)
	16 years or older	46.5% (4.0%)	47.2% (3.7%)	47.4% (4.8%)	47.5% (4.6%)

^a Houses were classified as 'modern' (synthetic walls and roofs, eaves closed or absent) or 'traditional' (all other construction)

Table 2. Malaria incidence in residence of all ages from MRC target areas

Study arm	Baseline *			24 months post-intervention			IRR (95% CI)**	p-value
	Episodes of malaria	Person years of observation	Malaria incidence per 1000 PY	Episodes of malaria	Person years of observation	Malaria incidence per 1000 PY		
pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	16,763	24,783	676	95,898	206,211	465	reference arm	
pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	15,621	23,162	674	90,466	192,720	469	1.06 (0.91-1.22)	0.47

* 3 months prior to completion of LLIN distribution

** Adjusted for baseline malaria incidence; random effect at the level of the district

Table 3. Secondary outcomes assessed at 12- and 24-months post-intervention from cross-sectional surveys of MRC target areas

Indicator	Study arm	12-month survey			24-month survey		
		n/N (%)	OR (95% CI)	p-value	n/N (%)	OR (95% CI)	p-value
LLIN ownership* in households	pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	1628/1771 (91.9%)	reference	—	1384/1690 (82.5%)	reference	—
	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	1571/1747 (89.9%)	0.81 (0.44-1.47)	0.48	1345/1682 (80.0%)	0.81 (0.45-1.47)	0.50
Adequate LLIN coverage† in households	pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	1060/1771 (59.9%)	reference	—	695/1690 (41.1%)	reference	—
	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	987/1747 (56.5%)	0.85 (0.58-1.25)	0.41	650/1682 (38.6%)	0.87 (0.56-1.36)	0.55
LLIN use‡ in household residents	pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	6121/8249 (74.2%)	reference	—	5341/8400 (63.6%)	reference	—
	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	6045/7940 (76.1%)	0.98 (0.54-1.79)	0.96	5117/8306 (61.6%)	0.80 (0.41-1.58)	0.52
Parasite prevalence in children 2-10 years	pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	521/2411 (21.6%)	reference	—	602/2311 (26.1%)	reference	—
	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	654/2482 (26.4%)	1.49 (0.88-2.51)	0.14	651/2208 (29.5%)	1.29 (0.81-2.05)	0.29
Anaemia** prevalence in children 2-4 years	pyrethroid-PBO LLINs	385/1065 (36.2%)	reference	—	191/971 (19.7%)	reference	—
	pyrethroid-pyriproxyfen LLINs	347/1022 (34.0%)	0.88 (0.57-1.34)	0.54	178/937 (19.0%)	0.95 (0.62-1.46)	0.81

* LLIN ownership defined as household with at least 1 LLIN

† Adequate LLIN coverage defined as household with at least 1 LLIN for every 2 residents

‡ LLIN use defined as household resident who reported sleeping under a LLIN the prior night

** Anaemia defined as haemoglobin < 11 g/dL





