

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37

Full title:

Does community-based health insurance affect lifestyle and timing of treatment seeking behavior? Evidence from Ethiopia

Short title:

Community-Based Health Insurance and Household behavioral change

Zecharias Fetene Anteneh^{1*¶}, Anagaw D. Mebratie^{2&}, Zemzem Shigute^{3&}, Getnet Alemu^{4&}, Arjun S. Bedi^{5&}

¹ Center for Health Economics, University of York, UK

² School of Public Health, College of Health Sciences, Addis Ababa University, Ethiopia

³ International Institute of Social Studies, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Hague, The Netherlands and International Institute of Development and Policy Research, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

⁴ Institute of Development and Policy Research, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

⁵ International Institute for Social Studies, Erasmus University Rotterdam, The Hague, The Netherlands

*Corresponding Author:

Author Name: Zecharias Fetene Anteneh

Mailing Address zecharias.anteneh@york.ac.uk

¶ ZFA involved in the inception of the research idea, data analysis, write up of the manuscript and revision

& ADM and ZS involved in the inception, write up of the manuscript, and revision

& GA and AB involved in the revision of the manuscript

38

39 **Abstract**

40 There has been a growing concern about the financial sustainability of community-
41 based health insurance (CBHI) schemes in developing countries recently. However,
42 little empirical studies have been conducted to identify potential contributors including
43 ex-ante and ex-post moral hazards. We respond to this concern by investigating the
44 effects of being insured on household lifestyle -Preventive Care- and the timing of
45 treatment seeking behavior in the context of Ethiopia's CBHI scheme. Using three
46 rounds of household panel data and a fixed-effects household model, we do not find a
47 significant impact on preventive care activities. However, we find that participation in
48 CBHI increases delay in treatment-seeking behavior for malaria, tetanus, and
49 tuberculosis symptoms. This behavior is costly for the insurer. Therefore, it is essential
50 to identify the primary causes of delays in seeking medical services and implement
51 appropriate interventions aimed at encouraging insured individuals to seek early
52 medical attention when signs of diseases emerge.
53

54 **Introduction**

55 High costs of care in developing countries are recognized as a leading cause of poor health
56 care utilization, poor health outcomes and a key factor in precipitating poverty. According
57 to (1), 800 million people worldwide spend at least 10 percent of their household budget on
58 health care expenses. For nearly 100 million people, that spending is enough to drive them
59 into extreme poverty and force them to survive on just \$1.90 or less a day. With the aim of
60 ensuring all people can access the health services they need without facing financial
61 hardships, CBHI schemes have been introduced since the second half of the 19th century in
62 the developing world (2,3). CBHI scheme is typically used to reduce inequalities in health
63 care utilization by reducing the cost of care. This scheme are established on the basis of
64 existing principles of social solidarity, operate at the community level and allow
65 community involvement in scheme management (4). Typically, membership fees are low
66 and substantial portion of healthcare costs are, therefore, subsidized by the government.
67 The scheme differs from social health insurances, which is primarily for employed
68 individuals, and publicly funded health insurance programs, which are essentially free at
69 point of use and tax funded.
70

71 Extensive studies evaluating CBHI have been conducted in different countries, mainly
72 examining the impact on health care utilization and out-of-pocket spending (5–12).
73 While CBHI seems promising in terms of enhancing health care utilization, concerns have
74 been raised about its sustainability as a health financing system (13–15). In the context of
75 Tanzania, (16) identified the presence of large claims, leading to the suggestion that
76 policymakers should confront a tradeoff between reducing the health benefit package or
77 increasing revenues to facilitate the nationwide expansion of the existing insurance scheme.
78 This concern resonates with findings from (14), who observed excess claim costs and
79 negative net income within Ethiopian CBHI in specific districts. A similar concern has
80 been expressed by the relevant government officials regarding Ethiopian CBHI (17). Large
81 claims in CBHI may stem from various factors, including ex-ante and ex-post moral
82 hazard problems (18). Ex-post moral hazard refers to the situation where beneficiaries
83 might become excessive healthcare consumers once they are insured, especially those who
84 enroll with severe existing health conditions, driven by a perceived lack of financial

85 barriers to seeking care. They may be more likely to seek medical care, driving up claim
86 costs. On the other hand, ex-ante moral hazard may manifest as a lack of preventive
87 practices or unhealthy behaviors among beneficiaries, leading to a higher likelihood of
88 future health issues and, subsequently, large claims.

89
90 While there is limited empirical evidence on whether adverse behavior by beneficiaries
91 contributes to rising healthcare costs in CBHI schemes, studies based on different insurance
92 schemes provide mixed insights. In developed countries, (19–22) suggests that insurance
93 can drive unhealthy lifestyles among policyholders, given that the health consequences of
94 their behavior are shared between insurers and policyholders. Conversely, studies like
95 (18,23–25) report increased utilization of preventive care with no evidence of risky health
96 behaviors among the insured individuals. One perspective on this phenomenon, as
97 discussed in (18), is that while insurance covers the financial aspect of healthcare access,
98 risk-averse individuals might still experience utility losses due to ill health. Consequently,
99 this factor could potentially mitigate the incentives for insured individuals to reduce their
100 preventive efforts.

101
102 In the context of low-income settings, (26–28) have made initial attempts to understand
103 behavioral responses to insurance schemes. (27) examined the impact of a CBHI scheme in
104 Burkina Faso on the probability of individuals seeking care when sick while, (26,28)
105 focused on the effects of insurance on preventive activities, such as use of malaria bed
106 nets.

107
108 In this paper we examine the effects of Ethiopian CBHI on behavioral response by
109 assessing preventive care activities, such as hand-washing before meals and water treatment
110 before drinking. Additionally, we analyze the timing of care-seeking behavior in
111 hypothetical cases of Malaria, Tetanus, and Tuberculosis symptoms. Our main departure
112 from the literature is while previous studies, such as (12,27,29,30), have primarily focused
113 on the treatment methods chosen by beneficiaries, our study looks at when households
114 decide to seek care upon the onset of disease symptoms. This approach is particularly
115 relevant for policymakers, as delayed care-seeking behavior among beneficiaries can have
116 cost implications for the insurer and potentially impact the financial sustainability of the
117 CBHI scheme.

118
119 In Ethiopia, CBHI has been implemented since 2011 to cover people operating in the
120 informal sector (rural and urban). The scheme provides financial protection for low-income
121 families to foster healthcare utilization thereby to improve their health status. Initially, four
122 regions out of nine administrative regions were covered by the program. Within these four
123 regions 13 districts were selected to gauge the response of households and later expanded to
124 cover other districts. Since this pilot stage, by June 2022, 879 districts located in six
125 regions and two city administrations (Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa) have joined the scheme
126 and it has enrolled more than 40% of the population in the country. As part of the Health
127 Sector Transformation Plan, it is also planned to cover 80% of districts and to enroll 80% of
128 the households at national level (Data from EHIS 2022).

129
130 Using three rounds of household panel data and applying a household fixed-effect
131 approach, we did not find a significant effect on preventive care behaviors. However,
132 participation in CBHI appears to be associated with increased delays in accessing modern
133 healthcare.

134
135
136
137
138

This paper is organized in six sections: section 2 describes Community-Based health insurance, section 3 presents data, section 4 empirical approach, section 5 provides results and discussions, and section 6 concludes.

139 **Community-based health insurance in Ethiopia**

140 Geographically, Ethiopia is divided into twelve regions and two administrative cities. Within the
141 public health system, the provision of healthcare infrastructure increased between 2000 and 2015 in
142 all parts of the country (8). Following the expansion of healthcare infrastructure, a key motivation
143 was to enhance the accessibility of healthcare services with the assumption that improved
144 accessibility would encourage greater utilization of care. However, despite these efforts, a significant
145 hurdle persisted – individuals were required to cover healthcare expenses out-of-pocket. This
146 financial barrier had a notable impact on healthcare utilization, resulting in continued low rates of
147 utilization. For instance, in the years 2009, 2010, and 2011, outpatient attendance per capita,
148 defined as the total outpatient attendance over the total population, stood at rates of 0.29, 0.3, and
149 0.29, respectively (31).

150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164

In response to this, the CBHI scheme was introduced in June 2011, specifically targeting those engaged in the informal sector both in rural and urban areas. The overall goal of the scheme is to achieve universal health coverage by ensuring low-cost access to health services, especially for those who cannot afford to use them. Initially, the scheme was piloted in thirteen woredas (hereafter districts) selected from four main regions (Tigray, Amhara, Oromia, and SNNP). The complete set of district selection criteria included (1) Willingness of district authorities to implement the schemes (2) Commitment of districts to support schemes, (3) Geographical accessibility of health centers (4) Quality of health centers, (5) The implementation of cost recovery, local revenue retention, and public pharmacy policies in health centers (8). Village level implementation of the scheme is decided by a majority vote of the residing households while households' enrolment in the scheme is voluntary. To curtail the problem of adverse selection, registration is accepted at the household level. Therefore, all household members must present their family insurance card to access the benefit packages at health care points.

165 Premium is a fixed rate, unlike other types of insurance that tend to be progressive based on
166 income. This is decided by the federal government in collaboration with local governments and other
167 stakeholders. At the beginning, the annual cost of premiums for households was low, ranging from
168 126 to 180 Ethiopian Birr (ETB), but from 2020 the premium increased to 350 (\$10) for urban
169 households and 240 ETB (\$7) for households living in rural areas. This cost amount to 0.5 to 1%
170 of household monthly income (32), but it might vary slightly across regions depending on
171 household characteristics (8). For instance, for a core household with a parent and all children
172 under 18, the monthly premium for the first year is 10.50 ETB in SNNP, 11 ETB in Tigray, and
173 15 ETB in Oromia. Households pay a one-time registration fee and premiums to the village
174 office, which then transfers the funds to the CBHI scheme (32). The scheme also targets and
175 provides fee waivers to the poorest households in the pilot districts. However, only few of eligible
176 households have actually joined the scheme with fee waiver benefits, not more than 10% of the
177 population in the district.

178
179
180
181
182
183
184

CBHI benefit package includes inpatient and outpatient domestic treatment, but it does not cover non-medical costs such as transportation to a facility. The program offers treatment options in urban public hospitals, but patients must follow referral procedures. Under CBHI, there is no co-payment and no limit on the number of services provided. However, treatments obtained from private health facilities (except for services that are not available at public facilities) or abroad and treatments which have largely cosmetic value are not covered under the scheme.

185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195

In Table 1 we show enrollment, drop-out and new membership rate in CBHI for each region and for various years. The overall enrollment rate was 41% in 2012 but increased to 48% in 2013. 18% of households enrolled in 2012 dropped out and 25% of uninsured households in 2012 became insured in 2013. Enrollment, drop-out and membership renewal varies across regions where pilot districts reside. Scheme uptake seems to be higher in the Amhara region with greater enrollment rates, lower dropout rates and the second highest new membership rate. The lowest enrollment incidence is recorded in SNNP region in both years. Tigray regions show the highest new membership rate at the same time experienced highest dropout rate.

Table 1: CBHI enrolment and drop-out in the pilot regions

Regions	Enrolled		Enrolled		Dopped-Out		New Members	
	2012		2013		2013		2013	
	%	obs	%	obs	%	obs	%	obs
Tigray	25.65	99	37.66	145	26.53	26	25.44	73
Amhara	37.15	146	47.07	185	6.85	10	19.84	49
Oromia	33.25	132	33.08	132	21.21	28	10.49	28
SNNP	27.3	107	27.3	107	21.5	23	8.07	23
Total	30.87	484	36.27	569	18.01	87	15.93	173

196

This table report CBHI takeup, dropout, and new membership in the balanced data.

197 Data

198 In this paper, we used three rounds of household panel data from rural Ethiopia, which was
199 collected as part of the research project on Poverty Dynamics, Health Shocks and
200 Coping Strategies in Ethiopia. This was a collaboration project of the International
201 Institute of Social Studies (ISS) of Erasmus University Rotterdam, the Ethiopian
202 Economics Association (EAA) and the Organization for Social Science Research in
203 Eastern and Southern Africa (OSSREA).

204
205 The first round of surveys was collected between March and April in 2011, a few months
206 before the launch of the CBHI program. The subsequent rounds were collected again
207 between March and April in 2012 and between March and April in 2013 after the launch of
208 the CBHI. The data collection involved 8 teams, each comprising 4 enumerators and 1
209 supervisor. Each team was assigned to collect data from 2 districts.

210
211 The surveys cover 16 districts located in four main regional states of Ethiopia, namely
212 Tigray, Amhara, Oromia and SNNP. Twelve of these districts operate CBHI program,
213 while one district in each region did not start offering CBHI. The survey includes a
214 information about individuals, households and community level questions. When collecting
215 the data, 6 villages from each district were selected randomly and 17 households from each
216 village were randomly selected from lists kept by the village administrations. The first
217 round of the survey thus included 1,632 households which were tracked longitudinally. In
218 the second survey round (in 2012) it was possible to resurvey 1,599 households, leading to
219 a 2% attrition. The third survey round contain 1,583 of the households, with an overall
220 3% attrition from the original sample.

221
222 Given that enrollment is accepted at a household rather than the individual level, we are
223 interested in household level lifestyle and timing of treatment seeking measures. Our
224 outcome variables are the following. First, we construct a binary indicator variable that
225 takes a value one if individuals in a household wash hands before and after meals and zero

226 otherwise. Second, another binary indicator variable that takes a value one for households
227 that treat water before drinking (filters, boils or apply other methods to make it safe) and
228 zero otherwise.

229
230 In the data we have information about what households would do if symptoms of disease,
231 specifically malaria, tetanus, and tuberculosis, were detected in an adult member of the
232 household. More than 95% of the households stated that they would take them to modern
233 healthcare providers. There is a follow-up question asking when they would take them to
234 their choice of modern care. The answer to this question for Malaria, Tetanus and
235 Tuberculosis (TB) is categorically 1 if they would take them immediately, 2 if they
236 would take them the next day if symptoms persist, 3 if they would take them after two
237 days if symptoms persist, 4 if they would take them to care between three days and a week, 5 if
238 they would take them to care after a week if symptoms persist, and 6 if they would take
239 them to care after more than a week if symptoms persist. Each stage indicates households
240 behavioral response to waiting time for each illness episode, allowing us to investigate the
241 effects of CBHI on whether the insured tends to receive immediate or delayed treatment.
242 These outcomes are based on clinical health need vignettes, where each household responded
243 to hypothetical scenario questions. For more details, refer to Appendix.

244
245 Generally, the literature assessing the association between health insurance and lifestyle
246 mainly focuses on individual behavior in relation to diet, smoking, alcohol drinking and
247 exercise, (18,20,22,33). Unfortunately, we do not have this information to extend our
248 analysis in this direction. However, we believe these outcomes would only be marginally
249 relevant for our purposes as we expect lower prevalence of smoking or alcohol
250 consumption and little physical activity due to limited infrastructure in the rural areas
251 where our data were collected.

252
253 In our study, the selection of washing hands and treat water or not as key outcomes
254 stems from a clear perspective. While CBHI is traditionally expected to promote health-
255 conscious behaviors, we recognize that in certain contexts, it might lead to riskier behavior
256 due to the financial security it provides. This paradoxical effect may also extend to the
257 timing of healthcare-seeking behavior for illness symptoms. Specifically, while having
258 CBH expected to encourage immediate care-seeking, can, in fact, lead individuals to
259 perceive minor symptoms as less urgent and delay care. Particularly, the reduction in
260 financial barriers can lead some to feel less urgency in seeking care for what they consider
261 minor symptoms. Additionally, the insured may incur additional costs when visiting a
262 healthcare facility, including transportation, lost work time, accommodation, meals, and
263 incidentals. Even though the medical costs are covered, some may perceive their symptoms
264 as not worth the related expense, leading to delayed care.

265

266 **Ethics Statement**

267 Ethics approval for the study was obtained from the Ethics Committee at the International
268 Institute of Social Studies, Erasmus University Rotterdam (reference: iss0001946).
269 Committee is chaired by the Deputy Rector for Research Affairs (then, Professor Mohamed
270 Salih).

271
272 Our study participants are household heads and we interviewed individuals who are aged above
273 18 years old and consent regarding child participants is not applicable in our case.

274

275 The data collection involved sequential rounds of household recruitment, starting on March 1,
276 2011, and concluding on April 30, 2011, with subsequent rounds conducted at one-year
277 intervals and two-year intervals at the same time window. Participants (household heads)
278 provided verbal informed consent for their participation in the study. The verbal consent process
279 involved a detailed explanation of the study purpose, procedures, and potential benefits.
280 Participants verbally expressed their willingness to participate, and this process was documented
281 by the interviewer's team.

282

283

284 **Empirical approach**

285 To examine the impact of CBHI on household lifestyles and timing of healthcare seeking,
286 we implement a household fixed-effect model, exploiting the longitudinal nature of our
287 data. We specify our fixed effects model as follows:

288

289

$$Y_{ht} = \alpha + \beta CBHI_{ht} + \sum_j \mu_j X_{jht} + \delta_h + \delta_t + \eta_{ht}$$

290 Where Y_{ht} represents the household-level outcomes at time t , which includes handwashing
291 before meals, water treatment before drinking, and the timing of care-seeking for illness
292 symptoms (Malaria, Tetanus, and TB). CBHI is a binary outcome that distinguishes the
293 insured and uninsured households. Hence, β is our parameter of interest, which capture
294 the effect of being insured by CBHI. We include a vector X_{jht} of covariates that might
295 potentially influence both the outcomes and CBHI enrollment. The controls included
296 are indicator for male household head, household size, number of under 6 years old
297 children, number of male youth (6-15 years), number of female youth (6-15 years), number
298 of working age women (16-64 years), number of elderly (over 64 years old), time to nearest
299 health center, time to nearest hospital, time to all-weather road, households with improved
300 water and modern light sources. We also include education level of the head of
301 household, education level of the spouse, marital status of the head of household, his/her
302 main religion, household consumption per capita, and the region of residence of the household.
303 δ_h and δ_t represent household and time fixed effects, respectively. The household fixed effect
304 allows us to control for any observed or unobserved time invariant characteristics that affect the
305 outcomes and enrollment decisions. And by including time fixed effect, we take into
306 account general changes in lifestyle over the years. η_{ht} denotes the idiosyncratic error
307 term.

308

309 To account for potential correlation across households within the same geographic area, we
310 cluster standard errors at the village level (34,35).

311 Results

312

313 **Baseline characteristics of the insured and uninsured households**

314 Table 2 reports the 2011 baseline characteristics of insured and uninsured households in
315 both pilot and non-pilot woredas. In our sample, both groups are comparable in terms of
316 household composition, but insured households are, on average, farther from health centers,
317 hospitals, and all-weather roads. Access to improved water, and modern light sources is
318 slightly better among the insured.

319

320 The insured households have better-educated heads and spouses. The heads are more

321 married, less divorced, and widowed compared to uninsured household heads. In terms of
 322 religious denomination, most of the heads of the insured are Orthodox Christians, while
 323 Muslims are relatively dominant among the uninsured. On average, per capita
 324 consumption is higher for insured households. The majority of the insured group in our
 325 sample originates from Amhara, which is Ethiopia's second most populous region. In
 326 contrast, a higher proportion of uninsured households are located in the SNNP region.
 327

328
 329
 330

Table 2: Baseline characteristics of control variables between insured and uninsured (balanced panel)

Independent Var	Insured household (2011)		Uninsured household (2011)	
	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.
331 Household composition				
Head sex (Male= 1)	0.88	0.32	0.85	0.36
Household size	6.06	2.17	5.6	2.19
Number of under 6 children	0.14	0.15	0.16	0.17
Number of young male (6-15)	0.16	0.15	0.15	0.16
Number of young age female (6-15)	0.15	0.14	0.14	0.15
Number of working age female (16-64)	0.25	0.14	0.25	0.15
Number of elderly (age>64)	0.04	0.11	0.06	0.16
Time to health center	67.46	45.04	60.58	40.67
Time to hospital	113.57	67.31	105.87	68.74
Time to all weather road	37.7	37.71	31.93	35.92
Have improved water source	0.78	0.41	0.77	0.42
Have modern light source	0.08	0.27	0.07	0.25
332 Education Status Reference- No education				
Head education informal	0.16	0.37	0.09	0.29
Head education primary	0.37	0.48	0.35	0.48
Head education secondary	0.05	0.21	0.03	0.18
Spouse education informal	0.08	0.27	0.03	0.17
Spouse education primary	0.18	0.38	0.17	0.38
Spouse education secondary	0.02	0.13	0.02	0.12
333 Marital status Reference-Single				
Married	0.87	0.34	0.83	0.38
Divorced	0.05	0.22	0.06	0.24
Widowed/other	0.07	0.26	0.1	0.3
334 Religion Reference-Other or no religion				
Orthodox	0.59	0.49	0.43	0.49
Protestant	0.14	0.35	0.26	0.44
Muslim	0.27	0.44	0.27	0.44
335 Per capita consumption Reference-				
Quintile 2	0.18	0.39	0.23	0.42
Quintile 3	0.21	0.41	0.19	0.39
Quintile 4	0.22	0.42	0.18	0.39
Quintile 5	0.21	0.4	0.18	0.39
336 Region Reference Tigray				
Amhara	0.33	0.47	0.15	0.36
Oromia	0.26	0.44	0.24	0.43
SNNP	0.18	0.38	0.34	0.47
Total observations	862		708	

337
 338

339

340

341

342 **Trends in lifestyle measures and healthcare seeking behavior**

343 In Table 3 we show the average level of each outcome by treatment status (insured versus
 344 uninsured households - pilot and non-pilot) and survey year. The statistics prior to CBHI
 345 implementation is based on enrollment status in post CBHI intervention period (2012,
 346 and 2013). Washing hands before meals shows a slight increase in insured households
 347 over the years, while this trend decreased in 2013 among uninsured households. When it
 348 comes to water treatment, the trend is more V-shaped among the insured but reverses
 349 among the uninsured. Among the insured, the preferred waiting time for treatment of
 350 Malaria, Tetanus, and TB appears to have been dropped immediately after CBHI launch,
 351 but then increased in 2013. While for the uninsured, with the exception of tetanus, the trend
 352 is consistently downward.

353 Table 3: Trends in household lifestyle indicators by enrollment status (balanced panel)

Dep. var	Insured Households						Uninsured Households					
	2011		2012		2013		2011		2012		2013	
	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.
Wash hands	0.95	0.21	0.97	0.16	0.99	0.08	0.88	0.33	0.93	0.25	0.94	0.23
Water treatment	0.18	0.38	0.17	0.38	0.07	0.26	0.10	0.30	0.14	0.34	0.07	0.25
Seek care malaria	2.23	1.12	2.30	1.04	2.12	1.14	2.59	1.35	2.31	1.01	2.24	1.16
Seek care tetanus	2.19	1.32	2.03	1.14	2.23	1.36	2.68	1.51	2.20	1.12	2.29	1.31
Seek care TB	2.76	1.53	2.72	1.39	2.79	1.70	3.32	1.72	2.80	1.31	2.74	1.61

354

355 **Baseline estimates**

356 In Table, 4 we present the effects of CBHI on household lifestyle indicators. We offer
 357 these estimates in two distinct ways: First, by comparing insured households with
 358 uninsured households in the pilot districts. Second, by combining uninsured households
 359 from both pilot and non-pilot districts as the control group. This approach allows us to
 360 assess how the effects vary depending on the composition of the control households,
 361 providing insights into the sensitivity and generalizability of the findings.

362

363 Our estimate shows that participation in the CBHI scheme does not affect behavior related
 364 to hygiene and water treatment before drinking regardless of the location of control
 365 households. However, in terms of waiting time, we find a delay of approximately 0.18 to
 366 0.27 points in the average treatment seeking timing outcome for Malaria symptoms in
 367 insured households compared to uninsured households. Given the scale of the dependent
 368 variable where higher levels indicate longer delays, this suggests that having CBHI is
 369 associated with a modest increase in delaying the timing of treatment. This result is
 370 statistically significant irrespective of the composition of control households, but the point
 371 estimates slightly decreases when this composition is both from the pilot and non-pilot
 372 districts. There is also a significant but relatively weak effect on preferred waiting time
 373 for Tetanus treatment. In this case, CBHI participation results in 0.19 point increases in
 374 waiting time for tetanus treatment when comparing the insured versus the uninsured in the
 375 pilot districts only. This marginal effect disappears when we consider the uninsured
 376 households from both pilot and non-pilot districts. Finally, participation in CBHI also
 377 increase relatively substantial delay (0.45 - 0.42 points more in the average treatment

378 timing) in treatment timing if a TB illness symptoms are seen in adult member of the
 379 household.
 380

381 Table 4: Impact of CBHI on household lifestyle: Fixed effect estimates (balanced panel)

Dep. Var	Wash hands		Treat water		Time to seek care for Malaria		Time to seek care for Tetanus		Time to seek care for TB	
	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts
CBHI	0.020 (0.018)	0.007 (0.017)	-0.040 (0.027)	-0.026 (0.028)	0.266*** (0.092)	0.182** (0.090)	0.190* (0.098)	0.160 (0.098)	0.454*** (0.145)	0.424*** (0.127)
Observations	3,345	4,390	3,348	4,394	3,276	4,264	3,246	4,228	3,282	4,298
Controls	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Avg. outcome	0.945	0.940	0.107	0.118	2.256	2.285	2.217	2.259	2.777	2.823

382 All control variables previously described are included. Standard errors in parenthesis are clustered at village level. Significance
 383 levels: P-value *** ≤ 0.01 , ** ≤ 0.05 , * ≤ 0.1 .

384

385 Robustness

386 Dichotomizing timing of treatment seeking behavior

387 We assess the sensitivity of our baseline estimates by converting treatment seeking
 388 outcome variables into binary indicators, measuring the effect on extensive margin.
 389 Specifically, we create an outcome that takes a value of one if a household would seek care
 390 immediately or the next day and zero otherwise for each illness symptoms (malaria, tetanus,
 391 and tuberculosis). Similar to the baseline, we assess the impact in a setting where the
 392 control groups are initially the uninsured in pilot districts and where the controls consist of
 393 uninsured households in pilot and non-pilot districts.
 394

395 Table 5 shows that our findings are robust, with the exception of tetanus. In particular, we
 396 find a reduction in immediate or next-day medical care seeking behavior among insureds
 397 compared to uninsured in pilot districts or uninsured in both pilot and non-pilot districts. In
 398 fact, the effect on tetanus is also robust, since initially the effect on tetanus symptoms was
 399 weaker. In overall, the estimates confirms that, as compared to those who are uninsured,
 400 the incidence of seeking immediate medical care for insured individuals are less by 7-10
 401 percentage points for malaria and by 7-7.4 percentage points for tuberculosis.

402 Table 5: Impact of CBHI on treatment seeking behavior: Extensive margin (balanced panel)

Dep. Var	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
	Time to seek care for Malaria	Time to seek care for Malaria	Time to seek care for Tetanus	Time to seek care for Tetanus	Time to seek care for TB	Time to seek care for TB
	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non-pilot districts
CBHI	-0.097*** (0.034)	-0.065* (0.033)	-0.054 (0.034)	-0.044 (0.033)	-0.074* (0.040)	-0.066* (0.036)
Observations	3,277	4,266	3,247	4,229	3,282	4,298
Controls	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Avg. outcome	0.620	0.606	0.638	0.616	0.501	0.479

403 All control variables previously described are included. Standard errors in parenthesis are clustered at village level.
 404 Significance levels: P-value *** ≤ 0.01 , ** ≤ 0.05 , * ≤ 0.1 .

405

406

407

408 **Fixed effect Ordered logit estimator**

409 Our baseline findings, obtained through a linear fixed effect estimator, are based on the
 410 assumption of equidistant intervals between the six categories of the timing of treatment-
 411 seeking outcome. We explore the sensitivity of our results to this assumption by
 412 employing a fixed effect ordered logit model with blow-up and cluster estimator. Unlike
 413 the linear model, the ordered logit estimator only assumes the ordered nature of response
 414 options and does not presuppose equal intervals between them (26). We adopt feologit user
 415 written command contributed by (36).

416

417 The results in Table 6 is generally in agreement with the baseline finding. Particularly,
 418 insured households exhibit 1.36 to 1.61 times higher odds of falling into a higher wait time
 419 category for malaria symptom treatment and 1.70 to 1.77 times higher odds for tuberculosis
 420 treatment compared to uninsured households, with all other model variables held constant.
 421 Similar to the baseline, this estimator shows a weak effect in the case of tetanus
 422 symptoms. Overall, this estimator appears to sustain the baseline finding that enrollment
 423 in CBHI is associated with delay in treatment.

424

425 Table 6: Impact of CBHI on the timing of treatment seeking behavior: Ordered logit regression

Dep. Var	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
	Time to seek care for Malaria		Time to seek care for Tetanus		Time to seek care for TB	
	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non- pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non- pilot districts	Control: Pilot districts	Control: Pilot and non- pilot districts
CBHI	1.608*** (0.260)	1.359** (0.208)	1.336* (0.201)	1.281* (0.192)	1.772*** (0.317)	1.703*** (0.269)
Observations	2869	3692	2792	3565	2978	3872
Controls	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES	YES
Avg. outcome	2.288	2.326	2.292	2.352	2.829	2.875

426

427 This table reports the odds ratios from a fixed effect ordered logit estimator. Standard errors in parenthesis are
 428 clustered at village level. Significance levels: P-value *** ≤ 0.01 , ** ≤ 0.05 , * ≤ 0.1 .

429

430

431 **Discussion**

432 Overall, while we don't find changes in preventive care activities, CBHI appears to
 433 increase delay in seeking care for illness symptoms. Delayed use of primary health care use
 434 could increase the risk of developing worse health conditions and may substantially
 435 increase health care costs. It could also create considerable challenges for the financial
 436 sustainability of insurance schemes (14,37,38). Since the Ethiopian CBHI is primarily
 437 intended for rural residents who are largely poor, an immediate visit for symptoms of
 438 illness would be costly to them. This is because, in rural areas, mainly health posts are
 439 available, but these facilities engaged in provision of preventive and promotion health
 440 services, and they do not provide curative care. In order to get medical care, they need
 441 to travel to the urban areas where health centers and hospitals are established. Visiting
 442 these facilities involves transportation infrastructure and subsistence costs that are not
 covered by CBHI scheme.

443

444 The existing evidence also indicates that one of the reasons for low utilization of modern
445 care in rural Ethiopia is transportation barriers (39,40). In addition, seeking immediate care
446 for rural people would result in disruption of productive activity and loss of income while
447 off farming. This opportunity cost might weigh more than the benefit from the household's
448 perspective (41). This rationale aligns with evidence from rural China, where factors such
449 as involvement in farming, longer distances to the hospital, and awareness were
450 significantly associated with higher odds of delaying care for TB (42). Knowledge is
451 likewise reported as the key factor in delaying TB treatment in Ethiopian context
452 (43,44) and for malaria higher waiting time at the health facility was associated with
453 increased delay in treatment (45). However, our finding may contrast (46) which reveals
454 the reverse, highlighting delayed treatment-seeking for actual TB symptoms among
455 individuals without health insurance.

456

457 In the context of preventive care, our findings aligns with studies by (24,47–49), which
458 also report insignificant impacts of other health insurance schemes. However, the broader
459 literature paints a varied picture, with the majority of studies showing significant effects
460 that depend on the scope of insurance coverage and the country of study. For instance,
461 (28) reported significant increase in unhealthy practices related to the use of malaria
462 protective materials among members of the Ghanaian National Health Insurance Scheme,
463 although this finding contradicts the results of a randomized experiment (26). In a similar
464 insurance context, (20) suggested that participation in China's Rural Cooperative Medical
465 Scheme encourages risky behaviors, such as smoking, heavy drinking, low physical
466 activity, consumption of high-calorie food, and being overweight. Studies in countries with
467 advanced insurance programs, (21,22,50), have shown increases in unhealthy individual
468 behaviors, such as heavy smoking, weight gain and lack of exercise in relation to private
469 insurance and Medicare. In contrast, (18,23,33) indicates that participation in insurance
470 programs can improve preventive care activities. This disparity is likely due to variations in
471 outcomes, research methodologies, and contextual factors.

472

473 In (19) a distinction is made between various sources of insurance to identify which ones
474 lead to increased risky behavior. The findings indicate that public health insurance may
475 contribute to higher inefficiencies in terms of exacerbating unhealthy behavior when
476 compared to private insurance. This suggests that, as observed in the Ethiopian context,
477 public health insurance schemes may face challenges in effectively controlling unhealthy
478 practices such as delay in care seeking among insurance beneficiaries and in developing
479 efficient insurance programs.

480

481 The results of this work shed new light on the understanding of the impact of CBHI scheme
482 beyond its primary objectives of promoting healthcare utilization and reducing the burden
483 of out-of-pocket health expenditure. While many CBHI schemes in developing country aim
484 to counteract adverse selection, little attention has been paid to possible adverse behavioral
485 responses from members. The evidence in this study implies the need to identify and solve
486 major causes of delay in seeking medical services among health insurance members. This
487 is important step to promote early use of services and, consequently, maintain financial
488 sustainability of the Ethiopian CBHI scheme.

489

490

491

492

493 **Conclusion**

494 There is an increasing number of studies highlighting concern about the financial
495 sustainability of CBHI schemes in developing countries. We partially respond to such
496 concern by examining the potential contribution of lifestyle and delayed care seeking
497 behavior in the context of Ethiopian CBHI. We find that CBHI increased waiting time
498 for treatment for malaria, tetanus and tuberculosis symptoms. The key important
499 implication for the insurer is that this delayed treatment would incur higher costs than
500 immediate treatment. If there are many such insured households delaying treatment,
501 perhaps the CBHI could collapse due to a large claim for reimbursement of care costs.

502

503 The expansion of CBHI in conjunction with supply-side investments such as improving the
504 accessibility of healthcare could mitigate such behavioral responses from members. Also,
505 improving the quality of care and increasing the staff could potentially reduce waiting times
506 at the health center, which could partially reduce the opportunity cost of seeking immediate
507 care.

508

509 Due to data limitation, we could not further explore behavioral responses in terms of other
510 indicators such as physical exercise, smoking, and alcohol consumption and potential
511 underlying mechanisms for the reported results. There is, therefore, ample scope for future
512 research in this area, including our limitations. CBHI is often considered a better
513 alternative to out-of-pocket expenditure on the path towards achieving universal health
514 coverage. Therefore, finding out other dimensions of factors that contribute to
515 counteracting CBHI in developing country is very important.

516

517 **References**

518

- 519 1. WHO. Global Nutrition Monitoring Framework: operational guidance for tracking progress
520 in meeting targets for 2025. 2017;
- 521 2. Carrin G, Waelkens MP, Criel B. Community-based health insurance in developing
522 countries: a study of its contribution to the performance of health financing systems. *Trop*
523 *Med Int Health*. 2005;10(8):799–811.
- 524 3. Bennett S. The role of community-based health insurance within the health care financing
525 system: a framework for analysis. *Health Policy Plan*. 2004;19(3):147–58.
- 526 4. Smith KV, Sulzbach S. Community-based health insurance and access to maternal health
527 services: evidence from three West African countries. *Soc Sci Med*. 2008;66(12):2460–73.
- 528 5. Atnafu A, Gebremedhin T. Community-Based Health Insurance Enrollment and Child
529 Health Service Utilization in Northwest Ethiopia: A Cross-Sectional Case Comparison
530 Study. *Clin Outcomes Res CEOR*. 2020;12:435.
- 531 6. Khan JA, Ahmed S, Sultana M, Sarker AR, Chakrovorty S, Rahman MH, et al. The effect of
532 a community-based health insurance on the out-of-pocket payments for utilizing medically

- 533 trained providers in Bangladesh. *Int Health*. 2020;12(4):287–98.
- 534 7. Demissie B, Negeri KG. Effect of community-based health insurance on utilization of
535 outpatient health care services in Southern Ethiopia: a comparative cross-sectional study.
536 *Risk Manag Healthc Policy*. 2020;13:141.
- 537 8. Mebratie AD, Sparrow R, Yilma Z, Abebaw D, Alemu G, Bedi AS. The impact of
538 Ethiopia’s pilot community based health insurance scheme on healthcare utilization and cost
539 of care. *Soc Sci Med*. 2019;220:112–9.
- 540 9. Alkenbrack S, Lindelow M. The impact of community-based health insurance on utilization
541 and out-of-pocket expenditures in Lao People’s Democratic Republic. *Health Econ*.
542 2015;24(4):379–99.
- 543 10. Yilma Z, Mebratie A, Sparrow R, Dekker M, Alemu G, Bedi AS. Impact of Ethiopia’s
544 community based health insurance on household economic welfare. *World Bank Econ Rev*.
545 2015;29(suppl_1):S164–73.
- 546 11. Mekonen AM, Gebregziabher MG, Teferra AS. The effect of community based health
547 insurance on catastrophic health expenditure in Northeast Ethiopia: A cross sectional study.
548 *PloS One*. 2018;13(10):e0205972.
- 549 12. Gnawali DP, Pokhrel S, Sié A, Sanon M, De Allegri M, Souares A, et al. The effect of
550 community-based health insurance on the utilization of modern health care services:
551 evidence from Burkina Faso. *Health Policy*. 2009;90(2–3):214–22.
- 552 13. Nyandekwe M, Nzayirambaho M, Kakoma JB. Universal health insurance in Rwanda:
553 major challenges and solutions for financial sustainability case study of Rwanda
554 community-based health insurance part I. *Pan Afr Med J [Internet]*. 2020 Sep [cited 2023
555 Oct 20];37(1). Available from: <https://www.ajol.info/index.php/pamj/article/view/212489>
- 556 14. Hussien M, Azage M, Bayou NB. Financial viability of a community-based health insurance
557 scheme in two districts of northeast Ethiopia: a mixed methods study. 2022;
- 558 15. De Allegri M, Sauerborn R, Kouyaté B, Flessa S. Community health insurance in sub-
559 Saharan Africa: what operational difficulties hamper its successful development? *Trop Med*
560 *Int Health*. 2009;14(5):586–96.
- 561 16. Durizzo K, Harttgen K, Tediosi F, Sahu M, Kuwawenaruwa A, Salari P, et al. Toward
562 mandatory health insurance in low-income countries? An analysis of claims data in
563 Tanzania. *Health Econ*. 2022;31(10):2187–207.
- 564 17. Mulat AK, Mao W, Bharali I, Balkew RB, Yamey G. Scaling up community-based health
565 insurance in Ethiopia: a qualitative study of the benefits and challenges. *BMC Health Serv*
566 *Res*. 2022;22(1):1–12.
- 567 18. Chen C, Liu GG, Wang T, Tan J. Ex-ante moral hazard and health insurance: Evidence from
568 China’s urban residence basic medical insurance scheme. *Health Econ*. 2023;32(11):2516–
569 34.

- 570 19. Botkins ER. Does Health Insurance Encourage Obesity? A Moral hazard Study. 2015.
- 571 20. Qin X, Lu T. Does Health Insurance Lead to Ex ante Moral Hazard? Evidence from China's
572 New Rural Cooperative Medical Scheme. Geneva Pap Risk Insur - Issues Pract. 2014
573 Oct;39(4):625–50.
- 574 21. Dave D, Kaestner R. Health insurance and ex ante moral hazard: evidence from Medicare.
575 Int J Health Care Finance Econ. 2009;9(4):367.
- 576 22. Stanciole AE. Health insurance and lifestyle choices: Identifying ex ante moral hazard in the
577 US market. Geneva Pap Risk Insur-Issues Pract. 2008;33(4):627–44.
- 578 23. Yu NN, Zhu X. Affordable care encourages healthy living: Theory and evidence from
579 China's new cooperative medical scheme. Health Econ. 2018;27(12):2051–66.
- 580 24. Simon K, Soni A, Cawley J. The Impact of Health Insurance on Preventive Care and Health
581 Behaviors: Evidence from the First Two Years of the ACA Medicaid Expansions. J Policy
582 Anal Manage. 2017;36(2):390–417.
- 583 25. Jerant A, Fiscella K, Tancredi DJ, Franks P. Health insurance is associated with preventive
584 care but not personal health behaviors. J Am Board Fam Med. 2013;26(6):759–67.
- 585 26. Powell-Jackson T, Hanson K, Whitty CJ, Ansah EK. Who benefits from free healthcare?
586 Evidence from a randomized experiment in Ghana. J Dev Econ. 2014;107:305–19.
- 587 27. Robyn PJ, Fink G, Sié A, Sauerborn R. Health insurance and health-seeking behavior:
588 evidence from a randomized community-based insurance rollout in rural Burkina Faso. Soc
589 Sci Med. 2012;75(4):595–603.
- 590 28. Yilma Z, van Kempen L, de Hoop T. A perverse 'net' effect? Health insurance and ex-ante
591 moral hazard in Ghana. Soc Sci Med. 2012;75(1):138–47.
- 592 29. Amegbor PM, Kuuire VZ, Bisung E, Braimah JA. Modern or traditional health care?
593 Understanding the role of insurance in health-seeking behaviours among older Ghanaians.
594 Prim Health Care Res Dev. 2019;20:e71.
- 595 30. Jowett M, Deolalikar A, Martinsson P. Health insurance and treatment seeking behaviour:
596 evidence from a low-income country. Health Econ. 2004;13(9):845–57.
- 597 31. FMOH. Health and health related indicators in 2011 EFY. Policy Plan Dir Fed Minstry
598 Health. 2019;
- 599 32. Shigute Z, Mebratie AD, Sparrow R, Alemu G, Bedi AS. The effect of ethiopia's
600 community-based health insurance scheme on revenues and quality of care. Int J Environ
601 Res Public Health. 2020;17(22):8558.
- 602 33. Courbage C, Coulon A de. Prevention and Private Health Insurance in the U.K. Geneva Pap
603 Risk Insur - Issues Pract. 2004 Oct;29(4):719–27.
- 604 34. Abadie A, Athey S, Imbens GW, Wooldridge JM. When should you adjust standard errors
605 for clustering? Q J Econ. 2023;138(1):1–35.

- 606 35. Bertrand M, Duflo E, Mullainathan S. How much should we trust differences-in-differences
607 estimates? *Q J Econ.* 2004;119(1):249–75.
- 608 36. Baetschmann G, Ballantyne A, Staub KE, Winkelmann R. feologit: A new command for
609 fitting fixed-effects ordered logit models. *Stata J.* 2020;20(2):253–75.
- 610 37. Johansson N, de New SC, Kunz JS, Petrie D, Svensson M. Reductions in out-of-pocket
611 prices and forward-looking moral hazard in health care demand. *J Health Econ.*
612 2023;87:102710.
- 613 38. Smith KT, Monti D, Mir N, Peters E, Tipirneni R, Politi MC. Access is necessary but not
614 sufficient: factors influencing delay and avoidance of health care services. *MDM Policy*
615 *Pract.* 2018;3(1):2381468318760298.
- 616 39. Wuneh AD, Bezabih AM, Persson LÅ, Okwaraji YB, Medhanyie AA. “If I Was Educated, I
617 Would Call the Ambulance and Give Birth at the Health Facility”—A Qualitative
618 Exploratory Study of Inequities in the Utilization of Maternal, Newborn, and Child Health
619 Services in Northern Ethiopia. *Int J Environ Res Public Health.* 2022;19(18):11633.
- 620 40. Miller NP, Bagheri Ardestani F, Wong H, Stokes S, Mengistu B, Paulos M, et al. Barriers to
621 the utilization of community-based child and newborn health services in Ethiopia: a scoping
622 review. *Health Policy Plan.* 2021;36(7):1187–96.
- 623 41. Lee H, Maffioli EM, Veliz PT, Sakala I, Chiboola NM, Lori JR. Direct and opportunity
624 costs related to utilizing maternity waiting homes in rural Zambia. *Midwifery.*
625 2022;105:103211.
- 626 42. Zhao X, Yang P, Gai R, Mei L, Wang X, Xu L. Determinants of health care-seeking delay
627 among tuberculosis patients in Shandong Province, China. *Eur J Public Health.*
628 2014;24(5):757–61.
- 629 43. Obsa MS, Daga WB, Wosene NG, Gebremedhin TD, Edosa DC, Dedecho AT, et al.
630 Treatment seeking delay and associated factors among tuberculosis patients attending health
631 facility in Ethiopia from 2000 to 2020: A systematic review and meta analysis. *PloS One.*
632 2021;16(7):e0253746.
- 633 44. Wondawek TM, Ali MM. Delay in treatment seeking and associated factors among
634 suspected pulmonary tuberculosis patients in public health facilities of Adama town, eastern
635 Ethiopia. *BMC Public Health.* 2019;19(1):1–7.
- 636 45. Goshu CJ, Tafasa SM. Determinants of delay in treatment seeking among malaria patients
637 in public health facilities of Dambi Dollo and Sayyo district, Western Ethiopia: A facility
638 based case control study. *Open Access J Dis Glob Health.* 2023;1(1):6–20.
- 639 46. Yoshikawa R, Kawatsu L, Uchimura K, Ohkado A. Delay in health-care-seeking treatment
640 among tuberculosis patients in Japan: what are the implications for control in the era of
641 universal health coverage? *West Pac Surveill Response J WPSAR.* 2020;11(2):37.
- 642 47. Finkelstein A, Taubman S, Wright B, Bernstein M, Gruber J, Newhouse JP, et al. The
643 Oregon Health Insurance Experiment: Evidence from the First Year*. *Q J Econ.* 2012

644 Aug;127(3):1057–106.

645 48. de Preux LB. Anticipatory ex ante moral hazard and the effect of medicare on prevention.
646 Health Econ. 2011;20(9):1056–72.

647 49. Newhouse JP, Group RCIE. Free for All?: Lessons from the Rand Health Insurance
648 Experiment. Harvard University Press; 1993.

649 50. Dave DM, Kaestner R, Wehby GL. Does public insurance coverage for pregnant women
650 affect prenatal health behaviors? J Popul Econ. 2019 Apr;32(2):419–53.

651

652 **Appendix**

653 **Health Care Need Vignettes**

654 Respondents were asked what they would do if they or someone in their household- were to
655 experience the following symptoms themselves. Only one answer per question was
656 allowed. Interviewers were instructed to emphasize that respondents should state what they
657 would do – not what they think should be done. The questions are:

658

659 A 20 year old male has always been healthy. For the last week, he has episodes of sudden
660 coldness followed by rigor and then fever and sweating. These episodes occur about every two
661 days. In between episodes he can still do some light housework.

662

663 A 25 year old male has got a small cut in his leg when working on the field three days ago.
664 The wound has become red and from time to time he feels a throbbing pain in his leg, but
665 he can still walk around and do some work.

666

667 A 35-year-old female has been coughing for three weeks now. She feels more tired than
668 usual but can still do some housework. Her relatives think she looks thinner than a few
669 weeks ago.

670

671 The answers to when would you go to facility of choice?

672 1=immediately,

673 2=the next day if symptoms continue, 3=after two days if symptoms continue,

674 4=between three days and a week if symptoms continue, 5=after a week if symptoms
675 continue,

676 6=after more than a week if symptoms continue

677

678

679

680

681

682

683

684

685

686