Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

**Title:** Educational Mobility, the Pace of Biological Aging, and Lifespan in the Framingham Heart Study

### Authors and Affiliations:

Graf, G.H., MPH<sup>1,2</sup> Aiello, A.E., PhD<sup>1,2</sup> Caspi, A., PhD<sup>3,4,5,6</sup> Kothari, M., MPH<sup>2</sup> Liu, H., PhD<sup>7,8</sup> Moffitt, T.E., PhD<sup>3,4,5,6</sup> Muennig, P., MD, MPH<sup>9</sup> Ryan, C.P., PhD<sup>2</sup> Sugden, K., PhD<sup>3,4</sup> Belsky, D.W., PhD<sup>1,2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Epidemiology, Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health

<sup>2</sup> Robert N. Butler Columbia Aging Center

<sup>3</sup> Department of Psychology & Neuroscience, Duke University

<sup>4</sup> Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, Duke University School of Medicine

<sup>5</sup> PROMENTA, University of Oslo

<sup>6</sup> Social, Genetic & Developmental Psychiatry Centre, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology, & Neuroscience, King's College London

<sup>7</sup> School of Criminal Justice, University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, OH, USA

<sup>8</sup> Institute for Interdisciplinary Data Science, University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, OH, USA

<sup>9</sup> Department of Health Policy and Management, Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health

**Acknowledgements.** This project was supported by US National Institutes of Health Grants R01AG073402, R01AG073207, and R21AG078627. GG is supported by T32ES023772. DWB is a fellow of the CIFAR CBD Network.

**COI:** AC, TEM, KS, and DWB are listed as inventors on the Duke University and University of Otago Invention DunedinPACE, which is licensed to TruDiagnostic.

#### **Corresponding author:**

Daniel W. Belsky Associate Professor Department of Epidemiology & Butler Aging Center Columbia University Mailman School of Public Health Phone: +1 212-304-7580 Email: db3275@cumc.columbia.edu

Word Count: 2981

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

## Abstract (322 words)

**Importance:** People who complete more education live longer lives with better health. New evidence suggests that these benefits operate through a slowed pace of biological aging. If so, measurements of the pace biological aging could offer intermediate endpoints for studies of how interventions to promote education will impact healthy longevity.

**Objective:** To test the hypothesis that upward educational mobility contributes to a slower pace of biological aging and increased longevity.

**Design:** Prospective cohort study.

**Setting:** We analyzed data from three generations of participants in the Framingham Heart Study: the Original cohort, enrolled beginning in 1948, the Offspring cohort, enrolled beginning in 1971, and the Gen3 cohort, enrolled beginning in 2002. Follow-up is on-going. Data analysis was conducted during 2022-2023 using data obtained from dbGaP (phs000007.v33).

**Participants:** We constructed a three-generation database to quantify intergenerational educational mobility. We linked mobility data with blood DNA methylation data collected from the Offspring cohort in (2005-2008) (n=1,652) and the Gen3 cohort in 2009-2011 (n=1,449). These n=3,101 participants formed our analysis sample.

**Exposure:** We measured educational mobility by comparing participants' educational outcomes with those of their parents.

**Outcomes:** We measured the pace of biological aging from whole-blood DNA-methylation data using the DunedinPACE epigenetic clock. For comparison purposes, we repeated analysis using four other epigenetic clocks. Survival follow-up was conducted through 2019.

**Results:** Participants who were upwardly mobile in educational terms tended to have slower DunedinPACE in later life (r=-0.18, 95% CI [-0.23,-0.13], p<0.001). This pattern of association was similar across generations and held in within-family sibling comparisons. 402 Offspringcohort participants died over the follow-up period. Upward educational mobility was associated with lower mortality risk (HR=0.89, 95% CI [0.81,0.98] p=0.014). Slower DunedinPACE accounted for roughly half of this association.

**Conclusions and Relevance:** Our findings support the hypothesis that interventions to promote educational attainment will slow the pace of biological aging and promote longevity. Epigenetic clocks, like DunedinPACE, have potential as near-term outcome measures of intervention effects on healthy aging. Experimental evidence is needed to confirm findings.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

## INTRODUCTION

People who complete more years of schooling tend to live longer, healthier lives. This educational gradient is thought to arise through improvements in socioeconomic resources and resulting access to health services, health-promoting social networks and communities, and healthy behaviors (1,2). Educational gradients are apparent in nearly every organ system and aging-related disease, including heart disease, diabetes, cancer, Alzheimer's disease, etc. (3–11); people with higher levels of education experience a lower prevalence of aging-related disease and later age of onset of disease. This evidence of more rapid decline across organ systems suggests an overall acceleration of the pace of biological aging.

Biological aging refers to a set of processes characterized by an accumulation of molecular changes or "hallmarks" that progressively undermine the integrity and resilience capacity of our cells, tissues, and organs as we grow older (12,13). We recently developed a novel method to quantify the pace of biological aging in humans. Our approach used longitudinal phenotyping of multiorgan system decline to derive a DNA-methylation blood test measurement of the pace of biological aging, DunedinPACE: Pace of Aging Calculated in the Epigenome (14).

We recently showed that DunedinPACE is accelerated in individuals with low levels of education, and slowed in those with higher levels of education (15,16). In this study, we build on these observations to test the hypothesis that higher educational attainment promotes longevity by slowing the pace of aging. Because educational attainment is influenced by both social factors and genetic inheritance (17–20), we focused our analysis on educational mobility, i.e., differences in educational achievements of children relative to their parents. We further conducted analysis of sibling differences to address potential confounding by other factors shared within a family (21).

We measured participants' educational mobility by linking educational records across the original cohort of Framingham Heart Study ("Original" cohort), the cohort formed from the Original cohort's children and their spouses ("Offspring" cohort), and the cohort formed from the Offspring cohort's children and their spouses ("Gen3" cohort). This procedure allowed us to

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

compute educational mobility for members of the Offspring and Gen3 cohorts. For these participants, we measured pace of aging from blood DNA-methylation data using the DunedinPACE algorithm. For Offspring cohort participants, we measured longevity outcomes over 15 years of follow-up from the time of DNA methylation measurement. Our analysis proceeded in two steps. We first tested associations between educational mobility and biological aging among participants for whom data on educational mobility and blood DNA methylation were available. We then tested the extent to which mobility-mortality associations were mediated through the pace of biological aging.

## **METHODS**

<u>Data and Participants.</u> The Framingham Heart Study (FHS) is an ongoing observational cohort study first initiated in 1948. Since study initiation, two additional cohorts have been recruited, consisting of the children and grandchildren of the original Framingham cohort and their spouses. DNA methylation data are available from blood tests administered during the Offspring cohort's 8<sup>th</sup> Exam (2005-2008) and the Gen3 cohort's second exam (2009-2011).

We analyzed data from n=14,106 participants across all generations for whom education data were available. Our DNA-methylation analysis sample consisted of participants who (1) provided data on their own educational attainment; (2) who could be linked to educational data from at least one parent; and (3) had provided a blood sample for DNA methylation analysis. This sample included 1,652 members of the Offspring cohort (46% male, mean age at DNA-methylation measurement=66, SD=9) from 1,025 families and 1,449 members of the Gen3 cohort (48% male, mean age at DNA-methylation measurement=45, SD=8) from 552 families. Participant flow diagrams are shown in **Fig. 1**.

## Educational mobility.

*Educational attainment.* We harmonized measures of educational attainment across FHS cohorts by converting reported levels of educational attainment completed years of education, following the method used by Liu and colleagues (18).

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

Within each of the three FHS cohorts, participants span a wide age range. For example, for participants in our Offspring cohort sample, ages at DNA-methylation (DNAm) measurement ranged from 40-92, corresponding to birth years spanning the early through mid-20th Century. More recent birth cohorts have generally experienced social and policy environments that encouraged higher educational attainment compared to their earlier-born counterparts (22). To adjust for this temporal trend in educational attainment, we converted each participant's completed years of education into z-scores standardized to gender and 5-year birth cohort. A comprehensive account of educational attainment by birth cohort, including the methodology employed for data harmonization and standardization, can be found in the **Supplemental Methods**.

*Educational mobility.* We linked records of participants and their parents. Participants whose parents had higher levels of educational attainment tended to have higher educational attainment themselves (Pearson's r=0.35; **Supplemental Fig. S1**). We computed mobility values using residualized-change scores, which quantify mobility as the difference between a participant's educational attainment and the attainment expected based on the educational levels of their parents, and difference scores, which quantify mobility as the raw difference between parental and offspring educational attainment. Details of both approaches have been discussed in our previous work (16). Both metrics are denominated in sex- and birth-cohort-standardized units of education. On average, for both the residualized-change and difference-score methods, each unit of mobility corresponded to approximately two years of education.

## Biological Aging.

Whole-genome DNA methylation (DNAm) profiles were obtained from dbGaP (phs000724.v10.p14). Details of the data are reported in the **Supplemental Methods**.

*DunedinPACE.* Biological aging is the progressive loss of integrity and resilience capacity in our cells, tissues, and organs that occurs with advancing chronological age (23,24). Pace of Aging is a phenotype reflecting the rate at which these biological changes occur (25). We quantified pace of biological aging using the DunedinPACE DNA methylation algorithm (14). The measure was constructed from analysis of 20-year longitudinal change in 19 biomarkers of organ-system

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

integrity in the Dunedin Study 1972-3 birth cohort at ages 26, 32, 38, and 45 (26). The longitudinal Pace of Aging measure was then distilled into a single-timepoint DNA methylation blood test using elastic-net regression (27). In diverse cohorts in the US and around the globe, DunedinPACE is associated with incident morbidity and disability, survival, and a range of socioenvironmental exposures including educational attainment (14,15,28–36). DunedinPACE values were computed following the procedure described by Belsky and colleagues (14) using code available on GitHub (https://github.com/danbelsky/DunedinPACE).

*Other epigenetic clocks.* Other candidate measures of aging can be computed from DNAmethylation data. For comparison purposes, we repeated our analysis using four alternative "epigenetic clocks" which are widely studied in the literature and which we have reported on in prior studies: the Horvath, Hannum, PhenoAge, and GrimAge clocks (37–40). These clocks were calculated using the online calculator hosted by the Horvath Lab

(https://dnamage.genetics.ucla.edu/new). Biological-age advancement was calculated by residualizing biological age values for chronological age at the time of DNA measurement.

#### <u>Survival.</u>

Details of FHS survival and mortality follow-up are reported elsewhere (41). Briefly, FHS conducts continuous mortality follow-up for all study participants. Date and cause of death are recorded for each participant based on hospital records, death certificates, and next-of-kin interviews. The present study included mortality data accumulated through 2019 (mean follow-up from DNA methylation baseline=12 years).

#### <u>Analysis.</u>

We tested associations of educational mobility with DunedinPACE using linear regression models. We used generalized estimating equations to account for non-independence of observations of individuals within nuclear families (42). We conducted within-family analysis comparing sibling differences in educational attainment with sibling differences in DunedinPACE using fixed effects regression (43). We tested associations of educational mobility and DunedinPACE with survival time using Cox proportional hazard regression models. Mediation analysis was conducted using the CMAverse package (44) in the R programming

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

environment (45) following the approach described by Valeri and Vanderweele (46). All models were adjusted for age and sex.

## RESULTS

Participant characteristics are reported in **Table 1**. FHS participants with data on education and educational mobility were similar to the overall DNA-methylation sample.

FHS participants who were upwardly mobile in their educational attainment experienced slower pace of biological aging. Participants who were upwardly mobile had slower DunedinPACE than those who were downwardly mobile (for residualized-change mobility, Offspring cohort Cohen's d=-0.18, 95%CI=[-0.23,-0.13], p<0.001; Gen3 cohort Cohen's d=-0.22, 95%CI=[-0.27,-0.16], p<0.001; for difference-score mobility, Offspring cohort Cohen's d=-0.07, 95%CI=[-0.11,-0.03], p<0.0015; Gen3 cohort Cohen's d=-0.08, 95%CI=[-0.13,-0.03], p<0.0012; Supplemental Table S1, Fig. 2). As a sensitivity analyses, we tested consistency of associations across participants who were born into lower- and higher-educated families to evaluate whether returns to educational mobility were concentrated at one end of the socioeconomic continuum. Effect-sizes were similar across strata of parental education (Supplemental Fig. S2). In addition, effect-sizes for educational mobility were comparable in the Offspring and Gen3 cohorts, suggesting consistent returns to relative educational mobility over time (Fig. 2). In comparative analysis of other epigenetic clocks, associations were weaker and not statistically different from zero for the Horvath, Hannum, and PhenoAge clocks. Results for the GrimAge clock, which was developed within the Framingham Heart Study, were similar to those for DunedinPACE. Full results are reported in **Supplemental Table S1**.

Among siblings, higher educational attainment was associated with slower pace of aging. To the extent that there are social or environmental factors that affect both educational mobility and aging trajectories, our results may overstate the impacts of mobility on healthy aging. To address this potential confound, we repeated our analysis within families. For participants with a sibling in the data (n=2,437; Offspring Cohort n=1,096; Gen3 Cohort n=1,341), we tested if the difference in educational mobility between siblings was associated with difference in DunedinPACE. This design blocks confounding by all factors shared by siblings in a family.

7

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

Results were similar to our primary analysis. The sibling with higher educational mobility tended to have slower DunedinPACE as compared with their less-educated sibling (Offspring cohort Cohen's d=-0.22, 95%CI=[-0.29,-0.14], p<0.009; Gen3 cohort Cohen's d=-0.25, 95%CI=[-0.31,-0.18], p<0.001; **Supplemental Table S2**). Again, associations were weaker and not statistically different from zero for the Horvath, Hannum, and PhenoAge clocks. Results for the GrimAge clock, which was developed within the Framingham Heart Study, were similar to those for DunedinPACE. (**Supplemental Table S2**).

Upwardly-mobile participants and participants with slower pace of aging tended to live longer. We next focused our attention on educational gradients in mortality in the Offspring Cohort (n=1,652; Gen3 participants were not included in this analysis because very few deaths occurred in this younger cohort during the follow-up period). Participants who were more upwardly educationally mobile had lower mortality risk (HR=0.89, 95%CI=[0.81,0.98], p=0.014). In parallel, as previously reported (14), participants with faster DunedinPACE were at higher risk of death than those with a slower DunedinPACE (mortality HR 1.61, 95%CI=[1.49,1.74], p<0.001). All DNA-methylation clocks, with the exception of the Horvath clock, were associated with mortality; effect-sizes were attenuated relative to DunedinPACE with the exception of the GrimAge clock, which was developed to predict mortality in the Framingham sample. Full results are reported in **Supplemental Table S3**.

A faster pace of aging partly mediated educational gradients in mortality risk. Finally, we tested if differences in DunedinPACE mediated educational gradients in mortality risk. We found that DunedinPACE mediated 50% of the association between educational mobility and mortality risk (indirect effect HR=0.93, 95%CI=[0.90,0.95]). Results were robust to methods that allow relaxation of assumptions about exposure-mediator and mediator-outcome confounding and exposure-mediator interactions (46). Full results are reported in **Supplemental Table S4**.

Sensitivity analysis. DunedinPACE was measured from blood DNA-methylation data. Blood DNAmethylation patterns are affected by smoking history and the white blood cell composition of the DNA sample (47,48). In turn, these factors may also be related to mortality risk. Therefore, we repeated our analysis including covariate adjustment for these factors. Smoking history was

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

recorded from participant reports; white blood cell composition in the DNA sample was estimated using the algorithms proposed by Houseman and colleagues (49). Covariate adjustment for estimated cell counts and participant reports of smoking history resulted in modest attenuation of some effect-sizes; however, all analyses still showed substantial mediation of educational gradients in mortality risk by DunedinPACE (**Supplemental Table S4**). Full results are reported in **Supplemental Tables S5-S8**.

## DISCUSSION

People with higher levels of education tend to live longer, healthier lives as compared to those with less education (50–52). We analyzed data from three generations of the Framingham Heart Study to test if this educational gradient in healthspan and lifespan could reflect effects of education on the pace of biological aging. Participants who were upwardly mobile in educational terms had slower pace of aging, as measured by the DunedinPACE epigenetic clock, and were less likely to die over the follow-up period. Differences in DunedinPACE accounted for roughly half of the association between educational mobility and mortality risk.

DunedinPACE was developed as a surrogate endpoint for interventions targeting healthy lifespan (53–55). Prior studies have reported associations between education and DunedinPACE, and between DunedinPACE and aging-related disease and mortality (14,15,28,30). Our study is the first to follow individuals across the educational-origins  $\rightarrow$ educational-attainment  $\rightarrow$  pace-of-aging  $\rightarrow$  mortality pathway. The magnitude of education-DunedinPACE associations we report in this sample (r=0.19-0.24) are consistent with population-representative studies in the US, UK, and New Zealand (r=0.17-0.38; (15)) and correspond to a 2-3% slower pace of aging per unit of upward educational mobility (approximately 2 years). In turn, our mediation analysis found that this magnitude of slowing in DunedinPACE corresponded to a roughly 7% reduction in the hazard of mortality, or half of the overall effect of educational mobility. Collectively, these findings contribute evidence that DunedinPACE is a candidate surrogate endpoint for the effects of educational interventions on aging.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

A further contribution of our study is evidence that healthy-aging returns to education persist into more recent birth cohorts, amongst whom higher levels of education are more common. Educational gradients in mortality have grown steeper in recent years (56). However, these trends reflect outcomes primarily for the cohorts born across the early-to-middle 20<sup>th</sup> century. Across these cohorts, the proportion of individuals completing high school and college education increased dramatically (57). Whether the trend of widening educational inequality in healthy aging will persist for later-20<sup>th</sup> century birth cohorts, for whom rates of high school and college graduation have been more stable, is unknown. We found that effect-sizes for associations between upward educational mobility and slower DunedinPACE were similar for the Offspring and Gen3 cohorts, suggesting that even in the context of relatively high educational attainment, upward mobility continues to yield returns for healthy aging.

We acknowledge limitations. There is no gold standard measure of biological aging (24). We focused on the pace of aging measure DunedinPACE based on three lines of evidence. First, DunedinPACE is predictive of diverse aging related outcomes, including disease, disability, and mortality (14,28,30,32,35). Second, DunedinPACE is associated with social determinants of healthy aging in young, midlife, and older adults (14,15,31,33,34,58). Third, DunedinPACE shows evidence of being modified by calorie restriction (59), an intervention that modifies the basic biology of aging in animal experiments (60). Confidence in results is further supported by the consistency of our findings with those for alternative measurements of biological aging in independent cohorts (61). Finally, our results are robust to known confounds of DNA methylation-based measurements of aging, specifically cell composition of blood samples used to derive DNA and smoking history (48,62).

Isolating effects of education on biological aging is challenging because the level of education people complete is strongly influenced by familial factors and other features of early life environment that are associated with the pace of biological aging (31,58,63–65). We addressed this potential confound in two ways. First, we focused on educational mobility between generations of a family. Second, we conducted analyses comparing siblings within a family. Across these specifications, we found consistent evidence of slower pace of aging in people who were upwardly educationally mobile and who completed more schooling as

10

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

compared to their siblings. Ultimately, evidence from randomized trials (e.g., (66)) will be needed to confirm if promoting educational attainment slows the pace of aging. The process of social mobility also involves post-education attainments. Studies of mobility, biological aging, and lifespan that consider mobility in terms of income, occupation, and wealth accumulation are needed (67,68).

The Framingham sample is predominantly White-identifying and includes relatively few participants with the lowest levels of educational attainment. In nationally representative datasets from the United States, the difference in mortality risk associated with having attended some college as compared to not is HR=0.66-0.76 (69). In the Framingham data we analyzed, the corresponding effect-size is somewhat smaller (HR=0.81). The lowest levels of educational attainment are not well represented in the Framingham Heart Study, possibly attenuating education-mortality associations. The ultimate result should be to make our estimates of mediation by DunedinPACE conservative. Nevertheless, replication of our results in more diverse cohorts is a priority. Measurement of DNA-methylation in the Offspring Cohort at the 8<sup>th</sup> wave of measurement, after roughly four decades of follow-up, could induce survival bias. However, we observe similar effect-sizes for associations of educational mobility with DunedinPACE in the Offspring Cohort and the younger Gen 3 cohort, for whom DNA methylation data were generated from samples collected at their second wave of measurement. Moreover, the distribution of educational attainment in Offspring Cohort participants included in our analysis is similar to the distribution at study baseline (wave 1 mean=12.1, SD=2.4; wave 8 mean=12.3, SD=2.5). Thus, selective mortality did not bias the distribution of education in our analysis sample.

The healthier aging of individuals with more education and other social advantages is well established. Our study contributes evidence that an accelerated pace of biological aging is among the mechanisms that account for this inequality. In addition, it suggests that new methods to quantify the pace of aging can provide near-term measures of health impacts for programs and policies designed to promote educational attainment and other socioeconomic assets. Because the pace of aging is variable from young adulthood, measurements such as DunedinPACE can illuminate intervention effects years or decades before aging-related

11

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

functional deficits and chronic diseases become apparent. Such information can, in turn, help

refine efforts to heal health disparities and building aging health equity.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

## References

- 1. Adler NE, Boyce T, Chesney MA, Cohen S, Folkman S, Kahn RL, et al. Socioeconomic status and health: the challenge of the gradient. American psychologist. 1994;49(1):15.
- 2. Adler NE, Rehkopf DH. US disparities in health: descriptions, causes, and mechanisms. Annu Rev Public Health. 2008;29:235–52.
- 3. Chia CW, Egan JM, Ferrucci L. Age-related changes in glucose metabolism, hyperglycemia, and cardiovascular risk. Circulation research. 2018;123(7):886–904.
- 4. Fleg JL, Strait J. Age-associated changes in cardiovascular structure and function: a fertile milieu for future disease. Heart failure reviews. 2012;17(4):545–54.
- 5. Janssen I, Ross R. Linking age-related changes in skeletal muscle mass and composition with metabolism and disease. Journal of Nutrition Health and Aging. 2005;9(6):408.
- 6. Castelo-Branco C, Soveral I. The immune system and aging: a review. Gynecological Endocrinology. 2014;30(1):16–22.
- 7. Marín J. Age-related changes in vascular responses: a review. Mechanisms of ageing and development. 1995;79(2–3):71–114.
- 8. Donato AJ, Machin DR, Lesniewski LA. Mechanisms of dysfunction in the aging vasculature and role in age-related disease. Circulation Research. 2018;123(7):825–48.
- 9. Nolan M, Nitz J, Choy NL, Illing S. Age-related changes in musculoskeletal function, balance and mobility measures in men aged 30–80 years. The Aging Male. 2010;13(3):194–201.
- 10. Tran D, Rajwani K, Berlin DA. Pulmonary effects of aging. Current Opinion in Anaesthesiology. 2018;31(1):19–23.
- Shi S, Klotz U. Age-related changes in pharmacokinetics. Current drug metabolism. 2011;12(7):601– 10.
- 12. López-Otín C, Blasco MA, Partridge L, Serrano M, Kroemer G. The hallmarks of aging. Cell. 2013;153(6):1194–217.
- 13. Campisi J, Kapahi P, Lithgow GJ, Melov S, Newman JC, Verdin E. From discoveries in ageing research to therapeutics for healthy ageing. Nature. 2019;571(7764):183–92.
- 14. Belsky DW, Caspi A, Corcoran DL, Sugden K, Poulton R, Arseneault L, et al. DunedinPACE, a DNA methylation biomarker of the pace of aging. Elife. 2022;11:e73420.
- 15. Sugden K, Moffitt TE, Arpawong TE, Arseneault L, Belsky DW, Corcoran DL, et al. Cross-National and Cross-Generational Evidence That Educational Attainment May Slow the Pace of Aging in European-Descent Individuals. The Journals of Gerontology: Series B. 2023 Apr 14;gbad056.
- 16. Graf GHJ, Zhang Y, Domingue BW, Harris KM, Kothari M, Kwon D, et al. Social mobility and biological aging among older adults in the United States. PNAS nexus. 2022;1(2):pgac029.
- 17. Lin MJ. The social and genetic inheritance of educational attainment: Genes, parental education, and educational expansion. Social Science Research. 2020;86:102387.
- 18. Liu H. Social and genetic pathways in multigenerational transmission of educational attainment. American Sociological Review. 2018;83(2):278–304.
- 19. Conley D, Domingue BW, Cesarini D, Dawes C, Rietveld CA, Boardman JD. Is the effect of parental education on offspring biased or moderated by genotype? Sociological science. 2015;2:82.
- 20. Domingue BW, Belsky DW, Conley D, Harris KM, Boardman JD. Polygenic influence on educational attainment: New evidence from the National Longitudinal Study of Adolescent to Adult Health. AERA open. 2015;1(3):2332858415599972.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

21. Haas: Health selection and the process of social... - Google Scholar [Internet]. [cited 2023 Sep 7]. Available from:

https://scholar.google.com/scholar\_lookup?title=Health%20selection%20and%20the%20process%2 0of%20social%20stratification%3A%20the%20effect%20of%20childhood%20health%20on%20socio economic%20attainment&author=SA%20Haas&publication\_year=2006&journal=J%20Health%20Soc %20Behav&volume=47&pages=339-354

- 22. Ryan CL, Bauman K. Educational attainment in the United States: 2015. 2016;
- 23. Kirkwood TB. Understanding the odd science of aging. Cell. 2005;120(4):437–47.
- 24. Ferrucci L, Gonzalez-Freire M, Fabbri E, Simonsick E, Tanaka T, Moore Z, et al. Measuring biological aging in humans: A quest. Aging Cell. 2020;19(2):e13080.
- 25. Belsky DW, Caspi A, Houts R, Cohen HJ, Corcoran DL, Danese A, et al. Quantification of biological aging in young adults. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences. 2015;112(30):E4104–10.
- 26. Elliott ML, Caspi A, Houts RM, Ambler A, Broadbent JM, Hancox RJ, et al. Disparities in the pace of biological aging among midlife adults of the same chronological age have implications for future frailty risk and policy. Nature aging. 2021;1(3):295–308.
- 27. Belsky DW, Caspi A, Arseneault L, Baccarelli A, Corcoran DL, Gao X, et al. Quantification of the pace of biological aging in humans through a blood test, the DunedinPoAm DNA methylation algorithm. Elife. 2020;9.
- 28. Faul JD, Kim JK, Levine ME, Thyagarajan B, Weir DR, Crimmins EM. Epigenetic-based age acceleration in a representative sample of older Americans: Associations with aging-related morbidity and mortality. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences. 2023;120(9):e2215840120.
- 29. Lin WY. Epigenetic clocks derived from western samples differentially reflect Taiwanese health outcomes. Frontiers in Genetics. 2023;14.
- 30. Föhr T, Waller K, Viljanen A, Rantanen T, Kaprio J, Ollikainen M, et al. Mortality associations with DNA methylation-based biological aging and physical functioning measures across a 20-year follow-up period. The Journals of Gerontology: Series A. 2023;glad026.
- 31. Kim K, Yaffe K, Rehkopf DH, Zheng Y, Nannini DR, Perak AM, et al. Association of adverse childhood experiences with accelerated epigenetic aging in midlife. JAMA network open. 2023;6(6):e2317987–e2317987.
- 32. Kresovich JK, Sandler DP, Taylor JA. Methylation-Based Biological Age and Hypertension Prevalence and Incidence. Hypertension. 2023;80(6):1213–22.
- 33. Shen B, Mode NA, Hooten NN, Pacheco NL, Ezike N, Zonderman AB, et al. Association of Race and Poverty Status With DNA Methylation–Based Age. JAMA Network Open. 2023;6(4):e236340– e236340.
- 34. Andrasfay T, Crimmins E. Occupational characteristics and epigenetic aging among older adults in the United States. Epigenetics. 2023;18(1):2218763.
- 35. Lin WY. Epigenetic clocks derived from western samples differentially reflect Taiwanese health outcomes. Front Genet. 2023 Feb 6;14:1089819.
- Sugden K, Caspi A, Elliott ML, Bourassa KJ, Chamarti K, Corcoran DL, et al. Association of Pace of Aging Measured by Blood-Based DNA Methylation With Age-Related Cognitive Impairment and Dementia. Neurology. 2022 Jul 6;10.1212/WNL.000000000200898.
- 37. Levine ME, Lu AT, Quach A, Chen BH, Assimes TL, Bandinelli S, et al. An epigenetic biomarker of aging for lifespan and healthspan. Aging (Albany NY). 2018;10(4):573.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

- 38. Lu AT, Quach A, Wilson JG, Reiner AP, Aviv A, Raj K, et al. DNA methylation GrimAge strongly predicts lifespan and healthspan. Aging (Albany NY). 2019;11(2):303.
- 39. Horvath S. DNA methylation age of human tissues and cell types. Genome biology. 2013;14(10):3156.
- 40. Hannum G, Guinney J, Zhao L, Zhang L, Hughes G, Sadda S, et al. Genome-wide methylation profiles reveal quantitative views of human aging rates. Molecular cell. 2013;49(2):359–67.
- 41. Murabito JM, Zhao Q, Larson MG, Rong J, Lin H, Benjamin EJ, et al. Measures of biologic age in a community sample predict mortality and age-related disease: the Framingham Offspring Study. The Journals of Gerontology: Series A. 2018;73(6):757–62.
- 42. Zorn CJ. Generalized estimating equation models for correlated data: A review with applications. American Journal of Political Science. 2001;470–90.
- 43. Petersen AH, Lange T. What is the causal interpretation of sibling comparison designs? Epidemiology. 2020;31(1):75–81.
- 44. Shi B, Choirat C, Coull BA, VanderWeele TJ, Valeri L. CMAverse: a suite of functions for reproducible causal mediation analyses. Epidemiology. 2021;32(5):e20–2.
- 45. Team RC. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. Published online 2020. Supplemental Information References S. 2021;1:371–8.
- 46. Valeri L, VanderWeele TJ. Mediation analysis allowing for exposure–mediator interactions and causal interpretation: theoretical assumptions and implementation with SAS and SPSS macros. Psychological methods. 2013;18(2):137.
- 47. Heijmans BT, Mill J. Commentary: The seven plagues of epigenetic epidemiology. International journal of epidemiology. 2012;41(1):74–8.
- 48. Birney E, Smith GD, Greally JM. Epigenome-wide association studies and the interpretation of disease-omics. PLoS genetics. 2016;12(6):e1006105.
- 49. Houseman EA, Accomando WP, Koestler DC, Christensen BC, Marsit CJ, Nelson HH, et al. DNA methylation arrays as surrogate measures of cell mixture distribution. BMC bioinformatics. 2012;13:1–16.
- 50. Conti G, Heckman JJ, Pinto R. The effects of two influential early childhood interventions on health and healthy behaviour. The Economic Journal. 2016;126(596):F28–65.
- 51. Galama TJ, Lleras-Muney A, Van Kippersluis H. The effect of education on health and mortality: a review of experimental and quasi-experimental evidence. 2018 [cited 2023 Sep 27]; Available from: https://www.nber.org/papers/w24225
- 52. Meghir C, Palme M, Simeonova E. Education and mortality: Evidence from a social experiment. American Economic Journal: Applied Economics. 2018;10(2):234–56.
- 53. Moffitt TE, Belsky DW, Danese A, Poulton R, Caspi A. The Longitudinal Study of Aging in Human Young Adults: Knowledge Gaps and Research Agenda. J Gerontol A Biol Sci Med Sci. 2016 Oct 7;glw191.
- 54. Raffington L, Belsky DW. Integrating DNA Methylation Measures of Biological Aging into Social Determinants of Health Research. Curr Envir Health Rpt. 2022 Jun 1;9(2):196–210.
- 55. Justice JN, Ferrucci L, Newman AB, Aroda VR, Bahnson JL, Divers J, et al. A framework for selection of blood-based biomarkers for geroscience-guided clinical trials: report from the TAME Biomarkers Workgroup. Geroscience. 2018;40(5):419–36.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

- Montez JK, Hummer RA, Hayward MD, Woo H, Rogers RG. Trends in the educational gradient of US adult mortality from 1986 through 2006 by race, gender, and age group. Research on aging. 2011;33(2):145–71.
- 57. Percentage of U. S. Population, Age 25 to 64, with High School Diploma and Bachelor's Degree, by Birth Cohort and Sex, 1900 to Present | RSF [Internet]. [cited 2023 Jul 14]. Available from: https://www.russellsage.org/research/chartbook/percentage-u-s-population-age-25-to-64-highschool-diploma-and-bachelors-degree-b
- 58. Raffington L, Schwaba T, Aikins M, Richter D, Wagner GG, Harden KP, et al. Associations of socioeconomic disparities with buccal DNA-methylation measures of biological aging. Clinical Epigenetics. 2023;15(1):70.
- 59. Waziry R, Ryan CP, Corcoran DL, Huffman KM, Kobor MS, Kothari M, et al. Effect of long-term caloric restriction on DNA methylation measures of biological aging in healthy adults from the CALERIE trial. Nature Aging. 2023;1–10.
- 60. Le Couteur DG, Raubenheimer D, Solon-Biet S, de Cabo R, Simpson SJ. Does diet influence aging? Evidence from animal studies. J Intern Med. 2022 Jun 14;
- 61. Fiorito G, Pedron S, Ochoa-Rosales C, McCrory C, Polidoro S, Zhang Y, et al. The Role of Epigenetic Clocks in Explaining Educational Inequalities in Mortality: A Multicohort Study and Meta-analysis. The Journals of Gerontology: Series A. 2022;77(9):1750–9.
- 62. Bell CG, Lowe R, Adams PD, Baccarelli AA, Beck S, Bell JT, et al. DNA methylation aging clocks: challenges and recommendations. Genome Biology. 2019 Nov 25;20(1):249.
- 63. Belsky DW, Caspi A, Cohen HJ, Kraus WE, Ramrakha S, Poulton R, et al. Impact of early personal-history characteristics on the Pace of Aging: implications for clinical trials of therapies to slow aging and extend healthspan. Aging Cell. 2017;16(4):644–51.
- 64. Raffington L, Belsky DW, Kothari M, Malanchini M, Tucker-Drob EM, Harden KP. Socioeconomic disadvantage and the pace of biological aging in children. Pediatrics. 2021;147(6).
- 65. Kankaanpää A, Tolvanen A, Heikkinen A, Kaprio J, Ollikainen M, Sillanpää E. The role of adolescent lifestyle habits in biological aging: A prospective twin study. ELife. 2022;11:e80729.
- 66. Muennig P. Can universal pre-kindergarten programs improve population health and longevity? Mechanisms, evidence, and policy implications. Social Science & Medicine. 2015;127:116–23.
- 67. Bao Y, Gorrie-Stone T, Hannon E, Hughes A, Andrayas A, Neilson G, et al. Social mobility across the lifecourse and DNA methylation age acceleration in adults in the UK. Scientific Reports. 2022;12(1):22284.
- 68. Lawrence KG, Kresovich JK, O'Brien KM, Hoang TT, Xu Z, Taylor JA, et al. Association of neighborhood deprivation with epigenetic aging using 4 clock metrics. JAMA network open. 2020;3(11):e2024329–e2024329.
- 69. Cutler DM, Lange F, Meara E, Richards-Shubik S, Ruhm CJ. Rising educational gradients in mortality: The role of behavioral risk factors. Journal of health economics. 2011;30(6):1174–87.
- 70. Mendelson MM, Marioni RE, Joehanes R, Liu, C, Hedman AK, Aslibekyan S, et al. Association of body mass index with DNA methylation and gene expression in blood cells and relations to cardiometabolic disease: a Mendelian randomization approach. PLoS medicine. 2017;14(1), e1002215.

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

# **Tables and Figures**

**Table 1. Characteristics of DNA-methylation, education, and mobility samples.** The table provides information on the composition of our analytic sample (n=3,101, Offspring n=1,652, Gen3 n=1,449). The sample includes all individuals all individuals who provided DNA-methylation data, who reported their own educational attainment levels, and for whom educational attainment data was available for at least one parent.

	Analytic Sample (n=3936)	Offspring sample (n=3874)	Gen3 Sample (n=3101)
No. families	1577	1025	552
No. individuals	3101	1652	1449
Age (Years)	56.14 (13.25)	65.57 (9.22)	45.38 (7.83)
Male	47%	46%	48%
Died	14%	24%	
Education (Years)	14.97 (2.13)	14.74 (2.31)	15.24 (1.88)
Parental Education (Years)	13.58 (2.7)	12.35 (2.45)	14.98 (2.26)
Ed. Mobility (Delta, Years)	1.24 (2.47)	1.99 (2.48)	0.4 (2.16)
Ed. Mobility (Resid)	0.04 (0.88)	0.09 (0.88)	-0.02 (0.89)
DunedinPACE	1.06 (0.12)	1.08 (0.12)	1.03 (0.11)

Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

**Figure 1. Offspring and Gen3 participant flow diagrams.** The figure shows how the final analytic samples were developed from the larger set of all participants in the Offspring (left) and Gen3 (right) Framingham cohorts (combined n=3,101).



Graf 20 September, 2023

Educational Mobility, DunedinPACE, & Lifespan

**Figure 2. Association of educational mobility with DunedinPACE.** The figure shows associations of educational mobility with faster pace of aging. The left side of the figure shows scatterplots and fitted regression slopes for the Offspring (orange) and Gen3 (purple) cohorts. The right side of the figure shows effect-estimates and 95% confidence intervals from regression analysis with covariate adjustments for participant age and sex. Effect-sizes are reported in standard-deviation units of DunedinPACE per standard deviation unit of educational mobility (interpretable on a Pearson r scale). Results are shown for analysis of educational mobility computed as the difference in education between children and their parents (top scatterplot, left-side set of bars) and for sibling differences in educational outcomes (bottom scatterplot, right-side set of bars).

