1

Reverse cholesterol transport and lipid peroxidation biomarkers in major depression and bipolar disorder: a systematic review and meta-analysis

SHORT TITLE: Lipid peroxidation in affective disorders

Abbas F. Almulla, Ph.D.^{a,b}, Yanin Thipakorn, M.D., Ph.D.^a, Ali Abbas Abo Algon, M.Sc.

^c, Chavit Tunvirachaisakul, M.D., Ph.D.^{a,d}, Hussein K. Al-Hakeim, Ph.D.^e, Michael Maes, M.D., Ph.D.^{a,f,g,h}

^a Department of Psychiatry, Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand.

^b Medical Laboratory Technology Department, College of Medical Technology, The Islamic University, Najaf, Iraq.

^c Iraqi Education Ministry, Najaf, Iraq

^dCognitive Impairment and Dementia Research Unit, Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand.

^e Department of Chemistry, College of Science, University of Kufa, Kufa, Iraq.

^f Department of Psychiatry, Medical University of Plovdiv, Plovdiv, Bulgaria.

^g Department of Psychiatry, IMPACT Strategic Research Centre, Deakin University, Geelong, Victoria, Australia.

^hKyung Hee University, 26 Kyungheedae-ro, Dongdaemun-gu, Seoul 02447, Korea

Corresponding author:

Prof. Dr Michael Maes, M.D., Ph.D.

Department of Psychiatry

Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University

Bangkok, 10330

Thailand

Email: Dr.michaelmaes@hotmail.com

E-mail addresses:

Abbass.chem.almulla1991@gmail.com

Yanin.T@chula.ac.th

ali.aboalgon@gmail.com

Chavit.tun@gmail.com

headm2010@yahoo.com

dr.michaelmaes@hotmail.com

3

Abstract

Background: Major depression (MDD) and bipolar disorder (BD) are linked to immune activation, increased oxidative stress, and lower antioxidant defenses.

Objectives: To systematically review and meta-analyze all data concerning biomarkers of reverse cholesterol transport (RCT), lipid-associated antioxidants, lipid peroxidation products, and autoimmune responses to oxidatively modified lipid epitopes in MDD and BD.

Methods: Databases including PubMed, Google scholar and SciFinder were searched to identify eligible studies from inception to January 10th, 2023. Guidelines of Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines were followed.

Results: The current meta-analysis included 176 studies (60 BD and 116 MDD) and examined 34,051 participants, namely 17,094 with affective disorders and 16,957 healthy controls. Patients with MDD and BD showed a) significantly decreases in RCT (mainly lowered high-density lipoprotein cholesterol and paraoxonase 1); b) lowered lipid soluble vitamins (including vitamin A, D, and coenzyme Q10); c) increased lipid peroxidation and aldehyde formation, mainly increased malondialdehyde (MDA), 4-hydroxynonenal, peroxides, and 8-isoprostanes; and d) Immunoglobulin (Ig)G responses to oxidized low-density lipoprotein and IgM responses to MDA. The ratio of all lipid peroxidation biomarkers / all lipid-associated antioxidant defenses was significantly increased in MDD (standardized mean difference or SMD=0.433; 95% confidence intervals (CI): 0.312; 0.554) and BD (SMD=0.653; CI: 0.501-0.806). This ratio was significantly greater in BD than MDD (p=0.027).

4

Conclusion: In MDD/BD, lowered RCT, a key antioxidant and anti-inflammatory pathway, may drive increased lipid peroxidation, aldehyde formation, and autoimmune responses to oxidative specific epitopes, which all together cause increased immune-inflammatory responses and neurotoxicity.

Keywords: Oxidative and nitrosative stress, antioxidants, depression, affective disorders, neuro-immune, autoimmunity

5

Introduction

There is now evidence that major depression (MDD) and bipolar disorder (BD) are immune disorders characterized by activation of the immune-inflammatory response system (IRS) and the compensatory immunoregulatory system (CIRS) (Almulla and Maes, 2022; Maes, 1995; Maes and Carvalho, 2018; Maes et al., 2011c; Vasupanrajit et al., 2022). IRS activation in MDD is indicated by increased levels of key cytokines of the M1 macrophage, T-helper (Th)-1, Th-2, Th-17, and T regulatory (Treg) lineages, as well as increased T cell activation markers on peripheral blood mononuclear cells (Maes and Carvalho, 2018; Maes et al., 1992).

Most immune functions are mediated and regulated via redox mechanisms, including the regulatory effects of antioxidant defenses (Morris et al., 2022). Moreover, immune activation is accompanied by increased concentrations of reactive oxygen (ROS) and nitrogen (RNS) species, including superoxide, peroxides, nitric oxide (NO), and peroxynitrite leading to nitro-oxidative damage to lipids, proteins and DNA, which may aggravate immune responses (Maes et al., 2011a; Moylan et al., 2014). Furthermore, lowered levels of antioxidants predispose towards nitro-oxidative stress and inflammatory responses (Maes et al., 2011a). In MDD and BD, activated neuro-oxidative pathways are associated with aberrations in neuro-immune pathways (Maes et al., 2011a; Moylan et al., 2011a; Moylan et al., 2014; Sowa-Kućma et al., 2018).

The first publication on deficits in lipid-associated antioxidant defenses was published in 1994 (Maes et al., 1994), reporting impairments in reverse cholesterol transport (RCT). The latter is a major detoxification pathway which removes free cholesterol from the body, thereby preventing atherogenicity and protecting against lipid

6

peroxidation, oxidation of low (LDL) and high density lipoprotein (HDL) cholesterol and inflammatory responses (Jirakran et al., 2023; Maes et al., 1994; Maes et al., 1997). Deficits in RCT in MDD, as indicated by lowered HDL, apolipoprotein A1 (ApoA) and lecithincholesterol acyltransferase (LCAT) activity, and increased free cholesterol levels (Jirakran et al., 2023; Maes et al., 1994; Maes et al., 1997), may cause increased atherogenicity (Maes et al., 1994), as well as damage to lipids with formation of oxidized LDL (oxLDL) and HDL (oxHDL) and formation of aldehydes, including malondialdehyde (MDA) (Maes et al., 2011e). Moreover, neoepitopes such as oxLDL and MDA are immunogenic and may activate the IRS and cause immunoglobulin (Ig)G and IgA-mediated autoimmune responses (Maes et al., 2011d). Furthermore, MDD is not only accompanied by lowered RCT, HDL, ApoA and LCAT, but also by lowered paraoxonase 1 (PON1) enzyme activity (Moreira et al., 2019b; Moreira et al., 2019a). This is important because PON1 has antioxidant, anti-inflammatory, and antiatherogenic activities (Moreira et al., 2019b; Moreira et al., 2019a). Apo A, LCAT and PON1 are part of the HDL complex and determine the antioxidant capacity of the HDL particles (Jirakran et al., 2023; Moreira et al., 2019b; Moreira et al., 2019a).

High concentrations of ROS/RNS and IRS activation may impact antioxidant defenses for example, by inducing lowered levels of circulating HDL (Feingold and Grunfeld, 2016; Guirgis et al., 2018; Kim et al., 2020), ApoA1 (Guirgis et al., 2018; Smith, 2010; Undurti et al., 2009) and PON1 (Han et al., 2006; Kumon et al., 2003; Moreira et al., 2019b; Moreira et al., 2019a). During inflammatory conditions, increased activity of myeloperoxidase (MPO) may impair PON1 activity and, thus, the antioxidant protection of HDL, which eventually may become pro-inflammatory (Farid and Horii, 2012; Han et

7

al., 2006; Kumon et al., 2003; Morris et al., 2022). As such, MDD is characterized by intertwined aberrations in IRS and lipid peroxidation and lowered lipid-associated antioxidant defenses (Maes et al., 2011b).

Dysfunctions in the HDL-PON1-ApoA-LCAT complex and RCT are considered to be key factors in affective disorders. This is because the Q192R PON1 variant, which controls PON1 activity and the antioxidant properties of the HDL-complex, is strongly linked to MDD and BD (Jirakran et al., 2023; Maes et al., 2011e; Morris et al., 2022). As such, PON1 gene variants, which determine lowered PON1 activity and, thus, lowered activity of the HDL-PON1-ApoA-LCAT complex predispose to increased lipid peroxidation, autoimmune responses, immune activation and increased atherogenicity (Jirakran et al., 2023; Maes et al., 1997). This is important because the HDL-PON1 and HDL-ApoA complexes are strongly associated with the recurrence of illness (ROI) of MDD and BD, suicidal behaviors and severity of depression (Jirakran et al., 2023; Maes et al., 2021; Maes et al., 2019; Moreira et al., 2019b; Moreira et al., 2019a; Vasupanrajit et al., 2022). Moreover, ApoE and ghrelin are endogenous antioxidants that protect against inflammation and take part in the HDL-PON1-ApoA-LCAT complex (Akki et al., 2021; Daniil et al., 2011).

Clinical studies and animal models of depression reported high oxidative products, including biomarkers of lipid peroxidation, such as MDA and 8-iso-prostaglandin F2 (8-iso) (Dimopoulos et al., 2008; Gałecki et al., 2009; Yager et al., 2010). Also, lowered levels of fat-soluble antioxidants (vitamins A, D, E, and K) (Khanzode et al., 2003; Maes et al., 2000b; Owen et al., 2005), and antioxidants that protect against lipid peroxidation, including coenzyme Q10, are frequently observed in MDD and BD (Maes et al., 2009;

8

Morris et al., 2021b). A first meta-analysis study showed that depression is accompanied by increased red-blood cell and serum levels of MDA, peroxides, 8-F2-isoprostanes and decreased levels of antioxidants including PON1 and HDL, and antioxidants that protect against ROS production, including albumin and zinc (Liu et al., 2015; Mazereeuw et al., 2015; Wei et al., 2020). Other meta-analyses showed that BD and MDD are characterized by increased lipid peroxidation and attenuated antioxidant defenses (Black et al., 2015; Brown et al., 2014; Jiménez-Fernández et al., 2021).

Nonetheless, these meta-analyses did not examine the more comprehensive lipid peroxidation profiles, including evaluation of the HDL-PON1-ApoA-LCAT complex (RCT), ghrelin and Apo E, and other lipid-associated antioxidants (LPANTIOX), including (vitamins A, D, E, K and coenzyme Q10; labeled ADEKQ) versus lipid associated oxidative stress toxicity (LPOSTOX), including assessments of lipid hydroperoxides (LOOH), MDA, 8-isoprostane, 4-hydroxynonenal (4-HNE), oxLDL and autoimmune responses to neoepitopes including MDA and oxLDL (LPAUTO). We also aimed to examine the LPOSTOX + LPAUTO / ADECKQ + RCT (together labeled LPANTIOX) ratio to examine the net effect of detrimental versus protective redox-related factors in MDD/BD as well as difference between MDD and BD.

Materials and method

We adhered to various methodological guidelines to conduct the current study, namely Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) 2020 (Page et al., 2021), Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews and Interventions (Cumpston et al., 2019), and the Meta-Analyses of Observational Studies in Epidemiology

9

(MOOSE). We recruited MDD and BD patients in the current meta-analysis to examine LPOSTOX peripheral levels biomarkers, LOOH. central and of namelv MDA/Thiobarbituric acid reactive substances (TBARS), 4-HNE, isoprostanes; LPAUTO biomarkers including IgM/IgG responses to neoepitopes including MDA, and oxLDL, RCT biomarkers, including (HDL, PON1, LCAT, ApoA), and ADEKQ vitamins, including CoQ10). Consequently, based on the aforementioned and other biomarkers (see below), we computed composites reflecting LPOSTOX, LPAUTO, RCT, ADECO, and LPANTIOX.

Search strategy

To gather all relevant data on the biomarkers, we searched electronic databases PubMed/MEDLINE, Google Scholar, and SciFinder using prespecified keywords and Mesh terms outlined in Table 1 of the supplementary electronic file (ESF), from September to January 10th, 2023. Additionally, we inspected the reference lists of eligible studies and preceding meta-analyses to ensure no pertinent studies were missed.

Eligibility criteria

The main criteria for including articles in this meta-analysis were that they were published in peer-reviewed journals and written in English. Nevertheless, the study also took into consideration grey literature and articles written in various languages, including Thai, French, Spanish, Turkish, German, Italian, and Arabic. Furthermore, inclusion criteria were observational case-control and cohort studies, which include controls and assessed lipid peroxidation and lipid antioxidant biomarkers. The MDD and BD patients

10

should have been diagnosed according to the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (DSM) or International Classification of Diseases (ICD). Follow up studies could be included provided that baseline levels of the biomarkers were assessed. Exclusion criteria were: a) animal-based, genotypic and translational studies, b) studies without a control group, c) studies with uncommon media, namely saliva, hair, whole blood, and platelet-rich plasma, d) papers that did not provide the mean and standard deviation (SD) or standard error (SE) values of the evaluated biomarkers. However, we sent emails to the authors of studies lacking mean (SD) or (SE) values and asked the authors to provide mean and SD values. In case of no response, we computed the mean (SD) values from the median (interquartile, IQR or minimum-maximum, min-mix range) based on the approach proposed by Wan et al (Wan et al., 2014) and estimated the mean (SD) of graphical data utilizing the Web Plot Digitizer (https://automeris.io/WebPlotDigitizer/).

Primary and secondary outcomes

The primary outcomes of the present meta-analysis are the RCT, ADECQ, LPANTIOX, LPOSTOX, and LPAUTO biomarker profiles as shown in **Table 1**. Subsequently, if these composites were significant, we also examined their single indicators.

Screening and data extraction

Two authors, AA and YT, carried out a preliminary evaluation of the relevant studies for inclusion in the meta-analysis. This evaluation was performed by reviewing the titles and abstracts of the studies and applying the predetermined inclusion criteria.

11

Subsequently, we obtained full texts of the papers that met our inclusion criteria and disregarded those that did meet our exclusion criteria. The same two authors employed a pre-specified excel file that included data like author names, study dates, biomarker names, mean and SD of the biomarkers, number of patients and control groups, study sample sizes. Furthermore, we also included the study design, type of sample (serum, plasma, CSF, brain tissues, blood cells), psychiatric rating scales used, mean (SD) of participants' ages, sex and location of the study. The authors double-checked the file and resorted to the last author (MM) in case of discrepancies.

Additionally, the quality of the methodology of the included studies was assessed utilizing the Immunological Confounder Scale (ICS) (Andres-Rodriguez et al., 2020). The ICS was adjusted by the last author (MM) to make it in line with lipid peroxidation studies. The ICS comprises two evaluation scales, namely the Quality Scale and the Redpoints Scale, which are outlined in Table 2 of the ESF. These scales were used in previous metaanalysis to gauge the methodological rigor of the publications that examined the immune and tryptophan catabolite data in individuals with affective disorders (Almulla et al., 2022b; Almulla et al., 2022c; Vasupanrajit et al., 2022). The Quality Scale score ranges from 0 to 10, where 0 represents lower quality and 10 indicates better quality. The scale mainly evaluates factors such as sample size, control of confounding variables and sampling duration. The redpoints scale is primarily designed to detect potential bias in the lipid peroxidation results and research designs by assessing the level of control over critical confounding factors. When the overall score was 0, it indicates that the highest level of control was maintained. Conversely, a score of 26 indicates that there was no control for the confounding variables.

Data analysis

We employed CMA V4 software while following PRISMA guidelines (see ESF, Table 3) to conduct the current meta-analysis, which required a minimum of two studies on each determined biomarker. LPOXTOX was computed by assuming dependence and including all relevant biomarkers in the CMA (MDA, TBARS, isoprostanes, 4-HNE, oxidized LDL, peroxide, LOOH, hydroxy and keto cholesterol, Apo B). LPAUTO included IgG responses to oxLDL and IgM responses to neoepitopes, including MDA. Likewise, we computed RCT by including PON1, LCAT, HDL and ApoA, ApoE and ghrelin, ADEKQ including vitamin A, D, E and K, and CoQ10, and LPANTIOX (RCT and ADECK). Furthermore, in the present meta-analysis, we also computed (LPOSTOX + LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX ratio by selecting a positive effect size for all LPOSTOX and LPAUTO data and a negative effect size for all LPANTIOX biomarkers in patients versus healthy controls while assuming dependence. We employed a random-effect model with constrained maximum likelihood to pool the effect sizes. Statistical significance was defined as a twotailed p-value less than 0.05, and effect sizes are reported as the standardized mean difference (SMD) with 95% confidence intervals (95% CI). SMD of 0.80, 0.5, and 0.20 were used to classify the effect size as large, moderate, or small, respectively (Cohen, 2013). We assessed heterogeneity by computing tau-squared statistics besides the Q and I^2 values as previously used in meta-analyses (Almulla et al., 2022a; Almulla et al., 2022d; Vasupanrajit et al., 2022). In addition, we used meta-regression to delineate the factors contributing to the observed heterogeneity. The divergences in biomarkers among MDD and BD patients and between various media types, brain tissues and cerebrospinal fluid

13

(CSF), serum, plasma and blood cells, were examined by subgroup analysis with each of the determinants being used as a unit of analysis. CSF and brain tissues were grouped together under the central nervous system (CNS) category due to the absence of statistically significant differences between studies measuring the biomarkers in these compartments. Likewise, we combined the studies of MDD and BD that measured lipid peroxides and antioxidants; however, we present the effect sizes of MDD and BD separately when there was a significant difference.

To evaluate the stability of effect sizes, we performed sensitivity analyses using the leave-one-out method. We examined the presence of publication bias by utilizing the failsafe N technique, the continuity-corrected Kendall tau, and the Egger's regression intercept, with one-tailed p-values being used for the latter two methods. The trim-and-fill approach was used to impute the missing studies in case of an asymmetry indicated by Egger's test; and adjusted effect sizes were computed. We also utilized funnel plots (study precision vs SMD), which simultaneously display observed and imputed missing values, to identify small study effects.

Results

Search results

In the initial search process, we found 56157 studies based on our predefined particular keywords and Mesh terms (see ESF, Table 1). The PRISMA flow chart in **Figure 1** illustrates the search results, including the total number of included and excluded articles. Nevertheless, 55136 articles were excluded after the results had been refined and irrelevant studies were removed. The current systematic review involved 169 studies, as 852 articles

14

were removed due to our inclusion-exclusion criteria. Moreover, 6 studies were eliminated due to reasons mentioned in ESF Table 4. As a consequence, 163 studies were eligible based on inclusion-exclusion criteria and entered in the present meta-analysis (see ESF, Eligible studies).

Furthermore, fourteen of the included articles examined lipid peroxidation biomarkers in two cohorts of patients, MDD and BD, within the same research and 1 study examined central and peripheral biomarkers. Consequently, the overall effect size in the current meta-analysis was pooled from 176 studies (60 BD and 116 MDD). We employed totally 34051 participants, namely 17094 affective disorder patients and 16957 healthy controls. The age ranged from 26 – 65 years. Several techniques were employed to assess the biomarkers examined in the current meta-analysis with ELISA; spectrophotometric and automated analysis being the most used techniques (ESF, Table 5). Turkey and Brazil have contributed the most to the eligible research, with 38 and 21 publications, respectively, while numerous other countries have contributed between 1 and 9 studies. In the present meta-analysis, the quality and redpoint scores expressed as median (min-max) were computed, and the findings are given in ESF, table 5.

Primary outcome variables

RCT profile

Table 1 shows that our meta-analysis comprises 55 studies that were analyzed to investigate the composite score of RCT. Of these studies, 18 displayed confidence intervals (CIs) that were entirely below zero, while 5 had CIs that was entirely above zero. In addition, 32 studies demonstrated overlapping CIs, and the SMD values were negative in

15

19 studies and positive in 13, as shown in Table 1. The forest plot in **Figure 2** depicts that MDD and BD patients exhibit significantly reduced RCT levels (effect size of -0.286) compared to healthy controls. Publication bias analysis revealed 11 studies missing to the left of the funnel plot. Imputing these studies led to a change in the SMD value, which became -0.481.

ADECQ profile (lipid soluble vitamins and Coenzyme Q10)

In the present meta-analysis, we incorporated 27 relevant studies to investigate the ADECQ index in MDD and BD patients. **Table 1** illustrates that out of these studies, 16 had CIs that were entirely negative, while only one study had a CI that was entirely positive. Furthermore, zero-overlapping CIs were observed in 10 studies, and among them, the SMD values were less than zero in 6 studies and greater than zero in 4 studies. **Table 2** and **Figure 3** indicate that MDD and BD patients display a significant decrease with a moderate effect size (-0.533) in the ADECQ profile. **Table 3** demonstrates that no bias was detected.

LPANTIOX profile

The present study investigated the LPANTIOX composite score by integrating data from 99 studies. **Table 1** demonstrate that 39 studies yielded CIs that were smaller than zero, whereas 15 studies yielded CIs that were greater than zero. **Table 2** and **Figure 4** reveal that patients with MDD and BD, as compared to healthy controls, exhibit significantly reduced lipid-associated antioxidant defenses, as indicated by a lowered LPANTIOX composite score (SMD = -0.270). Egger's and Kendall's tests revealed a

16

significant bias, with 15 studies missing on the left side of the funnel plot. After adjusting the SMD value for these studies, the effect size became -0.478.

LPOSTOX profile

In the present meta-analysis, we included 93 LPOSTOX studies. **Table 1** indicates that only 4 studies showed complete CIs on the negative side of zero, while 55 studies exhibited entire CIs on the positive side of zero. Additionally, zero-overlapping CIs were observed in 32 studies, and the SMD values were positive in 21 and negative in 11 studies. The forest plot displayed in **Figure 5** demonstrates a significantly increased LPOSTOX with large effect size (0.731) both in MDD and BD patients as compared with healthy controls. Table 3 reveals significant bias, as 18 studies were missing on the right side of the funnel plot. These missing studies were imputed, resulting in an even larger estimated effect size (0.987).

LPAUTO profile

The LPAUTO composite score, reflecting autoimmune responses against neoepitopes, was examined by combining 7 studies. The entire CIs of all studies appeared on the positive side of zero as shown in Table 1. Table 2 and **Figure 6** indicate that MDD and BD patients exhibit a significantly elevated LPAUTO index with high effect size (0.904). Table 3 demonstrated the absence of any apparent bias in the results.

(LPOSTOX+LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX ratio

17

The present study has examined the (LPOSTOX+LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX ratio from 176 relevant studies. Of these studies, the entire CIs of 16 studies were negative, while it was completely positive in 89 studies. Furthermore, 71 studies exhibit a zerointersection, and 27 studies had SMD values less than zero, while 44 studies had greater than zero SMD values. The group analysis showed a significant difference (p=0.027) in the (LPOSTOX+LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX ratio between patients with MDD and BD. However, Table 2 indicated that both MDD and BD patients demonstrated a significant increase in the former ratio, yet the effect size was greater in BD patients than in MDD patients. Table 3 revealed that in BD, there were 8 missing studies on the right side of the funnel plot and imputing these studies increases the estimated effects size (0.821). On the other hand, in MDD, there were 24 missing studies on the left side of the funnel plot, and adjusting the effect size to include these studies would reduce it to 0.141 (with 95% CI of 0.007; 0.274).

ESF, Tables 6-8 show the outcomes of the meta-analyses performed on the single indicators of the different indices used in the current study. ESF, Figures 1-8 show the forest plots of 8 solitary indicators. ESF, Listing show the list of all eligible studies.

Meta-regression analyses

Meta-regression analyses were conducted to identify the single indicators that contribute to the heterogeneity observed in studies on lipid peroxidation and antioxidant defenses. The findings, as presented in ESF, Table 9, reveal that BD versus MDD exert a significant influence on several variables including ghrelin, 4-HNE, MDA, and the (LPOSTOX+LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX ratio. The latter, MDA and LPOSTOX were

18

substantially affected by Young Mania Rating Scale (YMRS) scores. Moreover, latitude was identified as one of the most significant factors influencing RCT, HDL, LPANTIOX, and peroxides. On the other hand, body mass index significantly impacted vitamin E, MDA, and peroxides. Additionally, other factors such as age, gender, duration of illness, and age of onset demonstrate varying effects on different variables, all of which are presented in ESF, Table 9.

Discussion

This is the first large-scale meta-analysis providing strong evidence for the role of RCT, lipid-associated antioxidant systems, lipid peroxidation, and autoimmunity to oxidative specific epitopes in the pathophysiology of MDD and BD. In fact, the current meta-analysis is the first to examine autoimmunity against oxidatively modified neoepitopes and all relevant RCT indicators.

Reduced RCT in MDD and BD patients

The first major finding of the current meta-analysis is that MDD and BD are characterized by significantly reduced RCT as determined by HDL, PON1, Apo A and LCAT activity. The RCT pathway is a key antioxidant pathway that protects against atherogenicity, lipid peroxidation, inflammation and elevated bacterial load (Jirakran et al., 2023). Our results are in agreement with a recent pre-publication showing decreased RCT in MDD and suicidal behaviors (Jirakran et al., 2023). Maes et al. published the first study showing that MDD is accompanied by lowered RCT and elevated atherogenicity, as indicated by a reduced HDL/total cholesterol ratio (Maes et al., 1994). Further research

19

also detected increased levels of atherogenic biomarkers in MDD patients (Bortolasci et al., 2015; Morelli et al., 2021; Nunes et al., 2015). Elevated atherogenicity coupled with oxidative and inflammatory mechanisms may explain, at least in part, the cooccurrence of MDD, atherosclerosis, and cardiovascular diseases (Maes et al., 2011e).

Reduced vitamins A and D and coenzyme Q10 in MDD and BD.

The second major finding of the current meta-analysis is that patients with MDD and BD have significantly decreased levels of lipid-soluble vitamins and coenzyme Q10. The analysis of the solitary components of this composite indicate a significant decrease of vitamin A and D, but not E, while there are no studies concerning vitamin K and only one study on CoQ10. Previous meta-analyses also detected lowered levels of some selected lipid-soluble vitamins. In this regard, Anglin et al. reported decreased vitamin D levels in MDD (Anglin et al., 2013), and Liu et al. found no significant changes in vitamin E (Liu et al., 2015). Nevertheless, not one of the prior meta-analysis has covered all lipid-soluble vitamins in MDD and BD patients. Thus, the current study provides the first proof that not only RCT-related antioxidant defenses but also the lipid-soluble vitamins and coenzyme Q10 are lowered in affective disorders.

So, one of the most important things we learned from our study is that both MDD and BD are linked to a weakening of the antioxidant defense system associated with lipids, and that there are no major differences between MDD and BD in terms of lipid antioxidants except for the levels of ghrelin.

Increased lipid peroxidation in MDD and BD

20

The third major finding of the present study is that MDD and BD are characterized by an overall increase in oxidative damage to lipids, as reflected by the elevated LPOSTOX index. MDA, 4-HNE, and isoprostanes were the most essential lipid-associated peroxidation biomarkers. Intriguingly, the effect size of MDA was significantly greater in BD than in MDD. Nevertheless, there were no significant changes in LOOH, Apo B, or oxLDL in affective disorders, whilst other biomarkers, such as 7-ketocholesterol and hydroxycholesterol, could not be individually examined since they were assessed in one study only.

Our LPOSTOX results extend those of previous studies (Black et al., 2015; Brown et al., 2014; Jiménez-Fernández et al., 2021, 2022; Liu et al., 2015; Mazereeuw et al., 2015). Nevertheless, the analysis of Liu, Zhong et al. (2015) was based mainly on a Chinese population, that may have restricted the generalizability of the results since there are ethnical differences in oxidative stress responses (Morris, Zhao et al. 2012). Moreover, all previous meta-analyses were performed on solitary biomarkers rather than examining the more important overall effect of lipid peroxidation as assessed by combining all relevant biomarkers.

Increased autoimmune responses to oxidative specific epitopes

The fourth major finding of the present study is that affective disorders are accompanied by increased autoimmune responses against neoepitopes generated by oxidative stress. These findings indicate increased oxidative stress, lipid peroxidation, damage to LDL, aldehyde formation, and an autoimmune response directed to the oxidatively modified epitopes namely oxLDL and MDA (Maes et al., 2013a; Maes et al.,

21

2013b; Simeonova et al., 2021b; Simeonova et al., 2020a). The latter neoepitopes have proinflammatory effects, and are additionally immunogenic, thereby mounting autoimmune responses (Maes et al., 2013b). Moreover, these oxidative-specific epitopes in MDD and BD may act as damage-associated molecular patterns, which activate the Toll-Like Receptor (TLR)–Radical Cycle, thereby provoking and maintaining immune-inflammatory responses (Lucas and Maes, 2013).

All in all, affective disorders are accompanied by increased lipid peroxidation and autoimmune response and decreased lipid antioxidant defenses, as indicated by the (LPOSTOX + LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX ratio. Interestingly, the degree of lipid peroxidation may be somewhat higher in BD than MDD.

Consequences for the immune-inflammatory theory of MDD/BD

A decreased RCT is a key factor in MDD and BD because this condition increases the vulnerability to developing lipid peroxidation, oxidative damage of lipids, and, therefore, autoimmunity to oxidative specific epitopes, inflammation and increased atherogenicity (Marchio et al., 2019; Morris et al., 2021b). The PON1 Q192R polymorphism determines in part PON1 activity and, therefore, plays a key role in oxidative and inflammatory stress in MDD/BD (Bortolasci et al., 2014). HDL, PON1 and ApoA tightly regulate immune responses (Morris et al., 2021a; Morris et al., 2020a; Morris et al., 2019; Morris et al., 2020b; Morris et al., 2021c): a) HDL inhibits NF-κB activity, promotes dendritic cell maturation and antigen presentation to T cells, b) lowers TLR-4 activation by removing cholesterol from membrane lipid rafts; c) HDL affects the complement system, chemotaxis of monocytes and macrophages, and the activation of T

22

cells and B cells; and d) HDL has a key role in reducing inflammation and suppressing the immune system by degrading membrane lipid rafts and activating pentraxin 3, a molecule that plays a fundamental role in the immune response (Morris et al., 2022). PON1 protects against oxidative damage to immune cell membranes, oxidized lipoproteins, and mitochondria, upregulates glucose transporter-1 (GLUT-1), and regulates aerobic glycolysis, the pentose monophosphate pathway, fatty acid oxidation, and peroxisome proliferator-activated receptor gamma (PPAR- γ) activity (Morris et al., 2021a; Morris et al., 2020a). ApoA1 regulates the Th-17/Treg balance, enhances mitochondrial functions, activates the electron transport chain and stabilizes PON1 in HDL to preserve its activity (Morris et al., 2022).

Vitamins A and E serve as antioxidants in cell membranes and lipoproteins by inhibiting ROS and neutralizing free radicals (Burton et al., 1983; Palace et al., 1999; Popa et al., 2021). While vitamin D may not scavenge free radicals like vitamins E and C, it upregulates the master antioxidant gene, Nrf2, and antioxidant enzymes such as glutathione peroxidase, which both protect against oxidative damage (Boaventura and Cembranel, 2020; Wimalawansa, 2019). In addition, vitamin D promotes an energy-conserving state within mitochondria by stimulating processes such as fusion, mitophagy, and biogenesis, which in turn may renew mitochondria, maintain energy metabolism, and reduce oxidative stress (Bhutia, 2022; Sheeley et al., 2022). Coenzyme Q10 is known for its potent antioxidant, anti-inflammatory and neuroprotective properties (Maes et al., 2009; Morris et al., 2013). Moreover, Coenzyme Q10 lowers NF- κ B-gene expression and the production of pro-inflammatory cytokines, such as tumor necrosis factor (TNF)- α , and protects against lipopolysaccharide (LPS)-induced inflammatory responses (Abd El-Gawad and Khalifa,

23

2001; Schmelzer et al., 2008; Schmelzer et al., 2007a; Schmelzer et al., 2007b; Sugino et al., 1987).

Oxidative stress, including lipid peroxidation, augments inflammatory processes by activating redox-sensitive transcription factors, like NF- κ B, causing expression of proinflammatory genes and the release of inflammatory signaling molecules (Kabe et al., 2005; Morris et al., 2022). In this respect, some studies established activated NF- κ B in MDD and BD (Miklowitz et al., 2016; Roman et al., 2021). Furthermore, the nucleotidebinding domain, leucine-rich–containing family, pyrin domain–containing-3 (NLRP3) inflammasome, a key molecule in initiating innate immunity, is also activated by oxidative stress pathways (Morris and Maes, 2014; Zhou et al., 2011). Increased lipid peroxidation also causes depletion of ω 3-polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA) in plasma cholesteryl esters and phospholipids, which in turn increases the production of pro-inflammatory cytokines, especially in response to psychological stressors (Maes et al., 2000a; Maes et al., 1999).

Increased oxidative stress may cause damage to enzymes of the electron transport chain, structural and functional phospholipids, including cardiolipin (Kakkar and Singh, 2007; Morris and Maes, 2014; Paradies et al., 2011; Pope et al., 2008; Turrens, 2003). Furthermore, lipid peroxidation products, such as MDA, are neurotoxic by altering mitochondrial proteins resulting in mitochondrial dysfunction within the neurons and, hence, and inducing impairments in energy production (Long et al., 2009), which have been reported in mood disorders (Caruso et al., 2019). The resulting aberrations in ATP generation may further accelerate ROS production, thereby establishing a self-sustaining cycle of increasing neurotoxicity (Kakkar and Singh, 2007; Morris and Maes, 2014;

24

Turrens, 2003). Due to a high need for oxygen and high levels of PUFAs, brain cells are more likely to be damaged by the neurotoxic effects of lipid peroxidation. This makes neuronal cells highly vulnerable to oxidative stress-induced neurotoxicity and neurodegeneration (Syafrita et al., 2020).

Our results suggest that novel treatments of affective disorders should target the intertwined aberrations in oxidative and immune-inflammatory pathways. Some available antidepressants show a potential to lower oxidative stress (Maes et al., 2012). For example, Ahmadimanesh et al. found that selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors (SSRIs) significantly decreased DNA damage by reducing 8-hydroxy-2-deoxyguanosine (8-OHdG) and IL-6 (Ahmadimanesh et al., 2019). Furthermore, Kotan et al., in a longitudinal study, found that antidepressant treatments significantly decrease plasma MDA and increase PON1 activities (Kotan et al., 2011).

Limitation

When evaluating the results of this research, it is important to take into account a number of limitations. Higher heterogeneity caused by some identified input variables may have affected the precision and accuracy of the pooled effect estimates. Latitude was one of the primary drivers of this increased variability, and we identified a substantial negative relationship between latitude and RCT, HDL, and LPANTIOX, and a positive relationship with peroxides. Second, the limited studies regarding lipid peroxidation biomarkers in the brain and CSF restrict our ability to complete the profile of central lipid peroxidation. However, our group analysis showed no significant difference between central and peripheral LPOSTOX composite scores. Therefore, more post-mortem and CSF studies are

25

needed to examine the status of central lipid peroxidation and antioxidant biomarkers. Third, the absence of data on vitamin K in MDD and BD, and the paucity of studies on Coenzyme Q10 limit our ability to construct a thorough lipid-soluble vitamin (ADEKQ) profile and conduct separate meta-analyses. Fourth, the limited information regarding metabolic syndrome, which impacts HDL, ApoA, PON1 and some lipid peroxidation biomarkers, prevented us to examine the effects of metabolic syndrome (Jirakran et al., 2023). Fifth, given that most studies did not disclose data about antidepressant and mood stabilizer usage, we were unable to investigate their impact on lipid peroxidation biomarkers. Thus, more studies are required on drug-naïve versus treated MDD and BD patients.

Conclusions

The present large-scale meta-analysis shows that patients with MDD and BD have a decreased RCT and other lipid-associated antioxidant defenses coupled with higher oxidative damage to lipids, and greater IgG and IgM-mediated autoimmune responses to oxidatively modified neoepitopes. **Figure 7** summarizes the importance of increased lipid peroxidation and decreased lipid-associated antioxidant defenses for the enhanced inflammatory and autoimmune responses in MDD/BD. Hence, targeting these pathways is crucial for the treatment of MDD and BD.

Declaration of Competing Interests

The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

Ethical approval and consent to participate

Not applicable.

Consent for publication

Not applicable.

Availability of data and materials

The last author (MM) will respond to any reasonable requests for the dataset utilized in the present meta-analysis, following its full exploitation by all authors. This dataset will be provided in Excel file format.

Funding

The study was funded by the C2F program, Chulalongkorn University, Thailand, No. 64.310/436/2565 to AFA, and an FF66 grant and a Sompoch Endowment Fund (Faculty of Medicine), MDCU (RA66/016) to MM.

Author's contributions

The design of the current study is performed by AA and MM. AA and YT collected the data. AA and MM conducted the statistical analysis. All authors participated in the writing and revision of the manuscript and have approved the submission of the final draft.

Acknowledgments

Not applicable.

27

References

Abd El-Gawad, H.M., Khalifa, A.E., 2001. Quercetin, coenzyme Q10, and L-canavanine as protective agents against lipid peroxidation and nitric oxide generation in endotoxininduced shock in rat brain. Pharmacol Res 43, 257-263.

Ahmadimanesh, M., Abbaszadegan, M.R., Morshedi Rad, D., Moallem, S.A., Mohammadpour, A.H., Ghahremani, M.H., Farid Hosseini, F., Behdani, F., Akhondpour Manteghi, A., Jowsey, P., Shabani Behbahani, F., Moallem, S.M.H., Etemad, L., 2019. Effects of selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors on DNA damage in patients with depression. Journal of Psychopharmacology 33, 1364-1376.

Akki, R., Raghay, K., Errami, M., 2021. Potentiality of ghrelin as antioxidant and protective agent. Redox Rep 26, 71-79.

Almulla, A.F., Maes, M., 2022. The Tryptophan Catabolite or Kynurenine Pathway's Role in Major Depression. Curr Top Med Chem 22, 1731-1735.

Almulla, A.F., Supasitthumrong, T., Tunvirachaisakul, C., Algon, A.A.A., Al-Hakeim, H.K., Maes, M., 2022a. The tryptophan catabolite or kynurenine pathway in COVID-19 and critical COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. BMC Infectious Diseases 22, 615.

Almulla, A.F., Thipakorn, Y., Vasupanrajit, A., Abo Algon, A.A., Tunvirachaisakul, C., Hashim Aljanabi, A.A., Oxenkrug, G., Al-Hakeim, H.K., Maes, M., 2022b. The tryptophan catabolite or kynurenine pathway in major depressive and bipolar disorder: A systematic review and meta-analysis. Brain, Behavior, & Immunity - Health 26, 100537.

Almulla, A.F., Thipakorn, Y., Vasupanrajit, A., Tunvirachaisakul, C., Oxenkrug, G., Al-Hakeim, H.K., Maes, M., 2022c. The Tryptophan Catabolite or Kynurenine Pathway in a

Major Depressive Episode with Melancholia, Psychotic Features and Suicidal Behaviors: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. Cells.

Almulla, A.F., Vasupanrajit, A., Tunvirachaisakul, C., Al-Hakeim, H.K., Solmi, M., Verkerk, R., Maes, M., 2022d. The tryptophan catabolite or kynurenine pathway in schizophrenia: meta-analysis reveals dissociations between central, serum, and plasma compartments. Molecular Psychiatry 27, 3679-3691.

Andres-Rodriguez, L., Borras, X., Feliu-Soler, A., Perez-Aranda, A., Angarita-Osorio, N.,

Moreno-Peral, P., Montero-Marin, J., Garcia-Campayo, J., Carvalho, A.F., Maes, M., 2020. Peripheral immune aberrations in fibromyalgia: A systematic review, meta-analysis and meta-regression. Brain, behavior, and immunity 87, 881-889.

Anglin, R.E.S., Samaan, Z., Walter, S.D., McDonald, S.D., 2013. Vitamin D deficiency and depression in adults: systematic review and meta-analysis. The British Journal of Psychiatry 202, 100-107.

Bhutia, S.K., 2022. Vitamin D in autophagy signaling for health and diseases: Insights on potential mechanisms and future perspectives. The Journal of Nutritional Biochemistry 99, 108841.

Black, C.N., Bot, M., Scheffer, P.G., Cuijpers, P., Penninx, B.W.J.H., 2015. Is depression associated with increased oxidative stress? A systematic review and meta-analysis. Psychoneuroendocrinology 51, 164-175.

Boaventura, B.C.B., Cembranel, F., 2020. Protective effect of vitamin D on oxidative stress in elderly people. Aging. Elsevier, pp. 337-343.

Bortolasci, C.C., Vargas, H.O., Souza-Nogueira, A., Barbosa, D.S., Moreira, E.G., Nunes, S.O.V., Berk, M., Dodd, S., Maes, M., 2014. Lowered plasma paraoxonase (PON) 1

activity is a trait marker of major depression and PON1 Q192R gene polymorphism– smoking interactions differentially predict the odds of major depression and bipolar disorder. Journal of affective disorders 159, 23-30.

Bortolasci, C.C., Vargas, H.O., Vargas Nunes, S.O., de Melo, L.G.P., de Castro, M.R.P., Moreira, E.G., Dodd, S., Barbosa, D.S., Berk, M., Maes, M., 2015. Factors influencing insulin resistance in relation to atherogenicity in mood disorders, the metabolic syndrome and tobacco use disorder. Journal of Affective Disorders 179, 148-155.

Brown, N.C., Andreazza, A.C., Young, L.T., 2014. An updated meta-analysis of oxidative stress markers in bipolar disorder. Psychiatry Research 218, 61-68.

Burton, G.W., Joyce, A., Ingold, K.U., 1983. Is vitamin E the only lipid-soluble, chainbreaking antioxidant in human blood plasma and erythrocyte membranes? Arch Biochem Biophys 221, 281-290.

Caruso, G., Benatti, C., Blom, J.M.C., Caraci, F., Tascedda, F., 2019. The Many Faces of Mitochondrial Dysfunction in Depression: From Pathology to Treatment. Front Pharmacol 10, 995.

Cohen, J., 2013. Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences. Routledge.

Cumpston, M., Li, T., Page, M.J., Chandler, J., Welch, V.A., Higgins, J.P., Thomas, J., 2019. Updated guidance for trusted systematic reviews: a new edition of the Cochrane Handbook for Systematic Reviews of Interventions. Cochrane Database Syst Rev 10, 14651858.

Daniil, G., Phedonos, A.A., Holleboom, A.G., Motazacker, M.M., Argyri, L., Kuivenhoven, J.A., Chroni, A., 2011. Characterization of antioxidant/anti-inflammatory

30

properties and apoA-I-containing subpopulations of HDL from family subjects with monogenic low HDL disorders. Clin Chim Acta 412, 1213-1220.

Dimopoulos, N., Piperi, C., Psarra, V., Lea, R.W., Kalofoutis, A., 2008. Increased plasma levels of 8-iso-PGF2alpha and IL-6 in an elderly population with depression. Psychiatry Res 161, 59-66.

Farid, A.S., Horii, Y., 2012. Modulation of paraoxonases during infectious diseases and its potential impact on atherosclerosis. Lipids Health Dis 11, 92.

Feingold, K.R., Grunfeld, C., 2016. Effect of inflammation on HDL structure and function. Curr Opin Lipidol 27, 521-530.

Gałecki, P., Szemraj, J., Bieńkiewicz, M., Florkowski, A., Gałecka, E., 2009. Lipid peroxidation and antioxidant protection in patients during acute depressive episodes and in remission after fluoxetine treatment. Pharmacol Rep 61, 436-447.

Guirgis, F.W., Dodani, S., Leeuwenburgh, C., Moldawer, L., Bowman, J., Kalynych, C., Grijalva, V., Reddy, S.T., Jones, A.E., Moore, F.A., 2018. HDL inflammatory index correlates with and predicts severity of organ failure in patients with sepsis and septic shock. PLoS One 13, e0203813.

Han, C.Y., Chiba, T., Campbell, J.S., Fausto, N., Chaisson, M., Orasanu, G., Plutzky, J., Chait, A., 2006. Reciprocal and coordinate regulation of serum amyloid A versus apolipoprotein A-I and paraoxonase-1 by inflammation in murine hepatocytes. Arterioscler Thromb Vasc Biol 26, 1806-1813.

Jiménez-Fernández, S., Gurpegui, M., Garrote-Rojas, D., Gutiérrez-Rojas, L., Carretero, M.D., Correll, C.U., 2021. Oxidative stress parameters and antioxidants in patients with

31

bipolar disorder: Results from a meta-analysis comparing patients, including stratification by polarity and euthymic status, with healthy controls. Bipolar Disorders 23, 117-129. Jiménez-Fernández, S., Gurpegui, M., Garrote-Rojas, D., Gutiérrez-Rojas, L., Carretero, M.D., Correll, C.U., 2022. Oxidative stress parameters and antioxidants in adults with unipolar or bipolar depression versus healthy controls: Systematic review and metaanalysis. Journal of Affective Disorders 314, 211-221.

Jirakran, K., Vasupanrajit, A., Tunvirachaisakul, C., Kubera, M., Maes, M., 2023. Major depression, suicidal behaviors and neuroticism are pro-atherogenic states driven by lowered reverse cholesterol transport. medRxiv, 2023.2002.2010.23285746.

Kabe, Y., Ando, K., Hirao, S., Yoshida, M., Handa, H., 2005. Redox Regulation of NF-κB Activation: Distinct Redox Regulation Between the Cytoplasm and the Nucleus. Antioxidants & Redox Signaling 7, 395-403.

Kakkar, P., Singh, B.K., 2007. Mitochondria: a hub of redox activities and cellular distress control. Mol Cell Biochem 305, 235-253.

Khanzode, S.D., Dakhale, G.N., Khanzode, S.S., Saoji, A., Palasodkar, R., 2003. Oxidative damage and major depression: the potential antioxidant action of selective serotonin reuptake inhibitors. Redox report 8, 365-370.

Kim, S.Y., Yu, M., Morin, E.E., Kang, J., Kaplan, M.J., Schwendeman, A., 2020. High-Density Lipoprotein in Lupus: Disease Biomarkers and Potential Therapeutic Strategy. Arthritis Rheumatol 72, 20-30.

Kotan, V.O., Sarandol, E., Kirhan, E., Ozkaya, G., Kirli, S., 2011. Effects of long-term antidepressant treatment on oxidative status in major depressive disorder: a 24-week follow-up study. Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry 35, 1284-1290.

32

Kumon, Y., Suehiro, T., Ikeda, Y., Hashimoto, K., 2003. Human paraoxonase-1 gene expression by HepG2 cells is downregulated by interleukin-1beta and tumor necrosis factor-alpha, but is upregulated by interleukin-6. Life Sci 73, 2807-2815.

Liu, T., Zhong, S., Liao, X., Chen, J., He, T., Lai, S., Jia, Y., 2015. A Meta-Analysis of Oxidative Stress Markers in Depression. PLoS One 10, e0138904.

Long, J., Liu, C., Sun, L., Gao, H., Liu, J., 2009. Neuronal mitochondrial toxicity of malondialdehyde: inhibitory effects on respiratory function and enzyme activities in rat brain mitochondria. Neurochem Res 34, 786-794.

Lucas, K., Maes, M., 2013. Role of the Toll Like receptor (TLR) radical cycle in chronic inflammation: possible treatments targeting the TLR4 pathway. Mol Neurobiol 48, 190-204.

Maes, M., 1995. Evidence for an immune response in major depression: A review and hypothesis. Progress in Neuro-Psychopharmacology and Biological Psychiatry 19, 11-38. Maes, M., Carvalho, A.F., 2018. The Compensatory Immune-Regulatory Reflex System (CIRS) in Depression and Bipolar Disorder. Mol Neurobiol 55, 8885-8903.

Maes, M., Christophe, A., Bosmans, E., Lin, A., Neels, H., 2000a. In humans, serum polyunsaturated fatty acid levels predict the response of proinflammatory cytokines to psychologic stress. Biol Psychiatry 47, 910-920.

Maes, M., Christophe, A., Delanghe, J., Altamura, C., Neels, H., Meltzer, H.Y., 1999. Lowered ω 3 polyunsaturated fatty acids in serum phospholipids and cholesteryl esters of depressed patients. Psychiatry Research 85, 275-291.

33

Maes, M., De Vos, N., Pioli, R., Demedts, P., Wauters, A., Neels, H., Christophe, A., 2000b. Lower serum vitamin E concentrations in major depression. Another marker of lowered antioxidant defenses in that illness. J Affect Disord 58, 241-246.

Maes, M., Delanghe, J., Meltzer, H.Y., Scharpé, S., D'Hondt, P., Cosyns, P., 1994. Lower degree of esterification of serum cholesterol in depression: relevance for depression and suicide research. Acta Psychiatr Scand 90, 252-258.

Maes, M., Fišar, Z., Medina, M., Scapagnini, G., Nowak, G., Berk, M., 2012. New drug targets in depression: inflammatory, cell-mediated immune, oxidative and nitrosative stress, mitochondrial, antioxidant, and neuroprogressive pathways. And new drug candidates--Nrf2 activators and GSK-3 inhibitors. Inflammopharmacology 20, 127-150.

Maes, M., Galecki, P., Chang, Y.S., Berk, M., 2011a. A review on the oxidative and nitrosative stress (O&NS) pathways in major depression and their possible contribution to the (neuro) degenerative processes in that illness. Progress in Neuro-Psychopharmacology and Biological Psychiatry 35, 676-692.

Maes, M., Kubera, M., Leunis, J.C., Berk, M., Geffard, M., Bosmans, E., 2013a. In depression, bacterial translocation may drive inflammatory responses, oxidative and nitrosative stress (O&NS), and autoimmune responses directed against O&NS-damaged neoepitopes. Acta Psychiatr Scand 127, 344-354.

Maes, M., Kubera, M., Mihaylova, I., Geffard, M., Galecki, P., Leunis, J.-C., Berk, M., 2013b. Increased autoimmune responses against auto-epitopes modified by oxidative and nitrosative damage in depression: Implications for the pathways to chronic depression and neuroprogression. Journal of Affective Disorders 149, 23-29.

34

Maes, M., Kubera, M., Obuchowiczwa, E., Goehler, L., Brzeszcz, J., 2011b. Depression's multiple comorbidities explained by (neuro)inflammatory and oxidative & nitrosative stress pathways. Neuro Endocrinol Lett 32, 7-24.

Maes, M., Lambrechts, J., Bosmans, E., Jacobs, J., Suy, E., Vandervorst, C., De Jonckheere, C., Minner, B., Raus, J., 1992. Evidence for a systemic immune activation during depression: results of leukocyte enumeration by flow cytometry in conjunction with monoclonal antibody staining. Psychological Medicine 22, 45-53.

Maes, M., Leonard, B.E., Myint, A.M., Kubera, M., Verkerk, R., 2011c. The new '5-HT' hypothesis of depression: cell-mediated immune activation induces indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase, which leads to lower plasma tryptophan and an increased synthesis of detrimental tryptophan catabolites (TRYCATs), both of which contribute to the onset of depression. Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry 35, 702-721.

Maes, M., Mihaylova, I., Kubera, M., Leunis, J.-C., Geffard, M., 2011d. IgM-mediated autoimmune responses directed against multiple neoepitopes in depression: New pathways that underpin the inflammatory and neuroprogressive pathophysiology. Journal of Affective Disorders 135, 414-418.

Maes, M., Mihaylova, I., Kubera, M., Uytterhoeven, M., Vrydags, N., Bosmans, E., 2009. Lower plasma Coenzyme Q10 in depression: a marker for treatment resistance and chronic fatigue in depression and a risk factor to cardiovascular disorder in that illness. Neuro Endocrinol Lett 30, 462-469.

Maes, M., Moraes, J.B., Bonifacio, K.L., Barbosa, D.S., Vargas, H.O., Michelin, A.P., Nunes, S.O.V., 2021. Towards a new model and classification of mood disorders based on

35

risk resilience, neuro-affective toxicity, staging, and phenome features using the nomothetic network psychiatry approach. Metabolic Brain Disease 36, 509-521.

Maes, M., Moraes, J.B., Congio, A., Bonifacio, K.L., Barbosa, D.S., Vargas, H.O.,

Michelin, A.P., Carvalho, A.F., Nunes, S.O.V., 2019. Development of a Novel Staging Model for Affective Disorders Using Partial Least Squares Bootstrapping: Effects of Lipid-Associated Antioxidant Defenses and Neuro-Oxidative Stress. Molecular Neurobiology 56, 6626-6644.

Maes, M., Ruckoanich, P., Chang, Y.S., Mahanonda, N., Berk, M., 2011e. Multiple aberrations in shared inflammatory and oxidative & nitrosative stress (IO&NS) pathways explain the co-association of depression and cardiovascular disorder (CVD), and the increased risk for CVD and due mortality in depressed patients. Prog Neuropsychopharmacol Biol Psychiatry 35, 769-783.

Maes, M., Smith, R., Christophe, A., Vandoolaeghe, E., Van Gastel, A., Neels, H., Demedts, P., Wauters, A., Meltzer, H.Y., 1997. Lower serum high-density lipoprotein cholesterol (HDL-C) in major depression and in depressed men with serious suicidal attempts: relationship with immune-inflammatory markers. Acta Psychiatr Scand 95, 212-221.

Marchio, P., Guerra-Ojeda, S., Vila, J.M., Aldasoro, M., Victor, V.M., Mauricio, M.D., 2019. Targeting early atherosclerosis: a focus on oxidative stress and inflammation. Oxidative medicine and cellular longevity 2019.

Mazereeuw, G., Herrmann, N., Andreazza, A.C., Khan, M.M., Lanctôt, K.L., 2015. A meta-analysis of lipid peroxidation markers in major depression. Neuropsychiatr Dis Treat 11, 2479-2491.

36

Miklowitz, D.J., Portnoff, L.C., Armstrong, C.C., Keenan-Miller, D., Breen, E.C., Muscatell, K.A., Eisenberger, N.I., Irwin, M.R., 2016. Inflammatory cytokines and nuclear factor-kappa B activation in adolescents with bipolar and major depressive disorders. Psychiatry Res 241, 315-322.

Moreira, E.G., Correia, D.G., Bonifácio, K.L., Moraes, J.B., Cavicchioli, F.L., Nunes, C.S., Nunes, S.O.V., Vargas, H.O., Barbosa, D.S., Maes, M., 2019b. Lowered PON1 activities are strongly associated with depression and bipolar disorder, recurrence of (hypo)mania and depression, increased disability and lowered quality of life. World J Biol Psychiatry 20, 368-380.

Moreira, G.E., Boll, M.K., Correia, G.D., Soares, F.J., Rigobello, C., Maes, M., 2019a. Why Should Psychiatrists and Neuroscientists Worry about Paraoxonase 1? Current Neuropharmacology 17, 1004-1020.

Morelli, N.R., Maes, M., Bonifacio, K.L., Vargas, H.O., Nunes, S.O.V., Barbosa, D.S., 2021. Increased nitro-oxidative toxicity in association with metabolic syndrome, atherogenicity and insulin resistance in patients with affective disorders. Journal of Affective Disorders 294, 410-419.

Morris, G., Anderson, G., Berk, M., Maes, M., 2013. Coenzyme Q10 depletion in medical and neuropsychiatric disorders: potential repercussions and therapeutic implications. Mol Neurobiol 48, 883-903.

Morris, G., Gevezova, M., Sarafian, V., Maes, M., 2022. Redox regulation of the immune response. Cell Mol Immunol 19, 1079-1101.

Morris, G., Maes, M., 2014. Oxidative and Nitrosative Stress and Immune-Inflammatory Pathways in Patients with Myalgic Encephalomyelitis (ME)/Chronic Fatigue Syndrome (CFS). Curr Neuropharmacol 12, 168-185.

Morris, G., Puri, B.K., Bortolasci, C.C., Carvalho, A., Berk, M., Walder, K., Moreira, E.G., Maes, M., 2021a. The role of high-density lipoprotein cholesterol, apolipoprotein A and paraoxonase-1 in the pathophysiology of neuroprogressive disorders. Neurosci Biobehav Rev 125, 244-263.

Morris, G., Puri, B.K., Bortolasci, C.C., Carvalho, A., Berk, M., Walder, K., Moreira, E.G., Maes, M., 2021b. The role of high-density lipoprotein cholesterol, apolipoprotein A and paraoxonase-1 in the pathophysiology of neuroprogressive disorders. Neuroscience & Biobehavioral Reviews 125, 244-263.

Morris, G., Puri, B.K., Olive, L., Carvalho, A., Berk, M., Walder, K., Gustad, L.T., Maes, M., 2020a. Endothelial dysfunction in neuroprogressive disorders-causes and suggested treatments. BMC Med 18, 305.

Morris, G., Puri, B.K., Olive, L., Carvalho, A.F., Berk, M., Maes, M., 2019. Emerging role of innate B1 cells in the pathophysiology of autoimmune and neuroimmune diseases: Association with inflammation, oxidative and nitrosative stress and autoimmune responses. Pharmacol Res 148, 104408.

Morris, G., Walder, K.R., Berk, M., Marx, W., Walker, A.J., Maes, M., Puri, B.K., 2020b. The interplay between oxidative stress and bioenergetic failure in neuropsychiatric illnesses: can we explain it and can we treat it? Mol Biol Rep 47, 5587-5620.

38

Morris, G., Walker, A.J., Walder, K., Berk, M., Marx, W., Carvalho, A.F., Maes, M., Puri, B.K., 2021c. Increasing Nrf2 Activity as a Treatment Approach in Neuropsychiatry. Mol Neurobiol 58, 2158-2182.

Moylan, S., Berk, M., Dean, O.M., Samuni, Y., Williams, L.J., O'Neil, A., Hayley, A.C.,

Pasco, J.A., Anderson, G., Jacka, F.N., Maes, M., 2014. Oxidative & nitrosative stress in depression: Why so much stress? Neuroscience & Biobehavioral Reviews 45, 46-62.

Nunes, S.O.V., Piccoli de Melo, L.G., Pizzo de Castro, M.R., Barbosa, D.S., Vargas, H.O.,

Berk, M., Maes, M., 2015. Atherogenic index of plasma and atherogenic coefficient are increased in major depression and bipolar disorder, especially when comorbid with tobacco use disorder. Journal of Affective Disorders 172, 55-62.

Owen, A.J., Batterham, M., Probst, Y.C., Grenyer, B.F., Tapsell, L.C., 2005. Low plasma vitamin E levels in major depression: diet or disease? European journal of clinical nutrition 59, 304-306.

Page, M.J., McKenzie, J.E., Bossuyt, P.M., Boutron, I., Hoffmann, T.C., Mulrow, C.D.,
Shamseer, L., Tetzlaff, J.M., Akl, E.A., Brennan, S.E., Chou, R., Glanville, J., Grimshaw,
J.M., Hróbjartsson, A., Lalu, M.M., Li, T., Loder, E.W., Mayo-Wilson, E., McDonald, S.,
McGuinness, L.A., Stewart, L.A., Thomas, J., Tricco, A.C., Welch, V.A., Whiting, P.,
Moher, D., 2021. The PRISMA 2020 statement: An updated guideline for reporting
systematic reviews. PLOS Medicine 18, e1003583.

Palace, V.P., Khaper, N., Qin, Q., Singal, P.K., 1999. Antioxidant potentials of vitamin A and carotenoids and their relevance to heart disease. Free Radic Biol Med 26, 746-761.

Paradies, G., Petrosillo, G., Paradies, V., Ruggiero, F.M., 2011. Mitochondrial dysfunction in brain aging: role of oxidative stress and cardiolipin. Neurochemistry international 58, 447-457.

Popa, D.-S., Bigman, G., Rusu, M.E., 2021. The Role of Vitamin K in Humans: Implication in Aging and Age-Associated Diseases. Antioxidants.

Pope, S., Land, J.M., Heales, S.J., 2008. Oxidative stress and mitochondrial dysfunction in neurodegeneration; cardiolipin a critical target? Biochim Biophys Acta 1777, 794-799.

Roman, K.M., Jenkins, A.K., Lewis, D.A., Volk, D.W., 2021. Involvement of the nuclear factor-κB transcriptional complex in prefrontal cortex immune activation in bipolar disorder. Translational Psychiatry 11, 40.

Schmelzer, C., Lindner, I., Rimbach, G., Niklowitz, P., Menke, T., Döring, F., 2008.
Functions of coenzyme Q10 in inflammation and gene expression. Biofactors 32, 179-183.
Schmelzer, C., Lorenz, G., Lindner, I., Rimbach, G., Niklowitz, P., Menke, T., Döring, F., 2007a. Effects of Coenzyme Q10 on TNF-alpha secretion in human and murine monocytic cell lines. Biofactors 31, 35-41.

Schmelzer, C., Lorenz, G., Rimbach, G., Döring, F., 2007b. Influence of Coenzyme Q_{10} on release of pro-inflammatory chemokines in the human monocytic cell line THP-1. Biofactors 31, 211-217.

Sheeley, M.P., Andolino, C., Kiesel, V.A., Teegarden, D., 2022. Vitamin D regulation of energy metabolism in cancer. British Journal of Pharmacology 179, 2890-2905.

Simeonova, D., Stoyanov, D., Leunis, J.-C., Murdjeva, M., Maes, M., 2021b. Construction of a nitro-oxidative stress-driven, mechanistic model of mood disorders: A nomothetic network approach. Nitric Oxide 106, 45-54.

40

Simeonova, D., Stoyanov, D., Leunis, J.C., Carvalho, A.F., Kubera, M., Murdjeva, M., Maes, M., 2020a. Increased Serum Immunoglobulin Responses to Gut Commensal Gram-Negative Bacteria in Unipolar Major Depression and Bipolar Disorder Type 1, Especially When Melancholia Is Present. Neurotox Res 37, 338-348.

Smith, J.D., 2010. Myeloperoxidase, inflammation, and dysfunctional high-density lipoprotein. J Clin Lipidol 4, 382-388.

Sowa-Kućma, M., Styczeń, K., Siwek, M., Misztak, P., Nowak, R.J., Dudek, D., Rybakowski, J.K., Nowak, G., Maes, M., 2018. Lipid Peroxidation and Immune Biomarkers Are Associated with Major Depression and Its Phenotypes, Including Treatment-Resistant Depression and Melancholia. Neurotox Res 33, 448-460.

Sugino, K., Dohi, K., Yamada, K., Kawasaki, T., 1987. The role of lipid peroxidation in endotoxin-induced hepatic damage and the protective effect of antioxidants. Surgery 101, 746-752.

Syafrita, Y., Amir, D., Susanti, R., Fadhilah, I., 2020. Relationship of brain-derived neurotrophic factor, malondialdehyde, and 8-Hydroxy 2-Deoxyguanosine with post-ischemic stroke depression. Dement Neuropsychol 14, 41-46.

Turrens, J.F., 2003. Mitochondrial formation of reactive oxygen species. J Physiol 552, 335-344.

Undurti, A., Huang, Y., Lupica, J.A., Smith, J.D., DiDonato, J.A., Hazen, S.L., 2009. Modification of high density lipoprotein by myeloperoxidase generates a pro-inflammatory particle. J Biol Chem 284, 30825-30835.

41

Vasupanrajit, A., Jirakran, K., Tunvirachaisakul, C., Solmi, M., Maes, M., 2022. Inflammation and nitro-oxidative stress in current suicidal attempts and current suicidal ideation: a systematic review and meta-analysis. Molecular Psychiatry 27, 1350-1361.

Wan, X., Wang, W., Liu, J., Tong, T., 2014. Estimating the sample mean and standard deviation from the sample size, median, range and/or interquartile range. BMC medical research methodology 14, 1-13.

Wei, Y.-G., Cai, D.-B., Liu, J., Liu, R.-X., Wang, S.-B., Tang, Y.-Q., Zheng, W., Wang,
F., 2020. Cholesterol and triglyceride levels in first-episode patients with major depressive
disorder: A meta-analysis of case-control studies. Journal of Affective Disorders 266, 465-472.

Wimalawansa, S.J., 2019. Vitamin D deficiency: effects on oxidative stress, epigenetics, gene regulation, and aging. Biology 8, 30.

Yager, S., Forlenza, M.J., Miller, G.E., 2010. Depression and oxidative damage to lipids. Psychoneuroendocrinology 35, 1356-1362.

Zhou, R., Yazdi, A.S., Menu, P., Tschopp, J., 2011. A role for mitochondria in NLRP3 inflammasome activation. Nature 469, 221-225.

Table 1. The outcomes and number of patients with affective disorders and healthy controls and the position of the standardized mean

 difference (SMD) and 95% confidence intervals with respect to the zero SMD.

		Sid	le of 95% con	fidence interv	vals			Total
Quitcome profiles	n studies		Overlap 0	Overlap 0		Patient	Control	number of
outcome promes	II Studies	< 0	and SMD	and SMD	>0	Cases	Cases	narticipants
			< 0	> 0				participants
RCT	55	18	19	13	5	10372	11073	21445
ADECK	27	16	6	4	1	2690	2045	4735
LPANTIOX	99	39	23	22	15	13541	13692	27233
LPOSTOX	93	4	11	21	55	4538	4189	8727
LPAUTO	7	0	0	0	7	394	230	624
(LPOSTOX+LPAUTO) / LPANTIOX	176	16	27	44	89	17106	16921	34027

RCT or reverse cholesterol transport comprises high-density lipoprotein (HDL), paraoxonase-1 (PON-1), apolipoprotein A (Apo A), lecithin cholesterol acyltransferase (LCAT), ApoE and ghrelin.

ADECK comprises vitamin A, D, E, K, and coenzyme Q10.

LPANTIOX or lipid-associated antioxidant defenses comprises RCT and ADECK.

LPOSTOX or lipid oxidative stress toxicity comprises MDA, TBARS, 8-Isoprostane, 4-HNE, oxLDL, 7-Ketocholesterol, 27-Hydroxycholesterol, 25-Hydroxycholesterol, 24-Hydroxycholesterol, peroxides, LOOH and ApoB.

LPAUTO or autoimmunity against lipid associated neoepitopes. comprises immunoglobulin G against oxLDL and Immunoglobulin M against MDA.

Outcome feature sets	Ν	Groups	SMD	95% CI	Z	р	Q	df	р	I ² (%)	τ^2	Т
RCT*	55	Overall	-0.286	-0.403; -0.169	-4.804	0.000	527.277	54	< 0.0001	89.759	0.150	0.387
ADECK*	27	Overall	-0.533	-0.763; -0.304	-4.557	< 0.0001	322.595	26	< 0.0001	91.940	0.317	0.563
LPANTIOX*	99	Overall	-0.270	-0.374; -0.165	-5.053	< 0.0001	1175.144	98	< 0.0001	91.661	0.226	0.475
LPOSTOX*	93	Overall	0.731	0.572;0.891	8.982	< 0.0001	1070.419	92	< 0.0001	91.405	0.542	0.736
LPAUTO*	7	Overall	0.904	0.727; 1.081	10.011	< 0.0001	5.448	6	0.488	0.000	0.000	0.000
	60	BD	0.653	0.501; 0.806	8.383	0.000	604.682	59	0.000	90.243	0.291	0.540
(LPOSTOX+LPAUTO)/ LPANTIOX	116	Depression	0.433	0.312; 0.554	7.007	0.000	1441.883	115	0.000	92.024	0.380	0.617
				BD Vs	depressio	on Q= 4.91	8, df=1, p=	0.027				

Table 2. Results of meta-analyses performed on the primary outcome variables.

* Not significantly different between bipolar disorder and major depression

RCT or reverse cholesterol transport comprises high-density lipoprotein (HDL), paraoxonase-1 (PON-1), apolipoprotein A (ApoA), lecithin cholesterol acyltransferase (LCAT), ApoE and ghrelin.

ADECK comprises vitamin A, D, E, K, and coenzyme Q10.

LPANTIOX or lipid-associated antioxidant defenses comprises RCT and ADECK.

LPOSTOX or lipid oxidative stress toxicity comprises MDA, TBARS, 8-Isoprostane, 4-HNE, oxLDL, 7-Ketocholesterol, 27-Hydroxycholesterol, 25-Hydroxycholesterol, 24-Hydroxycholesterol, peroxides, LOOH and ApoB.

LPAUTO or autoimmunity against lipid associated neoepitopes. comprises immunoglobulin G against oxLDL and Immunoglobulin M against MDA.

 Table 3. Results on publication bias.

Outcome feature sets	Fail safe n	Z Kendall's τ	р	Egger's t test (df)	р	Missing studies (side)	After Adjusting
RCT	-12.377	2.497	0.006	0.827 (53)	0.205	11 (Left)	-0.481 (-0.608; -0.354)
ADECK	-13.447	1.292	0.098	1.571(25)	0.064	0	0
LPANTIOX	-14.648	0.882	0.188	0.852 (97)	0.198	15 (Left)	-0.478 (-0.592; -0.364)
LPOSTOX	26.493	3.076	0.0010	3.252 (91)	0.0008	18 (Right)	0.987 (0.800; 1.174)
LPAUTO	9.982	0.0000	< 0.0001	0.441(5)	0.338	0	0
(LPOSTOX+LPAUTO)/ LPANTIOX ratio in BD	21.685	2.264	0.011	2.054 (58)	0.022	8 (Right)	0.821 (0.658; 0.983)
(LPOSTOX+LPAUTO)/ LPANTIOX ratio in MDD	20.410	2.264	0.011	2.429 (114)	0.008	24 (Left)	0.141 (0.007; 0.274)

RCT or reverse cholesterol transport comprises high-density lipoprotein (HDL), paraoxonase-1 (PON-1), apolipoprotein A (ApoA), lecithin cholesterol acyltransferase (LCAT), ApoE and ghrelin.

ADECK comprises vitamin A, D, E, K, and coenzyme Q10.

LPANTIOX or lipid-associated antioxidant defenses comprises RCT and ADECK.

LPOSTOX or lipid oxidative stress toxicity comprises MDA, TBARS, 8-Isoprostane, 4-HNE, oxLDL, 7-Ketocholesterol, 27-Hydroxycholesterol, 25-Hydroxycholesterol, 24-Hydroxycholesterol, peroxides, LOOH and ApoB.

LPAUTO or autoimmunity against lipid associated neoepitopes. comprises immunoglobulin G against oxLDL and Immunoglobulin M against MDA. BD: bipolar disorder; MDD: major depression



Figure 1: The PRISMA flow chart.

RCT

<u>Study name</u>	Year	Statistics for e	ach study	Sample	size		Std diff in means and s	<u>95% C</u> I	
		Std diff in means	p-Value	Patients	Healthy Control				
Maes-a Olusi Maes-e Sevincok Ranjekar Huang-c Karlovic Huang-d Roohafza Huang-d Roohafza Huang-b Sarandol-b Lehto Barim Sagud-D Sagud-D Sagud-B Kodydkova Lehto-b Dortland Sadeghi Kotan Sukreet Hocaoglu Algul-a Vargas-b-B Bortolasci-B Saguat Noreira Doled Noreira Saguat	1994 1996 1997 2001 2003 2003 2004 2005 2006 2008 2009 2009 2009 2009 2010 2011 2011 2011 2011 2011 2012 2013 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2015 2015 2017 2015 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2017 2018 2018 2018 2019 2021 2021 2021 2021 2021 2021 2021 2021 2022 2022 2022 2022 2022 2023	Std diff in means -2,046 0,654 -1,085 -0,932 0,071 0,193 -0,310 0,192 -0,420 -0,420 -0,470 -0,479 -0,420 -0,479 -0,420 -0,420 -0,420 -0,420 -0,420 -0,420 -0,310 -0,420 -0,314 -1,553 -1,147 -0,886 -0,364 -0,047 -0,888 -0,053 -0,053 -0,254 -0,254 -0,254 -0,254 -0,254 -0,258 -0,254 -0,258 -0,254 -0,259 -1,723 -1,681 -1,956 -0,344 -0,536 -2,633 -0,244 -0,536 -2,633 -0,244 -0,536 -2,633 -0,2416 -0,344 -0,536 -2,633 -0,2111 -0,388 -0,111 -0,218 -0,035 -0,136 0,372 -0,046 0,076 0,372 -0,046 0,076 0,035 -0,264 -0,286 -0,286 -0,286	p-Value 0,000 0,000 0,002 0,846 0,339 0,176 0,309 0,142 0,276 0,978 0,011 0,293 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,798 0,997 0,907 0,000 0,798 0,997 0,000 0,000 0,798 0,997 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,005 0,053 0,066 0,109 0,823 0,013 0,000 0,000 0,025 0,053 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,000 0,025 0,053 0,0000 0,0000 0,0000 0,0000 0,0000 0,00000 0,000	Patients 16 100 36 27 10 68 38 103 25 109 86 63 24 34 21 35 44 864 153 50 100 30 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 20 49 91 92 30 15 100 186 94 204 99 130 37 92 122 37 75 33 55 6005 39 134 88 35 10372	Healthy Control 26 100 28 24 39 39 25 59 36 61 22 50 50 50 35 88 629 147 44 52 30 40 1199 199 199 199 199 199 199 199 199 1				
					-	Healthy	Control	Patients	3,00

Figure 2: Forest plot of reverse cholesterol transport (RCT) in patients with major depression and bipolar disorder compared to healthy controls.

Study name Year		Statistics for each study		Samp	le size	Std diff in means and 95% CI			
		Std diff in means	p-Value	Patients	Healthy Control				
Maes-e	1997	0,501	0,050	36	28				
Maes-f	2000	-0,880	0,001	42	26				
Schneider	2000	-0,774	0,005	25	31				
Eskandari	2007	-0,599	0,001	89	44				
Sarandol-c	2007	0,937	0,000	96	54				
Maes-d	2009	-1,726	0,000	22	35				
Kotan	2011	-0,088	0,671	50	44				
Bal	2012	-2,164	0,000	42	38				
Ghodake	2012	-1,205	0,000	30	30				
Jamilian	2013	-0,628	0,000	100	100				
Milaneschi	2014	-0,238	0,000	946	494				
Olga	2014	-1,755	0,000	91	89				
Sarandol-a	2015	-0,060	0,831	26	25				
Chowdhury	2017	-1,073	0,000	58	58				
Abedi	2018	-0,619	0,001	60	60				
Altunsoy	2018	-0,669	0,008	29	40				
Petrov-B	2018	0,665	0,106	13	12				
Petrov-D	2018	-0,120	0,775	11	12				
Esnafoglu	2020	-1,620	0,000	89	43				
Grudet	2020	-0,185	0,352	48	54				
Islam-b	2020	0,048	0,592	247	248				
Okasha-a	2020	-1,041	0,002	20	20				
XUE	2020	-0,206	0,267	75	48				
Kamalzadeh	2021	-0,499	0,000	174	173				
Quessada	2021	-0,048	0,713	117	117				
khan	2022	-0,787	0,000	100	100				
Rheenen	2023	0,363	0,152	55	22	│ │ ∔∎─ │			
Pooled		-0.533	0.000	2690	2045				
Prediction Interval		-0.533	-,						
		5,000			-	-3,00 -1,50 0,00 1,50	3,0		
						Healthy Control Patients			

Vitamin A+ D+ E+ CoQ10

Almulla et al, 2023

Figure 3: Forest plot of vitamins A, D, and E and coenzyme Q10 in patients with major depression and bipolar disorder as compared to healthy controls.

Image: Provide intermediate interm	Study name	Year	Statistics for	each study	Samp	le size	Std diff in means and 95% Cl
Intense Public Peters Control Nata 199 2.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Nata 199 2.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Nata 199 2.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Nata 100 4.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Servica 101 4.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Servica 101 4.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Servica 101 4.52 2.57 1.9 1.4 Servica 100 1.57 1.57 1.57 1.57 Servica 100 1.57 1.50 1.57 </th <th>0.000</th> <th></th> <th>Std diff</th> <th><u></u></th> <th><u></u></th> <th>Healthy</th> <th></th>	0.000		Std diff	<u></u>	<u></u>	Healthy	
Name 1994 0.08 1000 15 0.00 Name 1906 0.00 100 100 100 100 Name 1000 0.00 100 100 100 100 100 Name 1000 0.00 100 <th></th> <th></th> <th>in means</th> <th>p-Value</th> <th>Patients</th> <th>Control</th> <th></th>			in means	p-Value	Patients	Control	
Divide 1004 1005 100 100 Named 2001 107 0.005 10 10 Named 2001 107 0.005 10 10 Named 2001 107 0.005 10 10 Named 2001 100 0.005 10 10 Named 2001 100 0.005 10 10 Named 2001 100 0.005 10 10 Named 2007 100 0.005 10 10 10 Named 2007 100 0.005 10 10 10 10 Named 2007 100 0.005 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10<	Maos-a	1994	-2.046	. 0.000	16	26	
Massa 197 1.2 mass 207 20 20 20 Seventine 200 -0.74 0.00 25 21 Seventine 200 -0.74 0.00 20 21 Nergenine 200 -0.74 0.00 20 20 Seventine 200 -0.76 0.00 20 20 Seventine 20	Olusi	1996	0,654	0,000	100	100	
Name Object Object <td>Maes-e</td> <td>1997</td> <td>-0,292</td> <td>0,267</td> <td>36</td> <td>28</td> <td>▏</td>	Maes-e	1997	-0,292	0,267	36	28	▏
Desima Dot Dot <thdot< th=""> <thdot< t<="" td=""><td>Maes-f</td><td>2000</td><td>-0,880</td><td>0,001</td><td>42</td><td>26</td><td></td></thdot<></thdot<>	Maes-f	2000	-0,880	0,001	42	26	
Display Opposite Display <	Schneider	2000	-0,774	0,005	25	31	
Name District District <thdistrict< th=""> District <thd< td=""><td>Raniekar</td><td>2003</td><td>-0,932</td><td>0.846</td><td>10</td><td>31</td><td></td></thd<></thdistrict<>	Raniekar	2003	-0,932	0.846	10	31	
Karbeir 2016 0.210 0.772 31 39 Deproy 2016 0.242 0.271 19 31 Rody from 2016 0.242 0.271 19 31 Rody from 2016 0.242 21 31 Karbeir 2016 0.242 21 31 Karbeir 2017 1.050 0.051 12 21 Karbeir 2018 0.242 21 31 21 21 Karbeir 2017 1.050 0.050 12 22 21 21 Karbeir 2007 1.050 0.050 12 22 21	Huang-c	2003	0,193	0,339	68	39	╵
Name Dot Dot <thd< td=""><td>Karlovic</td><td>2004</td><td>-0,310</td><td>0,176</td><td>38</td><td>39</td><td>▏</td></thd<>	Karlovic	2004	-0,310	0,176	38	39	▏
Name 2003 0.407 0.17 <t< td=""><td>Huang-d</td><td>2004</td><td>0,192</td><td>0,309</td><td>103</td><td>39</td><td>│ │ │≝─ │ │</td></t<>	Huang-d	2004	0,192	0,309	103	39	│ │ │≝ ─ │ │
Nameson One Origin Origin <thorigin< td="" th<=""><td>Digney</td><td>2005</td><td>0,248</td><td>0,581</td><td>25</td><td>18</td><td></td></thorigin<>	Digney	2005	0,248	0,581	25	18	
Banghole Bangho	Huang-b	2005	-0,420	0.276	109	59	
Education 2070 -0.568 Dotto B 41 Schurdle 2077 -0.569 Dotto B 43 Schurdle 2077 -0.569 Dotto B 43 Schurdle 2077 -0.569 Dotto B 43 Schurdle 2077 -0.579 Dotto B 43 Schurdle 2078 -0.579 Dotto B 43 Schurdle 2078 -0.579 Dotto B 43 Schurdle 2078 -0.578 B B B Schurdle 2078 -0.578 B B B Schurdle 2071 -0.578 B B B Schurdle 2071 -0.578 B B B Schurdle 2071 -0.578 B B B B Schurdle 2071 -0.578 B B B B Schurdle 2071 -0.578 B B B B B B B	Sarandol-b	2006	0,005	0,978	86	36	
Name Dot Dot <thd< td=""><td>Eskandari</td><td>2007</td><td>-0,599</td><td>0,001</td><td>89</td><td>44</td><td>▏</td></thd<>	Eskandari	2007	-0,599	0,001	89	44	▏
Baranon (1997) 0.037 0.038 0.00 98 54 Horse (1997) 0.037 0.038 0.03 1.0 25 Karse (1997) 0.037 0.038 0.0 25 Karse (1997) 0.038 0.008 0.0 1.0 1.0 1.0 1.0 1.0 1.0 1.0 1.0 1.0	Kurt-b-D	2007	1,052	0,003	16	25	
Demin DOD DOD <th< td=""><td>Sarandol-c</td><td>2007</td><td>0.937</td><td>0,005</td><td>12</td><td>20 54</td><td></td></th<>	Sarandol-c	2007	0.937	0,005	12	20 54	
Lation 2009 -1.940 0.11 0.3 41 Shape D 2009 -1.957 0.00 21 80 Usin 2009 -1.957 0.00 21 80 Usin 2009 -1.957 0.00 21 80 Usin 2009 -0.957 0.01 21 20 0.01 21 20 Usin 2011 0.057 0.01 21 20 0.00 20 20 Usin 2012 0.511 0.00 20 <th< td=""><td>Dean</td><td>2008</td><td>-1,039</td><td>0,016</td><td>8</td><td>23</td><td></td></th<>	Dean	2008	-1,039	0,016	8	23	
Minha 2009 0.759 0.000 30 250 Minha 2009 0.747 0.000 30 250 Kinjshova 2009 0.747 0.000 30 250 Kinjshova 2009 0.747 0.000 21 31 Maeri 2009 0.758 0.000 21 31 Maeri 2009 0.758 0.000 21 31 Maeri 2009 0.758 0.000 24 324 Maeri 2009 0.778 0.000 24 324 Maeria 2011 0.047 0.000 24 324 Mushiko 2012 0.017 0.007 100 25 100 Mushiko 2012 0.017 0.007 100 25 100 1	Lehto	2008	-0,460	0,011	63	61	
Shippin Coord Link None	Kurt-a	2008	0,799	0,003	36	25	│
Nörgen Nörgen Nörgen Open Solgen Open Solgen Open Solgen </td <td>Sagud-D Sagud B</td> <td>2009</td> <td>-1,553</td> <td>0,000</td> <td>34</td> <td>50</td> <td></td>	Sagud-D Sagud B	2009	-1,553	0,000	34	50	
Name Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Name Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Lenon Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Kana Doit Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Kana Doit Dois Dois Dois Dois Dois Kana Doit	Kodvdkova	2009	-0.386	0.000	35	35	│ ┬╍──▄┤ │ │
Baim 2009 -0.62 0.61 24 23 24 Description 2010 -0.34 0.378 864 620 Description 2010 -0.34 0.378 864 620 Description 2011 0.328 0.378 864 620 Basersen 2011 0.328 0.026 14 14 Rescue 2011 0.328 0.026 14 14 Rescue 2012 0.218 0.026 14 14 14 Rescue 2012 0.218 0.026 14 14 14 Rescue 2012 0.218 0.026 14 14 14 Rescue 2012 0.218 0.026 16 16 17 14 14 Rescue 2012 0.218 0.026 16 16 16 17 17 Rescue 2013 0.268 0.028 16 18 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 19 </td <td>Kluge</td> <td>2009</td> <td>0,509</td> <td>0,268</td> <td>10</td> <td>10</td> <td>│ │ [─]┽╼──│ │</td>	Kluge	2009	0,509	0,268	10	10	│ │ [─] ┽╼──│ │
Manes OD OD OD OD PA DO DO PA DO DO DO DO D	Barim	2009	-0,642	0,041	24	22	
Deletion 000 001 010 010 010 010 010 010 010 01	Maes-d	2009	-1,726	0,000	22	35	│ ────┼──│ │ │
Seeson Diff Diff <thdiff< th=""> Diff Diff <t< td=""><td>Dortland</td><td>2010</td><td>-0,364</td><td>0,052</td><td>44 864</td><td>629</td><td></td></t<></thdiff<>	Dortland	2010	-0,364	0,052	44 864	629	
Kohn 2011 0.07 0.74 0.0 4.4 Serigue 2011 0.07 0.74 0.0 4.4 Order 2011 0.07 0.74 0.0 4.4 Order 2012 0.180 0.07 0.74 0.0 4.4 Order 2012 0.410 0.10 2.4 0.00 4.4 Malway 2012 0.410 0.10 2.4 0.00 4.4 Malway 2012 0.410 0.00 4.2 3.6 Malway 2012 0.414 0.00 4.2 3.6 Malway 2014 0.254 0.00 4.0 1.0 Malway 2014 0.254 0.00 4.0 1.0 Wagas-b-D 2014 0.223 0.00 2.7 2.7 Gammabaa 2017 0.441 0.00 2.7 4.0 0.00 2.0 0.00 0.0 0.00 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0 0.0	Sadeghi	2011	-0,898	0,000	153	147	
Rendsparker Bends	Kotan	2011	-0,067	0,747	50	44	
alexies, 2011 10 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100	Rodriguez	2011	0,125	0,606	34	35	│ │ <u>+</u> = │ │
Dimen Dis Dis <thdis< th=""> <thdis< td="" th<=""><td>Sukreet</td><td>2011</td><td>0,001</td><td>0,997</td><td>100</td><td>52</td><td></td></thdis<></thdis<>	Sukreet	2011	0,001	0,997	100	52	
Metson 2012 0.401 0.11 24 24 24 24 Har 2012 0.401 0.001 40 30 30 Har 2012 0.418 0.000 40 30 Alpula 0.011 0.000 20 40 Virgashe B 2014 0.388 0.022 40 Virgashe B 2014 0.238 0.000 46 484 Bordingo D 2014 0.238 0.000 45 119 Virgashe D 2014 0.238 0.000 45 119 Virgashe D 2014 0.238 0.000 15 119 Same D 2014 0.268 0.000 15 119 Same D 2015 1.73 0.000 15 119 Same D 2017 0.358 0.000 15 201 Same D 2017 0.358 0.000 10 10 Same D 2017 1.038 0.000 10 10 Meeina 2017	Ishitobi	2012	-1,205	0,000	30	30 103	│ ──────│ │
Headaghu Headaghu Hayan Hayan Hayan 2012 2012 2012 2013 2013 2014 2013 2014 2014 2013 2014 2014 2015 2014 2015 2014 2014 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2014 2015 2014 2015 2	Matsuo	2012	0,461	0,115	24	24	
Bel 2012 2, 2,184 0,000 4,2 38 Jamba 2013 0,528 0,000 4,2 48 Jamba 2013 0,528 0,000 4,2 49 Jamba 2013 0,528 0,000 4,2 49 Jamba 2013 0,528 0,000 4,4 49 Jamba 2013 0,228 0,000 8,4 4,49 Jamba 2014 0,288 0,000 8,4 4,49 Jamba 2014 0,288 0,000 8,4 4,49 Jamba 2014 0,588 0,223 3,5 3,5 3,5 3,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4,5 4	Hocaoglu	2012	0,943	0.001	30	30	▏
Jamilan Jamilan Jamilan Manikanch Derdesor-B 2014 0.214 0.228 0.028 0.	Bal	2012	-2,164	0,000	42	38	
Olymphone Dial	Jamilian	2013	-0,628	0,000	100	100	
Borbinsol-B Borbinsol-B Borbinsol-B Borbinsol-D 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014	Vargas-b-B	2013	-2,133	0.025	20	119	
Manacshi 2014 0.238 0.000 946 494 Brothand 2014 0.238 0.080 946 19 199 Manacod 2014 0.238 0.088 91 199 Manacod 2014 0.268 0.28 21 19 Description 2014 0.268 28 21 Oga 2014 0.755 0.000 91 95 Samadol 2015 0.74 18 0.28 27 Resource 2015 0.74 0.428 30 30 Carmo 2015 0.74 0.428 30 30 Carmo 2015 0.74 0.428 30 30 Carmo 2017 0.428 0.000 32 27 Resource 2017 0.428 0.000 30 80 Carmo 2018 0.000 20 80 Carmo 2018 0.000 2	Bortolasci-B	2014	-0,254	0,053	82	199	
Barchasc-D 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014 2014	Milaneschi	2014	-0,238	0,000	946	494	+
Variantica 2014 October October October October October October October Strandol a 2015 2014 2015 2017 2016 2017 2018 2017 2018	Bortolasci-D	2014	-0,233	0,066	91	199	
Openance	Vargas-b-D Potro	2014	-0,223	0,109	92	119	
Olga 2014 -1,758 0,000 91 98 Starndcla 2015 -0,248 0,139 10 99 Kanl 2015 -0,248 0,139 10 99 Memo 2015 -0,248 0,438 10 99 Memo 2015 -0,248 0,438 10 99 Messoud 2017 -0,344 0,168 81 151 Messoud 2017 -0,538 0,000 30 90 Chowlhavy 2017 -0,538 0,000 30 90 Almasov 2017 -1,052 0,000 30 90 Almasov 2018 -0,668 0,000 30 90 PetrovD 2018 -0,100 0775 11 11 12 Pila 2018 -0,100 151 120 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 99 90 910 910 910	Ozsov	2014	0.654	0.028	28	21	
Sarandola 2015 0.418 0.199 18 25 Carmo 2015 1.23 0.000 27 27 Troval-h 2015 1.23 0.000 27 27 Troval-h 2015 1.23 0.000 27 27 Troval-h 2015 1.23 0.000 27 27 Messacud 2017 0.344 0.018 81 151 Garmo 2017 0.344 0.018 81 151 Carmo 2017 0.438 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2017 0.438 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2017 0.438 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2017 0.468 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2017 0.468 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2017 0.468 0.000 55 864 Carmo 2017 0.468 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2017 0.468 0.000 55 863 Carmo 2018 0.468 0.000 190 190 Pag-h 2018 0.468 0.000 196 829 Carmo 2018 0.468 0.000 294 152 Pathon 2018 0.468 0.000 204 152 Pathon 2018 0.468 0.002 294 152 Pathon 2019 0.478 0.488 0.97 Magner 2019 0.478 0.488 0.97 Carmo 2019 0.478 0.488 0.97 Carmo 2019 0.478 0.488 0.97 Carmo 2019 0.478 0.488 0.97 Carmo 2020 0.414 0.0488 0.77 75 150 Carmo 2020 0.414 0.0488 0.75 75 150 Carmo 2020 0.414 0.000 174 177 Magner 2021 0.068 0.000 174 177 Magner 2022 0.428 0.000 175 177 Carmo 2022 0.428 0.000 174 177 Magner 2022 0.428 0.000 175 177 Carmo 2022 0.428 0.000 174 177 Magner 2022 0.428 0.000 175 177 Magner 2022 0.428 0.000	Olga	2014	-1,755	0,000	91	89	╎╶╼┽╴╷╴╴╷╴╷
Gall 2018 -0.253 0.438 10 90 Messoud 2016 -0.245 30 30 Messoud 2017 -0.344 0.018 81 151 Moreira 2017 -0.344 0.018 81 151 Moreira 2017 -0.344 0.018 81 151 Moreira 2017 -0.348 0.000 30 30 Chowdhay 2017 -1.052 0.000 30 80 Alunsoy 2018 -0.669 0.008 29 40 Petrox-D 2018 -0.669 0.008 29 40 Petrox-D 2018 -0.419 0.000 16 250 Erko 2018 -0.419 0.001 12 20 4 4 Merdoza 2018 0.408 0.002 244 120 4 4 Merdoza 2018 0.418 0.428 10 12 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4 4	Sarandol-a	2015	-0,418	0,199	18	25	▏
Binsio 2015 2.415 D.000 27 24 Home Tuncai-b 2016 0.2415 D.000 57 24 Home Messaoud 2017 -0.344 D.018 81 151 Messaoud 2017 -0.344 D.000 55 B63 Opiciak 2017 -0.344 D.000 56 B63 Opiciak 2017 -1.073 D.000 58 B63 Alumsoy 2017 -1.073 D.000 58 583 Alumsoy 2018 -0.619 D.001 100 104 Pila 2018 -0.499 D.000 106 104 Pila 2018 -0.499 D.000 104 152 Parko 2018 -0.499 D.000 30 20 Algub 2018 -0.499 D.012 20 20 Messaoud 2019 -0.180 D.499 20 20	Kahl	2015	-0,259	0,438	10	90	
Tunoisb 2016 0.207 0.425 30 30 Moreira 2017 0.536 0.000 55 863 Moreira 2017 -0.536 0.000 55 863 Einen 2017 -1.682 0.000 55 863 Chowdhwy 2017 -1.692 0.000 58 864 Alunesov 2018 -0.669 0.000 58 864 Alunesov 2018 -0.669 0.000 54 816 Bench 2018 -0.669 0.000 54 812 Periow-D 2018 -0.469 0.000 30 30 Bench 2018 -0.468 0.600 204 102 Envo 2018 -0.468 0.600 204 205 Envo 2018 -0.468 0.600 204 206	Rosso	2015	-2.415	0.000	57	49	
Messaoudi 2017 - 0.344 0.018 81 151 Moreira 2017 - 0.344 0.018 81 151 Ogodek 2017 - 1.681 0.000 55 863 Diversity 2017 - 1.681 0.000 55 863 Alumoy 2018 - 0.689 0.000 55 863 Alumoy 2018 - 0.689 0.000 55 866 Baghan 2018 - 0.619 0.001 60 60 60 Baghan 2018 - 0.619 0.001 60 60 60 Baghan 2018 - 0.469 0.000 160 160 Petrov-D 2018 - 0.469 0.000 160 160 Petrov-D 2018 - 0.469 0.000 160 160 Petrov-D 2018 - 0.468 0.000 160 160 Mondoza 2018 - 0.485 0.000 130 120 Mondoza 2018 - 0.485 0.000 204 206 Hu 2019 - 0.218 0.466 70 37 37 Sta-8 0 2019 - 0.218 0.466 70 37 37 Sta-8 0 2019 - 0.218 0.466 70 37 37 Sta-8 0 2019 0.035 0.844 47 40 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.465 0.352 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.465 0.362 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.465 0.362 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.000 174 173 Sta-8 0 2020 - 0.471 0.000 2.20 20 Chasha-a 2020 - 0.468 0.073 17 37 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.877 33 3 Sta-8 0 2019 0.035 0.844 47 40 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.373 17 17 Kue 2020 - 0.468 0.365 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.377 5 48 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.367 37 33 Mondoza 2018 0.376 55 477 KUE 2020 - 0.468 0.373 177 117 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.713 177 117 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.713 177 117 Moreira 2022 - 0.767 0.000 174 173 Karadeniz 2020 - 0.468 0.713 177 117 Moreira 2022 - 0.767 0.000 174 173 Karadeniz 2022 - 0.767 0.000 174 173 Karadeniz 2022 - 0.767 0.000 174 173 Mandoza 2012 - 0.268 0.875 35 34 Karadeniz 2022 - 0.767 0.000 170 100 Moreira 2022 - 0.767 0.000 135 13 137 Moreira 2022 - 0.767 0.000 135 14 1369 Moreira 20	Tuncel-b	2016	0,207	0,425	30	30	│ ⁻ │ _∔∎_ │ │
Moreiran 2017 -0.538 0.000 55 983 Enno 2017 -1.033 0.000 70 50 Enno 2017 -1.032 0.000 70 50 Enno 2017 -1.032 0.000 55 50 Alunsoy 2017 -1.032 0.000 56 54 Alunsoy 2018 -0.669 0.006 60 60 Baghal 2018 -0.416 0.000 100 104 Periov-D 2018 -0.416 0.000 30 30 Mordiza 2018 -0.418 0.000 30 30 Mordiza 2018 -0.418 0.000 30 30 Mordiza 2018 -0.111 0.438 99 96 96 Hu 2019 0.326 0.814 92 89 96 Su-b-D 2019 0.326 0.814 92 80 Su-b-D	Messaoud	2017	-0,344	0,018	81	151	▏
Uppon 2017 4.383 0.000 30 40 Tuncala 2017 1.073 0.000 30 40 Tuncala 2017 1.073 0.000 58 58 Alumsoy 2018 -0.619 0.001 60 60 Baghai 2018 -0.119 0.120 11 12 Periov-D 2018 -0.169 0.000 104 14 Periov-D 2018 0.666 13 12 14 14 Algub 2019 -0.188 0.800 30 30 40 Mendoza 2019 -0.188 0.802 20 20 4 Wagner 2019 -0.218 0.856 70 47 Sub-D 2019 0.338 0.870 37 43 Mardara 2020 -0.168 0.822 48 54 Sub-D 2020 -0.206 0.877 75 48	Moreira	2017	-0,536	0,000	55	863	
Tuncian 2017 1.092 0.000 30 30 Alunsoy 2017 -1.092 0.000 58 58 Alunsoy 2018 -0.669 0.000 58 58 Baghai 2018 -0.619 0.001 60 60 Baghai 2018 -0.416 0.003 100 104 Pritov-D 2018 -0.416 0.000 186 250 Pritov-D 2018 0.120 0.757 11 12 Aputo 2018 0.168 0.000 30 30 Mondoz 2018 0.468 0.000 30 30 Mondoz 2018 0.418 186 250 Hu 2019 -0.218 0.182 130 81 Hui 2019 -0.328 0.870 37 37 Stu-b-D 2019 0.038 0.826 75 48 Stu-b-B 2020 -0.145 0.456 20 47 Karadeniz 2020 0.148 0.456 <td>Ekinci</td> <td>2017</td> <td>-2,033</td> <td>0,000</td> <td>70</td> <td>20</td> <td></td>	Ekinci	2017	-2,033	0,000	70	20	
Chowdhury 2017 -1.073 0.000 58 58 58 Alunesoy 2018 -0.619 0.001 100 100 101 101 Pala 2018 -0.619 0.001 100 100 101 Pala 2018 -0.619 0.000 116 250 Enko 2018 2.048 0.000 116 1250 Enko 2018 2.048 0.000 116 1250 Pala 2018 -0.665 0.000 116 1250 Enko 2018 2.048 0.000 204 206 Mendzaa 2018 -0.188 0.000 204 206 Mendzaa 2018 -0.188 0.000 204 206 Mendzaa 2019 -0.218 0.182 137 81 Mendzaa 2019 -0.218 0.182 137 81 Mendzaa 2019 -0.218 0.188 0.228 30 Neb-D 2019 -0.218 0.465 70 47 Nu-8-B 2020 -0.145 0.456 70 47 Nu-8-B 2020 -0.145 0.456 70 47 Nu-8-B 2020 -0.145 0.456 70 47 XUE 2020 -0.206 0.287 75 48 Kamabaadeh 2021 -0.208 0.287 75 48 Kamabaadeh 2021 -0.208 0.287 75 48 Kamabaadeh 2021 -0.208 0.456 70 47 XUE 2020 -0.165 0.553 75 150 Gudara 2021 -0.268 0.287 75 48 Enanoglu 2020 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mendzaa 2021 -0.288 0.613 57 150 Mendzaa 2020 -0.168 0.533 4.47 54 Kamabaadeh 2021 -0.288 0.613 57 150 Mendzaa 2020 -0.168 0.533 75 150 Mendzaa 2020 -0.168 0.533 75 150 Mendzaa 2020 -0.168 0.533 75 150 Mendzaa 2020 -0.168 0.53 75 150 Mendzaa 2020 -0.168 0.533 75 150 Mendzaa 2021 -0.288 0.000 174 177 Mu-4 4 4 Mendzaa 2021 -0.288 0.000 150 100 Wei 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 150 100 Wei 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 5810 Mendzaa 2021 -0.288 0.000 55 101 Mendzaa 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 50 500 Mendzaa 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 000 500 500 Mendzaa 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 100 Mendzaa 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 100 100 Mendzaa 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 100 100 Mendzaa 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 100 1	Tuncel-a	2017	-1,092	0,000	30	30	▏
Alunasoy 2018 -0.688 0.008 29 40 Baghal 2018 -0.416 0.001 60 60 Baghal 2018 -0.416 0.001 101 102 Phan-D 2018 -0.416 0.000 116 12 Erko 2018 -0.416 0.000 116 12 Petrox-B 2018 -0.468 0.000 30 30 Mondoza 2018 -0.418 0.060 204 206 Hu 2019 -0.111 0.439 99 99 Wagner 2019 -0.218 0.162 130 61 Hu 2019 -0.218 0.456 70 47 Kuradeniz 2020 -0.145 0.456 70 47 Kuz 2020 -0.145 0.552 48 54 Karadeniz 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unier-5 2022 -1.244 0.000 45 36 Kanada 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unier-5 2022 -1.246 0.000 45 36 Kanada 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 50 5810 Junier-5 2022 -1.244 0.000 45 36 Kanada 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 50 5810 Junier-5 2022 -0.278 0.000 25 25 Kanada 2022 -0.278 0.000 35 43 Junier 2022 -0.270 0.000 35 43 Junier 2022 -0.278 0.000	Chowdhury	2017	-1,073	0,000	58	58	▏
Abend 2018 -0.018 0.000 00 00 Bigman 2018 -0.130 0.076 11 12 Pila 2018 -0.480 0.000 94 152 Petrov-B 2018 -0.686 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 -0.686 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 -0.688 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 -0.618 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2019 -0.218 0.162 130 61 Hu 2019 -0.218 0.162 130 61 Wagner 2019 -0.336 0.870 37 37 Su-b.D 2019 0.352 0.814 92 89 Su-b.D 2019 0.372 0.182 23 90 KuE 2020 -0.186 0.582 47 7 XUE 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Karadeniz 2020 0.048	Altunsoy	2018	-0,669	0,008	29	40	
Petrov-D 2018 0.120 0.775 11 12 Pila 2018 0.408 0.000 196 250 Enko 2018 0.408 0.000 196 250 Enko 2018 0.408 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 0.408 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 0.418 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2019 0.111 0.439 99 99 Wagner 2019 0.018 0.622 130 61 Hu 2019 0.035 0.814 92 89 Su-b-D 2019 0.035 0.814 92 89 Su-b-D 2019 0.136 0.288 195 89 Elcian 2019 0.036 0.287 73 48 Crudet 2020 0.145 0.466 70 47 XUE 2020 0.146 0.466 70 47 XUE 2020 0.146 0.466 70 47 XUE 2020 0.048 0.552 49 54 Karadaniz 2020 0.168 0.227 73 48 Karadaniz 2020 0.048 0.628 75 150 Guidara 2020 0.048 0.628 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.038 0.870 37 33 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.228 75 49 Kamalzadeniz 2020 0.048 0.628 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.228 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.000 24 36 Kanadaniz 2020 0.048 0.552 49 54 Kanadaniz 2020 0.048 0.628 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.000 24 36 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.020 47 48 Kanadaniz 2020 0.048 0.628 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.000 24 36 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.000 24 36 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.000 174 173 Kanada 2021 0.048 0.000 174 173 Kanada 2022 0.048 0.000 24 36 Guidara 2021 0.048 0.000 174 173 Kanada 2022 0.048 0.000 24 36 Kanadaniz 2021 0.048 0.000 174 173 Kanada 2022 0.048 0.000 24 36 Kanada 2021 0.048 0.000 174 173 Kanada 2022 0.048 0.000 174 173 Ka	Baghai	2018	-0,619	0,001	100	104	
Pilla 2018 0.380 0.000 186 250 Erko 2018 0.468 0.002 94 152 Petrox-B 2018 0.468 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 -0.188 0.400 204 206 Hu 2019 -0.111 0.439 99 99 99 Wagner 2019 -0.218 0.182 130 81 Hu 2019 -0.218 0.182 130 81 Su-AB 2019 -0.218 0.182 130 81 Su-AB 2019 -0.218 0.182 120 80 Su-AB 2019 -0.218 0.182 20 0.00 Platzor 2020 -0.445 0.456 70 47 XUE 2020 -0.458 0.582 247 74 48 Karadeniz 2020 -0.468 0.582 247 248 44 Mehrabani 2021 -0.499 0.000 174 173 111	Petrov-D	2018	-0,120	0,005	11	12	
Enko 2018 0.408 0.002 94 152 Petrov-B 2018 2.483 0.000 30 30 Mendoza 2018 2.483 0.000 30 30 Hu 2019 0.118 0.498 99 99 Hu 2019 0.111 0.439 99 99 Sub-D 2019 0.035 0.814 92 89 Sub-D 2019 0.035 0.814 92 89 Sub-D 2019 0.136 0.288 195 89 Elidan 2019 0.036 0.877 75 48 Grudet 2020 -1.041 0.002 20 20 20 Petrov-B 2020 -0.048 0.877 75 48 Grudet 2020 -0.048 0.852 48 54 Grudet 2020 -0.048 0.552 48 54 Grudet 2020 -0.048 0.552 47 48 Grudet 2020 -0.048 0.552 247 248 Eanaloglu 2020 -0.048 0.552 247 248 Grudet 2020 -0.048 0.552 247 248 Eanaloglu 2020 -0.048 0.552 247 248 Eanaloglu 2020 -0.048 0.552 44 54 Grudet 2020 -0.048 0.552 54 54 Grudet 2022 -0.286 0.000 24 36 Grudet 2022 -0.286 0.000 24 36 Grudet 2022 -0.286 0.000 24 36 Grudet 2022 -0.286 0.000 25 5810 Huang-a 2022 -0.286 0.000 25 5810 Huang-a 2022 -0.286 0.000 25 24 Jirakran 2022 -0.286 0.000 25 24 Jirakran 2022 -0.286 0.000 25 24 Huang-a 2022 -0.286 0.000 35 44 Grudet 2022 -0.286 0.000 35 44 Huang-a 2022 -0.28	Pilla	2018	0,390	0,000	186	250	
Performental 2018 0,085 0,106 13 12 Mendoza 2018 -0,118 0,090 204 206 Hu 2019 -0,218 0,162 130 81 Hu 2019 -0,218 0,162 130 81 Hu 2019 0,038 0,870 37 37 Su-8-B 2019 0,035 0,814 92 89 Eldan 2019 0,372 0,189 22 30 Okasha-a 2020 -0,145 0,466 70 48 Su-202 -0,168 0,532 48 54 Grudet 2020 -0,118 0,532 48 54 Grudet 2020 -0,118 0,532 48 54 Su-202 -0,168 0,532 48 54 Grudet 2020 -0,168 0,532 48 54 Su-202 -0,168 0,532 48 54 Grudet 2020 -0,168 0,535 75 150 Grudet 2020 -0,268 0,000 24 36 Grudet 2021 -0,068 0,000 24 36 Grudet 2022 -0,264 0,605 56 10 Grudet 2022 -0,264 0,605 56 10 Grudet 2022 -0,264 0,605 55 10 Grudet 2022 -0,266 0,000 25 25 24 Grudet 2022 -0,264 0,605 55 10 Grudet	Enko	2018	0,408	0.002	94	152	│ │ │ ■ <u></u> │ │ │
Auguro 2010 2.010 0.000 304 306 Mendoza 2018 -0.1111 0.439 99 99 99 Hu 2018 -0.213 0.62 130 61 Hu 2018 -0.033 0.870 37 37 Su-B 2019 0.033 0.870 37 37 Su-D 2018 0.136 0.288 195 88 Eldan 2019 0.136 0.228 195 88 Eldan 2019 -0.141 0.002 20 20 Platzer 2020 -0.206 0.287 75 48 Grudet 2020 -0.448 0.592 247 248 Karadeniz 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Karadeniz 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Karadeniz 2020 0.048 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.076 0.593 75 150 0.100 100	Petrov-B Algul b	2018	0,665	0,106	13	12	
Hu 2019 -0.111 0.439 93 99 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90 90	Mendoza	2018	-0.168	0.090	204	206	
Wagner 2019 -0.218 0.162 130 61 Hui 2019 -0.035 0.814 92 89 Su-a-B 2019 0.035 0.814 92 89 Eidan 2019 0.372 0.189 22 30 Okasha-a 2020 -1.041 0.002 20 20 Platzer 2020 -0.145 0.466 70 47 XUE 2020 -0.145 0.466 70 47 Kuradeniz 2020 -0.145 0.466 70 47 Kuradeniz 2020 -0.145 0.456 75 48 Grudel 2020 -0.185 0.352 48 54 Grudel 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Eenatogiu 2020 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unier-b 2022 -1.286 0.000 124 27 Kana 2022 -0.	Hu	2019	-0,111	0,439	99	99	-=+
rrui 2019 -0.038 0.870 37 37 Su-B-B 2019 0.035 0.814 92 89 Su-b-D 2019 0.136 0.288 195 89 Elcian 2019 0.372 0.169 22 30 Okasha-a 2020 -1.041 0.002 20 20 Platzer 2020 -0.145 0.456 70 47 XUE 2020 -0.206 0.267 75 48 Grudel 2020 -0.185 0.352 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.046 0.592 247 248 Mehrabani 2021 0.0383 0.123 33 33 Grudel 2021 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0.0383 0.123 33 33 Kennedy 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.096 0.001 24 27 Kian 2022 -0.787 0.000 174 173 Kennedy 2021 -0.098 0.001 24 27 Kian 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Shapiro 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0.266 0.861 88 89 Huang-a 2022 -0.266 0.861 88 89 Pediction Interval Prediction Interval Prediction Interval Huang-a 2022 -0.268 0.000 25 25 Jiakran 2022 -0.268 0.000 25 25 Jiakran 2022 -0.260 0.361 135 - 34 Rheenen 2022 -0.260 0.861 88 89 Prediction Interval Prediction Interval Huang-a 2022 -0.260 0.363 0.152 55 22 Prediction Interval Huang-a 2022 -0.260 0.364 0.363 43 Chesha-b 2022 -0.260 0.364 0.36 43 Chesha-b 2022 -0.260 0.36 43 Chesha-b 2022 -0.260 0.36 43 Chesha-b 2022 -0.260 0.364 0.364 0.369 43 Chesha-b 2022 -0.260 0.364 0.364 43 Chesha-b 2022	Wagner	2019	-0,218	0,162	130	61	−∎∱
Sub-D 2019 0.372 0.014 52 69 Eidan 2019 0.372 0.189 22 30 Okasha-a 2020 -0.145 0.456 75 48 Pister 2020 -0.145 0.456 75 48 Grudet 2020 -0.185 0.352 48 54 Grudet 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.0464 0.592 247 248 Enarolyu 2020 0.0464 0.592 247 248 Stanta 0.201 0.076 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.076 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unier-b 2022 -0	Hui Su a B	2019	-0,038	0,870	37	37	
Eldan 2019 0.372 0.160 22 30 Okasha-a 2020 -1,1041 0.002 20 20 Pitter 2020 -0.145 0.466 70 47 XUE 2020 -0.166 0.527 75 48 Grudet 2020 -0.166 0.528 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.046 0.592 247 248 Esnafoglu 2020 -1.662 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0.076 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.089 0.000 174 173 Karnatzafeh 2021 -0.099 0.000 174 173 Karnatzafeh 2021 -0.099 0.000 174 173 Karnatzafeh 2021 -0.099 0.000 174 173 Karnatzafeh 2021 -0.098 0.011 24 27 Khan 2022 -1.266 0.000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0.767 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.767 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.767 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.767 0.000 135 43 Shapiro 2022 0.026 0.861 88 99 Asian 2022 0.026 0.861 90 30 Asian 2022 0.026 0.861 308 90 Asian 2022 0.026	Su-a-D Su-b-D	2019	0.136	0,288	195	89	
Okasha-a 2020 -1,041 0,002 20 20 Platzar 2020 -0,145 0,456 70 47 XUE 2020 -0,206 0,287 75 48 Grudet 2020 -0,185 0,352 48 54 Karadeni2 2020 -0,186 0,352 48 54 Karadeni2 2020 -0,186 0,943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0,048 0,959 247 248 Esnarboglu 2021 -0,048 0,593 75 150 Guidara 2021 -0,048 0,713 117 117 Unler-a 2022 -1,266 0,000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Unler-b 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,266 0,861 88 89 Huang-a 2022	Eidan	2019	0,372	0,189	22	30	│ │ ↓ ∔■─ │ │
Priatzer 2020 -0,145 0,456 70 47 XUE 2020 -0,206 0,267 75 48 Grudet 2020 -0,185 0,352 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 0,016 0,943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0,016 0,943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0,016 0,943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 -1,620 0,000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0,076 0,593 75 150 Guidara 2021 -0,048 0,713 117 117 Unier-a 2022 -1,266 0,000 24 36 Outer-b 2022 -1,244 0,000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0,767 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,264 0,402 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0,363 0,152 55 42 Huang-a 2022 0,	Okasha-a	2020	-1,041	0,002	20	20	│ ┼╼─_│ │ │
Cuc 2020 -0.600 0.207 7.9 49 Grudet 2020 -0.185 0.352 48 54 Karadeniz 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Enaroglu 2020 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 -0.649 0.000 174 173 Kamalzadeh 2021 -0.999 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unier-a 2022 -1.266 0.000 24 36 Unier-b 2022 -1.244 0.000 45 36 Kasak 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Kasak 2022 -0.204 0.042 134 108 Kasak 2022 -0.204 0.042 134 108 Kasak 2022 -0.266 35 34 Khana 2022 0.369	Platzer	2020	-0,145	0,456	70	47	
Characteritz 0.1000 0.001 37 33 Chen 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Esnafoglu 2020 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0.076 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 -0.499 0.000 174 173 Kennedy 2021 -0.0499 0.000 174 173 Kennedy 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unler-b 2022 -1.286 0.000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.264 0.048 35 43 Shapiro 2022 0.264 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0.266 0.881 88 89 Jirakran 2023 0.369	Grudet	2020	-0,200	0,267	75 48	48 54	
Chen 2020 0.016 0.943 40 40 Islam-b 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Esnaroglu 2020 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0.076 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 -0.499 0.000 174 173 Kamalzadeh 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Unler-b 2022 -1.286 0.000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 36 Aziz 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Kasak 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.266 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0	Karadeniz	2020	0,308	0,204	37	33	│ │ ै┼┱─ │ │
Islam-b 2020 0.048 0.592 247 248 Esnafoglu 2020 -1.620 0.000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0.076 0.593 75 150 Guidara 2021 0.383 0.123 33 33 Kamalzadeh 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unler-b 2022 -1.246 0.000 24 36 Unler-b 2022 -1.246 0.000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Kasak 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0.266 0.851 88 89 Huang-a 2022 -0.266 0.000 25 525 Jirakran 2022 -0.266 0.000 35 43 Rheenen 2023 -0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 -0.479 0.000 13541 3692	Chen	2020	0,016	0,943	40	40	-+-
Esharangu 2020 -1,620 0,000 89 43 Mehrabani 2021 0,076 0,593 75 150 Guidara 2021 0,499 0,000 174 173 Kanatzadeh 2021 -0,049 0,0174 173 Kanatzadeh 2021 -0,048 0,713 117 117 Unler-a 2022 -1,246 0,000 24 36 Unler-b 2022 -0,996 0,001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0,996 0,001 24 27 Kasak 2022 -0,996 0,001 124 27 Kasak 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,264 0,042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0,264 0,042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0,266 0,000 35 43 Aslan 2022 -0,266 0,000 35 43 Huang-a 2022 -0,270 0,050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 -0,479 0,050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 -0,270 -0,000 13541 13692 Prediction Interval -0,270 -0,000 13541 -13692	Islam-b	2020	0,048	0,592	247	248	▏▁▁▁▁ ᢪ
Guidara 2021 0.0175 0.000 174 173 Kamalzadeh 2021 -0.499 0.000 174 173 Quessada 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unler-b 2022 -1.286 0.000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -1.286 0.000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -1.286 0.000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 khan 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Jirakran 2023 0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0.369 0.000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 0.3	∟snaiogiu Mehrabani	2020	-1,620	0,000	89 75	43 150	
Kamalzadeh 2021 -0.499 0.000 174 173 Kennedy 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.098 0.618 55 47 Unler-a 2022 -1.266 0.000 24 36 Aziz 2022 -1.244 0.000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0.996 0.001 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.0787 0.000 100 100 Kasak 2022 -0.375 0.108 39 36 Aslan 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.866 0.000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 0.479 0.650 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0.363 0.152 55 22 Pooied -0.270 -0.000	Guidara	2021	0,383	0,123	33	33	│ │ ↓ │ │
Kennady 2021 -0.099 0.618 55 47 Quessada 2021 -0.048 0.713 117 117 Unier-a 2022 -1.286 0.000 24 36 Unier-b 2022 -1.244 0.000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0.996 0.001 100 100 Kasak 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Kasak 2022 -0.375 0.108 39 36 Asian 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.266 0.881 89 Huang-a 2022 0.866 0.000 35 43 Okasha-b 2022 0.669 0.50 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0.479 0.500 35 34 Pooled -0.270 -0.200 13541 13692	Kamalzadeh	2021	-0,499	0,000	174	173	-=
Cuessadua 2021 -0,045 0,713 117 117 Unler-a 2022 -1,246 0,000 24 36 Unler-b 2022 -1,244 0,000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0,996 0,001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,375 0,108 39 36 Aslan 2022 -0,264 0,042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0,264 0,000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0,479 0,050 35 34 Okasha-b 2022 0,869 0,000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0,479 0,050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0,363 0,152 55 22 Prooled -0,270 0,000 13541 13692	Kennedy	2021	-0,099	0,618	55	47	
Unler-b 2022 -1,244 0,000 45 36 Aziz 2022 -0,996 0,001 24 27 Khan 2022 -0,787 0,000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0,375 0,108 39 36 Aslan 2022 -0,264 0,042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0,264 0,881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0,266 0,881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0,369 0,000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0,479 0,500 35 34 Rheenen 2023 -0,270 0,000 13541 13692 Prediction Interval -0,270 -0,000 13541 13692	Quessada Unier-a	2021	-0,048	0,713	117 24	117	
Aziz 2022 -0.996 0.001 24 27 khan 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.401 0.000 6005 5810 Kasak 2022 -0.375 0.108 39 36 Aslan 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 -0.266 0.861 88 89 Huang-a 2022 -0.896 0.000 35 43 Okasha-b 2022 -3.669 0.000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenesn 2023 0.363 0.152 55 22 Provide -0.270 -0.000 13541 13692 Prediction Interval -0.270 -3.00 -1.50 0.00 1.50 3.00	Unler-b	2022	-1,244	0.000	45	36	
khan 2022 -0.787 0.000 100 100 Wei 2022 -0.401 0.000 6005 5810 Kasak 2022 -0.375 0.108 39 36 Asian 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0.896 0.000 35 43 Okasha-b 2022 0.669 0.000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0.363 0.152 65 22 Pooled -0.270 0.270 13541 13692	Aziz	2022	-0,996	0,001	24	27	│ ┼─━─│ │ │
Wei 2022 -0.401 0.000 6005 5810 Kasak 2022 -0.375 0.108 39 36 Aslan 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0.869 0.000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 -0.479 0.050 35 34 Prooled -0.270 0.000 13541 13692	khan	2022	-0,787	0,000	100	100	
Natsain 2022 -0.3/5 0.108 39 36 Asian 2022 -0.264 0.042 134 108 Shapiro 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Huang-a 2022 0.026 0.881 88 89 Muang-a 2022 0.896 0.000 25 43 Okasha-b 2022 3.669 0.000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0.363 0.152 55 22 Pooled -0.270 0.000 13541 13692	Wei	2022	-0,401	0,000	6005	5810	
Justim Zu22 OLZY OLY	nasak Aslan	2022	-0,375	0,108	39	36	
Huang-a 2022 0,896 0,000 35 43 Okasha-b 2022 3,669 0,000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0,479 0,050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0,363 0,152 55 22 Pooled -0,270 0,000 13541 13692 Prediction Interval -0,270 -3,00 -1,50 0,00 1,50 3,00	Shapiro	2022	0.026	0.861	88	89	
Okasha-b 2022 3,669 0,000 25 25 Jirakran 2023 -0,479 0,050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 -0,270 0,000 13541 13692 Prediction Interval -0,270 0,000 13541 13692 -1,50 0,000 1,50 3,00	Huang-a	2022	0,896	0,000	35	43	
Jirakran 2023 -0.479 0.050 35 34 Rheenen 2023 0.363 0.152 55 22 Pooled -0.270 0.000 13541 13692 Prediction Interval -0.270 -3,00 -1,50 0,00 1,50 3,00	Okasha-b	2022	3,669	0,000	25	25	_ →
Citizenteri 2023 0,303 0,152 35 22 Pooled -0,270 0,000 13541 13692 -1,50 0,000 1,50 3,00 Prediction Interval -0,270 -3,00 -1,50 0,000 1,50 3,00	Jirakran Rhaasaa	2023	-0,479	0,050	35	34	
Prediction Interval -0,270 -3,00 -1,50 0,00 1,50 3,00	Pooled	2023	0,363 _0.270	0,152	55 13541	13692	
	Prediction Interval		-0,270	2,000		Jugar	
Healthy Constant - Better						-3	3,00 -1,50 0,00 1,50 3,00
							Healthy Castrol D-C C

LPANTIOX

49

50

Figure 4: The forest plot of lipid-associated antioxidants (LPANTIOX) in patients with major depression and bipolar disorder as compared to healthy controls.

o		a		-		
Study name	Year	Statistics for Std diff	each study	Samp	le size Healthy	Std diff in means and 95% Cl
		in means	p-Value	Patients	Control	
Olusi	1996	-0,570	0,000	100	100	
Fadillioglu Bilici	2000 2001	0,103 1 367	0,855	8 15	8	
Kuloglu	2002	3,236	0,000	23	20	
Ozcan	2003	1,144	0,000	30	21	│ │ │ ──■┼─ │
Ranjekar Sellev	2003	0,342	0,407	10	21	
Sarandol-b	2006	1,113	0,000	86	36	
Andreazza-b	2007	0,987	0,000	28	32	│ │ ─■ ┤ │
Sarandol-c	2007	0,776	0,000	96	54	
Vieira	2007	2,217	0,000	23	30	
Kunz	2008	1,560	0,000	28	32	
Kodydkova	2009	0,037	0,877	35	35	
Vang-B	2009	0,895	0,019	15	15	
Vang-D Balecki	2009	0,528	0,105	50	30	
ager	2010	0,706	0,000	73	72	
ksoy	2010	1,247	0,000	30	30	
Maes-b Sadeobi	2010	0,634	0,005	53	34	
Kotan	2011	0.059	0,045	50	44	
lukreet	2011	0,738	0,000	100	52	
an-B	2011	2,203	0,000	39	30	
;an-D (apczinski,₽	2011	2,169	0,000	32	30	
apoziniski-D	2011	3,203 0.955	0,000	20	80	
hodake	2012	0,871	0,001	30	30	
Bal	2012	0,901	0,000	42	38	
stefanescu	2012	1,293	0,001	16 37	20	
/lagalhaes-B	2012	1,462	0,000	82	94	
/lagalhaes-D	2012	-0,802	0,000	82	94	
zzaher	2012	0,640	0,000	90	92	
romara Rawdin	2012	1,616 -0.064	0,000	28	19	
Rybka	2013	1,635	0,000	15	19	
laes-h	2013	1,013	0,000	113	28	│ │ ∎_ │ │
Baek (2013	0,296	0,063	80	80	
rargas Subert	2013	0,010	0,950	12	12	
ndreazza-c	2013	0,484	0,142	16	26	
iousa	2014	-0,363	0,207	29	22	
Spanemberg	2014	-0,101	0,725	17	54	
rersace Baipai	2014	1.945	0,614	24 60	40	
Cudney	2014	0,306	0,185	52	30	
ydemir	2014	1,122	0,000	51	50	
Sarandol-a	2015	0,220	0,505	15	25	
iuncel-c	2015	1 018	0,008	23 18	18	
Bengesser	2015	-0,224	0,131	113	78	
limen	2015	0,938	0,041	18	18	│ │ │ │
lautmann	2015	0,641	0,002	49	49	
Scolaa	2015	-0,292	0,120	16	13	
liwek	2016	0,826	0,000	43	50	
sai-b	2016	0,483	0,077	21	40	
∠amκuπ-a Ivsasharion	2016	3,393	0,000	29	33	
)glodek	2017	2,354	0,000	30	20	
howdhury	2017	0,545	0,005	55	55	
lewton	2017	-0,250	0,361	29	25	
Xigun Samkurt-b	2017	-0.184	0,000	33	37	
Indqvist	2017	0,375	0,061	47	55	│ ────── │ ──│
eylan	2018	-0,017	0,939	32	51	
amiz slam-a	2018	0,324 1.436	0,083	247	248	
ordan	2018	0,325	0,249	18	43	
ucma-a-B	2018	0,803	0,000	133	50	
ucma-a-D	2018	0,842	0,000	114	50	
ucifia-b lu	2018	-0.080	0,000	57 99	99	
laes-k	2019	0,631	0,009	96	22	
aytan	2019	-0,313	0,451	12	12	╎──■┼──││
laes	2019	0,069	0,680	105	54	
imeon-b-BD	2019	0.758	0.004	33	49 30	
imeon-b-D	2020	0,720	0,003	44	30	
lamolhoda	2020	0.401	0,112	22	58	│ _ ┼▰─ │ │
amed	2020	-0,647	0,001	60 29	60	
lehrabani	2020	-1.080	0,000	∠o 75	150	
uidara	2021	0,245	0,352	33	33	
imeon-BD	2021	0,610	0,020	27	35	
imeon-D	2021	0,735	0,001	47	35	
nopra atrencikova	2021	0,521 -0.449	0,019	42	42 20	
pankovic	2022	0,431	0,134	39	18	
lvarez-Mon	2022	0,829	0,006	30	20	
liniksar	2022	1,123	0,000	42	38	│ │ <u></u> ──■┤ │
See Long a	2023	0,515	0,035	35	34	
irakran ooled		0.731	(14)(10)	45.48	4189 I	
rakran ooled rediction Interval		0,731 0,731	0,000	4538	4189	

LPOSTOX

51

Figure 5: The forest plot of lipid-associated oxidative stress toxicity (LPANTIOX) in patients with major depression and bipolar disorder as compared to healthy controls.



Autoimmunity

Almulla et al, 2023

Figure 6: Forest plot of autoimmune responses to lipid-peroxidation neoepitopes in patients with major depression and bipolar disorder as compared to healthy controls.



Figure 7: Summary of the role of reverse cholesterol transport (RCT), decreased lipid antioxidants and increased lipid peroxidation in the pathophysiology of major depression and bipolar disorder

54