

1 **The cost of arteriovenous fistula placement in patients with chronic end-stage**
2 **renal disease in Ouagadougou (Burkina Faso) 2020.**

3 **Authors:** Amadou Oury Toure¹, Tapsoba Yanne³, Fadima Yaya Bocoum², Seni Kouanda².

4 **Affiliations**

5 1-Institut de Nutrition et de Santé de l'Enfant (INSE) Conakry

6 2- Institut Africaine de Santé Publique (IASP) de Ouagadougou

7 3- TAV Advanced Consulting

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24 Correspondence author

25 **Email:** toureamadououry61@gmail.com

26 **Tel:** (00224) 622 437 976

27 **What Sapp:** (00224) 664 657 330

28 **NOTE:** This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

29 **Abstract**

30 End-stage renal disease (ESRD) is a late diagnosis. Its prevalence is rapidly increasing
31 worldwide. Although various management techniques exist, they all require access routes. The
32 arteriovenous fistula (AVF) is the vascular access of choice for regular and prolonged
33 hemodialysis sessions. Studies have shown that an AVF saves patients money. In our context,
34 we found no data in the literature on the cost of AVF and the lump-sum cost. The aim of this
35 study was to determine the average costs of AVF and lump-sum costs, and to describe patients'
36 coping strategies in relation to these costs.

37 **Methods**

38 We conducted a cross-sectional study in the three public hemodialysis units of the city of
39 Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso. Hemodialysis patients suffering from chronic renal failure,
40 hospitalized or not, minors or adults having given their consent (assent) were included in the
41 study.

42 **Results**

43 A total of 290 patients ranging in age from 12 to 82 years participated in the study. Almost half
44 the patients (47.5%) had no income. More than half the patients had undergone fistula repair
45 privately. Hypertension and diabetes were the pathologies most frequently associated with end-
46 stage renal disease in this study, with 77% and 16.90% respectively. The average cost of a
47 fistula was 260,798 Fcfa, while the average cost of a package was 506,459 Fcfa. To cope with
48 these costs, some patients resorted to selling goods (means of subsistence) in 4.83%, borrowing,
49 bartering and others begging.

50 **Conclusion**

51 The average cost of arteriovenous fistula and the fixed fee for haemodialysis remain an
52 economic barrier for patients and families to haemodialysis in Burkina Faso. More than half of
53 all patients have their fistulas done in the private sector, which costs twice as much as the public
54 sector. Training providers working in public haemodialysis units to perform arteriovenous
55 fistula is necessary to reduce this cost for patients.

56 **Key words:** Average cost, FAV, fixed price, Chronic renal failure, Burkina Faso

57

58

59 **Introduction**

60 End-stage renal disease (ESRD) is a late diagnosis. People at risk of CKD should be referred to
61 a nephrology service for proper management [1]. Its prevalence is rapidly increasing worldwide
62 [2]. It was 10.8% in China, 10.0% in the USA and 10.2% in Norway. Although various
63 techniques are available for the management of end-stage renal failure [3-5], they require
64 different access routes. The permanent arteriovenous fistula (AVF) is the vascular access of
65 choice for regular and prolonged haemodialysis sessions, offering good quality, optimal flow
66 and improved survival for haemodialysis patients [6,7]. The prevalence of AVF was over 90%
67 in 2013 in Japan and Russia, in the USA it had increased from 24% to 68%, and in South Africa
68 it was 51%. Studies have shown the cost of dialysis borne by patients and families [8,9].
69 According to the National Kidney Foundation, in the United States, Medicare spends an average
70 of 90,000 USD per patient per year on hemodialysis treatment for CKD [10]. Another study
71 proved that performing AVF saved beneficiaries \$199 per limb per month [11]. Yang.S et al in
72 2017 had reported in their study an average first-year cost per patient of USD 11,240 less for
73 AVF than for SAVF [12]. In the DRC, Izeidi.PPM et al reported in their study an average cost
74 of catheter placement of 277.2 USD \pm 134.9 USD. In addition, they found a difference between
75 temporary and permanent catheters of US\$265 and US\$900 respectively [8].

76 In the context of Burkina Faso, we found no data in the literature on the cost of arteriovenous
77 fistula placement and the lump-sum cost, which are prerequisites for hemodialysis in CKD
78 patients. The aim of this study was to determine the average cost of arteriovenous fistula
79 placement and the lump-sum cost in Ouagadougou, and to describe patients' strategies for
80 coping with these costs, as well as the associated pathologies.

81 **Methods**

82 Study period and type: This was a cross-sectional analytical study from July 1 to August 31,
83 2020.

84 Study sites: The three hemodialysis units of the three public university hospitals of
85 Ouagadougou were our collection sites for this study.

86 Study population: our study population consisted of all patients with chronic renal failure who
87 had undergone arteriovenous fistula treatment in the hemodialysis units of the Yalgado
88 Ouédraogo, Tingandogo and Bogodogo teaching hospitals during the study period.

89 Inclusion criteria: all patients with chronic end-stage renal disease who had undergone at least
90 one arteriovenous fistula for haemodialysis and who were followed up in the three public
91 haemodialysis units of the Ouagadougou teaching hospitals (Yalgado Ouedraogo, Tingandogo
92 and Bogodogo) were included in this study.

93 **Non-inclusion criteria**

94 Patients who had not given consent to participate in the study, patients who had undergone
95 arteriovenous fistulation but had lost their bill, patients who had undergone fistulation but
96 whose general condition had deteriorated and who had no major companion, patients whose
97 data were unusable (medical records, health record) and patients with mental disorders were
98 not included in this study.

99 **Study variables**

100 These were, on the one hand, the costs of fistula placement and patient registration, and, on the
101 other, socio-demographic variables.

102 The sociodemographic variables are: age, gender, education level, marital status, occupation,
103 source of care funding, patient income level, comorbidity, household size, UHC name and
104 residence.

105 **Sampling and sample size**

106 For the purposes of the study, we decided to carry out a census of all patients who met our study
107 criteria and who had agreed to participate in the study. This led to the construction of the table
108 below showing the sample size collected in each hospital.

109 **Table 1:** Breakdown of sample by teaching hospital

CHU	Number	%
Yalgado Ouédraogo	67	23,10
Bogodogo	133	45,86
Tingandogo	90	31,03
Total	290	100,00

110

111 **Data collection.**

112 Data were collected using a structured questionnaire. The data collection team consisted of the
113 principal investigator and three final-year medical students. They received two days' training
114 on ethical aspects and the definition of the variables to be collected. The questionnaire was then
115 pre-tested with a sample of 10 patients in the hemodialysis unit of Bogodogo University
116 Hospital for validation. Cost collection was based on evidence of receipts and/or invoices.
117 Interviews were conducted in French and in the local languages of Burkina Faso (More,
118 Foulfoulde, Dioula).

119 **Data analysis**

120 Data were entered using Epidata software, then exported to Stata version 15 for analysis.
121 Descriptive statistics were performed for socio-demographic characteristics. Pearson's chi-
122 square and Fisher's exact test were used to compare categorical variables. The Kruskal-Wallis

123 test was used for asymmetrically distributed continuous quantitative variables to compare group
124 means and categories.

125 **Ethical considerations**

126 We submitted and obtained ethical approval (N°2020-8-165) from the Burkina Faso Health
127 Research Ethics Committee to conduct this study. To comply with ethical principles, written
128 informed consent (assent for minors) was obtained from each participant prior to the interview.
129 Confidentiality of data collected from participants was ensured during and after the survey. All
130 methods were applied in accordance with current guidelines and regulations.

131 Informed consent was obtained from adult participants and parents/guardians of all children
132 under 16.

133 **Results**

134 A total of 290 patients were interviewed for this study. The age of the participants ranged from
135 12 to 82 years, with a mean age of 44.3 ± 14 years. The 34-44 age group was the most common.
136 Women accounted for 40.3%, with a sex ratio (male/female) of 1.4. The most represented socio-
137 professional category was the unemployed (26.2%), compared with 17.24% of government
138 employees. People with no income accounted for 47.5%. Patients with secondary education
139 represented 42.0%.

140 **Table 2:** Sociodemographic and socioeconomic characteristics

	Number	%
Age (Years)		
12 - 22	13	4,5
23 - 33	60	20,7
34 -44	77	26,6

45 -55	73	25,2
56 - 66	49	17
67 and over	18	6,2
Sex		
Male	173	59,7
Female	117	40
Occupation		
Public sector	50	17,2
Private sector	35	12,1
Self employment	37	12,8
Students/pupils	18	6,2
Housewives	53	18,3
Retired	21	7,2
Unemployed	76	26,2
Marital status		
Singles	6	2,1
Married	186	64,1
Divorced / Widowed	61	21,0
Concubinage	37	12,8
Education level		
Not schooling	50	17,2
Primary	46	15,9
Secondary	122	42,1
University	52	18
Schooling in arabic language	20	7
Income periodicity		

No income	139	47,6
Daily	33	11,4
Monthly	102	35,2
Trimestrial	12	4,1
Annual	5	1,7
Level of income		
No income	139	47,9
Lower than the minimum salary (34 664 Fcfa)	32	11,0
34 664 to 100 000 Fcfa	31	10,7
100 000 to 300 000 Fcfa	66	22,8
300 000 to 500 000 Fcfa	15	5,2
500 000 Fcfa and More	7	2,4

141

142 **Analysis of comorbidity associated with chronic renal failure**

143 Among the pathologies associated with CKD in the patients who took part in the study, arterial
 144 hypertension came in first place with 77% of cases, followed by diabetes 16.90%. The study
 145 showed that 4.48% of patients suffered from other illnesses in addition to chronic renal failure.
 146 These were: hemiplegia, hepatitis B, anemia, heart failure, tuberculosis, ulcer and pulmonary
 147 embolism.

148

149

150

151

152

153 **Table 3:** Distribution of patients according to pathologies associated with chronic renal failure

Associated diseases	Number	%
Nephrotic syndrome	1	0,34
HTA	226	77,93
Diabetes	49	16,90
Other diseases	13	4,48
VIH	1	0.34

154

155 **Distribution of patients by fistula location**

156 It remains to be seen whether certain elements, such as the fistula and the lump-sum deposit,
157 are borne by patients. These costs appear exorbitant. The study shows that 88% of patients have
158 their fistula performed privately.

159 **Analysis of fistula costs**

160 **Breakdown of fistula costs by place of operation**

161 The average cost of fistula was 277,849 Fcfa in the private sector, twice as high as in the public
162 sector. This result was statistically significant ($p= 0.000$) and (IC95% [251,666 ; 304,032]).

163 **Average cost of a fistula in Ouagadougou and patient coping strategies.**

164 Our results show that the average cost of a fistula in Ouagadougou was $260,798 \pm 12,112$ Fcfa.
165 The average lump-sum cost was 506,459 Fcfa, with a Std. Err of 5,960 and a 95% CI of [494727
166 ; 518190]. Patients' strategies for coping with costs, apart from those strictly using public and
167 private wages, included selling goods (means of subsistence) in 4.83%, borrowing, bartering
168 and others begging.

169

170

171 **Table 4:** Distribution of patients according to location of AVF, cost and coping strategies.

Distribution of patients by AV fistula location					
	Number			%	
Publics	35			12,07	
Private	255			87,93	
Total	290			100,00	
Fistula costs by location					
	Minimum	Median	Max	Mean	IC : 95%
Publics	0	137 500CFA	250 000CFA	136 571CFA	[109980 ; 163 163]
Private	0	250 000CFA	3000 000CFA	277 849CFA	[251666 ; 304 032]
Statistique de Chi 2	72,523				
Plus-value	0,000				
Average package and fistula costs					
	Average costs		Std. Err.	IC 95%	
Fistula	260 798 CFA		12 112	[236960 ; 284636]	
Package	506 459 CFA		5 960	[494727 ; 518190]	
Cost adaptation strategies					
Strategies	Workforce	%		P-values	
Sale of goods (livelihood)	14	4,83		0,090	
Public sector salary	47	16,21		0,011	
Private-sector salary	24	8,28		0,335	

Sale of livestock or livestock products	2	0,69	0,703
Borrowings	4	1,38	0,111
Begging	5	1,72	0,100
Troc	1	0,34	0,328

172

173 **Discussion**

174 This study on the cost of AVF placement shows that CKD patients face an economic barrier.
175 The cost of this activity varies according to where it is performed. The mean age of our
176 participants was 44.3 ± 14 years, ranging from 12 to 82 years. The young age in our study could
177 be explained by the sedentary lifestyle, lifestyle and self-medication, which are factors that can
178 influence the kidneys. A.Adedjouma et al in. 2014 had found in their study a median age of 58
179 years[7] . Another study carried out in Morocco by S.Cheikh et al in 2022 on the survival of
180 the first arteriovenous fistula in chronic hemodialysis had reported a mean patient age of 46.12
181 ± 22 years [6]. R.R.Yemi et al in 2018 in Nigeria had found that the mean age of participants
182 in their study was 46.3 ± 17.2 years [13].

183 **Analysis of comorbidity associated with chronic renal failure**

184 Pathologies such as arterial hypertension and diabetes were the ones most associated with
185 chronic renal failure in our study. This confirms the data in the literature.

186 A.Adedjouma.et al in 2014 who had found that the cause of CKD was diabetic nephropathy in
187 16.6%, vascular in 22.9%, glomerular in 29% and tubulointerstitial in 20.8% [7].

188 **Distribution of patients by fistula location**

189 **Analysis of fistula costs**

190 **Distribution of fistula costs according to location of implantation**

191 The cost of the fistula and the deposit are also borne by patients and their families. In this study,
192 we found an average fistula cost of 277,849 Fcfa in the private sector, which doubled the cost
193 in the public sector (136,571 Fcfa). This result was statistically significant at $p= 0.000$. This
194 may be explained by the lack of equipment in the public sector and the scarcity of specialists in
195 this field in these facilities, which results in long patient scheduling.

196 In a study carried out in the Democratic Republic of Congo, Izeidi.PPM et al found the cost of
197 vascular access to be USD 13,860 [8].

198 **Average cost of a fistula in Ouagadougou**

199 **Average package cost**

200 To provide hemodialysis for CKD patients in Ouagadougou, patients and their families have to
201 pay an average of 506,459 Fcfa as a lump sum. To meet these costs, patients and their families
202 resort to selling goods (means of subsistence), borrowing, bartering and even begging. This can
203 be explained by the high rate of unemployment and poverty in this category.

204 **Study strengths and limitations**

205 This study is the first to examine the cost of AVF and the fixed fee borne by patients in Burkina
206 Faso. It is also one of the few studies to have analyzed patients' coping strategies in the face of
207 these costs. As a limitation, this study was carried out in only three hemodialysis units, whereas
208 there are other units in the regions and in the private sector that were not included in this study.

209 **Implications for research and practice**

210 The results of this study contribute to a better understanding of the cost of AVF in public and
211 private settings, as well as patient coping strategies for achieving hemodialysis. The results of
212 this study will help guide actions to improve access to hemodialysis services in Burkina Faso.

213 They will also enable the planning of other, larger studies that will provide more important data
214 for an understanding of the economic barriers to access to hemodialysis in Burkina Faso.
215 Practical training in arteriovenous fistula procedures for healthcare personnel working in public
216 hemodialysis units would be necessary to alleviate this cost and reduce waiting times.

217 **Conclusion**

218 The average cost of arteriovenous fistula and the average fixed cost of hemodialysis remain an
219 economic barrier for patients and families in the management of CKD in Burkina Faso. Despite
220 the high cost of private fistulas, which are twice as expensive as public fistulas, and the state
221 subsidy for public fistulas, more than half of all patients have their fistulas done privately. To
222 reduce this cost for patients, it would be important to provide practical training for healthcare
223 staff working in public hemodialysis units on how to perform arteriovenous fistulas, in order to
224 shorten waiting times

225 **Acknowledgements**

226 **Authors' contributions**

227 Study design: AOT, YT, FYB.

228 Data collection: AOT.

229 Data analysis: AOT, YT

230 Initial drafting of manuscript: AOT, YT and FYB

231 Manuscript revision: FYB, SK.

232 The authors have read and approved the final manuscript.

233 **Funding**

234 Not funded

235 **Availability of data and materials**

236 Data supporting the results of this study are available from [Amadou Oury Toure], but
237 restrictions apply to the availability of these data and are therefore not publicly accessible, as
238 our research group is working on further analyses using the same data which will then be
239 submitted for publication. However, these data are available on reasonable request from the
240 corresponding author [Amadou Oury Touré].

241 **Declarations**

242 **Ethical approval and consent to participation**

243 As with any study involving human subjects, this study was submitted to and approved by the
244 Burkina Faso Health Research Ethics Committee (CERS) (N°2020-8-165). Participants were
245 informed about the study and gave their informed consent before answering any questions.

246 **Consent for publication**

247 **Not applicable.**

248 **Competing interest:** the authors declare that there is no competing interest.

249 **Table 4:** Distribution of patients according to location of AVF, cost and coping strategies.

Distribution of patients by AV fistula location					
	Number			%	
Publics	35			12,07	
Private	255			87,93	
Total	290			100,00	
Fistula costs by location					
	Minimum	Median	Max	Mean	IC : 95%

Publics	0	137 500CFA	250 000CFA	136 571CFA	[109980 ; 163 163]
Private	0	250 000CFA	3000 000CFA	277 849CFA	[251666 ; 304 032]
Statistique de Chi 2		72,523			
Plus-value		0,000			
Average package and fistula costs					
		Average costs		Std. Err.	IC 95%
Fistula		260 798 CFA		12 112	[236960 ; 284636]
Package		506 459 CFA		5 960	[494727 ; 518190]
Cost adaptation strategies					
Strategies		Workforce		%	P-values
Sale of goods (livelihood)		14		4,83	0,090
Public sector salary		47		16,21	0,011
Private-sector salary		24		8,28	0,335
Sale of livestock or livestock products		2		0,69	0,703
Borrowings		4		1,38	0,111
Begging		5		1,72	0,100
Troc		1		0,34	0,328

250

251

252

253

254

255 **References**

- 256 1. Wouk N. End-Stage Renal Disease: Medical Management. *Am Fam Physician*. 1 nov
257 2021;104(5):493-9.
- 258 2. Raina R, Krishnappa V, Gupta M. Management of pain in end-stage renal disease
259 patients: Short review. *Hemodial Int*. juill 2018;22(3):290-6.
- 260 3. Wolfe RA, Ashby VB, Milford EL, Ojo AO, Ettenger RE, Agodoa LY, et al.
261 Comparison of mortality in all patients on dialysis, patients on dialysis awaiting
262 transplantation, and recipients of a first cadaveric transplant. *New England Journal of*
263 *Medicine*. 1999;341(23):1725-30.
- 264 4. Canaud B. Principes et modalités d'application de l'hémodialyse au traitement de
265 l'insuffisance rénale chronique. *Néphrologie & thérapeutique*. 2009;5(3):218-38.
- 266 5. Lupi O, Rezende L, Zangrando M, Sessim M, Silveira CB, Sepulcri MA, et al.
267 Cutaneous manifestations in end-stage renal disease. *An Bras Dermatol*. 2011;86(2):319-26.
- 268 6. Cheikh S, Kharrat A, Sayah M, Mtioui N, El Khayat S, Zamd M, et al. La survie de la
269 première fistule artérioveineuse chez l'hémodialysé chronique. *Néphrologie & Thérapeutique*.
270 2022;18(5):424-5.
- 271 7. Adedjouma A, Fessi H, Cartery C, Kolko A, Jais JP, Ronco P, et al. Causes de retard à
272 la création d'une fistule artério-veineuse lors de l'initiation de l'hémodialyse chronique.
273 *Néphrologie & Thérapeutique*. 2014;10(5):291-2.
- 274 8. Izeidi PPM, Nlandu YM, Lepira FB, Makulo JRR, Engole YM, Mokoli VM, et al.
275 Cost estimate of chronic hemodialysis in Kinshasa, the Democratic Republic of the Congo: A
276 prospective study in two centers. *Hemodial Int*. janv 2020;24(1):121-8.

- 277 9. Toure AO, Balde MD, Diallo A, Camara S, Soumah AM, Sall AO, et al. The direct
278 cost of dialysis supported by families for patients with chronic renal failure in Ouagadougou
279 (Burkina Faso). *BMC Nephrol.* 23 juin 2022;23(1):222.
- 280 10. Marsh AM, Genova R, Buicko JL. Dialysis Fistula. In: StatPearls [Internet]. Treasure
281 Island (FL): StatPearls Publishing; 2022 [cité 5 oct 2022]. Disponible sur:
282 <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK559085/>
- 283 11. Everett B, Castel LD, McGinnis M, Beresky A, Rudolph C. Cane J, Cooper T, et al.
284 Economic and Clinical Outcomes Resulting From the Stage 4 Chronic Kidney Disease Case
285 Management Quality Improvement Initiative. *Professional Case Management.* nov
286 2017;22(6):291.
- 287 12. Yang S, Lok C, Arnold R, Rajan D, Glickman M. Comparison of post-creation
288 procedures and costs between surgical and an endovascular approach to arteriovenous fistula
289 creation. *J Vasc Access.* 28 mars 2017;18(Suppl. 2):8-14.
- 290 13. Raji YR, Ajayi SO, Aminu O, Abiola B, Efuntoye O, Salako BL, et al. Outcomes of
291 tunneled internal jugular venous catheters for chronic haemodialysis at the University College
292 Hospital, Ibadan, Nigeria. *Pan Afr Med J.* 2018;31:218.