

1 ***A protocol for a systematic critical realist synthesis of school mindfulness***
2 ***interventions designed to promote pupils' mental wellbeing***

3

4

5 Pamela Abbott^{1,2*}, Graeme Nixon^{1,2}, Isabel Stanley^{1,2}, Lucia D'Ambruoso^{1,3}

6

7

8 ¹Centre for Global Development, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, UK

9

10 ²School of Education, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, UK

11

12 ³Centre for Data Science, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, UK

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

44 A protocol for a systematic critical realist synthesis of school mindfulness 45 interventions designed to promote pupils' mental wellbeing

46

47 Abstract

48

49 Introduction

50 The review described in this protocol will be the first critical realist review of the literature
51 reporting on the impact of mindfulness interventions in schools on the mental wellbeing of
52 pupils. Mindfulness interventions are increasingly being introduced into schools to promote
53 children's (and teachers') wellbeing. Findings from impact evaluations, including systematic
54 reviews and metaanalysis, suggest that school-based mindfulness interventions promote
55 pupils' wellbeing. However, there is a need for further evidence on how they work and for
56 whom and under what circumstances.

57

58 Methods and analysis

59 A critical realist review methodology will be used to provide a causal interdisciplinary
60 understanding of how mindfulness interventions in schools promote the mental wellbeing of
61 pupils. This will be done through a systematic literature review and extrapolating context,
62 agency, intervention, mechanisms, and outcome configurations. This will enable us to
63 understand how in certain contexts, pupils can use the resources offered by a mindfulness
64 intervention to trigger mechanisms that promote their mental wellbeing and what
65 mechanisms in the context support, restrict or prevent change. We will then use retrodiction
66 and retroduction to develop the most plausible interdisciplinary middle-range theory to
67 explain the findings.

68

69 Discussion

70 The review findings will inform a critical realist evaluation of a mindfulness intervention in
71 schools that we will be carrying out. The findings from the review will enable us to inform
72 policymakers and other stakeholders about what conditions need to be in place for
73 mindfulness interventions to promote pupils' mental wellbeing and for which pupils. We will
74 publish the findings from the review in academic and professional publications, policy briefs,
75 workshops, conferences, and social media.

76

77

78 **PROSPERO registration number:** CRD42023410484

79 **Key Words**

80

81 Mindfulness; schools; mental wellbeing; children and adolescents; critical realism;
82 complexity theory

83 **Introduction**

84

85 This critical realist review aims to understand how and why school-based mindfulness
86 interventions (SBMIs) work or do not work in promoting children's mental wellbeing. The
87 broad purpose is to move from empirical observation to develop theorised understanding.
88 This will produce knowledge that enables us to make recommendations to improve practice,
89 that is, the delivery of mindfulness interventions in schools (1). In this sense, we can locate
90 the main purpose, to build a middle-range theory (2) that identifies the discursive formation
91 in which it is most fruitful to discuss the phenomena (i.e. the ontology within which the results
92 are to be understood), and uses this discourse to model the main underlying mechanisms. It
93 proceeds to explain how they are triggered by the agency of pupils in response to the
94 mindfulness interventions and how these interactions and interconnections make the
95 interventions work (or not and to what extent) in given contexts (schools, neighbourhoods,
96 countries). The findings will enable us to refine the programme theory for research we are
97 carrying out examining the potential for SBMIs to promote the mental wellbeing of children
98 and adolescents. The findings will also support policymakers and others globally to
99 implement policies promoting the mental wellbeing of children and adolescents through
100 SBMIs.

101

102 Poor mental wellbeing is a serious global challenge (3–6), with the lifetime risk of
103 experiencing mental health problems being 28-41% in low-and-middle-income countries and
104 17-49% in high-income countries (6). Income and gender inequalities exacerbate the
105 problem, with women being nearly twice as likely to develop depressive illnesses as men (7).
106 Poor people are likelier to have mental health problems than those better off (8). It is also
107 estimated that just under 50% of adults with mental health issues experienced them before
108 they were 18 and a third before 14 years (9). A life-course approach is, therefore, essential
109 to break the cycle of intergenerational transfer of mental disorders (6,10). Promoting CA
110 mental wellbeing is even more urgent owing to the negative impacts COVID-19 has had on
111 their mental wellbeing, including girls having been more negatively affected than boys (3,11).

112

113 All children have a right to enjoy their childhood, attain their full potential, and lead
114 productive adult lives (12). The absence of mental wellbeing means we can envisage a 'real'
115 utopia (13) where the mental wellbeing of all children is promoted. However, the low
116 prioritisation of mental wellbeing means that children are vulnerable to abuse of their human
117 rights as set out in the United Nations Convention *on the Rights of the Child* (14). The
118 benefits of promoting mental wellbeing to children, their families and societies are high,
119 meaning that there is a strong economic as well as a moral case for promoting their mental
120 wellbeing (15,16). Improved mental wellbeing improves individuals' quality of life and
121 productivity, and collective improvements in mental wellbeing reduce healthcare costs.
122 Schools are seen as an appropriate place to deliver interventions because of how much time
123 children spend in them and the economies of scale that can be achieved (15,17,18). Such
124 interventions benefit all children, empower them, are preventative and have some
125 therapeutic value. The WHO recommends providing mental wellbeing interventions for all
126 children (19,20).

127

128 Mindfulness has been identified as an effective intervention for promoting children's mental
129 wellbeing, as evidenced by systematic reviews and meta-analyses (21–23), especially when
130 integrated into a whole-school approach (21,24,25). Mindfulness training is relevant for CA
131 across the spectrum of mental wellbeing (26). SBMIs aim to support the education system
132 by reducing stress in pupils and teachers, reducing teacher absenteeism and burnout, and
133 improving pupil learning outcomes. Systematic reviews and meta-analyses of the impact of
134 SBMIs have shown positive outcomes, including increased prosocial behaviour and
135 resilience, improved attention, cognitive and socio-emotional skills, and better academic
136 performance in general, as well as reduced stress. Mindfulness interventions also reduce
137 teachers' stress levels, improve their mental wellbeing and life satisfaction, and their
138 relationships with students making classroom environments more conducive to student
139 learning (27–31). The finding that mindfulness has a positive effect across several outcome
140 domains has led to calls for the broad introduction of mindfulness in schools (28,31,32). The
141 consensus is that mindfulness is unlikely to cause harm, and the potential benefits are high
142 (33,34).

143

144 Whole-school interventions have the advantage of being relatively inexpensive, non-
145 stigmatising and inclusive. They can be integrated into the school curriculum and taught by
146 teachers after a short pre- or in-service training (16). Locating the intervention in schools
147 recognises that mindfulness is fundamentally relational and only has meaning when it is a
148 shared social practice (35,36). Whole school interventions also aim to improve the school
149 climate, create prosocial classrooms, improve pupil-teacher and pupil-pupil relations,

150 increase children's engagement, and support pupil and teacher wellbeing (23,37). Such
151 interventions aim to create schools where pupils and teachers share a disposition to
152 mindfulness and a sense of personal control and investment and feel more in control of their
153 lives. They enable pupils to develop a range of educational skills, including 'the flexible
154 transfer of skills and knowledge to new contexts, the development of deep understanding,
155 student motivation and engagement, the ability to think critically and creatively, and the
156 development of more self-directed learners' (38). SBMIs are then defended against the
157 charge of commodifying children and producing neoliberal subjects because they bring
158 about, or can bring about, educational aims and benefits (in addition to socioeconomic ones)
159 (16,37,39,40).

160
161 Promising as these findings are, we are left with unresolved issues that limit our ability to use
162 them. While systematic reviews have indicated promise regarding impacts, there have been
163 varying outcomes, and not all interventions have been shown to work (41). Mindfulness-
164 based interventions consist of several elements, vary in theoretical underpinnings, duration
165 and mode of delivery, and have heterogeneous outcomes (16,42). Most studies are from
166 Western, high-income countries, most notably the USA and the UK, with few in low-and-
167 middle-income countries (LMICs). Most notably, the evidence does not indicate *what makes*
168 *these programmes work, how, where, with whom and to what extent*. Researchers' primary
169 focus has been asking if mindfulness works rather than how and why it works (43). Most
170 theories assume that practising mindfulness exercises bring about the observed changes
171 (44) and that mindfulness is about changing the wiring of the brain and the psychology of
172 individuals (39,42,44). A scoping review to elucidate the mediators, moderators and
173 implementation factors in delivering universal mindfulness training in schools (45) identified
174 mediators and moderators that influenced the outcome of the intervention. These included
175 the fidelity of the intervention, the dose, the quality, the reach, and the receptivity of the
176 pupils. However, the analysis is descriptive rather than explanatory. The authors also point
177 out that few studies of SBMIs report findings from the process evaluation. It concluded that
178 what is required is higher quality trials that include process evaluation.

179
180 However, constant conjunction does not explain how mindfulness works, and psychological
181 theories of mindfulness are inadequate for explaining how an intervention designed to
182 promote mental wellbeing, a bio-psycho-social phenomenon, works. Evidence, for example,
183 suggests that group effects are important (46), as suggested by findings from whole-school
184 interventions (23,37,38). Mindful schools cultivate mindfulness as a disposition that changes
185 pupil (and teacher) behaviour, thereby improving the school 'climate'. Evidence from low,
186 middle and high-income countries shows that school climate is important for positive student

187 outcomes, including mental wellbeing, with feedback loops between teachers' improved
188 mental wellbeing and pupils' (47–49). A realist review of MBIs at the workplace designed to
189 improve employee wellbeing found that the intervention triggered four mechanisms that
190 participants were able to use: awareness/self-regulation, acceptance/compassion, feeling
191 permitted to take care of the self, and a sense of growth and being able to attain goals (44).
192 Critically, this research also found that a *supportive environment at work* was important,
193 linking mindfulness practice to specific practice settings and existing goals and practices.
194 The fear of being seen as non-productive stimulated the adoption of mindful practices and
195 reduced the extent of non-adherence/dropout.

196
197 Given the limitations of existing evidence on how SBMIs work, new interdisciplinary
198 knowledge considering their net effects and investigations of how and why, for whom and
199 under what circumstances they work (or do not) will provide the necessary evidence for
200 policy and decision-makers. Such research can generate the knowledge to understand
201 better what needs to be done to implement SBMIs, so they benefit pupils' and teachers'
202 mental wellbeing and improve their quality of life. To do so, they must open the black box
203 and map the complex pathways linking the mindfulness intervention to outcomes. The
204 conclusion from recent SBMI trials is that this should be a priority for future research (50,51)
205 rather than the usual recommendation of more trials of higher quality to demonstrate efficacy
206 definitively. That SBMIs and improvements in child mental wellbeing are correlated in many
207 instances has established a 'demi-regularity'. It is this demi-regularity that needs to be
208 explained (52). We need to determine the contexts and agential responses to the
209 mindfulness interventions that enable them to work for some children in some contexts and
210 not others.

211 **Aim and Objectives**

212

213 The aims of the review are to:

214

- 215 (a) describe plausible explanations for the effectiveness of mindfulness interventions
216 designed to promote pupils' wellbeing, and
217 (b) create transferable theories that can inform programme design and implementation in
218 different settings.

219

220 To achieve the aim, the objectives are to identify:

221

- 222 • theories about how mindfulness interventions work in schools;

- 223 • the contexts and mechanisms that may facilitate or hinder implementation;
- 224 • how pupils and teachers respond to mindfulness interventions (agency);
- 225 • how school contexts influence the agency of pupils in responding to the mindfulness
- 226 intervention and trigger mechanisms that change the context and lead to outcomes;
- 227 • how the school system changes (roles and relationships), including pupil-teacher
- 228 relations and pupil-pupil-relations;
- 229 • how the school attitudes and values change (culture), and;
- 230 • the outcomes resulting from the interventions.

231 Methodology

232

233 Introduction

234

235 To achieve our aims and objectives, we will conduct a systematic critical realist review to
236 identify how mindfulness interventions promote pupils' mental wellbeing. A critical realist
237 review is explanatory; it seeks to explain how interventions work and generate different
238 outcomes in different contexts (53,54). We will explore how mindfulness interventions are
239 supported or inhibited by contextual mechanisms in schools, how CA and teachers respond
240 to them and the outcomes that result from the interaction between the intervention and
241 contextual mechanisms and the response of CA and teachers. In doing so, we will identify
242 the 'demi-regularities', the contexts over time and space in which mindfulness interventions
243 enable pupils' agency to trigger mechanisms that promote their mental wellbeing (52).
244 Because critical realism affirms the reality of objects, agents, and mechanisms, which cannot
245 be viewed directly but only deduced from their effects, it seeks to identify, by retrodiction
246 and retrodiction, the middle-range interdisciplinary theory that most comprehensively
247 explains how mindfulness interventions work. Such theories are always open to refinement
248 in the light of new evidence.

249

250 There is no agreed standard or guide for critical realist reviews, but they are underpinned by
251 a critical realist meta-theory and draw on some elements of the realist review methodology
252 of Roy Pawson (1). We have adapted the standard for realist reviews (55,56) and taken into
253 account recommendations for traditional systematic reviews (57–59). PRISMA offers
254 transparency, validity, replicability, and updateability (Additional Material 1).

255

256 A critical realist research paradigm

257

258 Our methodology is informed by critical realist metatheory (Table 1 defines key critical realist
 259 terms used in this protocol). Critical realism in the social and health sciences is most
 260 frequently associated with the work of Roy Bhaskar (60). It has informed the development of
 261 methods for systematic reviews and impact evaluations that are designed to explain how
 262 and why interventions work in the ways they do (61). However, few systematic reviews and
 263 impact evaluations have used the approach. Understanding how meta-theory can inform
 264 carrying out and reporting on critical realist systematic reviews is still evolving.

265

266 Critical realism provides guidelines for inter/transdisciplinary research (13,62–64), including
 267 research on promoting wellbeing (13,65). Inter/transdisciplinary research is essential when
 268 considering mental wellbeing. It is a bio-psycho-social phenomenon and requires the
 269 identification of the biological, psychological and social generative mechanisms (65–68). The
 270 outcome of SBMIs are likely due to the complex interaction of neurobiological, cognitive,
 271 psychological, social-structural and cultural mechanisms. The interdisciplinary team must
 272 include researchers with expertise in these disciplines committed to working together to
 273 develop trans-factual middle-range theories of how the intervention works (13).

274

275

276

277 **Table 1: Critical Realist Terminology**

Agency	The power of individuals to engage in meaningful actions. Agents have causal powers because they respond to the intervention and, within their context, can trigger mechanisms that change the context.
Abduction	Reinterpreting events into a conceptual framework.
Complexity	Outcomes result from the complex interaction of mechanisms. Therefore, change is non-linear and involves feedback loops.
Context	The context sets limits to the efficacy of a programme intervention. Structures are material, physical, and human resources and associated practices. Culture is the realm of intersubjectivity, social values/ideas, and ideational influences. Contexts are dynamic and can change through agency triggered by the intervention.
Context Mechanisms	The resources and restrictions embedded in the social and organisational (relational) structure that can influence the outcomes and must be identified. They can be physical, social,

	interpersonal, intrapersonal, or conceptual and have causal powers. While they may not be observable, they can be retroduced from what is observed.
Culture	Intersubjectivity, ideas and ideational influences.
Demi-regularities	Partial event regularities indicate that an intervention in some contexts triggers mechanisms that result in the same outcome.
Depth Ontology	Reality is stratified into three domains. <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The Empirical: experiences of what actually happens; 2. The Actual: things that happen independently of whether we observe them or not; 3. The Real: constituted by mechanisms with generative power, events, and experiences.
Emergence	The ability of mechanisms to combine to create something new that cannot be reduced to the mechanisms from which it emerged.
Intervention	The intervention is designed to bring about change in a given context.
Intervention mechanisms	The mechanisms triggered by the experiences, interpretations, and responses to interventions by actors that can change the context mechanisms.
Judgemental Rationalism	The evaluation of competing explanations to identify the one that has the most credible explanation, the one that is most practically adequate.
Laminated System	The social world is understood as an open, complex, stratified (layered) system of objects that make things happen. There are seven layers, from the Global to the sub-individual level, each influencing the other.
Middle-Range Theory	Middle-range theories lie between untestable grand theory and concrete description. They are theories that can generate hypotheses that can be tested and refined through empirical research.
Morphogenic Approach	Based on the view that there are three primary causal powers in society, structure, culture and agency, and that structure and culture necessarily predate the actions that transform them.

Open System	A (social) system where multiple causal factors interact and influence each other, and it is impossible to isolate variables as in laboratory conditions. The multiplicity of mechanisms other than the ones triggered by the intervention means that what happens may not necessarily be what was envisaged.
Outcome	Outcomes are the changes in the context that result from how people respond to the intervention and the contextual mechanisms.
Retrodiction	Determining what mix of mechanisms interact reinforce, moderate, or counteract) to produce the outcomes.
Retrodution	Inferential thinking – what makes the observable phenomena possible, what must the real be like.
Structure	Material, physical, and human resources and their associated practices at the level of social and systems integration, that is, the relations between members of society and the relationship between institutions
Transitive and Intransitive Dimensions	The intransitive dimension is the physical and social world we inhabit; things are as they are and are not constituted by our understanding of them and are independent of how we describe them. The transitive is the theories and discourses we hold in order to understand our world.

278 (61,69)

279

280 Critical realist research is evolving, and there is no single approach. Critical realism is a
 281 philosophy of science that in itself explains nothing; it is a meta-theory of how it is possible to
 282 have scientific knowledge about the social world. What is necessary is to develop an
 283 explanatory programme. Our approach draws on Margaret Archer's practical morphogenic
 284 approach (70,71), a methodology that complements Critical Realism's social ontology (72).
 285 We developed our approach to the literature review, drawing on Porter's and Hind's and
 286 Dicksons' identifications (from the perspective of critical realism) of the weaknesses of the
 287 realist approach to systematic reviews based on the work of Ray Pawson (73–75).

288

289 Critical realism is: ontologically realist, arguing that phenomena exist in the social world
 290 relatively independent of what we know or think about them, and epistemologically
 291 interpretivist, arguing that the way we come to know about phenomena is context-
 292 dependent, fallible, prone to individual interpretation, and seen from our angle of vision

293 (61,76). Critical realism rejects Humean' constant conjunctions' that B invariably follows A as
294 an empirical basis for conceptualising social reality. They argue that correlations are
295 descriptive and fallible and do not explain how interventions work. Instead, they argue that
296 there are demi-regularities, and it is how they occur that needs to be explained; that is why
297 an intervention works in some contexts and not others and for some people and not others
298 (52). Critical realism is theory-driven and seeks to explain/theorise why things occur in the
299 way they do, what the (generally hidden) mechanisms are that generate events, recognise
300 that social systems are open, eliminated and layered and that events are often the outcome
301 of the complex interaction of mechanisms (75,77–80). The effectiveness of an intervention is
302 not based only on its inherent qualities but on the action of agents in taking up the
303 opportunities afforded by the intervention to trigger mechanisms that result in the outcomes
304 (60,71). Change is non-linear and often involves complex feedback loops (78,79,81,82).
305 Critical realists are committed to social justice, moving from how things are to how they
306 should be to improve people's lives enabling fairness in society (83–85). Different contexts
307 may be more or less supportive of change; therefore, outcomes are context-specific, and all
308 theories are fallible and open to modification or refutation.

309
310 Archer's morphogenic approach is the methodological complement to Bhaskar's model of
311 social transformation (71). She argues that every theory about the social involves
312 understanding the relationship between structure, agency, and culture (SAC) (Figure 1). She
313 argues against conflating agency with structure; the context in which we live comprises both
314 structural and cultural mechanisms, and that these mechanisms are analytically separable
315 from and necessarily predate the agency which reproduces or transforms them. Structural
316 and cultural mechanisms are real; they exist independently of us and place limitations on
317 opportunities for agency. The context in which agents live shapes their beliefs, desires, and
318 opportunities and limits their agency – context conditioning. However, the interaction
319 between context and agency shapes and reshapes the context; agency can change the
320 context (morphogenesis) or reproduce it (morphostasis). There are three morphogenetic
321 cycles, material, cultural and agency. An intervention such as introducing mindfulness into a
322 school aims to bring about change by giving pupils and teachers the resources to trigger
323 mechanisms that can lead to material and cultural change. Their responses to the
324 intervention are shaped, but not determined, by the context, and individuals generate
325 outcomes through actions and interactions. When actors trigger new mechanisms (material
326 and/or cultural), the context changes. However, pupils and teachers can resist, redefine,
327 repudiate, suspend, or circumvent engagement with the intervention.

328

329 **Figure 1: Intervention Cycle Showing Context, Agency, Intervention, Mechanisms**
330 **Outcome (CAIMO) Configuration**

331

332 **Methods/Design**

333

334 **Step 1: establishing the scope of the work.**

335

336 The review will focus on SBMIs designed to promote the mental wellbeing of pupils in high-,
337 middle-and low-income countries. We will document differences between SBMIs
338 underpinned by different theories, aims, approaches and techniques and delivered differently
339 for different lengths of time (86,87). The review will also capture other individual differences
340 and programme characteristics that can impact programme receptivity and impact (24). We
341 will only include school mindfulness interventions that include mindfulness meditation as a
342 central pedagogical component (16,88) aimed at improving pupils' behavioural, cognitive
343 and mental wellbeing outcomes. Nevertheless, outcomes will likely vary by the precise
344 nature of the mindfulness intervention.

345

346 **Step 2: search for evidence**

347

348 **Search techniques**

349 A rigorous systematic Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analysis
350 (PRISMA) approach will be used to search for literature (89). A PRISMA diagram will show
351 the steps of the inclusion and exclusion of documents (Additional Material 2). The literature
352 search will be in three phases: searching electronic databases, searching other sources
353 such as relevant journals and core publishers, and citation tracking to ensure all relevant
354 studies are included. The aim is to include as wide a range as possible of academic and
355 grey literature without restrictions on study type or publication date. No location restrictions
356 will be applied to gain a wide range of relevant studies internationally in high-, middle- and
357 low-income countries. Databases that index health, psychology, sociology and/or education
358 literature will be searched. The search will be restricted to publications in the English
359 language. The search terms and the databases used are based on the advice of an
360 academic librarian.

361

362 Twenty-one scholarly databases will be searched: MEDLINE, PsychoInfo, Web of Science
363 Core Collection, PubMed Central, Google Scholar, Cochrane Library, Proquest, SciELO

364 Citation Index, Embase, Sociological Abstracts, Scopus, Current Content Connected, Child
 365 Development and Adolescent Studies, British Education Index, Data Citation Index
 366 (Clarivate), CINAHL, ERIC, Education Abstracts, Education Research Abstracts,
 367 IngentaConnect, and JSTOR.
 368
 369 Seven databases will be used to search for the grey literature: the Bielefeld Academic
 370 Search Engine, OpenGrey, PsycEXTRA, ProQuest Dissertations and Theses, Grey Matters,
 371 ResearchGate, Academia.edu, and the Social Science Research Network.
 372
 373 For books and book chapters, the websites of eight academic publishers will be searched,
 374 Routledge (Taylor & Francis), Palgrave Macmillan, Springer, Elsevier, Wiley, SAGE, Oxford
 375 University Press and Cambridge University Press.
 376
 377 The Search terms will be: 'mindfulness' or 'mindful' or 'mindfulness-based cognitive therapy'
 378 or MBCT or MBSR and 'school' or 'whole school' or 'school-based' or 'educational context'
 379 and 'children' or 'adolescents' or 'youth' or 'young people' or 'juvenile' or 'teen' or 'young
 380 adult' or 'teenager' or 'pupils'.

381

382 Table 2: Search Terms for IngentaConnect and Scopus

IngentaConnect:	article for (Title, Keywords or Abstract contains 'mindfulness OR mindful OR "mindfulness-based cognitive therapy" OR MBCT OR MBSR AND school OR "whole school" OR "school-based" OR "educational context" AND children OR youth OR "young people" OR juvenile OR teen OR "young adult" OR teenager') Then due to last entry not fitting, second search of: article for (Title, Keywords or Abstract contains 'mindfulness OR mindful OR "mindfulness-based cognitive therapy" OR MBCT OR MBSR AND school OR "whole school" OR "school-based" OR "educational context" AND children OR youth OR "young people" OR juvenile OR teen OR "young adult" OR pupils')
Scopus	Search within Article title, Abstract, Keywords: mindfulness OR mindful OR "mindfulness-based cognitive therapy" OR MBCT OR MBSR AND school OR "whole school" OR "school-based" OR "educational context" AND children OR adolescents OR youth OR

	“young people” OR juvenile OR teen OR “young adult” OR “teenager” OR pupils
--	--

383

384

385 **Inclusion/exclusion criteria**

386 **Inclusion**

- 387 • Study design: all published study types reporting empirical research but excluding
- 388 literature reviews and meta-analysis. (The references of literature reviews and meta-
- 389 analyses will be scrutinised to ensure that all studies are included in the review. We
- 390 will also record their main conclusions on a separate extraction table).
- 391 • Documents: from any country or region.
- 392 • Publication date: any.
- 393 • Document type: any document type that will inform the review.
- 394 • Population: children aged 7-16 years participating in a SBMI.
- 395 • Intervention: includes mindfulness meditation as a central pedagogical component
- 396 and aims to improve behavioural, cognitive, and mental wellbeing outcomes.
- 397 • Language: English.

398

399 **Exclusion**

- 400 • Only includes special needs schools.
- 401 • Therapeutic interventions targeted at pupils with mental health problems.
- 402 • Only includes meditation, with mindfulness meditation not being a central
- 403 pedagogical component.
- 404 • Only includes yoga.
- 405 • Only includes pupils outside the 7-16 years age group.
- 406 • In languages other than English.

407

408 **Article screening**

409 *Covidence* will be used to manage article screening and data extraction.

- 410 1. Remove duplicates and citations without abstracts or summaries;
- 411 2. Two reviewers (PA and IS) will review the titles and abstracts of all retrieved
- 412 documents captured by our search strategy and code them as 'potentially relevant'
- 413 and 'not relevant'. Any disagreements will be resolved by discussion or, if necessary,
- 414 bringing in a third reviewer (LD);
- 415 3. Download the full text of potentially relevant documents.

416

417 Step 3: document appraisal and data extraction

418

419 Extract information from the documents that potentially meet our inclusion criteria into an
420 Excel spreadsheet:

- 421 1. Document details – title, authors, year of publication, location of study;
- 422 2. Country, income group (low, lower-middle, upper-middle, high) and main religion(s);
- 423 3. The mindfulness intervention description – the type of MBI, trainers, design,
424 aim/purpose, length of training;
- 425 4. Sample characteristics- age of pupils, sex/gender, socioeconomic status, ethnicity,
426 type of school;
- 427 5. The study design and if it is fit for purpose (quality/rigour);
- 428 6. Rational for SBMI, including any social justice framing;
- 429 7. Contextual factors (mechanisms) before the intervention was introduced;
- 430 8. Proximal outcomes measured;
- 431 9. How proximal outcomes were measured;
- 432 10. Outcomes;
- 433 11. Agency;
- 434 12. Generative mechanisms triggered by the intervention that could have supported
435 change (positive mechanisms);
- 436 13. Generative mechanisms triggered by the intervention that could have
437 restricted/prevented change (negative mechanisms);
- 438 14. Contextual mechanisms that could have supported change (positive mechanisms);
- 439 15. Contextual mechanisms that restricted/prevented change (negative mechanisms);
- 440 16. Any theoretical explanations identified for explaining the outcomes and the level of
441 the explanation that is, biological, psychological, or social;
- 442 17. Changes in context following the introduction of the mindfulness intervention.

443

444 The extraction tool will be piloted. PA, LD, IS and GN will independently read two documents
445 and complete the extraction table. They will then meet, compare their extraction tables, and
446 agree on any necessary modifications.

447

448 PA will extract all information. PA will remove any documents containing insufficient relevant
449 data to inform how and why the intervention worked (or did not work) and/or not using
450 credible and trustworthy methods. Documents will be considered relevant if they can help to
451 answer the research questions; that is, they report findings from research on SBMIs. They
452 will be included as credible if the methods used are adequate for generating the findings;

453 documents will be excluded if they are not based on credible research or are purely
454 anecdotal. The reasons for the exclusion of any document will be noted. A critical realist
455 synthesis does not require that two independent reviewers complete screening for quality or
456 data relevance. However, LD will review any documents PA identifies as not contributing or
457 not using credible and trustworthy methods, with differences being resolved by discussion
458 and, if necessary, by bringing in a third reviewer, GN.

459

460 We will provide a descriptive narrative summary of the findings from this stage of the review.

461

462 Step 5: Analysis and Reporting

463

464 The analysis will aim to identify a middle-range interdisciplinary theory that explains how
465 mindfulness interventions work in schools to promote pupils' mental wellbeing. It will open
466 the black box and identify the mechanisms the mindfulness interventions triggered that
467 explain how the intervention caused the reported outcomes (Figure 2). An interdisciplinary
468 middle-range theory will then be developed that explains how mindfulness interventions
469 work, recognising that outcomes will likely differ in different contexts.

470

471 Figure 2: Hypothetical Intervention Cycle Opening Up the Black Box

472

473 The analysis will follow the critical realist stages of analysis for applied interdisciplinary
474 research, Resolution, Redescription, Retrodiction, Elimination, Identification, Correction
475 (RRREIc) (Table 3) (13,90). Mental wellbeing is the outcome of a complex interaction of bio-
476 psycho-social mechanisms. An adequate explanation of how mindfulness interventions
477 impact children's mental wellbeing must be interdisciplinary (65). The framework consists of
478 six steps to build transdisciplinary accounts of phenomena. These are: (1) break down
479 complex events into component parts and identify disciplinary explanations of impact; (2)
480 redescribe impacts in mono-theoretically meaningful ways; (3) use retrodiction to identify
481 trans-factual theories that explain the ways the mechanisms interact to produce outcomes;
482 (4) eliminate alternative competing hypotheses; (5) identify the most comprehensive
483 explanation; (6) refine scientific knowledge in light of (provisional) findings (91).

484

485 Table 3: RRREIc Stages for Interdisciplinary Research

Planning Phase	Disciplinary Phase	Transdisciplinary Phase	Interdisciplinary Phase
----------------	--------------------	-------------------------	-------------------------

Resolution	Redescription	Retrodiction	Elimination	Identification	Refinement
Identification of the levels that are included. Biological/ Individual Social- Interaction Socioeconomic	Identification of disciplines and using abduction to develop theoretical explanations for the impact of the intervention on children's mental wellbeing	Identify how different mechanisms reinforce, moderate, and condition one another to affect the outcome	Elimination of alternative theoretical explanations.	Identify the most comprehensive interdisciplinary explanation for how mindfulness promotes children's mental wellbeing	
Identification of disciplines that research at different levels	Develop disciplinary theories to explain the impact. Reductionist/ atomistic explanations	Develop trans-factual theories integrating the disciplinary explanations.	Use judgemental rationality to eliminate theories that lack explanatory power	Use judgemental rationality to identify the most comprehensive explanation	Iterative refinement of theory

486

487 To do this, we will first build CAIMOs for each mechanism identified (92). This will involve a
 488 detailed and systematic analysis based on the outcome patterns, context, agency,
 489 interventions, mechanisms triggered by agency, and outcomes: the CAIMO configuration
 490 (Figure 4). The four critical realist evaluation categories are the context before the
 491 intervention, the children's agency, the mechanisms triggered by children's (and teacher's)
 492 agency and the outcomes. Agency is pupils' (and teachers') responses to the mindfulness
 493 interventions, mechanisms are triggered by agency and enable pupils (and teachers) to
 494 benefit from the intervention, and the pre-existing structures and culture are the contextual
 495 conditions that facilitate or inhibit pupils' potential to benefit from the intervention (see Figure
 496 3).

497

498 Outcomes patterns are the mental wellbeing outcomes pupils experience from participating
 499 in SBMIs. Within each category, findings will be broken down thematically and reported
 500 narratively to distinguish between different contexts, agency responses, mechanisms

501 triggered, and outcomes (Figure 4). The key themes that describe processes and causal
502 mechanisms for explaining mindfulness intervention outcomes in schools will then be
503 identified. Hypothetical links will then be made between the CAIMO themes, creating
504 potential pathways that account for the impacts of school-based mindfulness interventions
505 on pupils and why, for whom and under what circumstances these impacts occur.

506

507 **Figure 3: Critical Realist Evaluation Process**

508 However, to take account of complexity, it is necessary to develop a non-linear pathway of
509 change showing how the complex interaction of mechanisms (context mechanisms that
510 predate the intervention and those triggered by the intervention) leads to the observed
511 outcomes (Figure 4) (75,79,80,93). To do this, we will use feedback loop diagrams to model
512 change, showing both mechanisms triggered by the intervention that cause change, those
513 already in the context that supported change (+ve mechanism) and those already in the
514 context and mechanisms triggered by the intervention that restricted or prevented change (-
515 ve mechanisms). Outcomes will likely be more complex than a dichotomy between
516 morphogenesis (structural change) and morphostasis (structural reproduction).

517

518 **Figure 4: Simplified Hypothetical Causal Pathway of Change after an Intervention**

519 **Ethics**

520

521 Formal ethics approval is not required for a literature review. However, ethical approval has
522 been obtained from the University of Aberdeen, Addis Ababa University, and the University
523 of Rwanda for the research programme, of which the critical realist review forms an integral
524 element.

525 **Dissemination**

526

527 We will publish at least one article in a peer review journal reporting the findings from the
528 literature review, conforming to RAMESES publication standards (56) and a policy brief
529 intended for policymakers with the target audience including WHO, UNESCO, UNICEF and
530 the UK and Scottish Governments. Findings from the review will be disseminated via an
531 article in the Conversation, seminar and conference presentations, and podcasts posted on
532 the project website and disseminated by social media.

533 Discussion

534

535 Our review will be the first critical realist (or realist) review of the literature on mindfulness
536 interventions in schools. In the review, we aim to identify the generative mechanisms and
537 social structures that explain how and why school-based mindfulness interventions promote
538 the mental wellbeing of CA. This will enable policymakers and school leaders to understand
539 under what circumstances school-based mindfulness interventions promote CA mental
540 wellbeing and for which CA they work.

541

542 The main challenges are likely to be that: most studies will have been carried out in high-
543 income countries, so we will not be able to identify critical context elements and relevant
544 mechanisms that are unique to low-and-middle-income countries; there will be little
545 information in the documents on the context and; the documents may not include details of
546 the theoretical reasoning underpinning their intervention to enable us to develop middle-
547 range theories.

548

549 **Authors Contributions:** PA, GN and LD contributed to the NIHR grant application. PA led
550 on the design of the research and the writing of the protocol and produced the first draft. GN,
551 IS and LD revised drafts and agreed the final text of this paper.

552 References

- 553 1. Edgley A, Stickley T, Timmons S, Meal A. Critical realist review: exploring the real,
554 beyond the empirical. *J Furth High Educ* [Internet]. 2016;40(3):316–30. Available
555 from: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2014.953458>
- 556 2. Merton RK. On Sociological Theories of the Middle Range. In: *Social Theory and*
557 *Social Structure* [Internet]. New York, NY: Simon& Schuster, The Free Press; 1949.
558 Available from: [http://www.csun.edu/~snk1966/Robert K Merton - On Sociological](http://www.csun.edu/~snk1966/Robert K Merton - On Sociological Theories of the Middle Range.pdf)
559 [Theories of the Middle Range.pdf](http://www.csun.edu/~snk1966/Robert K Merton - On Sociological Theories of the Middle Range.pdf)
- 560 3. Nochaiwong S, Ruengorn C, Thavorn K, Hutton B, Awiphan R, Phosuya C, et al.
561 Global prevalence of mental health issues among the general population during the
562 coronavirus disease-2019 pandemic: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Sci Rep*
563 [Internet]. 2021;11(1):1–18. Available from: [https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-89700-8)
564 [89700-8](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-89700-8)
- 565 4. Bährer-Kohler S, Carod-Artal FJJ. Global mental health: Prevention and promotion.
566 *Glob Ment Heal Prev Promot*. 2017;1–243.
- 567 5. Wainberg ML, Scorza P, Shultz JM, Helpman L, Mootz JJ, Johnson KA, et al.
568 Challenges and Opportunities in Global Mental Health: A Research-to-Practice
569 Perspective. *J Int Soc Burn Inj*. 2017;19(5):28.
- 570 6. Kessler RC, Angermeyer M, Anthony JC, Graaf RD De, Demyttenaere K, Gasquet I,
571 et al. Lifetime prevalence and age-of-onset distributions of mental disorders in the
572 World Health Organization's World Mental Health Survey Initiative. *World Psychiatry*
573 [Internet]. 2007;6(October):168–76. Available from:
574 <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2174588/#!po=70.8333>
- 575 7. Yu S. Uncovering the Hidden Impacts of Inequality on Mental Health: A Global Study.

- 576 Transl Psychiatry. 2018;8(98).
577 8. Cortina MA, Sodha A, Fazel M, Ramchandani PG. Prevalence of Child Mental Health
578 Problems in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Systematic Review. Vol. 166, Archives of
579 Pediatrics and Adolescent Medicine. American Medical Association; 2012. p. 276–81.
580 9. Solmi M, Radua J, Olivola M, Croce E, Soardo L, Salazar de Pablo G, et al. Age at
581 onset of mental disorders worldwide: large-scale meta-analysis of 192 epidemiological
582 studies. *Mol Psychiatry*. 2022;27(1):281–95.
583 10. WHO. Adolescent mental health [Internet]. Fact Sheet. Geneva: World Health
584 Organisation; 2022 [cited 2022 Dec 4]. Available from: [https://www.who.int/news-](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/adolescent-mental-health)
585 [room/fact-sheets/detail/adolescent-mental-health](https://www.who.int/news-room/fact-sheets/detail/adolescent-mental-health)
586 11. Asante KO, Quarshie EN-B, Andoh-Arthur J. COVID-19 School Closure and
587 Adolescent Mental Health in Sub-Saharan Africa. *Int J Soc Psychiatry* [Internet].
588 2020;67(7):958–60. Available from: <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/33176525/>
589 12. WHO Secretariat. Risks to Mental Health: An Overview of Vulnerabilities and Risk
590 Factors. Geneva: World Health Organisation; 2012.
591 13. Bhaskar R, Danermark B, Price L. Interdisciplinarity and Wellbeing: A Critical Realist
592 General Theory of Interdisciplinarity [Internet]. London and New York, NY: Routledge;
593 2018. Available from: [https://www.amazon.co.uk/Interdisciplinarity-Wellbeing-Critical-](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Interdisciplinarity-Wellbeing-Critical-Realist-Routledge/dp/0415403715/ref=sr_1_1?crd=403D8WANEIEM&keywords=critical+realism+wellbeing&qid=1662303252&s=books&sprefix=critical+realism+wellbeing+%2Cs-tripbooks%2C70&sr=1-1)
594 [Realist-](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Interdisciplinarity-Wellbeing-Critical-Realist-Routledge/dp/0415403715/ref=sr_1_1?crd=403D8WANEIEM&keywords=critical+realism+wellbeing&qid=1662303252&s=books&sprefix=critical+realism+wellbeing+%2Cs-tripbooks%2C70&sr=1-1)
595 [Routledge/dp/0415403715/ref=sr_1_1?crd=403D8WANEIEM&keywords=critical+rea-](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Interdisciplinarity-Wellbeing-Critical-Realist-Routledge/dp/0415403715/ref=sr_1_1?crd=403D8WANEIEM&keywords=critical+realism+wellbeing&qid=1662303252&s=books&sprefix=critical+realism+wellbeing+%2Cs-tripbooks%2C70&sr=1-1)
596 [lism+wellbeing&qid=1662303252&s=books&sprefix=critical+realism+wellbeing+%2Cs-](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Interdisciplinarity-Wellbeing-Critical-Realist-Routledge/dp/0415403715/ref=sr_1_1?crd=403D8WANEIEM&keywords=critical+realism+wellbeing&qid=1662303252&s=books&sprefix=critical+realism+wellbeing+%2Cs-tripbooks%2C70&sr=1-1)
597 [tripbooks%2C70&sr=1-1](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Interdisciplinarity-Wellbeing-Critical-Realist-Routledge/dp/0415403715/ref=sr_1_1?crd=403D8WANEIEM&keywords=critical+realism+wellbeing&qid=1662303252&s=books&sprefix=critical+realism+wellbeing+%2Cs-tripbooks%2C70&sr=1-1)
598 14. OHCHR. The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child [Internet]. 1989
599 [cited 2023 Mar 12]. Available from:
600 <https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/Documents/ProfessionalInterest/crc.pdf>
601 15. McDaid D, Park A-L, Wahlbeck K. The Economic Case for the Prevention of Mental
602 Illness. *Annu Rev Public Health* [Internet]. 2019;40(8.1):373–89. Available from:
603 [http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/100054/1/McDaid_economic_case_prevention_mental_illness.](http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/100054/1/McDaid_economic_case_prevention_mental_illness.pdf)
604 [pdf](http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/100054/1/McDaid_economic_case_prevention_mental_illness.pdf)
605 16. Ergas O. Mindfulness In, As and Of Education: Three Roles of Mindfulness in
606 Education. *J Philos Educ*. 2019;53(2):340–58.
607 17. Vikram Patel, Rahman A. An Agenda for Global Child Mental Health. *Child Adolesc*
608 *Ment Health*. 2015;20(1):3–4.
609 18. O'Reilly M, Svirydzenka N, Adams S, Dogra N. Review of Mental Health Promotion
610 Interventions in Schools. *Soc Psychiatry Psychiatr Epidemiol*. 2018;53:647–662.
611 19. WHO. Helping Adolescents Thrive: Guidelines on Mental Health Promotion and
612 Prevention Interventions for Adolescents. Geneva: World Health Organisation; 2020.
613 20. United Nations Children's Fund. Five essential pillars for promoting and protecting
614 mental health and psychosocial well-being in schools and learning environments.
615 New, NY, NY: UNICEF Education Section, Programme Division; 2022.
616 21. Hudson KG, Lawton R, Hugh-Jones S. Factors Affecting the Implementation of a
617 Whole School Mindfulness Program: A Qualitative Study Using the Consolidated
618 Framework for Implementation Research. *BMC Health Serv Res*. 2020;20(133).
619 22. Šouláková B, Kasa A, Butzer B, Winkler P. Meta-Review on the Effectiveness of
620 Classroom-Based Psychological Interventions Aimed at Improving Student Mental
621 Health and Well-Being, and Preventing Mental Illness. *J Prim Prev*. 2019;40:255–78.
622 23. Zenner C, Herrnleben-Kurz S, Walach H. Mindfulness-based interventions in schools-
623 a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Front Psychol* [Internet]. 2014;5(603):1–20.
624 Available from: [https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4075476/pdf/fpsyg-05-](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4075476/pdf/fpsyg-05-00603.pdf)
625 [00603.pdf](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC4075476/pdf/fpsyg-05-00603.pdf)
626 24. Carsley D, Khoury B, Heath NL. Effectiveness of Mindfulness Interventions for Mental
627 Health in Schools: A Comprehensive Meta-analysis. *Mindfulness (N Y)* [Internet].
628 2018;9(3):693–707. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0020764020973684>
629 25. Rempel KDD. Mindfulness for Children and Youth: A Review of the Literature with an
630 Argument for School-Based Implementation Méditation de pleine conscience pour les

- 631 enfants et les jeunes: Survol de la littérature et argumentation pour sa mise en oeuvre
632 en milieu scol. *Can J Couns Psychother* [Internet]. 2012;46(3):201–20. Available from:
633 <https://mindfulnessinschools.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/09/remple.pdf>
- 634 26. Kuyken W, Nuthall E, Byford S, Crane C, Dalgleish T, Ford T, et al. The effectiveness
635 and cost-effectiveness of a mindfulness training programme in schools compared with
636 normal school provision (MYRIAD): Study protocol for a randomised controlled trial.
637 *Trials*. 2017;18(1):1–17.
- 638 27. Krame K. *The Efficacy of Mindfulness-Based Interventions on Occupational Stress
639 and Burnout among K-12 Educators: A Review of the Literature*. Vienna: World
640 Conference on Teaching and Education; 2021.
- 641 28. Weare K, Bethune A. *Implementing Mindfulness in Schools: An Evidence-Based
642 Guide* [Internet]. London: The Mindfulness Initiative Sheffield; 2021. Available from:
643 www.themindfulnessinitiative.org/appeal/donate
- 644 29. Lomas T, Medina JCC, Ivtzan I, Rupprecht S, Eiroa-Orosa FJJ. The impact of
645 mindfulness on the wellbeing and performance of educators: A systematic review of
646 the empirical literature. *Teach Teach Educ*. 2017;61:132–41.
- 647 30. Emerson LM, Leyland A, Hudson K, Rowse G, Hanley P, Hugh-Jones S. Teaching
648 Mindfulness to Teachers: a Systematic Review and Narrative Synthesis. *Mindfulness*
649 (N Y). 2017;8(5):1136–49.
- 650 31. Phan ML, Renshaw TL, Caramanico J, Greeson JM, MacKenzie E, Atkinson-Diaz Z,
651 et al. Mindfulness-Based School Interventions: a Systematic Review of Outcome
652 Evidence Quality by Study Design. *Mindfulness* (N Y). 2022;13(7):1591–613.
- 653 32. Klingbeil DA, Renshaw TL, Willenbrink JB, Copek RA, Chan KT, Haddock A, et al.
654 Mindfulness-based Interventions with Youth: A Comprehensive Meta-analysis of
655 Group-design Studies. *J Sch Psychol*. 2017;63:77–103.
- 656 33. Pillay K, Eagle G. The Case for Mindfulness Interventions for Traumatic Stress in
657 High Violence, Low Resource Settings. *Curr Psychol*. 2019;
- 658 34. Zoogman S, Goldberg SB, Hoyt WT, Miller L. Mindfulness Interventions with Youth: A
659 Meta-Analysis. *Mindfulness* (N Y). 2015;6:290–302.
- 660 35. Stanley S. Mindfulness: Towards A Critical Relational Perspective. *Soc Personal
661 Psychol Compass*. 2012;6(9):631–41.
- 662 36. Roeser RW, Greenberg MT, Frazier T, Galla BM, Semenov AD, Warren MT. Beyond
663 All Splits: Envisioning the Next Generation of Science on Mindfulness and
664 Compassion in Schools for Students. *Mindfulness* (N Y) [Internet]. 2022; Available
665 from: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12671-022-02017-z>
- 666 37. Tarrasch R. Mindful Schooling: Better Attention Regulation Among Elementary School
667 Children Who Practice Mindfulness as Part of their School Policy. *J Cogn Enhanc*.
668 2017;1(2):84–95.
- 669 38. Ritchhart R, Perkins DNN. Life in the mindful classroom: Nurturing the disposition of
670 mindfulness. *J Soc Issues*. 2000;56(1):27–47.
- 671 39. Forbes D. *Mindfulness and Its Discontents: Education, Self, and Social
672 Transformation* [Internet]. New York, NY: Fernwood Publishing; 2018. Available from:
673 [https://www.amazon.co.uk/gp/product/1773631160/ref=ppx_yo_dt_b_asin_title_o00_s
674 00?ie=UTF8&psc=1](https://www.amazon.co.uk/gp/product/1773631160/ref=ppx_yo_dt_b_asin_title_o00_s00?ie=UTF8&psc=1)
- 675 40. Leggett W. Can Mindfulness really change the world? The political character of
676 meditative practices. *Crit Policy Stud* [Internet]. 2022;16(3):261–78. Available from:
677 <https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2021.1932541>
- 678 41. Montero-Marin J, Allwood M, Ball S, Crane C, De Wilde K, Hinze V, et al. School-
679 based mindfulness training in early adolescence: What works, for whom and how in
680 the MYRIAD trial? *Evid Based Ment Health*. 2022;25(3):117–24.
- 681 42. Teasdale J. *What Happens in Mindfulness*. New York, NY and London: Guilford
682 Press; 2022.
- 683 43. Ditrach T. *Theorising Mindfulness: Conceptualisations and Research*. In: Ditrach T,
684 Wiles R, Lovegrove B, editors. *Mindfulness and Education Research and Practice*.
685 Newcastle upon Tyne; 2017.

- 686 44. Micklitz K, Wong G, Howick J. Mindfulness-based programmes to reduce stress and
687 enhance well-being at work: A realist review. *BMJ Open*. 2021;11(3):1–16.
- 688 45. Tudor K, Maloney S, Raja A, Baer R, Blakemore SJ, Byford S, et al. Universal
689 Mindfulness Training in Schools for Adolescents: a Scoping Review and Conceptual
690 Model of Moderators, Mediators, and Implementation Factors. *Prev Sci* [Internet].
691 2022;23(6):934–53. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s1121-022-01361-9>
- 692 46. Imel Z, Baldwin S, Bonus K, Maccoon D. Beyond the individual: group effects in
693 mindfulness-based stress reduction. *Psychother Res* [Internet]. 2008;18(6):735–42.
694 Available from: <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/18815948/>
- 695 47. Larson KE, Nguyen AJ, Orozco Solis MG, Humphreys A, Bradshaw CP, Lindstrom
696 Johnson S. A systematic literature review of school climate in low and middle income
697 countries. *Int J Educ Res*. 2020;102(June).
- 698 48. Gray C, Wilcox G, Nordstokke D. Teacher Mental Health, School Climate, Inclusive
699 Education and Student Learning: A Review. Vol. 58, *Canadian Psychology*. 2017. p.
700 203–10.
- 701 49. Thapa A, Cohen J, Guffey S, Higgins-D'Alessandro A. A Review of School Climate
702 Research. *Rev Educ Res*. 2013;83(3):357–85.
- 703 50. Kuyken W, Ball S, Crane C, Ganguli P, Jones B, Montero-Marin J, et al. Effectiveness
704 and cost-effectiveness of universal school-based mindfulness training compared with
705 normal school provision in reducing risk of mental health problems and promoting
706 well-being in adolescence: The MYRIAD cluster randomised controlled trial. *Evid
707 Based Ment Health* [Internet]. 2022;25(3):99–109. Available from:
708 <https://ebmh.bmj.com/content/ebmental/25/3/99.full.pdf>
- 709 51. Dunning D, Tudor K, Radley L, Dalrymple N, Funk J, Vainre M, et al. Do mindfulness-
710 based programmes improve the cognitive skills, behaviour and mental health of
711 children and adolescents? An updated meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials.
712 *BMJ Evid Based Ment Heal* [Internet]. 2022;25(3):135–42. Available from:
713 <https://ebmh.bmj.com/content/25/3/135>
- 714 52. Lawson T. *Economics and Reality*. London: Routledge; 1997.
- 715 53. Clegg S. Evidence-based practice in educational research: A critical realist critique of
716 systematic review. *Br J Sociol Educ*. 2005;26(3):415–28.
- 717 54. Mingers J, Standing C. Why things happen – Developing the critical realist view of
718 causal mechanisms. *Inf Organ*. 2017;27(3):171–89.
- 719 55. Greenhalgh T, Pawson R, Wong G, Westhorp G, Greenhalgh J, Manzano A, et al.
720 *Protocols and realist evaluation*. 2017;1–4. Available from:
721 https://www.ramesesproject.org/Standards_and_Training_materials.php
- 722 56. Wong G, Westhorp G, Manzano A, Greenhalgh J, Jagosh J, Greenhalgh T.
723 RAMESES II reporting standards for realist evaluations. *BMC Med* [Internet].
724 2016;14(1):1–18. Available from: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1186/s12916-016-0643-1>
- 725 57. Gough D, Oliver S, Thomas J. *Learning From Research : Systematic Reviews for
726 Informing Policy Decisions* [Internet]. London: EPPI-Centre, Social Science Research
727 Unit, Institute of Education, University of London; 2013. Available from:
728 <https://apo.org.au/sites/default/files/resource-files/2013-12/apo-nid71119.pdf>
- 729 58. Moher D, Liberati A, Tetzlaff J, Altman DGG. Preferred Reporting Items for
730 Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses: The PRISMA statement. *Ann Intern Med*
731 [Internet]. 2009;151(4):264–9. Available from: <https://doi.org/10.7326/0003-4819-151-4-200908180-00135>
- 732 59. Lockwood C, Munn Z, Porritt K. Qualitative research synthesis: Methodological
733 guidance for systematic reviewers utilizing meta-aggregation. *Int J Evid Based
734 Healthc*. 2015;13(3):179–87.
- 735 60. Bhaskar R. *The Possibility of Naturalism. A Philosophical Critique of the
736 Contemporary Human Sciences*. Hassocks: Harvester Press; 1989.
- 737 61. Danermark B, Ekström M, Karlsson JC. *Explaining Society: Critical Realism in the
738 Social Sciences*. London and New York, NY: Routledge; 2019.
- 739 62. Price L. Critical realist versus mainstream interdisciplinarity. *J Crit Realis*.
740

- 741 2014;13(1):52–76.
- 742 63. Stigendal M, Novy A. Founding transdisciplinary knowledge production in critical
743 realism: implications and benefits. *J Crit Realis* [Internet]. 2018;17(3):203–20.
744 Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1080/14767430.2018.1514561>
- 745 64. Danermark B. Applied interdisciplinary research: a critical realist perspective. *J Crit*
746 *Realis*. 2019;18(4):368–82.
- 747 65. Pilgrim D. Preventing mental disorder and promoting mental health: some implications
748 for understanding wellbeing. *J Crit Realis*. 2021;20(5):557–73.
- 749 66. Pilgrim D. Some implications of critical realism for mental health research. *Soc Theory*
750 *Heal*. 2014;12(1):1–21.
- 751 67. Powers P. The Philosophical Foundations of Foucaultian Discourse Analysis. *Crit*
752 *Approaches to Discourse Anal across Discip*. 2012;1(2):18–34.
- 753 68. Malhotra S, Sahoo S. Antecedents of depression in children and adolescents. *Ind*
754 *Psychiatry J*. 2018;27(11).
- 755 69. Hartwig M. *Dictionary of Critical Realism* [Internet]. Abingdon and New York, NY:
756 Routledge; 2007. Available from: <https://www.routledge.com/Dictionary-of-Critical-Realism/Hartwig/p/book/9780415260992>
- 757
- 758 70. Archer M. *Culture and Agency: The Place of Culture in Social Theory* [Internet]. 2nd
759 ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; 1998. Available from:
760 [https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/culture-and-](https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/culture-and-agency/D73435BFB89EF16E49E0BFB6BC9F6ACF)
761 [agency/D73435BFB89EF16E49E0BFB6BC9F6ACF](https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/culture-and-agency/D73435BFB89EF16E49E0BFB6BC9F6ACF)
- 762 71. Archer M. *Realist Social Theory: The Morphogenetic Approach*. Cambridge:
763 Cambridge University Press; 2008.
- 764 72. Archer M. The Morphogenetic Approach: Critical Realism’s explanatory framework
765 approach. In: Róna P, Zsolnai L, editors. *Agency and Causal Explanation in*
766 *Economics*. Cham: Springer; 2020.
- 767 73. Porter S. The uncritical realism of realist evaluation. *Evaluation*. 2015;21(1):65–82.
- 768 74. Porter S, McConnell T, Reid J. The Possibility of Critical Realist Randomised
769 Controlled Trials. *Trials*. 2017;18:133.
- 770 75. Hinds K, Dickson K. Realist synthesis: a critique and an alternative. *J Crit Realis*
771 [Internet]. 2021;20(1):1–17. Available from:
772 <https://doi.org/10.1080/14767430.2020.1860425>
- 773 76. Sayer A. *Method in Social Science: A Realist Approach* [Internet]. 2nd ed. London:
774 Routledge; 2010. Available from: [https://www.amazon.co.uk/Method-Social-Science-](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Method-Social-Science-Revised-2nd/dp/0415582474/ref=sr_1_8?crid=36VCTDY04BZQP&keywords=andrew+sayer&qid=1646414830&srefix=Andrew+Sayer%2Caps%2C58&sr=8-8)
775 [Revised-](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Method-Social-Science-Revised-2nd/dp/0415582474/ref=sr_1_8?crid=36VCTDY04BZQP&keywords=andrew+sayer&qid=1646414830&srefix=Andrew+Sayer%2Caps%2C58&sr=8-8)
776 [2nd/dp/0415582474/ref=sr_1_8?crid=36VCTDY04BZQP&keywords=andrew+sayer&qid=1646414830&srefix=Andrew+Sayer%2Caps%2C58&sr=8-8](https://www.amazon.co.uk/Method-Social-Science-Revised-2nd/dp/0415582474/ref=sr_1_8?crid=36VCTDY04BZQP&keywords=andrew+sayer&qid=1646414830&srefix=Andrew+Sayer%2Caps%2C58&sr=8-8)
- 777
- 778 77. Spacey A, Porter S. Understanding advance care planning in care homes throughout
779 the COVID-19 pandemic : A critical realist review and synthesis. *Palliat Med*. 2022;1–
780 14.
- 781 78. Byrne D. Complexity, configurations and cases. *Theory, Cult Soc*. 2005;22(5).
- 782 79. Hatt K. View of Considering Complexity_ Toward A Strategy for Non-linear Analysis.
783 *Can J Sociol*. 2009;34(2):313–47.
- 784 80. Mukumbang F, De Souza D, Liu H, Uribe G, Moore C, Fotheringham P, et al.
785 Unpacking the design, implementation and uptake of community-integrated health
786 care services: A critical realist synthesis. *BMJ Glob Heal* [Internet]. 2022;7(8):1–14.
787 Available from: <https://gh.bmj.com/content/bmjgh/7/8/e009129.full.pdf>
- 788 81. Yang Y. Critical realism and complexity theory: Building a nonconstructivist systems
789 research framework for effective governance analysis. *Syst Res Behav Sci*.
790 2021;38(1):177–83.
- 791 82. Walby S. Complexity Theory, Systems Theory, and Multiple Intersecting Social
792 Inequalities. *Philos Soc Sci* [Internet]. 2007;(4):449–70. Available from:
793 [http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.1071.5849&rep=rep1&type](http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.1071.5849&rep=rep1&type=pdf)
794 [=pdf](http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.1071.5849&rep=rep1&type=pdf)
- 795 83. Sum N-L, Jessop B. *Towards a Cultural Political Economy: Putting Culture in its Place*

- 796 in Political Economy. Cheltenham: Edward Elgar; 2013.
- 797 84. Sayer A. *Why Things Matter to People: Social Science, Values and Ethical Life*.
798 Cambridge: Cambridge University Press; 2011. 1–284 p.
- 799 85. Syed J, Mingers J. A critical realist pathway to relevant and ethical research. *Palgrave*
800 *Handb Knowl Manag*. 2018;667–90.
- 801 86. Semple RJJ, Droutman V, Reid BAA. Mindfulness Goes To School: Things Learned
802 (So Far) From Research and Real-World Experiences. *Psychol Sch*. 2017;54(1):29–
803 52.
- 804 87. Hart R, Ivtzan I, Hart D. Mind the gap in mindfulness research: A comparative account
805 of the leading schools of thought. *Rev Gen Psychol*. 2013;17(4):453–66.
- 806 88. Crane RS, Brewer J, Feldman C, Kabat-Zinn J, Santorelli S, Williams JMG, et al.
807 What defines mindfulness-based programs? The warp and the weft. *Psychol Med*.
808 2017;47(6):990–9.
- 809 89. Page MJ, Moher D, Bossuyt PM, Boutron I, Hoffmann TC, Mulrow CD, et al. PRISMA
810 2020 explanation and elaboration: Updated guidance and exemplars for reporting
811 systematic reviews. *BMJ*. 2021;372.
- 812 90. Bhaskar R. Contexts of interdisciplinarity Interdisciplinarity and climate change. In:
813 Bhaskar R, Frank C, Høyer KG, Parker P, Næss J, editors. *Interdisciplinarity and*
814 *Climate Change Transforming Knowledge and Practice for Our Global Future*
815 [Internet]. Abingdon and New York, NY: Routledge; 2010. Available from:
816 [https://course.greenskills.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/Interdisciplinarity-](https://course.greenskills.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/Interdisciplinarity-Bhaskar-2010.pdf)
817 [Bhaskar-2010.pdf](https://course.greenskills.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/Interdisciplinarity-Bhaskar-2010.pdf)
- 818 91. Myths R, Ideologies U. COVID-19/Sociology. *J Sociol* [Internet]. 2008;95(40):337–53.
819 Available from: <http://jos.sagepub.com/content/44/4/337.abstract>
- 820 92. Blom B, Morén S. Explaining social work practice - the CAIMeR theory. *J Soc Work*
821 [Internet]. 2010;10(1):98–119. Available from:
822 <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1468017309350661?journalCode=jswa>
- 823 93. Bellazzecca E, Teasdale S, Biosca O, Skelton DA. The health impacts of place-based
824 creative programmes on older adults' health: A critical realist review. *Heal Place*
825 [Internet]. 2022;76(January):102839. Available from:
826 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.healthplace.2022.102839>
827
828