Title: Genetically predicted 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels on Hypothyroidism: A two-sample Mendelian Randomization

Running title: Causal Relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D Levels and Hypothyroidism

Authors:

- 1. Mahdi Akbarzadeh; Ph.D., Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: akbarzadeh.ms@gmail.com
- 2. Sahand Tehrani Fateh; MD, School of Medicine, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: Sahh.tf@gmail.com
- 3. Aysan Moeinafshar, MD, School of Medicine, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: aysanmoeinafshar@gmail.com
- 4. Danial Habibi; Ph.D., Department of Biostatistics and Epidemiology, School of Health, and Student Research Committee, School of Health, Isfahan University of Medical Sciences, Isfahan, Iran. Email: dhabibi67@gmail.com
- 5. Amir Hossein Ghanooni; MD, Department of Endocrinology, School of Medicine, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: ircms@yahoo.com
- 6. Amir Hesam Saeidian; MD, Department of Surgery, Rasool-E Akram Hospital, School of Medicine, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: amirhesam_saeidian@yahoo.com
- 7. Parisa Riahi; MSc, Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: parisaariyahii@gmail.com
- 8. Maryam Zarkesh: Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: zarkesh@endocrine.ac.ir
- 9. Hossein Lanjanian; Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: hossein.lanjanian@gmail.com
- 10. Mina Jahangiri; Ph.D., Department of Biostatistics, Faculty of Medical Sciences, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran. Email: minajahangiri984@gmail.com
- 11. Maryam Moazzam-Jazi; Ph.D, Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: setareh227@gmail.com
- 12. Farshad Teymoori, Nutrition and Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti, Tehran, Iran. Email: teymoori.f68@gmail.com
- 13. Fereidoun Azizi; MD, Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: azizi@endocrine.ac.ir
- 14. Mehdi Hedayati; Ph.D., Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: hedayati47@gmail.com
- 15. Maryam Sadat Daneshpour; Ph.D., Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: daneshpour@sbmu.ac.ir

Corresponding author:

Maryam Sadat Daneshpour (Ph.D.), Associate Professor.

Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences. Email: daneshpour@sbmu.ac.ir

Tehran, Iran; PO Box: 19395-4763; Tel: +98(21)22432500; Fax: +98(21)22416264

Abstract:

Background: Alterations in levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D have been associated with the risk of thyroid disease. This study uses Mendelian randomization (MR) to infer the possible causal association of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D with hypothyroidism.

Methods: We performed two-sample MR using the summary statistics data from genome-wide association studies (GWAS) from populations with European ancestry to infer the causality of genetically controlled levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D on the risk of hypothyroidism, Hashimoto's thyroiditis, as well as biochemical parameters of thyroid diseases. The inverse-variance method (IVW) was used as the primary method to calculate the combined effect of all SNPs. Other methods were adopted to evaluate the stability and reliability of the results. Comprehensive sensitivity analyses were conducted to ensure that none of the MR analysis's primary assumptions were violated.

Results: The results of the IVW analysis revealed a significant causal association between higher levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and lower risk of hypothyroidism (beta = -0.197, 95% CI (-0.301, -0.093); SE = $0.053, P_{beta} = 2.256 \times 10^{-4}$) as well as increased levels of free T4 (beta = 0.204, 95% CI (0.305, 0.094); SE = $0.056, P_{beta} = 3.0506 \times 10^{-4}$). On the other hand, no significant causality was determined for higher levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D in association with Hashimoto's thyroiditis (beta=-0.047, 95% CI (-0.245, 0.151), p=0.641) and TSH levels (beta = -0.024, 95% CI (-0.099, -0.051); $P_{beta} = 0.524$).

Conclusion: The results of this two-sample MR study provide evidence supporting the potential of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D supplementation in reducing the risk of hypothyroidism.

Keywords: 25-Hydroxyvitamin D, Hypothyroidism, Genome-Wide Association Study Mendelian Randomization, Causality, Thyroid-stimulating hormone (TSH)

1 Introduction

Hypothyroidism is a condition characterized by increased serum levels of thyroid-stimulating 2 hormone (TSH), which can be accompanied by a reduction of free T4 (fT4) levels in cases of overt 3 hypothyroidism, in contrast to its normal levels in the subclinical condition (1). The prevalence of 4 5 the overt form of this condition has been estimated between 0-2% and 3-5% in the European populations, and higher prevalence has been reported among female sex, elderly (>65 years), and 6 Caucasian populations. In addition, hypothyroidism has been observed as a comorbidity of several 7 8 autoimmune diseases, including type 1 diabetes and celiac disease. On the contrary, cigarette 9 smoking and moderate levels of alcohol consumption have been considered protective factors 10 against hypothyroidism (2). Both iodine deficiency and excess, especially by consumption of 11 iodine-containing drugs and radioiodine treatment, can cause primary hypothyroidism, and iodine deficiency is the leading cause of this condition (3-7). The most common cause of hypothyroidism 12 13 in iodine-sufficient regions is Hashimoto thyroiditis (2). Central and peripheral hypothyroidism, associated with dysfunction of the pituitary/hypothalamus and deiodinase three enzymes, 14 respectively, are among the relatively rare causes of hypothyroidism (8, 9). 15

To date, a variety of genetic and environmental factors have shown a significant association with the incidence of autoimmune thyroid diseases. History of smoking, alcohol consumption, stress, infectious diseases, pharmacological agents, increased levels of iodine and selenium, and 25-Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency are among such environmental factors (10). 25-Hydroxyvitamin D is an important mediator of calcium and phosphorus homeostasis, which its role has also been implicated in a variety of systemic diseases, including diabetes, cardiovascular diseases, metabolic syndrome, and autoimmunity (11-13).

23 Many studies have shown a significant association between lower 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels, 24 hypothyroidism, and increased TSH levels. The association may, in turn, be due to the similarity 25 between the 25-Hydroxyvitamin D receptor (VDR) and the nuclear thyroid hormone receptors and 26 25-Hydroxyvitamin D's ability to regulate the secretion of TSH (14). 25-Hydroxyvitamin D has 27 also been identified as an immunomodulatory agent, and VDR is expressed in the majority of 28 immune cells, which is involved in the regulation of proliferation, differentiation, and 29 phagocytosis-related processes of these cell subsets in response to its ligand, 25-Hydroxyvitamin D (15). Several studies have shown that dysregulation in such inflammatory processes due to 25-30 Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency can be associated with the pathogenesis of Graves' disease and 31 Hashimoto's thyroiditis (16, 17). 32

The causal association between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and hypothyroidism has not been well investigated in the literature. A limited number of randomized controlled trials have been conducted on the effect of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D supplementation on biochemical characteristics of cases of hypothyroidism(14, 18). Due to the limitations of this type of study, an alternative approach can be used to assess such causal relationships.

Mendelian randomization (MR), as a beneficial and growingly favored epidemiological method, exploits genome-wide association (GWAS) summary statistics to infer causal relationships between specific exposure and outcome variables by using genetic variants as instrumental variables (IVs) without facing the limitations of randomized control trials and confounding variables of the observational studies (19).

In this study, as the first study of its kind, we have conducted an MR analysis based on the latest
GWAS findings worldwide, including more than 400k participants, to determine the causal
relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and hypothyroidism among the European population.

46 Method:

47 Study Design:

48 MR analysis was employed to investigate the causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D 49 levels in serum and hypothyroidism. Hypothyroidism as a general condition, Hashimoto's 50 thyroiditis as a type of autoimmune hypothyroidism, T4 and TSH as the markers of 51 hypothyroidism were assessed in this study.

52 The summary-level data for conducting MR analysis were obtained from the GWAS catalog 53 database, namely hypothyroidism (GCST90204167), Hashimoto's thyroiditis (GCST90018855), 54 and 25-Hydroxyvitamin D (GCST90000616). The summary-level data for TSH and fT4 was also 55 taken from the Thyroid Omics Consortium. The Details of summary-level data for each GWAS 56 are available in Table 1.

57 Assumptions of MR study:

In this study, three main assumptions are considered for MR analysis: 1) the SNPs selected as instrumental variables (IVs) should be strongly associated with the 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels; 2) the IVs must not have a relationship with the confounders of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and hypothyroidism association; and 3) the IVs should affect hypothyroidism merely through 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and do not have a direct association with hypothyroidism (20) (Figure 1). The validity of these assumptions should be tested in every MR analysis.

64 Selection of instrumental variables (IVs):

The two-sample MR was conducted using genetic data extracted from GWAS summary statistics. *TwoSampleMR* package in R was employed to integrate and analyze the data. SNPs associated with 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels in serum that passed the genome-wide significance threshold (P $< 5 \times 10-8$) were selected as IVs and then were clumped ($r^2 \le 0.001$; clumping window, 10,000 kb)

to ensure the independence of selected SNPs. We harmonized the summary data of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and hypothyroidism, Hashimoto's thyroiditis, fT4, and TSH to check whether alleles are genuinely aligned and also to exclude palindromic SNPs if they exist. The strength of each IV was assessed using the F-statistics ($F = R^2 \frac{N-2}{1-R^2}$, where $R^2 = 2 \times MAF \times \beta_{exp}^2$, and R^2 is the extracted SNPs' total variance, and N is the sample size) and IV with F-statistics lower than 10 were excluded.

75 Two-sample MR analysis:

The inverse variance-weighted (IVW) method was used as the primary method to calculate the 76 combined effect of all SNP s. A P-value below 0.0125 (0.05/4, 4 is the number of outcomes) was 77 considered statistically significant after the Bonferroni correction. Additionally, MR Egger, 78 79 Penalized MR-Egger, Robust MR-Egger, Penalized robust MR-Egger, Simple Median, Weighted 80 Median, Penalized Weighted Median, Simple Mode, Weighted Mode, Penalized IVW, Robust 81 IVW, Penalized robust IVW, MR Lasso, MR-cML, Debiased inverse-variance weighted, and mode-based estimation (MBE) method were adopted to evaluate the stability and reliability of 82 83 results (21). We conducted a comprehensive sensitivity analysis to ensure that none of the MR 84 analysis primary assumptions were violated. Two-sample MR is prone to heterogeneity due to differences in analysis platforms, populations, and experimental conditions. 85

Regarding heterogeneity, we used Cochran's Q statistic and the I² index for MR-inverse-variance 86 weighted analyses and Rucker's Q statistic for MR-Egger to detect heterogeneity (22, 23). Funnel 87 plot was also used to visualize the data and detect the outlier SNPs. Moreover, we used the MR-88 Egger method (by intercept tests) to evaluate horizontal pleiotropy (23). We also searched the 89 90 human phenotypic association database (phenoscanner gene V2) (http://www.phenoscanner.medschl.cam.ac.uk) and removed pleiotropic SNPs directly associated 91

with outcome or confounder variables. The Mendelian Randomization Pleiotropy RESidual Sum
and Outlier (MR-PRESSO) test was performed to detect possible outliers, correcting for horizontal
pleiotropy via outlier removal (24).

95 Cook's distance was used to diagnose and eliminate SNPs that strongly and falsely influenced the

96 fitted values of the model. SNPs detected as outliers and influential points were excluded for

- 97 further MR analysis. Leave-one-out and single SNP MR were used as sensitivity analyses (25).
- 98 All the statistical analyses were performed in R software 4.3.1 implemented in R Studio using

99 "TwoSampleMR", "MendelianRandomization", "MRPRESSO", and "mr.raps" packages (26, 27).

100 **Results:**

101 As shown in Figure 2, 16,012 SNPs passed the genome-wide significance threshold ($P < 5 \times 10^{-8}$)

102 in 25-Hydroxyvitamin D GWAS; after clumping those SNPs, 115 independent SNPs remained for

103 MR analysis. Those 115 SNPs were further used in the harmonization step for hypothyroidism.

Hashimoto's thyroiditis, fT4, and TSH as the outcomes. The process of MR analyses and the results are publicly available through the following HTML link:

106 https://akbarzadehms.github.io/VitDHypothyroidismMR/

107 The causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and hypothyroidism

After the harmonization step and removing palindromic SNPs, 90 SNPs were extracted. None of
the remained SNPs were detected as weak instruments (F>10). One SNP was found to be in HLA
genes and hence was excluded.

111 With 89 SNPs as IVs, according to the results of IVW, after adjustment, there was a nearly

- significant causal relationship between an increase in 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and a decrease
- 113 in hypothyroidism risk (beta = -0.131, 95% CI (-0.245, -0.017); SE = 0.058, P_{beta} = 0.023).
- 114 According to the pleiotropy test, there was no pleiotropy (MR–Egger intercept p value = 0.826);

115 however, the heterogeneity analysis found that there was heterogeneity in the analysis (the Q-p values of IVW and MR-Egger were 2.216×10^{-8} and 1.56×10^{-8} , respectively). In sensitivity 116 117 analysis, two, two, and eight SNPs were detected as outliers or influential observations using MR-118 PRESSO, leave-one-out sensitivity analysis, and Cook's distance, respectively, and were excluded stepwise. After excluding those SNPs, 77 remained IVs for further MR analysis (Supplementary 119 sheet 1). According to the results of IVW, there was a strongly significant causal relationship 120 121 between an increase in 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and a decrease in hypothyroidism risk (beta = -0.197, 95% CI (-0.301, -0.093); SE = 0.053, P_{beta} = 2.256×10^{-4}). Neither pleiotropy 122 123 (MR–Egger intercept p value = 0.229) nor heterogeneity (the Q-p values of IVW and MR–Egger 124 were 0.499 and 0.515, respectively) were detected in the analysis. Moreover, the P-values of the weighted median (beta = -0.214, 95% CI (-0.377, -0.051); P_{beta} = 9.937×10^{-3}), weighted mode 125 (beta = -0.266, 95% CI (-0.466, -0.066); P_{beta} = 0.011) and MR–Egger (beta = -0.319, 95% CI 126 127 (-0.540, -0.098); P_{beta} = 0.006) methods were all less than 0.0125. The results of other MR methods are depicted as a forest plot in Figures 3a, 4a. Single SNP sensitivity analysis, leave-one-128 129 out sensitivity analysis, and funnel plots are available in supplementary Figures 1a, 2a, 3a.

130 The causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and Hashimoto's thyroiditis

After the harmonization step and removing palindromic SNPs, 88 SNPs remained. None of the remaining SNPs were detected as weak instruments. One SNP was found to be in HLA genes and hence was excluded. With 87 SNPs as IVs, according to the results of IVW, there was no causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and Hashimoto's thyroiditis risk (beta = -0.047, 95% CI (-0.245, 0.151); SE = 0.101, P_{beta} = 0.641). According to the pleiotropy test, there was no pleiotropy (MR–Egger intercept p value = 0.331); however, the heterogeneity analysis found heterogeneity in the analysis (the Q-p values of IVW and MR–Egger were 0.023 and 0.024,

138 respectively). The sensitivity analysis excluded six SNPs detected as outliers or influential 139 observations using Cook's distance. In the MR analysis with 81 SNPs (Supplementary sheet 2) 140 using various MR methods, there was no significant causal relationship between gene-predicted 141 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and Hashimoto's thyroiditis after removing outlier SNPs. (The Pbeta values 142 in all analytical models were greater than 0.0125). Moreover, pleiotropy and heterogeneity analysis revealed that the results are not affected by pleiotropy (MR-Egger intercept p value = 0.366) or 143 heterogeneity (the Q-p values of IVW and MR-Egger were 0.103 and 0.102, respectively). The 144 145 results of all MR methods are depicted as a forest plot in Figure 3b,4b. Single SNP sensitivity analysis, leave-one-out sensitivity analysis, and funnel plots are available in supplementary 146 147 Figures 1b, 2b, 3b.

148 The causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and fT4

149 After the harmonization step and removing palindromic SNPs, 84 SNPs remained. None of the 150 remaining SNPs were detected as weak instruments, and no SNPs were found in HLA genes. With 151 84 SNPs as IVs, according to the results of IVW, there was no causal relationship between 25-152 Hydroxyvitamin D levels and fT4 levels (beta = 0.012, 95% CI (- 0.094, 0.118); SE = 0.054, $P_{beta} = 0.821$). According to the pleiotropy test, there was no pleiotropy (MR-Egger intercept p 153 value = 0.414); however, the heterogeneity analysis found heterogeneity in the analysis (the Q-p 154 155 values of IVW and MR-Egger were 1.156 ×10-11 and 1.199×10-11, respectively). To correct the 156 heterogeneity, sensitivity analyses were performed stepwise using MR-PRESSO, Cook's distance, 157 and leave-one-out sensitivity analysis, and two, eleven, and one SNPS were excluded in each step, 158 respectively. After excluding the aforementioned SNPs, 70 SNPs remained and were used as IVs 159 for further MR analysis (Supplementary sheet 3). According to the results of IVW, there was a 160 significant causal relationship between an increase in 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and an increase

in fT4 levels (beta = 0.204, 95% CI (0.305, 0.094); SE = 0.056, P_{beta} = 3.0506e-4). Neither pleiotropy (MR-Egger intercept p value = 0.735) nor heterogeneity (the Q-p values of IVW and MR-Egger were 0.073 and 0.064, respectively) were detected in the analysis. Moreover, the P values of the weighted median (beta = 0.223, 95% CI (0.067, 0.379); P_{beta} = 0.005) method was less than 0.0125. The results of other MR methods are depicted as a forest plot in Figures 3c, 4c . Single SNP sensitivity analysis, leave-one-out sensitivity analysis, and funnel plots are available in supplementary Figures 1c, 2c, 3c.

168 The causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and TSH

After the harmonization step and removing palindromic SNPs, 84 SNPs remained. None of the 169 remaining SNPs were detected as weak instruments, and no SNPs were found in HLA genes. One 170 171 variant was found to be pleiotropic in the Phenoscanner Database and hence was excluded. One 172 SNP was detected as an outlier in sensitivity analyses using MR-PRESSO. After excluding the 173 mentioned SNP, 82 SNPs were used as IVs for MR analysis (Supplementary sheet 4). In the MR 174 analysis using various MR methods, there was no significant causal relationship between genepredicted 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and TSH (the Pbeta values in all analytical models were greater 175 176 than 0.0125).

Moreover, pleiotropy and heterogeneity analysis revealed that the results are not affected by pleiotropy (MR–Egger intercept p value = 0.931) or heterogeneity (the Q-p values of IVW and MR–Egger were 0.260 and 0.236, respectively). The results of all MR methods are depicted as a forest plot in Figures 3d and 4d. Single SNP sensitivity analysis, leave-one-out sensitivity analysis, and funnel plots are available in supplementary Figures 1d, 2d, 3d.

- 182
- 183

184 **Discussion:**

To our knowledge, this is the first study to determine the causal relationship between 25-185 186 Hydroxyvitamin D and hypothyroidism using a two-sample MR analysis. Using two-sample MR, 187 we concluded that genetically predicted lower levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D have a significant causal association with the risk of hypothyroidism. In addition, the selected instrumental variables 188 189 also determined a causal association between lower 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and lower levels 190 of fT4 hormone. There is a relatively high clinical implication for this causality due to the high 191 worldwide prevalence of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency and the ease of its control using oral 192 supplements in most cases (28).

The association between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and hypothyroidism has been investigated 193 in several studies. Mackawy et al. conducted an observational study on 30 cases of 194 195 hypothyroidism, diagnosed according to biochemical criteria, and 30 healthy controls from the 196 Saudi Arabian population. The serum levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D were measured in both cases and controls. The results showed significantly lower levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D in 197 hypothyroidism cases compared to the control group (t=-11.128, p<0.001). However, the subgroup 198 199 analysis did not reveal any significant differences between male and female subjects (t=-1.32, p>0.05) (29). In a study on summertime 25-Hydroxyvitamin D status in patients with thyroid 200 201 disease in Poland, results indicated significantly lower levels of the 25-Hydroxyvitamin D 202 metabolites 25(OH)D and 3-epi-25(OH)D in hypothyroid patients in comparison with euthyroid 203 cases (30). Higher than 125 nmol/L serum levels of 25(OH)D in a secondary analysis of data of 204 the Pure North program in Canada is associated with a lower risk of hypothyroidism and a 205 reduction in levels of anti-thyroid antibodies by 30% and 32%, respectively, according to 206 Mirhosseini et al. (31). Although, a study by Musa et al. on a Saudi population showed no

significantly different levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D in female patients with a hypothyroidism
diagnosis in comparison with healthy controls (32). Suggesting the differences in results depending
on the population subgroup investigated in the study.

210 Autoimmune thyroid diseases (AITD) are the most common form of organ-specific autoimmune 211 diseases with an estimated prevalence of 5%, including a vast spectrum of manifestations ranging 212 from hyperthyroidism, known as Graves' disease, to hypothyroidism, known as Hashimoto's 213 thyroiditis, as well as cases with no history of clinical and biochemical findings (33, 34). The 214 pathophysiology of AITDs has been described as dysfunction of the normally established tolerance towards thyroid tissue antigens, infiltration of lymphocytes, subsequent activation of the 215 216 inflammatory response, and production of the characteristic autoantibodies. The commonly targeted autoantigens are thyroglobulin (Tg) and thyroid peroxidase (TPO) in Hashimoto's 217 218 thyroiditis and Thyroid stimulating hormone (TSH) receptor (TSHR) in Graves' disease (34, 35). 219 In addition to the studies on the association of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and hypothyroidism of 220 various etiologies, several studies have investigated this association in Hashimoto's thyroiditis 221 patients. In vivo, studies have shown that treatment of rat models of experimental autoimmune thyroiditis (EAT) with 1,25(OH)₂D3 prior to disease establishment is associated with maintaining 222 223 normal structural and biochemical thyroid profiles (36). The results of clinical observational 224 studies on this matter have shown substantial controversy, with both indicating insignificant association as well as a significant inverse correlation between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and 225 226 the risk of Hashimoto's thyroiditis (17, 37-39). A recent meta-analysis of 42 observational studies 227 also indicated significantly lower levels of serum 25-Hydroxyvitamin D in patients of 228 hypothyroidism (p=0.03), AITDs (p=0.013), and Hashimoto's thyroiditis (p<0.001) in comparison 229 with controls (40).

230 In addition to the aforementioned observational studies, few clinical trials have been conducted on 231 this matter. A randomized controlled trial (RCT) was conducted by Chahardoli et al. on 42 female 232 cases of Hashimoto's thyroiditis from an Iranian population. The patients were divided into 233 intervention, receiving weekly 25-Hydroxyvitamin D supplements, and control groups, receiving 234 placebo. The results of this study indicated a significant reduction of levels of TSH and anti-Tg 235 antibody in the treatment group over the course of the study. No significant changes were observed 236 in levels of anti-TPO, T3, and T4 (18). In a pilot randomized trial by Pezeshki et al., the effects of 237 25-Hydroxyvitamin D supplements were evaluated in 59 cases with the coexistence of subclinical 238 hypothyroidism and 25-Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency in an Iranian population. Also, they showed 239 a reduction in TSH levels throughout the study (41). In another RCT in an Iranian population on 201 cases of hypothyroidism, 25-Hydroxyvitamin D supplements significantly reduced TSH levels 240 241 in the treatment group with no significant alterations in levels of T3 and T4 (14). Although the 242 effect of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D supplements on thyroid function in hypothyroidism patients has 243 been investigated in the studies mentioned above, there is substantial controversy among the 244 results. To the best of our knowledge, the association of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D with the risk of hypothyroidism has not been investigated in RCTs, and due to the limitations of such studies, MR 245 246 studies can be an appropriate substitute to establish this causality. A recently published 247 bidirectional MR study investigated the causal relationship between levels of 25-Hydroxyvitamin 248 D and anti-TPO antibody using data from a Chinese population. The results of that study indicated 249 a significant causal relationship (β = -0.720, 95% CI -1.429 to -0.012) between levels of 25-250 Hydroxyvitamin D and anti-TPO antibody (42).

Our results indicated a causal relationship between lower 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and boththe risk of hypothyroidism and lower levels of fT4, which is consistent with the results of the

aforementioned observational studies. However, we found no significant causal association between this parameter and TSH levels or risk of Hashimoto's thyroiditis. As mentioned above, the results of the previously conducted studies are controversial and differ based on the target population, number of included patients, and study design. Although the previously mentioned clinical trials found significant associations between vitamin D and TSH levels, the results are not necessarily accurate due to the limited sample sizes and non-European ancestry of the included patients, in contrast with this MR study.

260 It is known that the most common cause of hypothyroidism in the world and the European 261 population is iodine deficiency. In iodine-sufficient populations, Hashimoto's thyroiditis is the most common cause of hypothyroidism (7). Since in our study, there was no significant 262 relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency and Hashimoto's thyroiditis, it can be 263 speculated that 25-Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency has a causal relationship with other 264 hypothyroidisms and even non-autoimmune etiologies and since the iodine deficiency is the 265 266 leading cause of hypothyroidism, future MR studies should be conducted to infer the causal 267 relationship of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D with iodine deficiency.

268

Several mechanisms have been proposed in the explanation of such associations. Both 25-Hydroxyvitamin D and thyroid hormones carry out their functional roles by binding to members of the steroid/thyroid receptor family (43). In addition, 25-Hydroxyvitamin D is a modulator of TSH secretion in the pituitary gland, both directly by binding to specific binding sites and utilizing the regulation of estrogen synthesis, which is a modulator of TSH secretion (44, 45). Regarding its role in AITDs' pathogenesis, 25-Hydroxyvitamin D is a modulator of the immune system. Both VDR and 1- α hydroxylase are expressed by a variety of immune cells including the antigen-

276 presenting cells (APCs) and lymphocytes (46). Activation of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D downstream 277 effectors leads to inhibition of expression of the major histocompatibility complex II (MHC II) 278 and its co-stimulators in APCs, and interleukin-12 (IL-12) and IL-23 in dendritic cells and 279 induction of IL-10 expression, ultimately leading to a reduction in antigen presentation and T cell 280 activation, as well as a shift in T cell phenotypes towards T helper 2 (Th2) cells (47, 48). In B 281 cells, 25-Hydroxyvitamin D inhibits the proliferation, memory B, and plasma cell differentiation, 282 and immunoglobulin secretion and induces apoptotic processes. In addition to the aforementioned 283 roles in inhibiting the adaptive immune response, 25-Hydroxyvitamin D is an inducer of innate 284 immune reactions (46).

Regarding clinical relevance, our study established a causal relationship between lower levels of
25-Hydroxyvitamin D and hypothyroidism, suggesting a protective effect of 25-Hydroxyvitamin
D supplementation in reducing the risk of hypothyroidism in the population. This can call for
public policy decisions in this matter due to the high effect size and low cost of such populationwide plans to initiate screening and treating 25-Hydroxyvitamin D deficiency.

This study possesses several strengths. First, the data regarding the instrumental variables are from reliable and widely used GWAS databases with acceptably large sample sizes. Second, the twosample MR is a method of analysis that substantially reduces the effect of confounders by using genetic variants as instrumental variables. Finally, the sensitivity analyses and estimations of pleiotropy reduce the risk of bias due to the presence of outliers and pleiotropic effects of the instrumental variables.

Despite the strengths above, this study faced some limitations as well. The data regarding the instrumental variables are extracted from European population GWASs, which can limit the application of our results in other populations, and the results should be interpreted cautiously.

Second, the GWASs primarily used to extract the summary statistic data might impose some limitations on our study, including population stratification and relatedness. Although measures were taken to reduce and omit such limitations, there is a possibility that these sources of bias still exist. Overall, although our results are generally applicable in various conditions, the results should be interpreted with caution.

304 Conclusion

In summary, this study provides evidence for a possible causal association between lower levels
of vitamin D and a higher risk of hypothyroidism and lower free T4 levels, using genetic variations

307 as an instrumental variable. These findings can be used in future population-level policies and

308 plans to prevent and manage hypothyroidism.

309

Figure's Legends

Figure 1. Directed acyclic graph of the MR framework investigating the causal relationship between 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and Hypothyroidism. The main assumptions of MR analysis 1) the SNPs selected as instrumental variables (IVs) should be strongly associated with the 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels; 2) the IVs must not have a relationship with the confounders of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and hypothyroidism association; and 3) the IVs should affect hypothyroidism merely through 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels and do not have a direct association with hypothyroidism

Figure 2. The flowchart of steps of MR analysis conducted for Hypothyroidism, Hashimoto's thyroiditis, fT4, and TSH.

Figure 3. Forest plot to visualize causal effects of variation in of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels on a) Hypothyroidism, b) Hashimoto's thyroiditis, c) fT4, and d) TSH. Presented odds ratios (OR) and confidence intervals (CI) correspond to the effects of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels on each outcome. The results of Mendelian Randomization (MR) analyses using various analysis methods are presented for comparison.

Figure 4. Scatter plots of 25-Hydroxyvitamin D levels on a) Hypothyroidism, b) Hashimoto's thyroiditis, c) fT4, d) TSH. Scatter plot demonstrating the effect of each 25-Hydroxyvitamin D-associated SNP on each outcome on the log-odds scale. The slopes of each line represent the causal association for each MR method (MR-Egger, Weighted median, Inverse variance weighted, Simple mode, and Weighted mode).

hon hour

Acknowledgments

Availability of data and materials

The datasets analyzed during the current study are publicly available and were extracted from the GWAS

catalog database and the ThyroidOmics Consortium. The process of MR analyses and the results are

publicly available through the following HTML link:

https://akbarzadehms.github.io/VitDHypothyroidismMR/

Abbreviations

Abbreviation	Full Version
CI	Confidence interval
GWAS	Genome-Wide Association Study
IVs	Instrumental Variables
IVW	Inverse Variance-Weighted
MAF	Mean Allele Frequency
MBE	Mode-Based Estimation
MR	Mendelian Randomization
MR-PRESSO	Mendelian Randomization Pleiotropy RESidual Sum and Outlier
RCT	Randomized Clinical Trial
SE	Standard Error
SNP	Single Nucleotide Polymorphism
TSH	Thyroid Stimulating Hormone
fT4	free T4
VDR	25-Hydroxyvitamin D Receptor

Author information:

- 1. Mahdi Akbarzadeh; Ph.D., Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: akbarzadeh.ms@gmail.com
- 2. Sahand Tehrani Fateh; MD, School of Medicine, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: Sahh.tf@gmail.com
- 3. Aysan Moeinafshar, MD, School of Medicine, Tehran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: aysanmoeinafshar@gmail.com
- 4. Danial Habibi; Ph.D., Department of Biostatistics and Epidemiology, School of Health, and Student Research Committee, School of Health, Isfahan University of Medical Sciences, Isfahan, Iran. Email: dhabibi67@gmail.com
- 5. Amir Hossein Ghanooni; MD, Department of Endocrinology, School of Medicine, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: ircms@yahoo.com
- 6. Amir Hesam Saeidian; MD, Department of Surgery, Rasool-E Akram Hospital, School of Medicine, Iran University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: amirhesam_saeidian@yahoo.com
- 7. Parisa Riahi; MSc, Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: parisaariyahii@gmail.com
- 8. Maryam Zarkesh: Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: zarkesh@endocrine.ac.ir
- 9. Hossein Lanjanian; Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: hossein.lanjanian@gmail.com
- 10. Mina Jahangiri; Ph.D., Department of Biostatistics, Faculty of Medical Sciences, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran. Email: minajahangiri984@gmail.com
- 11. Maryam Moazzam-Jazi; Ph.D, Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: setareh227@gmail.com
- 12. Farshad Teymoori, Nutrition and Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti, Tehran, Iran. Email: teymoori.f68@gmail.com
- 13. Fereidoun Azizi; MD, Endocrine research center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: azizi@endocrine.ac.ir
- 14. Mehdi Hedayati; Ph.D., Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: hedayati47@gmail.com
- 15. Maryam Sadat Daneshpour; Ph.D., Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: daneshpour@sbmu.ac.ir

Corresponding author:

Maryam Sadat Daneshpour (Ph.D.), Associate Professor.

Cellular and Molecular Endocrine Research Center, Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. Email: daneshpour@sbmu.ac.ir

Tehran, Iran; PO Box: 19395-4763; Tel: +98(21)22432500; Fax: +98(21)22416264

Funding

Not applicable.

Contributions

MA and STF conceptualize the study. MA, AM, and STF drafted the initial manuscript. MA and STF conceived the study, analyzed the data, and drafted the initial manuscript. MA and STF generated Tables and Figures. DH, AHG, AHS, validation, and revised the manuscript. PR, HL, MJ, FT, FA, MH, and MMJ revised the manuscript. MSD supervised, edited, and finalized the manuscript. All authors reviewed and approved the final manuscript.

Ethics declarations

The ethical committee approved this study at the Research Institute for Endocrine Sciences, Shahid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences (Research Approval Code: 28778 & Research Ethical Code: IR.SBMU.ENDOCRINE.REC.1400.084). In this study, all participants provided written informed consent for participating in the study. This study has been performed following the Declaration of Helsinki.

Consent for publication

Not applicable.

Competing interests

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

References

1. Mendes D, Alves C, Silverio N, Batel Marques F. Prevalence of Undiagnosed Hypothyroidism in Europe: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. Eur Thyroid J. 2019;8(3):130-43.

2. Chaker L, Bianco AC, Jonklaas J, Peeters RP. Hypothyroidism. Lancet. 2017;390(10101):1550-62.

3. Bougma K, Aboud FE, Harding KB, Marquis GS. lodine and mental development of children 5 years old and under: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Nutrients. 2013;5(4):1384-416.

4. Teng X, Shan Z, Chen Y, Lai Y, Yu J, Shan L, et al. More than adequate iodine intake may increase subclinical hypothyroidism and autoimmune thyroiditis: a cross-sectional study based on two Chinese communities with different iodine intake levels. Eur J Endocrinol. 2011;164(6):943-50.

5. Zhong B, Wang Y, Zhang G, Wang Z. Environmental Iodine Content, Female Sex and Age Are Associated with New-Onset Amiodarone-Induced Hypothyroidism: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Adverse Reactions of Amiodarone on the Thyroid. Cardiology. 2016;134(3):366-71.

6. Kahraman D, Keller C, Schneider C, Eschner W, Sudbrock F, Schmidt M, et al. Development of hypothyroidism during long-term follow-up of patients with toxic nodular goitre after radioiodine therapy. Clin Endocrinol (Oxf). 2012;76(2):297-303.

7. Chiovato L, Magri F, Carlé A. Hypothyroidism in Context: Where We've Been and Where We're Going. Adv Ther. 2019;36(Suppl 2):47-58.

8. Persani L. Clinical review: Central hypothyroidism: pathogenic, diagnostic, and therapeutic challenges. J Clin Endocrinol Metab. 2012;97(9):3068-78.

9. Huang SA, Tu HM, Harney JW, Venihaki M, Butte AJ, Kozakewich HP, et al. Severe hypothyroidism caused by type 3 iodothyronine deiodinase in infantile hemangiomas. N Engl J Med. 2000;343(3):185-9.

10. Effraimidis G, Wiersinga WM. Mechanisms in endocrinology: autoimmune thyroid disease: old and new players. Eur J Endocrinol. 2014;170(6):R241-52.

11. Bhattoa HP, Konstantynowicz J, Laszcz N, Wojcik M, Pludowski P. Vitamin D: Musculoskeletal health. Rev Endocr Metab Disord. 2017;18(3):363-71.

12. Wang H, Chen W, Li D, Yin X, Zhang X, Olsen N, et al. Vitamin D and Chronic Diseases. Aging Dis. 2017;8(3):346-53.

13. Bouchemal M, Hakem D, Azzouz M, Touil-Boukoffa C, Mezioug D. Vitamin D Levels Correlate with Metabolic Syndrome Criteria in Algerian Patients: The Ex-vivo

Immunomodulatory Effect of α, 25 Dihydroxyvitamin D3. Endocr Metab Immune Disord Drug Targets. 2020;20(8):1282-94.

14. Talaei A, Ghorbani F, Asemi Z. The Effects of Vitamin D Supplementation on Thyroid Function in Hypothyroid Patients: A Randomized, Double-blind, Placebo-controlled Trial. Indian J Endocrinol Metab. 2018;22(5):584-8.

15. Skrobot A, Demkow U, Wachowska M. Immunomodulatory Role of Vitamin D: A Review. Adv Exp Med Biol. 2018;1108:13-23.

16. Tamer G, Arik S, Tamer I, Coksert D. Relative vitamin D insufficiency in Hashimoto's thyroiditis. Thyroid. 2011;21(8):891-6.

17. Ma J, Wu D, Li C, Fan C, Chao N, Liu J, et al. Lower Serum 25-Hydroxyvitamin D Level is Associated With 3 Types of Autoimmune Thyroid Diseases. Medicine (Baltimore). 2015;94(39):e1639.

18. Chahardoli R, Saboor-Yaraghi AA, Amouzegar A, Khalili D, Vakili AZ, Azizi F. Can Supplementation with Vitamin D Modify Thyroid Autoantibodies (Anti-TPO Ab, Anti-Tg Ab) and Thyroid Profile (T3, T4, TSH) in Hashimoto's Thyroiditis? A Double Blind, Randomized Clinical Trial. Horm Metab Res. 2019;51(5):296-301.

19. Burgess S, Thompson SG. Mendelian randomization: methods for using genetic variants in causal estimation: CRC Press; 2015.

20. Davey Smith G, Hemani G. Mendelian randomization: genetic anchors for causal inference in epidemiological studies. Human molecular genetics. 2014;23(R1):R89-R98.

21. Slob EAW, Burgess S. A comparison of robust Mendelian randomization methods using summary data. Genet Epidemiol. 2020;44(4):313-29.

22. Hemani G, Zheng J, Elsworth B, Wade KH, Haberland V, Baird D, et al. The MR-Base platform supports systematic causal inference across the human phenome. Elife. 2018;7.

23. Burgess S, Thompson SG. Interpreting findings from Mendelian randomization using the MR-Egger method. Eur J Epidemiol. 2017;32(5):377-89.

24. Verbanck M, Chen C-Y, Neale B, Do R. Detection of widespread horizontal pleiotropy in causal relationships inferred from Mendelian randomization between complex traits and diseases. Nature genetics. 2018;50(5):693-8.

25. Burgess S, Davies N, Dudbridge F, Gill D, Glymour M, Hartwig F, et al. Guidelines for performing Mendelian randomization investigations: update for summer 2023. 2023.

26. Yavorska OO, Burgess S. MendelianRandomization: an R package for performing Mendelian randomization analyses using summarized data. International journal of epidemiology. 2017;46(6):1734-9.

27. Hemani G, Zheng J, Elsworth B, Wade KH, Haberland V, Baird D, et al. The MR-Base platform supports systematic causal inference across the human phenome. elife. 2018;7:e34408.

28. Amrein K, Scherkl M, Hoffmann M, Neuwersch-Sommeregger S, Köstenberger M, Tmava Berisha A, et al. Vitamin D deficiency 2.0: an update on the current status worldwide. Eur J Clin Nutr. 2020;74(11):1498-513.

29. Mackawy AM, Al-Ayed BM, Al-Rashidi BM. Vitamin d deficiency and its association with thyroid disease. Int J Health Sci (Qassim). 2013;7(3):267-75.

30. Kmieć P, Minkiewicz I, Rola R, Sworczak K, Żmijewski MA, Kowalski K. Vitamin D status including 3-epi-25(OH)D3 among adult patients with thyroid disorders during summer months. Endokrynol Pol. 2018;69(6):653-60.

31. Mirhosseini N, Brunel L, Muscogiuri G, Kimball S. Physiological serum 25-hydroxyvitamin D concentrations are associated with improved thyroid function-observations from a community-based program. Endocrine. 2017;58(3):563-73.

32. Musa IR, Gasim GI, Khan S, Ibrahim IA, Abo-Alazm H, Adam I. No Association between 25 (OH) Vitamin D Level And Hypothyroidism among Females. Open Access Maced J Med Sci. 2017;5(2):126-30.

33. Vargas-Uricoechea H. Molecular Mechanisms in Autoimmune Thyroid Disease. Cells. 2023;12(6).

34. Antonelli A, Ferrari SM, Corrado A, Di Domenicantonio A, Fallahi P. Autoimmune thyroid disorders. Autoimmun Rev. 2015;14(2):174-80.

35. Czarnywojtek A, Florek E, Pietrończyk K, Sawicka-Gutaj N, Ruchała M, Ronen O, et al. The Role of Vitamin D in Autoimmune Thyroid Diseases: A Narrative Review. J Clin Med. 2023;12(4).

36. Liu S, Xiong F, Liu EM, Zhu M, Lei PY. [Effects of 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D3 in rats with experimental autoimmune thyroiditis]. Nan Fang Yi Ke Da Xue Xue Bao. 2010;30(7):1573-6.

37. Cvek M, Kaličanin D, Barić A, Vuletić M, Gunjača I, Torlak Lovrić V, et al. Vitamin D and Hashimoto's Thyroiditis: Observations from CROHT Biobank. Nutrients. 2021;13(8).

38. Unal AD, Tarcin O, Parildar H, Cigerli O, Eroglu H, Demirag NG. Vitamin D deficiency is related to thyroid antibodies in autoimmune thyroiditis. Cent Eur J Immunol. 2014;39(4):493-7.

39. Ke W, Sun T, Zhang Y, He L, Wu Q, Liu J, et al. 25-Hydroxyvitamin D serum level in Hashimoto's thyroiditis, but not Graves' disease is relatively deficient. Endocr J. 2017;64(6):581-7.

40. Taheriniya S, Arab A, Hadi A, Fadel A, Askari G. Vitamin D and thyroid disorders: a systematic review and Meta-analysis of observational studies. BMC Endocr Disord. 2021;21(1):171.

41. Pezeshki B, Ahmadi A, Karimi A. The Effect of Vitamin D Replacement on Patient with Subclinical Hypothyroidism: A Pilot Randomized Clinical Trial. Galen Med J. 2020;9:e1592.

42. Chen Y, Han B, Zhu C, Li Q, Chen C, Zhai H, et al. Bidirectional Mendelian Randomization Analysis for Vitamin D and Thyroid Peroxidase Antibody. Int J Endocrinol. 2022;2022:2260388.

43. Feng M, Li H, Chen SF, Li WF, Zhang FB. Polymorphisms in the vitamin D receptor gene and risk of autoimmune thyroid diseases: a meta-analysis. Endocrine. 2013;43(2):318-26.
44. Sar M, Stumpf WE, DeLuca HF. Thyrotropes in the pituitary are target cells for 1,25 dihydroxy vitamin D3. Cell Tissue Res. 1980;209(1):161-6.

45. Kinuta K, Tanaka H, Moriwake T, Aya K, Kato S, Seino Y. Vitamin D is an important factor in estrogen biosynthesis of both female and male gonads. Endocrinology. 2000;141(4):1317-24.
46. Prietl B, Treiber G, Pieber TR, Amrein K. Vitamin D and immune function. Nutrients. 2013;5(7):2502-21.

47. Baeke F, Takiishi T, Korf H, Gysemans C, Mathieu C. Vitamin D: modulator of the immune system. Curr Opin Pharmacol. 2010;10(4):482-96.

48. Mathieu C, Adorini L. The coming of age of 1,25-dihydroxyvitamin D(3) analogs as immunomodulatory agents. Trends Mol Med. 2002;8(4):174-9.

	Phenotype	Reporting	Source	GWAS ID	Sampl	Ethnici	Referen
	· ·	traits in the database			e size	ty	ce
exposu re	25- Hydroxyvita min D	Serum 25- Hydroxyvita min D levels	GWAS catalog	GCST900006 16	417,58 0	Europea n	Revez et al. 2020
outcom e	Hypothyroidi sm	Hypothyroidi sm	GWAS catalog	GCST902041 67	51,194 (case), 443,38 3 (contro 1)	Europea n	Mathieu et al. 2022
	Hashimoto's thyroiditis	Hashimoto's thyroiditis	GWAS catalog	GCST900188 55	15,654 (case), 379,98 6 (contro 1)	Europea n	Sakaue et al. 2021
	fT4	fT4	Thyroid Omics Consortiu m	phs000930	49,269	Europea n	Teumer et al. 2018
	TSH	TSH	Thyroid Omics Consortiu m	phs000930	54,288	Europea n	Teumer et al. 2018

Table1. Detailed information of GWAS summary statistics data used for analyses.







d

0.005

0.075

0.075

0.018

0.018

< 0.001

< 0.001

<0.001

0.007

a

с

				b
Method	Beta (95% CI)		p-value	
IVW	-0.197 (-0.3020.092)		<0.001	
Penalized IVW	-0.197 (-0.3020.092)		<0.001	
Robust IVW	-0.202 (-0.3040.099)		<0.001	
Penalized robust IVW	-0.202 (-0.3040.099)		<0.001	
Simple median	-0.202 (-0.3670.036)		0.017	
Weighted median	-0.215 (-0.3750.054)	-	0.009	
Penalized weighted median	-0.215 (-0.3750.054)		0.009	
MR-Egger	-0.319 (-0.5410.096)		0.005	
Penalized MR-Egger	-0.319 (-0.5410.096)		0.005	
Robust MR-Egger	-0.317 (-0.5020.133)		0.001	
Penalized robust MR-Egger	-0.317 (-0.5020.133)		0.001	
Robust Adjusted Profile Score(MR-RAPS)	-0.199 (-0.3020.092)		<0.001	
MR-Lasso	-0.197 (-0.3020.092)		<0.001	
Constrained maximum likelihood(MR-cML)	-0.182 (-0.290.074)		0.001	
Debised Inverse-variance weighted	-0.2 (-0.3070.094)		<0.001	
Mode based method of Hartwig et al	-0.266 (-0.4860.046)		0.018	
		-E4 -6.2 Bela	43	
Method	Beta (95% CI)		p-value	d
IVW	0.204 (0.093-0.314)		<0.001	
Penalized IVW	0.204 (0.093-0.314)	-	<0.001	
Robust IVW	0.193 (0.075-0.31)	-	<0.001	
Penalized robust IVW	0.193 (0.075-0.31)	-	<0.001	
Simple median	0.123 (-0.034-0.28)		0.125	
Weighted median	0.224 (0.068-0.381)		0.005	

0.223 (0.066-0.38)

0.247 (-0.025-0.518)

0.247 (-0.025-0.518)

0.276 (0.046-0.507)

0.276 (0.046-0.507)

0.207 (0.107-0.306)

0.26 (0.216-0.304)

0.207 (0.095-0.319)

0.219 (0.06-0.379)

Method	Beta (95% CI)	p-value
IVW	-0.021 (-0.214-0.172)	- 0.829
Penalized IVW	-0.036 (-0.221-0.15)	- 0.706
Robust IVW	-0.032 (-0.167-0.104)	0.648
Penalized robust IVW	-0.036 (-0.171-0.099)	0.599
Weighted median	-0.04 (-0.335-0.254)	0.788
Penalized weighted median	-0.042 (-0.336-0.253)	0.782
MB-Egger	-0 144 (-0 473-0 184)	
Depailized MD_Egger	-0.121 (-0.441-0.198)	0.000
Pohatzed MR-Egger	-0.121 (-0.999 0.079)	0.934
Robust MR-Egger	-0.113 (-0.298-0.073)	0.234
Penalized robust MH-Egger	-0.105 (-0.283-0.073)	
Robust Adjusted Profile Score(MR–RAPS)	-0.021 (-0.386-0.157)	
MR-Lasso	-0.07 (-0.247-0.107)	• 0.436
Debised Inverse-variance weighted	-0.022 (-0.217-0.174)	- 0.829
Mode based method of Hartwig et al	-0.024 (-0.31-0.261)	0.867
Mathod	Bota (95% CI)	Beta
IVW	_0.03 (_0.097_0.038)	
Penalized IVW	-0.03 (-0.097-0.038)	
Robust IVW	-0.028 (-0.09-0.034)	0.383
Penalized robust IVW	-0.028 (-0.09-0.034)	0.383
Simple median	-0.031 (-0.145-0.084)	0.602
Weighted median	-0.015 (-0.123-0.094)	0.792
Penalized weighted median	-0.015 (-0.123-0.094)	0.794
MR-Egger	-0.033 (-0.14-0.073)	0.542
Penalized MR-Egger	-0.033 (-0.14-0.073)	—• —
Robust MR-Egger	-0.032 (-0.128-0.063)	0.507
Penalized robust MR-Egger	-0.032 (-0.128-0.063)	0.507
Robust Adjusted Profile Score(MR-RAPS)	-0.029 (-0.094-0.036)	0.369
MR-Lasso	-0.03 (-0.097-0.038)	0.392
Constrained maximum likelihood(MR-cML)	-0.002 (-0.029-0.025)	• 0.883
Debised Inverse-variance weighted	-0.03 (-0.097-0.038)	0.388
Mode based method of Hartwin et al	-0.037 (-0.153-0.079)	

-d.t -6.1 -6.0 -6.1 Beta

10

Figure3

Penalized weighted median

Penalized robust MR-Egger

Robust Adjusted Profile Score(MR-RAPS)

Constrained maximum likelihood(MR-cML)

Debised Inverse-variance weighted

Mode based method of Hartwig et al

Penalized MR-Egger

Robust MR-Egger

MR-Egger

