1	Exploring patient-, provider-, and health facility-level determinants of blood pressure among
2	patients with hypertension: A multicenter study in Ghana
3	
4	
5	Samuel Byiringiro <sup>1*</sup> , Thomas Hinneh <sup>1</sup> , Yvonne Commodore-Mensah <sup>1,2</sup> , Jill Masteller <sup>2</sup> , Fred
6	Stephen Sarfo <sup>3,4</sup> , Nancy Perrin, <sup>1</sup> Shadrack Assibey <sup>4</sup> , Cheryl R. Himmelfarb <sup>1,2,5</sup>
7	
8	<sup>1</sup> Johns Hopkins University School of Nursing, Baltimore, Maryland, United States
9	<sup>2</sup> Johns Hopkins University, Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, Maryland,
10	United States
11	<sup>3</sup> Kwame Nkrumah University of Science & Technology, Department of Medicine, Kumasi,
12	Ashanti Region, Ghana
13	<sup>4</sup> Komfo Anokye Teaching Hospital, Kumasi, Ashanti Region, Ghana
14	<sup>5</sup> Johns Hopkins University, School of Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland, United States
15	
16	
17	*Corresponding Author:
18 19	Email: <u>sbyirin1@jhu.edu</u> (SB)

# 20 Abstract

21 Optimal blood pressure (BP) control is essential in averting cardiovascular disease and 22 associated complications. Multi-level factors influence the achievement of BP targets in 23 hypertension management. We explored patient-, provider-, and health facility-level factors of 24 systolic and diastolic BP and controlled BP status among patients with hypertension in Ghana, 25 where the burden of hypertension and cardiovascular disease is rising. Using a cross-sectional 26 design, we recruited 15 health facilities, and from each facility, four healthcare professionals 27 who managed patients with hypertension and 15 patients diagnosed with hypertension. The 28 primary outcome of interest was systolic and diastolic BP: the secondary outcome was BP 29 control (<140/90 mmHg) in compliance with Ghana's national standard treatment guidelines. We 30 used mixed-effects regression models to explore the patient- and facility-level predictors of the 31 outcomes. From the 15 health facilities, we recruited 67 healthcare providers with a mean (SD) 32 age of 32 (7) and 224 patients with a mean (SD) age of 60.5 (12.7). Most (182 [81%]) of the 33 patient participants were female, and almost half (109 [49%]) had controlled BP. At the patient 34 level, secondary school education (Coeff.:-7.69, 95% CI: -15.13, -0.26) was associated with 35 lower systolic BP than a lower level of education; and traveling for 30 minutes to 1 hour to the 36 health facility was associated with higher diastolic BP (Coeff.: 3.75, 95% CI: 0.12, 7.38) and 37 lower odds of BP control (OR: 0.51, 95% CI: 0.28, 0.92) than traveling less than 30 minutes. 38 Receiving care at government health facilities was associated with less systolic BP (Coeff.: -39 19.4; 95% CI: -33.58, -5.22) than private health facilities. A higher patient-to-physician or 40 physician assistant ratio was associated with more elevated systolic BP (Coeff.: 23.06, 95% CI: 41 10.06, 36.05) and lower odds of controlled BP (OR: 0.18, 95% CI: 0.05, 0.74). Further research

- 42 is warranted to identify effective strategies to address the multi-level factors influencing
- 43 hypertension control and to mitigate the rising burden of hypertension in Ghana.
- 44 Keywords: High blood pressure, hypertension, Sub-Saharan Africa, Health systems

45

# 46 Background

47 A guarter of the adult population in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) is estimated to be living with 48 chronic hypertension, a major risk factor for leading causes of death, cardiovascular disease, and 49 stroke [1,2]. In Ghana, approximately 27% of the adult population has hypertension, yet 65% of 50 the patients are unaware of their hypertension status [3]. Twenty-one percent of patients are on 51 treatment, and only 27% of patients on treatment achieve controlled Blood Pressure (BP) (6% of 52 all hypertensive patients)— which highlights the dire need for improving the quality of 53 hypertension care services [3]. Countries in SSA are predominantly classified by the World Bank 54 as low-income and are ill-equipped with frail health systems that are not prepared to respond to 55 the projected further rise in hypertension and other non-communicable diseases (NCDs) [4]. 56 Inadequate health systems financing contributes to the shortcomings across key health system 57 components including the lack of essential equipment, proper training of staff, and the 58 continuous stocking of health facility pharmacies with necessary consumables [5,6]. These 59 shortcomings further limit the public health systems' initiatives to raise the population's 60 awareness of the dangers of major NCDs such as hypertension, hence leaving most patients 61 undiagnosed and therefore without access to treatment. Effective strategies are needed to respond 62 to the rising burden of hypertension.

While hypertension is a chronic condition with life-threatening complications, these can be
averted by controlling BP using lifestyle modifications, antihypertensive therapy, or both [7].
Multiple guidelines with different thresholds for defining hypertension and initiating patients on

- 66 treatment exist [7–10]. The 2017 American Heart Association/American College of Cardiology
- 67 guidelines recommend a treatment target of  $\leq 130/80$  mmHg [7] while the World Heart
- 68 Federation in its 2021 roadmap for hypertension management as well as many countries in SSA

69 recommend a treatment to target of  $\leq 140/90$  mmHg [10]. Despite variabilities in BP treatment 70 targets, evidence shows that even among patients with uncontrolled hypertension, a 5-mmHg 71 reduction in systolic or diastolic BP is associated with better health outcomes through the 72 reduction of composite cardiovascular event risk [11,12]. It would hence be beneficial to explore 73 factors not only of hypertension control, but also for systolic and diastolic BP reduction. 74 The factors that influence hypertension care and outcomes are multifaceted and exist at the 75 individual, community, and health system levels. The individual-level factors that have shown an 76 association with hypertension include age, sex, socioeconomic status, education, employment, 77 family history of hypertension, and lifestyles such as smoking, high salt consumption, 78 alcoholism, and the lack of physical exercise [13]. At the community level, the lack of resources 79 (or policy to ensure the availability of the resources) such as patient peer support groups, non-80 access to the facilities for physical exercises, and affordable foods for healthy diets contribute to 81 the worsening status of hypertensive patients [14,15]. There are very interlinked influences 82 among the various risk levels of acquiring or having a worsened state of hypertension. Without 83 strong health facilities and systems, the population sensitization and screening for elevated BP 84 are very weak. At the health facilities, provider factors such as inadequate training and shortages 85 of healthcare providers could contribute to poor BP outcomes among patients already on 86 hypertension treatment. These factors make the exploration of multi-level factors of hypertension 87 care and outcomes very important.

Health facilities play a critical role in coordinating screening for raised BP and ensuring that
identified patients achieve desired BP targets. The World Health Organization (WHO)'s health
systems framework highlights six key factors of health systems strengthening to look out for
including: service delivery, health workforce, medications, diagnostics, equipment, and

92 technology, health information systems, financing, and leadership and governance [16]. In the 93 context of hypertension care, health facilities require a sufficient number of well-trained 94 healthcare providers, validated and regularly inspected BP devices, and other essential tools for 95 taking physical measurements, sufficient stock of evidence-based anti-hypertensive medications, 96 and all the systems for ensuring that diagnosed patients are initiated and maintained on 97 treatment. The aim of this study was to explore the health facility readiness for hypertension 98 management and assess the patient-, provider- and health facility-level factors of systolic and 99 diastolic BP and BP control among patients receiving hypertension care at 15 health facilities in 100 Kumasi, Ghana.

## 101 Methods

#### 102 Setting

103 We conducted this study in the Kumasi Metropolitan District, the capital city of the Ashanti 104 region in Ghana [17]. According to the 2010 population and housing census in Ghana, the 105 Kumasi Metropolitan District had a population of 1,730,249 (36% of the Ashanti region's 106 population) but grew up to approximately 2,096,053 people by 2019 [18,19]. The Kumasi Metropolitan District is served by 263 health facilities, 145 of which are clinics, three health 107 108 centers, 53 hospitals, six training institutions, 55 maternity homes, and one regional hospital. Of 109 all the health facilities, 224 are privately owned, 18 are guasi-governmental, 16 are government 110 owned, and five are owned by the Christian Health Association of Ghana (CHAG) [20].

# 111 Design

112 We used a cross-sectional study design to explore the patient-, provider-, and health facility-level

determinants of systolic and diastolic BP and the overall BP control. We followed the

Strengthening the Reporting of Observational Studies in Epidemiology (STROBE) checklist [21]
to ensure an elaborate and unbiased reporting and discussion of the findings (S1 Table).

#### 116 Participants

117 We used a convenience sample of 15 health facilities at different levels of the health system and

118 ownership. Eligible health facilities were as follows: (a) located in Kumasi Metropolitan District;

(b) provided hypertension service per the ministry of health structure; (c) qualified as

120 government, quasi-governmental, private or Christian Health Association of Ghana hospital,

121 regional or tertiary hospitals, Clinics, or community health centers; and (d) had leadership

122 willing to be part of the study. From each participating health facility, we recruited four

123 healthcare providers involved in managing patients with hypertension. All clinical care

124 providers—including nurses, physicians, physician assistants, and dietitians working in

125 hypertension care clinics or outpatient departments (OPD)—were eligible to participate in the

126 study.

Additionally, from each health facility, we recruited 15 patients diagnosed with hypertension and
 prescribed antihypertensive therapy. We included patients 18 years of age and older.

129 We conducted the recruitment and data collection between April 15<sup>th</sup> and June 1<sup>st</sup>, 2022.

# 130 Recruitment and data collection process

We traveled to the health facilities for data collection after receiving the signed memorandum of understanding from the health facilities. We dedicated a minimum of two days per health facility for data collection. After arriving at the health facility, a pair of trained enumerators, led by the ranking health facility leader, visited the different health facility units to collect facility-level data about hypertension. Another enumerator recruited potential participants among healthcare

136 providers to complete the self-administered survey at that time or take the link and complete the

- 137 survey later. On the second day, the team recruited patients coming for their usual hypertension
- 138 care appointments. Before data collection, both the providers and patients signed the consent
- 139 form, electronically for healthcare providers and on paper for patients,. We compensated patients
- 140 and providers with 10 USD and 25 USD, respectively, for their time.

#### 141 Outcome of interest

- 142 The primary outcome was the patients' systolic and diastolic BP. We treated the systolic and
- 143 diastolic BP as continuous variables. To measure patients' BP, we used Omron 7 Series Upper
- 144 Arm BP Monitor following the American Heart Association's guideline for BP measurement
- 145 [22]. After 3 minutes of patient rest, we took three consecutive measures of BP with 1 minute
- between each measurement and used the average of the last two for BP measurement
- 147 ascertainment.

#### 148 Secondary outcomes

- 149 The secondary outcome was BP control. We adopted the treatment goal stated by the Ghana
- 150 hypertension treatment guidelines to define BP control (<140/90 mmHg) [23]. We hence treated
- 151 the BP control as a binary variable.

#### 152 Exposures of interest

153 The exposures of interest were at the health facility and patient level.

#### 154 Patient level exposures

- 155 We measured the patient behaviors regarding adherence to high BP treatment using the Hill-
- 156 Bone Compliance to High Blood Pressure Therapy Scale (HB-HBP), a 14-item scale with an
- 157 internal consistency reliability of 0.85 [24]. HB-HBP has 4 choice options on the Likert scale

158	ranging from "All of the Time" to "None of the Time" valid for 1 to 4 points respectively in that
159	order except for item 6 "How often do you make the next appointment before you leave the
160	doctor's office?" which requires reverse coding. HB-HBP scores ranged from 14 to 56, with
161	higher scores indicating behaviors of higher adherence to high BP therapy. HB-HBP consists of
162	three sub-scales: (1) dietary sodium intake, three items with score ranging from 3 to12; (2)
163	medication adherence, nine items with score ranging from 9 to 36; and (3) appointment keeping,
164	two items with score ranging from 2 to 8. We treated the HB-HBP overall and subscale scores as
165	continuous variables.
166	The other self-reported exposure variables that we measured at the patient level were the length
167	of time with hypertension diagnosis, which we treated as a binary variable ( $\leq$ five years, $\geq$ five
168	years) and travel duration to the health facility where they received hypertension care services as
169	a categorical variable (< 30 minutes, 30 minutes to < one hour, and $\geq$ one hour).

# 170 Healthcare provider level exposures

The provider-level predictors were the provider knowledge of and attitude towards hypertension treatment guidelines. In Ghana, patients are not assigned a primary care provider who would ideally follow them up over time. They rather usually meet the healthcare provider who is in the consulting office on the day of their appointment. For this reason, we could not link specific provider responses with a given patients' BP outcomes. We hence could not ascertain the association between patient BP and the provider knowledge score or attitudes towards hypertension guidelines.

We measured provider knowledge of hypertension treatment guidelines using a 23-item
questionnaire developed by the investigation team. Five items were multiple choice questions

with four response options, six were multiple choice questions with three response options plus
"I don't know", and 14 items were true and false questions with "I don't know" as added
response option. Each of the 23 items was scored at one point, and assigned if the provider made
the correct selection. We reported the total scores out of 23, with higher scores indicating higher
knowledge of hypertension guidelines.

185 To measure the provider attitude towards hypertension guidelines, we assessed their self-reported

186 confidence in adhering to hypertension treatment guidelines. To measure self-reported

187 confidence, we asked them to rate on a scale of "Very confident" to "Not at all confident" their

adherence to guidelines while (1) measuring BP, (2) assigning hypertension diagnosis, (3)

educating patients with hypertension on healthy lifestyles, (4) prescribing antihypertensive

190 medications, and (5) their overall management of patients with hypertension. In addition to this

191 5-point Likert scale, we had a "not applicable" option for the tasks that were outside the

192 provider's scope of practice.

### 193 Health facility level exposures

We used the WHO Service Availability and Readiness Assessment Tool to collect health facility-level measurements of hypertension service readiness [25]. Health facility characteristics included bed capacity as a categorical variable (<50, 50 to <100 beds, and  $\geq100$  beds), facility ownership as a categorical variable (government, private or Christian Health Association of Ghana (CHAG) health facilities), and possession of a hypertension clinic (versus managing patients in the general OPD) as a binary variable.

The indicators related to health workforce that we measured were the nurse-to-patient ratio and physician and physician assistant-to-patient ratio. To calculate the clinician-to-patient ratio, we

202 divided the number of patients received in the OPD in one recent month with the number of 203 registered and enrolled nurses or the number of physicians (generalist and specialists) and 204 physician assistants. We combined the physician and physician assistants because they were 205 licensed to diagnose and prescribe anti-hypertensive medications in their scope of practice in 206 Ghana. We categorized the patient-to-nurse ratio as < 20, 20 to  $< 40, and \ge 40$  patients per nurse 207 per month and the patient-to-physician or physician assistant ratio <140, 140 to < 280, and  $\geq$  280 208 patients per physician (or assistant) per month. We additionally asked if at least one healthcare 209 provider had received training on hypertension treatment guidelines over the previous two years 210 and treated this indicator as a binary variable. 211 The hypertension service readiness indicators we assessed were the availability of the 2017 212 Ghana Standard treatment guidelines [26]or the 2019 National Guidelines for the Management of 213 Cardiovascular Diseases (first edition) [23]; patient education materials consisting of brochures 214 and risk charts; BP measurement apparatus (functional automated BP device or a 215 sphygmomanometer with a stethoscope); the basic laboratory exams essential for patients with 216 hypertension, and all first line antihypertensive medications according to Ghana protocol [27]. 217 The basic laboratory exams included were as follows: (1) valid dipstick for urine protein, (2) 218 urine glucose, and (3) urine ketones, (4) glucometer for blood glucose and valid test strips, and 219 (5) hemoglobinometer or analyzer for hemoglobin testing. The Ghana the Standard Treatment 220 Guidelines 7th Edition [26] and the Essential Medicines List 7th Edition [27] require each health 221 facility that treats hypertension to possess all the first line antihypertension medications: 222 Angiotensin Converting Enzyme Inhibitors, Angiotensin Receptor Blocker, Calcium Channel 223 Blocker, Thiazide, and Beta Blocker.

#### 224 Covariates

225 The patient-level covariates we explored included patient age, educational level, employment 226 status, and marital status. We treated patient age as a continuous variable; biological sex as a 227 binary variable (male, female); education as a categorical variable (primary education or less, 228 secondary education, and tertiary education or higher); employment status as a categorical 229 variable (unemployed, employed, and retired); and marital status as a binary variable (married or 230 cohabiting and single, separated or widowed). 231 The provider-level covariates we evaluated were age, sex, educational level, profession, and 232 experience. We treated provider age as a continuous variable and sex as a binary variable (male, 233 female), education as a categorical variable (associate degree or less, bachelor's degree, and 234 post-graduate degree), and profession as a categorical variable (physicians (generalist, specialist, 235 physician assistant), and nurses (enrolled and registered), and other clinical staff). We treated

experience as a categorical variable (<two years, two to <four years,  $\geq$ four years).

237 We additionally asked providers whether they had received hypertension management training

over the previous two years (yes or no) and the type of training they had received.

#### 239 Analysis

240 We explored patients' characteristics by BP control status. We used means  $(\pm SD)$  to report

241 continuous variables and proportions and percentages for categorical variables. We used two

sample *t*-tests to compare means of the continuous variables and chi-square tests to compare the

243 proportions of the categorical variables by the BP control status.

We used percentages to summarize provider characteristics and means to summarize provider scores of hypertension guidelines knowledge. To compare scores of hypertension guidelines

246 knowledge across the different categorical variables of provider characteristics, we used one-way 247 analysis of variance. For the provider attitude towards hypertension guidelines, we reported 248 percentages of providers in each level of self-reported confidence in adherence to the guidelines. 249 We used a stacked graph to report the provider's levels of self confidence in adhering to 250 hypertension treatment guidelines. Since the health facility-level data were limited in the number 251 of observations, we reported proportions (proportion of health facilities which met a certain 252 standard of hypertension care) and percentages for categorical variables, and the median and 253 interquartile ranges (IQR) for continuous variables.

254 We used mixed-effects linear regression models to explore the patient- and health facility-level 255 factors of systolic and diastolic BP, and used mixed-effects logistic regression models to explore 256 the patient- and health facility-level factors of BP control. We chose this model to account for 257 possible intra-cluster correlation in BP outcomes across the different health facilities. We 258 initially estimated the bivariate models of each patient and facility level predictor then fitted fully 259 adjusted models separately for patient- and facility-level predictors. At the patient-level, the fully 260 adjusted models included the hypertension adherence variables, travel distance to the health 261 facility, duration with hypertension diagnosis, and all sociodemographic characteristics listed 262 under covariates. At the facility level, the fully adjusted model included the health facility 263 characteristics (ownership, availability of hypertension clinic, bed capacity); health workforce 264 indicators (patient-to-clinician ratio and provider training); and hypertension service availability 265 indicators (availability of all first line antihypertensive medications). The distribution of data for 266 these health facility level variables-basic laboratory exams, BP devices, and hypertension 267 guidelines; and patient educational materials-rendered the fully adjusted model unstable and

268	were excluded. We reported the coefficients or odds ratio with the associated 95% confidence
269	intervals. We considered associations with $0.05$ or smaller <i>p</i> -values to be statistically significant.
270	The power analysis assumed an Intra-Cluster Correlation (ICC) of 0.1 based on the systolic BP
271	ICC reported by the Phone-based Intervention under Nurse Guidance after Stroke (PINGS) study
272	interim results [28] and a BP control rate of 27% among hypertensive patients on treatment [3].
273	With these assumptions, our mixed-effects logistic regression had 80% power to predict odds
274	ratios of BP control of 1.92 or greater with continuous predictor variables with alpha of 0.05. For
275	dichotomous predictor variables, odds ratios of 3.31, 3.37, and 4.28 were to be detectable if the
276	predictor variable has a 50/50, 40/60, and 20/80 split, respectively.

# 277 Results

#### 278 Patient Characteristics

- This study included 224 patients with a mean (SD) age of 60.5 (12.7). Most participants, 182
- 280 (81%) were female. The mean (SD) systolic BP was 139 (20) mmHg and diastolic BP was 85
- 281 (13) mmHg (Table 1). Almost half of the participants, 109 (49%) participants had controlled BP
- 282 (<140/90 mmHg). A little over half of the patients (54%) were single, separated or widowed,
- almost half of the patients (47%) were employed and 199 (45%) of the patients had a tertiary or
- higher level of education. One hundred and forty-two (64%) patients had lived with a
- 285 hypertension diagnosis for more than 5 years.

# Table 1. Patients Characteristics stratified by Blood Pressure Control Status (BP <140/90</li> mmHg) Status, n (%) or mean (SD) (N = 224)

Patient level factors		Total	Uncontrolled	Controlled	<i>p</i> -value
		N = 224	N = 115	N =109	
Age (years), mean (SD)		60.50 (12.7)	60.3 (11.3)	60.8 (14.0)	0.749
Sex					
	Male	42 (18.7%)	21 (50%)	21 (50%)	0.847
	Female	182 (81.3%)	94 (51.7%)	88 (48.3%)	
Marital status					
	Married or cohabiting	104 (46%)	50 (48%)	54 (52%)	0.363

120 (54%)	65 (54%)	55 (46%)	
94 (42%)	51 (54%)	43 (46%)	0.542
106 (47%)	54 (51%)	52 (49%)	
24 (11%)	10 (42%)	14 (58%)	
65 (29%)	35 (54%)	30 (46%)	0.869
59 (26%)	29 (49%)	30 (51%)	
199 (45%)	51 (51%)	49 (49%)	
80 (36%)	40 (50%)	40 (50%)	0.762
142 (64%)	74 (51%)	68 (49%)	
90 (40%)	41 (46%)	49 (54%)	0.125
110 (49%)	64 (58%)	46 (42%)	
24 (11%)	10 (42%)	14 (58%)	
139 (20)	153 (17)	123 (10)	0.000
85 (13)	93 (11)	76 (8)	0.000
	Score (SD)	Score (SD)	
9.90 (1.66)	9.86 (1.63)	9.94 (1.70)	0.706
33.36 (2.21)	33.28 (2.39)	33.45 (2.01)	0.562
7.12 (1.18)	7.17 (1.12)	7.09 (1.25)	0.643
50 39 (3 26)	50 30 (3 01)	50 49 (3 52)	0.677
	120 (54%) 94 (42%) 106 (47%) 24 (11%) 65 (29%) 59 (26%) 199 (45%) 80 (36%) 142 (64%) 90 (40%) 110 (49%) 24 (11%) 139 (20) 85 (13) 9.90 (1.66) 33.36 (2.21) 7.12 (1.18) 50 39 (3.26)	$\begin{array}{c cccc} 120 \ (54\%) & 65 \ (54\%) \\ \hline \\ 94 \ (42\%) & 51 \ (54\%) \\ 106 \ (47\%) & 54 \ (51\%) \\ 24 \ (11\%) & 10 \ (42\%) \\ \hline \\ 65 \ (29\%) & 35 \ (54\%) \\ 59 \ (26\%) & 29 \ (49\%) \\ 199 \ (45\%) & 51 \ (51\%) \\ \hline \\ 80 \ (36\%) & 40 \ (50\%) \\ 142 \ (64\%) & 74 \ (51\%) \\ \hline \\ 90 \ (40\%) & 41 \ (46\%) \\ 110 \ (49\%) & 64 \ (58\%) \\ 24 \ (11\%) & 10 \ (42\%) \\ 110 \ (49\%) & 64 \ (58\%) \\ 24 \ (11\%) & 10 \ (42\%) \\ 139 \ (20) & 153 \ (17) \\ 85 \ (13) & 93 \ (11) \\ \hline \\ Score \ (SD) \\ 9.90 \ (1.66) & 9.86 \ (1.63) \\ 33.36 \ (2.21) & 33.28 \ (2.39) \\ \hline \\ 7.12 \ (1.18) & 7.17 \ (1.12) \\ \hline \\ 50 \ 39 \ (3.26) & 50 \ 30 \ (3.01) \\ \hline \end{array}$	120 (54%) $65 (54%)$ $55 (46%)$ $94 (42%)$ $51 (54%)$ $43 (46%)$ $106 (47%)$ $54 (51%)$ $52 (49%)$ $24 (11%)$ $10 (42%)$ $14 (58%)$ $65 (29%)$ $35 (54%)$ $30 (46%)$ $59 (26%)$ $29 (49%)$ $30 (51%)$ $199 (45%)$ $51 (51%)$ $49 (49%)$ $80 (36%)$ $40 (50%)$ $40 (50%)$ $142 (64%)$ $74 (51%)$ $68 (49%)$ $90 (40%)$ $41 (46%)$ $49 (54%)$ $110 (49%)$ $64 (58%)$ $46 (42%)$ $24 (11%)$ $10 (42%)$ $14 (58%)$ $139 (20)$ $153 (17)$ $123 (10)$ $85 (13)$ $93 (11)$ $76 (8)$ Score (SD)       Score (SD)       Score (SD) $9.90 (1.66)$ $9.86 (1.63)$ $9.94 (1.70)$ $33.36 (2.21)$ $33.28 (2.39)$ $33.45 (2.01)$ $7.12 (1.18)$ $7.17 (1.12)$ $7.09 (1.25)$

<sup>288</sup> 

290 The HB-HBP Scale mean scores (±SD) were: Overall, 50.39 (+3.26); medication adherence,

291 33.36 (+2.21); appointment keeping, 7.12 (+1.18); and dietary sodium intake, 9.90 (+1.66).

292 There was no statically significant difference in binary comparison by BP control status with any

- 293 of the measured variables
- 294 Provider Characteristics

Healthcare providers (N = 67) were 32 (+7) years of age (Table 2). Most healthcare providers, 53

296 (79%) were female, 40 (61%) had associate degree or less, and the majority, 61 (91%) were

- enrolled or registered nurses. Of the healthcare providers, 32 (48%) had 4 or more years of
- experience, 39 (59%) worked in general OPD, and 44 (66%) reported that they had received

training on hypertension management in the previous 2 years.

# **Table 2. Healthcare professional characteristics (n = 67)**

Characteristic	Number (%)
Mean Hypertension Knowledge Score (SD)	18.9 (1.9)

<sup>289</sup> 

Age in years, mean (SD)	32 (7)
Sex	
Male	14 (21%)
Female	53 (79%)
Education $(n = 66)$	
Associate degree or less	40 (61%)
Bachelor's degree	20 (30%)
Post-graduate degree	6 (9%)
Profession	
Physician/Doctors	6 (9%)
Enrolled & Registered Nurses	55 (82%)
Other clinical care providers	6 (9%)
Experience	
< 2 years	19 (28%)
2  to  < 4  years	16 (24%)
$\geq 4$ years	32 (48%)
Health facility department	
Hypertension Clinic	10 (15%)
General OPD	39 (59%)
Others	17 (26%)
Received hypertension training in the last 2 years	
No	23 (34%)
Yes	44 (66%)
Type of hypertension treatment received (n = 44)	
Job orientation	13 (30%)
On job training	15 (34%)
Professional certification program	7 (16%)
Conference or other hypertension training workshops	9 (20%)

301

302

#### 303 Health facility Characteristics

304 We conducted the study at 15 health facilities, among which almost half (47%) had less than 50-

305 bed capacity, and nearly half (47%) were government-owned (Table 3 and Table 4). Eight

306 (53%) of the health facilities managed patients in hypertension clinic; the remaining seven

307 managed them in the general OPD.

308

# 309 Table 3. Characteristics of included health facilities in Ashanti Region, Ghana

#### 310 (N = 15)

Sites
7 (47%)
5 (33%)
3 (20%)
7 (47%)

Private	5 (33%)
Christian Health Association of Ghana	3 (20%)
Patients treated in hypertension clinic	
No (General OPD only)	7 (47%)
Yes	8 (53%)
Personnel and training on cardiovascular diseases' management	
Number of full-time nurses (registered and enrolled), median (IQR)	35 (24-205)
Number of full-time doctors (generalists and specialists), median (IQR)	9 (5-17)
Number of full-time paramedical clinicians, median (IQR)	2 (1-7)
Patient/nurse ratio, media (IQR) – based on patient received in OPD last month	26 (19-46)
Patient/physician ratio, media (IQR) – based on patient received in OPD last month	235 (139-388)
Number of facilities where at least one provider received training on cardiovascular	11 (73%)
diseases within the last 2 years, n (%)	
Hypertension Service Readiness Indicators, n (%)	
Hypertension guidelines <sup>0</sup>	12 (80%)
Patient education materials	9 (60%)
At least one functional blood pressure measurement apparatus <sup>1</sup>	15 (100%)
Basic laboratory exams available <sup>2</sup>	11 (73%)
All first line treatment medications available $(n = 14)^3$	9 (64%)
At least one second line treatment medication available $(n = 14)^4$	14 (100%)
Availability of Essential antihypertensive medications, n = 14 (%)	
Angiotensin converting enzyme inhibitor	14 (100%)
Angiotensin receptor blocker	13 (93%)
Calcium channel blocker	14 (100%)
Thiazide diuretic	9 (64%)
Beta blocker	11 (78%)
Aldosterone antagonist	4 (28%)
Central acting agent	12 (86%)
Vasodilator	10 (71%)
Fixed dose combination	8 (57%)

Abbreviations: IQR - Interquartile Range; OPD - Outpatient Department.

<sup>o</sup>Considered the 2017 national treatment standards or 2021 cardiovascular diseases guidelines.

<sup>1</sup>Considered automatic Blood Pressure device or sphygmomanometer with stethoscope.

<sup>2</sup>Included 5 tests: valid dipstick for urine protein, urine glucose, and urine ketones; glucometer for blood glucose and valid test strips; and hemoglobinometer or analyzer for hemoglobin testing.

<sup>3</sup>First line treatment medications considered according to Ghana Protocol - Angiotensin Converting Enzyme Inhibitors, Angiotensin Receptor Blocker, Calcium Channel Blocker, Thiazide, and Beta Blocker. <sup>4</sup>Second line treatment medications considered - Centrally Acting Agent; Vasodilators, and Aldosterone Antagonists.

#### 311

#### 312

#### Table 4. Health Facility Characteristics Grouped by Patient Blood Pressure Control Status of Included Patients, n (%) (N = 224)

Patient level factors	Total	Uncontrolled	Controlled	<i>p</i> -value
	N=224	N=115	N =109	-
Facility ownership				
Private	69 (31%)	33 (48%)	36 (52%)	0.659
Government	109 (49%)	56 (51%)	53 (49%)	
СНАС	46 (20%)	26 (57%)	20 (43%)	
Hypertension Clinic	<u> </u>	· · ·	· · ·	
General OPD only	101 (45%)	57 (56%)	44 (44%)	0.167
Yes	123 (55%)	58 (57%)	65 (53%)	
Provider training	· · ·	· · ·	· · ·	
No	53 (24%)	25 (47%)	28 (53%)	0.487
Yes	171 (76%)	90 (53%)	81 (47%)	
Facility size by bed count		. ,		

< 50 beds	100 (45%)	50 (50%)	50 (50%)	0.682
50  to < 100  beds	76 (34%)	42 (55%)	34 (45%)	
$\geq$ 100 beds	48 (21%)	23 (48%)	25 (52%)	
All first line medications available				
No	67 (32%)	33 (49%)	34 (51%)	0.666
Yes	143 (68%)	75 (52%)	68 (48%)	
Patient to nurse ratio (patients per month per nurse)				
< 20	76 (30%)	31 (46%)	36 (54%)	0.611
20 to <40	99 (44%)	53 (54%)	46 (46%)	
≥40	58 (26%)	31 (53%)	27 (47%)	
Patient to physician or physician assistant ratio (patients per month per clinician)				
< 140	74 (33%)	31 (42%)	43 (58%)	0.095
140 to <280	90 (40%)	53 (59%)	37 (41%)	
≥280	60 (27%)	31 (52%)	29 (48%)	

315

316 Regarding the health facilities' hypertension service readiness indicators, 11 (73%) health 317 facilities had at least one healthcare provider who received training on cardiovascular diseases 318 within the last 2 years. Hypertension guidelines were available in 12 (80%) health facilities, 319 patient education materials were available in nine (60%) health facilities, and all 15 (100%) 320 health facilities had at least one functional BP measurement apparatus. The basic laboratory 321 exams were available in 11 (73%) health facilities, and all first-line antihypertensive medications 322 were available in nine (64%) of 14 health facilities assessed for medications availability. All 14 323 (100%) health facilities had at least one second-line antihypertensive medication. Angiotensin-324 converting enzyme inhibitors were available in all 14 (100%) health facilities, and thiazide 325 diuretics were the least available (observed in 9 or 64% of the 14 assessed health facilities) of 326 the first-line antihypertensive medications. Of the second-line antihypertensive medications, a 327 centrally acting agent category of drugs was the most available (observed in 12 or 86% of the 328 14 assessed health facilities); aldosterone antagonist category was the least available 329 (observed in 4 or 28% of the 14 assessed health facilities).

- 330 Patient-, provider-, and facility level predictors systolic and diastolic BP
- 331 Patient-level predictors of systolic and diastolic BP and BP control
- 332 The patients' educational level was associated with systolic BP while travel duration to the
- health facility, and the overall HB-HBP scores were associated with diastolic BP. Having a
- 334 secondary level of education was associated with roughly 8 mmHg lower systolic BP
- 335 (Coefficient: -7.69; 95% CI: -15.13, -0.26) than having a primary or lower educational level
- 336 (Table 5). Additionally, travelling for an hour or more to the health facility was associated with
- roughly 7 mmHg higher (Coefficient: 6.86; 95% CI: 0.92, 12.81) diastolic BP. Finally, a unit
- increase in overall HB-HBP scores was associated with a ½ mmHg lower (Coefficient: -0.55,
- 339 95% CI: -1.09, -0.01) diastolic BP. In the HB-HBP sub-scores, a unit increase in the diet control
- 340 scores was associated with one unit lower (Coefficient: -1.11; 95% CI: -2.20, -0.02) diastolic BP
- in mmHg.

# Table 5. Mixed-Effects Regression of Patient Factors of Systolic and Diastolic Blood Pressure and Blood Pressure Control in Kumasi, Ghana (n = 221 patients, 15 health facilities)

	Adjusted SBP Coefficients, 95% CI*	Adjusted DBP Coefficients, 95% CI*	Adjusted BP Control OR, 95% CI*
Patient level factors	,		,
Employment status			
Unemployed	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.
Employed	-5.25 (-11.83, 1.34)	-2.89 (-6.96, 1.19)	1.31 (0.67, 2.57)
Retired	-4.19 (-13.57, 5.2)	-3.41 (-9.24, 2.41)	1.91 (0.73, 5.00)
Education			
Primary or less	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.
Secondary level	-7.69 (-15.13, -0.26) †	-3.4 (-7.97, 1.16)	1.29 (0.61, 2.76)
Tertiary or higher	-1.85 (-8.8, 5.09)	-1.78 (-6.07, 2.52)	1.21 (0.6, 2.45)
Travel duration to the health fac	ility		
<30 minutes	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.
<i>30 to &lt;1 hour</i>	3.1 (-2.7, 8.91)	<b>3.75 (0.12, 7.38)</b> <sup>†</sup>	0.51 (0.28, 0.92)†
$\geq 1$ hour	5.46 (-3.96, 14.87)	6.86 (0.92, 12.81) <sup>†</sup>	1.03 (0.4, 2.67)
Compliance to High Blood Press	ure Therapy		
Diet (3 items) $*1$	-0.47 (-2.22, 1.28)	-1.11 (-2.20, -0.02) †	0.99 (0.82, 1.18)
Medication (9 items) *1	-0.95 (-2.19, 0.29)	-0.72 (-1.49, 0.06)	1.03 (0.91, 1.17)
Appointment (2 items) *1	0.89 (-1.44, 3.23)	0.51 (-0.97, 2.00)	0.98 (0.78, 1.24)
Overall score (14 items)	-0.46 (-1.33, 0.41)	-0.55 (-1.09, -0.01) †	1.01 (0.92, 1.1)

\*Adjusted for all other variables (except Hillbone treatment adherence sub scores) plus age, sex, marital status, and length of diagnosis | \*1Adjusted for all other variables (except other Hillbone treatment adherence sub scores and total score) plus age, sex, marital status, and length of diagnosis | SBP: Systolic Blood Pressure; DBP: Diastolic Blood Pressure | \*Statistically significant (p<0.05)

#### 345

- 346 In the unadjusted and fully adjusted mixed-effects logistic regression models, only the duration of
- 347 travel to the health facility remained significant. Patients who travelled 30 minutes to an hour to
- 348 the health facility were two times less likely to have controlled BP than their counterparts who
- 349 travelled less than 30 minutes (OR: 0.51; 95% CI: 0.28, 0.92).
- 350 Provider level predictors of BP outcomes
- 351 Provider knowledge of hypertension guidelines was 18.9 (+1.9) on a 23-point scale. In

association analyses, no provider characteristics were associated with the provider knowledge

353 scores. Two-thirds (75% of the 64) of respondents reported being very or moderately familiar

354 with hypertension treatment guidelines (Fig 1).

# Fig 1. Self-reported familiarity with hypertension treatment guidelines among healthcare providers in Kumasi, Ghana (n = 64)

357

358 Regarding the nurses' and other clinical staffs' (other than medical doctors) attitudes towards 359 hypertension guidelines, almost 100% of the respondents were "very confident" in their 360 adherence to the guidelines while measuring BP; roughly 80% were "very confident" in 361 providing counselling on healthy lifestyles (Fig 2). Only half of the respondents were "very 362 confident" in diagnosing hypertension, and even fewer, roughly 30%, were confident in 363 prescribing antihypertensive medications. Overall, 75% of the nurses and other clinical staff 364 (except medical doctors) were very confident in adhering to hypertension guidelines while 365 managing patients with hypertension.

#### Fig 2. Self-reported confidence in adhering to hypertension treatment guidelines among nurses and other clinical staff (except medical doctors) in Kumasi, Ghana (n = 57)

368

369 Health facility level predictors of systolic and diastolic BP and BP control

- 370 At the health facility level, the facility ownership and patient-to-physician or physician assistant
- 371 ratio predicted both systolic and diastolic BP and provider training showed association with
- diastolic BP (Tables 6).

#### 373 Table 6. Mixed-Effects Linear Regression of Health Facility Factors of Systolic and

Diastolic Blood Pressure and Blood Pressure Control in Kumasi, Ghana (n = 221 patients,
 15 health facilities)

	Adjusted SBPAdjusted DBPCoefficients, 95% CI*Coefficients, 95% CI*		Adjusted BP Control OR, 95%	
			CI*	
Facility level factors				
Facility ownership				
Private	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
Government	-19.4 (-33.58, -5.22) <sup>†</sup>	-13.48 (-22.21, -4.76) <sup>†</sup>	2.2 (0.49, 9.96)	
Christian Health Association of Ghana	-23.25 (-39.98, -6.52) †	-14.31 (-24.6, -4.01) <sup>†</sup>	3.4 (0.58, 19.85)	
Hypertension Clinic				
General OPD only	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
Yes	-2.27 (-9.08, 4.53)	-2.4 (-6.59, 1.79)	1.26 (0.61, 2.58)	
Provider training				
No	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
Yes	6.4 (-3.65, 16.45)	<b>6.8 (0.62, 12.98)</b> <sup>†</sup>	0.38 (0.13, 1.10)	
Facility size by bed count		<u> </u>	,	
<50 beds	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
50 to <100 beds	1.48 (-11.15, 14.12)	0.81 (-6.96, 8.59)	0.67 (0.18, 2.49)	
≤100 beds	-4.06 (-17.75, 9.63)	-0.62 (-9.05, 7.8)	1.54 (0.37, 6.51)	
All first line medications available	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	· · · · ·	· · · · ·	
No	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
Yes	-5.25 (-17.51, 7.01)	-1.06 (-8.61, 6.48)	1.6 (0.43, 5.89)	
Patient to nurse ratio (patients per mon	th per nurse)			
<20	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
20 to <40	-6.1 (-16.95, 4.76)	-5.35 (-12.03, 1.33)	1.3 (0.42, 4.08)	
≥40	-1.72 (-12.5, 9.06)	-3.34 (-9.98, 3.29)	0.93 (0.3, 2.88)	
Patient to physician or physician assist	tant ratio (patients per mont	h per clinician)	, <u>, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , </u>	
<140	Ref.	Ref.	Ref.	
140 to <280	23.06 (10.06, 36.05) *	15.52 (7.53, 23.52) †	0.18 (0.05, 0.74)†	
≥280	27.24 (6.59, 47.88) †	12.83 (0.12, 25.53) †	0.27 (0.03, 2.38)	
*Adjusted for all other variables plus age, sex.	education, employment status: (	OPD: Outpatient Department; SBI	P: Systolic Blood	

\*Adjusted for all other variables plus age, sex, education, employment status: OPD: Outpatient Department; SBP: Systolic Blood Pressure; DBP: Diastolic Blood Pressure. \*Statistically significant (p<0.05)

376

377 Compared to private health facilities, receiving care at government health facilities was

associated with a 19 mmHg (Coefficient: -19.4; 95% CI: -33.58, -5.22) and 13 mmHg

379 (Coefficient: -13.48; 95% CI: -22.21, -4.76) lower systolic and diastolic BP, respectively, and 380 receiving care at CHAG health facilities was associated with a 23 mmHg (Coefficient: -23.25; 381 95% CI: -39.98, -6.52) and 14 mmHg (Coefficient: -14.31; 95% CI: -24.6, -4.01) lower systolic 382 and diastolic BP, respectively. 383 Receiving care at health facilities where a physician or physician assistant consulted 140 to 280 384 patients per month in OPD was associated with a 23 mmHg (Coefficient: 23.06 95% CI: 10.06, 385 36.05) and 15 mmHg (Coefficient: 15.52; 95% CI: 7.53, 23.52) higher systolic and diastolic BP, 386 respectively, than where those clinicians consulted less than 140 patients per month in OPD. At 387 facilities where a physician or physician assistant consulted 280 or more patients per month, 388 there was a 27 mmHg (Coefficient: 23.06 95% CI: 10.06, 36.05) average higher systolic BP. 389 Oddly, patients at health facilities that reported having at least one provider who received

training in cardiovascular diseases in the last 2 years had a 7 mmHg higher diastolic BP

391 (Coefficient: 6.8; 95% CI: 0.62, 12.98).

392 In the unadjusted and fully adjusted mixed-effects logistic regression models, patient-to-

393 physician or physician assistant ratio (at the health facility level) predicted the patients' BP

394 control status (Table 6). Patients receiving care at health facilities where a physician or physician

assistant consulted 140 to 280 patients per month were five times less likely (OR: 0.18; 95% CI:

396 0.05, 0.74) to have controlled BP than those who received care where a physician or physician

assistant consulted less than 140 patients per month.

### 398 Discussion

399 The purpose of this study was to explore the health facility readiness for hypertension

400 management and assess the patient-, provider-, and health facility-level factors of systolic and

401 diastolic BP and BP control in Ghana. Most health facilities had at least one trained provider, had 402 hypertension guidelines, BP measurement equipment, and basic laboratory exams. Conversely, 403 the availability of patient educational materials and all first-line antihypertensive medications 404 was sub-optimal. We found that nearly half of the patient participants had a controlled BP. 405 Patients' education, travel duration to the health facility, and adherence to treatment predicted 406 BP outcomes. Providers had high knowledge of hypertension guidelines and reported being very 407 confident in their adherence to those guidelines in practice. At health facility level, the facility 408 ownership, the patient-to-physician or physician assistant ratio, and provider training predicted 409 the patient BP outcomes. 410 Our findings are comparable to the findings of the 2019 May Measurement Month conducted in 411 Kumasi, Ashanti Region, Ghana [29]. In that study, 49% of the patients on treatment for 412 hypertension had a controlled BP [29]. Different studies, however, have reported slightly 413 different levels of controlled BP among patients on hypertension treatment. The 2018 May 414 Measurement Month conducted in Ashanti Region reported a 32% controlled BP among patients

415 on hypertension treatment [30]. A different community-based study conducted in Bono Region

416 reported a 41% BP control [31], and a study which recruited patients from two hospitals in

417 greater Accra reported a 23% BP control level [32]. It is, however, necessary to understand that

418 only 30% of patients aware of their hypertension status are initiated on treatment, bringing the

419 overall estimate of people with hypertension with controlled BP down to 6% [3].

420 Patients with a secondary education had roughly 8 mmHg lower systolic BP than their

421 counterparts with primary or lower level of education. These findings are similar to those of the

422 previous literature. In a study conducted in Accra, patients with junior high and secondary

423 education had 3 times the odds of controlled BP than patients with no formal education [32]. The

424 level of education is one of the indicators of socio-determinants of health where higher education 425 is often associated with higher socioeconomic status, social networks, and access to better 426 quality of healthcare. Studies in different SSA countries demonstrate a relationship, often 427 mediated by body mass index, between wealth and hypertension, where higher socioeconomic 428 status is often associated with poor BP outcomes (higher BP) [33–35]. In the analysis of the 429 2014 Demographic and Health Survey data in Ghana, Amegah and Nayha (2018) demonstrated 430 that higher educational attainment attenuated the relationship between wealth and BP [33]. In 431 their analysis, affluent people with primary education had up to 8 times higher odds of elevated 432 BP than their poorest counterparts while there was no association between wealth and BP status 433 among people with a university degree [33]. However, poor and less educated people are at 434 increased risk for poor BP outcomes, as demonstrated by a study conducted in eight SSA 435 countries [36]. In that multinational study, individuals with low wealth index in both low- and 436 middle-income countries (LMICs) had 88% higher odds of uncontrolled BP than their 437 counterparts with higher wealth index [36]. Interventions for addressing hypertension will have 438 to include specific measures for socioeconomically disadvantaged populations. 439 We found that travelling for an hour or more to the health facility for hypertension care was 440 associated with roughly 7 mmHg higher diastolic BP. The distance of travel to the health facility 441 is an important factor of health services accessibility and utilization [37]. The international 442 standards specify that 80% of a given country's population should have access to a hospital 443 within 2 hours of walking distance for a timely management of emergencies. Yet, the literature 444 lacks consistency as to which practical distance or travel time from the health center is associated 445 with optimally good health outcomes. Some studies suggest 30 minutes from health centers, 446 others 45 minutes, and others consider one hour as the cap for living in the served radius of a

447 community health center [38–40]. The 2019 Ghana Living Standards Survey reported that on 448 average 20% of people in Ghana travelled more than an hour to the nearest health facility [41], 449 and another study reported that 14% of the population in Ghana travel more than two hours to 450 any nearest public hospital [42]. One significant challenge with hypertension care in Ghana is the 451 lack of emphasis on strengthening hypertension care services at the community-level health 452 facilities [43]. Since there are no guidelines and enforcement of systems for managing or 453 following up patients with hypertension at the low levels of the health systems (community-level 454 health facilities), and systems such as mobile clinics or digital healthcare are absent, patients 455 must travel long distances to hospitals for their regular hypertension follow-up appointments 456 [43]. On the hospital side, the patient overload leads to quicker depletion of resources, longer 457 waiting times, and the overall poor quality of services, hence poor health outcomes. In a 458 similarly low-income SSA country, Rwanda, a study demonstrated that after removing the 459 distance barriers of care access through the decentralization of hypertension care services to 460 community health centers, there was no significant difference in achieving BP targets between 461 patients followed up at the district hospitals versus community health centers [44]. Strategies for 462 improving the geographical access of hypertension services are very much needed in Ghana.

In the current study, we found that higher hypertension treatment adherence scores were associated with lower diastolic BP. These findings corroborate the previous literature. In their study, Sarfo and colleagues (2020) showed that each one-unit increase in the scores of adherence to treatment was associated with a quarter unit decline in diastolic BP and a 3% higher odds of BP control [45]. Multiple factors at the patient-, provider-, and health facility level influence the patient adherence to treatment. At the patient-level, the forgetfulness, alcohol consumption and smoking behaviors, and the lack of motivation with the understanding that hypertension is a

470 chronic condition requiring ongoing treatment are some of the reasons that hinder compliance to 471 treatment [46,47]. The provider factors include the competence in educating patients on their 472 health situation and the goal for treatment, and their own knowledge on hypertension could 473 influence patients' adherence to treatment. At the health facility and health systems level, the 474 availability, accessibility and affordability of the medications have been expressed as major 475 barriers to patients' adherence to treatment [46]. The success of any strategy to manage 476 hypertension will in many ways require finding measures for addressing factors of non-477 compliance with hypertension treatment.

478 Healthcare providers had high knowledge scores on hypertension guidelines and reported a high 479 overall self-confidence in adhering to guidelines on tasks that were in their scope of practice. 480 While there is limited literature on healthcare providers' objective knowledge of hypertension 481 guidelines, extensive literature exists about healthcare providers' perceptions on barriers to 482 hypertension management in Ghana—alluding more to their lack of knowledge on hypertension 483 and the need for more training [48,49]. A qualitative interview with healthcare providers at 484 community health centers in the Upper East Region of Ghana reported that providers felt that 485 they had inadequate knowledge on cardiovascular disease screening, treatment, and prescribing 486 medications for cardiovascular diseases, and expressed the need for regular training sessions, 487 workshops, and mentorship opportunities on cardiovascular diseases management [43]. In our 488 findings, many health facilities reported that at least one healthcare provider had received 489 training on hypertension management within two years, which could explain our findings of 490 higher knowledge scores and confidence. Yet, the training did not translate to better BP 491 outcomes. In our assessment, the most common type of training available for healthcare 492 providers was the job orientation for new hires. We think that the low patients' outcomes among

493 facilities with trained providers could be explained by the new and unexperienced healthcare 494 providers. Beyond provider training, however, there should be a system for flagging patients 495 with uncontrolled BP to identify patient-specific support measures to help them better adhere to 496 healthy behaviors and prescribed medications. More studies exploring the healthcare providers' 497 knowledge are needed to help strategize the needed content areas to cover while training 498 healthcare providers in cardiovascular diseases management. Finally, the structured training 499 accompanied with mentoring could be necessary to ensure that the acquired knowledge appropriately translated to practice, hence better patients outcomes. 500

501 We found that at facilities where a physician or physician assistant consulted 280 or more 502 patients per month, patients had an average of 27-mmHg higher systolic BP and were five times 503 less likely to have controlled BP. These findings speak to the shortage of healthcare providers, 504 especially those in charge of doing consultation and prescribing medications for patients with 505 hypertension (physicians, and physician assistants) and the associated poor BP outcomes. With a 506 long queue of patients outside, the physician or physician assistant can only rush through the 507 consultation, hence lacking adequate time to appropriately assess the patient needs to adjust the 508 treatment accordingly. Like in many other LMICs, Ghana health policy still does not permit 509 nurses to independently diagnose and prescribe antihypertensive medications [43,50]. Multiple 510 studies have successfully trained nurses to diagnose hypertension and prescribe medications and 511 patients have been very receptive of this approach [43,49,51,52]. Yet, practical and policy 512 challenges continue to implementation of task-shifting strategy. Amid the challenges 513 of maintaining the high numbers of medical doctors and physicians, the next best approach will 514 be for policymakers to refer to the existing evidence and quickly institute and reinforce a policy

on training nurses to manage hypertension, including the diagnosis and prescription ofantihypertensive medications.

517 We found that receiving care at private health facilities was associated with poor BP outcomes. 518 These findings are counterintuitive, given that most of private health facilities are created 519 because of inefficiencies in public health facilities and are often reported to have shorter wait 520 times, better patient-provider relationships, and higher overall user satisfaction [53]. While it is 521 not very clear why hypertension care in private health facilities is associated with poor outcomes, 522 a few elements could offer some explanations. One strategy that has shown to be effective in 523 hypertension management is team-based care—where healthcare professionals collaborate to 524 manage patients with hypertension [54]. Yet, to minimize expenses, private health facilities de-525 emphasize the need to hire all key healthcare professionals such as pharmacists, dieticians, 526 community health workers and others. Further, many private health facilities may not have the 527 financial capacity to employ full-time cardiologists or medical doctors, while public health 528 facilities may have them in addition to the other allied health professionals who are essential in 529 team-based hypertension management.

Another key aspect of care in private versus public health facilities is the cost of care. The cost of 530 531 care and the patient out-of-pocket spending are usually higher in private than government or 532 quasi-governmental health facilities facilities [53]. The high cost of care makes it that poor 533 people cannot attend private health facilities, but even the so-called wealthy might not be rich 534 enough to afford the care and associated costs. Looking for ways to cut spending, patients could 535 opt for poor utilization of health services or not purchasing some medications, hence leading to 536 poor BP health outcomes. Like public health facilities, many private health facilities in Ghana 537 provide services to patients insured by the National Health Insurance Scheme (NHIA). Yet,

previous literature has highlighted challenges with the NHIA, including major delays in reimbursements that impede timely programming and health planning, especially in private health facilities, which rely solely on these funds for all facility activities [40,43]. These lead to poor access to medications and other key equipment and justification of higher out-of-pocket charges that impact patients' outcomes.

543 Our study comes with some limitations. First, with the use of cross-sectional design, we could 544 not longitudinally assess the change in BP or achievement of BP control and associated patient-, 545 provider-, and facility-level factors. Second, our study was conducted at a small number of 546 health facilities, which did not allow sufficient statistical power to detect small associations 547 between facility-level predictors with the outcomes of interest. Third, in Ghana and many other 548 countries in SSA, there are no systems for patients to maintain one primary healthcare provider, 549 hence, we could not link patients' outcomes with individual healthcare providers. We hence 550 aggregated variables of provider-level characteristics, knowledge scores, and self-reported 551 adherence to hypertension guidelines but could not link them directly to patients' BP outcomes. 552 Additionally, some assessments of the patient- and provider-level predictors were based on self-553 reported measures which could be associated with recall and social desirability bias. Last, the 554 Service Availability and Readiness Assessment tool we used to measure health facility data has 555 not been extensively utilized in other settings to measure hypertension service readiness, which 556 limits comparison of findings across studies and settings. Despite the listed limitations, our study 557 has major strengths in that it incorporates a broader viewpoint (from patient up to the facility-558 level) on the factors associated with hypertension service provision and patients' BP outcomes. 559 This study provides data that is vital to entities looking to explore the multi-level factors of

hypertension care and outcomes at a broader scale or looking to implement interventions forhypertension management.

# 562 CONCLUSION

563 In conclusion, hypertension control among patients with hypertension on treatment is low. 564 Patients' education and access to treatment, facility type of management, and provider density 565 are associated with BP outcomes. Providers expressed high confidence in adhering to guidelines, 566 but provider training was associated with poor outcomes, highlighting the lack of experience in 567 hypertension management. Interventions targeting the patient-, provider-, and health system-568 levels will be needed to successfully address the hypertension burden. A large-scale study 569 exploring the patient, provider, health facilities, and overall system factors of hypertension care 570 and outcomes is needed. Specifically, larger studies should explore hypertension services 571 accessibility, provider knowledge to guide curriculum development, nurse-to-patient ratio, and 572 overall health facility hypertension readiness characteristics on patients' BP outcomes

# 573 Declarations

#### 574 Ethics Statement

575 This study was approved by the committee on human research, publication, and ethics at Kwame

- 576 Nkrumah University of Science and Technology School of Medicine and Dentistry (Ref:
- 577 CHRPE/AP/021/22) and the Johns Hopkins Medicine Institutional Review Board
- 578 (IRB00218586). After securing the ethics committee approvals, we secured signed memoranda
- 579 of understanding with each participating health facility detailing the study procedures, timelines,

580	and potential individuals to	be invited in t	he study. All pat	ients and healthcare	providers signed

581 informed paper and electronic consent, respectively, prior to participating in the study.

# 582 Funding Statement

- 583 SB received the following funding to conduct this project: (1) Discovery and Innovation Fund by
- Johns Hopkins School of Nursing [2021], (2) Johns Hopkins Provosts' Travel and Research
- 585 Award [2021-2022], (3) Johns Hopkins Provosts' Dissertation Completion Award [2021-2022],
- 586 (4) Global Health Established Field Placement Travel Grant offered by the Johns
- 587 Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health [2021], and (5) Joana and Bill Conway Scholarship
- 588 [2019-2022]. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily
- represent the official views of any of the funders. The funding sources had no role in the
- 590 development of this manuscript.

# 591 Acknowledgment

- 592 We thank all the health facilities in Kumasi Ghana, healthcare providers, and patients who
- 593 participated in the ADHINCRA study.

594

# 595 References

- 596 1. Guwatudde D, Nankya-Mutyoba J, Kalyesubula R, Laurence C, Adebamowo C, Ajayi IO,
- 597 et al. The burden of hypertension in sub-Saharan Africa: A four-country cross sectional
- 598 study. BMC Public Health. 2015;15: 1211. doi:10.1186/s12889-015-2546-z
- 599 2. World Health Organization (WHO). Hypertension Fact Sheet. 2019 [cited 15 Apr 2020].
- 600 Available: https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/hypertension
- 601 3. Bosu WK, Bosu DK. Prevalence, awareness and control of hypertension in Ghana: A
- 602 systematic review and meta-analysis. PLoS ONE. 2021.
- 603 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0248137
- 4. Nyaaba GN, Stronks K, de-Graft Aikins A, Kengne AP, Agyemang C. Tracing Africa's
- 605 progress towards implementing the Non-Communicable Diseases Global action plan
- 606 2013-2020: a synthesis of WHO country profile reports. BMC Public Health. 2017;17:
- 607 297. doi:10.1186/s12889-017-4199-6
- 5. Iwelunmor J, Plange-Rhule J, Airhihenbuwa CO, Ezepue C, Ogedegbe O. A Narrative
- 609 Synthesis of the Health Systems Factors Influencing Optimal Hypertension Control in
- 610 Sub-Saharan Africa. PLoS One. 2015;10: e0130193–e0130193.
- 611 doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0130193
- 612 6. Nulu S, Aronow WS, Frishman WH. Hypertension in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Contextual
- 613 View of Patterns of Disease, Best Management, and Systems Issues. Cardiol Rev.
- 614 2016;24: 30–40. doi:10.1097/CRD.00000000000083
- 615 7. Whelton PK, Carey RM, Aronow WS, Casey DE, Collins KJ, Himmelfarb CD, et al. 2017
- 616 ACC/AHA/AAPA/ABC/ACPM/AGS/APhA/ASH/ASPC/NMA/PCNA Guideline for the

617	Prevention,	Detection,	Evaluation,	and Managemen	it of High E	Blood Pressure	in Adults. J
-----	-------------	------------	-------------	---------------	--------------	----------------	--------------

618 Am Coll Cardiol. 2018;71: e127 LP-e248. doi:10.1016/j.jacc.2017.11.006

- 8. James PA, Oparil S, Carter BL, Cushman WC, Dennison-Himmelfarb C, Handler J, et al.
- 620 2014 Evidence-Based Guideline for the Management of High Blood Pressure in Adults:
- 621 Report From the Panel Members Appointed to the Eighth Joint National Committee (JNC
- 622 8). JAMA. 2014;311: 507–520. doi:10.1001/jama.2013.284427
- 623 9. Unger T, Borghi C, Charchar F, Khan NA, Poulter NR, Prabhakaran D, et al. 2020
- 624 International Society of Hypertension Global Hypertension Practice Guidelines.

625 Hypertension. 2020;75: 1334–1357. doi:10.1161/HYPERTENSIONAHA.120.15026

- 626 10. Jeemon P, Séverin T, Amodeo C, Balabanova D, Campbell NRC, Gaita D, et al. World
- 627 heart federation roadmap for hypertension A 2021 update. Glob Heart. 2021;16: 63.
- 628 doi:10.5334/GH.1066/METRICS/
- 629 11. Suzuki Y, Kaneko H, Yano Y, Okada A, Matsuoka S, Fujiu K, et al. Reduction in blood
- 630 pressure for people with isolated diastolic hypertension and cardiovascular outcomes. Eur

631 J Prev Cardiol. 2022 [cited 10 Jan 2023]. doi:10.1093/EURJPC/ZWAC278

632 12. Flint AC, Conell C, Ren X, Banki NM, Chan SL, Rao VA, et al. Effect of Systolic and

633 Diastolic Blood Pressure on Cardiovascular Outcomes. New England Journal of Medicine.

634 2019;381: 243–251.

635 doi:10.1056/NEJMOA1803180/SUPPL\_FILE/NEJMOA1803180\_DISCLOSURES.PDF

- 636 13. Chaix B, Bean K, Leal C, Thomas F, Havard S, Evans D, et al. Individual/neighborhood
- 637 social factors and blood pressure in the RECORD Cohort Study: which risk factors
- explain the associations? Hypertension. 2010;55: 769–75.
- 639 doi:10.1161/HYPERTENSIONAHA.109.143206

- 640 14. Wagner EH. Chronic disease management: what will it take to improve care for chronic
- 641 illness? Effective clinical practice : ECP. United States; 1998. pp. 2–4.
- 642 15. Owusu MF, Basu A, Barnett P. Hypertension and diabetes management: a policy
- 643 perspective from Ghana. J Health Organ Manag. 2018/11/09. 2019;33: 35–50.
- 644 doi:10.1108/JHOM-03-2018-0076
- 645 16. World Health Organization (WHO). Monitoring the Building Blocks of Health Systems:
- 646 A handbook of indicators and their meaurement strategies. World Health Organization.
- 647 Geneva; 2010. doi:10.1146/annurev.ecolsys.35.021103.105711
- 648 17. Ahafo B, Accra G, East U, West U, Executives C, Comity T, et al. Ghana Districts A
- 649 repository of all districts in the republic of Ghana. 2012; 2–3.
- 650 18. Ghana Statistical Service. Population by Regions. 2019 [cited 18 Nov 2020].
- 651 doi:10.1128/AAC.03728-14
- 652 19. Ghana Statistical Service. Kumasi metropolitan. 2010; 92.
- 653 20. Ghana Open data initiative. Health Facilities | Ghana Open Data Initiative. 2016 [cited 16
- 54 Jun 2020]. Available: https://data.gov.gh/dataset/health-facilities-
- 655 ghana/resource/aa5b8e2f-a2e7-4aa6-9fef-
- 656 cc31e1d1aa90#%7Bquery:%7Bfilters:[%7Btype:!term,field:!Region,term:!ashanti%7D]%
- 657 7D,view-
- 658 graph:%7BgraphOptions:%7Bhooks:%7BprocessOffset:%7B%7D,bindEvents:%7B%7D
  659 %7D%7D%7D,
- 660 21. Cuschieri S. The STROBE guidelines. Saudi J Anaesth. 2019;13: S31.
- 661 doi:10.4103/SJA.SJA\_543\_18

- 662 22. Muntner P, Shimbo D, Carey RM, Charleston JB, Gaillard T, Misra S, et al. Measurement
- of Blood Pressure in Humans: A Scientific Statement From the American Heart
- 664 Association. Hypertension. 2019;73: E35–E66. doi:10.1161/HYP.000000000000087
- 665 23. NATIONAL GUIDELINES FOR THE MANAGEMENT OF CARDIOVASCULAR
- 666 DISEASES First Edition. Accra; 2019.
- 667 24. Kim MT, Hill MN, Bone LR, Levine DM. Development and testing of the Hill-Bone
- 668 Compliance to High Blood Pressure Therapy Scale. Prog Cardiovasc Nurs. 2000;15: 90–
- 669 96. doi:10.1111/J.1751-7117.2000.TB00211.X
- 670 25. Baldridge A, Orji A, Omitiran K, Guo M, Ajisegiri S, Ojo T, et al. Capacity and Site
- 671 Readiness for Hypertension Control Program Implementation in the Federal Capital
- 672 Territory of Nigeria: A Cross-Sectional Study. Health Serv Res. 2020;55: 67–67.
- 673 doi:10.1111/1475-6773.13421
- 674 26. National Standard Treatment Guidelines 7th Edition. Accra; 2017. Available:
- 675 https://www.moh.gov.gh/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/GHANA-STG-2017-1.pdf
- 676 27. Ministry of Health Ghana National Drugs Programme (GNDP) Essential Medicines List
- 677 7th Edition. Accra; 2017. Available: https://www.moh.gov.gh/wp-
- 678 content/uploads/2020/07/GHANA-EML-2017.pdf
- 679 28. Sarfo F, Treiber F, Gebregziabher M, Adamu S, Patel S, Nichols M, et al. PINGS (Phone-
- 680 Based Intervention Under Nurse Guidance After Stroke): Interim Results of a Pilot
- 681 Randomized Controlled Trial. Stroke. 2017/12/08. 2018;49: 236–239.
- 682 doi:10.1161/STROKEAHA.117.019591
- 683 29. Tannor EK, Nyarko OO, Adu-Boakye Y, Owusu Konadu S, Opoku G, Ankobea-Kokroe
- 684 F, et al. Prevalence of Hypertension in Ghana: Analysis of an Awareness and Screening

- 685 Campaign in 2019. https://doi.org/101177/11795468221120092. 2022;16.
- 686 doi:10.1177/11795468221120092
- 687 30. Tannor EK, Nyarko OO, Adu-Boakye Y, Owusu Konadu S, Opoku G, Ankobea-Kokroe
- 688 F, et al. Burden of hypertension in Ghana Analysis of awareness and screening
- campaign in the Ashanti Region of Ghana. JRSM Cardiovasc Dis. 2022;11:
- 690 204800402210755. doi:10.1177/20480040221075521
- 691 31. Dosoo DK, Nyame S, Enuameh Y, Ayetey H, Danwonno H, Twumasi M, et al.
- 692 Prevalence of Hypertension in the Middle Belt of Ghana: A Community-Based Screening
- 693 Study. Int J Hypertens. 2019;2019. doi:10.1155/2019/1089578
- 694 32. Okai DE, Manu A, Amoah EM, Laar A, Akamah J, Torpey K. Patient-level factors
- 695 influencing hypertension control in adults in Accra, Ghana. BMC Cardiovasc Disord.
- 696 2020;20. doi:10.1186/S12872-020-01370-Y
- 697 33. Amegah AK, Näyhä S. Educational attainment modifies the association of wealth status
- 698 with elevated blood pressure in the Ghanaian population. Heliyon. 2018;4: 711.
- 699 doi:10.1016/J.HELIYON.2018.E00711
- 700 34. Banchani E, Tenkorang EY, Midodzi W. Examining the effects of individual and
- 701 neighbourhood socioeconomic status/wealth on hypertension among women in the
- 702 Greater Accra Region of Ghana. Health Soc Care Community. 2022;30: 714–725.
- 703 doi:10.1111/HSC.13185
- 35. Mustapha A, Ssekasanvu J, Chen I, Grabowski MK, Ssekubugu R, Kigozi G, et al.
- 705 Hypertension and Socioeconomic Status in South Central Uganda: A Population-Based
- 706 Cohort Study. Glob Heart. 2022;17. doi:10.5334/GH.1088/METRICS/

- 707 36. Antignac M, Diop IB, de Terline DMQ, Kramoh KE, Balde DM, Dzudie A, et al.
- 708 Socioeconomic status and hypertension control in sub-saharan Africa the multination
- EIGHT study (evaluation of hypertension in Sub-Saharan Africa). Hypertension. 2018;71:
- 710 577–584. doi:10.1161/HYPERTENSIONAHA.117.10512
- 711 37. Sarkodie AO. The effect of the price of time on healthcare provider choice in Ghana.
- 712 Humanities and Social Sciences Communications 2022 9:1. 2022;9: 1–7.
- 713 doi:10.1057/s41599-022-01282-6
- 38. dos Anjos Luis A, Cabral P. Geographic accessibility to primary healthcare centers in
- 715 Mozambique. Int J Equity Health. 2016;15: 1–13. doi:10.1186/S12939-016-0455-0
- Stock R. Distance and the utilization of health facilities in rural Nigeria. Soc Sci Med.
  1983;17: 563–570. doi:10.1016/0277-9536(83)90298-8
- 40. Koduah A, Nonvignon J, Colson A, Kurdi A, Morton A, van der Meer R, et al. Health
- systems, population and patient challenges for achieving universal health coverage for
- hypertension in Ghana. Health Policy Plan. 2021;36. doi:10.1093/heapol/czab088
- 41. Ghana Statistical Service. Ghana Living Standards Survey (GLSS). Accra; 2019 Jun.
- 42. Ouma PO, Maina J, Thuranira PN, Macharia PM, Alegana VA, English M, et al. Access
- to emergency hospital care provided by the public sector in sub-Saharan Africa in 2015: a
- geocoded inventory and spatial analysis. Lancet Glob Health. 2018;6: e342–e350.
- 725 doi:10.1016/S2214-109X(17)30488-6

43. Laar AK, Adler AJ, Kotoh AM, Legido-Quigley H, Lange IL, Perel P, et al. Health system

- 727 challenges to hypertension and related non-communicable diseases prevention and
- treatment: Perspectives from Ghanaian stakeholders. BMC Health Serv Res. 2019;19: 1–
- 729 13. doi:10.1186/S12913-019-4571-6/TABLES/1

730	44.	Ngoga G, Park I	PH, Borg R,	Bukhman G,	Ali E, Mun	yaneza F, et al.	Outcomes of
						-1	

731 decentralizing hypertension care from district hospitals to health centers in Rwanda,

732 2013–2014. Public Health Action. 2019;9: 142. doi:10.5588/PHA.19.0007

- 45. Sarfo FS, Mobula L, Plange-Rhule J, Gebregziabher M, Ansong D, Sarfo-Kantanka O, et
- al. Longitudinal control of blood pressure among a cohort of Ghanaians with
- 735 hypertension: A multicenter, hospital-based study. The Journal of Clinical Hypertension.
- 736 2020;22: 949. doi:10.1111/JCH.13873
- 737 46. Woode E, Boakye-Gyasi E, Obirikorang Y, Adu EA, Obirikorang C, Acheampong E, et
- al. Predictors of medication nonadherence among hypertensive clients in a Ghanaian
- population: Application of the Hill-Bone and Perceived Barriers to Treatment Compliance
  Scale. Health Sci Rep. 2022;5: e584. doi:10.1002/HSR2.584
- 47. Sarkodie E, Afriyie DK, Hutton-Nyameaye A, Amponsah SK. Adherence to drug therapy
- among hypertensive patients attending two district hospitals in Ghana. Afr Health Sci.
- 743 2020;20: 1355. doi:10.4314/AHS.V20I3.42
- 48. De-Graft Aikins A, Kushitor M, Koram K, Gyamfi S, Ogedegbe G. Chronic non-
- communicable diseases and the challenge of universal health coverage: Insights from
- community-based cardiovascular disease research in urban poor communities in Accra,
- 747 Ghana. BMC Public Health. 2014;14: 1–9. doi:10.1186/1471-2458-14-S2-S3/TABLES/2
- 49. Iwelunmor J, Gyamfi J, Plange-Rhule J, Blackstone S, Quakyi NK, Ntim M, et al.
- Exploring stakeholders' perceptions of a task-shifting strategy for hypertension control in
- 750 Ghana: A qualitative study. BMC Public Health. 2017;17: 1–9. doi:10.1186/S12889-017-
- 751 4127-9/PEER-REVIEW

- 50. Ogedegbe G, Gyamfi J, Plange-Rhule J, Surkis A, Rosenthal DM, Airhihenbuwa C, et al.
- 753 Task shifting interventions for cardiovascular risk reduction in low-income and middle-
- income countries: a systematic review of randomised controlled trials. BMJ Open. 2014;4.
- 755 doi:10.1136/BMJOPEN-2014-005983
- 51. Iwelunmor J, Gyamfi J, Plange-Rhule J, Blackstone S, Quakyi NK, Ntim M, et al.
- Exploring stakeholders' perceptions of a task-shifting strategy for hypertension control in
- 758 Ghana: a qualitative study. BMC Public Health. 2017;17: 216. doi:10.1186/s12889-017-
- 759 4127-9
- 760 52. Iwelunmor J, Onakomaiya D, Gyamfi J, Nyame S, Apusiga K, Adjei K, et al. Adopting
- 761 Task-Shifting Strategies for Hypertension Control in Ghana: Insights From a Realist
- 762 Synthesis of Stakeholder Perceptions. Glob Heart. 2019;14: 119.
- 763 doi:10.1016/j.gheart.2019.05.007
- 764 53. Tenkorang EY. Health Provider Characteristics and Choice of Health Care Facility among
- 765 Ghanaian Health Seekers. https://doi.org/101080/2328860420161171282. 2016;2: 160–
- 766 170. doi:10.1080/23288604.2016.1171282
- 767 54. Ware LJ, Schutte AE. Team-based care for hypertensive patients is essential in low- and
- middle-income countries. The Journal of Clinical Hypertension. 2019;21: 1210–1211.
- 769 doi:10.1111/JCH.13586
- 770
- 771
- 772 Supporting information
- 773 S1 Table. STROBE Checklist

Self-reported familiarity with hypertension treatment guidelines among healthcare providers in Kumasi, Ghana (n=64)



# Self-reported familiarity with hypertension treatment guidelines



\*Number of respondents varies by those who reported ever involved in performing the specific activity (Measuring BP: 55; Assigning diagnosis: 40; Counselling on lifestyles: 44; Prescribing antihypertensive med.: 27; Overall management of hypertension: 53)

# Self-reported confidence in adhering to hypertension treatment