1	Willingness and Perceived ability to pay for Uganda's Proposed National Health Insurance
2	Scheme among Informal Sector workers in Iganga and Mayuge districts, Uganda: A
3	Contingent Valuation Method.
4	
5	Noel Namuhani ^{1*} , Angela Kisakye ^{1, 2} and Suzanne N Kiwanuka ¹
6	
7	Institutional affiliations
8	¹ Makerere University School of public health, Department of Health policy planning and
9	
10	² African Field Epidemiology Network, Lugogo House, Plot 42, Lugogo By-Pass
11	
12	*Corresponding Author
13	Email: nnamuhani@musph.ac.ug
14	
15	
16	
17	

18 Abstract

Background: Access to health care remains a challenge, especially among the informal sector workers in most low-income countries, due to high out-of-pocket (OOP) expenditures, with Uganda spending over 28.0% out of pocket on health care. In response, Uganda has proposed a national health insurance scheme (NHI). However, the willingness and ability to pay for the proposed NHI scheme within the informal sector have not yet been explored in Uganda. This study assessed the willingness and perceived ability to pay for the proposed NHI scheme and its determinants among the informal sector workers in Iganga and Mayuge districts, Uganda.

Methodology: A cross-sectional study was conducted in Iganga and Mayuge districts in April and May 2019. A contingent valuation method using the bidding game technique was used to elicit the willingness to pay (WTP). A total of 853 informal sector workers, including farmers, commercial motorists, fishermen, and traders, were randomly sampled. Seven focus group discussions (FGD) were also conducted. Logistic regression was done to identify the determinants of willingness to pay for the proposed NHI scheme. Qualitative data was analyzed thematically.

Results: The majority 695/853, (81.5%) of the respondents were willing to pay for NHI; the median WTP was UGX 25,000 (USD 6.8) annually; and 633/853, (74.2%) of the respondents believed that they were able to pay for the health insurance. Willingness to Pay was significantly associated with being a fisher folk (AOR: 1.70 95%CI: 1.04-2.79, P = 0.035), being in the fourth wealth quintile (AOR: 2.98, 95% CI: 1.56–5.65), not hearing about health insurance (AOR: 0.50 95%CI: 0.23-0.86, P = 0.032), and not having saving group membership (AOR: 0.51, 95%CI: 0.34-0.76, P<0.001). Most of the FGD participants were willing to pay for the proposed scheme;

39 however, some of the participants doubted their ability to pay for the scheme given their high

40 poverty levels and their unstable income.

41 **Conclusion:** The willingness to pay for health insurance in the informal sector is high.

- 42 Therefore, it is viable for the government to extend NHI to the informal sector. However,
- 43 awareness building and due consideration of high poverty levels in setting appropriate
- 44 premiums should be a priority.

45 Key words: National Health insurance scheme, Willingness to pay, Ability to pay, informal sector,

46 Contingent Valuation method.

47

48 Introduction

Access to health care remains a big challenge, especially among the informal sector in most lowincome countries (1, 2), mainly due to high out-of-pocket (OOP) expenditures (3). This put about 150 million people at risk of catastrophic healthcare costs annually, driving over 100 million people into poverty worldwide (3). According to the World Bank, direct modes of payment for health care services constitute 40% of health care expenditure in developing countries (4).

In Uganda, although the national health accounts reported a reduction in the out-of-pocket expenditure on health as a share of current health expenditure (CHE) from 38.6% in the financial year 2018/2019 to 27.4% in the financial year 2020/2021, the OOPE remains significantly high (5). Accessing healthcare is associated with several expenses, including transport, drugs,

diagnostics, and consultancy fees, among other expenses related to personnel and capital costs(6).

In Uganda, over 80% of the labor force belongs to the informal sector (7). These include peasant farmers, commercial cyclists, fishermen, and those employed in unregistered or small-scale enterprises. It is estimated that 59% of the people in the informal sector in Eastern Uganda cannot afford to access quality health care due to high poverty levels and OOP for health care (8).

Globally, the implementation of health insurance schemes is one of the major responses to addressing out-of-pocket payments for health care (3, 9) in low and middle-income countries. Health insurance has the ability to reduce financial barriers to health care access and protect individuals and families against the risk of unpredictable health care expenditures, hence aiding the attainment of UHC (10). This has improved access to healthcare, especially in developed countries.

71 High coverage and enrollment in the health insurance scheme are critical for the success and 72 sustainability of the scheme. However, enrolment in health insurance schemes remains low, 73 ranging from 2% to 40% in most African countries (11-13). The poor enrolment rates in the different countries have been attributed to a number of factors, including low incomes, large 74 75 household sizes, long distances to health facilities, limited awareness, poor quality of health care 76 services, inappropriate benefit packages, a lack of trust in the systems, and high illiteracy levels, especially in the informal sector (14-16). The informal sector workers are sometimes of low 77 socioeconomic status compared to the formal sector workers, hence having a lower ability to pay 78

for health insurance (16). Furthermore, the informal sector is not well organized; they have unpredictable incomes, making it difficult to enroll and register them into the NHI scheme and collect regular contributions from them (13, 17).

Uganda is in the process of developing a NHI scheme to address the high OOP and access to 82 services. However, given the high poverty levels among Ugandans and more so in the informal 83 84 sector, the policy question of how much money people are willing to spend and their ability to pay remains unanswered. Eastern Uganda is the poorest region in Uganda, with 35.7% of most 85 households living below the poverty line (7). The willingness to pay for the proposed NHI scheme, 86 especially within the informal sector, which makes up 80% of Uganda's population, is critical to 87 the achievement of equity in access to care and the core risk pooling function of a health 88 insurance scheme. This would translate into high enrollment rates, which foster the financial 89 sustainability of the schemes (10). 90

The national health insurance bill, 2019, proposes that the scheme will be mandatory for all Ugandans, and each person is to pay a premium that will be determined by the board. The bill was passed by parliament in 2021 but was not assented to by the president due to disagreements among stakeholders who were not consulted. As of 2024, the bill is being discussed by the Ministry of Health and stakeholders before being re-tabled in the Parliament of Uganda.

There is a paucity of information on the willingness and ability to pay for the proposed NHI, especially within the informal sector. Therefore, this study aimed at documenting the willingness to pay and the perceived ability to pay for the proposed NHI and factors that influence willingness

to pay for the proposed NHI scheme among the informal sector workers. This study's findings will
be used by the MOH in determining affordable premiums and how they should be paid.

101 Materials and Methods

Study design: This was a cross-sectional study design that involved mixed methods of data 102 collection. This study adopted a contingent valuation method (CVM) using the bidding game 103 104 technique to directly elicit or measure willingness to pay for a hypothetical (not yet on the 105 market) health insurance package (18). This approach has been used because it has been proven to be an effective way of assessing willingness to pay with minimal bias for goods that are not 106 107 presently available on the market. The CVM creates a hypothetical marketplace in which no 108 actual transactions are made; hence, this approach has been successfully used for commodities that are not exchanged in regular markets. This approach makes the assumption that people have 109 110 had no previous experience buying the health service that is going to be put on the market and 111 instead asks people their willingness to pay on the basis of their expectations and the benefits 112 attached to the service (19). In the absence of markets for public goods, this method presents consumers with hypothetical markets in which they have the (hypothetical) opportunity to buy 113 the good in question. Since the elicited WTP values are contingent upon the particular 114 115 hypothetical market described to the respondent, this approach is called the contingent valuation method (20). 116

Study setting: The study was conducted in the Iganga and Mayuge districts of eastern Uganda.
Iganga and Mayuge districts were selected purposively because they are the most poverty-hit
districts in the country and 80% of the population lives in rural areas. They also have 80–85% of

the population belonging to the informal sector (7). Iganga District is bordered by Kaliro District 120 121 to the north, Bugweri District to the east, Mayuge District to the south, Jinja District to the 122 southwest, and Luuka District to the west. With a total population of 504,197 people, 9.9% of the 123 households are 5 km or more from the nearest health facility, and 19.9% are near a public health 124 facility (UBOS, 2016). It is composed of 3 counties, 8 sub counties, 66 parishes, and 395 villages. 125 The major economic activity is farming. Mayuge district is located in south-eastern Uganda with a population of 473,2394 and a growth rate of 3.5%, and it has thirteen subcounties. The major 126 127 economic activities are farming and fishing. Mayuge district is bordered by Lake Victoria to the 128 south, as well as Jinja and Bugiri districts. It has a total of 33 landing sites where fishing activities take place. 129

Study Population: The study targeted the four major categories of informal sector workers: 1) farmers; 2) fishermen; 3) commercial cyclists; and 4) the business community (traders and market vendors) in the study area. The informal sector was chosen because they make up the largest (80%) portion of the population, without which the sustainability of the scheme will be questionable.

Sample Size: The sample size was calculated using the Kish Leslie formula (21), considering a 95% confidence interval, a 50% expected level of WTP, a 5% level of precision, a design effect of 2, and a 10% non-response rate. This gave a total sample size of 853 informal sector workers. Four focus group discussions were conducted with women (four FGDs), and three FGDs were conducted with men (in the informal sector). This number depends on the level of information saturation. This was determined by doing preliminary analysis while still in the field.

Sampling Procedure: Stratified random sampling was used in this study. For Iganga district, the 141 142 informal sector workers were divided into three major categories (strata): farmers, commercial cyclists, traders/market vendors. In Mayuge district, the informal sector workers were divided 143 144 into four categories: fishermen, farmers, commercial cyclists, and market vendors. A random 145 sample from each stratum was taken in a number proportional to the stratum's size when 146 compared to the population. In Iganga district, two subcounties were randomly selected, and five villages from each subcounty were also randomly selected. A proportionate sample of 286 147 148 households from the 10 villages was selected, and the household heads were systematically 149 selected for interviews. Seven bodaboda stages located along main roads and junctions were randomly selected, and 10 cyclists available at the time of the study were randomly selected to 150 151 participate in the interviews. A total of 84 traders were selected systematically from the two main markets for interviews. In Mayuge district, a total of 10/33 landing sites were randomly selected, 152 153 and 248 fishermen were selected from the 10 landing sites proportionate to size. Sixty-two 154 traders were randomly selected from three main markets systematically, and 62 bodaboda cyclists were randomly selected from six stages located along main roads in Mayuge town (Table 155 1). Men and women from each of the categories were purposively selected for the focus group 156 discussions. 157

Table 1: Sampling procedure per category of informal sector

Iganga district (Iganga district planning office, 2018)						
Category	Farmers/peasants	Commercial cyclists	Traders/vendors	Fisherfolk		
Proportion in	0.65	0.16	0.19			
the district						
Sample size	(0.65*440) =286	(0.16*440) =70	(0.19*440) =84	-		

Selection	2 sub counties	7 Boda boda stages	Traders were	-
procedure	(SC) and 5 villages	in the town were	systematically	
	from each SC	randomly selected,	selected for the	
	were randomly	cyclists on stage	interviews two	
	selected.	randomly selected	main markets	
	Households	to be interviewed		
	proportionate to			
	size selected.			
Mayuge distric	t	I		
Category	Farmers/peasants	Commercial cyclists	Traders/vendors	Fisherfolk
Proportion in	0.1	0.15	0.15	0.6
the district				
Sample size	(0.1*413) =41	(0.15*413) =62	(0.15*413) =62	(0.6*413) =248
Selection	One sub county	6 Boda boda stages	Traders were	10/33 landing
procedure	and two villages	in town were	systematically	sites were
	were randomly	randomly selected,	selected from 3	randomly
	selected, the	later cyclists on	main markets	selected.
	number of	stage at that time		Fishermen at
	households were	were randomly		each site were
	determined	selected to be		randomly
	proportionate to	interviewed		selected,
	size.			proportionate to
				size
Total	327	132	146	248
samples				

159

160 **Data collection methods and tools**

The willingness to pay was assessed using a contingent valuation method using the "bidding game" technique. The bidding game was used to determine the maximum premium that a respondent is willing to pay for the proposed NHI plan. A bidding game technique was chosen because of its ease of implementation and its minimal biases. In addition, many studies have found the bidding game to be very reliable (22, 23). The respondent was asked if he or she was willing to pay the starting bid. If the respondent agreed, the interviewer would raise the bid by 10% of the first bid and again ask if the respondent was willing to pay the new bid. The

interviewer continued to present the different bids until the respondent expressed an 168 169 unwillingness to pay. On the other hand, if the respondent expressed unwillingness to pay the starting bid, the interviewer lowered the bid by 10% and repeated the guery. This was continued 170 171 until a bid was reached where the respondent was willing to pay. The starting bid was 20,000 172 UGX (5.4 USD), since this was the average premium for beneficiaries in the existing community-173 based health insurance schemes in Luweero, Western Uganda, and Jinja. The proportion of those willing to pay, the average, and the median amount of money people were willing to pay were 174 175 computed. The perceived ability to pay was measured by asking respondents whether they were 176 able to pay premiums for health insurance per year and how much they could afford without foregoing other basic needs. 177

178 A semi-structured questionnaire was used to collect quantitative data such as 179 sociodemographics, WTP, perceived ability to pay, and associated factors from informal sector 180 workers. The data was collected in April and May 2019. The data collection tools were translated 181 to the local language and then back translated to English to check whether the translated questions still held informational validity. The principal investigator recruited and trained 182 research assistants so that they were familiar with the statement of the problem, objectives of 183 the study, sampling procedure, data collection tools, and plan for data collection. Research 184 185 assistants were oriented to the bidding game technique for assessing WTP. They were also taught 186 the meaning of health insurance and how it intends to be operationalized in the country. Research assistants were also trained on the basic interview techniques, such as asking questions 187 188 in a neutral manner, not showing by words or actions what answers were being expected of the 189 study participants, and how to record answers, especially from open-ended questions, without

interpreting them. The data collection tools were pre-tested in the neighboring district, Bugweri district. This was done to test the validity and ease of application of the tools. Filled electronic forms were checked at the point of data collection for completeness, and those found incomplete were completed before the respondent was discharged. The data were cleaned and edited by the research assistants before they submitted the complete forms to the server.

Focus group discussion (FGD) guides were also used to collect data from informal sector workers to understand the determinants of willingness to pay and their perceived ability to pay for the NHI. The FGDs were audio-taped. The FGD was composed of 6–8 participants. The discussion had a moderator and a note-taker, and the discussions lasted for an average of one hour. These were conducted in the local language, and these were audio recorded.

200 Data management and analysis: The quantitative data were downloaded from the server and imported into STATA 14 for cleaning and analysis. Descriptive statistics, including mean, median, 201 standard deviations, frequencies, and percentages, were obtained. The information was 202 presented in frequency distribution tables. Principal component analysis was done to generate 203 204 wealth quintiles using the demographic health survey categorization. The wealth quintiles were generated based on nine household items, which included possession of a car, motorcycle, 205 bicycle, radio, television, mobile phone, piece of land, owning a house, and having animals. 206 Inferential statistics were obtained using logistic regression. This was done in two stages: 1) 207 208 bivariate analysis was done to determine the potential variables associated with willingness to 209 pay for health insurance. Crude odds ratios at a 95% confidence interval were obtained to 210 measure the potential association. 2) A multivariate analysis was done to determine the actual

factors associated with WTP. All variables that were statistically significant at bivariate analysis and the important factors known in the literature to be statistically significant, such as socioeconomic status, occupation, and potential confounders like residence, were included in the model. Variables were tested for multicollinearity before being included in the model. The model was built step-by-step while testing it using lfit until the best model was obtained. Variables that remained statistically significant at 95% confidence were considered the factors associated with WTP for health insurance. Adjusted odds ratios were obtained as measures of association.

Qualitative data was analyzed manually using a thematic-inductive approach. The recordings were transcribed verbatim and translated from the local language (Lusoga) to English. Transcripts were read by more than two independent analysts who identified codes, sub-themes, and then organized them into themes. The information was triangulated with the quantitative data findings to gain a deeper understanding.

223 Ethics statement

The study was approved by the Makerere University, School of Public Health Higher Degrees, Research and Ethics Committee (HDREC). At the district level, permission to conduct the study was obtained from the local leaders and the District Health Office. Permission was also sought from subcounty chiefs and local council one chairpersons. The informed written consent of each individual participant was obtained at the start of the study. Confidentiality and anonymity were maintained by the use of codes.

230 Results

231 Background Characteristics of the Respondents

232	Of the 853 respondents who participated in the study, 327 (38.3%) were peasant farmers,
233	248929.1%) were fishermen, 146 (17.1%) were business people, and 132 (15.5%) were
234	commercial cyclists. The mean age of the respondents was 37.0 years (SD \pm 11.3). The majority
235	667/853 (78.2%) of the respondents were males, 783/853 (91.8%) of the household heads were
236	males, and 618/853 (72.4%) resided in rural areas. The average household size was 5 persons.
237	The median monthly income was UGX 150,000 (USD 40.5). Only 158/853 (18.5%) were in the
238	wealthiest quintile, while 349/853 (41.0%) of the households were in the second and poorest
239	wealth quintiles (Table 2).

Variable	Frequency (N=853)	Percentage (%)
Sex of respondent		
Male	667	78.2
Female	186	21.8
Sex of the household head		
Male	783	91.8
Female	70	8.2
Residence		
Rural	618	72.4
Urban	235	27.6
Marital status		
Married	694	81.4
Single	85	10.0
Separated	48	5.6
Widowed	26	3.0
Age category		
18-25	124	14.5
26-35	303	35.5
36-45	239	28.0
46-55	126	14.8
56 above	61	7.2

	Table 2: Background	Characteristics of	the Respondents
--	---------------------	--------------------	-----------------

241	Education level		
	None	51	6.0
	Primary	445	52.2
242	Secondary	280	32.8
	Tertiary	77	9.0
243	Religion		
	Muslim	304	35.6
	Protestant	276	32.4
244	Catholic	194	22.7
	Born again	53	6.2
245	SDA	26	3.1
245	Occupation		
	Farmer	327	38.3
246	Fishermen	248	29.1
	Business	146	17.1
247	Bodaboda	132	15.5
247	Wealth quintiles		
	Poorest (<-1.39)	172	20.2
248	Poor (-1.400.50)	177	20.8
	Moderate (-0.51 -0.29)	163	19.1
	Wealthy (0.30 -1.23)	183	21.5
249	Wealthiest(1.24-4.14)	158	18.5

258

259

260 Willingness to Pay for the Proposed NHI

261	The majority 695/853 (81.5%) of the respondents were willing to pay for the proposed NHI. Of
262	those willing to pay, the median willingness to pay was UGX 25,000 (USD 6.8) while the mean
263	WTP was UGX 28,950 (USD 7.8) per person, inclusive of 4 dependents per year. Only 3.8%
264	protested contributing to the scheme, and 126/853 (14.7%) gave WTP zero because they
265	believed they were too poor to pay for national health insurance (Table 3).

266 Qualitatively, most of the FGD participants were also willing to make contributions for health 267 insurance. However, others resented making contributions, as noted below:

- 268 "Sincerely, the government is meant to provide all the medical services. So, there is no way
- 269 that you can lie to us and say that the government can't provide those services..." (FGD
- 270 male-fishermen-Mayuge)

A number of FGD participants were not willing to pay because of poverty, while others criticized the government's misuse of taxes collected from the tax payer on salaries for officials rather than on health services, as noted in the guotes below.

274 *"The fact is that poverty is the biggest hindrance. Because at times you can fall sick, yet*275 *you don't have money, and you resort to borrowing from colleagues who may not even be*276 *able to help you out because they also don't have. So generally, I disagree with paying for*277 *health insurance.*" (FGD-Business Women, Mayuge District)

- 278 *"I am not willing to pay because we are always charged a lot of tax to register our*
- 279 businesses. That is all tax. Where does that tax go? Let them reduce the salary of Members
- 280 of Parliament so that part of it is utilized to buy medicine. Members of Parliament have
- 281 *no importance in our area."* (FFGD-Male-fishermen-Mayuge district)

282 Willingness to Pay with Copayments:

- A copayment is a cost-sharing arrangement where one covers a portion of the costs out of pocket
- each time one visits the health facility. Less than half, 309/695 (44.5%) of the respondents, were
- willing to co-pay. The mean co-pay amount was UGX 2,650 (USD 0.7), with a median of UGX 2000

286 (USD 0.5), each time someone accessed services. The average maximum amount of money that

- respondents were willing to pay with the copayment was UGX 23,000 (USD.6.2) and the median
- 288 was UGX 20,000 (USD.5.4) (Table 3).

Table 3: Willingness to Pay for the Proposed NHI annually

WTP	Frequency (%)	Mean	Median
Protests (WTP=0)	32 (3.8)	0	0
WTP=0	126 (14.7)	0	0
WTP>0	695(81.5)	28,950	25,000
Total	853 (100.0)	23,600	20,000
Copayment scenario			
Amount willing to copay	309/695(44.5)	2,650	2,000
WTP with co payment	309/695(44.5)	23,000	20,000

290 **Notes;** Protests-those protested attaching valuing to HI (WTP=0 but it has no economic sense).

- 292 Qualitatively, most of the FGD participants were not in support of copayments, as expressed by
- 293 one of the FGD participants.

²⁹¹ WTP=0 means willingness to pay is actually zero. WTP>0 that it is positive -WTP is above zero.

294	"I also do not support the idea that we pay money each	n time we visit the health facility,
-----	--	--------------------------------------

- 295 especially when we are paying every year. This will make people unable to access the
- 296 services, and hence the problem of access to services will not have been solved. People
- 297 are already poor, and that will mean people will continue to sell their property to go to
- 298 *health facilities."* (FGD Male Farmer)

299 Preferred Mode of Payment

- 300 Most (54.1%) respondents preferred to pay annually, while 21.0% preferred to pay per
- harvesting season. Only 13.1% wanted to pay according to their monthly income, with the
- majority (63.1%) preferring to pay 1 percent of their monthly income, followed by those who
- 303 were willing to pay 5%.

304 Perceived Ability to Pay for the Health Insurance Scheme

More than half 633/853 (74.2%) of the respondents believed that they were able to pay for health insurance, with a mean of UGX 23,000 (USD.6.2) and median of UGX 20,000 (USD.5.4) per person per year.

- 308 Regarding the perceived ability to pay, most of the FGD participants noted that most of the
- 309 people are poor and most likely may not be able to make periodic subscriptions, especially if
- 310 the money is raised more than what people earn. This was attested to, as indicated below:
- 311 "Sincerely speaking, some people cannot afford to pay money; for instance, you may find
- a very old person who is no longer earning anything, yet they also need health care."
- 313 (FGD-Boda-boda-Iganga district)

314 Another FGD participant, who was a business lady, noted that

315	"I support the idea. But not very much because of the issue of affordability. Not everyone
316	can afford to pay, and note that we earn differently. Because some of us play the role of
317	mother and father in the family, there are a lot of requirements to provide." (FGD
318	Business Women, Iganga)
319	Furthermore, most of the participants noted that setting premiums should be based on
320	people's income and ability to pay, as noted below:
321	"Since everyone earns differently, the charges should depend on how much someone
322	earns. I could be in a position to afford UGX 50,000, but yet my colleague cannot at all
323	since people in the village are used to getting free medicine. When some people are
324	asked to pay just 500shs for drugs, they will consider it unworthy because they know
325	that drugs/medication are freely given. So, if possible, we charge according to
326	people's income." (FGD: business women, Iganga district).
327	Determinants for level of Willingness to Pay for Health Insurance Scheme
328	At bi-variable analysis, wealth quintiles, having savings group membership, having a family
329	member with chronic illness, use of traditional medicine, and hearing about health insurance
330	were statistically significant for willingness to pay for health insurance. The odds of being willing
331	to pay when in the fourth wealth quintile were 2.88, compared to the odds of being willing to

- pay among those in the poorest category (COR: 2.88, 95% CI: 1.60–5.18, P<0.001). Not being in
- the saving group reduced the chances of being willing to pay for health insurance by 42%

334 compared to those who had saving group memberships (COR: 0.58, 95% CI: 0.33-0.69, P<0.001)
 335 (Table 4).

After adjusting for any confounding factors, occupation, wealth, saving group membership, use of traditional medicine, and having heard about health insurance were significantly associated with the level of willingness to pay for the proposed health insurance scheme.

339 The odds of fishermen's willingness to pay for health insurance were 1.70 compared to those of farmers after adjusting for other factors (AOR: 1.70, 95% CI: 1.04–2.79, P = 0.035). Respondents 340 in the fourth wealth quintile were 2.98 times more likely to pay for health insurance compared 341 342 to those in the poorest wealth quintile (AOR: 2.98, 95% CI: 1.56–5.65). Respondents who were not in any saving group were 0.51 times less likely to pay for the proposed health insurance 343 compared to those with saving group membership (AOR: 0.51, 95% CI: 0.34-0.76, P<0.001), and 344 individuals who had never heard about HI were 50% less willing to pay for the proposed National 345 Health Insurance compared to those who had ever heard about health insurance (AOR: 0.50, 95% 346 CI: 0.23-0.86, P = 0.032) (Table 4). 347

Table 1: Multi variable analysis of factors associated with WTP for NHI scheme.

Variable	Level of Willingness to pay		COR (95%CI)	AOR (95%CI)
	No (n=158)	Yes (n=695)		
Sex of respondent				
Male	127(80.4)	540(77.7)	1.0	
Female	31(19.6)	155(22.3)	1.18(0.76-	1.30(0.80-2.11)
			1.81)	
Residence				
Rural	110(69.6)	508(73.1)	1.0	
Urban	48(30.4)	187(26.9)	0.84(0.58-	1.09(0.52-2.26)
			1.23)	
Occupation				

Farmer	60(38.0)	267(38.4)	1.0	
Business	32(20.2)	114(15.4)	0.80(0.49-	0.59(0.26-1.35)
			1.30)	
Boda boda	25(15.8)	107(15.4)	0.96(0.57-	1.04(0.50-2.18)
			1.61)	
Fishermen	41(26.0)	207(29.8)	1.13(0.73-	1.70(1.04-2.79) *
			1.76)	
Wealth quintiles				
Poorest	43(27.2)	129(18.6)	1.0	
Second poorest	32(20.3)	145(20.9)	1.51(0.90-	1.83(1.05-3.19) *
			2.53)	
Middle	35(22.1)	128(18.4)	1.22(0.73-	1.23(0.70-2.14)
			2.03)	
Fourth	19(12.0)	164(23.6)	2.88(1.60-	2.98(1.58-5.65) *
			5.18)	
Wealthiest	29(18.4)	129(18.6)	1.48(0.87-	1.53(0.81-2.88)
			2.52)	
In saving group				
Yes	49(31.0)	337(48.5)	1.0	
No	109(69.0)	358(51.5)	0.48(0.33-	0.51(0.34-0.76) **
			0.69)	
Family member with ch				
Yes	36(22.7)	241(34.7)	1.0	
No	122(77.2)	576(67.5)	0.56(0.37-	0.73(0.46-1.14)
			0.83)	
Ability to meet health of	care			
Difficult	112(70.9)	571(82.2)	1.0	
Easy	46(29.1)	124(17.8)	0.53(0.36-	0.68(0.43-1.05)
			0.78)	
Use Traditional Medici	ine			
No	59(38.8)	345(51.4)	1.0	
Yes	93(61.2)	326(48.6)	0.60(0.42-	0.71(0.48-0.92) *
			0.86)	
Ever heard about NHI				
Yes	9(5.7)	83(11.9)	1.0	
No	149(94.3)	612(88.1)	0.45(0.22-	0.50(0.23-0.86) *
			0.91)	

349 Note: ** *p*<0.001, **P*<0.05

350

351 Discussions

Firstly, this study is unique in its assessment of the level of WTP, perceived ability to pay, and 352 353 determinants of WTP for the proposed national health insurance scheme among the informal sector workers in Uganda, who constitute 80% of the Ugandan population. These findings are 354 355 pertinent if the proposed NHI is to achieve adequate coverage. Secondly, the study applied a 356 contingent valuation approach using a bidding game technique to hypothetically elicit the informal sector's willingness to pay. The highlight of this study is the high level of willingness to 357 pay for NHI among informal sector workers, as well as their preferred modes of engagement. 358 359 These findings provide valuable insights for fine-tuning the proposed NHI.

360 The level of WTP for the proposed NHI was high, with a median willingness to pay of UGX 25,000 361 (USD 6.8) and a mean WTP of UGX 28,950 (USD 7.8) per person, inclusive of 4 dependents per 362 year. This level of willingness to pay was higher than the reported WTP in Nepal (71%) and in 363 South Sudan (68%) among the informal sector (13, 24). However, the maximum amount of 364 money people were willing to pay was lower than the 5.5 USD per person per month in Iran, 6.6 USD per person per month in Namibia, and 3 USD in Kenya per month (18, 24, 25). The differences 365 in WTP across the different countries could be due to the differences in the socio-economic status 366 367 of the different populations in the different countries. The high level of willingness to contribute to health insurance highlights high chances of the scheme being successful. However, the 368 369 suggested premium being higher than the stated WTP may hinder many from participating in the 370 scheme. But this also brings up the policy question of whether the WTP can sustain the scheme. Thus, there is a need for careful revision of the premiums before Parliament passes the NHI bill. 371

The ability to pay is another important consideration when planning to implement health insurance, especially among the informal sector, whose incomes are unpredictable. A high

number of participants believed that they could afford to make periodic contributions to the health insurance scheme in this study. This finding further highlights the potential for the NHI to succeed if the informal sector is included. However, the ability to pay needs to be considered when setting premiums, given the fact that less than 20% of the studied population were in the wealthiest category.

Although more than half of the respondents earned more than 100,000 UGX (27 USD) a month, 379 there are substantial sections of the informal sector that will struggle to pay for health insurance, 380 and therefore, these will require significant government subsidies to be included. This further 381 382 highlights the need to consider the idea of making contributions as a proportion of people's 383 earnings and wealth status because it would make people pay according to their ability and is 384 more equitable than just having a flat figure for all people. Moreover, by virtue of the unpredictable nature of their income, informal sector workers expressed the desire to have 385 386 premiums synchronized to earning cycles such as harvest seasons. This implies that the NHI will 387 have to explore flexible premium schedules for informal sector workers in order to enhance their 388 uptake of the scheme. In Ethiopia, making premium systems more flexible eased payments (26).

In this study, having a savings group membership increased the likelihood of willingness to pay for the proposed national health insurance scheme. In Asian countries, saving groups were reported to be key in initiating community-based health insurance schemes (27). Savings groups provide members with a secure place to save money, generate a pool fund, and have the opportunity to borrow in small amounts. They also provide affordable basic insurance services and enable the community to meet the premiums(27). Local savings groups have become one of the most famous financial support systems in rural Uganda over the last decade (28). Savings and

burial groups present an opportunity to leverage in enhancing access to health care in rural communities. This implies that as countries plan to initiate NHI, saving groups can become a great resource to tap into to ensure community participation and payment of the premiums for the scheme.

400 Participants belonging to the highest wealth category were more likely to pay for the proposed 401 national health insurance scheme. This is in agreement with studies conducted in Nigeria, Ethiopia, and Ghana, which have reported that socio-economic factors such as poverty, income, 402 403 or wealth status have a bearing on the ease or difficulty of enrolling in a given scheme, with high 404 premiums deterring enrollment in schemes (29-31). Similar studies conducted in Sierra Leone 405 and Iran showed that the WTP for the HI scheme depended on the monthly income of the 406 respondent (25, 32). In Nepal, belonging to a lower wealth quartile was associated with a lower 407 willingness to pay for National Health Insurance Scheme (33). This therefore underscores the 408 need for income generating projects to be implemented within the communities to aid them make contributions for health insurance. 409

410 The use of traditional medicine was negatively associated with participation in the health 411 insurance scheme. This is because members who use traditional medicine see no need to utilize modern health care services, making them less likely to pay for health insurance. Studies have 412 413 shown that the presence and use of alternative medicine and other forms of healthcare, such as herbalists, negatively affects participation in a health insurance scheme since insurance requires 414 415 regular use of modern medicine. Studies conducted in Cameroon, Burkina Faso, Nigeria, and India have reported that those who use modern medicine are more willing to pay for health insurance 416 than those who use traditional medicine (34-36). In Uganda's pluralistic health system, the 417

ministry of health and other mandated regulatory bodies need to institute measures that not
only regulate the alternative sector but ultimately attract people to use modern medicine as
opposed to traditional medicine.

It is not surprising that those who had never heard about health insurance had 50% less WTP 421 compared to those who had prior information about health insurance. Indeed, the level of 422 423 knowledge on how health insurance operates was very low, and statistical tests of significance could not be used in this study. However, one systematic review and meta-analysis of factors 424 influencing WTP for voluntary contributary health insurance schemes in LMICs has revealed that 425 knowledge and understanding of the functioning of the scheme positively influence the 426 willingness to pay for and participate in the scheme (37, 38). As the Ugandan government moves 427 to implement health insurance, information, education, and communication will be paramount 428 to the success of the proposed scheme. 429

Study Limitations: As with most contingent valuation studies, the elicitation technique is always subject to bias, and the assignment of the first bid or amount is also biased. However, this was triangulated with an open-ended question and qualitative data. The low level of knowledge about health insurance among respondents was also a limitation for attaching value to the proposed scheme. This was solved by educating the respondent about health insurance before eliciting a willingness to pay.

436 **Conclusions**

This study indicated a high level of WTP, and the majority believed they could afford to pay for
the health insurance scheme. However, studies on the ability to pay need to be conducted, as

this study is based on the perceived ability to pay for health insurance schemes. The high level of

440	WTP indicates that the informal sector is willing to make a contribution to their health, making it
441	feasible for the government to propose a flexible and affordable scheme within which the
442	informal sector can bear some costs towards their health care. To support the ability to pay, there
443	is a need to build local solidarity groups and strengthen local initiatives to aid poor members.
444	Declarations
445	Consent for publication
446	Not Applicable
447	Availability of data and materials
448	The datasets analyzed for this study are available from the corresponding author on reasonable
449	request.
450	Competing interests
451	The authors declare that they have no competing interests
452	Funding
453	The author(s) received no specific funding for this work
454	Authors' contributions
455	NN, SNK, AK conceived the study, NN collected, analyzed and wrote the first draft of the
456	manuscript. SNK and AK provided reviews on all drafts of manuscript. All the authors read and
457	approved the final manuscript.

458 Acknowledgements

We wish to thank the District Health Officers of Mayuge and Iganga districts for their cooperation, mobilization and ensuring that data collection went on smoothly. We also extend our sincere appreciation to the research assistants and all respondents in Iganga and Mayuge for sparing their time to contribute to this piece of work.

463 **References**

1. Sarker AR, Sultana M, Mahumud RA, Ahmed S, Islam Z, Morton A, et al. Determinants of

465 enrollment of informal sector workers in cooperative based health scheme in Bangladesh. PloS

466 one. 2017;12(7):e0181706.

467 2. Kiwanuka S, Ekirapa E, Peterson S, Okui O, Rahman MH, Peters D, et al. Access to and

468 utilisation of health services for the poor in Uganda: a systematic review of available evidence.

469 Transactions of the Royal Society of Tropical Medicine and Hygiene. 2008;102(11):1067-74.

WHO. Health Systems Financing: The Path to Universal Coverage. Geneva: World Health
Organization 2010.

472 4. World Bank. Financing health in low-income countries. Washington DC: World Bank473 Group; 2010.

474 5. MoH. National Health Accounts 2018/19-2020/21 Report. 2021.

475 6. Tashobya CK, Ssengooba F, Cruz VO, Yates R, Murindwa G, McPake B. Health systems
476 reforms in Uganda: processes and outputs. Christine Kirunga Tashobya FS and, Valeria Oliveira
477 Cruz, editors. 2006.

478 7. UBOS. The National Population and Housing Census 2014 – Main Report. Kampala,

479 Uganda: Uganda Bureau of Statistics; 2016.

480 8. Twaweza. Health Check: Ugandans' experiences and opinions on health services

481 Uganda: Twaweza; 2019 [Available from: <u>https://www.twaweza.org/go/szw-ug-health-check</u>.

482 9. Gottret P, Schieber G. Health financing revisited: a practitioner's guide: The World Bank;

483 2006.

484 10. Xu K, Evans DB, Carrin G, Aguilar-Rivera AM, Musgrove P, Evans T. Protecting

households from catastrophic health spending. Health affairs. 2007;26(4):972-83.

486 11. De Allegri M, Sanon M, Bridges J, Sauerborn R. Understanding consumers' preferences

487 and decision to enrol in community-based health insurance in rural West Africa. Health policy.

488 2006;76(1):58-71.

489 12. Kyomugisha E, Buregyeya E, Ekirapa E, Mugisha J, Bazeyo W. Strategies for sustainability

and equity of prepayment health schemes in Uganda. African health sciences. 2009;9(2).

491 13. Basaza R, Alier PK, Kirabira P, Ogubi D, Lako RLL. Willingness to pay for National Health

492 Insurance Fund among public servants in Juba City, South Sudan: a contingent evaluation.

493 International journal for equity in health. 2017;16(1):158.

14. Nguyen H, Knowles J. Demand for voluntary health insurance in developing countries:

the case of Vietnam's school-age children and adolescent student health insurance program.

496 Social Science & Medicine. 2010;71(12):2074-82.

497 15. Acharya A, Vellakkal S, Taylor F, Masset E, Satija A, Burke M, et al. Impact of National

498 Health Insurance for the Poor and the Informal sector in Low-and Middle-Income Countries.

London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research Unit, Institute of Education, University of London;2012.

- 16. Basaza R, Criel B, Van der Stuyft P. Community health insurance in Uganda: why does
- 502 enrolment remain low? A view from beneath. Health Policy. 2008;87(2):172-84.
- 503 17. Jowett M, Kutzin J, Organization WH. Raising revenues for health in support of UHC:

strategic issues for policy makers. World Health Organization; 2015.

- 505 18. Gustafsson-Wright E, Asfaw A, van der Gaag J. Willingness to pay for health insurance:
- 506 An analysis of the potential market for new low-cost health insurance products in Namibia.
- 507 Social science & medicine. 2009;69(9):1351-9.
- 508 19. Russell S, Fox-Rushby J, Arhina D. Willingness and ability to pay for health care: a

selection of methods and issues. Health Policy and Planning. 1995;10(1):94-101.

510 20. Mitchell RC, Carson RT. Using surveys to value public goods: the contingent valuation

- 511 method: Rff Press; 2013.
- 512 21. Kish L. Survey sampling. Inc., New York.: John Wiley and Sons; 1965.
- 513 22. Whittington D, Smith VK, Okorafor A, Okore A, Liu JL, McPhail A. Giving respondents
- time to think in contingent valuation studies: a developing country application. Journal of
- 515 Environmental Economics and Management. 1992;22(3):205-25.
- 516 23. Dong H, Kouyate B, Cairns J, Sauerborn R. A comparison of the reliability of the take-it-
- 517 or-leave-it and the bidding game approaches to estimating willingness-to-pay in a rural
- 518 population in West Africa. Social Science & Medicine. 2003;56(10):2181-9.

519 24. Barasa EW, Mwaura N, Rogo K, Andrawes L. Extending voluntary health insurance to the 520 informal sector: experiences and expectations of the informal sector in Kenya. Wellcome open 521 research. 2017;2.

522 25. Nosratnejad S, Rashidian A, Mehrara M, Sari AA, Mahdavi G, Moeini M. Willingness to

523 pay for social health Insurance in Iran. Global journal of health science. 2014;6(5):154.

524 26. Habte A, Tamene A, Ejajo T, Dessu S, Endale F, Gizachew A, et al. Towards universal

525 health coverage: The level and determinants of enrollment in the Community-Based Health

526 Insurance (CBHI) scheme in Ethiopia: A systematic review and meta-analysis. PloS one.

527 2022;17(8):e0272959.

528 27. Shaikh BT, Noorani Q, Abbas S. Community based saving groups: an innovative approach

to overcome the financial and social barriers in health care seeking by the women in the rural

remote communities of Pakistan. Archives of Public Health. 2017;75(1):57.

531 28. Mutebi A, Muhumuza Kananura R, Ekirapa-Kiracho E, Bua J, Namusoke Kiwanuka S,

532 Nammazi G, et al. Characteristics of community savings groups in rural Eastern Uganda:

533 opportunities for improving access to maternal health services. Global health action.

534 2017;10(sup4):1347363.

535 29. Kotoh AM, Aryeetey GC, Van der Geest S. Factors that influence enrolment and
536 retention in Ghana'National Health Insurance Scheme. International journal of health policy
537 and management. 2018;7(5):443.

538 30. Odeyemi IA. Community-based health insurance programmes and the national health 539 insurance scheme of Nigeria: challenges to uptake and integration. International journal for 540 equity in health. 2014;13(1):20.

541 31. Mebratie AD, Sparrow R, Yilma Z, Alemu G, Bedi AS. Enrollment in Ethiopia's

542 community-based health insurance scheme. World Development. 2015;74:58-76.

543 32. Jofre-Bonet M, Kamara J. Willingness to pay for health insurance in the informal sector

of Sierra Leone. PloS one. 2018;13(5):e0189915.

545 33. Khatiwada B, Ghimire S, N S. Willingness to pay for health insurance in mangalbare

village development committee of illam district. MOJ Public Health. 2017;5(2):43-6.

547 34. Mathiyazaghan K. Willingness to pay for rural health insurance through community

548 participation in India. The International journal of health planning and management.

549 1998;13(1):47-67.

550 35. Donfouet HPP, Mahieu P-A, Malin E. Using respondents' uncertainty scores to mitigate

551 hypothetical bias in community-based health insurance studies. The European Journal of Health

552 Economics. 2013;14(2):277-85.

36. Oriakhi H, Onemolease E. Determinants of rural household's willingness to participate in
community based health insurance scheme in Edo State, Nigeria. Studies on ethno-medicine.
2012;6(2):95-102.

556 37. Adebayo EF, Uthman OA, Wiysonge CS, Stern EA, Lamont KT, Ataguba JE. A systematic 557 review of factors that affect uptake of community-based health insurance in low-income and 558 middle-income countries. BMC health services research. 2015;15(1):543.

559 38. Dror DM, Hossain SS, Majumdar A, Koehlmoos TLP, John D, Panda PK. What factors

affect voluntary uptake of community-based health insurance schemes in low-and middle-

income countries? A systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS One. 2016;11(8):e0160479.

562