S	outhern	Ethiopian	skilled birth	attendant	variations	and
----------	---------	------------------	---------------	-----------	------------	-----

2	maternal mortality: a multilevel study of a population-
3	based cross-sectional household survey
4	
5	
6	Southern Ethiopian skilled birth attendant variations and maternal
7	mortality
8	
9	Authors
10	Aschenaki Zerihun Kea ^{1, 2*} , Bernt Lindtjorn ^{1, 2} , Achamyelesh Gebretsadik Tekle ¹ , Sven
11	Gudmund Hinderaker ²
12	
13	Affiliations

- ¹ School of Public Health, College of Medicine and Health Sciences, Hawassa University,
- 15 Hawassa, Ethiopia
- ² Centre for International Health, University of Bergen, Bergen, Norway
- 17 *Corresponding author
- 18 Email: aschenakizer@yahoo.com; aschekea@gmail.com (AZK)

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

Abstract

19

20

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

35

36

37

38

39

40

Introduction

21 Studies examining skilled birth attendants (SBA) use and its correlation with maternal

mortality at lower administrative levels are scarce. This study assessed the coverage and

variations of SBA, the physical accessibility of health facilities for SBA, and the association of

SBA with maternal mortality.

Materials and methods

A cross-sectional study using a population-based household survey was conducted in six

Sidama National Regional State, southern Ethiopia districts, from July 2019 to May 2020.

Women who had given birth in the past two years prior to the study were included. Stata 15

and ArcGIS 10.4.1 were used for data analysis. A multilevel logistic regression analysis was

conducted to assess the effect of the sampling units and identify factors independently

associated with SBA. The association between SBA and maternal mortality was examined

using data from a maternal mortality household survey.

Results

A total of 3191 women were interviewed. The coverage of SBA was 46.7%, with high

variations in the districts. Thirty percent of SBA use was accounted for by the differences

among the districts. One-third of the women travel more than two hours to access the

nearest hospital. Districts with low coverage of SBA and located far away from the regional

referral centre had high maternal mortality. Education of the mother, occupation of the

husband, pregnancy-related complications, use of antenatal care, parity, and distance to the

nearest hospital and health centre were associated with the use of SBA.

Conclusions

41

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

The coverage of SBA in the Sidama Region was low, with high variations in the districts. Low

SBA use was associated with high maternal mortality. Due attention should be given to

districts with low coverage of SBA and those located far away from the referral centre.

Access to hospitals has to improve. All women should be encouraged to get antenatal care

services.

Introduction

The time around labour, childbirth, and the first week post-delivery holds a higher risk of

death for mothers and new-borns [1]. Hence, every mother should be assisted by a skilled

birth attendant (SBA) during this critical time. SBA is defined as a competent maternal and

new-born health professional, trained and regulated to national and international standards

[2]. It includes doctors, midwives, and nurses who perform all signal functions of emergency

maternal and new-born care to optimise the health and well-being of women and new-

borns [2].

Globally, a skilled attendant at birth has been considered one of the key interventions to

reduce maternal mortality and an indicator used to monitor the progress of maternal

mortality reduction [3]. Studies conducted using the data of countries from international

databases and systematic reviews demonstrated that there existed an inverse relationship

between SBA and maternal mortality: high coverage of SBA was associated with low

maternal mortality [4-6]. However, the effect of SBA on maternal mortality is not well

studied at the subnational and district levels using primary data.

In low and middle-income countries (LMICs), access to maternal health services is poor [7], and the coverage of skilled birth attendance is low [8-10]. As a result, many births are attended by unskilled birth attendants, like traditional birth attendants, neighbours, mother-in-law, and husbands; some even take place without any assistance [11, 12]. Besides poor access and low coverage of SBA in LMICs, the existing health care is not uniformly accessible to all segments of the population [13-17]. Reaching every woman by minimising inequalities in access and improving the coverage of care is one of the strategic objectives to end preventable maternal mortality [18]. The utilisation of SBA services can be affected by several factors related to maternal characteristics such as the age of the mother [19], educational status [10], use of antenatal care (ANC) [10], parity [19], pregnancy-related complications [12], household characteristics like husband education [9], occupation of the husband [20], wealth status [9, 19], and distance or travel time required to access a health facility [21]. Like other LMICs, Ethiopia has an unacceptably high maternal mortality [22, 23]. Despite an increasing trend in the coverage of skilled birth attendance since 2000 [24], coverage and access to SBA are still low in the country [10, 16]. In Ethiopia, there is a dearth of studies conducted to assess the utilisation of skilled birth attendants [10, 25, 26]. However, this study tries to answer the following questions: what is the coverage and disparities of SBA in Sidama Region and the districts, how physically accessible the health centres and hospitals are to pregnant women and how they are utilized by the women during labour and childbirth, and does SBA have an effect on the magnitude of maternal mortality in districts of Sidama Region.

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license.

We conducted this study as part of a larger study that aimed at measuring maternal mortality in Sidama National Regional State, employing a population-based household survey with a five-year recall of pregnancy and birth outcomes and the sisterhood method [11, 27]. We found that the maternal mortality ratio (MMR) was 419 per 100,000 live births (LB) by five-year recall and 623 per 100,000 LB by the sisterhood method, with large variations by district [11, 27]. The studies also identified that districts far from the regional capital, with poor infrastructure and inadequate skilled health personnel, had a higher rate of maternal mortality [11, 27].

Hence, we carried out this study with the following specific objectives: 1) determine SBA coverage and district-level variations; 2) identify factors associated with SBA; 3) assess the geographical accessibility of health centres and hospitals to SBA; 4) examine the association between SBA and the maternal mortality ratio in the Sidama Region.

Materials and methods

Study design, setting, and period

A population-based cross-sectional household survey was conducted in six districts of Sidama National Regional State, southern Ethiopia, from July 2019 to May 2020. The details of the study setting have been described elsewhere [11].

Study population and sampling techniques

Women in the reproductive age group of 15-49 years in Sidama National Regional State who had given birth in the past two years preceding the survey were the source population.

Women of the same age range who resided in sampled households and had given birth two years before the survey were the study population. In the period between 1 July 2019 and

31 May 2020, a total of 3191 women who had given birth in the past two years before the study were recruited from the sampled households in Sidama Region.

The sampling techniques of the study have been described elsewhere [11]. Below, we briefly describe the summary of the sampling technique. We employed multistage cluster sampling techniques. Firstly, we randomly selected six districts out of the 30 districts in the region.

Secondly, we selected 40 kebeles (the smallest administrative structure with an average population of 5000 people) from the six districts, proportional to the size of the kebeles.

Thirdly, from each kebele, we sampled six limatbudin (administrative units organised by 40-50 neighbouring households), and finally, we selected 37 households from each limatbudin.

In the sampled households, we interviewed women who had given birth in the past two years before the survey. Households in which women had given birth more than two years before the survey were not included in the study. If a woman had given birth twice in the past two years before the survey, we chose the most recent birth experience for the study.

Variables

The main outcome measure of the study was the use of a skilled attendant during childbirth, which was derived from the question, "Who assisted the delivery of your last birth?" This gives a dichotomized response that categorises the study participants into two groups: women who used skilled birth attendants and those who used unskilled birth attendants.

Operationally, we defined a woman as having used a skilled birth attendant when she gave birth with the assistance of skilled health personnel such as nurses, midwives, health officers, and doctors [2], and the delivery was conducted at government health facilities: health centres and hospitals, faith-based clinics, private clinics, or hospitals. In contrast, we defined women who used unskilled birth attendants as those who gave birth with the

assistance of unskilled birth attendants like health extension workers (HEWs), TBAs, motherin-law, husbands, and neighbours [15, 28]. According to the Ethiopian health system, health centres are responsible for basic emergency obstetric and new-born care (BEmONC), including delivery services. Hospitals provide comprehensive emergency obstetric care (CEMONC), including all BEMONC services, obstetric surgery, and blood transfusion [29]. Health posts, run by the HEWs, provide disease prevention and health promotion activities and some basic curative services [30]. As the government of Ethiopia promotes SBA, the HEWs do not provide delivery services as part of their routine duties except to assist mothers who come to their knowledge during an emergency and facilitate referral to the catchment health centre or primary hospital [30]. The explanatory variables in this study include background characteristics of women like age, education, history of parity, ANC visits, pregnancy-related complications, family or household characteristics such as education of the husband, occupation of the head of household, socioeconomic status (wealth index) of the household, and distance from the residential location to the nearest health centre and the nearest hospital. **Data source and measurement** An interviewer-administered questionnaire was used to collect the data from women who were of childbearing age, 15-49 years old, and who had given birth in the past two years

before the study. The data was collected by diploma-level teachers recruited from each

kebele who were familiar with the culture and language of the study area.

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license.

During the household visit, the data collectors recorded the geographic coordinates (latitude and longitude) of residential locations, the nearest health centres, and hospitals using the Garmin ETrex 10 handheld global positioning system (GPS). The age of a woman was collected and registered in a completed year. The educational level of the woman and husband was registered as "completed grade" and further categorised as "no formal education," grade 1-4," "grade 5-8," "grade 9-12," and "high school or above." The occupation of the head of the household was identified as the main source of income and registered as a farmer, trader, government employee, and others. The history of pregnancy-related complications was assessed using questions eliciting whether a woman had pregnancy-related complications during pregnancy or childbirth. The household's wealth status was estimated by creating a wealth index using household assets and facility variables. We used principal component analysis (PCA) to create a household wealth index [31]. The wealth index initially had five centiles: poorest, poor, middle, rich and richest. Later, we classified the poorest, poor and middle as "poor" and the rich and richest as "rich" for analysis. The variables used for wealth index creation have been described elsewhere [11]. The distance from the residential location to the nearest health centre and hospital was calculated by a straight line or Euclidean distance [32, 33] employing the "Near Analysis" function in ArcGIS 10.4.1.

Data quality control

The questionnaire for the study was prepared after reviewing the relevant literature. We initially prepared the questionnaire in English, translated it into the local language (*Sidaamu*

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

Afoo), and had it back-translated to English by another individual to check its consistency. Before data collection, the questionnaire was pretested in one district not included in the study. The principal investigator trained the data collectors and supervisors for three days. The training included discussion on the content and aim of each question, interview techniques, role plays, how to operate, read, and record geographical coordinates using GPS (Garmin ETREX 10), and a field test. Two public health officers recruited from each district who were familiar with the culture and language of the study setting supervised the data collectors. The supervisors followed the data collectors and checked the consistency and completeness of the questionnaire daily. When eligible respondents were absent during the initial visit, the data collectors revisited the households the next day. The data was double entered using EpiData software (EpiData Association 2000-2021, Denmark). The consistency of the two entries was checked, and discrepancies were validated from the hard copies of the questionnaire. To maintain the quality of spatial data, the coordinates of residential locations, the nearest health centres, and the nearest hospitals were recorded both on a GPS device and on paper and double-checked for consistency. To confirm the place of delivery reported by mothers, we asked different verification and probing questions: asked a woman to mention the name of the health facility she had given birth to, whether a birth certificate was provided or not during childbirth, whether the baby was vaccinated, and whether immediate post-natal counselling was given to the mother.

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

Sample size determination

The estimated sample size for this study was determined based on the following assumptions: 50% prevalence of skilled delivery [34], a design effect of 2 (as the study employed the multistage cluster sampling method), and precision +/-5%. Hence, the sample size calculated was 768 women who gave birth in the past two years prior to the survey. Adding 10% non-response, the final sample size needed was 845 women.

This study is part of a larger maternal mortality study, and the sample of households needed for the larger study was 8880 households, with the corresponding number of mothers [11]. We assumed that surveying the 8880 households would be sufficient to get the desired sample of women for this study, which enables us to estimate the coverage of SBA.

Data analysis

We used Stata 15 (Stata Corp., College Station, TX) for data analysis. Frequency analysis like mean (SD), proportions, and percentages were computed to describe the outcome and explanatory variables. A bivariate analysis using the Chi-square test was conducted to identify factors associated with the outcome variable; SBA. To account for the hierarchical nature of the data, where individual mothers are nested within a household, households are nested in limatbudin, limatbudins are nested in kebeles, and kebeles are nested in districts, a multilevel mixed-effect logistic regression model (MLLR) was employed.

The MLLR analysis aimed to understand the extent of variations in SBA accounted for by the three sampling units (limatbudin, kebele, and district) and assess factors independently associated with the outcome variable. Variables with a p-value <0.2 in the bivariate analysis were considered for MLLR analysis [12]. Four models were fitted. The first model was the

null model, which had no explanatory variables. The null model was used to assess the random effect of the sampling units. The second model contained individual variables, the third model adjusted for household-level factors, and the fourth model included both individual and household-level variables. Intra-cluster correlation (ICC) was used to assess the random effect. Model fitness was assessed using Akaike's Information Criterion (AIC). To assess the strength of the association between explanatory variables and the outcome variable, crude and adjusted odds ratios with a 95% confidence interval (CI) were computed. Associations with a p-value <0.05 in the MLLR model were considered significant. A stratified analysis was conducted to assess confounding and effect modification using the estimates of stratum-specific, crude, and adjusted odds ratios. We also assessed the association between the coverage of SBA and the maternal mortality ratio (MMR). The MMR data was obtained from a maternal mortality household survey conducted in the study area where the current study was conducted as part of the study [11]. We assumed women residing in locations within 10 km of the nearest health centre or the nearest hospital have good physical accessibility to SBA services [35], whereas women who live in areas outside 10 km of the nearest health centre or the nearest hospital are assumed to have poor physical accessibility to SBA services [35]. ArcGIS 10.4.1 (ESRI, Redlands, CA, USA) software was used to measure the distance between residential locations and the nearest hospital and health centre. We assumed that 2 hours of walking time are required to travel 10 km [36].

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

227

228

229

230

231

232

233

234

Ethical approval

We obtained ethical approval for this study from the institutional review board of Hawassa University College of Medicine and Health Sciences (IRB/015/11) and the Regional Ethical Committee of Western Norway (2018/2389/REK Vest). We got support letters from the Sidama National Regional State Health Bureau (formerly known as the Sidama Zone Health Department), the district health offices, and the kebele administrations. Informed (thumbprint and signed) consent was obtained from the respondents. To maintain the anonymity of the study participants, we did not collect any personal identifying information during data collection. In this study, we did not find minors (women below the age of 18 years). Hence, we did not require consent from parents or guardians.

Result

Sociodemographic and obstetric backgrounds of study participants

Table 1 describes the sociodemographic and obstetric backgrounds of the participant women and their household characteristics. A total of 3191 (100%) women of childbearing age (15-49 years) were interviewed. The mean age of the women was 25.2 years, and 145 (4.5%) were under the age of 20 years.

Twenty-two percent, 698 (21.9%) women, had no formal education, 790 (24.8%) did not have antenatal care (ANC), and 2401 (75.2%) had at least one antenatal visit. Among those who had ANC, 853 (35.5%) had four or more ANC visits. Mothers who reported at least one pregnancy-related complication during pregnancy or childbirth were 1246 (39%). The husbands of the women with no formal education were 420 (13.2%). Three-fifths of the women, 1932 (60.5%), were from poor households, and 2276 (71.3%), the heads of the households, were engaged in farming activities.

Table 1. Background characterstics of study women and households, Sidama National Regional State, 2020.

Variable	Number	Percent
Age of mother:		
15-19	145	4.5
20-24	1146	35.9
25-29	1147	35.9
30-34	546	17.1
35+	207	6.8
Education of mother		
No formal education	698	21.9
1-4 Grade	1004	31.5
5-8 Grade	1102	34.5
9-12 Grade (High School)	316	9.9
Above high school	71	2.2
Had ANC		
No	790	24.8
Yes	2401	75.2
Number of ANC visit		
Less than 4 ANC visits	1548	64.5
Four or more ANC visits	853	35.5
Had at least one pregnancy related complication		
No	1945	61.0
Yes	1246	39.0
Education of husband		
No formal education	420	13.2
1-4 Grade	730	22.9
5-8 Grade	1393	43.7
9-12 Grade (High School)	461	14.4
Above high school	187	5.9
Wealth index of household		
Poor	1932	60.5
Rich	1259	39.5
Occupation of household head		
Farming	2276	71.3
Non-farming (trading, gov't employee etc.)	915	28.7
Distance to the nearest hospital		
Outside 10 km	1052	33.0
Below 10 km	2139	67.0
Distance to the nearest health centre		
Between 5-10 km	225	7.1
Below 5 km	2966	92.9
Note: ANC: Antenatal care, km: kilometre		

259

Place of delivery and assistance during delivery

Table 2 presents the place and assistance for delivery. We found that 46.9% of mothers delivered at health facilities and 53.1% delivered at home. Among mothers who had given birth at a health facility, 99.7% were assisted by skilled health personnel, whereas health extension workers assisted 0.3% of deliveries. Among mothers who had given birth at health facilities, 84.4% had normal, 11.2% had instrumental, and 4.4% had caesarean section deliveries. Mothers who had given birth at a health facility used an ambulance in 47% of cases, and 31.3% went by foot to reach the health facility for delivery service. After reaching the first health facility, 12.8% of mothers were referred to another health facility. Of mothers who had given birth at home, 20.8% were assisted by traditional birth attendants (TBAs), 41.5% by their mother-in-law, 6.1% by their husbands, and 17.8% by neighbours; 13.8% of home births had no assistant.

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

Table 2. Delivery place and assistance during delivery, Sidama National Regional State,

southern Ethiopia, 2020

281

Variable	Number	Percent	
Delivery place			
Home	1694	53.1	
Health post	5	0.2	
Health centre	931	29.2	
Hospital	541	17.0	
Faith based clinic	20	0.6	
Mode of institutional delivery			
Normal	1263	84.4	
Instrumental	168	11.2	
Caesarean section	66	4.4	
Health facility delivery attendant			
Health extension worker	5	0.3	
Nurse	486	32.5	
Midwife	803	53.6	
Doctor	203	13.6	
Attendant of home delivery			
Traditional birth attendant	352	20.8	
Mother in law	703	41.5	
Husband	104	6.1	
Neighbour	301	17.8	
No assistant/alone	234	13.8	
Reason for not giving birth at health facility			
Not necessary	161	9.5	
Not customary	982	58.0	
Preferred TBA	89	5.3	
Health facility incur cost	7	0.4	
Did not have money	23	1.4	
Health facility far away	178	10.5	
Transportation problem	184	10.9	
Did not have accompany	30	1.8	
Low quality service at health facility	16	0.9	
Family did not allow	24	1.4	

Spatial accessibility, variations, and utilisation of skilled birth care The mean distance from the women's residential locations to the nearest health centre was 2.6 km, ranging from 0 to 8.5 km. All 3191 women lived within 10 km of the nearest health centre. Of the 1492 mothers assisted by skilled health personnel during birth, 1391 (93.2%) lived within 5 km and 101 (6.8%) between 5 and 10 km of the nearest health centre. Among the 1699 mothers who gave birth at home, 1551 (91.3%) lived within 5 km and 148 (8.7%) between 5 and 10 km of the nearest health centre. The mean distance from the women's residential locations to the nearest hospital was 8.5 km, ranging from 1 to 22 km. Two-thirds of the women, 2137 (67%), resided within 10 km, whereas one-third, 1054 (33%), lived in areas more than 10 km from the nearest hospital. Of the 1492 mothers who had given birth assisted by skilled health personnel, 1215 (81.4%) lived within 10 km, while 277 (19.6%) lived more than 10 km from the nearest hospital. Among the 1699 mothers who had given birth at home, 922 (54.3%) lived within 10 km, and 777 (45.7%) lived more than 10 km from the nearest hospital. Table 3 shows household and district-level accessibility variations to the nearest health centre, the nearest hospital, and the regional referral centre, Hawassa. The proportion of women living more than 5 km from the nearest health centre was 20.8% in Aleta Chuko district, 17.6% in Daela, and 12.7% in Aroresa. Three districts had a high proportion of women living more than 10 km from the nearest hospital: Daela (100%), Wondogenet (99.4%), and Aroresa (34.2%). The same districts had the lowest SBA. Aroresa and Daela districts are

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302

considered remote districts located 181 km and 175 km from the regional centre, Hawassa, respectively.

Table 3. Accessibility variations, Sidama National Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

		Nearest Health Centre			Nearest	rest Hospital			Referral hospital, Hawassa	
		Mean	Maximum	Women		Mean	Maximum	Women		Mean distance (km)
	Total	distance	distance	residing	%	distance	distance	residing	%	from district to
District	women	(km)	(km)	outside 5km		(km)	(km)	outside 10km		referral centre
Aleta Chuko	596	3	8.5	124	20.8	6.7	12.4	55	9.2	61
Aleta Wondo	704	1.7	6.4	1	0.1	6.4	14.0	97	13.8	64
Aroresa	503	3.4	5.8	64	12.7	6.8	14.2	172	34.2	181
Daela	205	3.4	6.9	36	17.6	12.5	14.8	205	100.0	175
Hawassa Zuriya	658	2.5	4.9	0	0.0	5.4	18.6	1	0.2	21
Wondogenet	525	2.3	4.6	0	0.0	17.0	21.9	522	99.4	25
Total	3191	2.6	8.5	225	7.1	8.5	21.9	1052	33.0	

Note: Km: kilometre

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

304

305

306

Variations in the use of skilled birth attendants and maternal

mortality

Table 4 describes the proportion of deliveries with skilled birth attendants in districts of Sidama Region and the corresponding maternal mortality ratio (MMR). The coverage of SBA was less than 50% in three out of six districts. Daela district had the lowest SBA coverage; 5.4% (95% CI: 3.0-9.4), followed by Aroresa; 19.7% (95% CI: 16.4-23.4), and Wondogenet at 26.8% (95% CI: 23.2-30.8). The two districts with the lowest coverage of SBA, Aroresa and Daela districts, had the highest MMR, with Aroresa district having a MMR of 1142 (95% CI: 693-1591) per 100,000 LB and Daela district having a MMR of 641 (95% CI: 77-1358) per 100,000 LB.

Table 4. Skilled birth attendants and maternal mortality ratio by district, Sidama National

Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

	Skilled	d birth attendar	Maternal mortality	ratio (MMR)		
	Total mothers	Mothers				
District	interviewed	used SBA	% SBA	95% CI	MMR	95% CI
Aleta Chuko	596	375	62. 9	59.0-66.7	263	58-467
Aleta Wondo	704	498	70. 7	67.3-74.0	525	207-842
Aroresa	503	99	19. 7	16.4-23.4	1142	693-1591
Daela	205	11	5. 4	3.0-9.4	641	77-1358
Hawassa Zuriya	658	368	55. 9	52.1-59.7	114	24-251
Wondogenet	525	141	26. 8	23.2-30.8	258	8-508

Note: CI: Confidence interval

318

319

320

321

Factors associated with skilled birth attendants

322 Table 5 shows the result of the mixed-effect multilevel logistic regression (MLLR) analysis. 323 The likelihood of utilization of SBA was higher among mothers with formal education (AOR: 1.5; 95% CI: 1.1-2.0), whose husbands were not engaged in farming (AOR: 1.5; 95% CI: 1.2-324 1.9), who experienced pregnancy-related complications (AOR: 1.7; 95% CI: 1.4-2.2), and who 325 attended ANC visits (AOR: 10.3; 95% CI: 7.5-14.1). Multiparous women were less likely to 326 use skilled birth (AOR: 0.5; 95% CI: 0.4-0.6). 327 The intra-cluster correlation (ICC) for the districts was 0.30 (95% CI: 0.24-0.36), meaning 328 329 that 30% of the variations in use of SBA were attributable to the district-level differences. We did not find significant ICC for limatbudin and kebele levels. 330 331 Distance to the nearest facility was associated with the use of SBA: a 1 km increase in distance to the hospital decreased the proportion of SBA by 14%; a 1km increase in distance 332 to the health centre decreased the proportion of SBA deliveries by 25%. 333

Table 5. Multilevel logistic regression analysis of skilled birth attendants, Sidama National

Regional State, southern Ethiopia, 2020

334

335

Variable		Type of birth		Bivariate analysis	Multilevel Logistic Regression Analysis	
Fixed effect	Total	Skilled	Unskilled	COR (95% CI)	AOR (95% CI)	P-value
Age of mother	3191			0.9 (0.8-0.9)	0.9 (0.9-1.0)	0.252
Education of mother						
No formal education	698	184	514	1	1	
Formal education	2493	1308	1185	3.1 (2.6-3.7)	1.5 (1.1-2.0)	0.041
Education of husband						
No formal education	420	120	300	1	1	
Formal education	2771	1372	1399	2.4 (1.9-3.1)	1.0 (0.7-1.4)	0.817
Wealth index of household						
Poor	1932	933	999	1	1	
Rich	1259	559	700	0.8 (0.7-1.0)	1.0 (0.8-1.3)	0.548
Occupation of husband						
Farming	2276	966	1310	1	1	
Non-farming*	915	526	389	1.8 (1.6-2.1)	1.5 (1.2-1.9)	<0.001
Parity						
Nulipara	1063	624	439	1	1	
Multipara	2128	868	1260	0.5 (0.4-0.6)	0.5 (0.4-0.6)	<0.001
ANC						
No	790	86	704	1	1	
Yes	2401	1406	995	11.6 (9.1-14.7)	10.3 (7.5-14.1)	<0.001
Pregnancy related complication						
Had no complication	1945	838	1107	1	1	
Had complication/s	1246	654	592	1.4 (1.3-1.7)	1.7 (1.4-2.2)	<0.001
Distance (nearest Hosp. in km)	3191			0.89 (0.87-0.90)	0.86 (0.83-0.89)	0.001
Distance (nearest HC in km)	3191			0.76 (0.72-0.80)	0.75 (0.67-0.85)	<0.001
Random effect						
ICC District					0.30 (0.24-0.36)	
AIC					3088	

Note: *Trading, government employee etc. AIC: Akaike's Information Criterion, AOR: Adjusted odds ratio CI: Confidence interval, COR: Crude odds ratio, ICC: Intra-cluster correlation, HC: Health centre, Hosp: Hospital

Discussion

Main findings

In the Sidama region, the proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel was 46.7%, with large variations between the districts. Thirty percent of variations in SBA are accounted for by the differences among the districts. Maternal mortality was high in districts where the proportion of births attended by skilled personnel was low. Factors associated with the use of SBA were education of the mother, occupation of the husband, pregnancy-related complications, ANC, parity, and distance to the nearest hospital and health centre.

Strengths and weaknesses of the study

In this study, we used the geographic coordinates of the nearest health centres and hospitals and coordinates collected at the individual household level to estimate the accessibility of the nearest health centres and hospitals as opposed to the commonly used village centroid.

This study had some limitations. Recall bias is a limitation of the study, as we asked about women's birth experiences in the past two years. However, giving birth is memorable, and recall bias is less likely. Social desirability bias: participants may state what they think is the acceptable response in the community, which can influence our results. However, we used different verification and probing questions to confirm the SBA. We could not establish a temporal relationship between the outcome and exposure variables due to the study's cross-sectional nature.

We could not find data on roads and modern transportation networks as the study was done in a rural area. Hence, we used Euclidean (straight line) distance to measure the

geographic accessibility of health centres and hospitals for SBA. The Euclidean method is recommended in rural settings to measure the accessibility of health facilities [32, 33]. Studies have also documented that in a rural setting, estimates from straight line distance measurements are comparable with the results of driving distance and driving time [32]. We may have missed births for women who are unmarried. However, we believe that in a rural setting, the majority of pregnancies are a result of marriage. Studies have shown that unmarried women do not constitute a significant number in such studies [12, 14]. We did not also find women who had a history of pregnancy below the age of 15 years. Since the crude and adjusted risk factors vary substantially (Table 5), we carried out stratified analysis to identify and control for confounding [37]. When we analysed the association between husband education and SBA, stratified by mother education, the difference between crude and adjusted odds ratios remained markedly different. This indicates that mother education is a confounder of husband education, as it is associated with the exposure (husband education) and the outcome (SBA). In other words, an educated husband is more likely to marry an educated woman, and mother education is a risk factor for SBA. In addition, there might be residual confounders that we did not consider in our study, which may have affected our results. Coverage and district-level variations of skilled birth attendants In Sidama Region, the proportion of deliveries using SBA was 46.7%, with large variations in the districts. This finding is comparable with the findings of other studies in the country [16, 24, 34]. However, it is below the national plan for 2020 and the target set for the year 2025 by Health Sector Transformation Plan II [38]. The global proportion of births using SBA is 84%; however, in this study, the coverage of SBA is below the level of the sub-Saharan

359

360

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

African countries, at 52% [4]. The very low coverage of SBA in some districts in Sidama is attributable to the inaccessibility of health facilities, difficult topography, and lack of transportation, poor referral systems, and a shortage of skilled health professionals. Urgent action and concerted effort are needed to increase the use of SBA in the Sidama region and to support the country's efforts towards attaining the Sustainable Development Goal. This study found that around one-third of the variation in SBA was attributed to the differences among districts. This result is higher than the findings of a national study conducted in Ethiopia, which found around 22% of the variation in SBA was attributed to differences between communities [39]. The differences between the two studies can be explained by the fact that in our study, the ICC of the districts was considered, whereas the national study used enumeration locations to estimate the ICC. The high variations in SBA attributable to the differences between the districts in our study could be explained by the uneven distribution of health services, including the differences in the mix and number of skilled health professionals, the availability of the necessary logistics and supplies for maternal health services, and other infrastructure like roads, water supply, and electricity in the districts.

Skilled birth attendants and maternal mortality

This study shows that districts with a low proportion of deliveries attended by SBA have a high maternal mortality. Similar findings have been reported in the 2022 UNICEF report [4]. In places with low SBA, many mothers give birth at home, unattended by skilled health professionals and without access to life-saving drugs and interventions. This leads to the loss of many mothers and new-borns due to the risks associated with unattended home delivery

382

383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391

392

393

394

395

396

397

398

399

400

401

402

[40]. Improving access, quality, and coverage of key interventions, including SBA, saves the lives of mothers and new-borns [41]. Wondogenet district seems to be an exception, with a fairly low MMR in spite of a low proportion of deliveries using SBA. We think the reason for lower MMR is that the district has better roads, available transportation for emergencies, a functional local referral system, and fairly easy access to the regional referral centre in Hawassa. Factors associated with skilled birth attendants The use of SBA was more common among mothers with an education. This finding agrees with the studies done in Ethiopia [12, 25] and elsewhere [9, 42]. Mothers' formal education is associated with better health knowledge and, consequently, with improved use of health services [43]. Educated women have higher healthcare decision autonomy [44] and are more likely to plan and prepare for an obstetric emergency [45]; education empowers women, and consequently, more of them use SBA [46]. However, the association between mother education and SBA is weak in our study. This shows other factors like ANC, complications of pregnancy, distance to the nearest hospital, and distribution of services within the districts play a great role in the use of SBA. The probability of using SBA increased for women who had complications during pregnancy. Studies conducted in northwest Ethiopia [12] and Bangladesh [47] reported similar findings. This association can be explained by the fact that mothers with pregnancy complications are more likely to seek medical care, be advised on the importance of SBA during ANC, and be

referred for SBA [48].

404

405

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419

420

421

422

423

perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license.

This study demonstrated that attendance at antenatal care is a strong predictor of using SBA. This finding agrees with the studies conducted in Kenya [49] and Ethiopia [25]. This could be explained by the fact that women who attend ANC will be familiar with the health system and health facilities, be encouraged and counselled on the importance of SBA by ANC providers, and get prepared in advance for facility delivery. Compared to primiparous women, multiparous women were less likely to use SBA. A similar finding has been reported by a study conducted in southern Ghana and Tanzania [19, 50]. Multiparous women may be influenced by their previous experiences and consider childbirth a natural process. Moreover, multiparous women may have strong cultural ties and be more influenced by traditional practices. The use of SBA during deliveries is more common among women married to employed men or traders. A similar finding has been reported from a study conducted in Nigeria [51]. This could be explained by the fact that employed husbands are more likely to be educated, better understand the use of SBA, and support their wives to take SBA care and have a better income, making it easier for the family to cover the costs associated with skilled delivery care. Accessibility of health centres and hospitals and use of skilled birth care According to the WHO, pregnant women should be able to access EmONC health facilities within 2 hours of travel time [35, 52]. Our study found that 33% of women reside more than 10 km from the nearest hospital, with great variations by district, meaning a third of the women have to travel more than 2 hours to access the nearest hospital. Districts where the

425

426

427

428

429

430

431

432

433

434

435

436

437

438

439

440

441

442

443

444

445

women live far from the nearest hospital had a lower proportion of delivering women assisted by SBA. It has also been recommended that, at the national or subnational level, at least 80% of pregnant women should access the nearest hospital within 2 hours of travel time [52, 53], but we found in our study three districts where the proportion of pregnant women who access the nearest hospital in 2 hours is below the recommended 80%.

Policy implications

The low proportion of births attended by SBA with high variations in districts shows the Sidama National Regional Health Bureau and district health offices should take urgent action to improve the use of SBA, identify risk factors, and design interventions tailored to the local context. The association of low SBA with high maternal mortality in districts far away from the regional centre reaffirms that SBA plays a key role in reducing maternal mortality. It also signals that the government should give due attention to the remote and distant districts, addressing the uneven distribution of maternal health services, a lack of skilled health personnel, and poor infrastructure to improve SBA and consequently decrease the prevailing maternal mortality. Access to hospitals should be improved through the construction of hospitals in areas devoid of services. All pregnant mothers should be encouraged and supported to take ANC.

Conclusions

In Sidama Region, the coverage of SBA is low, with high variation in districts. Low SBA was associated with high MMR. Corrective actions should be taken to improve the low SBA and decrease the high MMR. Hospitals should be accessible to pregnant mothers, and the ANC should be strengthened.

Acknowledgements

We want to thank the participants in the study for their time and information. Our special thanks go to the Sidama National Regional State Health Bureau, respective district health offices, and kebele administrations in Ethiopia for their support and permission to conduct the study. We thank data collectors and clerks for their time and commitment.

References

495

1. Saleem S, McClure EM, Goudar SS, Patel A, Esamai F, Garces A, et al. A prospective study of 496 497 maternal, fetal and neonatal deaths in low- and middle-income countries. Bulletin of the 498 World Health Organization. 2014;92(8):605-12. doi: 10.2471/BLT.13.127464 PMCID: PMC4147405 499 500 2. WHO. Defining competent maternal and new-born health professionals. Joint statement by 501 WHO, UNFPA, UNICEF, ICM, ICN, FIGO and IPA. Geneva: World Health Organization. 2018. 502 Available from: https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/272817 503 3. Sustainable Development Goals. Every Woman, Every Child: The Global Strategy for 504 Women's, Children's and Adolescents' Health (2016-2030). 2015. 505 4. United Nations Children's Fund. Delivering for Women: Improving maternal health services 506 to save lives. New York: UNICEF. 2022. 507 5. Girum T, Wasie A. Correlates of maternal mortality in developing countries: an ecological 508 study in 82 countries. Maternal health, neonatology and perinatology. 2017;3:19. doi: 10.1186/s40748-017-0059-8 509 PMCID: 29142757 Berhan Y, Berhan A. Skilled health personnel attended delivery as a proxy indicator for 510 6. 511 maternal and perinatal mortality: a systematic review. Ethiopian journal of health sciences. 2014; 24 Suppl (0 Suppl):69-80. doi: 10.4314/ejhs.v24i1.7S 512 PMCID: 25489184 513 7. Vadrevu L, Kanjilal B. Measuring spatial equity and access to maternal health services using 514 enhanced two step floating catchment area method (E2SFCA) - a case study of the Indian 515 Sundarbans. International journal for equity in health. 2016;15:87. doi: 10.1186/s12939-516 517 016-0376-y PMCID: PMC4897818

518	8.	Crowe S, Utley M, Costello A, Pagel C. How many births in sub-Saharan Africa and South Asia
519		will not be attended by a skilled birth attendant between 2011 and 2015? BMC pregnancy
520		and childbirth. 2012;12:4. <u>10.1186/1471-2393-12-4</u> PMCID: <u>PMC3274439</u>
521	9.	Tessema ZT, Tesema GA. Pooled prevalence and determinants of skilled birth attendant
522		delivery in East Africa countries: a multilevel analysis of Demographic and Health Surveys.
523		Italian journal of pediatrics. 2020;46:177. doi: <u>10.1186/s13052-020-00943-z</u> PMCID:
524		PMC7708172
525	10.	Ayele GS, Melku AT, Belda SS. Utilization of skilled birth attendant at birth and associated
526		factors among women who gave birth in the last 24 months preceding the survey in Gura
527		Dhamole Woreda, Bale zone, southeast Ethiopia. BMC public health. 2019;19:1501.
528		doi: <u>10.1186/s12889-019-7818-6</u> PMCID: <u>PMC6849185</u>
529	11.	Kea AZ, Lindtjorn B, Gebretsadik A, Hinderaker SG. Variation in maternal mortality in Sidama
530		National Regional State, southern Ethiopia: A population based cross sectional household
531		survey. PloS one.2023;18(3):e0272110. doi: <u>10.1371/journal.pone.0272110</u> PMCID:
532		PMC9990948
533	12.	Alemayehu M, Mekonnen W. The Prevalence of Skilled Birth Attendant Utilization and Its
534		Correlates in North West Ethiopia. BioMed research international. 2015;2015:436938.
535		doi: <u>10.1155/2015/436938</u> PMCID: <u>PMC4609361</u>
536	13.	Seboka BT, Mamo TT, Mekonnen T. Identifying geographical inequalities of maternal care
537		utilization in Ethiopia: a Spatio-temporal analysis from 2005 to 2019. BMC health services
538		research. 2022;22:1455. doi: <u>10.1186/s12913-022-08850-1</u> PMCID: <u>PMC9714149</u>
539	14.	Ayalew HG, Liyew AM, Tessema ZT, Worku MG, Tesema GA, Alamneh TS, et al. Spatial
540		variation and factors associated with home delivery after ANC visit in Ethiopia; spatial and
541		multilevel analysis. PloS one. 2022;17(8):e0272849. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0272849
542		PMCID: <u>PMC9409554</u>

543 15. Bediako VB, Boateng ENK, Owusu BA, Dickson KS. Multilevel geospatial analysis of factors associated with unskilled birth attendance in Ghana. PloS one. 2021;16(6):e0253603. 544 doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0253603 PMCID: PMC8232528 545 546 Gilano G, Hailegebreal S, Seboka BT. Determinants and spatial distribution of institutional 16. delivery in Ethiopia: evidence from Ethiopian Mini Demographic and Health Surveys 2019. 547 Archives of public health = Archives belges de sante publique. 2022;80:65. 548 doi: 10.1186/s13690-022-00825-2 PMCID: PMC8862569 549 550 17. Mishra PS, Sinha D, Kumar P, Srivastava S. Spatial inequalities in skilled birth attendance in 551 India: a spatial-regional model approach. BMC public health. 2022;22:79. doi: 10.1186/s12889-021-12436-7 PMCID: PMC8756682 552 553 18. World Health Organization. Strategies towards ending preventable maternal mortality (EPMM). 2015. Available from: https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/153544 554 Manyeh AK, Akpakli DE, Kukula V, Ekey RA, Narh-Bana S, Adiei A, et al. Socio-demographic 555 19. determinants of skilled birth attendant at delivery in rural southern Ghana. BMC research 556 notes. 2017;10:268. doi: 10.1186/s13104-017-2591-z 557 PMCID: PMC5504761 558 20. Okonofua F, Ntoimo L, Ogungbangbe J, Anjorin S, Imongan W, Yaya S. Predictors of women's 559 utilization of primary health care for skilled pregnancy care in rural Nigeria. BMC pregnancy 560 and childbirth. 2018;18:106. doi: 10.1186/s12884-018-1730-4 PMCID: 561 PMC5907371 Higgins-Steele A, Burke J, Foshanji Al, Farewar F, Naziri M, Seddiqi S, et al. Barriers 562 21. 563 associated with care-seeking for institutional delivery among rural women in three provinces 564 in Afghanistan. BMC pregnancy and childbirth. 2018;18:246. doi: 10.1186/s12884-018-1890-2 PMCID: PMC6006744 565 Central Statistical Agency Ethiopia: The DHS Program ICF Rockville M, USA. Demographic and 566 22. 567 Health Survey 2016 Final Report: 2017.

perpetuity.

It is made available under a CC-BY 4.0 International license .

568 23. WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA, BANK W, UNPD. Trends in Maternal Mortality:2000-2017. WHO, 569 UNICEF, UNFPA, UNDP and The World Bank estimates. 2019. Available from: 570 https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/327596 571 24. Tarekegn W, Tsegaye S, Berhane Y. Skilled birth attendant utilization trends, determinant and inequality gaps in Ethiopia. BMC women's health. 2022;22:466. doi: 572 10.1186/s12905-022-01995-5 573 PMCID: PMC9682649. 25. Abebe HT, Adhana MT, Gebremichael MW, Gezae KE, Gebreslassie AA. Magnitude, trends 574 575 and determinants of skilled delivery from Kilite-Awlaelo Health Demographic Surveillance System, Northern Ethiopia, 2009-2017. PloS one. 2021;16(9):e0254146. doi: 576 10.1371/journal.pone.0254146 PMCID: PMC8428565 577 Alamneh TS, Teshale AB, Yeshaw Y, Alem AZ, Ayalew HG, Liyew AM, et al. Barriers for health 578 26. 579 care access affects maternal continuum of care utilization in Ethiopia; spatial analysis and 580 generalized estimating equation. PloS one. 2022;17(4):e0266490. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0266490 PMCID: PMC9032438 581 Kea AZ, Lindtjorn B, Gebretsadik A, Hinderaker SG. Reduction in maternal mortality ratio 27. 582 varies by district in Sidama Regional State, southern Ethiopia: Estimates by cross-sectional 583 studies using the sisterhood method and a household survey of pregnancy and birth 584 585 outcomes. medRxiv 280613 [preprint] [posted 2022 October 042022. Available from: https://medrxiv.org/cgi/content/short/2022.10.02.22280613v1 586 Acquah E, Nyarko SH, Boateng ENK, Dickson KS, Addo IY, Adzrago D. Spatial and multilevel 587 28. 588 analysis of unskilled birth attendance in Chad. BMC public health. 2022;22:1561. doi: 589 10.1186/s12889-022-13972-6 PMCID: PMC9382725 590 29. Windsma M. Vermeiden T. Braat F. Tsegave AM, Gavm A, van den Akker T, et al. Emergency 591 obstetric care provision in Southern Ethiopia: a facility-based survey. BMJ. 2017;7(11):e018459.: doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2017-018459 PMCID: PMC5695514 592

593	30.	Ministry of Health. Health Extension Programme in Ethiopia. 2007.
594		https://www.moh.gov.et/site/directorates/health-extension
595	31.	Vyas S, Kumaranayake L. Constructing socio-economic status indices: how to use principal
596		components analysis. Health policy and planning. 2006;21(6):459-68. doi:
597		10.1093/heapol/czl029
598	32.	Al-Taiar A, Clark A, Longenecker JC, Whitty CJ. Physical accessibility and utilization of health
599		services in Yemen. International journal of health geographics. 2010;9:38.
600		doi: <u>10.1186/1476-072X-9-38</u> PMCID: <u>PMC2914054</u>
601	33.	Nesbitt RC, Gabrysch S, Laub A, Soremekun S, Manu A, Kirkwood BR, et al. Methods to
602		measure potential spatial access to delivery care in low- and middle-income countries: a
603		case study in rural Ghana. International journal of health geographics. 2014;13:25. doi:
604		<u>10.1186/1476-072X-13-25</u> PMCID: <u>PMC4086697</u>
605	34.	Ethiopian Public Health Institute (EPHI) Ethiopia and ICF. Ethiopia Mini Demographic and
606		Health Survey 2019: key indicators. Rockville, Maryland, USA: EPHI and ICF.
607	35.	WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA, AMDD. Monitoring Emergency Obstetric Care, a handbook. WHO
608		Publications. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization. 2009. Available from:
609		https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/44121
610	36.	Ray N, Ebener S. AccessMod 3.0: computing geographic coverage and accessibility to health
611		care services using anisotropic movement of patients. International journal of health
612		geographics. 2008;7:63. doi: <u>10.1186/1476-072X-7-63</u> PMCID: <u>PMC2651127</u>
613	37.	Pourhoseingholi MA, Baghestani AR, Vahedi M. How to control confounding effects by
614		statistical analysis. Gastroenterology and hepatology from bed to bench. 2012;5(2):79-83.
615		PMID: <u>24834204</u>
616	38.	Ethiopia Ministry of Health. Health Sector Transformation Plan: 2020-2025. 2021.

617	39.	Tolossa T, Bekele D. Multilevel analysis of skilled birth attendance and associated factors
618		among reproductive age women in Ethiopia: Data from EDHS 2016. International Journal of
619		Africa Nursing Sciences. 2020.
620	40.	Ndola Prata , Paige Passano , Tami Rowen , Suzanne Bell , Julia Walsh, Potts M. Where There
621		Are (Few) Skilled Birth Attendants. Journal of Health, Population and Nutrition.
622		2011;29(2):81-9. doi: <u>10.3329/jhpn.v29i2.7812</u> PMCID: <u>PMC3126980</u>
623	41.	Bhutta ZA, Das JK, Bahl R, Lawn JE, Salam RA, Paul VK, et al. Can available interventions end
624		preventable deaths in mothers, newborn babies, and stillbirths, and at what cost?
625		Lancet. 2014;384(9940):347-70. doi: <u>10.1016/S0140-6736(14)60792-3</u> PMID:
626		<u>24853604</u>
627	42.	Solanke BL, Rahman SA. Multilevel analysis of factors associated with assistance during
628		delivery in rural Nigeria: implications for reducing rural-urban inequity in skilled care at
629		delivery. BMC pregnancy and childbirth. 2018;18:438. doi: <u>10.1186/s12884-018-2074-</u>
630		9 PMCID: <u>PMC6225672</u> .
631	43.	Greenaway ES, Leon J, Baker DP. Understanding the association between maternal
632		education and use of health services in Ghana: exploring the role of health knowledge.
633		Journal of biosocial science. 2012;44(6):733-47. doi: 10.1017/S0021932012000041
634		PMCID: <u>PMC3590019</u>
635	44.	Kassahun A, Zewdie A. Decision-making autonomy in maternal health service use and
636		associated factors among women in Mettu District, Southwest Ethiopia: a community-based
637		cross-sectional study. BMJ open. 2022;12(5):e059307. doi: <u>10.1136/bmjopen-2021-</u>
638		<u>059307</u> PMCID: <u>PMC9062806</u>
639	45.	Ketema DB, Leshargie CT, Kibret GD, Assemie MA, Petrucka P, Alebel A. Effects of maternal
640		education on birth preparedness and complication readiness among Ethiopian pregnant

641 women: a systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC pregnancy and childbirth. 642 2020;20:149. doi: 10.1186/s12884-020-2812-7 PMCID: PMC7060625 46. Dickson KS, Adde KS, Ameyaw EK. Women empowerment and skilled birth attendance in 643 sub-Saharan Africa: A multi-country analysis. PloS one. 2021;16(7):e0254281. 644 645 doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0254281 PMCID: PMC8263257 47. Islam N, Islam MT, Yoshimura Y. Practices and determinants of delivery by skilled birth 646 attendants in Bangladesh. Reproductive health. 2014;11:86. doi: 10.1186/1742-4755-11-647 648 86 PMCID: PMC4292816 649 48. Gabrysch S, Campbell OM. Still too far to walk: literature review of the determinants of 650 delivery service use. BMC pregnancy and childbirth. 2009;9:34. doi: 10.1186/1471-2393-PMCID: PMC2744662 9-34 651 Gitimu A, Herr C, Oruko H, Karijo E, Gichuki R, Ofware P, et al. Determinants of use of skilled 652 49. 653 birth attendant at delivery in Makueni, Kenya: a cross sectional study. BMC pregnancy and 654 childbirth. 2015;15:9. doi: 10.1186/s12884-015-0442-2 PMCID: PMC4324035 655 50. Damian DJ, Tibelerwa JY, John B, Philemon R, Mahande MJ, Msuya SE. Factors influencing 656 utilization of skilled birth attendant during childbirth in the Southern highlands, Tanzania: a multilevel analysis. BMC pregnancy and childbirth. 2020;20:420. doi: 10.1186/s12884-657 020-03110-8 PMCID: PMC7382099 658 Adewemimo AW, Msuya SE, Olaniyan CT, Adegoke AA. Utilisation of skilled birth attendance 659 51. 660 in Northern Nigeria: a cross-sectional survey. Midwifery. 201430(1):e7-e13. doi: 10.1016/j.midw.2013.09.005 661 52. Ebener S, Stenberg K, Brun M, Monet JP, Ray N, Sobel HL, et al. Proposing standardised 662 geographical indicators of physical access to emergency obstetric and newborn care in low-663 income and middle-income countries. BMJ global health. 2019;4(Suppl 5):e000778. doi: 664 665 10.1136/bmjgh-2018-000778 PMCID: PMC6623986

666 53. Meara JG, Greenberg SL. The Lancet Commission on Global Surgery Global surgery 2030: 667 Evidence and solutions for achieving health, welfare and economic development. Surgery. 2015;157(5):834-5. doi: <u>10.1016/j.surg.2015.02.009</u> 668 669 670