# 1 Codesign of digital health tools for suicide prevention: A scoping

2 review

3 4	Codesign, digital tools and suicide prevention
5 6 7	Dianne Wepa 1 2 3 ¶ #a, Martin Neale 1 ¶, Waseem Abo-Gazala 1 ¶, Sally Cusworth 1 &, Jae Hargan 4 &, Manoj Mistry 1 &, Jimmy Vaughan 1 &, Stephen Giles 1 &, Mehnaz Khan 1 &
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	<ol> <li>School of Nursing &amp; Healthcare Leadership, Faculty of Health Studies, University of Bradford, West Yorkshire, United Kingdom</li> <li>School of Public Health, Faculty of Health &amp; Environmental Sciences, Auckland University of Technology, New Zealand</li> <li>Mental Health and Suicide Prevention Research and Education Group, Clinical and Health Sciences, University of South Australia, Australia</li> <li>School of Allied Health &amp; Midwifery, Faculty of Health Studies, University of Bradford, West Yorkshire, United Kingdom</li> </ol>
18	
19 20 21 22	* Corresponding author Email: <u>d.wepa@bradford.ac.uk</u>
23 24 25 26	#a Current address University of Bradford, Richmond Road, Bradford, West Yorkshire, BD7 1DP, United Kingdom
27 28 29 30	<ul> <li>¶ These authors contributed equally to this work</li> <li>&amp; These authors also contributed equally to this work</li> </ul>

## 31 Abstract

The importance of codesigning digital health tools for suicide prevention has gained popularity since 2012. Promoted as cost-effective and innovative, digital health tools are widely used but seldom described or evaluated from a codesign lens. This scoping review provides an overview of the research and gaps in the delivery of codesigned digital health tools for suicide prevention. This review is phase two within a three-phase study. Phase one involved a scoping review protocol which informed this scoping review and the results will contribute to a proof-of-concept project to develop a digital tool for suicide prevention (phase three).

The search strategy followed the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-SCR) and Population, Concept, Context (PCC) framework to ensure reporting standards were maintained and supplemented by Arksey and O'Malley and Levac et al. The search dates occurred from November 2022 to March 2023. Five data bases were searched: Medline, Scopus, CINAHL, PsycInfo and Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews. Grey literature searches included government, non-government health websites, Google and Google Scholar.

46 3260 records were identified from the initial search and 61 were included in the final review. All 47 members of the research team screened the included records. Data from published and grey literature 48 were extracted and a narrative approach identified the results and five themes (acceptability by users, 49 future inclusion of experts-by-experience, inconsistent use of Patient and Public Involvement (PPI), 50 digital tools to supplement face-to-face therapy and digital divide).

51 We found that none of the data from the included studies used codesign methodology and experts-52 by-experience roles were minimised as members of focus groups, advisory groups, pilot studies or at 53 the final stage of usability testing. Future research is required where codesign involves co-authorship

with experts-by experience, end-to-end partnership from design, implementation and evaluation of
digital health tools for suicide prevention.

#### 56 Author summary

57 As more people turn to digital technology (such as mobile apps and websites) to help with their mental 58 health, they enjoy many of the benefits such as feeling less judged and being more affordable than 59 face-to-face therapy. There are also risks involved such as how privacy is managed and reliance on the 60 distressed person to self-manage their signs and symptoms. We found that people who have 61 experienced suicidal thoughts and carers did not have an equal voice with those that developed the 62 digital tools for suicide prevention. Our group comprising of experts-by-experience, health 63 professionals, a mental health nursing student, technology expert and researchers felt that there was 64 a gap in this area and met on a monthly basis for one year to see what the literature was saying. We 65 found that the term codesign was used a lot but when we looked deeper into the articles and websites, we noted that experts-by-experience were only included to test apps or were involved in focus or 66 67 advisory groups. We will be using the information from this scoping review to apply for funding to 68 develop a digital solution that is truly designed with and by the people that need it the most.

69

### 70 Introduction

Suicide affects more than 700,000 globally each year [1] and the ripple effect extends to the person's family, friends and community [2]. As a response to prevent suicide, over 10,000 digital health technologies (video conferencing, smartphone apps, texting and social media) emerged as the first port-of-call for people experiencing mental health distress especially during and immediately after the COVID-19 pandemic [3-7]. Given the exponential rise of digital solutions for suicide prevention, there appears however, to be a disconnect between bringing the technology to market and involving experts-by-experience or service users as codesigners [8]. With a rapidly evolving technological

environment, understanding the place and space of experts-by-experience in suicide prevention
 requires urgent attention.

For this scoping review the following definitions of codesign and experts-by-experience are provided. Codesign is defined as 'a co-creation approach involving collaboration between researchers and end users from the onset' [9] (p. 1). Experts-by-experience is a term that was selected by our research Patient and Public Involvement (PPI) group members, as it reflected the range of experiences as carers and mental health services users. Experts-by-experience is therefore defined as 'people who have recent personal experience of using and caring for someone who uses health, mental health and/or social care services ' [10].

This scoping review is phase two within a three-phase study. During phase one, our scoping review protocol outlined the process for the study which informed this review [11]. Results from this scoping review will inform a funding application to codesign a proof-of-concept digital health tool for suicide prevention (phase three).

## 91 Materials and methods

We used the recommended six stages of scoping reviews [12,13] and the Preferred Reporting Items for Systemic Reviews and Meta-Analyses Extension for Scoping Reviews checklist (PRISMA-ScR) guidelines [14]. This review did not appraise the quality of evidence found as it sought to examine a topic which has not been systematically reviewed before. We used the Population-Concept-Context (PCC) framework to strengthen the importance of this methodology [15].

97

## 98 Stage One: Identifying the research question

99 Our research question was: What is known from the existing literature about codesign of digital health

100 *tools for suicide prevention*. The PPC framework assisted with guiding us to identify the important

101 aspects of the research question and determining the inclusion and exclusion criteria. We conducted 102 our search from November 2022 to March 2023. The population of interest included patients, 103 students, adults, internet users, experts by experience, service users and soldiers. Concept included 104 suicide intervention, reduction and prevention. Context were countries such as New Zealand, UK, USA, 105 Australia and countries that produced English language as primary and secondary literature within the European Union. The search timeframe was from 2012-2023 to ensure recency of the evolving nature 106 107 of digital technology. The exclusion criteria were study protocols and opinion/editorial data. The 108 search strings for published and grey literature are provided in Table 1.

- 109 Table 1. Population, Concept, Context & Search String.
- 110

Search String
Patient* OR student* OR "internet user*" OR Adult* OR pupil* OR soldier* OR "experts by experience" OR "service user*"
Softwar* OR app* OR tool* OR technolog* OR digital* AND suicide* OR "suicide prevent*" OR "suicide reduc*" OR "suicide intervent*" OR MH* OR "internet based" OR "web based" OR "mobile based"
>2012 AND PUBYEAR >2023 AND English lang* UK* AND United King* OR US* United State* AND Canad* AND NZ* OR New Zeal* AND European Un* OR EU*

- 111
- 112

### 113 Stage Two: Identifying relevant sources

114 Published literature: Search strategy

The following licensed electronic databases (from 2012 to 2023) were systematically searched: Medline, Scopus, CINAHL, PsycInfo and Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews. The initial sources were limited to English in the UK, Canada, USA, Australia and New Zealand. After receiving feedback during the review stage of our protocol, we extended the context to include European Union countries with publications in English. Furthermore, we identified articles such as systematic reviews where the researchers were located in these respective countries, however the data they sourced were from countries such as China, Japan and Sri Lanka.

The initial published data of 3210 records were identified and uploaded into EndNote X9.0, a citation and management software. Almost half were duplicates and removed (n=1570) and the remaining 1640 articles were exported into the reviewing software, Covidence, for title and abstract screening before full-text screening (Fig 1) [16].

126

127 Grey literature: Search strategy

A grey literature search (from 2012 to 2023) was conducted using institutional and government electronic databases and websites. Google and Google Scholar were searched with relevant results reviewed which included non-government organisations and social media. The sources selected were limited to English. 50 records were identified with 42 excluded once the inclusion/exclusion criteria were applied and 9 records were assessed for eligibility. The included data were Samaritans, Facebook, Save.org, Lifeline, National Suicide Prevention, Forefront, Papyrus, Mental Health Commission and Beyond Blue (Fig 1).

#### 136 Figure 1: PRISMA flow diagram for included searches of databases and grey literature.

137

#### 138



#### 139 140

#### 141 Stage Three: Source selection

From the- 1640 articles uploaded into Covidence, the title and abstracts were screened by DW and WAB and MN resolved any conflicts. Full-text articles were discussed among the research team to ensure moderation of the process particularly with experts-by-experience. Once the inclusion and exclusion criteria were applied, we removed 1588 studies, leaving at total of 61 records (n=52 published articles, n=9 records from grey literature).

#### 147 Stage Four: Charting the data

All included data were first extracted from full-text articles and read and excerpts that were relevant to the research question were highlighted. Data from grey literature sources were also included in the data extraction table and included digital interventions predominantly from non-government

- 151 websites. The data was charted according to the following categories: Author/Year, Aim/Objectives,
- 152 Methods/Analysis, Population/Sample Size, Countries, Outcome/Limitations (Table 2).

# 153 Table 2. Data extraction table.

Published Literature						
Author/Year	Aim/objectives	Methods/Analysis	Population/sample size	Countries	Outcome/Limitations	
Arshad et al. 2020 5	Reviewed the acceptability feasibility and efficacy of mobile and web- based intervention for self-injurious thoughts and behaviours (STB)	Systematic Review of 22 trials 12 = Randomised Control Trials 9 = Single-arm studies 1 = crossover counterbalanced controlled design	Adults	USA, UK, China, Denmark, Australia, Sweden, Netherland, Japan, Belgium, France, Sri Lanka	Interventions limited within the literature, qualitative data excluded. Acceptability based upon participant reported experiences of using the intervention, specifically how helpful or useful the intervention was, or the perceived likelihood of using it again in the future. Feasibility based upon intervention engagement or usage rates (e.g., number of times accessing a mobile phone app during the study period). Suicidal ideation was also included as a secondary outcome. Recommend involving those with lived experience of STB in the development to ensure interventions feel acceptable and useful to the individuals they have been designed to help.	
Bailey et al 2020 30	Ethical issues and practical barriers to internet-based suicide prevention research	Mixed methods, 2 phases. Systematic search and online survey of researchers from phase one	15 x studies 15 x researchers	Australia, USA, Europe	Difficulties in managing risk in online environments. Half of respondents reported problems with obtaining ethics approval. Assessment and management of risk is more complex with internet-based intervention studies compared to face-to-face studies. Different countries had different ethics jurisdictions. Recommend inclusion of people with lived experience in the design of interventions and trials.	
Baines et al 2022 25	Patient, public involvement in digital health innovation	Systematic review	433 x articles and grey literature	UK USA Canada Australia	Areas described: cancer n=50, mental health n=43, diabetes n=26, long-term conditions n=19. PPI most involved in the final passive stages e.g., usability testing. Ability to influence change was severely limited. Common barriers data privacy, security concerns, not involved early enough, lack of trust.	
alcombe & De Leo 2022a 36	Review of human-computer interaction in digital mental health	Modified integrative review	Population not specified	Australia	Focused on effectiveness, feasibility, accessibility, sociocultural inclusion, rigor and readiness for adoption and upkeep. Difficulty translating findings in clinical practice because of low engagement. Stepped model of care recommended with self-help or chatbots followed by therapist-guided digital therapy.	
Balcombe & De Leo 2022b	Review of digital tools for suicidal men	Integrative review	Adult men	Australia	Man Up programme found active and empowering language useful. Digital phenotyping via tracking on a smartphone app can monitor patient status but not provide an intervention.	

37					Unclear what to prescribe for digital suicide prevention because of a lack of strategy integration. Need for co-design, development and evaluation when providing Virtual reality and video games.
Berrouiget et al 2014 38	Post-acute crisis text messaging for suicide prevention	Evaluate acceptability of text messaging 2 months after crisis	4 x men 14 x women Aged 24-61 years	France	First message sent within 48 hours which patients were satisfied. Service did not allow patients to reply but were prompted to keep follow up appointments and to ring health provider if required. Small study sample.
Biddle et al 2020	Explored distressed users' perceptions of	Grounded theory Reporting suicide- related internet	53 x Adults	United Kingdom	Critical of websites that only offer signposting to offline services as their primary response. Many participants regularly used formal online help for ongoing mental health difficulties.
51	formal online help during times of crisis	use			Sites lacked a sense of community or opportunity for emotional connection. Want instant chat, if going online, want to stay online. Efforts have been made by Internet Service Providers to adjust search algorithms to prioritise help sites in suicide elated search output. However, research has focused on quantifying characteristics of help-seekers, trialling specific online interventions (e.g., apps), or examining online support groups, rather than seeking user evaluations of everyday online help pages. Recommend formal online help services be reappraised to meet users' needs for immediacy and responsive help. Users should be co-producing new online materials and approaches. Incorporate interactive elements e.g., live chat, links to forums (moderated by health professionals), self-help tools and lived- experience content.
Brown et al 2020 39	Review mobile app to support suicide prevention gatekeepers in Australia	2 participatory design workshops	12 x Indigenous health workers and community workers	Australia	Change the term gatekeeper to responder which is a more culturally appropriate term. Combination of multiple support resources recommended e.g., mobile applications, social media and wallet cards, regular meetings. Recommend regular training for community members to include collaboration with community services.
Bush et al 2015 60	Proof-of-concept of virtual hope box (VHB) smartphone app	Phase 1 = VHB & development Phase 2 = clinical field testing	18 x high risk of self-harm veterans enrolled in Dialectical Behaviour Therapy (DBT) programme	USA	Usable therapeutic tool to supplement face-to-face therapy. Limited by sample size and entirely descriptive analyses.

Cohen et al	Web-based	Sequential cross-	9 x young people	UK	11 suicide-specific online help services out of 232. 17 sites
2021	support services	sectional mixed	4 x general practitioners		included lived experiences accounts of suicidal stories
	for suicide	methods, user-	232 sites		provided as hope and recovery. 5 sites provided offline
58	prevention in	informed review			telephone hotline or email service. 4 sites provided active peer
	young people				support. Clarity, brevity and immediacy most important facets
	and students				for young people. Preference for text-based rather than verbal
					forms of communication. Few services provided peer support.
Bruen et al	Report the	Interactions with a	79 x adult inpatients	United	Natural language processing (NLP) using language from social
2020	practicalities and	novel phone app:		Kingdom	media posts could identify people at risk of suicide. Facebook
	acceptability of	Strength Within Me			accentuated participants' distress when comparing their lives
40	trialling digital	and Fitbit for 7			with family and friends on Facebook posts. 4G connectivity
	technologies in	days. Journaling			was essential for reliable and continuous access to the app and
	an inpatient	and rating mood			can help reduce barriers to face-to-face help-seeking, such as
	mental health	and creating safety			stigma and discomfort about discussing one's own mental
	setting	plans. Option to			health. Findings restricted to an inpatient population. The
		include Facebook.			practical components of trialling a novel phone app within
					health services may be valuable for future research and health
					care organizations. Recommend app to include uplifting
					quotes, self-help links, an SOS (abbreviation for distress)
					button for helpful contact numbers.
Buscher et al	Does Cognitive	Systematic review	2 x studies = youth	Netherlands	Internet-based self-help interventions for suicide prevention
2020	Behaviour	and meta-analysis	4 x studies = adults	USA, Australia	considered a low-threshold treatment option to complement
	Therapy (CBT)	6 x Randomised		Belgium	current services. Low number of included studies.
23	target suicidal	Control Trial (RCT)			
	ideation				
Buus et al	Stakeholder	Comparative	4 x focus groups	Denmark	Flexibility of app allowed for tailored safety planning
2020	perspectives on	thematic analysis	5 x youth		compared to the more static paper version. Use of Hope Box
	suicide	of 4 focus groups	8 x adults		reported as innovative and helpful. Collaborative process
41	prevention	using MYPLAN app	3 x relatives		supported the analyses' credibility. Context of participants'
	mobile phone	for suicide	10 x clinicians		experiences important to included. Intense feelings of despair
	арр	prevention			could make it impossible to engage with planned strategies.
					Took special effort to engage with app if person felt better.
Castillo-	Review of mobile	Descriptive analysis	16 x apps	Canada	Design and development of apps require support from health
Sanchez et al	apps for suicide	16 parameters	Population not specified	Scotland	personnel to humanize them. Apps not updated regularly.
2019	prevention			Spain	Technical quality cannot be determined. 82% of apps in English
				UK	language only. Most outstanding apps had an average of

52				USA	10,000 downloads. Only 3 apps had high value reviews: Stay Alive (201), Suicide Safety Plan (179), Virtual Hope Box (611). Non-inclusion of advertisements was useful and helped avoid detracting the person's concentration or overwhelming them. Virtual Hope Box met many of the parameters. Only app that offered 6 languages and highest number of downloads 10,000 and reviews 611. It is updated frequently. Omission of word suicide is notable and associated with negative emotions. Positive words such as hope is better option for suicide prevention. The Virtual Hope Box was developed at the National Centre for Tele-Health and Technology (US Department of Defence) and is based on the analogue version of the hope box concept, a therapeutic tool used by clinicians to help patients with depression or suicidal tendencies to redirect their negative thoughts toward reflecting on reasons for living instead. This app is particularly interesting because, based on the evaluated results, the technical elements of its use and design could be used in the development of similar apps. Low number of apps. User preference needs further investigation.
Chen & Chan	Review of	Meta-analysis	34 x articles	USA, Australia	18 articles examined effectiveness for reducing suicide.
2022	ettectiveness of	RCTs	Population not specified	Belgium,	Majority of studies conducted in developed countries which
21	interventions			Germany	effective and more accessible than traditional prevention
	(DHI) on			New Zealand	programmes. Recommend policy makers should improve
	unintentional			Sweden	peoples' digital literacy.
	injury, violence			Switzerland	
	and suicide			Netherlands	
				UK, China, Sri	
De la cara et	Fuel and a star			Lanka	Online self hele intermention means offerting in medicing
De Jaegere et	Evaluating the	wob based	Lo years or older	Beiginin	cuicidal ideation and symptoms than waitlist control group
ai 2019	online treatment	intervention	Intervention group = 365		suicidal ideation and symptoms than watchst control group.
17	of suicidal	2 arm, parallel	received access to unguided		
	ideation	design RCT in	web-based intervention		

		general population	Control group = 359 placed on a		
		In Flanders	waitlist		
Dickter et al	Impact of online	Determine overall	83 x Adolescents	USA	Higher self-esteem predicts lower suicidal ideation
2019	programme for	efficacy of CATCH-	13 x primary care sites across		
	depression and	IT online	four states		
42	suicide	programme for	Age 14 -21 years		
	intervention	adolescent suicidal			
		ideation and risk			
		factors for suicide			
Dimeff et al	Feasibility,	Pilot RCT	31 x adults acutely suicidal in ED	USA	Advisory group with lived experience assisted in developing
2021	acceptability and	Tablet-based app	14 x randomised		the research procedures to ensure acceptability of the
	effectiveness of	for direct use by	17 x care as usual control group		research method. Significant decrease in distress and agitation
18	Jaspr Health	patients which			and learning to cope more effectively for participants.
	among suicidal	enables the			Small sample size
	adults in	delivery of 4			
	Emergency	evidenced-based			
	Departments	practices			
	(ED)				
Dreier et al	Sharing insights	Sequential	7 x Adults 18+ years old	Germany	Involving people with lived experience of suicide enriches
2021	involving people	explanatory mixed	Affected by suicide or are close		research projects and can be empowering for the people
	with lived	methods design	to those affected		involved and essential to create a credible programme.
59	experience of	with three			Evaluation of the programme development could have been
	suicide in the	measurement			more standardized.
	development of	points, pre, post,			
	an online suicide	follow-up of			
	prevention	programme 8 Lives			
	programme	– Lived experience			
		reports and facts			
		on suicide			
Franco-Martin	Review of	Systematic review	30 x studies on adolescents	English	51% = web technologies
et al 2018	existing			speaking	22% = mobility solutions
	technology for			countries	12% = social networks
3	suicide				3% = machine learning
	prevention				95 = others
					Collaboration required among technologists, psychiatrists,
					patients and family members to advance the development of

					new technology-based solutions. Lack of studies on social networks. The use of technology mostly for training health professionals, families and patients. Those focused on adolescents have a greater acceptance of technologies.
Gibson et al 2019 53	Young peoples' talk about suicide	Focus groups, social constructionist approach	38 x young people aged 15-22 years, 9 x focus groups, not suicidal	New Zealand	Unhealthy silence on suicide in the public domain. Support of online community allows young people to escape adult surveillance and stigma. Limited sample and not targeting more marginalized youth populations.
Goldberg et al 2022 24	Mobile phone interventions for mental health	Systematic review	14 x meta-analyses of RCTs Adults, Adolescents	Not identified	1 x article focused on suicidal ideation. Text-messaging services outperformed non-specific controls. Results support the potential of mobile phone-based interventions.
Gould et al 2021 54	Effectiveness of Lifeline crisis interventions	Pre and post-chat survey	6 x core centres 70% under 24 years of age 40% minors	USA	39,911 chats. Chatters reported being less suicidal than when they started the chat. 2/3rds were female.
Hetrick et al 2018 43	Youth co-design of mobile phone app for major depression, suicidal ideation and self-harm	4 x co-design workshops with young people (design studio) 2 x focus groups with clinicians	<ul><li>11 x young adults 18-25 years</li><li>old experienced depression,</li><li>suicidal ideation, self-harm.</li><li>16 x clinicians</li></ul>	Australia	Focus on positive approach with naming 'well-being tracker'. Brief personalised interventions between face-to-face appointments. App not designed for young people not engaged in face-to-face treatment. Issue to balance needs of young people with potential clinical burden. Need to intervene with young people in real time with acute risk of suicide rather than using the app as a digital diary.
Hobson et al 2019 26	Mobile health for First Nations populations	Systematic review 13 studies	First Nations	Canada New Zealand Australia USA	Mental health and suicide prevention, particularly in the Australian context, were common themes (n=5). This is an important finding given the documented mental health challenges experienced by First Peoples of Australia, New Zealand, and the United States on account of intergenerational trauma. Scientific research is responding to the mental and emotional challenges faced by First Nations populations. Grey literature not included.
Josifovski et al 2022	Text message and online brief	Non-randomised, single-arm	13 x young adults and adults aged 16-65 years	Australia	Text messages well received indicating preferred method to be contacted. Significant reduction in number of self-reported
44	contact intervention following self-	methods pilot study.	previous 7 days of self-harm or		acceptability of 6 participants 12 months after presentation. High acceptability of 6 participants 12 months after. Small pilot, almost all female, no control group.

	harm or suicide	Reconnecting After	suicide attempt and have		
	attempt	self-harm (RAFT)	Australian mobile phone		
Kennard et al	App support	Pilot study As Safe	2 x sites	USA	Participants reported high satisfaction, acceptability,
2018	inpatient	as Possible (ASAP)	66 x adolescents aged 12-18		feasibility with the intervention and app. Low rate of family
	intervention to	to reduce suicide	years old hospitalised for		engagement.
45	prevent post-	attempts following	suicidal ideation n=26		
	discharge suicidal	hospital discharge	Or recent suicide attempt n=40		
	behaviour for	Randomised			
	adolescents	3 x hour			
		intervention			
		inpatient unit			
Kennedy et al	Digital	Adult learning	169 x farming males aged 30-64	Australia	Majority of postcards and message's themes were growth,
2020	intervention to	model	years. Personalise and tailored		new realisations, hope and encouragement. Attitudinal and
	reduce suicide	Ripple Effect digital	farming type, gender and		behaviour change with reduced stigma associated with mental
46	stigma among	intervention	experience of suicide. Post card		health and suicide. Farmers have high level of suicide of suicide
	farming men	website.	messages, video stories,		trajectory given their access to lethal means. Focus
			education and personal goal		development on suicide safety planning targeting farmers.
			setting.		Maintaining engagement recommended for future
					development.
Kimberly et al	Usability,	Web-based	20 x parents	USA	App has the capacity to reduce feelings of isolation and
2017	feasibility and	prototype of Crisis	20 x adolescents, 16 x females,		loneliness. High acceptability and usability by adolescents and
	acceptability of	Care pilot-tested	4 x males		parents. Helped connect adolescents to parents. Potential to
47	Crisis Care		Outpatient paediatric hospital		enhance family-focused safety family procedures, intervention
					and treatment. Small sample size, predominately female.
Kiosses et al	Emotion	Feasibility and	12 x middle aged and older	USA	WellPATH app feasible and accepted among middle-aged and
2021	regulation tablet	acceptability of two	adults 50 years and older		older adults at high suicide risk. Reduced negative emotions
	app for middle-	case studies	Suicidal ideation at discharge		and reinforced emotion regulation strategies.
48	aged and older	Use of WellPATH	from hospital		
	adults at high	app. 12-week			
	suicide risk	psychotherapy			
		intervention			
Kreuze et al	Technology-	Systematic review	16 x studies. Standalone or	USA	Technology-enhanced approaches performed favourably for
2017	enhanced suicide	CDC Risk and	adjunct interventions delivered		depressed mood, anxiety, hopelessness and negative
	prevention	Protective Factors	by mobile phone apps, text		automatic thoughts. Telephone management reduced suicidal
27	interventions	Ecological Model	message, telephone, computer,		thoughts, suicide re-attempts and suicide mortality.
			web CD-ROM and video.		

			Population not specified		Technology-enhanced interventions was more affordable than
					face-to-face interventions alone and reduced stigma.
Lai et al, 2014	Review of web-	Literature review	15 x articles	Not specified	Three key factors assist with web-based suicide prevention
	based suicide		All populations		strategies: ease of accessibility, degree of anonymity and text-
31	prevention				based communication. Web-based approaches advantages
					due to stigma, physical/psychological limitations or
					geographical location and cost-effective. Issues of
					confidentiality, safety in an acute crisis.
Martinengo et	Adherence to	Systematic review	69 x apps	Australia	Only 5 of the depression and suicide prevention apps offered
al 2019	clinical guidelines		General population	Spain, UK	the 6 suicide prevention strategy domains. Failure of Apple
	for suicide		Students	USA	and Google app stores and health app industry in self-
28	prevention and		Veterans	New Zealand	governance, quality and safety assurance. Risks and benefits
	depression apps			Canada	to users' needs to be identified. 34 apps belonged to Health
				Bangladesh	and Fitness category and 14 14 categorised as medical.
Martinez-	Acceptability of	Exploratory pilot	12 x participants aged 20-53	Mexico	60% of participants reported emotional competence and
Miranda et al	mobile-based	for virtual agent.	vears old. Past suicidal		adherence. Appearance and voice of avatars required
2019	conversational	HelPath	behaviour/ideation/planning or		improvement to reflect users.
	agent for		attempt		
49	prevention and				
	detection of				
	suicidal				
	hehaviour				
Meier et al	SERO – Mohile	Proof-of-concent	Focus groups	Switzerland	Potential for self-management self-assessment and self-
2022	ann for suicide	SERO ann to	Health professionals people	Switzeriana	reflection Limitations with ann considered a medical device
2022	nrevention		with illness experience and		and requires further funding to meet legal regulations
61	prevention		relatives to test 6 strategies for		
01			suicide prevention:		
			1 Tracking mood or suicidal		
			thoughts		
			2 Safety plan development		
			3 offer activities to deter		
			suicidal thoughts		
			A Information an education		
			5 Access to support networks		
			6 Access to emergency		
			o Access to entergency		
1				1	

	A 1.101 1		A 11-1		
Ivillne-lves et	Artificial	Scoping review	4 x articles	UK	importance of maintaining user engagement. Sample size
al 2022	intelligence and		Population not specified	USA	small
	machine learning				
32	in mobile apps				
	for mental health				
Morgieve et al	Use of EMMA	Case report study	14 x participants	France	Recommend integrating EMMA into existing emergency
2020	app	Ecological Mental	Presence of mental disorders		procedures. Interpret co-design as being consulted early and
	~~~	Momentary	and suicidal thoughts and		through focus groups not in publication
50		Accoccmont	hobaviours		
50			benaviours.		
		Longitudinal			
		Clinical assessment			
		1,3,5 months			
O'Grady et al	Develop SafePlan	Focus groups	15 x mental health care	Ireland	Ready for trailing. Core function to provide interactive safety
2020	app for suicide	Survey	professionals		plan for people with suicidal thoughts/ behaviours as an
	prevention		18 x secondary school students		adjunct to face-to-face therapy. High acceptability and
55			aged 14-16 years		usability. No automated warning to inform people when they
					should consider seeking professional help.
O'Toole et al	App-assisted	Compare	129 x adults aged 18-65 years	Denmark	Group receiving treatment as usual in combination with access
2019	treatment for	treatment	Outpatient suicide prevention		to mobile app experienced a smaller decrease in self-reported
	suicide		clinic Treatment as usual with		suicide risk immediately following treatment
19	nrevention		ann = 69 and without = 69		saled e hist infine diately following incutinenti
Posnos et al	Web-based tools	Systematic review	36 x articles	Not specified	No inclusion of health professionals
2017	and apps to	Systematic review	14 x web based tools	Not specified	2 focused on suicide provention: Virtual Hone box (improves
2017	ailu apps to		14 X web based tools		2 locused on suicide prevention. Virtual hope box (improves
20	miligale burnoul,		22 x mobile applications		users ability to cope with unpreasant thoughts and emotions)
29	depression and		Healthcare students only		& Stay Alive (customized safety plan, breatning & grounding
	suicidality among				exercise tutorials. Online discussion forum, links to other
	healthcare				resources). Recommend applying user-centred design for
	students and				future tools.
	professionals				
Primack et al	Feasibility and	Mobile Application	8 x veterans	USA	Ability to address suicide risk in real time. Intended to adjunct
2021	acceptability of	for the Prevention	2 weeks post-treatment from		to therapy rather than stand-alone treatment. High rating of
	mobile app for	of Suicide (MAPS)	psychiatric facility		acceptability. Participants would use it again and recommend
56	the prevention of	Semi-structured			to a friend. Ability to help users to understand themselves and
	suicide	interviews			their emotions.

Rassy et al 2021 33	Information and communication technology use in suicide prevention	Scoping review	115 studies Population not specified	Not identified	ICT play a major role in suicide prevention however large-scale evaluation studies are needed to further examine their effectiveness. 10 studies referred to universal suicide prevention strategies using health promotion through educational websites and awareness campaigns. ICT may provide a sense of being connected to people who are otherwise isolated and reluctant to use offline services. Algorithms helped identify individuals at risk of suicide, but a clinical application of these algorithms is yet to be developed.
Reen et al	Mobile apps for	Ascertain the	35 x apps	Not specified	Lack of research on how users' privacy is managed.
2022	suicide	efficacy of mobile	41 x articles		Recommend more interactive apps and apply user-centre
34	prevention and privacy policies	intervention in preventing suicide & investigating privacy strategies	Population not specified		design approach.
Rice et al 2016	Implementation	Review of online	3 x online and social media	Australia	Moderation of interventions are required to monitor
35	of online suicide	and social media	adolescents 14-25 year olds		adolescents behaviours online.
	intervention	intervention studies			
Rozek et al	Machine learning	Secondary data	152 x Veterans	USA	Small sample size. Inconclusive findings.
2020	to predict suicide	analysis of RCT	76 = CBT		
20	attempts in the	testing the efficacy	76 = Treatment as usual		
20	minuary	compared to			
		treatment as usual.			
Varzgani et al	Review of suicide	Systematic review	30 x articles	Not specified	Categorised features are user engagement, safety planning,
2021	prevention		All populations		helplines and support, coping strategies, self-assessment.
63	smartphone				engagement features. 3 apps used Imaginator. LifeApp
_	applications				engagement such as notifications, alerts, reminders
					Imaginator added gamification and a reward badge system,
					points, avatars. 2 apps, SafePlan and BeyondNow allowed
					BevondNow app provided video outlining practice of safety
					planning. All apps included emergency helplines. MyPlan

Povev et al	Evolore	Qualitative study	9 x Aboriginal community	Australia	included locating nearest emergency department. 10 apps had distraction feature provided music, games, mindfulness exercises, stories and videos. 6 apps provided suicidal thought tracking with self-reported scales, questionnaires, therapy sessions with experts. Limited with some apps including therapy and some were stand alone.
2016	Aboriginal and Torres Strait	2 culturally responsive e-	members	Australia	illnesses. Motivation, technological competence and literacy likely to influence acceptability. Clinician support to use apps
57	Islander experiences of two apps	mental health apps, 3 x focus groups, ibobly and AIMHi apps			recommended. Apps complement rather than replace face-to- face services. Culturally relevant language and graphics. Balance between security and usability. Small sample size from one location.
Robinson et al 2015 6	Social media and suicide prevention	Systematic review	30 x studies Population not specified	Australia	Social media platforms can reach large numbers of otherwise hard-to-reach people. Acceptability of providing an anonymous, accessible and non-judgmental forum. Sites generally governed by an ethical code of conduct and successfully moderated by trained volunteers who received professional supervision. Users used platforms to seek peer support as opposed to professional support. Very few people used the sites to seek information about suicide methods or suicide partners. Challenges with controlling user behaviour, accurately assessing risk, privacy and confidentiality. Platforms as opposed to offline help and support could further marginalize people from mainstream society. Possibility of normalising of suicide-related behaviour as a response to one's problems.
Tighe et al 2017 64	Evaluate the effectiveness of a self-help mobile app (ibobbly) for suicide prevention	Pilot randomised control trial Randomised to receive acceptance-based therapy over 6 weeks (through app) or waitlisted for 6 weeks	61 x Aboriginal adults aged 18- 35 years	Remote and very remote North-western Australia	Apps for suicide prevention reduce distress and depression but do not show significant reductions on suicide ideation or impulsivity. 16 participants did not have suicide ideation as a baseline making it difficult to demonstrate a significant effect in a small sample.

Torous et al	Assess whether	Clinical review of	Mental H	lealth clinicians	Not applicable	Apple App Store and Google Play store targeting suicide
2018	technology-	smartphones,				prevention are not evidence based and few have been
	based solutions	sensors and				clinically validated. Apps need to augment care and never to
50	reduce suicide	machine learning				fragment care. Majority of apps are never opened more than
						once. Little data on use of smartphone apps for child and
						adolescent populations as concerns about privacy, legal and
						efficacy. Dearth of research on digital tools for suicide
						prevention in older adults. Considering that older adults are at
						the highest risk for death by suicide, there is an even greater
						need to offer new effective tools for this population.
Torok et al	Does direct and	Systematic review	16 x stud	lies	Belgium, USA,	Self-guided digital interventions directly targeting suicidal
2020	indirect digital	and meta-analysis	10 x dire	ct interventions	Australia,	ideation are effective immediately post-intervention. Indirect
	interventions		6 x indirect interventions		Netherlands,	interventions were not significant. Digital interventions should
7	effective in		All popul	ations	Germany	be promoted and disseminated widely, especially where there
	reducing suicidal					is a lack of, or minimal access to health services. Overall effect
	ideation and					size of interventions is small, the population impact could be
	behaviours.					significant.
Witt et al	Online and	Systematic review	7 x datab	bases	Australia, USA	Digital interventions associated with reductions for suicidal
2017	mobile apps for	and meta- analysis	14 x non-	-overlapping studies	Germany	ideation scores at post-intervention. No evidence of a
	self-management		3,356 x p	articipants	Netherlands	treatment effect for self-harm or attempted suicide. Only 5
52	of suicidal				Sweden	developed specifically for self-management of suicidal
	ideation and self-				Switzerland	ideation. Only 1 developed for the self-management of self-
	harm					harm.
Grey Literature						
Author/Year	Methods/Analysis	Countries		Outcome/Limitations		
Payrus	N/A	UK		Self-harm prevention	and suicide prevent	tion focus. Trustees experience suicide with family members. Not
,				clear if youth are activ	ely involved in co-	design of services or website.
62						
Samaritans	Service Review	International		Reviewed their servic	es and launched a	text service (SHOUT) in 2019 and a suicide prevention website
				(StavingSafe) in 2018.	Consulted people	with lived experience, video footage and safety plans.
2010 - 2013						
65						
65						

Facebook 2017 66	Service Review	International	Artificial Intelligence (AI) commenced to detect suicidal posts before they are reported. Only liaised with mental health experts and not service users.
Save.org 67	N/A	USA, UK, India, Canada	Focused on raising public awareness and education. Not clear if co-design of services or website occurred.
National Suicide Prevention	N/A	UK	Work with a network of organisations and individuals in suicide prevention. Focused on raising public awareness and education. Not clear if co-design of services or website occurred.
68			
Lifeline 69	N/A	International	Crisis response helpline. Provided in different languages with option to phone a trained counsellor. Not clear if co-design of services or website occurred.
Forefront 70	N/A	USA	Focused on raising public awareness and education in schools, higher education, workplaces and communities. Not clear if co-design of services or website occurred.
Mental Health & Wellbeing Commission 2021	N/A	New Zealand	Focused on raising public awareness and education. Created by the government after an enquiry into mental health and addiction. Some involvement with people with lived experience at governance level.
71			
Beyond Blue	N/A	Australia	Focused on raising public awareness and education on anxiety, depression and suicide. Safety planning app available to download from website. Phone and chat options with trained counsellor. Not clear if co-design of services or website occurred.

### 155 Stage Five: Collating, summarizing and reporting the results

This scoping study aimed to present an overview of material reviewed which is not synthesised as is the case with a systematic review. While this study followed an analytic framework, we did not attempt to present a view regarding the weight of evidence. The results therefore did not seek to assess the quality of evidence and cannot determine if the findings are generalizable. Having charted the data, however, we were able to present our findings in a narrative format after organising the data according to study characteristics (Table 3) and themes (Table 4).

DW reviewed the first iteration of themes according to the inclusion criteria and analysed iteratively the emerging categories from the published and grey literature. MN analysed the emerging themes and referred to the full text where required. DW and MN worked together to simplify the descriptions and identified fuller commonalities according to the study characteristics and five themes. A final review was provided by the rest of the research team to confirm the results.

# 168 Results

### 169 Study characteristics of the included studies

170 Table 3 provides an overview of the study characteristics. There were several study types from the 52

171 published articles including four randomized control trials [17-20], one meta-analysis of randomised

172 control trials [21], one clinical review [22], four systematic review and meta-analysis [4, 7, 23, 24], nine

systematic reviews [3, 5, 6, 25-29, 63], one mixed methods [30], five literature or scoping reviews [31-

174 35], two integrative reviews [36- 37], thirteen pilots or trials [38- 50], seven qualitative studies [51-

175 57), two sequential cross-sectional mixed methods (58-59) and two proof-of-concept [60-61].

The following demographics were noted from the published and grey literature. 7 x articles identified young people specifically ranging from 14- 22 years old [35, 42- 43, 47, 53, 58- 59). 1 x website targeted youth [62] and 1 x article focused on young females [54]. 6 x articles focused on young people alongside adults, carers, parents and/or healthcare professionals [12, 23, 28, 45, 49, 55]. Adults were identified within 6 articles with an age range from 24-61 years [5, 38, 40, 51, 59]. Two articles specifically discussed adult males [37, 46].

Older adults aged over 50 years were discussed in one article [48]. Veterans were discussed in four articles [20, 28, 56, 60]. Ethnicity was focused on the experiences of Indigenous cultures within 5 articles from Australia, New Zealand, Canada and USA [26, 39, 57, 59, 64]. 16 published articles and 8 items of grey literature did not specify which populations the authors were targeting, or it was implied that all populations were included [21, 25, 27, 29-34, 36, 38, 50-52, 65-72].

# 187 Table 3. Study characteristics of included data.

Author	Study type
[17–20]	Randomised control trials (RCT)
[21]	Meta-analysis of randomised control trials
[22]	Clinical review
[4], [7], [23-24]	Systematic review and meta-analysis
[3], [5-6], [25-29], [63]	Systematic review
[30]	Mixed methods
[31-34]	Literature review / scoping review
[36-37]	Integrative review
[38-50]	Pilots / trials
Author	Demographics
[35], [42-43], [47], [53], [58], [59]	Young people aged 14-22 years old
[62]	Youth
[54]	Young females
[12], [23], [28], [45], [49], [55]	Young people, adults, carers, parents and/or healthcare professionals

[5], [38], [40], [51], [59]	Adults aged 24-61 years old
[37], [46]	Adult males
[48]	Older adults aged over 50 years old
[20], [28]. [56], [60]	Veterans
[26], [39], [57], [59], [64]	Ethnicity focus on Indigenous cultures
[21], [25], [27], [29], {30-34], [36], [38], [50-52], [65-72]	Not specified or implied all populations were included

#### 190 Theme One: Acceptability by users

191 Table 4 provides an overview of the five themes that emerged from the 52 peer reviewed articles and 192 9 items from grey literature. We found the first theme of *acceptability by users* was prominent from 193 the published literature (n=19). The articles either examined acceptability of digital tools for suicide 194 prevention explicitly or it emerged as a key finding [5-6, 18, 23-24, 35-40, 45, 47-49, 54-57]. 195 Interestingly, almost half of the 19 items (n=9) specifically reviewed suicide prevention and self-injury 196 apps to establish if users found them acceptable [5, 18, 40, 45, 47-48, 55-57]. The remaining published 197 literature focused on text messaging services [6, 35] or involved systematic reviews of social media 198 platforms and mobile phone-based interventions [6, 24, 36]. Only one article reviewed the chat 199 function on the Samaritan's website, a major non-government organisation that has a long history of 200 providing suicide prevention services [54].

#### 201 Theme Two: Future inclusion of experts-by-experience

202 The second theme identified from 12 articles located in the published literature recommended the 203 future inclusion of experts-by-experience [3, 5, 26, 29, 30, 32, 34, 37, 39, 46, 50, 51]. One item from 204 grey literature also emerged within this theme [65]. The terminology and ways to involve experts-by-205 experience varied among the literature. For example, involving people with *lived experience* in the 206 design of interventions and trials was specifically highlighted in four studies [5, 26, 30, 65]. Codesign, 207 coproduction, user-centred design and collaboration were terms used in five studies where the 208 emphasis was on end-to-end input, albeit in a generalised format [29, 34, 37, 39, 51]. To a lesser 209 extent, the importance of user engagement or focus groups was recommended in three studies [32, 210 46, 50] and one study specifically recommended targeting *adolescents* whom the authors argued have 211 a greater acceptance of technologies [3]. Interestingly, given that the recommendations from these 212 articles were to include experts-by-experience within health research, we found it surprising that such 213 recommendations were identified and not followed through by the authors themselves. We found 214 one exception where the Samaritans' website was reviewed from 2017-2019 [65]. The review

involved repackaging the Samaritans' web-based services and text service, SHOUT. Following consultation with people with lived-experience a new website (StayingSafe) included strategies for developing a safety plan and lived-experience video footage. The review found that it was important to continue evaluating developments and identify models of effective help provision. In addition, it was noted that users should be involved not only in such evaluation, but also as co-producers of new online materials and approaches.

#### <sup>221</sup> Theme Three: Inconsistent use of Patient and Public Involvement (PPI)

Patient and Public Involvement (PPI) in research is defined as 'Research being carried out with or by 222 223 members of the public rather than to, about or for them' [73]. Notwithstanding, the Inconsistent use 224 of PPI theme emerged from 19 published articles where the authors where unclear about the purpose 225 and role of PPI [18-19, 25, 41, 43-49, 53, 55-58, 61, 64]. Furthermore, Facebook, a major online 226 networking site, stated that their company liaised with mental health experts (not service users) and considered this type of consultation met the requirements of PPI research [66]. None of the data from 227 228 the published and grey literature identified PPI as co-authors and used a variation of terms to imply 229 codesign methodology. For example, PPI were involved passively during the final stages of usability 230 testing for digital tools [25], the middle of the research as user-informed participants [58], part of a 231 collaborative process to support the analysis [41], as members of focus groups or advisory groups [18, 232 43, 53, 55, 57, 59, 61], pilot studies or prototypes [19, 44-47, 49, 56, 64] and case studies [48].

### <sup>233</sup> Theme Four: Digital technology tools to supplement face-to-face

#### 234 therapy

The theme of *digital technology tools as a supplement to face-to-face therapy*, emerged from 20 articles within the published literature [7, 17, 19, 20, 23, 28, 33, 35-36, 38, 42-43, 50, 52, 55-57, 60, 63-64]. From within this theme, four articles found that self-guided digital tools were most effective immediately post-intervention [17, 19, 38, 50]. It was not clear however if the effectiveness continued 239 once the studies were complete and the digital tools such as tablets and mobile phones were returned 240 to the researchers. Four articles noted that low threshold treatments were successful as a 241 complement face-to-face therapy [20, 23, 57, 64]. People that were considered actively at high risk 242 of suicide were not included in the studies. Websites and platforms such as Facebook were reviewed where clinical applications of algorithms were recommended as a future requirement to identify 243 244 suicide risk [28, 33]. As a high risk group of suicide, moderation of digital interventions were 245 recommended in three studies particularly for adolescents [35, 42-43] and engagement with clinical 246 practice is still required [17, 36, 52, 55-56, 60, 63]. Although the articles recommend digital 247 intervention as part of model of care, 9 articles involved limited sample sizes and were not 248 generalizable [38, 60, 23, 52, 56, 20, 57, 64, 7].

#### 249 Theme Five: Digital Divide

The digital divide is the gap that exists between individuals who have access to modern information and communication technology and those who lack access [74]. Although only three articles were included within the theme of *digital divide*, we felt its impact required attention as disparities associated with access, geography and income were identified [21, 32, 40].

254 One article noted that 4G connectivity was essential for reliable and continuous access to the 255 applications [40]. Those on low incomes tended to use 2G and 3G technology that did not require 256 smartphones and relied on text messaging services. Similarly, a second article found that technology-257 enhanced interventions such as telephone management were more affordable than face-to-face 258 interventions and reduced stigma [32]. Furthermore the majority of research on digital technology and suicide prevent was conducted in First-world countries, which excluded less developed countries 259 260 [21]. Recommendations include policy makers improving peoples' digital literacy and inclusion of 261 research with more countries on a global scale [21].

## Table 4. Narrative grouping of data into themes.

Author	Theme			
Theme 1: Acceptability by users				
[5], [18], [40], [45], [47-48], [55- 57]	Suicide prevention and self-injury apps			
[6], [35]	Text messaging services			
[6], [24], [36]	Social media platforms and mobile phones			
[54]	Chat function			
Theme 2: Future	e inclusion of experts-by-experience			
[3]	Adolescents and greater acceptance of technologies			
[5], [26], [30], [65]	Lived experience in design of interventions and trials			
[32], [46], [50]	Importance of user engagement or focus groups			
[29], [34], [37], [39], [51]	Codesign, coproduction, collaboration, user centred			
Theme 3: Inconsisten	t use of Public, Patient Involvement (PPI)			
[66]	Consulted mental health experts and not service users			
[25]	Final stages of usability testing			
[58]	Middle stage of research as user-informed			
[41]	Collaborate to support the analysis			
[18], [43], [53], [55], [57], [59], [61]	Members of focus groups or advisory groups			
[19], [44-47], [49], [56], [64]	Pilot studies or prototypes			
[48]	Case studies			
Theme 4: Digital tools to supplement face-to-face therapy				
[17], [19], [38], [50]	Self-guided digital tools most effective immediately post- intervention			
[20], [23], [57], [64]	Low threshold treatment complement face-to-face therapy			
[28], [33]	Clinical applications of algorithms to identify suicide risk required			
[35], [42-43]	Moderation of interventions required for adolescents			
[17], [36], [52], [55-56], [60], [63]	Engagement still required with clinical practice			
Theme 5: Digital Divide				
[40]	4G connectivity essential			
[21]	Majority of research in developed countries			
[32]	More affordable and reduced stigma			

#### 265 Stage Six: Stakeholder consultation

The experts-by-experience members of this project are part of the university's PPI group and regularly provide input into programmes or research. The group were approached by the primary researcher to be part of the project and were paid as per the National Institute of Health and Care Research guidelines [73]. The members met on a monthly basis to review the articles and the chairperson meet with the primary researcher in between meetings. All members have been identified on funding applications, publications and conference presentations.

### 272 **Discussion**

273 This scoping review was the first to explore what is known about codesign, digital tools and suicide 274 prevention. Our findings highlighted the disconnect between developers, researchers and experts-by-275 experience understanding and acceptability of the digital health tools. For example, none of the 276 published articles were clear about codesign as a methodology and end users were only included 277 passively through focus groups, advisory groups, or during the testing stage of pilot studies or 278 prototypes. Despite the initial engagement of experts-by-experience with digital tools for suicide 279 prevention immediately after an intervention, the removal of regular monitoring by health 280 professionals once trials were completed, contributed to lack of data to confirm ongoing success.

281 Supplementation of digital solutions in partnership with face-to-face therapy will increase especially 282 for digital natives such as adolescents. The ethical concerns over how younger populations will have 283 their privacy safeguarded is an area that is yet to be developed more fully within the literature. The 284 digital divide is noteworthy as a future concern as countries such as the United Kingdom are phasing 285 out 2G and 3G networks in 2023 to make room for faster 5G networks [75]. The implications for those 286 on low incomes and experiencing mental distress may not be visible to the general public as access to 287 digital platforms in the future will require uninterrupted connectivity through smartphones and 288 internet access.

## 289 Limitation

- 290 A limitation of this scoping review is the exclusion of literature that was not written in the English
- 291 language. Based on feedback on our scoping protocol, we extended our search to include countries
- from the European Union and countries such as China, Japan and Sri Lanka. The search criteria would
- 293 be extended to non-English articles for future reviews.

### 294 Conclusion

- 295 When we conducted this scoping review from a codesign perspective, we were surprised by the lack
- of literature published and unpublished, that also followed the same methodology. We believe our
- 297 findings will support future researchers and developers to implement codesign that maintains the
- 298 integrity of their project. Authentic involvement requires experts-by-experience as co-authors and
- 299 end-to-end partners from design, implementation and evaluation of digital health tools for suicide
- 300 prevention.

### 301 Supporting information

- 302 S1 Table. Population, Concept, Context Search String. 303 (DOCX) 304 S2 Table. Data Extraction. 305 (DOCX) 306 S3 Table. Study characteristics of included data. 307 (DOCX) 308 S4 Table. Narrative grouping of data into themes. 309 (DOCX) 310 S1 Figure. PRISMA flow diagram for included searches of databases and grey literature.
- 311 (DOCX)

# 312 Acknowledgments

- 313 We acknowledge the support and guidance from Simon Couth, The Working Academy, Academic
- 314 Librarians and members of the expert-by-experience group.

# 315 Author Contributions

- 316 Conceptualisation: Dianne Wepa
- 317 Investigation: Dianne Wepa, Martin Neale, Waseem Abo-Gazala, Sally Cusworth, Jae Hargan, Manoj
- 318 Mistry, Jimmy Vaughan, Stephen Giles, Mehnaz Khan
- 319 Methodology: Dianne Wepa, Martin Neale, Waseem Abo-Gazala
- 320 Formal analysis: Dianne Wepa, Martin Neale
- 321 Writing original draft: Dianne Wepa
- 322 Writing reviewing & editing: Dianne Wepa, Martin Neale, Waseem Abo-Gazala, Sally Cusworth,
- 323 Jae Hargan, Manoj Mistry, Jimmy Vaughan, Stephen Giles, Mehnaz Khan

# 324 **References**

- 325 1. World Health Organization. Suicide [Internet]. 2022 [cited 2023 March 31]. Available from
- 326 <u>https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/suicide</u>
- 327 2. Survivors of bereavement by suicide. Support after a suicide booklet. 2023 [cited 2023 March 31].
- 328 Available from https://uksobs.org/resources-for-survivors/support-after-a-suicide-booklet
- 329 3. Franco-Martin M, Munoz-Sanchez A, Sainz-de-Abajo J, Castillo-Sanchez L, Hamrioui B, Torre-Diez G.
- 330 A Systematic Literature Review of Technologies for Suicidal Behaviour Prevention. Journal of
- 331 Medical Systems. 2018; 42(4):1-7. Available from: <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s10916-018-0926-5</u>
- 4. Witt K, Spittal MJ, Carter G, Pirkis J, Hetrick S, Currier D, et al. Effectiveness of online and mobile
- telephone applications (apps) for the self-management of suicidal ideation and self-harm: a
- 334 systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Psychiatry. 2017; 17(297):1-18. Available from:
- 335 https://doi.org/10.1186/s12888-017-1458-0
- 5. Arshad U, Farhat A, Gauntlett J, Husain N, Chaudhry N, Taylor PJ. A Systematic Review of the
- 337 Evidence Supporting Mobile and Internet Based Pscyhcological Interventions for Self-Harm.
- 338 Suicide & life-threatening behaviour. 2020;50:151-179. Available from:
- 339 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/sltb.12583</u>
- 340 6. Robinson J, Georgina C, Bailey E, Hetrick S, Rodrigues M, Fisher S, et al. Social media and suicide
- 341 prevention: a systematic review. Early Intervention in Psychiatry. 2016; 10:103-12. Available from:
- 342 <u>https://doi.org/10.111/eip.12229</u>
- 343 7. Torok M, Han J, Baker S, Werner-Seidler A, Wong I, Larsen ME, et al. Suicide prevention using self-
- 344 guided digital interventions: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled
- trials. Lancet Digital Health. 2020; 2(1):25–36. Available from:
- 346 https://doi.org/10.1016/S2589-7500(19)30199-2

- 347 8. Nusir M, Rekik M. Systematic review of co-design in digital health for COVID-19 research.
- 348 Universal Access in the Information Society. 2022. Available from:
- 349 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10209022-00964-x
- 350 9. Goodyear-Smith F, Jackson C, Greenhalgh T. Co-design and implementation research: challenges
- and solutions for ethics committees. BMC Medical Ethics. 2015. Available from:
- 352 <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s12910-015-0072-2</u>
- 353 10. Care Quality Commission. Experts by Experience [Internet]. 2023 [cited 2023 March 31].
- 354 Available from: <u>https://www.cqc.org.uk/about-us/jobs/experts-experience</u>
- 11. Wepa D, Neal M, Abo-Gazala W, Cusworth S, Hargan J, Mistry M, et al. Codesign of a digital
- health tool for suicide prevention: protocol for a scoping review. BMJ Open. 2023. Available from:
- 357 <u>https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2-22-070329</u>
- 12. Arksey H, O'Malley L. Scoping studies: towards a methodological framework. International
- 359 Journal of Social Research Methodology. 2005; 1:19-32. Available from:
- 360 https://doi.org/10.1080/1364557032000119616
- 361 13. Levac D, Colquhoun H, O'Brien KK. Scoping studies: advancing the methodology. Implement
- 362 Science. 2020; 20(5):69. Available from: <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/1364557032000119616</u>
- 363 14. Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. Prisma Extension for Scoping
- 364 Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. Annals of Internal Medicine. 2018; 169(7):467-
- 365 473. Available from: <u>https://doi.org/10.7326/M18-0850</u>
- 366 15. Peters M, Marnie C, Tricco A, Pollock D, Munn Z, Lyndsay A, et al. Updated methodological
- 367 guidance for the conduct of scoping reviews. JBI Synthesis. 2020; 18(10:2119-2126. Available from
- 368 https://doi.org/10.11124/JBIES-20-00167
- 369 16. Veritas Health Innovation. Covidence Systematic Review Software [Internet]. 2022 [cited 2023]
- 370 March 31]. Available from: <u>https://www.covidence.org</u>
- 17. De Jaegere E, van Landschoot R, van Heeringen K, van Spijker B, Kerkhof A, Mokkenstorm J, et al.
- 372 The online treatment of suicidal ideation: A randomised controlled trial of an unguided web-based

intervention. Behaviour Research and Therapy. 2019; 119:1-8. Available from

#### 374 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.brat.2019.05.003</u>

- 18. Dimeff L, Jobes D, Koerner K, Kako N, Tropher J, Keey-Brimer A, et al. Using a table-based app to
- 376 deliver evidence-based practices for suicidal patients in the emergency department: Pilot randomized
- 377 control trial. JMIR Mental Health. 2021; 8(3):1-15. Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.2196/23022">https://doi.org/10.2196/23022</a>
- 378 19. O'Toole M, Arendt M, Pedersen C. Testing an app-assisted treatment for suicide prevention in a
- 379 randomized controlled trial: Effects on suicide risk and depression. Behavior Therapy. 2018; 50:421-
- 380 429. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.beth.2018.07.007</u>
- 381 20. Rozek D, Andres W, Smith N, Leifker F, Arne K, Jennings G, et al. Using machine learning to predict
- 382 suicide attempts in military personnel. Psychiatry Research. 2020; 294:1-5. Available from
- 383 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychres.2020.112515</u>
- 384 21. Chen M, Chan K. Effectiveness of digital health interventions on unintentional injury, violence and
- 385 suicide: Meta-analysis. Trauma, violence & abuse. 2020: 23(2):605-619. Available from
- 386 <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838020967346</u>
- 387 22. Torous J, Nicholas J, Larsen M, Firth J, Christensen H. Clinical review of user engagement with
- 388 mental health smartphone apps: evidence, theory and improvements. Evidence Based Mental Health.
- 389 2018; 21(3):116-119. Available from: <u>https://doi.org/10.1136/be-2018-102891</u>
- 390 23. Buscher R, Torok M, Terhorst Y, Sander L. Internet-based cognitive behavioral therapy to reduce
- 391 suicidal ideation: A systematic review and meta-analysis. JAMA Network Open. 2020; 3(4):1-13.
- 392 Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.3933">https://doi.org/10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2020.3933</a>
- 393 24. Goldberg S, Lam S, Simonsson O, Torous J, Sun S. Mobile phone-based interventions for mental
- health: A systematic meta-review of 14 meta-analyses of randomized controlled trials. PLOS Digital
- 395 Health. 2022; 1(1):1-21. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pdig.0000002</u>

- 25. Baines R, Bradwell H, Edwards K, Stevens S, Prime S, Tredinnick-Rowe J, et al. Meaningful patient
- 397 and public involvement in digital health innovation, implementation and evaluation: A systematic
- review. Health Expectations. 2022; 1-14. Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.1111/hex.13506">https://doi.org/10.1111/hex.13506</a>
- 26. Hobson G, Caffery L, Neuhaus M, Langbecker D. Mobile health for First Nations populations:
- 400 Systematic Review. JMIR MHealth and UHealth. 2019; 7(10):1-16. Available from
- 401 <u>https://doi.org/10.2196/14877</u>
- 402 27. Kreuze E, Jenkins C, Gregoski M, York J, Mueller M, Lamis D, et al. Technology-enhanced suicide
- 403 prevention interventions: A systematic review. Journal of Telemedicine and Telecare. 2017; 23(6):605-
- 404 617. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/1357633X16657928</u>
- 28. Martinengo L, Van Galen L, Lum E, Kowalski M, Subramaniam M, Car J. Suicide prevention and
  depression apps' suicide risk assessment and management: a systematic assessment of adherence to
  clinical guidelines. BMC Medicine. 2019; 17(231):1-12. Available from
  https://doi.org/10.1186/s12916-019-1461-z
- 29. Pospos S, Young I, Downs N, Iglewicz A, Depp C, Chen J, et al. Web-based tools and mobile
  applications to mitigate burnout, depression and suicidality among healthcare students and
  professionals: A systematic review. Academic Psychiatry. 2018: 42:109-120. Available from
- 412 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s40596-017-0868-0</u>
- 413 30. Bailey E, Muhlmann C, Rice S, Nedeljkovic M, Alvarez-Jimenez M, Sander L, et al. Ethical issues
- 414 and practical barriers in internet-based suicide prevention research: a review and investigator
- 415 survey. BMC Medical Ethics. 2020; 21(37):1-16. Available from
- 416 https://bmcmedethics.biomedcentral.com/articles/10.1186/s12910-020-00479-1
- 417 31. Lai M, Maniam T, Chan L, Ravindran A. Caught in the web: A review of web-based suicide
- 418 prevention. Journal of Medical Internet Research. 2014; 16(1):1-8. Available from
- 419 <u>https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.2973</u>

- 420 32. Milne-Ives M, Selby E, Inkster B, Lam C, Meinert E. Artificial intelligence and machine learning in
- 421 mobile apps for mental health: A scoping review. PLOS Digital Health. 2022; 1(8):1-13. Available from
- 422 https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pdig.0000079
- 423 33. Rassy J, Bardon C, Dargis L, Cote LP, Corthesy-Blondin L, Morch CM, et al. Information and
- 424 communication technology use in suicide prevention: Scoping review. Journal of Medical Internet
- 425 Research. 2021; 23(5):1-20. Available from <u>https://doi.org.10.2196/25288</u>
- 426 34. Reen J, Friday A, Orji R. Saving life and keeping privacy: A study on mobile apps for suicide
- 427 prevention and privacy policies. Persuasive. 2022; 190-207. Available from
- 428 https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-98438-0\_15
- 429 35. Rice S, Robinson J, Bendall S, Hetrick S, Cox G, Bailey E, et al. Online and social media suicide
- 430 prevention interventions for young people: A focus on implementation and moderation. Journal of
- the Canadian Academy of Child and Adolescent psychiatry. 2016; 25(2):80-86. Available from
- 432 <u>https://researchmgt.monash.edu/we/portalfiles/portal/303332545/303332247\_0a.pdf</u>
- 433 36. Balcombe L, Diego D. Human-computer interaction in digital mental health. Informatics. 2022;
- 434 9(14):1-18. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.3390/informatics9010014</u>
- 435 37. Balcombe L, Diego D. The potential impact of adjunct digital tools and technology to help
- 436 distressed and suicidal men: An integrative review. Frontiers in Psychology. 2022; 12:1-10. Available
- 437 from <u>https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2021.796371</u>
- 438 38. Berrouiguet S, Gravey M, Le Galudec M, Alavi Z, Walter M. Post-acute crisis text messaging
- 439 outreach for suicide prevention: A pilot study. Psychiatry Research. 2014; 217:154-157. Available from
- 440 <u>http://dx.doi.org/.1016/j.psychres.2014.02.034</u>
- 441 39. Brown K, Toombs M, Nasir B, Kisely S, Ranmuthugala G, Brennan-Olsen S, et al. How can mobile
- 442 applications support suicide prevention gatekeepers in Australian Indigenous communities? Social
- 443 Science & Medicine. 2020; 258:1-10. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socsimed.2020.113015</u>

444	40. Bruen A, Wall A, Haines-Delmont A, Perkins E. Exploring Suicidal Ideation Using an Innovative
445	Mobile App-Strength Within Me: The Usability and Acceptability of Setting up a Trial Involving Mobile
446	Technology and Mental Health Service Users. JMIR Mental Health. 2020;7(9):18407. Available from:

- 447 <u>https://doi.org/10.2196/18407</u>
- 448 41. Buus N, Erlangsen A, River J, Andreasson K, Frandsen H, Larsen J, et al. Stakeholder perspectives
- on using and developing the MYPLAN suicide prevention mobile phone application: A focus group
- 450 study. Archives of Suicide Research. 2018; 24(1):48-63. Available from
- 451 <u>https://doi.org/10.1080/13811118.2018.1489319</u>
- 452 42. Dickter B, Bunge E, Brown L, Leykin Y, Soares E. Van Voorhees B, et al. Impact of an online
- 453 depression prevention intervention on suicide risk factors for adolescents and young adults. mHealth.
- 454 2019; 5(11):1-10. Available from <u>http://doi.org/10.21037/mhealth.2019.04.01</u>
- 455 43. Hetrick S, Robinson J, Burge E, Blandon R, Mobilio B, Rice S, et al. Youth Codesign of a mobile phone
- 456 app to facilitate self-monitoring and management of mood symptoms in young people with major
- 457 depression, suicidal ideation and self-harm. JMIR Mental Health. 2018; 5(1):1-14. Available from
- 458 <u>https://doi.org/10.2196/mental.9041</u>
- 459 44. Josifovski N, Shand F, Morley K, Chia J, Henshaw R, Petrie K, et al. A pilot study of a text message
- 460 and online brief contact intervention following self-harm or a suicide attempt: A mixed methods
- 461 evaluation. General Hospital Psychiatry. 2022; 76:1-2. Available from
- 462 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.genhosppsych.2022.03.002</u>
- 463 45. Kennard B, Goldstein T, Foxwell A, McMakin D, Wolfe K, Biernesser C, et al. As safe as possible
- 464 (ASAP): A brief app-supported inpatient intervention to prevent post discharge suicidal behaviour in
- 465 hospitalized, suicidal adolescents. Am J Psychiatry. 2018; 175:864-872. Available from
- 466 <u>https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ajp.2018.17101151</u>

- 46. Kennedy A, Brumby S, Versace V, Brumby-Rendell T. The ripple effect: a digital intervention to
- 468 reduce suicide stigma among farming men. BMC Public Health. 2020; 20:1-12. Available from
- 469 <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-020-08954-5</u>
- 470 47. Kimberly H, O'Brien M, LeCloux M, Ross A, Gironda C, Wharff E. A pilot study of the acceptability
- 471 and usability of a smartphone application intervention for suicidal adolescents and their parents.
- 472 Archives of Suicide Research. 2017; 21:254-264. Available from
- 473 https://doi.org/10.1080/13811118.2016.1182094
- 474 48. Kiosses D, Monkovic J, Stern A, Czaja S, Alexopoulos G, Arslanoglou E, Ebo T, et al. An emotion
- 475 regulation tablet app for middle-aged and older adults at high suicide risk: Feasibility, acceptability
- and two case studies. American Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry. 2022; 30(5):575-584. Available from
- 477 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jagp.2021.08.015</u>
- 478 49. Martinez-Miranda J, Martinez A, Ramos R, Aguilar H, Jimenez L, Arias Hodwar et al. Assessment of
  479 users' acceptability of a mobile-based embodied conversational agent for the prevention and
  480 detection of suicidal behaviour. Journal of Medical Systems. 2019; 43(246):1-18. Available from
- 481 https://doi.org/10.1007/s10916-019-1387-1
- 482 50. Morgieve M, Genty C, Aze J, Dubois J, Leboyer M, Vaiva Guillaume et al. A digital companion, the
- 483 Emma App, for ecological momentary assessment and prevention of suicide: Quantitative case series
- 484 study. JMIR MHealth and UHealth. 2020; 8(10):1-16. Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.2196/15741">https://doi.org/10.2196/15741</a>
- 485 51. Biddle L, Derges J, Goldsmith C, Donovan JL, Gunnell D. Online help for people with suicidal
- 486 thoughts provided by charities and healthcare organisations: a qualitative study of users' perceptions.
- 487 Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology. 2020; 55:1157–1166. Available from:
- 488 <u>https://doi.org/10.1007/s00127-020-01852-6</u>

52. Castillo-Sanchez G, Camargo-Henriquez I, Munoz-Sanchez J, Franco-Martin M, Torre-Diez I. Suicide
prevention mobile apps: Descriptive analysis of apps from the most popular virtual stores. JMIR
MHealth and UHealth. 2019; 7(8):1-9. Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.2196/13885">https://doi.org/10.2196/13885</a>

492 53. Gibson K, Wilson J, Le Grice J, Seymour F. Resisting the silence: The impact of digital
493 communication on young people's talk about suicide. Youth & Society. 2019; 51(8):1011-1030.
494 Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X17720986">https://doi.org/10.1177/0044118X17720986</a>

495 54. Gould M, Chowdhury S, Lake A, Galfalvy H, Kleinman M, Kuchuk M, et al. National Suicide
496 Prevention Lifeline crisis chat interventions: Evaluation of chatters' perceptions of effectiveness.
497 Suicide and Life-Threatening Behavior. 2021; 51:1126-1137. Available from

- 498 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/sltb.12795</u>
- 55. O'Grady C, Melia R, Bogue J, O'Sullivan M, Young K, Duggan J. A mobile health approach for
  improving outcomes in suicide prevention (SafePlan). Journal of Medical Internet Research. 2020;
- 501 22(7):1-14. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.2196/17481</u>
- 502 56. Primack J, Bozzay M, Barredo J, Armey M, Miller I, Fisher J, et al. Feasibility and acceptability of the

mobile application for the prevention of suicide (MAPS). Military Psychology. 2021; 34()3):315-325.

504 Available from https://doi.org/10.1080/08995605.2021.1962187

505 57. Povey J, Mills P, Dingwall K, Lowell A, Singer J, Rotumah D, et al. Acceptability of mental health 506 apps for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Australians: A qualitative study. Journal of Medical

- 507 Internet Research. 2016; 18(3):1-12. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.5314</u>
- 508 58. Cohen R, Rifkin-Zybutz R, Moran P, Biddle L. Web-based support services to help prevent suicide 509 in young people and students: A mixed-methods, user-informed review of characteristics and effective 510 elements. Health and Social Care in the Community. 2022; 30:2404-2413. Available from
- 511 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/hsc.13819</u>

512	59. Dreier M, Baumgardt J, Bock T, Harter M, The 8 Lives Team, Liebherz S. Development of an online
513	suicide prevention program involving people with lived experience: ideas and challenges. Research
514	Involvement and Engagement. 2021; 7(60):1-14. Available from <a href="https://doi.org/10.1186/s40900-021-">https://doi.org/10.1186/s40900-021-</a>
515	<u>00307-9</u>

- 516 60. Bush N, Dobscha S, Crumpton R, Denneson L, Hoffman J, Crain A, et al. A virtual hope box
- 517 smartphone app as an accessory to therapy: Proof-of-concepts in a clinical sample of veterans. Suicide
- and Life-Threatening Behaviour. 2015; 45(1):1-9. Available from <a href="https://doi.org.10.1111/sltb.12103">https://doi.org.10.1111/sltb.12103</a>
- 519 61. Meier L, Gurtner C, Nuessli S, Miletic M, Burkle T, Durrer M. SERO A new mobile app for suicide
- 520 prevention. In: Healthcare of the Future. Studies in Health Technology and Informatics. 2022; 292:3-
- 521 8. Available from <u>https://doi.org/10.3233/SHTI220310</u>
- 522 62. Papyrus. Thinking of suicide? [Internet]. 2023 [cited 2023 April 3]. Available from
- 523 https://www.papyrus-uk.org
- 63. Varzgani F, Tulu B, Djamasbi S, Frost E, Wang Z, Pietro J, et al. Suicide prevention through smartphone
- 525 applications: A systematic review of literature. AMCIS Proceedings. 2021. Available from
- 526 https://doi.org/10.2196/jmir.5314
- 527 64. Tighe J, Shand F, McKay K, McAllister T, Mackinnon A, Christensen H. Usage and acceptability of the
- 528 iBobbly App: Pilot trial for suicide prevention in Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Youth. JMIR Mental
- 529 Health. 2020; 7(12):e14296. Available from https://doi.org/10.2196/14296
- 530 65. Samaritans. Staying safe [Internet]. 2023 [cited 2023 April 3]. Available from 531 https://giveusashout.org
- 66. Facebook. Facebook rolls out AI to detect suicidal posts before they're reported [Internet]. 2017.
  [cited 2023 April 3]. Available from <a href="https://techcrunch.com/2017/11/27/facebook-ai-suicide-">https://techcrunch.com/2017/11/27/facebook-ai-suicide-</a>
- 534 prevention/

- 535 67. Save.org. Suicide can be prevented and SAVE is here to help [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 3].
- 536 Available from <u>https://save.org</u>
- 68. National Suicide Prevention. Preventing suicide together [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 3].
- 538 Available from <u>https://nspa.org.uk</u>
- 539 69. Lifeline. Lifeline is always here to help [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 3]. Available from
- 540 https://www.lifelinehelpline.info
- 541 70. Forefront. Reconstructing resilience: Mental Health Literacy [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 3].
- 542 Available from <u>https://intheforefront.org</u>
- 543 71. Mental Health and Wellbeing Commission. Transforming the mental health and wellbeing system
- 544 [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 3]. Available from <u>https://www.mhwc.govt.nz</u>
- 545 72. Beyond Blue. We're here for you [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 3]. Available from
- 546 https://www.beyondblue.org.au
- 547 73. UK Standards for Public Involvement. Definitions [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 10]. Available
- 548 from https://www.nihr.ac.uk/pi-standards/definitions
- 549 74. Digital Divide Council. What is the Digital Divide? [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023 April 10]. Available
- 550 from https://www.digitaldividecouncil.com/what-is-the-digital-divide/
- 551 75. Which.co.uk. The UK 3G network switch off: what you need to know [Internet]. 2023. [cited 2023
- 552 April 10]. Available from https://www.which.co.uk/review/mobile-phone-providers/article/the-uk-3g-
- 553 <u>network-switch-off-what-you-need-to-know</u>
- 554
- 555

557			
558			
559			
560			
561			
562			
563			
564			
565			
566			
567			
568			
569			
570			
571			
572			
573			
574			
575			
576			
577			
578			