

Patterns of Herbal Medicine Use in a General Outpatient Clinic in Nigeria- A Cross-sectional Study

Word count: 2,029

Authors

1. Dr Afisulahi Abiodun Maiyegun

Department of Family Medicine,

Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University Teaching Hospital,

Bauchi, Nigeria

Email: hafeezmaiye@gmail.com

Phone number: +2347034884005

Orcid ID: 0000-0002-6582-9800

2. Dr Mark Divine Akangoziri

Department of Family Medicine

Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University Teaching Hospital,

Bauchi, Nigeria

Email: dr.osydivine@gmail.com

Phone number: +2348036078282

Orcid ID: 0000-0002-6780-7867

3. Bukar Alhaji Grema

Department of Family Medicine,
Aminu Kano Teaching Hospital,
Kano, Nigeria

Email: bugrema@yahoo.com

Phone number: +2348036381118

Orcid ID :0000-0002-2316-6455

4. Yahkub Babatunde Mutalub

Department of Family Medicine,
Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University Teaching Hospital,
Bauchi, Nigeria

Email: myahkub@yahoo.com

Phone number: +2348032073874

Orcid ID : 0000-0001-7161-127X

5. Farida Buhari Ibrahim

Department of Nursing,
Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University Teaching Hospital,
Bauchi, Nigeria

Email: faridaibrahimb@gmail.com

Phone number: +2347065023946

Orcid ID: 0009-0008-3757-7782

6. AbdulRauf Segun Ibraheem

Department of Family Medicine,

Federal Medical Centre,

Birnin Kebbi,

Nigeria.

Email: ibraheemabdulrauf@ymail.com

Phone number: +2348069231090

Orcid ID: 0009-0005-7987-6738

Conflict of Interest: The authors have no conflict of interest to declare.

Sponsorship: The authors did not receive any funding from external source to conduct or publish the work.

Abstract

Background:

Herbal medicine use remains an important part of primary care and the World Health Organization has mandated member countries to conduct research into this and other forms of traditional medicine. However, research into traditional medicine remains scanty, even in the developing where it is often a major health option.

Objective: to determine the prevalence, types and sources of herbal medicine used among the study population.

Methods

Three hundred and forty-one questionnaires were administered to adult patients attending the general outpatient clinic of a tertiary hospital in Northern Nigeria. The data was collected and analysed using EPI INFO version 7.2.5.0 software.

Results

The prevalence of herbal medicine use was 85.34%; the commonest herbs were moringa (59.8%), black seed (36.8%), and olive oil (34.4%); and the commonest source of the herbs were herbal practitioners and herbal medicine vendors (79.04%). Herbal medicine use was associated with religion ($P= 0.0005$) and residential area ($P= 0.01$). Only 18.12 % of participants ever discussed herbal medicine use with their doctors.

Conclusion: herbal medicine use remains high even among patients attending outpatient clinics in tertiary hospitals in Nigeria. However, health workers are often not the source of herbal medicine and patients rarely disclose its use to them.

Keywords: herbal medicine, traditional medicine, complementary and alternative medicine, Islamic/Prophetic Medicine, Nigeria.

Introduction

The World Health Organization (WHO) estimates that up to 80 % of the African population use traditional medicine for their health needs^[1]. It also acknowledges the role of traditional medicine in the global aim to achieve universal health coverage.^[2] In recognition of this role, the WHO has mandated member states to increase research into traditional medicine used in their regions. This will include research into the types of traditional medicine, the reasons for use, the sources, and the safety of such medicines, among other related issues.^[2]

In Nigeria, relatively few studies have addressed the use of traditional medicine among the population - though available local studies suggest a high prevalence - and majority of these studies have been conducted in the southern parts of the country, with very scanty literature about the traditional medical practices in Northern Nigeria.^[3-6] Since the country is characterized by significant geographical contrast in flora, culture and religion, factors which drive the use of traditional medicine, studies in Northern Nigeria are required to fill the knowledge gap.

Herbal medicine are the commonest traditional medicines.^[7,8] Herbs are also one of the most likely traditional medicines to intersect with orthodox medicine due to the side effects of herbs and drug-herb interactions.^[9,10] This study, therefore, aimed to determine the types and characteristics of herbal medicine use among primary care clinic attendees in Bauchi, North-eastern Nigeria.

Methods

The study was conducted in the general outpatient unit of Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University Teaching Hospital (ATBUTH), Bauchi, Northern Nigeria, between September and December 2018. The study population were adult patients (at least 18 years old) attending the general

outpatient clinic. Patients who were very sick or declined consent were excluded from the study. Sample size for the study was determined using the Cochran's formula: $N = Z^2pq/d^2$, where N = minimum sample size, Z = confidence level at 95% (1.96), p = 0.67, being the prevalence of herbal medicine use from a previous study in Nigeria (Oreagba et al), q = (1-p), and d = level of precision (0.05).^[3] The sample size was 341. Prospective participants were selected through systematic random sampling, and their written consent sought and obtained before enrolment. The study was approved by the Ethical Review Committee of ATBUTH (Approval number: 03/03/2018).

An interviewer-administered, semi-structured questionnaire was used for data collection. The questionnaire had five sections: biodata, family characteristics, family income, medical history and herbal medicine use. Data was analyzed using Epi Info version 7.2.5.0 software developed by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, United States of America.

Results

Sociodemographic Characteristics of Study Participants

A total of 341 participants took part in the study, given a response rate of 100%. Participants' modal age group was 25 to 44 years (49.27%). Most respondents were Muslim (85.92%) and of Hausa/Fulani ethnicity (79.77%), with 64.22% having at least secondary education. Majority (83.87%) lived within Bauchi metropolis. The remaining sociodemographic data are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Sociodemographic Characteristics of the Respondents

Sociodemographic variable	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Age		
18-24	56	16.42
25-44	168	49.27
45-64	98	28.74
65-85	19	05.57
Gender		
Male	137	40.18
Female	204	59.82
Tribe		
Hausa/Fulani	272	79.77
Igbo	8	02.34
Yoruba	6	01.76
Others	55	16.13
Religion		
Christianity	48	14.08
Islam	293	85.92
Education		
No formal education	75	22.00
Primary education	47	13.78
Secondary education and above	219	64.22

Sociodemographic variable	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Occupation		
Public Servant	102	29.92
Self-employed	118	34.60
Unemployed	121	35.48
Marital Status		
Currently Married	258	75.66
Not currently Married	83	24.34
Place of residence		
Within Bauchi	286	83.87
Outside Bauchi	55	16.13
Average family income (Naira)		
<50,000	122	35.78
>50,000-<100,000	51	14.96
≥100,000	55	16.13
Undeclared	113	33.13
\$1 equivalent to 324.2 Naira in 2018		

Hypertension was the commonest morbidity among the participants (34.60%;118/341), followed by diabetes (7.62%; 26/341), with 5.28% (18/341) having both diabetes and hypertension.

In the study, 291 participants had used herbal medicine before, resulting in a lifetime prevalence of 85.34%. Eighty participants were currently using herbal medicine (80/291; 27.49%), 88 (30.24%) had used it within the preceding twelve months, but only 14 (4.81%) had used it throughout the preceding twelve months. Ninety-eight (83.05%) of the 118 with hypertension and 22 (84.62%) of the 26 with diabetes used herbal medicine. Herbs were mostly used for treatment (248; 85.22%), and health promotion (102; 35.05%) among the participants.

The commonest motivation for using herbs was their effectiveness (Table 2).

Table 2 Motivations for Using Herbal Medicine (n=291)

Reason	Frequency	Percentage (%)
It is effective	123	42.27
Better than nothing	65	22.34
It is easily available	62	21.31
It is natural medicine	50	17.18
Religious recommendation	38	13.06
It is cheap	33	11.34

*Multiple responses allowed

Participants classified the herbs they used as traditional medicine (90.72%; 264/291) and Islamic medicine (51.20%; 149/291).

Abdominal pain was the commonest conditions treated with herbal medicine (36.08%). About a sixth of the participants used herbal medicine for febrile illnesses (Table 3)

Table 3. Conditions Treated with Herbal Medicine

Condition	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Abdominal pain	105	36.08
Hypertension	43	14.78
Febrile illness	34	16.49
Headache	33	11.34
Body pain	32	11.00
Sexual performance enhancement ²¹	21	7.22
Pregnancy and labour	17	5.84
Cough	14	4.81

*Multiple responses allowed

Table 4 shows fifteen of the herbs commonly used by participants. Many of them are familiar, edible, local herbs.

Table 4. Herbs reported in the study

Herb			Frequency n (%)
Local (Hausa) name	English name	Botanical name	
Zogale	Moringa	<i>Moringa oleifera</i>	174 (59.8)
Habatu-sawda	Black seed	<i>Nigella sativa</i>	107 (36.8)
Zaytun	Olive oil	<i>Olea europaea</i>	100 (34.4)
Tafarnuwa	Garlic	<i>Allium sativum</i>	96 (33.0)
Ararabi	Frankincense	<i>Boswellia dalzielli</i>	95 (32.6)
Hulba	Fenugreek	<i>Trigonella foenum-graecum</i>	65 (22.3)
Lemun tsami	Lemon	<i>Citrus limon</i>	56 (19.2)
Mankadai	Shea butter oil	<i>Vitellaria paradoxa</i>	44 (15.1)
Citta	Ginger	<i>Zingiber officinale</i>	42 (14.4)
Bagaruwa	Acacia	<i>Acacia nilotica</i>	39 (13.4)
Namijin goro	Bitter kola	<i>Garcinia kola</i>	31 (10.7)
Yayan magarya	Lote tree seed	<i>Ziziphus mauritiana</i>	31 (10.7)
Dogoyaro	Neem	<i>Azadirachta indica</i>	30 (10.3)
Ganyen zobo	Roselle	<i>Hibiscus sabdariffa</i>	29 (10)
Kankana	Water melon	<i>Citrullus lanatus</i>	29(10)

Association between Herbal Medicine Use and Sociodemographic Characteristics

Table 5 shows association between herbal medicine use and sociodemographic characteristics.

Two sociodemographic factors – religion and place of residence - were significantly associated with herbal medicine use in the study population, with Muslims ($P = 0.0005$), and those living outside Bauchi ($P= 0.01$) more likely to use herbs.

Table 5. Association between herbal medicine use and sociodemographic characteristics

	Categories	Used Herbs n (%)		Total	X ²	df	P value
		Yes	No				
Age Group	18-24	47(83.93)	9(16.07)	56	1.24	3	0.74
	25-44	146(86.90)	22(13.10)	168			
	45-64	81(82.65)	17(17.35)	98			
	≥65	17(89.47)	2(10.53)	19			
Gender	Male	119 (86.86)	18 (13.14)	137	0.43	1	0.51
	Female	172 (84.31)	32 (15.69)	204			
Tribe	Hausa/Fulani	237(87.13)	35(12.87)	272	5.95	3	0.11
	Igbo	6(75.00)	2(25.00)	8			
	Yoruba	6(100)	0(0)	6			
	Others	42(76.36)	13(23.64)	55			
Religion	Christianity	33(68.75)	15(31.25)	48	12.28	1	0.0005*

		Used Herbs n (%)		Total	X ²	df	P value
Categories		Yes	No				
Education	Islam	258(88.05)	35(11.95)	293			
	None	66(88.00)	9(12.00)	75	0.86	2	0.65
	Primary	41(87.23)	6(12.77)	47			
	≥Secondary	184(84.02)	35(15.98)	219			
Occupation	Employed	185(87.50)	35(12.50)	8	0.77	1	0.38
	Unemployed	106(84.00)	15(16)	25			
Place of residence	Outside	53(96.36)	2(3.64)	55	6.37	1	0.01*
	Bauchi						
	Metropolis						
	Within	238(83.22)	48(16.78)	286			
	Bauchi						
	Metropolis						

*statistically significant

Note: Fisher exact test was used for cells with value <5.

Participants reported very few side effects (Table 6). The commonest was abdominal pain (4.12%)

The commonest route of administration was oral. Inhalation was reported by over a third of study participants (Table 6). Herbal medicines were prepared in different ways, mostly by cooking. However, participants did not report the use of alcohol as a solvent (Table 6).

Table 6. Side effect, route of administration and methods of preparation (n=291)

Variable	Categories	Frequency	Percentage
Side effect	Abdominal pain	12	4.12%
	Dizziness	6	2.06%
	Nausea	3	1.03%
	Headache	2	0.69%
	Skin rash	1	0.34%
	Body swelling	1	0.34%
Route of administration	Orally	276	94.85%
	Topical	119	40.89%
	Inhalation	99	34.02%
	Putting in the genitals	8	2.75%
	Methods of preparation	cooked	157
	mixed with pap	132	45.36%

soaked in water	121	41.58%
soaked in oil	38	13.06%
ground	28	9.62%
powdered	23	7.90%
Alcohol	0	0.00%

Most participants who used herbal medicine obtained the products from herbal medical practitioners and herbal vendors (79.03%). Of note, doctors and other health workers very rarely were the source of herbal medicine (Table 7).

Table 7: Source of procurement of herbal medicine

Source	Frequency	Percentage
Herbal medical practitioner	122	41.92%
Herbal vendors	108	37.11%
Self-made	79	27.15%
Friends and family	61	20.96%
Chemist/Pharmaceutical shop	1	0.34%
Other health workers	1	0.34%
Doctors	0	0.00%

Only 18.12 % of participants ever discussed herbal medicine use with their doctors (Table 8).

The major reason cited for not discussing was that the doctors never asked (195/291; 81.59 %).

Table 8: Reasons for not discussing use of herbs with doctors

Reasons	Frequency	Percentage (%)
Doctor did not ask	195	81.59
I was afraid of the doctor's response	16	6.69
I did not think it was important	22	9.21
There was no time to discuss	2	0.84
Others	4	1.67

DISCUSSION

The study aimed to determine characteristics of herbal medicine use among patients attending the general outpatient clinic of Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University Teaching Hospital. In all, 341 participants were enrolled. The modal age group was 25 -44 years (49.27%), with about 87% in that age range being users of herbal medicine (Table 1), suggesting the popularity of herbal medicine among the youth. Similarly, among those with at least secondary level of education, over 80% used herbal medicine. These findings indicate the popularity of herbal medicine among the young and the educated in Nigeria. Local studies corroborating these findings include Ahwinahwi et al. who reported that 81.78% of young undergraduates in Delta State used complementary and alternative medicine (CAM), with herbal medicine as the main

CAM; and Osuchukwu et al in Calabar, where 75.5% of the respondents had at least secondary education.^[4,8]

Most respondents were Muslims (85.92 %), the religion of the Hausa/Fulani tribe who constitute 79.77 % of the respondents. As such, religious influences are reflected in the prevalent pattern of herbal use. For instance, ‘Habatus-sawda’ (*Nigella sativa*) used commonly in this study is hardly reported in any study in the southern part of Nigeria. Its popularity among the study population is traceable to religious sources, where it is recommended as an elixir.^[11,12] This religious influence is buttressed by the distinction participants made between traditional medicine (90.72%) and Islamic medicine (51.20%), otherwise known as Prophetic medicine.^[13]

The lifetime prevalence of herbal medicine use in the study was 85.34%. This supports the estimate of the World Health Organization that about 80% of the population in Africa use traditional medicine.^[1] Mbada reported a similar prevalence of 83.8% in Oyo State, though among rural farmers.^[5] However, it appears that for the general population in our study, herbal medicine use was not a continuous practice, as only 4.81 % of the population continued to use herbal medicine throughout the year. This is in stark contrast to what was reported by Mbada et al. in South-West Nigeria, that as many as 96.8% of their respondents used herbs regularly at any time of the year. The occupation of the study participants in the latter study might explain this: most of the participants were farmers and used herbs mainly for relief of musculoskeletal pain, a constant result of their profession.

Our study found a very high prevalence of herbal medicine use among patients with hypertension (83%) and diabetes (85%), exceeding the prevalence reported in other studies in the southern part of the country. Among hypertensives in Ibadan, Osamor and Owumi found a prevalence of 29.1%, while Ogbera et al. reported a prevalence of 46% among diabetic patients in Lagos.^[14,15]

The few numbers of participants with hypertension and diabetes in our study may account for this discrepancy. Larger studies in Northern Nigeria among these two patient subgroups are recommended for better comparison.

Treatment was the main reason for use of herbal medicine by most respondents (85.22%), though a good proportion of the population also used herbs for health promotion (35.05%). Similar reasons were reported in other studies in Nigeria. In Calabar, Nigeria, Osuchukwu et al. found that the commonest reason why people used herbs was treatment, while in Uyo, South-South Nigeria, the commonest reason reported by Idung and his colleagues was health promotion and disease prevention.^[4,6] Like in many previous studies, the commonest motivation for using herbs were effectiveness (42.27%), easy availability (21.31%), and naturalness (17.18%).^[4,6,16,17]

The commonest conditions treated with herbal medicine in this study (Table 3) was abdominal pain. Meanwhile in Calabar, malaria and skin infection were the main conditions for herbal medicine use, and in Lagos, majority used herbs for 'no specific reason'.^[3,4] This variation in reasons for herbal medicine use reflects the different health priorities among different communities: health practitioners need to understand the health needs in their areas of practice.

The place of residence of respondent and their religion were significantly associated with use of herbal medicine ($p=0.01$ and $p=0.0005$ respectively) [Table 5]. Muslims were more likely to use herbs in this study. This was because of their double sources of herbal medicine: the Hausa/Fulani tradition and the influence of the aforementioned Islamic medicine, used by over 50% of those who used herbs. Religion was also significantly associated with herbal medicine use in Malaysia, a predominantly Muslim country.^[18]

Place of residence was the second sociodemographic variable significantly associated with herbal medicine use, similar to the findings of Idung et al in Uyo.^[6] This suggests that the environment could influence access to and use of herbs.

Despite the high prevalence of herbal medicine used and number of herbs used, very few side effects were reported. This is probably because many of the herbs, such as moringa and olive oil, are generally safe and edible.

The commonest route of administration of herbal medicine was oral, as in other studies.^[19,20] However, the significant use of the nasal route (inhalation constituted 34.02 %) could exacerbate respiratory problems, especially for people with pre-existing respiratory diseases such as asthma and chronic obstructive pulmonary disease.^[21]

Like in many African traditions, herbal medicine was prepared by cooking and soaking in water or oil (decoctions and infusions).^[19,20] However, alcoholic solvents were not reported in this study most probably due to the aforementioned influence of the Islamic religion, which strictly forbids the use of intoxicants, even for medical purposes.^[22]

The major sources of herbal medicine were outside the hospital: the herbal medical practitioners and the herbal vendors. Unlike in Norway, Germany, Japan and other countries, where doctors and other health workers receive training in herbal medicine and other CAMs, and offer them to interested patients or refer them to CAM practitioners, only one participant reported a health worker was the source of herbal medicine.^[2,23,24] This reflects a dichotomy between orthodox medicine and traditional medicine in Nigeria, as against the integrative medicine model envisioned by the WHO.^[1]

Less than a fifth of participants who used herbs (18.12 %) ever discussed their use of herbal medicine with doctors, and the chief reason for non-communication was that the doctors did not ask (81.59 %). Djuv et al in Norway similarly reported that only 15% of herb users discussed this with their general practitioners, and the major reason for this was because the doctor did not ask.^[23]

Major limitations of the study are that it did not quantify the doses of herbal medicine used nor map specific herbs to particular ailments. Hopefully, future studies will focus on these.

The study reported that herbs commonly used by the respondents were often local, edible, familiar plants and that the principal motivation for use was assumed herbal efficiency. Unlike the studies in other parts of Nigeria, religion was a significant factor in the herbal medicine practice of Northern Nigeria. Finally, the study found that most patients source their herbal medicine from herbal medical practitioners and herbal vendors, and never discussed their use of herbal medicine with their doctors, suggesting CAM is yet to be integrated into mainstream medicine in Nigeria. With the high prevalence of herbal medicine use in Nigeria, it is recommended that the government increases research efforts into traditional medicine, in order to integrate it with orthodox medicine as recommended by the WHO.

References

1. World Health Organization (WHO). WHO traditional medicine strategy 2002–2005. Geneva: WHO; 2002.
2. World Health Organization (WHO). WHO traditional medicine strategy. 2014-2023. Geneva: WHO; 2013.

3. Oreagba IA, Oshikoya KA, Amachree M. Herbal medicine use among urban residents in Lagos, Nigeria. *BMC Complement Altern Med* [Internet] 2011;11(1):117. Available from: <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-6882/11/117>
4. Osuchukwu NC, Eko JE, Abia RP, Ochei KC. Use of herbal medicine among adult residents in Calabar Metropolis , Cross River State , Nigeria. *Journal of Complementary and Alternative Medical Research* 2017;2(3):1–14.
5. Mbada CE, Adeyemi TL, Adedoyin AR, Badmus HD, Awotide TO, Arije OO, et al. Prevalence and modes of complementary and alternative medicine use among peasant farmers with musculoskeletal pain in a rural community in South-western Nigeria. *BMC Complement Altern Med* 2015; 15:164. DOI 10.1186/s12906-015-0695-3
6. Idung AU, Okokon IB, Udoh SB, Inem VA. Clinical and sociodemographic profiles of complementary and alternative medicine users among outpatient clinic attendees in Uyo. *Fam Med Med Sci Res* 2014;3(1):1–5.
7. Lail G, Luck NH, Tasneem AA, Rai AA, Laeeq SM, Majid Z. The usage of complementary and alternative medicine in gastrointestinal patients visiting the outpatients’ department of a large tertiary care centre-views from Pakistan. *Pan African Medical Journal* 2016;24:247. Available from: <http://www.panafrican-med-journal.com/content/article/24/247/full/>
8. Ahwinahwi US, Chukwudi K. Perception and use of complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) among undergraduate students in a Nigerian university. *J Appl Pharm Sci* 2016;6(6):96–101.

9. Agbabiaka TB, Wider B, Watson KL, Goodman C. Concurrent use of prescription drugs and herbal medicinal products in older adults: A systematic review. *Drugs Aging* 2017;34: 891- 905.
10. Moreira D de L, Teixeira SS, Monteiro MHD, De-Oliveira ACAX, Paumgarten FJR. Traditional use and safety of herbal medicines. *Revista Brasileira de Farmacognosia* 2014;24(2):248–57.
11. Ahmad A, Husain A, Mujeeb M, Khan S, Najmi A, Siddique N, et al. Review on therapeutic potential of *Nigella sativa*: A miracle herb. *Asian Pac J Trop Biomed* 2013;3(5):337–52.
12. Al-rawi S, Fetters MD. Traditional arabic & Islamic medicine: A conceptual model for clinicians and researchers. *Glob J Health Sci* 2012;4(3):164–9.
13. Shahpesandy H, Al-Kubaisy T, Mohammed-Ali R, Oladosu A, Middleton R, Saleh N. A concise history of Islamic medicine: An Introduction to the origins of medicine in Islamic civilization, its impact on the evolution of global medicine, and its place in the medical world today. *Int J Clin Med* 2022;13(04):180–97.
14. Osamor PE, Owumi BE. Complementary and alternative medicine in the management of hypertension in an urban Nigerian community. *BMC Complement Altern Med* 2010;10:36
Available from: <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-6882/10/36>
15. Ogbera AO, Dada O, Adeleye F, Jewo PI. Complementary and alternative medicine use in diabetes mellitus. *West Afr J Med* 2010;29(3):158–62.

16. Duru CB, Diwe KC, Uwakwe KA, Duru CA, Merenu IA, Iwu AC, et al. Combined orthodox and traditional medicine use among households in Orlu, Imo State, Nigeria: Prevalence and determinants. 2016;4(1):5–11.
17. Ekeanyanwu RC. Traditional medicine in Nigeria: Current status and the future. *Research Journal of Pharmacology* 2011;5(6):90–4.
18. Ching SM, Zakaria ZA, Paimin F, Jalalian M. Complementary alternative medicine use among patients with type 2 diabetes mellitus in the primary care setting: a cross-sectional study in Malaysia. *BMC Complement Altern Med [Internet]* 2013;13(1):1. Available from: <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-6882/13/148>
19. Birhanu Z, Endale A, Shewamene Z. An ethnomedicinal investigation of plants used by traditional healers of Gondar town, North-Western Ethiopia. *Journal of Medicinal Plants Studies* 2015;3(2):36–43.
20. Boadu AA, Asase A. Documentation of herbal medicines used for the treatment and management of human diseases by some communities in southern Ghana. *Evidence-based Complementary and Alternative Medicine* 2017;2017: 3043061. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1155/2017/3043061>
21. Freilich S, Usmani OS, Polkey MI, Hopkinson NS. Emphysema due to smoke from a herbal asthma remedy. *JRSM Short Rep* 2010;1(1):1–2.
22. Rahem A. Patients' attitude towards an alcohol content and halalness of cough medicines. *Journal of Halal Product and Research*. 2019; 2(2): 106-113. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.20473/jhpr.vol.2-issue.2.106-113>

23. Djuv A, Nilsen OG, Steinsbekk A. The co-use of conventional drugs and herbs among patients in Norwegian general practice: a cross-sectional study. *BMC Complement Altern Med* [Internet] 2013; 13:295. Available from: <http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-6882/13/295>

24. Krug K, Kraus KI, Herrmann K, Joos S. Complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) as part of primary health care in Germany – comparison of patients consulting general practitioners and CAM practitioners: a cross-sectional study. *BMC Complement Altern Med* [Internet]2016;16:409. Available from: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s12906-016-1402-8>