

Risk of Ischemic Stroke after COVID-19 Bivalent Booster Vaccination in an Integrated Health System

Katie A Sharff MD ^a, Thomas K Tandy MPH^b, Paul F Lewis MD, MPH^c, Eric S Johnson PhD^b

^a Department of Infectious Diseases, Northwest Permanente, Portland, Oregon; ^b Department of Analytics, Northwest Permanente, Portland, Oregon; ^c Department of Pediatrics, Northwest Permanente, Portland Oregon

Correspondence: Katie A. Sharff, Northwest Permanente, Portland, Oregon, katie.a.sharff@kp.org

5 key points:

1. We identified a 50% increase in incidence of ischemic stroke or transient ischemic attack (TIA) per 100,000 patients ages 65 and older vaccinated with the Pfizer bivalent vaccine, compared to the data presented by the Vaccine Safety Datalink (VSD).
2. Seventy-nine percent of the ischemic stroke and TIA cases were admitted to hospitals that are not owned by the integrated delivery system.
3. A delay in processing outside hospital insurance claims was likely responsible for the discrepancy in case ascertainment of ischemic stroke.
4. Replication of the VSD case definition confirmed the exceptionally high positive predictive value (PPV) in identifying ischemic stroke or TIA within 21 days of Pfizer bivalent vaccination in individuals 65 years and older when the ICD-10-CM hospital discharge code is restricted to the primary position.
5. Physician adjudication of all cases in this study allowed accurate absolute incidence estimates of stroke per 100,000 vaccine recipients and is helpful in calculation of net benefit for policy recommendations and shared decision-making.

Abstract:

Purpose: What is the absolute occurrence of ischemic stroke and transient ischemic attack after a COVID-19 bivalent vaccination?

Methods:

We conducted a retrospective cohort study of Kaiser Permanente Northwest (KPNW) patients 18 years and older who were vaccinated with either the Pfizer or Moderna formulation of the COVID-19 bivalent vaccine between September 1, 2022 and March 1st 2023. Patients were included in the study if they had KP membership at the time of vaccination and through the 21-day follow up period. We replicated the Vaccine Safety Datalink (VSD) rapid cycle analysis methodology and searched for possible cases of ischemic stroke or TIA in the 21 days following vaccination using ICD-10-CM diagnosis codes in both the primary position and any position. We waited 90 days from the end of the follow up (March 21, 2023) for complete non-KP data accrual before analyzing the data to account for the lag in processing outside hospital insurance claims. Two physicians adjudicated possible cases by reviewing the clinical notes in

the electronic health record. The analyses were stratified by age ≥ 65 years to allow for comparisons with VSD's reporting at the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP) meeting of incidence of ischemic stroke or TIA (VSD reported incidence; 24.6 cases of ischemic stroke or TIA per 100,000 patients vaccinated).

Results:

The incidence of ischemic stroke or TIA was 34.3 per 100,000 (95% CI, 17.7 – 59.9) in patients 65 years or older who received the bivalent Pfizer vaccine—based on a diagnosis code in the primary position of the emergency department or hospital discharge. The incidence increased to 45.7 per 100,000 (95% CI 26.1 – 74.2) when we expanded the search to a diagnosis in any position and did not adjudicate to confirm. However, most of those additional apparent stroke or TIA diagnoses were false-positive diagnoses based on physicians' adjudications. Estimating the incidence based on the primary position agreed closely with estimating the incidence based on any position and physician adjudication: 37.1 per 100,000 (95% CI 19.8 – 63.5). Seventy-nine percent of the ischemic stroke cases were admitted to hospitals that are not owned by the integrated delivery system.

Conclusion:

We identified a 50% increase in the incidence of ischemic stroke per 100,000 patients ages 65 and older vaccinated with the Pfizer bivalent vaccine, compared to the data presented by the VSD. Seventy-nine percent of the ischemic stroke cases were admitted to non-plan hospitals and a delay in processing outside hospital insurance claims was likely responsible for the discrepancy in case ascertainment of ischemic stroke. Physician adjudication of all cases in this study allowed accurate absolute incidence estimates of stroke per 100,000 vaccine recipients and is helpful in calculation of net benefit for policy recommendations and shared decision-making.

Purpose:

Bivalent Omicron BA4/5 COVID19 boosters were approved for use in the United States on August 31, 2022.¹ The Centers for Disease Control (CDC) tracks safety data related to vaccines through the Vaccine Safety Datalink (VSD) which is a collaborative project between CDC and thirteen integrated healthcare systems in the US, including Kaiser Permanente Northwest (KPNW). The VSD utilizes rapid cycle analysis (RCA) methodology for near real-time surveillance of 21 prespecified outcomes during weekly sequential monitoring after COVID-19 bivalent booster vaccination.²

VSD's RCA found a statistical signal (excess rate ratio) for ischemic stroke and TIA in individuals 65 years and older who received the bivalent Pfizer-BioNTech (Pfizer) COVID19 vaccine. Although the VSD identified an initial signal, the small number of strokes and imprecise rate ratios limited some analyses, and this signal was not replicated in other safety systems.^{3,4,5}

To estimate the incidence of ischemic stroke and TIA after a COVID-19 bivalent vaccination, we conducted a retrospective cohort study at KPNW. Because all potential ICD-10-CM-coded ischemic strokes would be adjudicated by physicians to exclude false-positive diagnoses, we searched for ICD-10-CM diagnosis codes in any position on a hospital discharge to improve sensitivity (complete case

ascertainment). Our cohort study addresses a gap in the evidence: We estimated the absolute occurrence of ischemic stroke to support improved diagnosis and calculation of net benefit for policy recommendations and shared decision-making.

Methods:

We conducted a retrospective cohort study of KPNW patients 18 years and older who were vaccinated with either the Pfizer or Moderna formulation of the COVID-19 bivalent vaccine between September 1, 2022 and March 1 2023. Patients were included in the study if they had KP membership at the time of vaccination and through the 21-day follow up period. We replicated the VSD RCA methodology and searched for possible cases of ischemic stroke or TIA in the 21 days following vaccination. The following ICD-10-CM diagnosis codes were included to find the incident cases: G45.8, G45.9 and I63*. The primary diagnosis was defined by an incident case ICD-10-CM code in the primary diagnosis field of the hospital discharge: emergency department visits or hospital admissions. The VSD's RCA protocol and publications do not specify whether they restricted their search to the primary position for ICD-10-CM diagnosis codes for emergency department visits or hospitalizations, but the primary position seems likely given the high PPV and lack of routine adjudication of events. Furthermore, we waited 90 days from the end of the follow up (March 21, 2023) for complete non-KP data accrual before analyzing the data to account for the lag in processing outside hospital insurance claims. Patients were excluded if they had atrial fibrillation, sickle cell anemia, primary thrombophilia, prior history of TIA, or sequelae of cerebrovascular disease at any point prior to the incident case, COVID-19 within the past 30 days, acute MI within the past 28 days, injury of blood vessels at neck level, or arterial embolism/thrombosis within one day of the incident case as outlined in the VSD protocol.² Two physicians adjudicated possible cases by reviewing the clinical notes in the electronic health record. The analyses were stratified by age ≥ 65 years to allow for comparisons with VSD's reporting at the Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices (ACIP) meeting (24.6 cases of ischemic stroke or TIA per 100,000 patients vaccinated).⁴ For the incidence estimates and positive predictive value estimates we calculated exact 95% confidence intervals using Stata 17 and the default Clopper-Pearson binomial method.⁶ The Institutional Review Board at KPNW approved this study.

Results:

We followed 105,171 patients 18 years and older vaccinated with at least one dose of Pfizer or Moderna COVID19 bivalent vaccines: 85,535 (81.3%) received Pfizer and 19,688 (18.7%) received by Moderna. When we restricted our search to the primary position of ICD-10-CM diagnosis code we identified 19 patients who met the VSD criteria for acute ischemic stroke or TIA within 21 days of vaccination. Two physicians confirmed that 18 of the 19 possible cases met the clinical definition of TIA or ischemic stroke, positive predictive value of 94.7% (95% CI, 74.0-99.9).

When we expanded our search to include an ICD-10-CM diagnosis code in any position (i.e., not restricted to the primary position) we identified 24 possible cases. Two physicians confirmed that 19 of the 24 cases met the clinical definition of TIA or ischemic stroke (Table). The expanded search with ICD-10-CM diagnosis codes in any position had a PPV of 79.2 % (95% CI, 57.8-92.9). The 5 cases that did not meet clinical adjudication had a variety of alternative diagnosis including dizziness or sepsis.

When we restricted the analysis to patients 65 years and older who received the bivalent Pfizer vaccine—based on the VSD's RCA signal detection-- we identified 12 cases with an ICD-10-CM in the primary position and all were confirmed: PPV=100% (95% CI, 73.5-100). When we expanded the search

to any position, there were 16 cases and 13 were confirmed by adjudication: PPV=81.3% (95% CI, 54.4-96.0).

When we restricted the analysis to the 35,003 patients 65 years and older who received the bivalent Pfizer vaccine, we identified an incidence of ischemic stroke or TIA of 34.3 per 100,000 (95% CI, 17.7 – 59.9) based on the primary code position. For the same group of patients the incidence increased when a diagnosis could appear in any position: 45.7 per 100,000 (95% CI, 26.1-74.2)(non-adjudicated); 37.1 per 100,000 (95% CI, 19.8-63.5) (adjudicated and confirmed).

Table: Adjudicated ischemic stroke or TIA cases in all patients 18 years and older with ICD-10-CM hospital discharge diagnosis code in any position

Case	Age	Claims	Sex	Diagnosis	Vaccine Brand	Days from Vaccination to Onset of Stroke/TIA	High Dose Flu Vaccine	Timing of High Dose Flu Vaccine
1	40-49	Yes	Male	R middle cerebral artery occlusion	Pfizer	12	No	NA
2	50-59	Yes	Male	L middle cerebral artery ischemic stroke	Pfizer	20	No	NA
3	50-59	Yes	Female	Lacunar Infarct	Pfizer	11	No	NA
4	50-59	Yes	Male	Subacute Infarct R frontal lobe	Pfizer	21	No	NA
5	60-69	Yes	Female	TIA	Pfizer	7	No	NA
6	60-69	Yes	Male	TIA	Pfizer	14	No	NA
7	60-69	Yes	Male	Infarct of R ventral pons	Pfizer	5	Yes	Same day
8	60-69	Yes	Male	R thalamic infarct	Pfizer	21	Yes	Same Day
9	70-79	Yes	Female	Acute Ischemic stroke	Moderna	10	Yes	Same day
10	70-79	Yes	Female	Acute Pontine Infarct	Pfizer	21	Yes	Same Day
11	70-79	Yes	Male	Stroke in pons	Pfizer	6	Yes	21 days prior
12	70-79	Yes	Male	Expressive aphasia, presumptive stroke, unable to image	Pfizer	4	Yes	>30 days prior
13	70-79	Yes	Male	TIA	Pfizer	15	Yes	>30 days prior
14	70-79	Yes	Female	Acute multifocal L hemisphere stroke	Pfizer	11	Yes	>30 days prior
15	80-89	Yes	Male	TIA followed by infarct post-central gyrus	Pfizer	5	Yes	20 days prior
16	80-89	Yes	Female	Acute microvascular infarcts	Pfizer	0	No	NA
17	80-89	Yes	Male	TIA	Pfizer	18	Yes	Same day
18	80-89	Yes	Female	Right basal ganglia stroke	Pfizer	10	Yes	>30 days prior
19	80-89	Yes	Male	R basal ganglia	Pfizer	1	Yes	Same Day

				ischemic stroke				
--	--	--	--	-----------------	--	--	--	--

TIA: Transient ischemic attack

R: Right

L: Left

NA: Not applicable

Pfizer: Pfizer-BioNTech COVID-19 Vaccine, Bivalent

Moderna: Moderna COVID-19 Vaccine Bivalent

Conclusion:

The incidence of ischemic stroke or TIA was 34.3 per 100,000 (95% CI, 17.7 – 59.9) in patients 65 years or older who received the bivalent Pfizer vaccine—based on a diagnosis code in the primary position of the emergency department or hospital discharge. The incidence increased to 45.7 per 100,000 (95% CI, 26.1 – 74.2) when we expanded the search to a diagnosis in any position and did not adjudicate to confirm. However, most of those additional apparent stroke or TIA diagnoses were false-positive diagnoses based on physicians’ adjudications. Estimating the incidence based on the primary position agreed closely with estimating the incidence based on any position and physician adjudication: 37.1 per 100,000 (95% CI, 19.8 – 63.5), which is a 50% increase in incidence as presented by the VSD at ACIP for this same population (24.6 cases per 100,000 patients vaccinated (non-adjudicated)).⁴

Our findings demonstrated that the current VSD protocol has a high PPV 94.7 (95% CI, 74.0-99.9) in identifying ischemic stroke or TIA within 21 days of bivalent booster vaccine in patients ages 18 and older, and a PPV=100% (95% CI, 73.5-100) in Pfizer recipients ages 65 and older. Our findings corroborate the VSD estimate presented at the ACIP meeting in which they reported a PPV of 92% for Pfizer vaccine recipients ages 65 and older.³

Bivalent COVID-19 vaccine first became available in the United States on August 31, 2023.⁷ The VSD identified a safety signal of ischemic stroke with clustering in the first 11-22 days after bivalent BNT162b2 Pfizer-BioNTech vaccination with a relative risk of 1.47 (95% CI 1.11-1.95) in the days 1-21 post vaccination compared to days 22-44 post-vaccination, however this signal was not replicated in other systems.^{3,4,5}

A possible explanation for our higher incidence relative to the VSD data may be related to the delay in processing outside hospitals’ insurance claims.⁸ In our analysis, 79% of the adjudicated cases were admitted to an outside hospital and we waited a full 90 days after the follow up period (March 21, 2023) to allow for complete case ascertainment. When insurance claims are used to identify inpatient diagnoses, claims delays are lengthy for sites that do not own the hospitals used by their patients.⁹ The VSD relies on real-time data with analysis updated weekly, but within the VSD system, at least 4 of the health systems rely on claims from hospitals that are not owned by the integrated delivery system.^{3,4}

The position of the ICD-10-CM hospital discharge code (primary position vs any position) identified one additional case after physician adjudication and therefore was a small contribution to the discrepancy for case ascertainment of ischemic stroke between our study and the VSD’s rapid cycle analysis.

A limitation to this study is we were unable to account for underlying differences in the KPNW VSD population (age, gender, comorbid conditions) in comparison to the aggregate VSD population that may increase their inherent risk of stroke or TIA.

Because the rapid cycle surveillance requires weekly analyses of ICD-10-CM-coded emergency department visits and hospital admissions, that timeline allow insufficient time for physician adjudication through chart review; the case definitions for the 21 outcomes are designed to optimize the positive predictive value, sometimes at the expense of sensitivity (i.e., complete outcome ascertainment). The VSD's rapid cycle case definitions support accurate *rate ratios* that inform timely signal detection. The VSD's rapid cycle case definitions do not necessarily support accurate *absolute* incidence estimates that answer a distinct question: How often does the adverse event occur in patients who were recently vaccinated? Physicians need to know how often an adverse event occurs to reduce missed diagnoses—"Bayesian thinking."¹⁰ Knowing how often an adverse event occurs also informs the calculation of net benefit for policy recommendations and shared decision-making.¹¹

Our study identified a 50% increase in the incidence of ischemic stroke or TIA per 100,000 Pfizer bivalent vaccine recipients ages 65 and older compared to the data shared by VSD. The reasons for this finding are uncertain but may be related to a delay in processing of outside hospital claims.

References

1. FDA. Coronavirus (COVID-19) Update: FDA Authorizes Moderna and Pfizer-BioNTech Bivalent COVID-19 Vaccines for Use. JAMA. [Online]. [Accessed June 27, 2023]. Available from: <https://www.fda.gov/news-events/press-announcements/coronavirus-covid-19-update-fda-authorizes-moderna-pfizer-biontech-bivalent-covid-19-vaccines-use>
2. Klein et al. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). COVID-19 Vaccines Safety Monitoring - Rapid Cycle Analysis (RCA) Protocol. JAMA. [Online]. [Accessed June 27, 2023]. Available from: <https://www.cdc.gov/vaccinesafety/pdf/covid19-rca-protocol-1342-508.pdf>
3. Tom T. Shimabukuro, ACIP meeting 2.24.23 Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). (2023, February 24). COVID-19 Vaccine Safety Update: February 2023 [PDF slides]. Retrieved from <https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/acip/meetings/downloads/slides-2023-02/slides-02-24/COVID-02-Shimabukuro-508.pdf> [accessed 9.11.23]
4. Tom T. Shimabukuro, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). (2023, April 19). COVID-19 Vaccine Safety Update: April 2023 [PDF slides]. Retrieved from <https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/acip/meetings/downloads/slides-2023-04-19/03-COVID-Shimabukuro-508.pdf> [accessed 9.11.23]
5. Andrews N, Stowe J, Miller E, Ramsay M. BA.1 Bivalent COVID-19 Vaccine Use and Stroke in England. JAMA. 2023;330:184-5.
6. Clopper, C. J., Pearson ES. The use of confidence or fiducial limits illustrated in the case of the binomial. Biometrika 1934; 26:404-413.
7. COVID-19 Vaccination Tracker [Internet]. Atlanta, GA: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; [cited 2023 Jun 27]. Available from: https://covid.cdc.gov/covid-data-tracker/#vaccinations_vacc-people-booster-percent-pop5 [accessed 9.11.23]
8. Sharff KA, Dancoes DM, Longueil JL, Johnson ES, Lewis PF. Risk of myopericarditis following COVID-19 mRNA vaccination in a large integrated health system: A comparison of completeness and timeliness of two methods. Pharmacoepidemiol Drug Saf. 2022;31(8):921-925.

9. Greene SK, Kulldorf M, Yin R, et al, *Pharmacoepidemiology and Drug Safety*, 2011; 20: 583–590.
10. Detsky AS. Learning the art and science of diagnosis. *JAMA* 2022;327:1759-60.
11. Krist AH, Wolff TA, Jonas DE, et al. Update on the methods of the U.S. Preventive Services Task Force: Methods for understanding certainty and net benefit when making recommendations. *Am J Prev Med* 2018;54:S11-S18.