

1                    **Developmental pathways of physical aggression**

2                                    **from infancy to early school age**

3

4

5    Ane Nærde <sup>1\*</sup>, Harald Tage Janson<sup>1</sup>, Mike Stoolmiller<sup>1,2</sup>

6

7    <sup>1</sup>The Norwegian Center for Child Behavioral Development, Oslo, Norway

8    <sup>2</sup>Oregon Research Institute, Eugene, Oregon, USA

9    \*Corresponding author

10    E-mail: [ane.narde@nubu.no](mailto:ane.narde@nubu.no) (AN)

11

## 12 **Abstract**

13           This study identified latent trajectories of physical aggression from infancy to  
14 preschool age and tested for (a) early parent, parenting and child predictor effects on  
15 trajectory membership and (b) trajectory-effects net of parent, parenting, and child  
16 predictor effects on Grade 2 social, behavioral and academic functioning. We used data  
17 from the Behavior Outlook Norwegian Developmental Study (BONDS), comprising 1,159  
18 children (559 girls). Parents reported on risk and protective factors, and on physical  
19 aggression from 1 to 5 years; teachers reported on Grade 2 outcomes. We employed latent  
20 class growth curve analyses to identify nine aggression trajectories. In fully adjusted models  
21 testing simultaneously all associations among predictors, trajectories, and outcomes,  
22 maternal and paternal harsh parenting, child gender, and sibling presence predicted  
23 trajectory membership, which significantly predicted Grade 2 externalizing. Child gender  
24 had a pervasive influence on all outcomes as well as on trajectory membership. This is the  
25 first trajectory study that attempts to sort out which predictors are most proximal, more  
26 distal, or just confounded, with their relative direct effect sizes, and to link early paternal as  
27 well as maternal harsh parenting with children’s development of physical aggression from  
28 infancy to preschool age. Our findings underscore the need to include fathers in  
29 developmental research and early prevention and intervention efforts.

30

## 31 Introduction

32 In this study, we take a deep dive into the developmental patterns of physical  
33 aggression during early childhood and explore how these longitudinal patterns influence  
34 children's social, behavioral and academic functioning in school age when simultaneously  
35 considering early individual and contextual risk and protective factors. During the past few  
36 decades, it has become increasingly evident that children's use of physical aggression is  
37 predictable, normative, and close to ubiquitous during certain developmental periods.  
38 Indeed, behaviors such as kicking, hitting, and pushing have their origins in early childhood  
39 and serve developmentally salient and adaptive functions. At the same time, physical  
40 aggression may be highly problematic and is in fact considered as the most serious and  
41 socially unacceptable form of aggression, being ontogenetically antecedent to less "serious"  
42 forms such as verbal aggression or indirect aggression [1].

43 The systematic study of how physical aggression develops already from early  
44 childhood onwards is still recent [2], as most existing research focuses on aggression  
45 beginning in toddlerhood or preschool age [but see e.g., 3, 4]. Still, theoretical and empirical  
46 research efforts together with advances in quantitative theory and practice have moved the  
47 field forward. In short, there is compelling evidence that: (a) children start to physically  
48 aggress at an early age [5-7]; (b) such behavior typically peaks around 2-3 years of age  
49 followed by a steep decline [3, 8-10]; and (c) a small proportion of children, more often boys,  
50 maintain a high and stable frequency of physical aggression during middle childhood that is  
51 associated with a range of negative outcomes [11-17]. Yet, existing longitudinal research is  
52 limited by mainly starting out from the second year of life, comprising relatively few  
53 observations of aggressive behavior, relying solely on assessments from mothers, and

54 primarily *about* mothers, and not testing simultaneously all associations among predictors,  
55 trajectories, and outcomes. We add to the existing literature by identifying trajectories of  
56 physical aggression from infancy to preschool age (i.e., 1 to 5 years) in a large population-  
57 based sample using data from multiple informants and examining social, behavioral and  
58 academic adjustment in second grade as a function of these trajectories as well as of  
59 empirically driven early predictors. Following previous research [7, 18], we use the term  
60 physical aggression to denote physical acts directed against others in the form of observable  
61 child behaviors such as kicking and hitting, without any consideration of intentionality.

## 62 **Developmental trajectories of physical aggression across early** 63 **childhood**

64 In a seminal paper at the turn of the century, Tremblay [1] reviewed the state of  
65 knowledge regarding the origins of aggressive behavior and highlighted the need to focus on  
66 the first few years of development if we are to understand physical aggression and prevent  
67 chronic cases. He argued that infants' physical aggression typically had not been deemed  
68 developmentally significant and stated that "the exciting work that needs to be done is to  
69 study the developmental trajectories of these aggressive behaviors at the intra-individual  
70 level during infancy and toddlerhood, and their relationship with later development" [1, p.  
71 134]. Some twenty years later, this task seems well underway, with published results from  
72 several longitudinal studies mapping the development of aggression utilizing state-of-the-  
73 art analytic techniques. Among other things, empirical evidence shows that there is  
74 heterogeneity in the early development of physical aggression [2, 13, 14, 17, 19-21]. In the  
75 following, we provide an overview of research applying a developmental trajectory  
76 approach, that is, the identification of prototypic subgroup curves that represent different

77 developmental patterns of aggression [e.g., 16]. We focus on summarizing key results from  
78 large-scale longitudinal studies specifically exploring developmental pathways of physical  
79 aggression starting in toddlerhood, which is in accord with the focus of the current study.

80 Research addressing the course of aggression has found varying numbers of  
81 developmental trajectories. This is likely related to sample variations like age range, size,  
82 and risk factor composition, the number of repeated assessments and variation in the  
83 targeted constructs that measurements are able to capture, as well as model specification  
84 and model selection criteria [8, 22]. Several studies focusing on the course of physical  
85 aggression through early childhood have identified either 3 [8, 10, 17, 20], 4 [19, 23-27], or 5  
86 trajectories of aggression [13, 21]. Some have also reported differing numbers of trajectory  
87 groups for girls and boys (i.e., 3 for girls and 5 for boys [2]. Results from two studies [13, 21]  
88 utilizing a sample of over 1,100 children identified 5 distinct aggression trajectories from age  
89 2 through 9 years including a "very low" group characterized by low frequency in early  
90 childhood followed by a rapid decline (~45% of the sample), a "low-aggression" group  
91 (~25%), also quite low in aggression throughout, although higher than the lowest group, a  
92 "moderate-decline" group, showing a marked decline over time (~12%), a "moderate" group  
93 being moderately stable, albeit slightly declining (~15%), and a "high" group showing the  
94 highest level of aggression (~3%).

95 There are several similarities across findings. Groups of children who display high  
96 physical aggression at young ages tend to continue to display high aggression over time.  
97 Moreover, studies have typically identified at least one trajectory group showing low levels  
98 of aggression across time, as well as one characterized by a high and stable level. Whereas  
99 several, but not all, studies have identified trajectories characterized by declining physical  
100 aggression [21, 24, 27], no late onset high physical aggression groups tend to be identified.

101            Given empirical evidence that children start to physically aggress already at 6 to 8  
102 months of age [5, 6], it is noteworthy that only a small minority of longitudinal studies  
103 addressing developmental trajectories of aggression have started out before the second  
104 year of life. Urges for researchers conducting longitudinal developmental research to start  
105 up in early childhood and conduct multiple observations across a host of data sources have  
106 been expressed, including by Jennings and Reingle [22] in their comprehensive meta-review  
107 of latent group-based trajectories of violence, aggression, and delinquency across the life  
108 span. Examples of longitudinal studies starting out this early include the Quebec  
109 Longitudinal Study of Child Development [QLSCD; see e.g., 2, 20, 28], the National  
110 Longitudinal Survey of Children and Youth in Canada [NLSCY; see e.g., 19], the NICHD Study  
111 of Early Child Care and Youth Development in the US [SECCYD; see e.g., 14, 21], and studies  
112 by Lorber et al., [4, 7] and Tremblay et al. [10]. Finally, it should be mentioned that despite  
113 the call from Tremblay [1] for longitudinal studies to include repeated measurements of  
114 aggressive behavior at least every two to three months from birth to 36 months, and ideally  
115 every 6 months from 36 months onward, existing evidence is typically based on data  
116 collected about yearly [2, 3, 27], every other year [8, 19], or a mix (17, 21). [But see e.g., 4, 7,  
117 29].

## 118 **Predictors of physical aggression trajectories**

119            One implicit assumption when identifying population heterogeneity is that groups of  
120 children exhibiting atypical developmental patterns have specific risk characteristics [2, 8,  
121 21]. Considerable efforts have thus been devoted to identifying early predictors of trajectory  
122 group membership. Results from twin research [30, 31] suggest that individual differences in  
123 the frequency of physical aggression may be substantially driven by genetically based

124 factors, and recent evidence [32, 33] indicate that epigenetic mechanisms could be involved  
125 in the development of chronic aggression, highlighting the need to identify early bio-psycho-  
126 social mechanisms [33, 34]. Longitudinal patterns of aggression have also been linked to  
127 several environmental predictors (including gene-environment correlations), comprising *risk*  
128 as well as *protective* factors. Protective factors contribute to positive outcomes especially in  
129 the context of increased risk, but also regardless of risk level (the latter is sometimes  
130 distinguished as *promotive* factors; a distinction which is meaningful but empirically not so  
131 clear-cut [see e.g., 21, 35]. These risk and protective factors fit within Bronfenbrenner's [36]  
132 socio-ecological model addressing the ecology of human development. In line with this,  
133 Labella and Mason [37] recently discussed the most salient family-based risk and protective  
134 factors for the development of aggression and violence including those relating to children's  
135 proximal developmental contexts, which can be grouped into *parent/family factors* (i.e.,  
136 sociodemographic risk, parental psychopathology), *parenting factors* (i.e., parenting style),  
137 and *child factors* (i.e., gender, temperament).

### 138 ***Parent/family factors***

139 Sociodemographic risk and parental psychopathology represent two of the strongest  
140 and most persistent predictors of multiple types of child maladjustment, including  
141 physical aggression [37- 40]. For instance, results from the SECCYD NICHD ECCRN [21]  
142 indicated that family poverty, low maternal education, and single parenthood predicted  
143 higher and more stable maternal reported physical aggression trajectories among more  
144 than 1,100 children from 2 years to third grade. Relatedly, Côté et al. explored maternal  
145 reported trajectories of physical aggression from 2 to 8 years [19] and from 2 to 11 years [8]  
146 among 1,183 children participating in the NLSCY and found that those in the high aggression  
147 group were more likely than the ones following lower aggression groups to come from low-

148 income families, with mothers who had not completed high school. Similar findings were  
149 also reported by Tremblay et al. [10] in that low income, early maternal childbearing,  
150 smoking during pregnancy, the presence of similarly aged siblings, maternal antisocial  
151 behavior in high school, and family dysfunction predicted the high aggression group at ages  
152 17, 30, and 42 months among 572 Canadian families. Finally, Teymoori et al. [2] addressed  
153 predictors of maternal reported physical aggression trajectories separately for boys and girls  
154 among 2,223 Canadian children participating in the QLSCD from 1.5 to 13 years of age. The  
155 girls in the high trajectory group were significantly different from those in the low on 9 out  
156 of 12 family risk factors, including parent's education, depression, and antisocial behavior in  
157 adolescence, household income, socioeconomic status, and number of siblings at birth and  
158 at 17 months. The boys in the highest group furthermore had parents with lower education  
159 and socioeconomic status, higher depression, and mothers who were younger at first  
160 childbirth. According to the much-studied family stress model [41-44], poverty and financial  
161 instability undermine parents' psychological well-being and lead to persistently elevated  
162 levels of stress, which in turn predict their parenting practices and subsequent child  
163 functioning.

164       Having siblings (younger or older) furthermore constitutes a major risk factor for  
165 aggressive behavior [45-50]. Siblings represent easily accessible targets for and sources of  
166 aggression, and physical aggression amongst siblings is the most prevalent, albeit often  
167 overlooked form of family violence, for which the lack of a comprehensive theory has long  
168 been noted [51, 52]. Relevant theoretical perspectives mainly include family systems theory,  
169 evolutionary psychology, and social learning theories (49-52). For instance, Patterson [49, 50]  
170 suggested a sibling-training hypothesis wherein coercive sibling interactions set the stage  
171 for the development and escalation of aggressive behavior through direct practice,



172 modeling, and reinforcement. In accord with Patterson’s coercion theory [53], parental  
173 reactions and handling of their children’s conflicts and aggressive behaviors further  
174 contribute to exacerbate or diminish such sibling behavior [48].

### 175 ***Parenting factors***

176         There is much evidence to support that parenting style is predictive of children’s  
177 externalizing behavior. For example, results from the SECCYD NICHD ECCRN [21] indicated  
178 that less sensitive and involved maternal parenting predicted higher and more stable  
179 aggression trajectories from 2 years to third grade. Moreover, Tremblay et al. [10] found  
180 that maternal coercive parenting behavior predicted membership in the high aggression  
181 group from 17 to 42 months, which was also reported by Côté et al. [19] across 2 to 8 years.  
182 Among the most well-established theories of development of aggression and externalizing  
183 problem behavior is Patterson’s [53] coercion theory, wherein child externalizing develops  
184 from transactional reinforcement processes between the child and important others in the  
185 early developmental period. Parenting behaviors characterized by lack of skills, warmth and  
186 positive affect in a discipline encounter can lead the child to react with (even more) negative  
187 and challenging behaviors, which may make the parents feel overwhelmed and frustrated  
188 and possibly giving in to the child just to restore peace. This parental negative  
189 reinforcement for child acting out behavior is what perpetuates an adverse parent-child  
190 cycle [53, 54]. Such suboptimal parenting behaviors are typically associated with parental  
191 psychopathology and depression (in research mainly focusing on mothers; [55-56] but see  
192 also Cheung and Theule [57]), which illustrates how these risk factors tend to appear and  
193 operate in tandem.

194         The recurring failure to integrate fathers into empirical research addressing child  
195 development in general, and development of physical aggression in particular (although see

196 a recent exception by Yang et al. [58]), is serious and unfortunate as it might bring about  
197 erroneous conclusions, such as misattributing influences of fathers to mothers or leaving  
198 important sources of variation unexplained. Cabrera et al. [59] and Cabrera [60] recently  
199 discussed the puzzling fact that fathers are still mostly absent from parenting research,  
200 despite strong suggestions that traditional mother-focused models of developmental  
201 influences are outdated. Father involvement is particularly high in societies where this is  
202 facilitated by social policies [61]. In Norway, both parents have the right to a lengthy paid  
203 leave in connection with childbirth, of which a particular quota (6 weeks in 2006, when the  
204 current sample was recruited) is reserved for the father. Indeed, Norwegian fathers started  
205 spending significantly more time with their children following the introduction of this quota  
206 [62], and time-use data show that they tend to be highly involved in caregiving [63],  
207 providing a unique opportunity to assess the importance of factors relating to mothers and  
208 fathers alike (e.g., parenting behavior and psychopathology) for the development of  
209 aggression. Finally, the dearth of research examining paternal sensitivity in conjunction with  
210 maternal within developmental psychopathology more generally was highlighted in a recent  
211 meta-analytic review [64] addressing (observed) paternal sensitivity and children's cognitive  
212 and socioemotional outcomes.

### 213 ***Child factors***

214 It is well established that boys use direct forms of aggression (i.e., physical or verbal)  
215 more often than girls. In line with this, Côté et al. [19] reported that children in the high  
216 aggression trajectory group from 2 to 8 years (amongst other things) were more likely to be  
217 boys. Researchers has frequently addressed various aspects of these gender differences,  
218 including *when* they emerge, the *types* of aggressive behaviors boys and girls generally  
219 engage in, and *alternative hypotheses* for such differences [5, 19, 23, 65-67]. Empirical

220 evidence suggests that boys and girls use physical force against others (e.g., pulling peoples  
221 hair, hitting, biting) at similar rates in infancy and early toddlerhood [5, 66, 68], whereas  
222 boys show significantly more physical aggression in the next few years [3, 5, 25, 69].  
223 According to Hay [5], no single factor explains the widening gender gap, but rather a  
224 developmental cascade of biological and social factors. One important contribution of  
225 trajectory- or group-based approaches is the finding that emerging gender differences  
226 primarily may be accounted for by more boys than girls making up the small group of  
227 children who continue to deploy aggression at high rates [11].

228 Finally, the contribution of child temperament to the early development of  
229 externalizing problem behaviors is well documented, including high negative emotionality,  
230 activity level and reactivity, along with low effortful control, inadaptability, persistence, and  
231 negative mood - sometimes subsumed under the broad construct difficult temperament [5,  
232 25, 29, 70, 71]. Several theoretical models (see Slagt et al. [72] for overview) postulate  
233 individual differences among children in their general susceptibility to parenting and  
234 environmental influences based on their temperamental characteristics. A meta-analysis [72]  
235 on parenting-by-temperament interactions reported partly support for Belsky's [73]  
236 differential susceptibility hypothesis wherein young children with difficult temperament are  
237 more likely to develop externalizing problems in the presence of negative parenting  
238 compared with those having an easier temperament [47, 70, 74-76].

## 239 **Outcomes of physical aggression trajectories**

240 A key question when mapping the developmental course of aggression across early  
241 childhood is the degree to which the trajectories predict subsequent behavior and  
242 adjustment, and whether moderate versus elevated levels of aggression predict different

243 patterns of outcomes [12, 13, 65, 76, 77]. Much research exploring outcomes of aggression  
244 trajectories has focused on more serious delinquency and antisocial behavior in adolescence  
245 and emerging adulthood [12, 15, 16, 78, 79], as well as in adulthood [80-82], whereas less  
246 has addressed a broader range of social and academic outcomes that may also confer risk  
247 [but see e.g., 13, 17, 21, 24, 83]. Results from two studies using data from the SECCYD [13,  
248 21] show that both level and stability of aggression from age 2 to 9 predict middle childhood  
249 academic achievement and social functioning at home, school, and in the peer group. In the  
250 first study [21], the five identified trajectories were compared on age 9 measures of  
251 academic competence and cognitive functioning, teacher reported behavior problems and  
252 social competence, self-reported peer relationships, friendships, and hostile attribution  
253 biases, observed behavior in school, and mother-reported discipline and mother-child  
254 conflict. Relatedly, in a second study, Campbell et al. [13] explored age 9 to 12 adjustment  
255 (i.e., teacher reported behavior problems, social competence, and academic achievement,  
256 child self-reported peer relations, depression, and risk taking, observed classroom behavior  
257 and friendship interaction) as a function of the same 5 trajectories. Overall, the results  
258 indicated that outcomes varied by trajectory group. As expected, children in the high- and  
259 moderate-stable groups showed continuing behavioral and social problems relative to those  
260 very low in aggression; the high-stable group evidenced signs of significant antisocial  
261 behavior, whereas the moderate-stable showed symptoms of ADHD and more minor peer  
262 problems [13, 21]. The researchers suggested that the two groups seemed to be on  
263 different developmental pathways. Moreover, children in the moderate decreasing group  
264 displaying transient and age-related aggression that disappeared before school age, showed  
265 good adjustment both at age 9 [21], and across the transition to adolescence [13]. A more  
266 surprising finding was the differences between the two low aggression groups (i.e., low-

267 stable, and very-low), given that the aggression in the low-stable group initially seemed  
268 trivial. Still, relative to the very-low group, children in the low-stable group had elevated  
269 scores on several measures of internalizing and externalizing problems and poor social skills  
270 in elementary school [13]. Consequently, moderate, or low-level physical aggression that  
271 persists from toddlerhood through school entry may signal that adjustment problems will  
272 continue or emerge by middle childhood, albeit not at the level of the high-stable trajectory  
273 group.

## 274 **The present study**

275 In the present study, we extend previous research by scrutinizing developmental  
276 pathways of physical aggression spanning the age range during which it emerges among  
277 most children, when it is particularly prevalent and viewed as normative, as well as the  
278 period when such behavior usually declines. The study follows up on previous work [9]  
279 utilizing the same sample, which addressed the developmental course of physical aggression  
280 from infancy to age 2 applying growth curve modeling rather than a developmental  
281 trajectory approach and comprising early predictors but no outcomes. We include a  
282 comprehensive set of 20 early predictors and several school-age outcomes, enabling us to  
283 disentangle the relative importance of children's longitudinal patterns of physical aggression  
284 for their subsequent social, behavioral, and academic functioning, while simultaneously  
285 considering the direct and indirect impact of early risk and protective factors. As far as we  
286 know, this is the first study to examine trajectories of physical aggression across the  
287 developmental period from 1 year until pre-school age including frequent parental reports  
288 of child aggression (up to 21 reports with 90% of the sample having at least ten) and to test  
289 in the same model the effects of a comprehensive set of early risk and protective factors on

290 trajectory membership, as well as those of trajectory membership on teacher-reported  
291 school-age outcomes net of early predictors. In contrast, most prior research has either  
292 focused on effects of precursors on trajectories, or of trajectories on outcomes, or has  
293 included a somewhat restricted set of covariates. Finally, we take advantage of very recent  
294 advances in statistical methods for trajectory analysis, so called 3-step procedures [84], that  
295 were not available for many prior studies, when incorporating multiple predictors and  
296 multiple outcomes in the trajectory model to obtain the best possible estimates of both  
297 effect sizes and their associated standard errors.

## 298 **Research issues**

299 We employed state-of-the-art analytic techniques to:

- 300 1. Model trajectories of physical aggression from infancy (i.e., 1 year) to preschool age (i.e.,  
301 5 years);
- 302 2. Predict aggression-trajectory membership from empirically driven parent, parenting,  
303 and child predictors measured at child age 0.5 or 1 year both unadjusted and adjusted  
304 for all other predictors; and
- 305 3. Predict children's teacher-rated Grade 2 adjustment (externalizing and internalizing,  
306 social skills, and academic competence) as a function of aggression-trajectory  
307 membership as well as the early predictors, both unadjusted and adjusted for all other  
308 predictors and for trajectory membership.

## 309 **Materials and methods**

### 310 **Sample and procedures**

311 We utilized data from the Behavior Outlook Norwegian Developmental Study  
312 (BONDS), a population-based longitudinal study of 1,159 children (559 girls and 600 boys)

313 from five municipalities in southeast Norway conducted by the Norwegian Center for Child  
314 Behavioral Development. The BONDS is approved by the Regional Committee for Medical  
315 and Health Research Ethics and the Norwegian Social Sciences Data Services (approval  
316 numbers S-06067; 2009/224a), and all parents provided informed written consent.  
317 Participants were recruited from September 13, 2006 until December 31, 2008 by nurses at  
318 the 5-month visit at child health clinics, which are attended almost universally. Inclusion  
319 criteria were the child being of the appropriate age and one parent being able to participate  
320 without an interpreter. Families of 1,931 eligible children were informed about the project.  
321 Of the 1,465 (76%) who agreed to be contacted, 1,159 (79%, or 60% of the eligible group)  
322 opted to participate. The sample was fairly representative of the general population,  
323 however, somewhat biased toward mothers with higher education, fewer immigrant  
324 parents, more firstborns, and fewer single mothers [85]. Personal interviews, which  
325 included a computerized questionnaire, were conducted when children were aged 6 months,  
326 1, 2, 3, and 4 years, and in the child's first school year. Whereas both parents were invited  
327 to participate in the first interview, fathers were primarily targeted in the 1- and 3-year  
328 waves, and mothers in the 2- and 4-year waves. At 1, 2, and 3 years, the assessment  
329 included videotaped structured parent-child interaction tasks, in which more fathers thus  
330 participated at ages 1 and 3 years, and more mothers at age 2. The parental interviews  
331 (including the interaction tasks) were conducted by trained assistants in local offices (or in  
332 the home setting if parents preferred). At two occasions (i.e., 5 years as well as in the child's  
333 second school year), lengthier telephone interviews including many of the study's variables  
334 were conducted instead of a personal interview. In addition to the yearly main data  
335 collections, brief telephone interviews comprising a small selection of items relevant to the  
336 study's key outcomes were conducted at about 8 months, 10 months, 1 year and 3 months,

337 1 year and 6 months, 1 year and 9 months, 2 years and 4 months, 2 years and 8 months, and  
338 3½ years. Brief telephone interviews were also added 2 and 1 months prior to and 1-, 2-,  
339 and 3-months following entry into center-based childcare when the child’s date of entry was  
340 known to the project and these ages were not covered by another interview. At age four,  
341 which was the endpoint for the original participation consent, 1,121 children (96.7%)  
342 remained in the study. Parents of 1,027 children (88.6%) renewed their informed written  
343 consent for participation in a continuation of the study until second grade. At the Grade 2  
344 data collection, 996 children (85.9% of the original sample) remained in the study. Teachers  
345 of 901 children contributed reports on the child in Grade 2.

## 346 **Child physical aggression measure**

347 Our measurement design for physical aggression included repeated measurements  
348 per child across time and as many items on physical aggression as thought to be relevant  
349 and feasible at each wave of data collection. Thus, from 10 months onward, each  
350 questionnaire (i.e., at 1, 2, 3, and 4 years in the current dataset) and each telephone  
351 interview (i.e., in the current dataset including 7 target ages from 1 year and 3 months up to  
352 5 years, and in addition prior to and after entry into center-based childcare as described  
353 above) included 2 to 9 items on child physical aggression. We used an original instrument  
354 developed for the BONDS, with idiomatic wordings and a selection of items widely  
355 acceptable to parents of small children, including exclusively physical behavior directed at  
356 others covering also the lower range of intensity (Supporting information A). In telephone  
357 interviews, respondents were asked if the behavior was true now or in the past two weeks,  
358 with a dichotomous (*yes/no*) response format. In the questionnaire format, respondents  
359 were asked how often the child engaged in the behavior, with responses given on a seven-



360 point frequency scale ranging from 1 (*never/not in the past year*) to 7 (*three times daily or*  
361 *more*). The present set of analyses used physical aggression data starting with the 1-year  
362 interview and including up to the 5-year telephone interview. The number of regularly  
363 scheduled interviews from 1 to 5 years was eleven; a smaller number of interviews occurred  
364 when families discontinued participation or declined to participate in specific interviews; a  
365 greater number of interviews occurred when additional telephone interviews were added  
366 prior to and after entry in center-based day care, and when both father and mother  
367 contributed with an interview at the same age. Reports on 1,141 children were available.  
368 Table 1 shows item inclusion and frequencies for telephone interviews from around 1 year 3  
369 months to around 5 years, as well as for the 1- to 4-year questionnaires. The number of  
370 reports per child ranged from one (7 cases) to 21 (1 case) with a mean of 12.0 ( $SD=2.5$ ), with  
371 90% having at least ten reports and 43% having at least thirteen. In total, 26% of the reports  
372 were by fathers.  
373

374 Table 1. Item inclusion and frequencies for telephone interviews from around 15 to around 60 months and 1- to 4-year questionnaires.

	Telephone-interview responses (% Yes for past two weeks)							Questionnaire responses ( <i>M</i> [ <i>SD</i> ] for frequency) <sup>a</sup>			
	15	18	21	28	32	42	60	12	24	36	48
Target age (months)	14-16 <sup>b</sup>	17-19 <sup>b</sup>	20-22 <sup>b</sup>	27-29 <sup>b</sup>	31-33 <sup>b</sup>	41-44 <sup>b</sup>	59-61 <sup>b</sup>	10-15 <sup>c</sup>	22-29 <sup>c</sup>	34-39 <sup>c</sup>	46-51 <sup>c</sup>
Hits you	44 %	59 %	60 %	63 %	56 %	41 %	27 %	1.8 (0.8)	2.2 (0.6)	2.0 (0.5)	1.8 (0.6)
Hits siblings <sup>d</sup>	37 %	57 %	62 %	66 %	61 %	50 %	53 %	1.7 (0.7)	2.3 (0.7)	2.1 (0.7)	2.0 (0.6)
Hits other adults	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	--	1.7 (0.6)	--	--
Pushes someone to get his/her will	38 %	48 %	54 %	59 %	54 %	44 %	32 %	1.6 (0.7)	2.1 (0.7)	2.0 (0.6)	1.9 (0.6)
Pulls someone's hair	--	-- <sup>e</sup>	-- <sup>e</sup>	19 %	17 %	7 %	4 %	--	1.6 (0.7)	1.4 (0.6)	1.3 (0.5)
Pinches someone	--	--	--	--	--	--	14 %	--	1.6 (0.7)	1.5 (0.6)	1.4 (0.5)
Throws things at others	-- <sup>e</sup>	31 %	37 %	35 %	34 %	23 %	18 %	--	1.9 (0.7)	1.8 (0.5)	1.6 (0.5)
Bites someone <sup>f</sup>	-- <sup>f</sup>	29 %	25 %	19 %	15 %	6 %	--	-- <sup>f</sup>	1.6 (0.6)	1.4 (0.5)	1.2 (0.4)
Kicks someone	-- <sup>e</sup>	8 %	10 %	17 %	18 %	18 %	18 %	--	1.4 (0.5)	1.5 (0.5)	1.5 (0.6)
N responses <sup>e</sup>	1603	1391	1211	1127	1098	1034	919	1215	1141	1091	1127

It is made available under a [CC-BY 4.0 International license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

	Telephone-interview responses (% Yes for past two weeks)							Questionnaire responses ( <i>M</i> [ <i>SD</i> ] for frequency) <sup>a</sup>			
	15	18	21	28	32	42	60	12	24	36	48
Target age (months)											
Age range (months)	14-16 <sup>b</sup>	17-19 <sup>b</sup>	20-22 <sup>b</sup>	27-29 <sup>b</sup>	31-33 <sup>b</sup>	41-44 <sup>b</sup>	59-61 <sup>b</sup>	10-15 <sup>c</sup>	22-29 <sup>c</sup>	34-39 <sup>c</sup>	46-51 <sup>c</sup>
<b>Father responses</b>	23 %	21 %	22 %	23 %	19 %	18 %	7 %	69 %	8 %	70 %	9 %
<b>N children</b>	1096	1086	1068	1057	1058	1015	880	1101	1075	1024	1059

375 <sup>a</sup> Means and standard deviations are based on the reduced 4-point frequency scale: 1 (never/not in the past year), 2 (on single occasions/1-3 times per  
376 month/once per week), 3 (2-3 times per week/1-2 times per day), and 4 (3 times per day or more). <sup>b</sup>Children’s age in whole months, i.e., from -1.0 to +2.0  
377 months from target age. Mostly due to telephone interviews around entry in center-based childcare, there were 716 (7.9%) telephone-interview responses  
378 from 526 different children outside of these age ranges; while those responses were included in the data set, percentages tabulated here include only  
379 responses within the indicated age ranges. <sup>c</sup>Age range in whole months for all questionnaire responses. <sup>d</sup>Administered only to children with a similar-aged  
380 sibling in the family (who ranged from 39% at age 1 to 82% at age 5). <sup>e</sup>According to study design, this question should not have been included at this age.  
381 However, due to interviewer choice, the data set included 10 or fewer responses for this age; a percentage out of this small number is not tabulated here.  
382 <sup>f</sup>Excluding during breastfeeding. Data prior to 18 months excluded. <sup>g</sup>Multiple telephone-interviews responses per child up to 42 months occurred as a result  
383 of frequent interviews around center-based day care entry. Two questionnaire responses per child, or two 60-month telephone interviews, occurred when  
384 both parents participated in the yearly parental interview.

385 We employed Rasch scaling [86] to equate response formats, link response patterns  
386 with varying sets of completed items, and address measurement invariance. The following is  
387 a summary; a fuller account is given in Supporting information B. We first performed Rasch  
388 scaling in two calibration subsamples – one of questionnaire responses, and one of  
389 telephone-interview responses – each consisting of responses covering the age span  
390 sampled such that each child contributed only one response. Rasch rating scale analyses  
391 suggested that a reduction of the scale from seven to four categories (1 [*never/not in the*  
392 *past year*], 2 [*on single occasions/1-3 times per month/once per week*], 3 [*2-3 times per*  
393 *week/1-2 times per day*], and 4 [*three times daily or more*]) gave a more optimally  
394 functioning rating scale. There was almost perfect correlation ( $r=.986$ ) between item scale  
395 value estimates from questionnaires and the corresponding estimates from telephone  
396 interviews. In both calibration subsamples, we tested and found reasonable measurement  
397 invariance of the Rasch model with respect to item scale value estimates for respondent  
398 (mother vs. father) and child gender (boy vs. girl) by means of Rasch-model differential item  
399 functioning (DIF) analyses. For child age, six items' scale values were allowed to vary as a  
400 function of age based on the DIF analyses in the calibration subsamples and further analyses  
401 of item displacement in eleven age-specific subsamples. The arbitrary average difference in  
402 person locations that was a result of the two data types (questionnaire vs. telephone  
403 interview) was addressed by adding a constant of about 2 to questionnaire data. We  
404 obtained person location estimates for all measurements in the sample according to the  
405 estimation procedure presented by Linacre [87].

406 In the final data set after recoding of extreme values and equivalating for forms, the  
407 13,673 person location estimates from the Rasch analyses that we used as our physical  
408 aggression measurements ranged from -5.30 to 5.02 with a mean of -1.86 and standard

409 deviation of 1.87 (variance 3.49; skewness 0.28; kurtosis -0.23). The estimates of the  
410 measures' standard error averaged 1.22, and the average squared standard error estimate  
411 was 1.67. Thus, Rasch-model based person reliability estimated in the entire sample by  
412 means of these terms equaled .52, suggesting modest overall reliability of an individual  
413 measurement. On the other hand, from a standard (i.e., 1-class) growth model  
414 parameterized the same way as our latent class growth models (4th order polynomial  
415 trajectories, see below), the average reliability of the child level aggression was estimated  
416 at .88 at age 2.2 years, the growth curve intercept (.82 at 1.2 years; .81 at 4.4 years), and the  
417 growth curves accounted for about 55 percent of the total outcome variance. Thus,  
418 although an individual aggression measurement at one point in time has only modest  
419 reliability, sets of repeated aggression measurements over time are substantially more  
420 reliable and suitable for growth curve or latent class growth curve analysis.

421         The average time-to-time correlation of physical aggression measurements for 2- to  
422 12-month intervals between study design target ages was .46. A simple, non-parametric  
423 regression (Loess) plot of the repeated measures of physical aggression vs child age is  
424 shown in Figure 1. The developmental trend shows a rapid increase from 10 months to a  
425 peak at about 2 years and 2 months, and a slower decrease thereafter.

426

427 **Fig 1. Loess plot of average child physical aggression by child age**

428

429 **Predictor measures**

430 **Parent/family measures**

431           **Parental education and age.** Information about parental age, education, and family  
432 composition was obtained from the interviews at child ages 6 months and 1 year. Parental  
433 age at child age 6 months was dichotomized into 1 (young, i.e.,  $\leq 25$  years) and 0 (not young).  
434 Mothers and fathers reported on their educational level in six categories: 1 (*9-year*  
435 *elementary school or shorter*), 2 (*1-2 years of high school*), 3 (*Higher vocational*), 4 (*3 years*  
436 *of high school, upper secondary school*), 5 (*College, university up to 4 years [Bachelor, Nurse,*  
437 *Teacher, Engineer]*), or 6 (*University, college, more than 4 years [Master's degree]*). The  
438 reports were recoded to represent the total years of education, the six categories taken to  
439 represent 9, 10.5, 12, 12, 15.5, and 18 years of education, respectively.

440           **Family composition.** Single parent status, from child age 1 year if a report existed,  
441 and from 6 months otherwise, was coded 1 and not being single was coded 0.

442           **Financial stress.** Parents' reports at child age 1 year of having more long-standing  
443 financial difficulties in the past year (rent, mortgage, obligations, etc.) We obtained reports  
444 from at least one parent for 1096 children, coded 1 if at least one parent reported the  
445 presence of such difficulties, and 0 otherwise.

446           **Couple relationship.** We used mothers' questionnaire reports at child age 6 months  
447 of the relationship between her and her husband/partner on a shortened and modified 10-  
448 item version of the Relationship satisfaction scale [88], answered on a 6-point Likert scale  
449 from 1 (*very much agree*) to 6 (*very much disagree*). Cronbach's alpha was .90 for 1084  
450 mothers.

451           **Parental depression and anxiety.** A 12-item version of the Hopkins Symptom Check  
452 List [89] from the 6-month interview was used as a measure of symptoms of depression and  
453 anxiety. The 12 items are a subset of those in the 25-item version, a widely used self-report  
454 symptom inventory tapping the most common forms of psychopathology in non-psychiatric

455 populations (i.e., anxiety and depression; [90]). The response format is a Likert-type scale  
456 from 1 (*not at all*) to 4 (*extremely*). We computed a mean score of the 12 items. Cronbach's  
457 alpha was .88 for 1130 mothers and .87 for 677 fathers who contributed reports.

## 458 **Parenting predictor measures**

459 **Parent sensitivity.** Parent sensitivity was measured based on ratings of videotaped  
460 parent-child structured interaction tasks at age 1 year. Fathers were the primarily targeted  
461 participants at this age, and more fathers took part in the assessment than mothers, but  
462 when fathers were not able or willing to come, the mother took part instead. We thus  
463 obtained videotapes of father-child interaction for the greater part of the sample, but for  
464 mother-child interaction for a smaller part. The interaction tasks were selected based on  
465 their capacity to elicit parent and child behaviors associated with subsequent child  
466 adjustment [91, 92] following literature reviews and discussions with international experts.  
467 The tasks strived at being gender non-stereotypic and included *free-play*, where parents  
468 were asked to play with their child as they liked with a provided set of toys (4 min.); *clean up*,  
469 where parents were asked to put the toys away and told that the child could help but was  
470 not required to (2 min.); *structured play*, where two sets of toys were presented, a shape  
471 sorter box and a set of stacking rings (selected to be too difficult for most 1-year-olds to  
472 manage on their own), and parents were asked to help the child as much as they thought  
473 necessary with one toy at a time (2 × 3 min.; the assistant informed the dyad when it was  
474 time to switch toys). They were also told that there was no need to complete the tasks (e.g.,  
475 put all stacking rings in the correct order). Prior to the observations, parents were informed  
476 that they could choose to discontinue the tasks at any time.

477 We used the mean of three global ratings - Sensitivity/responsiveness, Detachment/  
478 disengagement (reversed), and Positive regard for the child – from the Norwegian

479 adaptation of the Qualitative Ratings for Parent Child Interaction at 3-15 Months in the  
480 NICHD SECCYD study [93, 94] to form a composite index of parent sensitivity. The mean was  
481 aggregated across two separately rated interaction segments, one being free-play and clean  
482 up, and the other structured play. Each variable was rated on a Likert-type scale of 1 to 5 by  
483 trained judges; interrater reliability (single rating, absolute agreement, two-way, random  
484 intraclass correlation) ranged from .65 to .74 in the full set of all rating variables [94]. The  
485 average was computed if at least three out of six ratings were present, which occurred in  
486 717 fathers and 244 mothers. Internal consistency (alpha) for the composite was .88 for  
487 fathers and .86 for mothers in 708 fathers and 242 mothers with complete sets of six ratings.

488 **Harsh and positive parenting.** Those mothers and fathers who took part in the 1-  
489 year assessment contributed self-reports of parenting practices on a subset of items of the  
490 Parenting scale from the Fast Track Project adapted from the Parental Discipline Scale and  
491 Parent Praise scales from the Pittsburgh Youth Study [95, 96]. For the same reasons as for  
492 parent sensitivity, these self-reports were obtained for a larger proportion of fathers and a  
493 smaller proportion of mothers. Items were answered on a frequency scale from 1 (*never*) to  
494 5 (*almost always*). We used the mean of three items on parent positive behavior (giving the  
495 child a smile, saying something nice about the child to the child, and giving the child a hug,  
496 pat on the back, or a kiss) in response to desirable child behavior as the measure of positive  
497 parenting practices. We used the mean of two parent negative items (yelling or screaming  
498 and slapping or hitting) in response to undesirable child behavior as the measure of harsh  
499 parenting practices. Alpha was .60 and .25, respectively, for positive and harsh parenting,  
500 for 377 mothers, and alpha was .71 and .24, respectively, for positive and harsh parenting,  
501 for 835 fathers. However, one issue with these reliability estimates is that Cronbach's alpha  
502 – a correlational measure – provides an overly pessimistic view of the reliability of these



503 measures considering attenuation due to ceiling and floor effects. We thus in addition  
504 conducted supplemental measurement models appropriate for ordered categorical  
505 variables. We fit separate confirmatory factor models to the respective items sets for harsh  
506 and positive parenting. Because of the floor and ceiling effects, we tested models that  
507 specified the items as ordered categorical indicators of their underlying latent constructs  
508 using in one case, a logit link function and robust, full-information, maximum likelihood  
509 (FIML) estimation and in the second case, a probit link function and WLSMV (weighted least  
510 squares mean and variance adjusted) estimation. The confirmatory factor analysis (CFA)  
511 model for the harsh parenting with only 2 indicators per latent construct was specified with  
512 fixed factor loadings of 1, making it a random intercept model. With 3 items per latent  
513 construct for positive parenting, we estimated 2 factor loadings and the factor variance for  
514 each latent construct. In the FIML models, the test for the missing completely at random  
515 (MCAR) assumption could not be rejected for both constructs, suggesting that the subsets of  
516 the sample, father only, mother only and mother and father were random samples from the  
517 same underlying population. The latent models indicated that the items functioned as  
518 intended, and that the latent factors were well defined: In the FIML models, the test of the  
519 underlying model for the ordered categorical indicators (a continuous latent indicator with  
520 thresholds) could not be rejected, suggesting that ordered categorical indicator model  
521 assumptions were reasonable. For the WLSMV models, the overall chi-square tests of model  
522 fit were non-significant (smallest  $p$  value was .21), RMSEAs were well under .05 (biggest  
523 RMSEA was .020), and CFI/TLI were well above .9, (smallest value was .948). In the fully  
524 standardized CFA results, all items loaded significantly (all  $p < .001$ ) and moderately to  
525 strongly on their intended constructs, with FIML estimated single-indicator reliabilities for  
526 the harsh parenting items for fathers and mothers of .43 and .41, respectively, and

527 estimated single-indicator reliabilities for the positive parenting items for fathers and  
528 mothers ranging from .30 to .98, suggesting that equivalent reliabilities for latent construct  
529 scores would be .60 for father's harsh parenting, .58 for mother's harsh parenting, .86 for  
530 fathers' positive parenting, and .81 for mothers' positive parenting. Correlations of  
531 estimated factor scores from latent models with the transformed raw scores we used in the  
532 latent class growth models were very high at .95, suggesting that little would be gained by  
533 using factor scores rather than the trimmed mean of the items that we had used.

### 534 **Child predictor measures**

535 **Child age.** The child's age was calculated as the time difference between the  
536 interview date and the child's approximate ( $\pm 5$  days) birth date.

537 **Child gender.** The child's gender was a sampling variable recorded at study inclusion  
538 and was coded 0 (*girl*) or 1 (*boy*).

539 **Presence of similar-aged sibling.** Presence of a similar-aged sibling (age difference  
540 up to 5 years, thus for the greater part indicating the presence of older siblings) was coded 1,  
541 absence was coded 0.

542 **Child temperament.** To measure temperament, we included the scales Activity level  
543 and Distress to limitations from Rothbart's Infant Behavior Questionnaire-Revised [97] as  
544 well as the Soothability scale from the Infant Behavior Questionnaire [98], completed at the  
545 6-month interview with a modified three-point response format: 1 (*most of the time*), 2  
546 (*sometimes*), or 3 (*rarely or never*), in addition to a *does not apply* option. The mean score of  
547 items was used as the scale score. Cronbach's alpha was .71, .76, and .77, respectively, for  
548 the three scales.

### 549 **Outcome variables**

550 Teachers completed questionnaires in the middle of the second school year. With  
551 few exceptions, children were in their 8th year around the time of data collection. We  
552 selected the following variables:

553 **Externalizing.** We used the sum of the 12 Externalizing problem behavior items from  
554 the Social Skills Improvement System-Rating Scales (SSIS-RS; [99]). Frequency is rated on a  
555 four-point scale ranging from 0 (*never*) to 3 (*almost always*). We allowed one item to be  
556 missing when calculating the sum; if so, the sum was adjusted as 12 times the item mean  
557 and rounded up to the next integer. This sum could be calculated for 901 children (893  
558 children had complete data whereas 8 had one missing item). No children had more than  
559 one missing item. Cronbach's alpha based on 893 children with complete data was .92 for  
560 the scale of 12 items.

561 **Internalizing.** We used the sum of the seven Internalizing behavior items from the  
562 SSIS-RS [99]. Frequency is rated on a four-point scale ranging from 0 (*never*) to 3 (*almost*  
563 *always*). We allowed one item to be missing when calculating the sum; if so, the sum was  
564 adjusted as 7 times the item mean and rounded to the next integer. This sum could be  
565 calculated for 901 children (892 children had complete data whereas 9 had one missing  
566 item). No children had more than one missing item. Cronbach's alpha based on 892 children  
567 with complete data was .83 for the scale of 7 items.

568 **Academic competence.** We used the sum of the ratings for the seven Academic  
569 Competence items from the SSIS-RS [99], which are rated on a five-point scale ranging from  
570 1 (*lowest 10%*) to 5 (*highest 10%*). We allowed one item to be missing when calculating the  
571 sum; if so, the sum was adjusted as 7 times the item mean and rounded to the next integer.  
572 This sum could be calculated for 896 children (889 children had complete data whereas 7

573 had one missing item). Data for one child with four items completed were excluded.  
574 Cronbach's alpha based on 889 children with complete data was .96 for the scale of 7 items.  
575 **Social skills.** We used the sum of the frequency ratings for the 46 Social Skill items of  
576 the SSIS-RS [99]. Frequency is rated on a four-point scale ranging from 0 (*never*) to 3 (*almost*  
577 *always*). We allowed up to four items to be missing when calculating the sum; when items  
578 were missing, the sum was adjusted as 46 times the item mean and rounded to the next  
579 integer. This sum could be calculated for 887 children (839 children had complete data, 38  
580 had one missing item, and 10 children had 2, 3, or 4 missing items). Data for fourteen  
581 children with 41 or fewer items completed was excluded. Cronbach's alpha based on 839  
582 children with complete data was .96 for the scale of 46 items.

## 583 **Statistical analyses**

### 584 **Software**

585 Basic data operations were performed in SPSS, versions 20.0 through 28.0. Rasch  
586 analyses of child physical aggression were performed in Winsteps, version 3.90.0 through  
587 4.7.1.0. Standard regression and latent class analyses were carried out using R, version 4.1  
588 and Mplus, versions 8.6 and 8.7, respectively.

### 589 **Analytic subsample and missing data**

590 The present study used an analytic subsample of 1141 children with reports of  
591 physical aggression. Among predictor variables from 6 months representing demography  
592 and child temperament, 1.3% missing observations were imputed prior to the main analyses  
593 using a single imputation of missing values by means of the Estimation Maximization (EM)  
594 algorithm in SPSS as described in more detail in Nærde et al. [9].

595 For the remaining early predictor variables and Grade 2 outcomes, missingness was  
596 addressed using multiple imputation in R [100] for standard regression analyses. The  
597 imputation model included all early predictors and grade 2 outcomes. For all analyses  
598 involving latent classes, missingness was handled within the latent-variable framework in  
599 Mplus as described below under Statistical Methods.

600 Attrition analyses revealed that the analytic subsample resembled the entire original  
601 study sample very closely with respect to all early predictors (Supporting information C).  
602 Analyses also revealed very great similarity between the entire original sample and the  
603 subsample of 901 children who had Grade 2 teacher reports with respect to early predictors;  
604 a multivariate binomial logistic regression on early predictors of presence of Grade 2  
605 teacher reports, which made up our distal outcomes, suggested that maternal education,  
606 single parent, and sibling presence together significantly predicted missingness in Grade 2  
607 teacher reports. These three early predictors were included in the fully adjusted models,  
608 including in the modeling of missingness, thus reducing or eliminating the possibility of bias  
609 in the fully adjusted models due to any missingness explained by early predictors.

## 610 **Data transformations**

611 Continuous predictors were centered at their sample means. To prevent potential  
612 distortions due to outliers, we trimmed non-binary predictors at about the 2nd and 98th  
613 percentiles of their respective distributions. Some of the non-binary predictors as well as  
614 the Grade 2 outcomes of externalizing and internalizing were highly skewed, as would be  
615 expected in this population, and were square root transformed to make the assumption of  
616 within-class normality more reasonable. Descriptive statistics for predictors and outcomes,  
617 before and after transformations, are shown in Table 2.

618 Table 2. Descriptive statistics for predictors and outcomes

	Raw data						Transformed data						
	<i>N</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	Skew	Kurt	Min	Max	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	Skew	Kurt	Min	Max
	Early predictors												
Maternal education <sup>a</sup>	1141	14.29	2.57	-0.14	-1.06	9	18	0.00	2.57	-0.14	-1.06	-5.29	3.71
Paternal education <sup>a</sup>	1141	13.84	2.59	0.23	-1.09	9	18	0.01	2.59	0.23	-1.09	-4.84	4.17
Young mother	1141	0.14	0.34	2.12	2.49	0	1	--	--	--	--	--	--
Young father	1141	0.06	0.23	3.86	12.95	0	1	--	--	--	--	--	--
Financial stress	1096	0.12	0.33	2.34	3.46	0	1	--	--	--	--	--	--
Couple relationship <sup>b</sup>	1072	5.33	0.65	-1.70	4.18	1.20	6.00	0.70	0.39	-0.15	-0.70	0.00	1.38
Single parent	1141	0.05	0.21	4.32	16.66	0	1	--	--	--	--	--	--
Mat'l depression & anxiety <sup>c</sup>	1116	1.33	0.37	1.95	5.98	1.00	3.75	0.47	0.32	0.07	-0.82	0.00	1.15
Pat'l depression & anxiety <sup>c</sup>	671	1.27	0.33	2.59	13.12	1.00	4.00	0.40	0.31	0.10	-1.11	0.00	1.00
Maternal sensitivity <sup>d</sup>	244	3.90	0.61	-0.79	0.36	1.83	5.00	0.01	0.59	-0.63	-0.31	-1.43	0.93
Paternal sensitivity <sup>d</sup>	717	3.74	0.69	-0.45	-0.17	1.17	5.00	0.00	0.66	-0.32	-0.75	-1.41	1.09

	Raw data						Transformed data						
	<i>N</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	Skew	Kurt	Min	Max	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	Skew	Kurt	Min	Max
Maternal harsh parenting <sup>d</sup>	377	1.42	0.50	1.96	7.73	1.00	5.00	-0.01	0.47	1.28	1.70	-0.42	1.58
Paternal harsh parenting <sup>d</sup>	835	1.40	0.47	1.23	1.77	1.00	4.00	-0.01	0.44	0.82	-0.28	-0.41	1.10
Mat'l positive parenting <sup>d</sup>	377	4.71	0.45	-2.82	13.90	1.00	5.00	0.01	0.40	-1.61	2.25	-1.38	0.29
Pat'l positive parenting <sup>d</sup>	835	4.53	0.54	-2.10	8.50	1.00	5.00	0.02	0.47	-0.86	-0.18	-1.19	0.47
Child gender	1141	0.52	0.50	-0.06	-2.00	0	1	--	--	--	--	--	--
Similar-aged sibling	1141	0.38	0.49	0.47	-1.78	0	1	--	--	--	--	--	--
Child activity level <sup>d</sup>	1141	2.07	0.28	0.07	0.00	1.09	2.83	0.00	0.27	0.11	-0.42	-0.54	0.60
Child distress to limitations <sup>d</sup>	1141	1.69	0.31	0.40	0.13	1.00	2.82	0.00	0.30	0.30	-0.31	-0.56	0.70
Child soothability <sup>d</sup>	1141	2.63	0.29	-0.46	-0.35	1.56	3.00	0.00	0.28	-0.30	-0.89	-0.63	0.37
Grade 2 outcomes													
Externalizing <sup>e</sup>	901	4.81	5.26	1.68	3.22	0	35	1.83	1.21	0.34	-0.36	0.00	5.92
Internalizing <sup>e</sup>	901	3.01	2.97	1.17	1.49	0	18	1.42	1.00	-0.04	-0.94	0.00	4.24
Academic competence	896	25.03	7.12	-0.40	-0.50	7	35	--	--	--	--	--	--

	Raw data						Transformed data						
	<i>N</i>	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	Skew	Kurt	Min	Max	<i>M</i>	<i>SD</i>	Skew	Kurt	Min	Max
Social skills	887	103.79	19.56	-0.43	-0.45	32	137	--	--	--	--	--	--

619 Note. Some variables were transformed as marked by letter subscripts. Descriptive statistics for transformed variables are displayed in the right part of the  
 620 table. Reversing and recentering are linear transformations that do not change the shape of a distribution, the rank order of observations, or the linear  
 621 relations with other variables. Trimming and square root transformations are non-linear transformations that change the shape of a distribution (make it  
 622 less skewed and heavy-tailed), the rank order of a few of the observations (only trimming and this is because it produces ties among extremes) and thus  
 623 potentially alter linear relations with other variables.

624 <sup>a</sup>Centered. <sup>b</sup>Trimmed (values smaller than the 2nd percentile or larger than the 98th percentile recoded back to the 2nd or 98th percentile values),  
 625 reversed, recentered to have a minimum score of zero and square root transformed. <sup>c</sup>Trimmed, recentered to have a minimum score of zero and square  
 626 root transformed. <sup>d</sup>Centered and trimmed. <sup>e</sup>Square root transformed.



## 627 **Statistical methods**

628 **Growth model and latent class (trajectory) analysis (LCGA).** Because of the large  
629 number and irregular timing of the repeated growth measures within children, we found it  
630 simplest to use a 2-level specification for the LCGA with the child's age in years, centered at  
631 2.2, as the time variable. Prior research clearly indicates that the pattern of growth requires  
632 at least a 2nd degree polynomial (i.e., quadratic) model to capture the rise to a peak and  
633 subsequent decline. Preliminary analyses indicated that a 4th order model fit significantly  
634 and substantially better than 2nd or 3rd order models in our sample with up to 21 repeated  
635 measures, so we adopted the 4th order model for all analyses (i.e., included terms up to the  
636 4th power of time). The basic 2-level LCGA-growth model specification included 5 child-level  
637 growth components with freely estimated means for the 5 growth components in each class,  
638 no within-class variability on growth components, and time-specific variability constrained  
639 to be equal across both time and classes. The specification of no within class variability in  
640 growth is what locates our model in the category of LCGA (latent class growth analysis; [16],  
641 which is considered the simplest longitudinal mixture model [101]). Most prominent  
642 trajectory studies to date, [including e.g., 8, 16, 21, 25] have employed LCGA models. LCGA  
643 models in common circumstances extract more classes than growth mixture models (GMM),  
644 which do allow for some variation of trajectories within classes [102].

645 **3-Step approach.** For models that included latent classes and either predictors,  
646 outcomes, or both, we used the manual 3-step procedure as recommended by Asparouhov  
647 and Muthen [84]. In addition to the advantages given by Asparouhov and Muthen, the 3-  
648 step approach allows us to use a much simpler way of dealing with missing data in child  
649 level predictors because Step 3 eliminates all the repeated growth measurements for a  
650 particular child and replaces them with one child level nominal predictor of latent class –

651 pseudo-class – which enables us to switch to a 1-level model. We had several important  
652 predictors with substantial amounts of missing data. Mplus requires the use of a  
653 computationally intensive approach based on Monte Carlo numerical integration to deal  
654 with missing data in the predictors and this is much simpler in a 1-level model.

655 **Prediction of trajectory (class) membership.** To evaluate the overall effect of each  
656 predictor on class membership, whether unadjusted and considered singly or fully adjusted  
657 for all competing predictors on class membership, we used likelihood ratio tests (LRT)  
658 comparing the model with all possible predictor effects to the model that included the  
659 predictor but had all predictor effects constrained to zero. We used a pseudo-*R* statistic [103]  
660 as the indicator of the strength of association between predictor and class membership.

661 We investigated predictor effects on membership in any class versus another in  
662 multinomial logistic regressions in the context of the 3-step approach. The multinomial  
663 logistic model is a collection of individual logistic regressions, one less than the number of  
664 classes, where one class serves as the reference class and predictors compete to  
665 discriminate each of the other classes against the reference class in the individual,  
666 simultaneous logistic regressions. The multinomial logistic regression model is estimated on  
667 the log odds scale; a contrast coefficient of  $\pm 0.69$  on the log odds scale corresponds to an  
668 odds ratio of 2 or 0.5, thus expressing double the odds of membership in one of the  
669 compared classes over the reference class conditional on the predictor. Contrast coefficients  
670 express the change in log odds of the outcome for a 1-unit change in the predictor. For  
671 interpretability, we standardized predictor coefficients by the predictors' sample standard  
672 deviations.

673 In our case with 9 latent classes, the multinomial logistic regression produces 8  
674 effects for each class vs the reference class for each predictor. The choice of the reference

675 class is arbitrary and Mplus uses the "last" class by default. The 8 effects can be recombined  
676 in simple linear combinations to derive any contrast between any 2 classes, and it is very  
677 helpful to examine these alternative contrasts to understand the nature of the effects of a  
678 predictor on class membership. With 9 classes, there are 36 non-redundant, pairwise  
679 contrasts.

680 **Prediction of Grade 2 outcomes from class (trajectory).** To evaluate the overall  
681 effect of class membership on the distal outcomes considered singly, similarly to our  
682 approach for comparing predictor effects, we adopted an LRT approach comparing the  
683 model with distal outcome means freely estimated in each class to the null hypothesis  
684 model with distal outcome means forced to be equal in each class. To summarize the overall  
685 effect of latent class on outcomes we computed  $R$  as the square root of  $R^2$  by computing the  
686 proportional reduction of total outcome variance represented by the residual, within class  
687 outcome variance, that is,  $R^2 = \text{proportion explained variance} = 1 - (\text{residual variance}/\text{total}$   
688  $\text{variance})$ . For means comparisons of outcomes among latent classes, we used standardized  
689 mean differences and examined all pairwise contrasts among classes.

690 **Prediction of Grade 2 outcomes from early predictors.** We used a standardized  
691 regression weight as the indicator of the strength of association between each early  
692 predictor and Grade 2 outcomes. These standard regression analyses were carried out in R  
693 using multiple imputations to account for missing data.

694 **Unadjusted versus fully adjusted prediction models.** Comparing unadjusted vs  
695 adjusted effects is useful because we gain insight into which predictors are the most  
696 proximal and which are more distal. The former remains significant even after full  
697 adjustment and the latter becomes nonsignificant, whether overall or just a few class  
698 contrasts. We first examined all prediction effects unadjusted for other influences.

699 For each distal outcome, we went on to build fully adjusted models for the influence  
700 of early predictors on trajectory, as well as the influence of trajectory and early predictors  
701 on the outcome. For these analyses, we retained those early predictors that either had a  
702 significant unadjusted effect on trajectory membership or had a significant effect on any of  
703 the four distal outcomes after adjusting for all other predictors in separate multi-predictor  
704 models. The full models included all possible predictor effects on latent class, all latent class  
705 effects on the distal outcome, and all possible direct paths from the predictors to the distal  
706 outcome.

## 707 **Results**

### 708 **Number and shape of trajectories**

709 We considered two- to ten trajectory solutions. We relied on information criteria,  
710 the parametric bootstrap likelihood ratio test (BLRT), and substantive considerations to  
711 select the number of trajectories that seemed optimal with respect to parsimony, model fit,  
712 and the distinctions that the trajectory model made in the data. Table 3 shows information  
713 criteria for the sequence of models. Test statistics for the BLRT are given in table SD2 in  
714 Supporting information D. Nine trajectories minimized the Bayesian information criterion  
715 (BIC), whereas ten trajectories (or possibly more) minimized the sample size adjusted BIC  
716 and the Akaike information criterion (AIC). A less often reported criterion, the consistent  
717 Akaike information criterion (CAIC; [104]) was minimized by the eight-trajectory solution.  
718 The BLRT consistently rejected simpler models with less than 8 trajectories, although due to  
719 the heavy computational burden we did not attempt to test 9 or more trajectories against  
720 simpler models.

721 Table 3. Information criteria, entropy, and parameters for 2 to 10 trajectory models.

Trajectories	-2logL	Parameters	BIC	adjBIC	AIC	CAIC	Entropy
			5149	5146			
<b>2</b>	51385	12	9	1	51408	51511	.83
			5078	5072			
<b>3</b>	50609	18	1	3	50645	50799	.82
			5044	5036			
<b>4</b>	50212	24	1	4	50260	50465	.80
			5029	5019			
<b>5</b>	50009	30	4	9	50069	50324	.77
			5017	5005			
<b>6</b>	49827	36	0	5	49899	50206	.77
			5008	4994			
<b>7</b>	49680	42	0	6	49764	50122	.79
<b>8</b>	49575	48	5003	4988	49671	<b>50080</b>	.76

				2	0			
			<b>5003</b>		4985			
<b>9</b>	49515	54	<b>0</b>	8	49623	50084		.76
			5004		<b>4985</b>			
<b>10</b>	49470	60	1	<b>0</b>	<b>49590</b>	50101		.77

722 *Note.*  $-2\log L$ : -2 times the  $H_0$  loglikelihood. BIC: Bayesian information criterion. adjBIC: Sample-size adjusted Bayesian criterion. AIC: Akaike information  
723 criterion. CAIC: Consistent Akaike information criterion [104]. Numbers in bold indicate minima or maxima that suggest the optimal solution according to  
724 each information criterion.

725           The assembled statistical evidence clearly suggested to us that at least 7 trajectories  
726 were necessary. Visual inspection of graphs of the two- to ten-trajectory solutions  
727 (reproduced in Supporting information D) revealed, among other things, (a) that at least one  
728 declining trajectory appeared in all solutions starting with the four-trajectory solution; (b)  
729 that the small high-stable trajectory appeared from the seven-trajectory solution and  
730 persisted virtually unchanged in shape and proportion through to the ten-trajectory solution;  
731 (c) that starting with the eight-trajectory solution, there were two rather than one no- or  
732 low-aggression trajectories; and (d) that in going from eight to nine trajectories two  
733 declining trajectories appeared rather than one.

734           In considering 7, 8, or 9 trajectories, we eliminated the 7-trajectory model from  
735 consideration because it was clearly and strongly rejected by the BLRT, the test that has the  
736 best support mathematically [105, 106] and in simulations [104]. We selected the nine-  
737 trajectory solution over the eight because it was suggested by the BIC, which is strongly  
738 recommended by methodologists as being accurate, or at worst somewhat conservative, in  
739 this context [104].

740           Figure 2 shows the 9-class model estimated trajectories, which seem to represent:  
741           (1) one *high-stable* trajectory that rises to a very high peak of physical aggression  
742           around 2 years, and stays at a high level (Trajectory 9, model-based trajectory  
743           proportion 3%);  
744           (2) three *variable-start, high-endpoint* trajectories that end up at an intermediately  
745           elevated level of physical aggression, but with different early developments: one  
746           starting high and declining after a rather high peak (Trajectory 8, 7%), one  
747           starting low and quickly attaining the peak and decline levels of the

748 beforementioned (Trajectory 7, 9%), and one starting low with a late and flat  
749 peak (Trajectory 6, 17%);  
750 (3) two *high-start, low-endpoint* trajectories that decline from their initial highest  
751 level, with a late and flat peak followed by another decline to a low level, one  
752 following a slightly higher-level path (Trajectory 5, 5%) than the other (Trajectory  
753 4, 7%);  
754 (4) two *medium-peak, low-endpoint* trajectories that start and end up with a low  
755 level of physical aggression, one reaching an early peak of a somewhat high level  
756 (Trajectory 3, 16%), and one with a flatter peak at a lower level (Trajectory 2,  
757 22%); and  
758 (5) one *low-stable* or "*no aggression*" trajectory that starts out and stays at a low  
759 level of aggression with just a minor rise to a very low, flat peak, and a decline  
760 back to a low level (Trajectory 1, 14%).

761 Details of the 9-class model are given in Supporting information E.

762

763 **Fig 2. Model predicted child physical aggression by trajectory in nine-trajectory solution**  
764 **(fourth-grade polynomial growth function)**

765

766 The curls toward the end of the developmental period for many of the trajectories  
767 are most likely an artefact of fitting a 4th degree polynomial function to a data set with no  
768 planned data collections between 4 and 5 years. The conclusion that levels of physical  
769 aggression in Trajectories 4 and 5 rebound at or after 5 years is not well supported or  
770 justified due to the lack of observed data between ages 4 and 5 years.



771 Table 4 shows model-estimated and pseudo-class assigned (i.e., by children's highest  
772 estimated trajectory membership probability) proportions of trajectories, and the  
773 distribution of boys and girls within trajectories. The estimated and assigned proportions  
774 were overall very similar, supporting the model's fit to the empirical distinctions present in  
775 the data set. Gender differences in development were clear in that more boys than girls  
776 were described by the high-endpoint and high-stable Trajectories 6-9 (from 60% to a  
777 maximum of 69% pseudo-class assignments for Trajectory 9), and more girls than boys were  
778 described by the no-aggression Trajectory 1 (28% boys by pseudo-class assignments). It is  
779 noteworthy that there were no trajectories that exclusively described only one gender; the  
780 low-endpoint Trajectories 2-5 described more or less even proportions of boys and girls, and  
781 each trajectory, including those with the most uneven gender distribution, described a fair  
782 proportion of the less represented gender (1 boy per 2.5 girls in Trajectory 1, and 1 girl per  
783 2.2 boys in Trajectory 9).

784 Table 4. Trajectory proportions and gender proportions within trajectory.

Trajectory	Model estimates		Pseudo-class assignments			
	Trajectory proportion	Proportion			Trajectory proportion	Proportion
		boys within trajectory <sup>a</sup>	Girls	Boys	boys within trajectory	
1 No aggression	.137	.24	111	44	.136	.28
2 Medium-peak, low-endpoint – flatter	.219	.51	130	126	.224	.49
3 Medium-peak, low-endpoint – early peak	.160	.51	89	98	.164	.52
4 High-start, low-endpoint – lower	.069	.45	39	34	.064	.47
5 High-start, low-endpoint – higher	.054	.58	24	32	.049	.57
6 High-endpoint – late flat peak	.168	.62	80	119	.174	.60
7 High-endpoint – low start	.092	.66	35	64	.087	.65
8 High-endpoint – high start, high peak	.075	.59	35	52	.076	.60
9 High-stable	.027	.70	9	20	.025	.69

785 <sup>a</sup>The model estimated proportion of boys was derived from the set of unstandardized and unadjusted trajectory prediction contrast coefficients for child  
786 gender as trajectory-membership predictor (Table 6 displays the corresponding standardized set) and the model estimated trajectory proportions (pseudo-  
787 class proportions yielded the same result).

## 788 **Unadjusted predictor effects on trajectory membership**

789 Overall effects of each predictor in isolation on trajectory membership are shown in  
790 the first three data column of Table 5 including an overall, 8-degree-of-freedom chi-square  
791 test and the strength of the overall effect as pseudo- $R$ .

792 Table 5. Unadjusted overall prediction effects of early predictors on trajectory and outcomes, and of trajectory on outcomes.

Predictor	Prediction to trajectory <sup>a</sup>			Prediction to Grade 2 outcomes <sup>b</sup>			
	$\chi^2$	<i>p</i>	Pseudo <i>R</i> <sup>2</sup>	Externalizing	Internalizing	Academic competence	Social skills
Maternal education	17.1	.029	.12*	-.13***	-.12***	.22***	.18***
Paternal education	14.5	.070	.11	-.12***	-.09**	.17***	.15***
Young mother	13.7	.090	.11	.09**	.11**	-.01	-.09*
Young father	5.9	.660	.07	.09*	.13***	-.05	-.08*
Financial stress	12.2	.144	.10	.16***	.15***	-.13***	-.18***
Couple relationship (reversed)	23.3	.003	.14**	.09*	.12***	-.08*	-.06
Single parent	13.9	.086	.11	.16***	.13***	-.14***	-.15***
Maternal depression & anxiety	40.8	<.001	.19***	.07*	.09**	-.09**	-.06
Paternal depression & anxiety	16.1	.041	.12*	.13**	.08	.00	-.17***
Maternal sensitivity	4.4	.818	.06	-.12	-.13*	.11	.09
Paternal sensitivity	11.4	.179	.10	-.12**	-.07	.10*	.11**
Maternal harsh parenting	46.5	<.001	.20***	.13*	.04	-.09	-.09

Predictor	Prediction to trajectory <sup>a</sup>			Prediction to Grade 2 outcomes <sup>b</sup>			
	$\chi^2$	<i>p</i>	Pseudo <i>R</i> <sup>a</sup>	Externalizing	Internalizing	Academic competence	Social skills
Paternal harsh parenting	31.7	<.001	.17***	.06	.01	-.11**	-.09*
Maternal positive parenting	6.5	.594	.08	.02	-.02	-.06	-.03
Paternal positive parenting	7.5	.485	.08	.03	.04	.04	-.02
Child gender	54.7	<.001	.22***	.30***	.13***	-.13***	-.30***
Similar-aged sibling	66.6	<.001	.24***	-.02	-.07*	-.02	.04
Child activity level	32.3	<.001	.17***	.09**	.09**	-.03	-.08*
Child distress to limitations	38.0	<.001	.18***	-.04	.00	.02	.04
Child soothability	29.5	<.001	.16***	.09**	.03	-.07*	-.11**
Trajectory <sup>c</sup>	--	--	--	.27***	.11	.19***	.19**

793 \**p*<.05 \*\**p*<.01 \*\*\**p*<.001.

794 <sup>a</sup>Overall prediction to trajectory was assessed by comparing a model with all class discrimination effects of each single predictor freely estimated to a

795 reduced model where all the class discrimination effects are zeroed out in an 8 degrees of freedom chi-square test; the effect size is given as pseudo-R

796 estimated as the square root of Nagelkerke's pseudo *R*<sup>2</sup> derived from robust chi-square, which was identical to the effect measure *w* derived from robust

797 chi square. <sup>b</sup>Predictor-to-outcome associations are given as fully standardized regression coefficients. Coefficients were standardized by sample means  
798 (Table 2). <sup>c</sup>Prediction of outcomes from trajectory membership is given as  $R$ , the square root of  $R^2$  computed as the proportional reduction in total outcome  
799 variance represented by the residual within class variance, that is,  $R^2 = \text{proportion explained variance} = 1 - (\text{residual variance}/\text{total variance})$ .

800           Eleven out of the 20 predictors had significant overall effects on trajectory  
801 membership with pseudo-*R* ranging from .12 to .24. Similar-aged sibling and child gender  
802 were the two strongest predictors, and also significant at this level were maternal education,  
803 couple relationship, both parents' depression and anxiety, both parents' harsh parenting,  
804 and all three child-temperament variables. Trajectory predictor coefficients (with Trajectory  
805 1 [no aggression], as the reference trajectory) with all possible pairwise contrast tests are  
806 shown in the upper part of Table 6. Pairwise contrasts were not corrected for mass  
807 significance; at  $p < .05$ , 1.8 pairwise contrasts (i.e., 3.6 superscripts as each pair of trajectories  
808 are superscripted for a contrast) would be expected to be significant by chance in the case  
809 of a null association between a predictor and the 9-trajectory solution. In the presence of a  
810 significant overall effect, the pairwise contrast tests are offered as a guide to interpret the  
811 predictor-trajectory effect direction. In the absence of a significant overall effect, significant  
812 uncorrected pairwise contrasts do not suggest an effect unless clearly exceeding the chance  
813 expected number (i.e., at least 3 significant contrasts) and suggesting a difference involving  
814 one – or possibly a few – categories in isolation against other classes, which is an effect  
815 pattern that may be present even in the case of an insignificant overall test. This ability to  
816 detect effects that are limited to only a few groups but still may be large enough to be  
817 important represents a strength of the latent class approach.



818 Table 6. Trajectory predictor coefficient contrasts for unadjusted effects of early predictors on trajectory and means comparison contrasts for  
 819 unadjusted effects of trajectory on outcomes.

Variable	Overall effect <sup>a</sup>	Trajectory								
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Trajectory prediction coefficients with pairwise contrasts for effects of early predictors on trajectory <sup>b</sup>										
Maternal education	.12*	0.00	0.15 <sup>489</sup>	0.00	-0.27 <sup>267</sup>	0.12	0.13 <sup>489</sup>	0.21 <sup>489</sup>	-0.24 <sup>267</sup>	-0.40 <sup>67</sup>
Paternal education	.11	0.00 <sup>9</sup>	-0.04	-0.10	-0.17	-0.02	-0.03 <sup>9</sup>	0.21 <sup>89</sup>	-0.31 <sup>7</sup>	-0.60 <sup>67</sup>
Young mother	.11	0.00	-0.02	0.03	0.23 <sup>67</sup>	-0.04	-0.29 <sup>48</sup>	-0.30 <sup>4</sup>	0.12 <sup>6</sup>	-0.03
Young father	.07	0.00	-0.03	-0.07	-0.08	-0.07	-0.23 <sup>9</sup>	-0.17	-0.06	0.18 <sup>6</sup>
Financial stress	.10	0.00 <sup>9</sup>	0.04 <sup>9</sup>	0.20	0.29	0.23	0.09 <sup>9</sup>	0.26	0.29	0.46 <sup>6</sup>
Couple relationship (reversed)	.14**	0.00 <sup>6</sup>	-0.13 <sup>35689</sup>	0.21 <sup>24</sup>	-0.22 <sup>3689</sup>	0.23 <sup>2</sup>	0.28 <sup>124</sup>	0.17	0.24 <sup>24</sup>	0.45 <sup>6</sup>
Single parent	.11	0.00	-0.50	0.02	0.06	-0.12	-0.05	0.12	0.15	0.06
Maternal depression & anxiety	.19***	0.00 <sup>36789</sup>	0.09 <sup>3789</sup>	0.45 <sup>12</sup>	0.30 <sup>9</sup>	0.33	0.32 <sup>19</sup>	0.57 <sup>12</sup>	0.63 <sup>12</sup>	0.84 <sup>1246</sup>
Paternal depression & anxiety	.12*	0.00 <sup>8</sup>	-0.35 <sup>48</sup>	0.05	0.29 <sup>2</sup>	0.04	0.15	0.10	0.47 <sup>12</sup>	0.18
Maternal sensitivity	.06	0.00	0.09	-0.11 <sup>5</sup>	-0.09 <sup>5</sup>	0.68 <sup>34678</sup>	-0.07 <sup>5</sup>	-0.10 <sup>5</sup>	-0.08 <sup>5</sup>	0.22
Paternal sensitivity	.10	0.00	-0.03	-0.13 <sup>4</sup>	0.57 <sup>3569</sup>	-0.22 <sup>4</sup>	-0.24 <sup>4</sup>	0.08	0.03	-0.22 <sup>4</sup>

It is made available under a [CC-BY 4.0 International license](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

medRxiv preprint doi: <https://doi.org/10.1101/2023.09.06.23295119>; this version posted September 15, 2023. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

Variable	Overall effect <sup>a</sup>	Trajectory								
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Maternal harsh parenting	.20***	0.00 <sup>38</sup>	-0.64 <sup>3456789</sup>	0.88 <sup>12</sup>	0.68 <sup>2</sup>	0.72 <sup>2</sup>	0.65 <sup>28</sup>	0.64 <sup>2</sup>	1.15 <sup>1269</sup>	0.47 <sup>28</sup>
Paternal harsh parenting	.17***	0.00 <sup>3679</sup>	0.23 <sup>79</sup>	0.51 <sup>19</sup>	0.45 <sup>9</sup>	0.48 <sup>9</sup>	0.54 <sup>19</sup>	0.75 <sup>12</sup>	0.47 <sup>9</sup>	1.00 <sup>12345</sup>
Maternal positive parenting	.08	0.00	-0.19	-0.43	-0.10	-0.46	-0.13	-0.38	-0.39	0.00
Paternal positive parenting	.08	0.00 <sup>28</sup>	-0.43 <sup>1</sup>	-0.29	-0.35	-0.25	-0.22	-0.21	-0.43 <sup>1</sup>	-0.46
Child gender	.22***	0.00 <sup>23456789</sup>	0.59 <sup>1</sup>	0.59 <sup>1</sup>	0.47 <sup>17</sup>	0.73 <sup>1</sup>	0.80 <sup>1</sup>	0.90 <sup>14</sup>	0.76 <sup>1</sup>	0.98
Similar-aged sibling	.24***	0.00 <sup>356789</sup>	0.33 <sup>789</sup>	0.37 <sup>1789</sup>	0.07 <sup>6789</sup>	0.55 <sup>1</sup>	0.53 <sup>1479</sup>	0.90 <sup>12346</sup>	0.80 <sup>1234</sup>	1.00 <sup>346</sup>
Child activity level	.17***	0.00 <sup>4589</sup>	-0.04 <sup>4589</sup>	0.06 <sup>48</sup>	0.45 <sup>1236</sup>	0.35 <sup>126</sup>	-0.09 <sup>4589</sup>	0.18	0.50 <sup>1236</sup>	0.37
Child distress to limitations	.18***	0.00 <sup>3456789</sup>	0.32 <sup>58</sup>	0.56 <sup>1</sup>	0.63 <sup>1</sup>	0.75 <sup>12</sup>	0.53 <sup>1</sup>	0.54 <sup>1</sup>	0.68 <sup>12</sup>	0.67
Child soothability	.16***	0.00 <sup>23568</sup>	-0.34 <sup>18</sup>	-0.39 <sup>18</sup>	-0.17 <sup>8</sup>	-0.58 <sup>1</sup>	-0.45 <sup>18</sup>	-0.20 <sup>8</sup>	-0.76 <sup>1234679</sup>	-0.29
Standardized means comparisons with pairwise contrasts for effects of trajectory on distal outcomes <sup>c</sup>										
Externalizing	.27***	0.00 <sup>23456789</sup>	0.32 <sup>167</sup>	0.37 <sup>17</sup>	0.47 <sup>17</sup>	0.48 <sup>17</sup>	0.71 <sup>12</sup>	0.99 <sup>12345</sup>	0.63 <sup>1</sup>	0.75 <sup>1</sup>
Internalizing	.11	0.00	0.06	0.19	0.25	-0.03	0.16	0.17	0.31	0.46
Academic competence	.19***	0.00 <sup>9</sup>	-0.19 <sup>9</sup>	-0.24 <sup>9</sup>	-0.11 <sup>9</sup>	0.08 <sup>79</sup>	-0.19 <sup>9</sup>	-0.34 <sup>59</sup>	-0.38 <sup>9</sup>	-1.09 <sup>1234567</sup>

Variable	Overall	Trajectory								
	effect <sup>a</sup>	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Social skills	.19**	0.00 <sup>679</sup>	-0.06 <sup>679</sup>	-0.15 <sup>9</sup>	-0.43	-0.35	-0.42 <sup>12</sup>	-0.45 <sup>12</sup>	-0.33	-0.80 <sup>123</sup>

820 \* $p < .05$  \*\* $p < .01$  \*\*\* $p < .001$  for overall effects.

821 <sup>a</sup>Pseudo- $R/R$  estimate with overall significance test from Table 5. <sup>b</sup>Trajectory prediction contrast coefficients are fully standardized logistic regression effects  
 822 on the log odds scale (the effect on the log odds of the class contrast for a change in the predictor of one standard deviation) given relative to membership  
 823 in Trajectory 1 (the "no aggression" trajectory). Coefficients were standardized by sample means (Table 2). Contrast coefficients between any pair of  
 824 trajectories can be derived by subtraction (i.e., for maternal education between Trajectories 2 and 4:  $0.15 - [-0.27] = 0.42$ , which is significant at  $p < .05$  as  
 825 indicated by superscripts). A contrast coefficient of 0.69 is equivalent to an odds ratio of 2.0, and a coefficient of -0.69 is equivalent to an odds ratio of 0.5.

826 <sup>c</sup>The entries are standardized mean differences relative to Trajectory 1. Contrast coefficients between any pair of trajectories can be derived by subtraction.

827 <sup>123456789</sup>Number superscripts indicate pairwise contrast tests significant at  $p < .05$  between the indexed trajectory and the trajectory with the superscripts'  
 828 number; significant contrasts are superscripted for both involved trajectories. Contrast tests are not adjusted for mass significance; the chance expected  
 829 number out of 36 pairwise contrasts at  $p < .05$  would be 1.8 per variable, or 3.6 numbered subscripts per table row, in the case of a null association between  
 830 a predictor/outcome and the 9-trajectory solution. In the presence of a significant overall effect, contrast tests are offered as a guide to effect direction  
 831 interpretation; in the absence of a significant overall effect, significant contrast tests should not be taken as implying an effect unless clearly exceeding the  
 832 chance expected number (i.e., at least 3 significant contrasts) and suggesting a difference involving one or possibly a few isolated trajectories.

833           The contrast tests for predictors with a significant overall effect on trajectory  
834 membership generally indicated effects in the expected direction, with risk factors  
835 predicting trajectories with higher overall level, peak, or endpoints, and protective factors  
836 predicting in the opposite direction. Out of the nine predictors without a significant overall  
837 effect, there were four for which the number of significant pairwise contrast tests clearly  
838 exceeded the chance expected number and suggested a difference involving one or a few  
839 categories in isolation; these were *paternal education* (as education went up, a child was  
840 less likely to be in Trajectory 9 vs. Trajectories 1, 6, or 7, and more likely to be in Trajectory 7  
841 vs. Trajectory 8), *financial stress* (as stress went up, a child was more likely to be in  
842 Trajectory 9 compared to Trajectories 1, 2, and 6), *maternal sensitivity* (as sensitivity went  
843 up, a child was more likely to be in Trajectory 5 compared to five other trajectories) and  
844 *paternal sensitivity* (as sensitivity went up, a child was more likely to be in Trajectory 4  
845 compared to four other trajectories). (For young mothers, the number of significant  
846 contrasts exceeded chance expectations, but suggested no clear effect pattern.)

## 847 **Unadjusted effects of trajectory membership on grade 2 outcomes**

848           Overall effects of physical-aggression trajectory on outcomes in isolation tested with  
849 a likelihood ratio chi-square with 8 degrees of freedom are shown in the lowermost row of  
850 Table 5. Trajectory significantly predicted externalizing ( $R^2 = 7.4\%$ ), academic competence  
851 ( $R^2 = 3.6\%$ ), and social skills ( $R^2 = 3.7\%$ ). Uncorrected for mass significance, pairwise means  
852 comparisons among outcomes by trajectory with contrast tests are shown in the lower part  
853 of Table 6, and should be interpreted analogous to the predictor-trajectory contrasts tests,  
854 That is, in the presence of a significant overall effect as a guide to effect direction  
855 interpretation, and in the absence of a significant overall effect suggesting no effect unless

856 clearly exceeding the chance expected number (i.e., at least 3) and revealing a difference  
857 involving one or possibly a few isolated trajectories. Regarding externalizing, the no-  
858 aggression trajectory (1) had the lowest mean, contrasting to all other trajectories, of which  
859 Trajectory 7 had the highest mean level. For academic competence, however, it was the  
860 high-stable trajectory (9) that contrasted to all other trajectories.

## 861 **Unadjusted predictor effects on grade 2 outcomes**

862       When considering the effects of predictors in isolation on any of the four outcomes,  
863 17 predictors—all except maternal and paternal positive parenting and child distress to  
864 limitations—influenced one or more of the outcomes. The effects of the significant  
865 predictors on each outcome are shown in the rightmost four data columns of Table 5. The  
866 significant predictor-outcome associations were in the expected direction, with risk factors  
867 predicting poorer Grade 2 outcomes and protective factors predicting in the opposite  
868 direction, with the following exceptions: Soothability predicted slightly to (a) more  
869 externalizing, (b) less academic competence, and (c) lower social skills; having a similar-aged  
870 sibling predicted to less internalizing. The consistent prediction to all four Grade 2 outcomes  
871 from the parent and family variables of parental educational level, financial stress, single  
872 parent, and maternal depression and anxiety is noteworthy, as well as the finding that child  
873 gender (but not the other child variables) predicted strongly and consistently to each  
874 outcome.

## 875 **Fully adjusted models predicting each distal outcome from early** 876 **predictors and trajectory**

877       For each distal outcome, we went on to build fully adjusted models for the influence  
878 of early predictors on trajectory, as well as the influence of trajectory and early predictors

879 on the outcome. For these analyses, we retained those 14 early predictors that either had a  
880 significant unadjusted effect on trajectory membership (Table 5) or had a significant effect  
881 on any of the four distal outcomes after adjusting for all other predictors in separate multi-  
882 predictor models. Paternal education, young father, maternal and paternal sensitivity, and  
883 maternal and paternal positive parenting did not have a significant overall effect on  
884 trajectory (unadjusted) or any of the Grade 2 outcomes (adjusted for other predictors) and  
885 were not included in the fully adjusted models. We did not allow significant predictor effects  
886 to be in the opposite direction of effects in the unadjusted results. This occurred for the  
887 effect of paternal depression and anxiety on academic competence (unadjusted  
888 standardized regression coefficient -0.002 [N.S.]; freely estimated fully adjusted  
889 standardized regression coefficient 0.139 [ $p=.018$ ]); the final fully adjusted model for this  
890 outcome was thus re-estimated with the effect of this predictor fixed to zero. The findings  
891 are shown in Table 7.

892 Table 7. Fully adjusted overall prediction effects of early predictors on trajectory and outcomes, and of trajectory on outcomes.

Predictor	Prediction to trajectory <sup>a</sup>			Prediction to Grade 2 outcomes <sup>b</sup>			
	$\chi^2$	<i>p</i>	Pseudo <i>R</i> <sup>a</sup>	Externalizing	Internalizing	Academic competence	Social skills
Maternal education	8.2	.417	.08	-.07	-.04	.18***	.10**
Young mother	5.2	.732	.07	.04	.04	.08	-.01
Financial stress	5.5	.704	.07	.09*	.10*	-.07	-.09*
Couple relationship (reversed)	7.8	.453	.08	.03	.08*	-.02	.00
Single parent	12.4	.135	.10	.09*	.07	-.09*	-.07
Maternal depression & anxiety	10.9	.205	.10	.00	.02	-.02	.00
Paternal depression & anxiety	4.2	.834	.06	.03	.00	.00 <sup>c</sup>	-.09
Maternal harsh parenting	27.8	.001	.16***	.06	.00	-.10	-.05
Paternal harsh parenting	20.1	.010	.13**	.02	-.01	-.09	-.05
Child gender	49.2	<.001	.21***	.25***	.11**	-.10**	-.27***
Similar-aged sibling	90.3	<.001	.28***	-.06	-.06	.02	.06
Child activity level	15.2	.055	.12	.05	.06	.03	-.02

Predictor	Prediction to trajectory <sup>a</sup>			Prediction to Grade 2 outcomes <sup>b</sup>			
	$\chi^2$	<i>p</i>	Pseudo <i>R</i> <sup>a</sup>	Externalizing	Internalizing	Academic competence	Social skills
Child distress to limitations	10.7	.222	.10	-.10*	-.05	.01	.08*
Child soothability	11.5	.174	.10	.10*	.04	-.08*	-.10**
Trajectory <sup>d</sup>	--	--	--	.22***	.09	.16	.12

893 \**p*<.05 \*\**p*<.01 \*\*\**p*<.001.

894 <sup>a</sup>Comparisons are of a baseline model where all class discrimination effects of all early predictors are included to a reduced model where all the class  
895 discrimination effects for a single early predictor are zeroed out completely; prediction to trajectory membership is given as pseudo-*R* as the effect  
896 measure *w* derived from robust chi square. <sup>b</sup>Predictor-to-outcome associations are given as fully standardized regression coefficients. <sup>c</sup>The effect of  
897 paternal depression and anxiety changed signs from the unadjusted results and was fixed at 0. <sup>d</sup>Prediction of outcomes from trajectory membership is given  
898 as *R*, the square root of *R*<sup>2</sup> computed as the proportional reduction in total outcome variance represented by the residual within class variance, that is, *R*<sup>2</sup> =  
899 proportion explained variance = 1 - (residual variance/total variance).



900 In these adjusted models, the number and magnitude of significant effects, as  
901 expected, generally shrank relative to the unadjusted effects (Table 5), highlighting that  
902 these adjusted models identify the most proximal predictors of the trajectories and  
903 outcomes. Important but more distal influences that primarily work through the most  
904 proximal predictors will generally not be significant, except possibly in very large samples.

905 Significant adjusted overall predictors of trajectory included similar-aged sibling  
906 presence (the effect of which was stronger in the fully adjusted model than in unadjusted  
907 models, but which did not have a direct effect on any Grade 2 outcome), child gender  
908 (which also had direct effects on all Grade 2 outcomes), and maternal and paternal harsh  
909 parenting (with no direct effects on Grade 2 outcomes). The upper part of Table 8 displays  
910 fully adjusted trajectory prediction contrast coefficients. For the predictors with significant  
911 effects, the contrast patterns resembled those in the unadjusted results, although fewer  
912 contrasts reached significance. Out of the nine predictors without a significant overall effect,  
913 there were three for which the number of significant pairwise contrast tests clearly  
914 exceeded the chance expected number and suggested a difference involving one or a few  
915 categories in isolation after adjustment for competing predictors; these included maternal  
916 perceptions of poor relationship quality, child distress to limitations, and child soothability.  
917 As maternal perceptions of poor relationship quality went up, a child was significantly more  
918 likely to be in Trajectories 1, 3, or 6 compared to Trajectory 4. As distress to limitations went  
919 up, a child was significantly more likely to be in Trajectories 3, 5, or 6 compared to  
920 Trajectory 1. As soothability went up, a child was significantly more likely to be in  
921 Trajectories 1, 3, and 4 compared to Trajectory 8.

922 **Table 8. Trajectory predictor coefficient contrasts for fully adjusted effects of early predictors on trajectory and means comparison contrasts for fully**  
 923 **adjusted effects of trajectory on outcomes.**

Variable	Overall effect <sup>a</sup>	Trajectory								
		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Trajectory prediction coefficients with pairwise contrasts for effects of early predictors on trajectory <sup>b</sup>										
Maternal education	.08	0.00	0.09	0.10	-0.14	0.18	0.12	0.36	-0.13	-0.24
Young mother	.07	0.00	-0.05	0.16	0.18	0.08	-0.17	-0.14	0.18	-0.10
Financial stress	.07	0.00	-0.07	0.12	0.11	0.17	0.07	0.25	0.10	0.27
Couple relationship (reversed)	.08	0.00 <sup>4</sup>	-0.21	0.06 <sup>4</sup>	-0.40 <sup>136</sup>	0.05	0.17 <sup>4</sup>	-0.03	-0.13	0.07
Single parent	.10	0.00	-0.29 <sup>7</sup>	0.24	0.14	0.07	0.15	0.34 <sup>2</sup>	0.27	0.15
Maternal depression & anxiety	.10	0.00 <sup>79</sup>	0.27	0.34	0.24	0.15	0.19	0.51 <sup>1</sup>	0.41	0.71
Paternal depression & anxiety	.06	0.00	-0.10	-0.26	0.06	-0.13	-0.14	-0.17	0.03	-0.03
Maternal harsh parenting	.16***	0.00 <sup>38</sup>	-0.66 <sup>38</sup>	1.18 <sup>129</sup>	0.62	0.66	0.72	0.57	1.16 <sup>129</sup>	0.34
Paternal harsh parenting	.13**	0.00 <sup>3679</sup>	0.20 <sup>7</sup>	0.68 <sup>1</sup>	0.51	0.55	0.62 <sup>1</sup>	0.76 <sup>12</sup>	0.53	0.80 <sup>1</sup>
Child gender	.21***	0.00 <sup>2356789</sup>	0.64 <sup>1</sup>	0.53 <sup>1</sup>	0.39 <sup>79</sup>	0.70 <sup>1</sup>	0.80 <sup>1</sup>	1.04 <sup>14</sup>	0.69 <sup>1</sup>	1.04 <sup>14</sup>
Similar-aged sibling	.28***	0.00 <sup>356789</sup>	0.36 <sup>789</sup>	0.38 <sup>1789</sup>	0.25 <sup>789</sup>	0.59 <sup>1</sup>	0.49 <sup>1789</sup>	1.03 <sup>12346</sup>	0.97 <sup>12346</sup>	1.03 <sup>12346</sup>
Child activity level	.12	0.00	0.03	-0.26 <sup>8</sup>	0.12	0.12	-0.33 <sup>8</sup>	0.00	0.20 <sup>36</sup>	0.10

Variable	Overall	Trajectory								
	effect <sup>a</sup>	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
Child distress to limitations	.10	0.00 <sup>356</sup>	0.17	0.48 <sup>1</sup>	0.54	0.53 <sup>1</sup>	0.45 <sup>1</sup>	0.42	0.32	0.46
Child soothability	.10	0.00 <sup>8</sup>	-0.28	-0.05 <sup>8</sup>	0.02 <sup>8</sup>	-0.28	-0.21	0.03	-0.49 <sup>134</sup>	-0.07
Standardized means comparisons with pairwise contrasts for effects of trajectory on distal outcomes <sup>c</sup>										
Externalizing	.22***	0.00 <sup>23456789</sup>	0.33 <sup>17</sup>	0.35 <sup>17</sup>	0.40 <sup>1</sup>	0.47 <sup>1</sup>	0.62 <sup>1</sup>	0.88 <sup>123</sup>	0.52 <sup>1</sup>	0.53
Internalizing	.09	0.00	0.17	0.19	0.23	-0.02	0.14	0.16	0.29	0.35
Academic competence	.16	0.00 <sup>9</sup>	-0.31	-0.20 <sup>9</sup>	-0.02 <sup>9</sup>	0.07 <sup>9</sup>	-0.09 <sup>9</sup>	-0.22	-0.27	-0.84 <sup>456</sup>
Social skills	.12	0.00	-0.12	-0.13	-0.36	-0.32	-0.31	-0.27	-0.22	-0.55

924 \* $p < .05$  \*\* $p < .01$  \*\*\* $p < .001$  for overall effects.

925 <sup>a</sup>Pseudo- $R^2$  estimate with overall significance test from Table 7. <sup>b</sup>Trajectory prediction contrast coefficients are fully standardized logistic regression effects  
 926 on the log odds scale (the effect on the log odds of the class contrast for a change in the predictor of one standard deviation) given relative to membership  
 927 in Trajectory 1 (the "no aggression" trajectory). Coefficients were standardized by sample means (Table 2). Contrast coefficients between any pair of  
 928 trajectories can be derived by subtraction (i.e., for couple relationship [reversed] between Trajectories 6 and 4: 0.17- [-0.40]=0.57, which is significant at  
 929  $p < .05$  as indicated by superscripts). A contrast coefficient of 0.69 is equivalent to an odds ratio of 2.0, and a coefficient of -0.69 is equivalent to an odds

930 ratio of 0.5. <sup>c</sup>The entries are standardized mean differences relative to Trajectory 1. Contrast coefficients between any pair of trajectories can be derived by  
931 subtraction.

932 <sup>123456789</sup> Number superscripts indicate pairwise contrast tests significant at  $p < .05$  between the indexed trajectory and the trajectory with the superscripts'  
933 number; significant contrasts are superscripted for both involved trajectories. Contrast tests are not adjusted for mass significance; the chance expected  
934 number out of 36 pairwise contrasts at  $p < .05$  would be 1.8 per variable, or 3.6 numbered subscripts per table row, in the case of a null association between  
935 a predictor/outcome and the 9-trajectory solution. In the presence of a significant overall effect, contrast tests are offered as a guide to effect direction  
936 interpretation; in the absence of a significant overall effect, significant contrast tests should not be taken as implying an effect unless clearly exceeding the  
937 chance expected number (i.e., at least 3 significant contrasts) and suggesting a difference involving one or possibly a few isolated trajectories.

938 We can thus infer that the set of predictors that were significantly related to trajectory  
939 membership (either overall or for some trajectory contrasts) prior to adjustment, but not  
940 after, potentially have important *indirect* or *mediated effects* on trajectory membership.  
941 These predictors include paternal depression and anxiety, maternal education, financial  
942 stress, and young mother status. It is beyond this work's scope, however, to identify and  
943 quantify specific mediational pathways.

944 In the adjusted models, trajectory had a significant overall effect on externalizing ( $R^2$   
945 = 5.0%), but not on academic competence ( $R^2 = 2.6\%$ ), social skills ( $R^2 = 1.5\%$ ) or internalizing  
946 ( $R^2 = 0.8\%$ ). Adjustment for competing predictors eliminated the significant unadjusted  
947 overall effect of trajectory on academic competence and social skills. Out of the outcomes  
948 with no significant overall effect, the number of pairwise contrast tests exceeded the chance  
949 expected number for academic competence, suggesting a difference involving specifically  
950 Trajectory 9 (high-stable), which had the lowest mean, contrasting with Trajectories 1, 3, 4,  
951 5, and 6. Thus, after adjustment for early predictors, trajectory effects remained significant  
952 and important for externalizing (overall) and for academic competence (high-stable in  
953 isolation contrasting with five other trajectories), were eliminated for social skills, and  
954 remained unrelated to internalizing.

955 There were direct effects on one or more Grade 2 outcomes of several early  
956 predictors including child gender (effects on all 4 outcomes), financial stress (externalizing,  
957 internalizing, and social skills), maternal education (academic competence and social skills),  
958 single parent status (externalizing and academic competence), couple relationship  
959 (internalizing), child distress to limitations (three outcomes, all in unexpected direction), and  
960 soothability (two outcomes, both in unexpected direction).

## 961 Discussion

962 The current study extends previous research about the variation in normative  
963 development of physical aggression from infancy to preschool age, how this development  
964 matters for social, behavioral, and academic functioning in early school age, and the relative  
965 importance of early characteristics related to the child, the parents, and the family on the  
966 course and outcomes of aggression development. This is one of few studies extensively  
967 testing these longitudinal trajectories in comprehensive models unraveling the relative  
968 importance of children's developmental patterns of physical aggression for their subsequent  
969 behavior and functioning, and the only one to simultaneously considering the direct and  
970 indirect impact of a range of early risk and protective factors.

971 We found that nine latent trajectories represented the development of child physical  
972 aggression from 1 to 5 years in a Norwegian population-based sample. The developmental  
973 patterns could be characterized as *high-stable*, *variable-start and high endpoint*, *high-start*  
974 *and low-endpoint*, *medium-peak and low-endpoint*, and *low stable (no aggression)*,  
975 respectively (Figure 2). Before adjustment for competing early risk and protective factors,  
976 these trajectories had significant and moderate overall effects on externalizing, social skills,  
977 and academic competence in Grade 2, but not on internalizing ( $R^2$  of 7.4%, 3.7%, 3.6% and  
978 1.2%, respectively). Despite the moderate overall effect size, significant individual mean  
979 contrasts on outcomes among trajectory groups ranged from medium to very large effects.

980 The presence of a similar-aged sibling and child gender showed the strongest  
981 unadjusted association with trajectory membership. Whereas each trajectory described  
982 both boys and girls, gender differences manifested themselves in a larger proportion of girls  
983 in the no-aggression trajectory, and a larger proportion of boys in the high-stable and high-

984 endpoint trajectories. In this respect, our findings are in accordance with earlier trajectory-  
985 or group-based approaches [11] in suggesting that gender differences may result from more  
986 boys than girls making up the small group of children who continues to display aggression at  
987 high rates. The strongest and most consistent unadjusted predictors of Grade 2 outcomes  
988 were child gender, maternal and paternal educational level, single parent status, and  
989 financial stress.

990         In the fully adjusted model, which represents the most rigorous empirical test of  
991 these influences to date, the effects of the aggression trajectories on the outcomes  
992 simultaneously competed with those early predictors identified as having significant  
993 unadjusted effects on trajectory membership or significant adjusted effects on any outcome.  
994 While the significant direct effects were fewer and smaller, the ones remaining represent  
995 the most proximal predictors of physical aggression development and Grade 2 functioning.  
996 Trajectory membership had significant and important effects on teacher rated externalizing  
997 problems as well as on academic competence when the children were in their 8th year.  
998 Significant adjusted overall predictors of trajectory membership included the presence of a  
999 similar-aged sibling, child gender, and early maternal and paternal harsh parenting. Five  
1000 other predictors (i.e., child temperament, maternal depression and anxiety, maternal  
1001 perceptions of poor relationship quality, and single parent status) that fell short of an  
1002 overall significant effect still had at least one significant class contrast. In addition to indirect  
1003 effects through trajectory membership, child gender also had direct effects on all Grade 2  
1004 outcomes. Finally, paternal depression, maternal education, financial stress, and young  
1005 motherhood all had potential indirect or mediated effects on class membership, as these  
1006 predictors were significantly related to class membership *before* adjustment, but not *after*.

1007 In the following, we discuss the findings and the empirical contributions from our study in  
1008 more detail, focusing mainly on the adjusted results.

1009 In contrast to our 9 trajectories, the most comparable extant latent trajectory studies  
1010 have typically found three to five trajectories [2, 8, 10, 13, 17, 19, 21, 24, 25]. Compared to  
1011 existing studies, our study started early encompassing the period of peak change (at about 2  
1012 years), had frequent assessment (up to 21), used a vertically (age) scaled measurement  
1013 instrument, and utilized 4th order polynomial growth curves, all qualities that would tend to  
1014 increase significant distinctions among trajectories. The present study is indeed the only one  
1015 getting close to the recommendation made by Tremblay [1] of assessments at least every  
1016 two to three months from birth to 3 years, and ideally every 6 months from 3 years onward.  
1017 Overall, these differences provided the power to make finer distinctions and detect more  
1018 fine-grained developmental patterns of physical aggression.

1019 Even with the dissimilarities between our sample and findings and those from  
1020 previous studies, there are also important similarities. Like other research [15, 17, 21, 24, 25,  
1021 27], we identified one high-stable trajectory group (Trajectory 9) with the lowest prevalence  
1022 (3%) and poor outcomes (the most severe on academic competence and social skills; but not  
1023 on externalizing, although the difference between Trajectory 9 and the one with the poorest  
1024 externalizing outcome was not significant). The proportion of children belonging to the  
1025 typically identified high-stable trajectory, however, tends to vary across studies. For  
1026 instance, in accord with our findings, the SECCYD study [21] found a high-stable trajectory  
1027 group from 2 to 9 years constituting 3% of their sample (N=1195), having the poorest  
1028 academic and social functioning through age 12 [13]. Also, Wildeboer et al. [17] found a  
1029 high-increasing trajectory across 1.5, 3, and 6 years consisting of 3.2% of their sample  
1030 (N=4781). Moreover, Joussemet et al. [25] reported about a high trajectory group from



1031 kindergarten to sixth grade consisting of 6% of their sample (N=1508), whereas Tremblay et  
1032 al. [10] found that 13.9% of the sample (N=572), followed a rising trajectory of high physical  
1033 aggression from 17 to 42 months. Finally, Côté et al. [8] found that as much as 16.6% of  
1034 their large sample (N=10658) followed a high stable trajectory between 2 and 11 years.

1035 With respect to the lower end of the physical aggression spectrum, the SECCYD study  
1036 [21], found a very low trajectory describing 45% of the study children, and another 25%  
1037 described by a low group. In our sample, the *low-stable or no aggression* (1), *medium-peak*  
1038 *and low endpoint* (2,3), and *high-start and low-endpoint* (4,5), all with low aggression  
1039 endpoints at age 5, albeit with differing developmental patterns up to then, may  
1040 quantitatively (in all 64%) correspond to a couple of larger very-low or low aggression  
1041 trajectories like those identified in the SECCYD [21]. Such a comparison may be even more  
1042 reasonable considering that the SECCYD, like most previous research, did not start until 2  
1043 years, when physical aggression probably has begun to diminish among most children and  
1044 particularly those engaging in low levels or frequency of aggression.

1045 Our set of nine trajectories revealed more diversity in predictor-trajectory patterns  
1046 than a less fine-grained classification into fewer developmental patterns might have enabled.  
1047 That is, the somewhat complex solution offered a perspective that was differentiated  
1048 enough to view not only a few main developmental trends, but also to identify some more  
1049 subtle distinctions in developmental patterns and their relation to predictors that  
1050 supplemented and nuanced the main findings. Overall, all child characteristics (gender and  
1051 three temperament dimensions) predicted trajectory membership in the unadjusted results,  
1052 along with similar-aged siblings, maternal education, couple relationship, both parents'  
1053 depression and anxiety, and both parents' harsh parenting practices, generally in the  
1054 expected direction (Table 6). These effects were most clearly seen in significant predictor-

1055 coefficient contrasts between, on the one hand, the *low-stable or no aggression* trajectory  
1056 (1) and to a lesser extent the *medium-peak and low-endpoint* trajectory (2), and on the  
1057 other hand, the *high-stable* trajectory (9) and to a lesser extent the *variable-start and high-*  
1058 *endpoint* trajectories (6, 7, 8).

1059 Exploration of the finer distinctions in predictor-trajectory effect patterns may  
1060 provide some clues for what make children follow an intermediate-endpoint rather than a  
1061 stable-high trajectory. While the intermediate- and high endpoint Trajectories 6-9 shared  
1062 many predictors – notably, there were no significant trajectory prediction contrasts among  
1063 them for child gender, child distress to limitation, couple relationship, paternal depression  
1064 and anxiety, or paternal or maternal sensitivity – the predictor-trajectory contrasts seemed  
1065 to suggest some possibly important effect-pattern differences. High maternal, but low  
1066 paternal, harsh parenting (compared to Trajectory 9), low child soothability (compared to  
1067 Trajectories 9, 6, and 7) and high child activity level (like Trajectory 9 but unlike Trajectory 6)  
1068 was associated with a child being in Trajectory 8. This could suggest that Trajectory 8 was  
1069 somewhat more driven by child temperament and heated mother-child interactions, which  
1070 is in line with the established knowledge that children’s temperamental characteristics are  
1071 associated with the development of externalizing problems [72], and with the mentioned  
1072 differential susceptibility model postulating that children with difficult temperament are  
1073 more vulnerable to negative parenting behavior than those with easy temperament [47, 70,  
1074 73-75]. Moreover, the suggestion of a possible compensatory effect of father’s low harsh  
1075 parenting in a context with high maternal harsh parenting underscores the importance of  
1076 including fathers in developmental research. This is in accord with the family systems  
1077 perspective [107, 108] highlighting the need to consider how the behavior of both parents  
1078 jointly impact children’s socioemotional development. Also, higher maternal and paternal

1079 education (compared to Trajectories 9 and 8), and higher child soothability (compared to  
1080 Trajectory 8), was associated with membership in Trajectories 6 and 7. This may indicate  
1081 that parent resourcefulness and child self-regulation can function as protective factors  
1082 against the high-stable aggression pattern even in the presence of many other shared risk  
1083 factors. The association between self-regulation and externalizing is well-documented in the  
1084 literature [109-111], as is the link between socioeconomic status and parenting [112, 113].  
1085 Again, the results indicate that both maternal and paternal level of education matters for  
1086 development. In addition, Trajectory 6 membership was associated with low financial stress,  
1087 sibling absence, low infant activity level, and low maternal depression and anxiety  
1088 (compared to Trajectory 9 and for child activity also to Trajectory 8), suggesting several  
1089 other possible contributing factors that might elevate physical aggression.

1090 As regards the trajectory-outcome effect patterns, results from the unadjusted  
1091 models consistently suggested poorer outcomes on externalizing, social skills, and academic  
1092 competence associated with the higher level and endpoint Trajectories 6-9. Still, there was a  
1093 mean difference among these trajectories for academic competence only. In particular,  
1094 Trajectory 9 had significantly worse outcomes than Trajectories 6-8 (except for externalizing,  
1095 for which Trajectory 7 had the highest level), higher parental education predicting  
1096 Trajectory 6 and 7 memberships compared to 9 and 8 possibly suggesting a contributing  
1097 explanation.

1098 The prediction patterns for the two declining-aggression trajectories 4 and 5 may be  
1099 particularly interesting to note. More difficult child temperament (i.e., higher activity level,  
1100 more distress to limitations, and less soothability) compared to Trajectory 1, and one  
1101 parent's high sensitivity (mother's for Trajectory 5 and father's for Trajectory 4,  
1102 underscoring the importance of including both parents), predicted membership in these

1103 trajectories. This might suggest that parental sensitivity (and perhaps a good couple  
1104 relationship, in the case of the lower declining Trajectory 4) moderates or mitigates  
1105 physical-aggression development in children displaying difficult infant temperament, which  
1106 is in accord with the differential susceptibility model [47, 70, 73-75]. In line with this, high  
1107 infant activity level in combination with parental sensitivity to infant behavior may also  
1108 hypothetically be elements explaining the high starting point of parent-reported child  
1109 aggression in these trajectories.

1110         Of interest in an opposite manner might be pairs of trajectories for which the  
1111 prediction pattern seemingly had less to offer in terms of possible explanations for  
1112 differences in physical-aggression development. For instance, Trajectory 3 (low aggression,  
1113 with an early rise and moderate peak) shared some predictors with trajectories with  
1114 consistently higher aggression over time and was in fact indistinguishable from Trajectory 6  
1115 on any predictor and contrasted with Trajectory 7 only with respect to sibling absence. It is  
1116 tempting to hypothesize that groups of children whose development were described by  
1117 Trajectories 3, 6, and possibly 7, did not differ dramatically on critical predictors at the  
1118 outset, and that explanations outside the present set of predictors – perhaps involving time-  
1119 varying or intervening influences – must be sought for what differentiated these  
1120 developmental paths.

1121         Among predictors identified by previous research, neither being a single parent nor a  
1122 young mother was significantly related to trajectory. This is probably due to the low  
1123 proportion of single parents in our sample when the children were 1 year old, as well as the  
1124 low proportion of young mothers ( $\leq 25$  years), given the low prevalence of teenage mothers  
1125 in Norway and the high mean age for primiparous women (i.e., 30.1 years in 2021 [114]).  
1126 There were notably fewer statistically significant predictor-trajectory, trajectory-outcome,

1127 and predictor-outcome relationships in the *fully adjusted* set of results than in the  
1128 unadjusted. While the differences between these sets of results may seem dramatic, it is  
1129 crucial to acknowledge that the fully adjusted model, which is the benchmark test for  
1130 identifying the most proximal predictors, constituted a rigorous test of all possible  
1131 simultaneous effects. Importantly, net of all other effects, trajectory still predicted Grade 2  
1132 externalizing problems and academic competence. Within this context, it may be worth  
1133 noting that the high-stable trajectory specifically predicted to poor academic competence,  
1134 while the no-aggression trajectory was the one that contrasted most starkly to all other  
1135 groups with respect to externalizing problems.

1136 Our results both support and extend previous research in strongly suggesting that  
1137 early maternal and paternal harsh parenting practices, in addition to child gender and  
1138 similar-aged sibling presence, consistently predict physical-aggression development from 1  
1139 to 5 years. This is the first study applying a trajectory approach addressing developmental  
1140 patterns of physical aggression from infancy to preschool age to link early *paternal* harsh  
1141 parenting, as well as that of *maternal*, with this development. Previous research [8, 10, 14,  
1142 25] has not been able to explore this association due to lack of data on fathers parenting  
1143 behavior. The results from the current study underscore the significance of fathers' harsh  
1144 parenting behavior in infancy for children's subsequent development of physical aggression  
1145 and is in line with a limited but growing literature highlighting the significance of fathering  
1146 for children's and adolescents' development [58, 59, 64, 115].

1147 The importance of harsh parenting in predicting the development of children's  
1148 physical aggression corresponds with findings from previous research that has included this  
1149 process-oriented predictor albeit with mothers only [8, 10, 14, 25], and generally with the  
1150 mentioned theories of development of aggression and externalizing problems, particularly

1151 Patterson’s [53] coercion theory. In line with the established knowledge that parenting  
1152 behaviors typically associated with the development of externalizing behaviors tend to co-  
1153 appear with parental psychopathology [55-57], it is theoretically and empirically sound to  
1154 view the pattern of predictor-trajectory influences in our unadjusted and adjusted results in  
1155 a perspective where factors like parental depression and anxiety, couple relationship  
1156 troubles, and difficult child temperament do not in *themselves* produce an effect on  
1157 physical-aggression development, unless they are associated with an increase in harsh  
1158 maternal and paternal parenting behavior. At the same time, we would like to add that this  
1159 is in fact a bit of an over-simplification of all the predictor-trajectory results. As mentioned  
1160 earlier, there were some significant contrast patterns in the fully adjusted models for  
1161 predictors that did not have a significant overall adjusted effect (i.e., child distress to  
1162 limitations and soothability and maternal perceptions of poor relationship quality). These  
1163 effects tend to be notable in magnitude but limited in scope, that is, they affect only a few  
1164 classes or small classes.

1165 All in all, the fully adjusted findings add importantly to previous findings. The few  
1166 studies that have examined trajectory outcomes as well as predictors [14, 17, 21, 24]  
1167 included a more limited number of social risk variables as covariates in their final set of  
1168 analyses, and thus did not consider competing effects on trajectory and outcomes of the  
1169 *complete* set of predictors, as was done in the present study.

1170 As regards *predictor-outcome effects* in both sets of findings, it is noteworthy that  
1171 early financial stress had a consistent impact on three Grade 2 teacher-rated outcomes  
1172 (externalizing, internalizing, and social skills) in the fully adjusted model. This is even more  
1173 notable considering the crude measure we used (i.e., parents’ dichotomous reports of  
1174 having more long-standing financial difficulties in the past year [rent, mortgage, obligations,

1175 etc.]). Family financial stress when the child is about one year old may thus have long-lasting  
1176 (or continuing) effects on child social, behavioral, and academic functioning. Importantly  
1177 though, this effect may not relate specifically to the development of children’s physical  
1178 aggression (the predictor had no significant effect on *trajectory* in any set of findings). This  
1179 result highlights the well-established finding linking socioeconomic conditions to a range of  
1180 child behavioral outcomes [40, 42, 116, 117]. At the same time, some previous research has  
1181 found low family income to act as a risk factor for more frequent and stable use of physical  
1182 aggression across early childhood and adolescence [2, 8, 10]. We have no clear opinion as to  
1183 why our results do not replicate earlier findings on this point, but possible explanations  
1184 could be differences between countries/cultures with a smaller income range and a smaller  
1185 proportion of families in serious financial hardship in Scandinavia than in North America and  
1186 Canada, variations in age span, the use of financial stress as opposed to low family income  
1187 as an indicator of financial risk, and the crude nature of our measure.

1188 Another note concerning predictor-outcome effects concerns the two child  
1189 temperament variables of distress to limitations and soothability. While predicting  
1190 aggression trajectories as expected in the unadjusted results, these also predicted three  
1191 outcomes in the *unexpected direction* in the unadjusted and adjusted findings. We have no  
1192 strong and plausible hypothesis concerning these findings. Possible explanations include  
1193 interactional or transactional associations among child temperament, child behavior, and  
1194 parenting [72]. For example, that difficult temperament in a population-based and for some  
1195 part resourceful sample like the present might elicit child-parent behavior transactions  
1196 bolstering or mitigating the temperamental risk, which could eventually lead to better  
1197 outcomes for some children having difficult infant temperament, to the extent of producing  
1198 a paradoxical overall mean effect.

1199           Finally, the weak associations between observed parental sensitivity and aggression  
1200 trajectory, and the lack of association with Grade 2 outcomes, merit some attention, not  
1201 least considering that self-reported harsh parenting practices in response to undesirable  
1202 child behavior for mothers and fathers alike was one of the strongest predictors of  
1203 trajectory membership. As previously noted by Nordahl [94], null findings in the current  
1204 sample may partly relate to the fact that the parents overall displayed low levels of aversive  
1205 or negative parenting behaviors with their 1-year-olds during the interaction session. Thus,  
1206 limited variability in the observed parenting behavior may have contributed to the finding of  
1207 weak associations. For one thing, fathers from a population based (versus clinical) sample  
1208 may essentially engage in positive behavior during interaction with their infants, and  
1209 particularly when being observed. Moreover, the observed interactions were relatively short  
1210 in duration and the tasks were not designed to induce conflict or elicit negative or harsh  
1211 parenting behaviors. This made it less likely that parents would experience the session as  
1212 very challenging and/or that it would trigger much undesirable child behavior. Whereas  
1213 results from the NICHD SECCYD [21] indicated that less observed sensitive and involved  
1214 maternal parenting was associated with higher and more stable trajectories of physical  
1215 aggression from toddlerhood to middle childhood, that study had access to more  
1216 comprehensive observational data at several ages across infancy and third grade.

1217           This study has some notable strengths. We apply rigorous statistical tests using very  
1218 recent advances in latent class methodology of the early predictors and distal outcomes of  
1219 developmental trajectories of physical aggression, using a rich longitudinal data set. The  
1220 latent trajectory approach, among other things, also allows us to detect important effects  
1221 that are limited to only a few groups. The sample is relatively large and resembles the  
1222 general Norwegian population fairly well. The participation rate is furthermore high and the



1223 attrition for the most part low. We also include frequent reports on a relevant measure of  
1224 child physical aggression from both mothers and fathers, covering the developmental  
1225 periods when such behavior typically emerges, peaks, and decreases. Teachers, being  
1226 independent informants from a different setting, report the Grade 2 outcomes. Moreover,  
1227 our data set contains a comprehensive number of early predictors and all of those used in  
1228 previous research, including some with reports from both parents. The only relevant  
1229 predictor from other research that we were not able to include was parents' antisocial  
1230 behavior in their own youth, which was not measured in our sample. We also test all  
1231 possible predictor-outcome influences simultaneously. The strength of the fully adjusted set  
1232 of findings is that it highlights effects that stand out as proximal, strong and consistent  
1233 enough to withstand the competition with other possibly relevant associations. Particularly,  
1234 in contrast to previous sets of findings in which all links between the included early  
1235 predictors, the trajectories as well as the outcomes were not considered simultaneously,  
1236 trajectory-outcome associations are not overstated.

1237         The study is also limited in a few ways. Some of our predictors were quite  
1238 imperfectly measured. In particular, the estimated reliability of self-reported harsh and  
1239 positive parenting was less than desirable even when estimated by latent-variable models  
1240 that were not attenuated by floor and ceiling effects. Also, due to study design, only subsets  
1241 of fathers and mothers provided such self-reports at 1 year. Under such circumstances, null  
1242 findings (e.g., no trajectory or outcome prediction from positive parenting practices) are  
1243 uninformative, whereas significant results (e.g., significant prediction to trajectory and distal  
1244 outcomes from harsh parenting) signal true effects that are large enough to be detected  
1245 with the given sample, although attenuated and less precisely estimated. The findings from  
1246 sensitivity analyses showing that latent-variable constructs predicted trajectory just in the

1247 same way as the manifest variables further supported the unlikeliness that low predictor  
1248 reliability artefactually distorted these effects.

1249 As mentioned, there is evidence that individual differences in the early use of  
1250 physical aggression is associated with both social and genetic factors [33]; however, our  
1251 design did not permit the disentangling of genetic predispositions toward aggressive  
1252 behavior in children and parents. Moreover, in line with most others, we use parents as  
1253 informants about children’s aggressive behavior. Our design and analytical strategy, with a  
1254 range of predictors and outcomes and nine distinct developmental trajectories of physical  
1255 aggression, furthermore, reduced the possibility for investigating interaction effects among  
1256 predictors, or among predictors and trajectories in predicting outcomes. Possible interaction  
1257 effects worth studying include moderating effects of gender on predictor-trajectory,  
1258 trajectory-outcome, or predictor-outcome patterns, as well as interactions between  
1259 parenting and child gender and sibling status. For example, it is easy to imagine that sibling  
1260 squabbling could amplify harsh parenting. The choice to study a nine-trajectory model (in  
1261 the normative absence of a known true number of groups) also has consequences for what  
1262 results emerge as significant: A model with fewer trajectories, all other things being equal,  
1263 would have greater statistical power to detect predictor-trajectory or trajectory-outcome  
1264 associations. Of course, this holds only to the degree that the fewer trajectories still  
1265 captured the critical differences in development that mattered for those relationships.  
1266 Otherwise, fewer groups could obscure associations to the degree that the broader  
1267 trajectories encompassed subgroups with differing predictor or outcome patterns.

1268 Also related to analytical strategy, the merits of testing all influences in fully adjusted  
1269 models are obvious, but this approach also brings with it the limitation that the results are  
1270 dependent on the particular variable universe of the present study. The included predictors

1271 were all time-invariant in the analyses, measured only *prior to* or *at* the starting point for  
1272 the trajectory model. This precluded us from investigating the importance of time-varying  
1273 predictors or intermediate-timepoint predictors such as parental harsh parenting and  
1274 financial stress at later child ages for the subsequent development of physical aggression  
1275 and school-age outcomes. Then again, including such variables would have brought with it  
1276 even more complexity and have warranted more interpretive caution with respect to cause-  
1277 effect directions.

1278 *Sibling presence* merits a special note. We measured the presence of a similar-aged  
1279 sibling only at study start. This predictor, which constitutes one of the strongest and most  
1280 consistent predictors of physical aggression, is thus of having an *older* sibling. Our finding is  
1281 in line with those from other studies [10] exploring the links between older siblings and  
1282 aggression trajectories (but not with outcomes). A fair proportion of the children we studied,  
1283 however, acquired younger siblings as the study progressed, and any influences of the  
1284 presence of younger siblings is unmeasured in our study. The overall predictive effect of  
1285 sibling presence may thus potentially have been underestimated.

1286 As regards outcomes, we studied each outcome in isolation, not addressing possible  
1287 comorbidity or overlap. However, physical aggression trajectories may well predict  
1288 specifically to certain multivariate outcome configurations or profiles (e.g., predictors of a  
1289 multi-problem outcome profile might be different from what precedes isolated problematic  
1290 outcomes).

1291 Future research should focus on the potentially intricate interplay of predictors,  
1292 including gender-moderating effects and relevant interaction effects among predictors (e.g.,  
1293 of parental depression, harsh parenting, child gender and number of siblings). This should  
1294 also include the study of time-varying predictors (e.g., of financial or other stress across the

1295 developmental period, or of language and motor development in tandem with aggressive-  
1296 behavior development), and predictors that may have an influence at a particular time or  
1297 age (e.g., transition to day-care or to school). Research should also address trajectory and  
1298 predictor effects on profiles of outcomes rather than single outcomes in isolation.

1299         Understanding common and less common developmental patterns of physical  
1300 aggression, the link with subsequent social, behavioral, and academic functioning, and  
1301 markers for the various patterns, is crucial for early prevention and intervention efforts. The  
1302 results from our study confirm and expand previous research in underscoring the  
1303 importance of addressing harsh parenting behavior to influence the developmental  
1304 pathways of physical aggression during infancy and toddlerhood. Our findings also support  
1305 the notion that fathers matter and must be included both in research and early prevention  
1306 and intervention efforts.

1307

### 1308         **Acknowledgements**

1309         We are very grateful to the participating families and to the research assistants who  
1310 contributed to the data collection. We thank Elisabeth Askeland and Anett Apeland for their  
1311 contribution to the development of the physical aggression measure.

## 1312 **References**

- 1313 1. Tremblay RE. The development of aggressive behavior during childhood: What have  
1314 we learned in the past century? *International Journal of Behavioral Development*.  
1315 2000;24(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/016502500383232>
- 1316 2. Teymoori A, Côté S, Jones B, Nagin, D, Boivin, M, Vitaro F, et al. Risk factors  
1317 associated with boys' and girls' developmental trajectories of physical aggression  
1318 from early childhood through early adolescence. *JAMA network open*. 2018;1(8),  
1319 Article e186364. <https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2018.6364>
- 1320 3. Alink LRA, Mesman J, Van Zeijl J, Stolk MN, Juffer F, Koot, HM, et al. The early  
1321 childhood aggression curve: Development of physical aggression in 10- to 50-month-  
1322 old children. *Child Development*. 2006;77(4), 954–966. [https://doi.org/10.1111 /](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2006.00912.x)  
1323 [j.1467-8624.2006.00912.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2006.00912.x)
- 1324 4. Lorber MF, Del Vecchio T, Slep AMS. The development of individual physically  
1325 aggressive behaviors from infancy to toddlerhood. *Developmental Psychology*. 2018;  
1326 54(4), 601-612. <https://doi.org/10.1037/dev0000450>
- 1327 5. Hay DF. The early development of human aggression. *Child Development*  
1328 *Perspectives*. 2017;11(2), 102-106. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdep.12220>
- 1329 6. Lorber MF, Del Vecchio T, Slep AMS. The emergence and evolution of infant  
1330 externalizing behavior. *Development and Psychopathology*. 2015;27(3), 663-680.  
1331 <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0954579414000923>
- 1332 7. Lorber MF, Del Vecchio T, Slep AM, Scholer SJ. Normative trends in physically  
1333 aggressive behavior: Age-aggression curves from 6 to 24 months. *The Journal of*  
1334 *Pediatrics*. 2019;206, 197-203. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpeds.2018.10.025>

- 1335 8. Côté SM, Vaillancourt T, LeBlanc JC, Nagin DS, Tremblay RE. The development of  
1336 physical aggression from toddlerhood to pre-adolescence: A nationwide longitudinal  
1337 study of Canadian children. *Journal of Abnormal Child Psychology*. 2006;34(1), 68–82.  
1338 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10802-005-9001-z>
- 1339 9. Nærde A, Ogden T, Janson H, Zachrisson HD. Normative development of physical  
1340 aggression from 8 to 26 months. *Developmental Psychology*. 2014;50(6), 1710–1720.  
1341 <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0036324>
- 1342 10. Tremblay RE, Nagin DS, Séguin JR, Zoccolillo M, Zelazo PD, Boivin M, et al. Physical  
1343 aggression during early childhood: Trajectories and predictors. *Pediatrics*. 2004;  
1344 114(1), 43–50. <https://doi.org/10.1542/peds.114.1.e4>
- 1345 11. Baillargeon RH, Zoccolillo M, Keenan K, Côté S, Pérusse D, Wu HX, et al. Gender  
1346 differences in physical aggression: A prospective population-based survey of children  
1347 before and after 2 years of age. *Developmental Psychology*. 2007;43(1), 13-26.  
1348 <https://doi.org/10.1037/0012-1649.43.1.13>
- 1349 12. Broidy LM, Nagin DS, Tremblay RE, Bates J, Brame B, Dodge KA, et al. Developmental  
1350 trajectories of childhood disruptive behaviors and adolescent delinquency: A six-site,  
1351 cross-national study. *Developmental Psychology*. 2003;39(2), 222–245.  
1352 <https://doi.org/10.1037/0012-1649.39.2.222>
- 1353 13. Campbell SB, Spieker S, Burchinal M, Poe MD, The NICHD Early Child Care Research  
1354 Network. Trajectories of aggression from toddlerhood to age 9 predict academic and  
1355 social functioning through age 12. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*. 2006;  
1356 47(8), 791–800. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7610.2006.01636.x>
- 1357 14. Campbell SB, Spieker S, Vandergrift N, Belsky J, Burchinal M, The NICHD Early Child  
1358 Care Research Network. Predictors and sequelae of trajectories of physical

- 1359 aggression in school-age boys and girls. *Development and Psychopathology*. 2010;  
1360 22(1), 133–150. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0954579409990319>
- 1361 15. Fontaine N, Carbonnea R, Barker ED, Vitaro F, Hébert M, Côté SM, et al. Girls'  
1362 hyperactivity and physical aggression during childhood and adjustment problems in  
1363 early adulthood: A 15-year longitudinal study. *Archives of General Psychiatry*.  
1364 2008;65(3), 320-328. <https://doi.org/10.1001/archgenpsychiatry.2007.41>
- 1365 16. Nagin D, Tremblay RE. Trajectories of boys' physical aggression, opposition, and  
1366 hyperactivity on the path to physically violent and nonviolent juvenile delinquency.  
1367 *Child Development*. 1999;70(5), 1181–1196. [https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-](https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8624.00086)  
1368 8624.00086
- 1369 17. Wildeboer A, Thijssen S, Van IJzendoorn MH, Van Der Ende J, Jaddoe VW, Verhulst FC,  
1370 et al. Early childhood aggression trajectories: Associations with teacher-reported  
1371 problem behaviour. *International Journal of Behavioral Development*. 2015;39(3),  
1372 221-234. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0165025414562239>
- 1373 18. Tremblay RE, Japel CJ, Perusse D, Mcduff P, Boivin M, Zoccolillo M, et al. The search  
1374 for the age of "onset" of physical aggression: Rousseau and Bandura revisited.  
1375 *Criminal Behaviour and Mental Health*. 1999;9(1), 8–23.  
1376 <https://doi.org/10.1002/cbm.288>
- 1377 19. Côté SM, Vaillancourt T, Barker ED, Nagin D, Tremblay RE. The joint development of  
1378 physical and indirect aggression: Predictors of continuity and change during  
1379 childhood. *Development and psychopathology*. 2007;19(1), 37-55. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0954579407070034)  
1380 10.1017/S0954579407070034
- 1381 20. Côté SM, Boivin M, Nagin DS, Japel C, Xu Q, Zoccolillo M, et al. The role of maternal  
1382 education and nonmaternal care services in the prevention of children's physical

- 1383 aggression problems. Archives of General Psychiatry. 2007;64(11), 1305-1312.
- 1384 doi:10.1001/archpsyc.64.11.1305
- 1385 21. NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. Trajectories of physical aggression from  
1386 toddlerhood to middle childhood: Predictors, correlates and outcomes. Monographs  
1387 of the Society for Research in Child Development. 2004;69(4), vii-129.  
1388 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0037-976x.2004.00312.x>
- 1389 22. Jennings WG, Reingle JM. On the number and shape of developmental/life-course  
1390 violence, aggression, and delinquency trajectories: A state-of-the-art review. Journal  
1391 of Criminal Justice. 2012; 40(6), 472-489. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcrimjus.2012.07.001)  
1392 2012.07.001
- 1393 23. Archer J, Côté S. Sex differences in aggressive behavior: a developmental and  
1394 evolutionary perspective. In: Tremblay RE, Hartup WW, Archer J, editors.  
1395 Developmental Origins of Aggression. New York: Guilford Press; 2005. p. 425–43.
- 1396 24. Jambon M, Madigan S, Plamondon A, Jenkins J. Developmental trajectories of  
1397 physical aggression and prosocial behavior in early childhood: Family antecedents  
1398 and psychological correlates. Developmental Psychology. 2019;55(6), 1211-1225.  
1399 <https://doi.org/10.1037/dev0000714>
- 1400 25. Joussemet M, Vitaro F, Barker ED, Côté S, Nagin DS, Zoccolillo M, Tremblay RE.  
1401 Controlling parenting and physical aggression during elementary school. Child  
1402 Development. 2008; 79(2), 411-425. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2007.01133.x)  
1403 8624.2007.01133.x
- 1404 26. Nagin DS, Tremblay RE. Parental and early childhood predictors of persistent physical  
1405 aggression in boys from kindergarten to high school. Archives of General psychiatry.  
1406 2001; 58(4), 389-394. doi:10.1001/archpsyc.58.4.389



- 1407 27. van Adrichem DS, Huijbregts SC, van der Heijden KB, Van Goozen SH, Swaab H. The  
1408 role of inhibitory control, attention and vocabulary in physical aggression trajectories  
1409 from infancy to toddlerhood. *Frontiers in Psychology*. 2020; 11, 1079. [https://doi.org](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.01079)  
1410 [/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.01079](https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.01079)
- 1411 28. Orri M, Boivin M, Chen C, Ahun MN, Geoffroy MC, Ouellet-Morin I, et al. Cohort  
1412 profile: Quebec longitudinal study of child development (QLSCD). *Social Psychiatry*  
1413 *and Psychiatric Epidemiology*. 2021; 56(5), 883-894. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s00127-](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00127-020-01972-z)  
1414 [020-01972-z](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00127-020-01972-z)
- 1415 29. Hay DF, Waters CS, Perra O, Swift N, Jones R, Jones I, et al. Precursors to aggressive  
1416 conduct problems are evident by six months of age. *Developmental Science*. 2014;  
1417 17(3), 471–480. doi:10.1111/desc.12133
- 1418 30. Brendgen M, Dionne G, Girard A, Boivin M, Vitaro F, Pérusse D. Examining genetic  
1419 and environmental effects on social aggression: A study of 6-year-old twins. *Child*  
1420 *Development*. 2005; 76(4), 930-946. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2005.00887.x)  
1421 [8624.2005.00887.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2005.00887.x)
- 1422 31. Dionne G, Tremblay R, Boivin M, Laplante D, Pérusse D. Physical aggression and  
1423 expressive vocabulary in 19-month-old twins. *Developmental Psychology*. 2003;  
1424 39(2), 261–273. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0012-1649.39.2.261>
- 1425 32. Provençal N, Booij L, Tremblay RE. The developmental origins of chronic physical  
1426 aggression: biological pathways triggered by early life adversity. *Journal of*  
1427 *Experimental Biology*. 2015;218(1), 123-133. doi:10.1242/jeb.111401
- 1428 33. Tremblay RE, Vitaro F, Côté SM. Developmental origins of chronic physical aggression:  
1429 a bio-psycho-social model for the next generation of preventive interventions.

- 1430 Annual Review of Psychology. 2018;69(1), 383-407. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469->  
1431 7610.2010.02211.x
- 1432 34. Tremblay RE. Developmental origins of chronic physical aggression: An international  
1433 perspective on using singletons, twins and epigenetics. European Journal of  
1434 Criminology. 2015;12(5), 551-561. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1477370815600617>
- 1435 35. Brumley LD, Jaffee SR. Defining and distinguishing promotive and protective effects  
1436 for childhood externalizing psychopathology: a systematic review. Social Psychiatry  
1437 and Psychiatric Epidemiology. 2016;51(6), 803-815. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00127->  
1438 016-1228-1
- 1439 36. Bronfenbrenner U. The ecology of human development: Experiments by nature and  
1440 design. Harvard university press, 1979
- 1441 37. Labella MH, Masten AS. Family influences on the development of aggression and  
1442 violence. Current Opinion in Psychology. 2018;19, 11-16. <https://doi.org/10.1016>  
1443 [/j.copsyc.2017.03.028](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2017.03.028)
- 1444 38. Huijbregts SC, Seguin JR, Zoccolillo M, Boivin M, Tremblay RE. Maternal prenatal  
1445 smoking, parental antisocial behavior, and early childhood physical aggression.  
1446 Development and Psychopathology. 2008;20(2), 437-453. DOI: <https://doi.org>  
1447 [/10.1017/S0954579408000217](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0954579408000217)
- 1448 39. Kinge JM, Øverland S, Flatø M, Dieleman J, Røgeberg O, Magnus MC, et al. Parental  
1449 income and mental disorders in children and adolescents: prospective register-based  
1450 study. International Journal of Epidemiology. 2021;50(5), 1615-1627. doi: 10.1093/ije  
1451 [/dyab066](https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dyab066)
- 1452 40. Peverill M, Dirks MA, Narvaja T, Herts KL, Comer JS, McLaughlin KA. Socioeconomic  
1453 status and child psychopathology in the United States: A meta-analysis of

- 1454 population-based studies. *Clinical Psychology Review*. 2021;83, 101933.
- 1455 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpr.2020.101933>
- 1456 41. Conger RD, Ge X, Elder Jr GH, Lorenz FO, Simons RL. Economic stress, coercive family  
1457 process, and developmental problems of adolescents. *Child Development*. 1994;  
1458 65(2), 541-561. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.1994.tb00768.x>
- 1459 42. Conger RD, Conger KJ, Martin MJ. Socioeconomic status, family processes, and  
1460 individual development. *Journal of Marriage and Family*. 2010;72(3), 685-704.  
1461 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1741-3737.2010.00725.x>
- 1462 43. Masarik AS, Conger RD. Stress and child development: A review of the Family Stress  
1463 Model. *Current Opinion in Psychology*. 2017;13, 85-90. [https://doi.org/10.1016/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2016.05.008)  
1464 [j.copsyc.2016.05.008](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copsyc.2016.05.008)
- 1465 44. Mazza JR, Pingault JB, Booij L, Boivin M, Tremblay R, Lambert J, et al. Poverty and  
1466 behavior problems during early childhood: The mediating role of maternal  
1467 depression symptoms and parenting. *International Journal of Behavioral*  
1468 *Development*. 2017;41(6), 670-680. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0165025416657615>
- 1469 45. Dunn J, Munn P. Sibling quarrels and maternal intervention: Individual differences in  
1470 understanding and aggression. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry*. 1986;  
1471 27(5), 583-595. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7610.1986.tb00184.x>
- 1472 46. Garcia MM, Shaw DS, Winslow EB, Yaggi KE. Destructive sibling conflict and the  
1473 development of conduct problems in young boys. *Developmental Psychology*. 2000;  
1474 36(1), 44–53. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0012-1649.36.1.44>
- 1475 47. Mesman J, Stoel R, Bakermans-Kranenburg MJ, van IJzendoorn MH, Juffer F, Koot  
1476 HM, et al. Predicting growth curves of early childhood externalizing problems:  
1477 Differential susceptibility of children with difficult temperament. *Journal of*

- 1478 Abnormal Child Psychology. 2009;37(5), 625-636. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10802->  
1479 009-9298-0
- 1480 48. Olson SL, Ip KI, Gonzalez R, Beyers-Carlson EE, Volling, BL. Development of  
1481 externalizing symptoms across the toddler period: The critical role of older siblings.  
1482 Journal of Family Psychology. 2020;34(2), 165-174. <https://doi.org/10.1037/>  
1483 fam0000581
- 1484 49. Patterson GR. Siblings: Fellow travelers in coercive family processes. In: Blanchard RJ,  
1485 editor. Advances in the study of aggression New York: Academic Press; 1984. p. 174-  
1486 213.
- 1487 50. Patterson G. R. The contribution of siblings to training for fighting: A microsocial  
1488 analysis. In: Olweus D, Block J, Radke-Yarrow M, editors. Development of antisocial  
1489 and prosocial behavior: Research, theories, and issues. Orlando, Florida: Academic;  
1490 1986, p. 235–261.
- 1491 51. Caspi, J. Sibling aggression: Assessment and treatment. New York, NY: Springer; 2012.
- 1492 52. Eriksen S, Jensen V. A push or a punch: Distinguishing the severity of sibling violence.  
1493 Journal of Interpersonal Violence. 2009; 24(1), 183-208. <https://doi.org/10.1177/>  
1494 0886260508316298
- 1495 53. Patterson GR. The early development of coercive family processes. In: Reid JB,  
1496 Patterson GR, Snyder J, editors. Antisocial behavior in children and adolescents: A  
1497 developmental analysis and model for intervention. American Psychological  
1498 Association; 2002. p. 25–44.
- 1499 54. Shaw DS, Winslow EB, Owens EB, Vondra JI, Cohn JF, Bell RQ. The development of  
1500 early externalizing problems among children from low-income families: A

- 1501 transformational perspective. *Journal of Abnormal Child Psychology*. 1998;26(2), 95-  
1502 107. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1022665704584>
- 1503 55. Goodman SH, Rouse MH, Connell AM, Broth MR, Hall CM, Heyward D. Maternal  
1504 depression and child psychopathology: A meta-analytic review. *Clinical Child and*  
1505 *Family Psychology Review*. 2011;14(1), 1–27. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s10567-010-](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10567-010-0080-1)  
1506 0080-1
- 1507 56. Wilson S, Durbin CE. Effects of paternal depression on fathers’ parenting behaviors:  
1508 A meta-analytic review. *Clinical Psychology Review*. 2010;30(2), 167-180.  
1509 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpr.2009.10.007>
- 1510 57. Cheung K, Theule J. Paternal depressive symptoms and parenting behaviors: An  
1511 updated meta-analysis. *Journal of Child and Family Studies*. 2019;28(3), 613-626.  
1512 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10826-018-01316-1>
- 1513 58. Yang, P, Schlomer GL, Lippold MA. Mothering versus fathering? Positive parenting  
1514 versus negative parenting? Their relative importance in predicting adolescent  
1515 aggressive behavior: A longitudinal comparison. *Developmental psychology*. 2022;  
1516 59(1), 69-83. <https://doi.org/10.1037/dev0001442>.
- 1517 59. Cabrera NJ, Volling BL, Barr R. Fathers are parents, too! Widening the lens on  
1518 parenting for children’s development. *Child Development Perspectives*. 2018;12(3),  
1519 152-157. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdep.12275>
- 1520 60. Cabrera NJ. Father involvement, father-child relationship, and attachment in the  
1521 early years. *Attachment & Human development*. 2020;22(1), 134-138. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1080/14616734.2019.1589070)  
1522 [org/10.1080/14616734.2019.1589070](https://doi.org/10.1080/14616734.2019.1589070)
- 1523

- 1524 61. Haas LL, Hwang CP. Fatherhood and social policy in Scandinavia. In: Shwalb DW,  
1525 Shwalb BJ, Lamb ME, editors. Fathers in cultural contexts. New York, NY: Routledge;  
1526 2013. p. 303–331.
- 1527 62. Rege M, Solli IF. The impact of paternity leave on long-term father involvement.  
1528 CESifo Working Paper Series No. 3130. 2010. Available at SSRN:  
1529 <https://ssrn.com/abstract=1649344>
- 1530 63. Sullivan O, Coltrane S, McAnnally L, Altintas E. Father-friendly policies and time-use  
1531 data in a cross-national context: Potential and prospects for future research. The  
1532 Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, 2009; 624(1), 234–  
1533 254. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716209335138>
- 1534 64. Rodrigues M, Sokolovic N, Madigan S, Luo Y, Silva V, Misra S. et al. Paternal  
1535 sensitivity and children’s cognitive and socioemotional outcomes: A meta-analytic  
1536 review. Child Development. 2021;92(2), 554-577. [https://doi.org/10.1111/  
1537 cdev.13545](https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.13545)
- 1538 65. Card NA, Stucky BD, Sawalani GM, Little TD. Direct and indirect aggression during  
1539 childhood and adolescence: A meta-analytic review of gender differences,  
1540 intercorrelations, and relations to maladjustment. Child Development 2008;79(5),  
1541 1185–1229. [https://doi.org/10.1111 /j.1467-8624.2008.01184.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2008.01184.x)
- 1542 66. Hay DF. The gradual emergence of sex differences in aggression: alternative  
1543 hypotheses. Psychological Medicine. 2007;37(11), 1527-1537. DOI: [https://doi.org  
1544 /10.1017/S0033291707000165](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0033291707000165)
- 1545 67. Hay DF, Nash A, Caplan M, Swartzentruber J, Ishikawa F, Vespo JE. The emergence of  
1546 gender differences in physical aggression in the context of conflict between young

- 1547 peers. *British Journal of Developmental Psychology*. 2011;29(2), 158–175.
- 1548 doi:10.1111/j.2044-835X.2011.02028.x
- 1549 68. Hay DF. The beginnings of aggression in infancy. In: Tremblay RE, Hartup WW, Archer
- 1550 J, editors. *Developmental origins of aggression*. New York: Guilford Press; 2005. p.
- 1551 107–132.
- 1552 69. Côté SM. Sex differences in physical and indirect aggression: A developmental
- 1553 perspective. *European Journal on Criminal Policy and Research*. 2007;13(3), 183-200.
- 1554 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10610-007-9046-3>
- 1555 70. van Zeijl J, Mesman J, Stolk MN, Alink LR, Van IJzendoorn MH, Bakermans-
- 1556 Kranenburg MJ, et al. Differential susceptibility to discipline: the moderating effect of
- 1557 child temperament on the association between maternal discipline and early
- 1558 childhood externalizing problems. *Journal of Family Psychology*. 2007;21(4), 626-636.
- 1559 <https://doi.org/10.1037/0893-3200.21.4.626>
- 1560 71. Vitaro F, Barker ED, Boivin M, Brendgen M, Tremblay RE. Do early difficult
- 1561 temperament and harsh parenting differentially predict reactive and proactive
- 1562 aggression? *Journal of Abnormal Child Psychology*. 2006;34(5), 681–691.
- 1563 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10802-006-9055-6>
- 1564 72. Slagt M, Dubas JS, Deković M, van Aken, MA. Differences in sensitivity to parenting
- 1565 depending on child temperament: A meta-analysis. *Psychological Bulletin*. 2016;
- 1566 142(10), 1068-1110. <https://doi.org/10.1037/bul0000061>
- 1567 73. Belsky J. Variation in susceptibility to environmental influence: An evolutionary
- 1568 argument. *Psychological Inquiry*. 1997;8(3), 182-186. DOI:
- 1569 10.1207/s15327965pli0803\_3

- 1570 74. Belsky J. Theory testing, effect-size evaluation, and differential susceptibility to  
1571 rearing influence: The case of mothering and attachment. *Child Development*. 1997;  
1572 68(4), 598-600. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.1997.tb04221.x>
- 1573 75. Belsky J, Hsieh KH, Crnic K. Mothering, fathering, and infant negativity as  
1574 antecedents of boys' externalizing problems and inhibition at age 3 years:  
1575 Differential susceptibility to rearing experience? *Development and Psychopathology*.  
1576 1998;10(2), 301-319. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S095457949800162X>
- 1577 76. Campbell SB, Shaw DS, Gilliom M. Early externalizing behavior problems: Toddlers  
1578 and preschoolers at risk for later maladjustment. *Development and Psychopathology*  
1579 2000; 12(3), 467– 488. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0954579400003114>
- 1580 77. Brame B, Nagin DS, Tremblay RE. Developmental trajectories of physical aggression  
1581 from school entry to late adolescence. *The Journal of Child Psychology and*  
1582 *Psychiatry and Allied Disciplines*. 2001;42(4), 503-512. DOI: [https://doi.org/10.1017/](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0021963001007120)  
1583 [S0021963001007120](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0021963001007120)
- 1584 78. Cleverley K, Szatmari P, Vaillancourt T, Boyle M, Lipman E. Developmental  
1585 trajectories of physical and indirect aggression from late childhood to adolescence:  
1586 Sex differences and outcomes in emerging adulthood. *Journal of the American*  
1587 *Academy of Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*. 2012;51(10), 1037-1051. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaac.2012.07.010)  
1588 [10.1016/j.jaac.2012.07.010](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaac.2012.07.010)
- 1589 79. Kokko K, Tremblay RE, Lacours, E, Nagin DS, Vitaro F. Trajectories of prosocial  
1590 behavior and physical aggression in middle childhood: Links to adolescent school  
1591 dropout and physical violence. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*. 2006;16(3), 403-  
1592 428. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1532-7795.2006.00500.x>



- 1593 80. Kokko K, Pulkkinen L, Huesmann LR, Dubow EF, Boxer P. Intensity of aggression in  
1594 childhood as a predictor of different forms of adult aggression: A two-country  
1595 (Finland and the United States) analysis. *Journal of Research on Adolescence*. 2009;  
1596 19(1), 9-34. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1532-7795.2009.00579.x>
- 1597 81. Reef J, Diamantopoulou S, van Meurs I, Verhulst F, van der Ende J. Predicting adult  
1598 emotional and behavioral problems from externalizing problem trajectories in a 24-  
1599 year longitudinal study. *European Child & Adolescent Psychiatry*. 2010;19(7), 577-  
1600 585. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00787-010-0088-6>
- 1601 82. Temcheff CE, Serbin LA, Martin-Storey A, Stack DM, Hodgins S, Ledingham J, et al.  
1602 Continuity and pathways from aggression in childhood to family violence in  
1603 adulthood: A 30-year longitudinal study. *Journal of Family Violence*. 2008;23(4), 231-  
1604 242. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10896-007-9147-2>
- 1605 83. Carbonneau R, Boivin M, Brendgen M, Nagin D, Tremblay RE. Comorbid development  
1606 of disruptive behaviors from age 1½ to 5 years in a population birth-cohort and  
1607 association with school adjustment in first grade. *Journal of Abnormal Child  
1608 Psychology*. 2016;44(4), 677-690. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10802-015-0072-1>
- 1609 84. Asparouhov T, Muthén B. Auxiliary variables in mixture modeling: Three-step  
1610 approaches using Mplus. *Structural Equation Modeling*. 2014;21(3), 329-341.  
1611 <https://doi.org/10.1080/10705511.2014.915181>
- 1612 85. Nærde A, Janson H, Ogden T. BONDS (The Behavior Outlook Norwegian  
1613 Developmental Study): A prospective longitudinal study of early development of  
1614 social competence and behavior problems. Oslo: The Norwegian Center for Child  
1615 Behavioral Development; 2014. Report. ISBN 978-82-93406-00-6.

- 1616 86. Bond TG, Fox CM. Applying the Rasch model: Fundamental measurement in the  
1617 human sciences (3rd ed.). Routledge; 2015.
- 1618 87. Linacre JM. Estimating Rasch measures with known polytomous (or rating scale) item  
1619 difficulties: Anchored Maximum Likelihood Estimation (AMLE). *Rasch Measurement*  
1620 *Transactions*. 1998;12(2), 638. <https://www.rasch.org/rmt/rmt122q.htm>
- 1621 88. Blum JS, Mehrabian A. Personality and temperament correlates of marital  
1622 satisfaction. *Journal of Personality*. 1999; 67(1), 93–125.
- 1623 89. Winokur A, Winokur DF, Rickels K, Cox DS. Symptoms of emotional distress in a  
1624 family planning service: Stability over a four-week period. *British Journal of*  
1625 *Psychiatry*. 1984;144(4), 395-399. <https://doi.org/10.1192/bjp.144.4.395>
- 1626 90. Tambs K, Moum T. How well can a few questionnaire items indicate anxiety and  
1627 depression? *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*. 1993;87(5), 364–367.  
1628 <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1600-0447.1993.tb03388.x>
- 1629 91. Aspland H, Gardner F. Observational measures of parent-child interaction: An  
1630 introductory review. *Child and Adolescent Mental Health*. 2003;8(3),136–143.  
1631 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/1475-3588.00061>
- 1632 92. Snyder J, Stoolmiller M, Wilson M, Yamamoto M. Child anger regulation, parental  
1633 responses to children’s anger displays, and early child antisocial behavior. *Social*  
1634 *Development*. 2003;12(3), 335–360. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/1467-9507.00237>
- 1635 93. Cox MJ, Crnic K. Qualitative ratings for parent–child interaction at 3–12 months of  
1636 age. Unpublished manuscript. Department of Psychology, University of North  
1637 Carolina at Chapel Hill; 2003.

- 1638 94. Nordahl KB. Early father-child interaction in a father-friendly context: Gender  
1639 differences, child outcomes, and predictive factors related to fathers' parenting  
1640 behaviors with one-year-olds [dissertation]. University of Bergen, Norway; 2014.
- 1641 95. Loeber R, Stouthamer-Loeber M, Van Kammen W, Farrington D. Initiation, escalation  
1642 and desistance in juvenile offending and their correlates. *Journal of Criminal Law and*  
1643 *Criminology*. 1991;82(1), 36-82.
- 1644 96. Thornberry T, Huizinga D, Loeber R. The prevention of serious delinquency and  
1645 violence: Implications from the Program of Research on the Causes and Correlates of  
1646 Delinquency. In: Howell J, Krisberg B, Hawking D, Wilson JD, editors. *Sourcebook on*  
1647 *serious, violent and chronic juvenile offenders* Sage; 1995. p. 213-327.
- 1648 97. Gartstein MA, Rothbart MK. Studying infant temperament via the Revised Infant  
1649 Behavior Questionnaire. *Infant Behavior & Development*. 2003;26(1), 64–86.  
1650 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0163-6383\(02\)00169-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0163-6383(02)00169-8)
- 1651 98. Rothbart MK. Measurement of temperament in infancy. *Child Development*. 1981;  
1652 52(2), 569-578. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1129176>
- 1653 99. Gresham FM, Elliott SN. *Social Skills Improvement System: Rating scales*.  
1654 Bloomington, MN: Pearson Assessments 2008.
- 1655 100. van Buuren S, Groothuis-Oudshoorn K. mice: Multivariate imputation by chained  
1656 equations in R. *Journal of Statistical Software*. 2011;45(3), 1-67.  
1657 <https://doi.org/10.18637/jss.v045.i03>
- 1658 101. Muthén B. Latent variable hybrids: Overview of old and new models. In: Hancock GR,  
1659 Samuelson KM, editors. *Advances in latent variable mixture models*. Charlotte, NC:  
1660 Information Age Publishing, Inc; 2008. p. 1-24.
- 1661

- 1662 102. Tofighi D, Enders CK. Identifying the correct number of classes in growth mixture  
1663 models. In: Hancock GR, Samuelsen KM, editors. Advances in latent variable mixture  
1664 models. Information Age Publishing 2008, pp. 317-341.
- 1665 103. Nagelkerke NJ. A note on a general definition of the coefficient of determination.  
1666 Biometrika. 1991;78(3), 691-692.
- 1667 104. Nylund K, Asparouhov T, Muthen BO. Deciding on the number of classes in latent  
1668 class analysis and growth mixture modeling: A Monte Carlo simulation study.  
1669 Structural Equation Modeling. 2007;14(4), 535–569. [https://doi.org/10.1080/  
1670 10705510701575396](https://doi.org/10.1080/10705510701575396)
- 1671 105. Dziak JJ, Lanza ST, Tan X. Effect size, statistical power and sample size requirements  
1672 for the bootstrap likelihood ratio test in latent class analysis. Structural Equation  
1673 Modeling. 2014; 21(4): 534–552. doi:10.1080/10705511.2014.919819.
- 1674 106. McLachlan G, Peel D. Finite Mixture Models. New York, NY: John Wiley and Sons Inc  
1675 2000.
- 1676 107. Cox MJ, Paley B. Families as systems. Annual Review of Psychology. 1997;48(1), 243–  
1677 267. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.psych.48.1.243>
- 1678 108. Kerr ME, Bowen M. Family evaluation: An approach based on Bowen theory. WW  
1679 Norton & Co 1988.
- 1680 109. Olson S, Lopez-Duran N, Lunkenheimer E, Chang H, Sameroff A. Individual differences  
1681 in the development of early peer aggression: Integrating contributions of self-  
1682 regulation, theory of mind, and parenting. Development and Psychopathology.  
1683 2011;23(1), 253-266. doi:10.1017/S095457941000077

- 1684 110. Spinrad TL, Eisenberg N, Gaertner B, Popp T, Smith CL, Kupfer A, et al. Relations of  
1685 maternal socialization and toddlers' effortful control to children's adjustment and  
1686 social competence. *Developmental psychology*. 2007; 43(5), 1170.
- 1687 111. Sulik MJ, Blair C, Mills-Koonce R, Berry D, Greenberg M. Early parenting and the  
1688 development of externalizing behavior problems: Longitudinal mediation through  
1689 children's executive function. *Child Development*. 2015;86(5), 1588–1603.  
1690 <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12386>
- 1691 112. Hoff E, Laursen B. Socioeconomic status and parenting. In: Bornstein MH, editor.  
1692 *Handbook of parenting. Volume 2: Biology and Ecology of Parenting*. Routledge 2019,  
1693 pp. 421-447.
- 1694 113. Shaw DS, Shelleby EC. Early-onset conduct problems: Intersection of conduct  
1695 problems and poverty. *Annual Review of Clinical Psychology*. 2014;10(503), 503-528.  
1696 doi: 10.1146/annurev-clinpsy-032813-153650
- 1697 114. Andersen E. Økt fruktbarhet for første gang på 12 år (Increased fertility for the first  
1698 time in 12 years). *Statistics Norway* 2022, March 9. Available from:  
1699 [https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/fodte-og-dode/statistikk/fodte/artikler/okt-](https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/fodte-og-dode/statistikk/fodte/artikler/okt-fruktbarhet-for-forste-gang-pa-12-ar)  
1700 [fruktbarhet-for-forste-gang-pa-12-ar](https://www.ssb.no/befolkning/fodte-og-dode/statistikk/fodte/artikler/okt-fruktbarhet-for-forste-gang-pa-12-ar)
- 1701 115. Bakermans-Kranenburg MJ, Lotz A, Alyousefi-van Dijk K, van IJzendoorn M. Birth of a  
1702 father: Fathering in the first 1,000 days. *Child Development Perspectives*. 2019; 13(4),  
1703 247-253. <https://doi.org/10.1111/cdep.12347>
- 1704 116. Leventhal T, Brooks-Gunn J. The neighborhoods they live in: The effects of  
1705 neighborhood residence on child and adolescent outcomes. *Psychological Bulletin*.  
1706 2000;126(2), 309. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.126.2.309>

- 1707 117. Poulain T, Vogel M, Kiess W. Review on the role of socioeconomic status in child  
1708 health and development. *Current Opinion in Pediatrics*. 2020; 32(2), 308-314.  
1709 [https://doi.org/ 10.1097/mop.0000000000000876](https://doi.org/10.1097/mop.0000000000000876)
- 1710 118. Karlberg P, Taranger J, Engström I, Klackenber-Larsson I, Lichtenstein H, Stensson J  
1711 et al. The development of children in a Swedish urban community: A prospective,  
1712 longitudinal study. *Acta Paediatrica*. 1968; 57(S187), 48-66. [https://doi.org/10.1111](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1651-2227.1968.tb06040.x)  
1713 [/j.1651-2227.1968.tb06040.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1651-2227.1968.tb06040.x)
- 1714 119. Patterson GR, Chamberlain P, Reid JB. A comparative evaluation of a parent-training  
1715 program. *Behavior Therapy*. 1982; 13(5), 638-650. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0005-](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0005-7894(82)80021-X)  
1716 [7894\(82\)80021-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0005-7894(82)80021-X)
- 1717 120. Singer JD, Willett JB. *Applied longitudinal data analysis: Modeling change and event*  
1718 *occurrence*. Oxford University Press; 2003. [https://doi.org/10.1093/](https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195152968.001.0001)  
1719 [acprof:oso/](https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195152968.001.0001)  
[9780195152968.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195152968.001.0001)
- 1720 121. Andrich D. *Rasch models for measurement*. Sage; 1988. [https://dx.doi.org/ 10.4135/](https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412985598)  
1721 [9781412985598](https://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781412985598).
- 1722 122. Olsen R, Garratt A, Iversen H, Bjertnaes O. Rasch analysis of the Psychiatric Out-  
1723 Patient Experiences Questionnaire (POPEQ). *BMC Health Services Research*. 2010; 10,  
1724 Article 282. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6963-10-282>
- 1725 123. Janson H, Bringedal, GE, Nærde A. A flowchart of participation and collected data  
1726 across 15 years of The Behavior Outlook Norwegian Developmental Study (BONDS).  
1727 Oslo, Norway: The Norwegian Center for Child Behavioral Development; 2023.  
1728 Report. [https://www.nubu.no/getfile.php /1323354-1687432522/ Filer/nubu.no](https://www.nubu.no/getfile.php/1323354-1687432522/Filer/nubu.no/Intranett/Dokumenter/Rapporter/2023%20Report%20BONDS%20Participation.pdf)  
1729 [/Intranett/Dokumenter/Rapporter/2023%20Report%20BONDS%20Participation.pdf](https://www.nubu.no/getfile.php/1323354-1687432522/Filer/nubu.no/Intranett/Dokumenter/Rapporter/2023%20Report%20BONDS%20Participation.pdf)
- 1730

## 1731 **Supporting information**

1732 **Supporting information A: Physical aggression measure**

1733 **SA1 Table. Physical aggression measure developed for the Behavior Outlook Norwegian**

1734 **Developmental Study.**

1735 **SA2 Table. Physical aggression item inclusion in data collections at ages 1-5 years in the**

1736 **Behavior Outlook Norwegian Developmental Study.**

1737 **Supporting information B: Scaling of the physical aggression measure**

1738 **SB1 Table. Final Rasch-model item scale value estimates at target ages.**

1739 **Supporting information C: Attrition**

1740 **SC1 Table. Descriptive data for predictors in the original sample, for children with any**

1741 **physical aggression data, and for children with Grade 2 outcome data.**

1742 **Supporting information D: Additional comparisons of 2-10 trajectory solutions.**

1743 **SD1 Table. Initial and final starts, replications of best loglikelihood, and final starts**

1744 **replications and converged for 2 to 10 trajectory models.**

1745 **SD2 Table. Bootstrap likelihood ratio tests for 2- to 9-trajectory solutions.**

1746 **SD Fig. Trajectory Plots for 2-9 Trajectory Solutions.**

1747 **Supporting information E: Details of the 9-trajectory solution.**

1748 **SE1 Table. Class counts and proportions for latent classes based on estimated posterior**

1749 **probabilities.**

1750 **SE2 Table. Estimated parameters with associated standard errors of trajectory parameters**

1751 **for the 9-trajectory solution.**

1752 **SE3 Table. Average latent class probabilities for the most likely latent class membership**

1753 **(row) by latent class (column).**

1754 **SE4 Table. Classification probabilities for the most likely latent class membership (column)**

1755 **by latent class (row).**





