

1 **Performance of three diagnostic tests for tuberculosis**
2 **among Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) patients**
3 **presenting to a health facility in an informal urban**
4 **settlement in Nairobi, Kenya.**

5 **Eunita A. Ochola^{1¶}, Marshal M. Mweu^{2¶}**

6 ¹ Department of Medical Laboratory Science, Faculty of Health Sciences, South Eastern
7 Kenya University, Kitui, Kenya

8 ²Department of Public and Global Health, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of Nairobi,
9 Nairobi, Kenya

10

11 *Corresponding author

12 Email: echola@seku.ac.ke

13 ¶These authors contributed equally to this work.

14

15

16 Abstract

17 The absence of an accurate reference test complicates the evaluation of tuberculosis (TB)
18 diagnostic tests among people living with Human Immunodeficiency Virus (PLWHIV). The
19 objective of this study was to estimate (using Bayesian latent class models [BLCM]) the
20 sensitivity (Se), specificity (Sp) and negative and positive predictive values (NPV and PPV) of
21 sputum smear microscopy (SSM), Xpert Ultra and lipoarabinomannan antigen (LAM) tests
22 for TB among PLWHIV in Nairobi, Kenya.

23 This cross-sectional study enrolled a total of 190 patients aged ≥ 18 years with presumptive
24 TB seeking treatment at the Kibra Community Health Center Comprehensive Care Centre
25 (CCC) clinic between September 2022 and March 2023. The diagnostic data obtained from
26 the three tests were analysed using a BLCM framework to derive accuracy estimates of the
27 three diagnostic tests.

28 The Xpert Ultra assay registered a higher Se (85.0; 95% PCI [41.4 – 99.4]) compared to
29 LAM (26.8; 95% PCI [4.7 – 67.6]) and SSM (56.7 [16.4 – 97.4]). However, SSM had the
30 highest Sp (99.6; 95% PCI [97.7 – 100.0]). The Xpert Ultra assay yielded the highest overall
31 combination of Se and Sp at 80.8% (95% PCI [37.0 – 96.5]). On predictive values, SSM
32 recorded the highest PPV at 84.5% (95% PCI [38.4 – 99.4]). Nonetheless, all the tests
33 exhibited noticeably high NPVs (>96%).

34 An optimal testing approach in this low-prevalence TB setting could entail an initial
35 screening with the more sensitive Xpert Ultra test, with any resultant positives retested with
36 the more specific SSM test - a two-test serial testing strategy.

37

38

39 Introduction

40 Worldwide, tuberculosis (TB) ranks among the main causes of mortality from a single
41 pathogenic agent(1). Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) infected patients have a 20 to 30
42 fold higher probability of contracting TB(2). As of 2017, approximately 9% of the 10 million
43 new TB cases were people living with HIV (PLWHIV), with Africa accounting for a 72%
44 disproportionate share(3). Kenya ranks amid the high-TB burden nations whose primary
45 cause of death is TB(4).

46

47 In Kenya, pulmonary TB is the most prevalent type and 66% of TB cases occur among those
48 aged ≤ 44 years(5). In line with the national TB diagnosis and treatment guidelines, the
49 commencement of TB treatment is informed by bacteriological confirmation of *Mycobacterium*
50 *tuberculosis* (MTB). However, clinical diagnosis where bacteriological confirmation is not
51 possible may suffice for initiation of treatment(6).

52

53 Sputum smear microscopy (SSM) has been the main diagnostic tool for TB especially in
54 developing countries (7). It is extensively used because it is easy to run, rapid, inexpensive
55 and has high specificity (Sp) for TB diagnosis (8, 9). Nevertheless, it has a limited sensitivity
56 (Se) of approximately 10,000 TB bacilli/ml of sputum. Notably, its poor Se poses a challenge
57 for diagnosis of TB in PLWHIV since they have fewer bacilli in their sputum (10).

58

59 Diagnostic tests with improved Se and rapid turnaround time among PLWHIV could lead
60 to improved patient outcomes, reduced mortality and lower progressive transmission of TB
61 (11). The real time polymerase chain reaction (PCR) assay utilizing the gene Xpert platform
62 such as Xpert Ultra, offers better test Se and Sp with ability to discriminate between
63 tuberculous and non-tuberculous mycobacteria(12). Moreover, the test may detect at least

64 15.6 Colony forming units (CFU) of MTB/ml in sputum samples in under two hours(12).
65 Nonetheless, the technical and operational cost implications of the diagnostic test in resource-
66 limited settings remain a challenge(13, 14).

67

68 With sputum production among HIV infected individuals being limited(15), the need for
69 alternative biological specimens for the diagnosis of TB arises. A rapid
70 immunochromatographic test detecting the *Mycobacterium* cell wall antigen
71 lipoarabinomannan (LAM) in urine samples is available as a point-of-care test for TB (16).
72 The test is easy to run, has no need for specialized equipment or laboratory facilities and
73 results are obtainable within 25 minutes – rendering the test field applicable. Moreover,
74 among PLWHIV, the test displays high Sp, with Se increasing with diminishing CD4
75 counts(15-18).

76

77 Diagnostic studies evaluating the performance of SSM, Xpert Ultra and TB LAM among
78 PLWHIV have previously been conducted globally (19, 20). A major shortcoming of these
79 evaluations is that the index tests were evaluated against imperfect reference standards, thus
80 introducing bias in the accuracy estimates of the evaluated tests(21). A superior alternative
81 involves the use of latent class models fit using Bayesian methods that allow for concurrent
82 evaluation of Se and Sp of two or more tests without prior knowledge of the unobserved
83 disease status of individuals(22). Consequently, the objective here was to estimate the Se and
84 Sp as well as the predictive values of SSM, Xpert Ultra and LAM tests for TB among HIV
85 patients within an informal outpatient setting using a Bayesian latent class model (BLCM)
86 framework.

87

88

89 **Materials and Methods**

90 **Study setting, design and population.**

91 The study was carried out at the Kibra Community Health Centre; a level three state-run
92 facility located in the southern part of Nairobi. Notably, the facility serves an immediate large
93 informal-settlement population characterised by a high dual burden of HIV/AIDS and TB,
94 which are leading causes of mortality in slums(23). It registers around 150-200 out-patients
95 daily, conducts approximately 50-60 deliveries monthly and offers comprehensive care clinic
96 (CCC) services to over 1,500 patients per month.

97 A facility-based cross-sectional study was employed to evaluate the performance of the three
98 diagnostic tests for TB. The rationale for the choice of this design stems not only from the
99 descriptive nature of the study but also the ease of recruitment of study participants
100 presenting to the CCC clinic for care.

101 **Sample size and participant selection**

102 The required sample size was derived using the McNemar's sample size formula for paired
103 proportions(24):

$$104 \quad n_{per\ test} = \left(\frac{Z_{\alpha/2} \sqrt{p_{disc}} + Z_{\beta} \sqrt{p_{disc} - p_{diff}^2}}{p_{diff}} \right)^2$$

$$105 \quad p_{disc} = (1 - Se_1) + (1 - Se_2)$$

$$106 \quad p_{diff} = (1 - Se_1) - (1 - Se_2)$$

107

108 Where: $n_{per\ test}$ = sample size required for each test, $Z_{\frac{\alpha}{2}}$ (1.96) is the value required for the
109 two-sided 95% confidence level, and Z_{β} (-0.84) is the value specifying the desired power of
110 80%. Se_1 and Se_2 are estimates of Se of the Gene xpert MTB/RIF and SSM respectively from
111 literature i.e. Se_1 is 90.3% and Se_2 is 67.1% (25).

112 As per the above mentioned figures, a total sample size of 190 was generated, after an upward
113 adjustment by 5% to account for non-response.

114 To obtain the required sample, individuals visiting the hospital's CCC clinic were
115 systematically random sampled in their order of arrival where every seventh person (after an
116 initial random start) who met the eligibility criteria was selected. Eligibility was limited to
117 PLWHIV (symptomatic or asymptomatic for TB) aged ≥ 18 years who at the time of
118 recruitment (28th September 2022- 31st March 2023) were visiting the CCC at the facility for
119 care and consented to participation in the study. Importantly, recruitment followed triage by
120 the clinic nurse and examination by a physician.

121 **Ethical considerations**

122 Written permission to conduct this study was obtained from and approved from the Kenyatta
123 National Hospital -University of Nairobi Ethics and Research Committee (Ref. No.
124 KNH/ERC/R/145 and KNH/ ERC/Mod & SAE/347), the Nairobi metropolitan Services
125 (Ref. No. EOP/NMS/HS/222), as well as the National Commission for Technology and
126 Innovation (NACOSTI) (Ref. No. NACOSTI/P/21/14098). Moreover, a written informed
127 consent was secured from individual patients prior to enrolling them into the study.

128

129 **Sample collection**

130 Participants were provided with clear instructions on collection of urine and sputum samples.
131 Of note, the LAM and SSM tests were carried out immediately at the facility's laboratory by
132 a trained laboratorian. Samples for the Xpert Ultra assay were stored in cooler boxes and
133 delivered to a referral laboratory for processing. On enrolment, the participants'
134 sociodemographic characteristics (age, sex, marital status, level of education, area of
135 residence, occupation and highly active antiretroviral therapy status (HAART) were
136 recorded.

137

138 **Target condition**

139 The infection (latent) status being targeted by the three tests (Xpert Ultra, SSM and LAM)
140 constitutes a respiratory or urine sample carrying either the live MTB, its DNA or cell wall
141 LAM antigen at any concentration.

142 **Sputum Smear Microscopy (SSM)**

143 This was performed as per standard guidelines(7). Briefly, a sputum smear covering 2cm by
144 1 cm on the centre of the slide was prepared immediately after receipt of the sample. The
145 smears were then stained with the primary stain 1% Carbol fuchsin for a period not exceeding
146 10 minutes. Decolourisation was then performed by flooding the slides with 25% sulphuric
147 acid for 3 minutes and subsequently the counterstain 0.1% methylene blue was added for 1
148 minute. Slides were rinsed before every staining stage and excess water drained by gently
149 tilting each slide. The slides were thereafter examined under a light microscope at 100x
150 magnification. *Mycobacterium* quantification was achieved by counting the acid fast bacteria
151 (AFB) as per the International Union Against TB and Lung Disease recommended grading

152 of sputum smear microscopy(7). For analytical purposes, AFB counts above zero constituted
153 a positive result; otherwise negative.

154 **Gene Xpert Mycobacterium/ Rifampicin Ultra (Xpert Ultra)**

155 This was carried out as described elsewhere(26). Briefly, a sample reagent (a constitution of
156 sodium hydroxide and Isopropanol) was added into a sputum sample in a ratio of 2:1 for
157 liquefaction and inactivation of the sputum. The mixture was then vigorously shaken and
158 incubated at room temperature for 15 minutes. The liquefied specimen was afterwards
159 pipetted into the test cartridge (Cat. No. 42722, Cepheid). The pre-labelled test cartridge was
160 loaded into the MTB/RIF test platform (Cepheid) where automated testing commenced. The
161 semi-nested real time amplification and detection occurred in an integrated reaction tube and
162 the results were printed. Results were interpreted as positive when MTB was detected.

163 **Lateral Flow Urine Lipoarabinomannan (LAM)**

164 Alere Determine™ TB LAM antigen kit (Cat No. 238237, Abbott Diagnostics Scarborough)
165 was used to test for the presence of TB LAM antigen in collected urine samples. This was
166 executed as per the instructions in the Alere Determine™ TB LAM antigen manual (27). A
167 total of 60ul of urine was added into the strip sample well. In order to allow for the urine to
168 flow towards both the test and control windows, the strip was incubated at room temperature
169 for 25 minutes. A positive result was denoted by the appearance of two colour bands; one band
170 on the control line being indicative of a negative result.

171 **Statistical analysis**

172 A Bayesian latent class model fitted in OpenBUGS v3.2.2(28) but called from R software
173 through the 'BRugs' package(29) was used to estimate the TB prevalence, Se and Sp of the
174 three tests together with their predictive values. The guidelines for standards for reporting

175 diagnostic accuracy studies that use BLCMs were used to inform the analysis and reporting
176 of the results (30). The model code is available as underlying data(31).

177

178 Three assumptions are necessary when fitting a BLCM(32). Firstly, the tests should be
179 conditionally independent given the TB infection status. This was met since microscopy
180 targets the live bacterium, Xpert Ultra amplifies and detects the *Mycobacterium* DNA and TB
181 LAM detects the *Mycobacterium* cell wall LAM antigen. Hence, the probability of testing
182 either positive or negative on one diagnostic tool did not depend on the outcome of the other
183 tests. Secondly, the Se and Sp of the tests being evaluated should be constant across the
184 subpopulations studied. With a single target population, as was the case here, the tests'
185 constancy premise was likely to be upheld. Thirdly, the target population should consist of
186 two or more subpopulations with different prevalences. In situations where only a single
187 population exists, at least three tests are necessary to provide sufficient degrees of freedom to
188 achieve model identifiability (30)

189

190 A multinomial distribution was assumed for the counts (O) of the different test combinations
191 (e. g. +, +, +) and took the form below:

$$192 \quad O \mid Se_i Sp_i P \sim \text{multinomial} (Prob, n)$$

193 Where Se_i and Sp_i reflect the specific test characteristics of the individual tests ($i = 1, 2, 3$),
194 P denotes the prevalence for the singular population, $Prob$ is a vector of probabilities of
195 observing different test combinations and n denotes the sample size of the study population.
196 As an illustration, the probability of an individual testing positive on all three tests is given
197 by:

198

$$199 \quad Prob = \Pr(T_1^+ T_2^+ T_3^+ | D^+) + \Pr(T_1^+ T_2^+ T_3^+ | D^-)$$

200
$$= Se_1 Se_2 Se_3 P + [1 - Sp_1][1 - Sp_2][1 - Sp_3][1 - P]$$

201 With three tests, a total of seven degrees of freedom was sufficient to estimate the required
202 seven parameters (the Se and Sp of the three tests together with the single population
203 prevalence). Since there was no reliable prior information for any of the tests, uninformative
204 priors (*beta* (1, 1)) were used as initial parameters for the model.

205 The positive predictive value (PPV) and negative predictive value (NPV) of the test (*i*) were
206 estimated as follows:

207
$$ppv_i = PSe_i / (PSe_i + [1 - P][1 - Sp_i])$$

208
$$npv_i = [1 - P]Sp_i / (P[1 - Se_i] + [1 - P]Sp_i)$$

209 Two Markov Chain Monte Carlo chains each having different values were used to initialise
210 the Bayesian model. Convergence of the chains was then evaluated via the time series plots of
211 selected variables and the Gelman-Rubin diagnostic plots. The posterior distributions of the
212 test estimates (Se, Sp and the predictive values) and the population prevalence were reported
213 as the median and the associated 95% posterior credible intervals (PCI). The Youden index
214 which is a measure of a test's overall diagnostic ability was also computed as : $Se + Sp - 1$
215 (33).

216 Results

217 Of the 190 participants, two were unable to provide all the required samples and were thus
218 excluded from the analysis. Another five were excluded on the basis of their Xpert Ultra
219 results being invalid.

220 The sociodemographic characteristics and information on HAART status is as shown in
221 Table 1. The median age of the participants was 43 years (Range: 19 – 82 yrs). The majority
222 of participants were female (64.0%, n=117), married (60.7%, n=111), with only 2.2% (n=4)

223 lacking a formal education. A substantial percentage of the participants was on HAART
224 (97.5%, n=178).

225

226 **Table 1: Summary statistics on the sociodemographic characteristics and information**

227 **on HAART status for HIV patients presenting to a primary health facility in an**

228 **informal settlement, Nairobi County, Kenya. (n=183)**

Variable	Values	Median	Range	Frequency n (%)
Age				
		43	19-82	
Weight				
		60	40-101	
Sex				
	Male			66(36.1)
	Female			117(64.0)
Marital status				
	Married			111(60.7)
	Single			50(27.3)
	Separated/ divorced			18(9.8)
	Widowed			4(2.2)
Level of education				
	None			4(2.2)
	Primary			91(49.7)
	Secondary			69(37.7)
	Tertiary			19(10.4)
Area of residence				
	Formal			60(32.8)
	Informal			123(67.2)
Occupation				
	Employed			67(36.6)
	Unemployed			116(63.4)
HAART				
	Naïve			5(2.7)
	Experienced			178(97.3)

229 HAART; Highly Active Antiretroviral Therapy

230

231 The cross-tabulated counts of the tests' outcomes are displayed in Table 2.

232 **Table 2: Cross- classified results for LAM, Xpert Ultra and SSM tests for diagnosis of**
 233 **TB among PLWHIV presenting to the Kibra Community Health Centre CCC clinic,**
 234 **Nairobi County, Kenya. (n=183)**

Cross-tabulated counts of the three test outcomes

Stratum	Test outcomes combinations (LAM, XPRT ULTRA & SSM)								Total (%)
	+++	++-	+ -+	- ++	+ - -	- + -	- - +	- - -	
Single population	1	1	0	3	21	8	0	149	183 (100%)

235 LAM; Lipoaribomannan, SSM; Sputum Smear Microscopy

236

237 The estimates of the Se and Sp of the three tests, along with their respective predictive values
 238 and the prevalence of MTB infection are shown in Table 3. The Xpert Ultra assay registered
 239 a higher Se (85.0; 95% PCI [41.4 – 99.4]) compared to LAM (26.8; 95% PCI [4.7 – 67.6])
 240 and SSM (56.7 [16.4 – 97.4]). However, SSM displayed the highest Sp (99.6; 95% PCI [97.7
 241 – 100.0]). As per the Youden indices, Xpert Ultra yielded the highest overall combination of
 242 Se and Sp at 80.8% (95% PCI [37.0 – 96.5]). On predictive values, SSM recorded the highest
 243 PPV at 84.5% (95% PCI [38.4 – 99.4]). Nonetheless, all the tests exhibited noticeably high
 244 NPVs (>96%). The true prevalence of MTB infection in this HIV-infected outpatient
 245 population was 4.1% (95% PCI [1.2 – 11.2]).

246

247 **Table 3. Estimates of prevalence, sensitivity, and specificity of LAM, Gene Xpert**
 248 **Ultra, and SSM tests for MTB infection among HIV patients as well as their**
 249 **corresponding predictive values and Youden indices.**

Parameter	Estimate (95% PCI)
Se_{LAM}	26.8 (4.7 – 67.6)
Se_{Xpert}	85.0 (41.4 – 99.4)
Se_{SSM}	56.7 (16.4 – 97.4)
Sp_{LAM}	87.6 (82.1 – 92.0)
Sp_{Xpert}	96.0 (91.6 – 99.6)
Sp_{SSM}	99.6 (97.7 – 100)
P	4.1 (1.2 – 11.2)
NPV_{LAM}	96.7 (89.7 – 99.3)
NPV_{Xpert}	99.4 (95.1 – 100)
NPV_{SSM}	98.3 (91.5 – 100)
PPV_{LAM}	8.3 (1.1 – 26.8)
PPV_{Xpert}	45.3 (13.5 – 94.8)
PPV_{SSM}	84.5 (38.4 – 99.4)
$Y.index_{LAM}$	14.3 (-8.9 – 55.6)
$Y.index_{Xpert}$	80.8 (37.0 – 96.5)
$Y.index_{SSM}$	56.2 (15.7 – 96.8)

251 Se; Sensitivity, Sp; Specificity, PCI; Posterior confidence interval, LAM; Lipoaribomannan, P;

252 Prevalence, NPV; Negative predictive value, PPV; Positive predictive values

253

254

255 Discussion

256 This study has utilized Bayesian latent class analysis for the estimation of the accuracy of
257 SSM, Xpert Ultra and LAM tests (together with their corresponding predictive values) for
258 the diagnosis of TB infection among PLWHIV. This is a key strength in this study since
259 BLCM allows for the estimation of index tests' characteristics devoid of classification errors
260 typically inherent in traditional evaluation studies employing the use of imperfect reference
261 standards(21). Accordingly, the estimates obtained from this study can be considered
262 generalisable to settings with similar MTB burden among PLWHIV.

263

264 On Se, Xpert Ultra assay recorded the highest Se of the three tests. This result is in agreement
265 with previous reports that demonstrated the superiority of Xpert Ultra Se over other tests in
266 TB screening and diagnosis among PLWHIV in outpatient settings. In particular, in a
267 systematic review involving studies conducted in high TB prevalence settings among
268 PLWHIV, the Xpert Ultra test Se ranged between 81% - 90%(20). The superiority of the
269 test's Se owes to its low detection limit of tubercle bacilli (16 CFU/ ml of sputum)(34)
270 compared to SSM whose threshold is 5,000 - 10,000 CFU/ ml of sputum (35) and LAM at ~
271 2000 CFU / ml (36, 37).

272 The LAM test exhibited the lowest Se in the diagnosis of TB in the present study. This
273 performance is comparable with findings from studies carried out in other outpatient settings.
274 For instance, among existing, ART-naïve and newly diagnosed HIV patients presenting to
275 outpatient facilities in LMICs, LAM's Se was found to range between 25% - 30% (17, 36, 38,
276 39). Notably, an inverse relationship has been demonstrated, with LAM's test Se increasing
277 with reducing CD4 counts among critically ill HIV patients(17, 40). LAM Se was observed

278 to be at its highest ($\geq 65\%$) among patients with CD4 counts < 50 cells/ul and Se of 35% - 55%
279 for patients with CD4 counts between 100 and 200 cells/ul respectively (17, 40). Increased
280 uptake of ARV therapy in the present study setting may have contributed to improved CD4
281 counts in the patient population resulting in a low Se of the LAM test - underscoring its
282 limited utility in this setting. SSM registered a test Se of 56.7% which falls within the 18% -
283 94.2% range observed in other studies(41, 42). The wide variability in performance is
284 attributable to the number of CFUs available in a sample, with Se increasing with higher
285 CFUs. Moreover, the test Se is also highly dependent on user expertise and other technical
286 and operational factors (42).

287 As regards Sp, SSM exhibited the highest which is consistent with findings from studies
288 carried out in outpatient settings among PLWHIV(43, 44). The Sp displayed by LAM is also
289 corroborated by findings from other studies carried out in similar low-resource settings
290 where specificities ranging between $>90\%$ - 100% were registered (36, 38, 45, 46). Xpert Ultra
291 Sp is in agreement with specificities found in other similar settings where the test Sp was
292 reported to range between 78% - 96% (20, 47).

293 False negative and false positive results compromise Se and Sp estimates respectively. As for
294 LAM and SSM, false negative results are more likely to occur in patients with bacterial load
295 below the tests detection limits(48). Additionally, LAM is more likely to give false negative
296 results in patients who have already received anti-TB treatment(49). False positive results by
297 LAM have been demonstrated in samples contaminated with non-Mycobacterial pathogens
298 such as *Nocardia* and *Candida* spp. that similarly exhibit LAM-like glycoprotein antigen(46).
299 SSM is also unable to distinguish MTB from other smear-positive *Mycobacteria* spp.(50). False
300 positives by Xpert Ultra could be attributable to detection of MTB DNA in patients recently
301 cured of TB (44).

302

303 Notably, in this population, the three tests' sensitivities displayed wide credible intervals
304 (signifying low precision of the estimates) since there were few diseased individuals. In
305 contrast, the tests' Sp's demonstrated high precision owing to the significant number of truly
306 non-diseased individuals. Overall, in this low-prevalence TB setting, Xpert Ultra affords good
307 promise for informing treatment and surveillance for TB among PLWHIV.

308

309 With low MTB prevalence (4.1%), generally low PPVs but high NPVs would be anticipated
310 for the three tests. These estimates signify a stronger confidence in a negative than a positive
311 test result. Consequently, in this low-prevalence setting where the probability of false
312 positives is highly contemplated, a multiple testing strategy with serial interpretation of the
313 test results may be necessary in order to raise the confidence in a positive test result. This
314 could entail an initial screening with the more sensitive Xpert Ultra test, with any resulting
315 positives followed up with the more specific SSM test. This approach should assure that false
316 positive individuals are not unnecessarily subjected to protracted therapy for TB.

317 **Conclusions**

318 The Xpert Ultra assay registered the highest Se compared to SSM and LAM. However, SSM
319 registered the highest Sp and thus PPV estimate. Nevertheless, the three tests recorded
320 similar NPVs. Owing to the low prevalence of TB in the study setting, an optimal testing
321 approach could entail an initial screening with the more sensitive Xpert Ultra assay, with any
322 resultant positives re-tested with the more specific SSM test – a serial testing strategy - to
323 bolster the overall PPV of a TB testing and surveillance programme.

324

325 **Acknowledgments**

326 The authors sincerely thank the study participants, the administration and staff at Kibra
327 Community Health Centre for making it possible to realise this research work.

328

329

330 **References**

331 1. WHO. World Health Organization annual report 2019 WHO Country Office
332 Lebanon: health for all. Cairo: World Health Organization. Regional Office for the Eastern
333 Mediterranean, 2020 2020-06. Report No.: 9789290223207.

334

335 2. WHO. WHO meeting report of a technical expert consultation: non-inferiority
336 analysis of Xpert MTF/RIF Ultra compared to Xpert MTB/RIF. Geneva: World Health
337 Organization. Geneva: 2017.

338

339 3. World Health O. Global tuberculosis report 2018. Geneva: World Health
340 Organization, 2018 2018. Report No.: 9789241565646.

341

342 4. Enos M, Sitienei J, Ong'ang'o J, Mungai B, Kamene M, Wambugu J, et al. Kenya
343 tuberculosis prevalence survey 2016: Challenges and opportunities of ending TB in Kenya.
344 PLoS One. 2018;13(12):e0209098. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0209098. PubMed PMID:
345 30586448; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC6306266.

346

347 5. MOH. Kenya Tuberculosis Prevalence Survey: Final Survey Report. Nairobi, Kenya:
348 2016.

349

350 6. MOH. Guidelines for management of Tuberculosis and Leprosy in Kenya. Nairobi,
351 Kenya: 2013.

- 352 7. Dawson D, Akhtar M, Bretzel G, Boulahbal F, Fattorini L, Feldmann K, et al.
353 Technical guide sputum examination for Tuberculosis by direct microscopy in low income
354 countries. 2000.
355
- 356 8. Akanbi MO, Achenbach C, Taiwo B, Idoko J, Ani A, Isa Y, et al. Evaluation of gene
357 xpert for routine diagnosis of HIV-associated tuberculosis in Nigeria: A prospective cohort
358 study. *BMC Pulm Med.* 2017;17(1):87. doi: 10.1186/s12890-017-0430-6. PubMed PMID:
359 28558662; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC5450144.
360
- 361 9. Gelaw B, Shiferaw Y, Alemayehu M, Bashaw AA. Comparison of loop-mediated
362 isothermal amplification assay and smear microscopy with culture for the diagnostic accuracy
363 of tuberculosis. *BMC Infect Dis.* 2017;17(1):79. doi: 10.1186/s12879-016-2140-8. PubMed
364 PMID: 28095790; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC5240421.
365
- 366 10. Behr MA, Warren SA, Salamon H, Hopewell PC, de Leon AP, Daley CL, et al.
367 Transmission of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* from patients smear-negative for acid-fast
368 bacilli. *The Lancet.* 1999;353(9151):444-9. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(98)03406-0.
369
- 370 11. Steingart KR, Schiller I, Horne DJ, Pai M, Boehme CC, Dendukuri N. Xpert(R)
371 MTB/RIF assay for pulmonary tuberculosis and rifampicin resistance in adults. *Cochrane*
372 *Database Syst Rev.* 2014(1):CD009593. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD009593.pub3. PubMed
373 PMID: 24448973; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC4470349.
374
- 375 12. Chakravorty S SA, Rowneki, M PH, Cao Y, Ryan J, Banada PP,, Deshpande S SS, Gall
376 A, Glass J,, Krieswirth B SS, Nabeta P,, Tukvadze N RC, Skrahina A, Tagliani E,, Cirillo DM

377 DA, Denkinger CM, Persing, et al. The new Xpert MTB/RIF Ultra: improving detection of
378 Mycobacterium tuberculosis and resistance to rifampin in an assay suitable for point-of-care
379 testing. American Society for Microbiology. 2017;Volume 8(Issue 4).

380

381 13. Steingart KR, Schiller I, Horne DJ, Pai M, Boehme CC, N D. Xpert® MTB/RIF assay
382 for pulmonary tuberculosis and rifampicin resistance in adults (Review). JohnWiley & Sons,
383 Ltd. 2014. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD009593.pub3.

384

385 14. Stephen D. Lawn, Sophie V. Brooks, Kranzer K, MPN, Andrew Whitelaw, Monica
386 Vogt, et al. Screening for HIV-Associated Tuberculosis and Rifampicin Resistance before
387 Antiretroviral Therapy Using the Xpert MTB/RIF Assay: A Prospective Study. PLOS
388 MEDICINE. 2011;8. doi: 10.1371/journal.pmed.1001067.

389

390 15. Peter J, Green C, Hoelscher M, Mwaba P, Zumla A, Dheda K. Urine for the diagnosis
391 of tuberculosis: current approaches, clinical applicability, and new developments. Curr Opin
392 Pulm Med. 2010;16(3):262-70. doi: 10.1097/MCP.0b013e328337f23a. PubMed PMID:
393 20375787; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC5454484.

394

395 16. Huerga H, Ferlazzo G, Bevilacqua P, Kirubi B, Ardizzoni E, Wanjala S, et al.
396 Incremental Yield of Including Determine-TB LAM Assay in Diagnostic Algorithms for
397 Hospitalized and Ambulatory HIV-Positive Patients in Kenya. PLoS One.
398 2017;12(1):e0170976. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0170976. PubMed PMID: 28125693;
399 PubMed Central PMCID: PMC5268475.

400

- 401 17. Drain PK, Losina E, Coleman SM, Giddy J, Ross D, Katz JN, et al. Diagnostic accuracy
402 of a point-of-care urine test for tuberculosis screening among newly-diagnosed HIV-infected
403 adults: a prospective, clinic-based study. *BMC infectious diseases*. 2014;14:110. Epub
404 2014/02/28. doi: 10.1186/1471-2334-14-110. PubMed PMID: 24571362; PubMed Central
405 PMCID: PMCPmc3944827.
- 406
- 407 18. Shah M, Hanrahan C, Wang ZY, Dendukuri N, Lawn SD, Denkinger CM, et al.
408 Lateral flow urine lipoarabinomannan assay for detecting active tuberculosis in HIV-positive
409 adults. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*. 2016(5):CD011420. doi:
410 10.1002/14651858.CD011420.pub2. PubMed PMID: 27163343; PubMed Central PMCID:
411 PMCPMC4916932.
- 412
- 413 19. Cattamanchi A, Dowdy DW, Davis JL, Worodria W, Yoo S, Joloba M, et al.
414 Sensitivity of direct versus concentrated sputum smear microscopy in HIV-infected patients
415 suspected of having pulmonary tuberculosis. *BMC Infect Dis*. 2009;9:53. doi: 10.1186/1471-
416 2334-9-53. PubMed PMID: 19419537; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC2690598.
- 417
- 418 20. Zifodya JS, Kreniske JS, Schiller I, Kohli M, Dendukuri N, Schumacher SG, et al.
419 Xpert Ultra versus Xpert MTB/RIF for pulmonary tuberculosis and rifampicin resistance in
420 adults with presumptive pulmonary tuberculosis. *The Cochrane database of systematic*
421 *reviews*. 2021;2:CD009593. doi: 10.1002/14651858.CD009593.pub5. PubMed PMID:
422 33616229.
- 423
- 424 21. Claes Enøe, Marios P Georgiadis, Johnson WO. Estimation of sensitivity and
425 specificity of diagnostic tests and disease prevalence when the true disease state is unknown,
426 *Preventive Veterinary Medicine*. 2000;45(1-2):61-81.

- 427 22. Joseph L, Gyorkos TW, Coupal L. Bayesian estimation of disease prevalence and the
428 parameters of diagnostic tests in the absence of a gold standard. American journal of
429 epidemiology. 1995;141(3):263-72. Epub 1995/02/01. doi:
430 10.1093/oxfordjournals.aje.a117428. PubMed PMID: 7840100.
431
- 432 23. Beguy D, Elung'ata P, Mberu B, Oduor C, Wamukoya M, Nganyi B, et al. Health &
433 Demographic Surveillance System Profile: The Nairobi Urban Health and Demographic
434 Surveillance System (NUHDSS). International journal of epidemiology. 2015;44(2):462-71.
435 doi: 10.1093/ije/dyu251. PubMed PMID: 25596586.
436
- 437 24. Connor RJ. Sample size for testing differences in proportions for the paired-sample
438 design. Biometrics. 1987;43(1):207-11. Epub 1987/03/01. PubMed PMID: 3567305.
439
- 440 25. Boehme CC, Nicol MP, Nabeta P, Michael JS, Gotuzzo E, Tahirli R, et al. Feasibility,
441 diagnostic accuracy, and effectiveness of decentralised use of the Xpert MTB/RIF test for
442 diagnosis of tuberculosis and multidrug resistance: a multicentre implementation study. The
443 Lancet. 2011;377(9776):1495-505. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(11)60438-8.
444
- 445 26. Raja S, Ching J, Xi L, Hughes SJ, Chang R, Wong W, et al. Technology for automated,
446 rapid, and quantitative PCR or reverse transcription-PCR clinical testing. Clin Chem.
447 2005;51(5):882-90. doi: 10.1373/clinchem.2004.046474. PubMed PMID: 15746302.
448
- 449 27. Abbott. Determine™ TB LAM Ag SAVING LIVES with early TB diagnosis in people
450 with HIV. 2010.

- 451 28. Lunn D, Spiegelhalter D, Thomas A, Best N. The BUGS project: Evolution, critique
452 and future directions. *Stat Med.* 2009;28(25):3049-67. doi: 10.1002/sim.3680. PubMed
453 PMID: 19630097.
- 454
- 455 29. Thomas A, O'Hara, R, Ligges, U & Sturtz,. 'Making BUGS open', *R News.*, 2006.
- 456
- 457 30. Kostoulas P, Nielsen SS, Branscum AJ, Johnson WO, Dendukuri N, Dhand NK, et al.
458 STARD-BLCM: Standards for the Reporting of Diagnostic accuracy studies that use
459 Bayesian Latent Class Models. *Preventive veterinary medicine.* 2017;138:37-47. doi:
460 10.1016/j.prevetmed.2017.01.006. PubMed PMID: 28237234.
- 461
- 462 31. Eunita A. Replication Data for: Evaluation of the performance of three diagnostic tests
463 for Tuberculosis among HIV patients presenting to a health facility in an informal urban
464 settlement in Nairobi county, Kenya. DRAFT VERSION ed: Harvard Dataverse; 2023.
- 465
- 466 32. Hui SL, Walter SD. Estimating the Error Rates of Diagnostic Tests. *Biometrics.*
467 1980;36(1):167-71. doi: 10.2307/2530508.
- 468
- 469 33. Schisterman EF, Perkins NJ, Liu A, Bondell H. Optimal Cut-Point and Its
470 Corresponding Youden Index to Discriminate Individuals Using Pooled Blood Samples.
471 *Epidemiology.* 2005;16(1):73-81.
- 472
- 473 34. Helb D, Jones M, Story E, Boehme C, Wallace E, Ho K, et al. Rapid detection of
474 *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* and rifampin resistance by use of on-demand, near-patient
475 technology. *Journal of clinical microbiology.* 2010;48(1):229-37. doi: 10.1128/JCM.01463-09.
476 PubMed PMID: 19864480; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC2812290.

477 35. Behr MA, Warren SA, Salamon H, Hopewell PC, Ponce de Leon A, Daley CL, et al.
478 Transmission of Mycobacterium tuberculosis from patients smear-negative for acid-fast
479 bacilli. *Lancet*. 1999;353(9151):444-9. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(98)03406-0. PubMed PMID:
480 9989714.

481
482 36. Nakiyingi L, Moodley VM, Manabe YC, Nicol MP, Holshouser M, Armstrong DT, et
483 al. Diagnostic accuracy of a rapid urine lipoarabinomannan test for tuberculosis in HIV-
484 infected adults. *Journal of acquired immune deficiency syndromes*. 2014;66(3):270-9. doi:
485 10.1097/QAI.000000000000151. PubMed PMID: 24675585; PubMed Central PMCID:
486 PMC4146703.

487
488 37. Kawasaki M, Echiverri C, Raymond L, Cadena E, Reside E, Gler MT, et al.
489 Lipoarabinomannan in sputum to detect bacterial load and treatment response in patients
490 with pulmonary tuberculosis: Analytic validation and evaluation in two cohorts. *PLoS Med*.
491 2019;16(4):e1002780. doi: 10.1371/journal.pmed.1002780. PubMed PMID: 30978194;
492 PubMed Central PMCID: PMC6461223 following competing interests: MK, TO, RI, RH and
493 KK are employees of Otsuka Pharmaceutical Co., Ltd. YL is an employee of Otsuka
494 Pharmaceutical Development & Commercialization, Inc., which is a subsidiary of Otsuka
495 Pharmaceutical Co., Ltd. During the conduct of the clinical studies, MTG was an employee
496 of Otsuka (Philippines) Pharmaceutical Inc., which is a subsidiary of Otsuka Pharmaceutical
497 Co., Ltd. The rest of the authors declare no conflicts of interest associated with this
498 manuscript. The corresponding author had full access to all the data in the study and had final
499 responsibility for the decision to submit for publication.

500
501 38. Balcha TTW, N. Sturegard, E. Skogmar, S. Reepalu, A., Jemal ZH, Tibesso G, Schon
502 T, Bjorkman P. Detection of lipoarabinomannan in urine for identification of active

503 tuberculosis among HIV-positive adults in Ethiopian health centres. *Tropical medicine &*
504 *international health : TM & IH.* 2014;19(6):734-42. doi: 10.1111/tmi.12308. PubMed PMID:
505 24684481.

506

507 39. Stephen D Lawn ADK, Monica Vogt, Robin Wood. Diagnostic accuracy of a low-cost,
508 urine antigen, point-of-care screening assay for HIV-associated pulmonary tuberculosis
509 before antiretroviral therapy: a descriptive study. 2012. doi: 10.1016/S1473-3099(11)70251-
510 1.

511

512 40. Aliasgar Esmail a, b Anil Pooran,a,b Natasha F. Sabur,a,c Mohammed Fadul,a,b
513 Mantaj S. Brar,d Suzette Oelofse,a,b, Michele Tomasicchio a, b Keertan Dheda,a,b,e,f. An
514 Optimal Diagnostic Strategy for Tuberculosis in Hospitalized HIV-Infected Patients Using
515 GeneXpert MTB/RIF and Alere Determine TB LAM Ag. *Journal of clinical microbiology.*
516 2020. doi: 10.1128/JCM.

517

518 41. Jean Claude Semuto Ngabonziza WS, Florence Mutua, Gabriela Torrea, Augustin
519 Dushime,, Michel Gasana EA, Schifra Uwamungu, Alaine Umubyeyi Nyaruhirira, Dufton
520 Mwaengo and, Muvunyi CM. Diagnostic performance of smear microscopy and incremental
521 yield of Xpert in detection of pulmonary tuberculosis in Rwanda. *BMC infectious diseases.*
522 2016. doi: 10.1186/s12879-016-2009-x.

523

524 42. Mecky Matee LM, Tarja Lounasvaara, Wendy Wieland-Alter,, Richard Waddell JL,
525 Muhammad Bakari,, Reyn KP aCFv. Sputum microscopy for the diagnosis of HIV-associated
526 pulmonary tuberculosis in Tanzania. 2008. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-8-68.

527 43. Catharina C. Boehme MD, Pamela Nabeta, M.D., Doris Hillemann, Ph.D., Mark P.
528 Nicol, Ph.D., Shubhada Shenai PD, Fiorella Krapp, M.D., Jenny Allen, B.Tech., Rasim
529 Tahirli, M.D., Robert Blakemore, B.S., Roxana Rustomjee MD, Ph.D., Ana Milovic, M.S.,
530 Martin Jones, Ph.D., Sean M. O'Brien, Ph.D., David H. Persing MD, Ph.D., Sabine Ruesch-
531 Gerdes, M.D., Eduardo Gotuzzo, M.D., Camilla Rodrigues, M.D., David Alland MD, and
532 Mark D. Perkins, M.D. Rapid Molecular Detection of Tuberculosis and Rifampin Resistance.
533 The New England Journal of Medicine. 2010;363.

534

535 44. Balcells ME, García P, Chanqueo L, Bahamondes L, Lasso M, Gallardo AM, et al.
536 Rapid molecular detection of pulmonary tuberculosis in HIV-infected patients in Santiago,
537 Chile. The international journal of tuberculosis and lung disease : the official journal of the
538 International Union against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease. 2012;16(10):1349-53. Epub
539 2012/08/07. doi: 10.5588/ijtld.12.0156. PubMed PMID: 22863872.

540

541 45. Paul K. Drain M, MPH^{1,2}, Elena Losina, PhD^{1,3,4}, Sharon M. Coleman, MS⁶, Janet
542 Giddy, MBBCh⁷, Douglas Ross, MBBCh, MBA⁸, Jeffrey N. Katz, MD⁴, and Ingrid V.
543 Bassett, MD, MPH. Value of Urine Lipoarabinomannan Grade and Second Test for
544 Optimizing Clinic-based Screening for HIV-associated Pulmonary Tuberculosis. 2015.

545

546 46. Peter J, Theron G, Chanda D, Clowes P, Rachow A, Lesosky M, et al. Test
547 characteristics and potential impact of the urine LAM lateral flow assay in HIV-infected
548 outpatients under investigation for TB and able to self-expectorate sputum for diagnostic
549 testing. BMC infectious diseases. 2015;15:262. doi: 10.1186/s12879-015-0967-z. PubMed
550 PMID: 26156025; PubMed Central PMCID: PMC4495934.

551

- 552 47. Berhanu RH, David A, da Silva P, Shearer K, Sanne I, Stevens W, et al. Performance
553 of Xpert MTB/RIF, Xpert Ultra, and Abbott RealTime MTB for Diagnosis of Pulmonary
554 Tuberculosis in a High-HIV-Burden Setting. *Journal of clinical microbiology*. 2018;56(12).
555 doi: 10.1128/jcm.00560-18.
- 556
- 557 48. Saeed M, Rasheed F, Iram S, Hussain S, Ahmad A, Riaz S, et al. False Negativity of
558 Ziehl-Neelsen Smear Microscopy: Is the Scale-up the Worth It in Developing Countries?
559 *Journal of the College of Physicians and Surgeons--Pakistan : JCPSP*. 2018;28(3):201-5. Epub
560 2018/03/17. doi: 10.29271/jcpsp.2018.03.201. PubMed PMID: 29544576.
- 561
- 562 49. Nel JS, Lippincott CK, Berhanu R, Spencer DC, Sanne IM, Ive P. Does Disseminated
563 Nontuberculous Mycobacterial Disease Cause False-Positive Determine TB-LAM Lateral
564 Flow Assay Results? A Retrospective Review. *Clinical infectious diseases : an official
565 publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America*. 2017;65(7):1226-8. Epub
566 2017/06/03. doi: 10.1093/cid/cix513. PubMed PMID: 28575238.
- 567
- 568 50. Maxwell Oluwole Akanbi, Chad Achenbach, Babafemi Taiwo, John Idoko, Agatha Ani,
569 Yetunde Isa, et al. Evaluation of gene xpert for routine diagnosis of HIV-associated
570 tuberculosis in Nigeria: A prospective cohort study. *BMC Pulmonary medicine*. 2017. doi:
571 10.1186/s12890-017-0430-6.
- 572

573 **Supporting information**

574 **S1 File. Harvard Dataverse: Replication Data for: Performance of three diagnostic tests**
575 **for tuberculosis among HIV patients presenting to a primary care facility in an informal**
576 **settlement in Nairobi County, Kenya.** [https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/PYRPCQ\(31\)](https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/PYRPCQ(31))

