

State-Level Excess Mortality in US Adults During the Delta and Omicron Waves of COVID-19.

Benjamin Renton, BA

Chengan Du, PhD

Alexander Junxiang Chen

Shu-Xia Li, PhD

Zhenqiu Lin, PhD

Harlan M. Krumholz MD, SM

Jeremy Samuel Faust, MD MS (corresponding author)

623 words

1 table, 6 references

***10 Vining Street**

Boston, MA 02115

jsfaust@gmail.com

Abstract

Introduction

The US has continued to see excess mortality through the Delta and Omicron periods. We sought to quantify excess mortality on a state level and calculate potential deaths averted if all states matched the excess mortality rates of those with the 10 lowest excess mortality rates.

Methods

Observational cohort, US and state-level data. Expected monthly deaths were modeled using pre-pandemic US and state-level data (2015-2020). Mortality data was accessed from CDC public reporting.

Results

We find that during the Delta and Omicron waves, the US recorded over 596,000 excess deaths. 60% of the nation's total excess mortality during these periods could have been averted if all states had excess mortality rates equal to those with the 10 lowest excess mortality rates.

Conclusion

With large differences in excess mortality across US states in this 15-month study period, we note that a significant portion of deaths could have been averted with higher vaccination rates, improved mitigation policies, and adherence to other behaviors.

Introduction

The US has recorded substantial all-cause excess mortality during the COVID-19 pandemic.¹ States had varying policies and strategies to address the pandemic. States also varied in their excess mortality, a metric that takes into account baseline health risks by determining how their pandemic mortality compared with their predicted mortality. While vaccination rates likely played an important role, other characteristics likely also influenced any detected differences.^{2,3}

Accordingly, we quantified state-level excess deaths and estimated the number of excess deaths that could have potentially been averted if all US states had excess death rates matching the 10 US states with the lowest excess death rates during the SARS-CoV-2 variant era (i.e., the Delta and Omicron periods).

Methods

We applied seasonal autoregressive integrated moving average (sARIMA) models to monthly all-cause death data from the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention and state population counts (2014-2020) to create monthly population and expected death estimates for the study period (July 1, 2021-September 30, 2022), correcting for population losses due to cumulative pandemic-associated excess deaths.^{4,5} Excess deaths were defined as observed minus expected deaths.

For each state, we modeled three age groups of adults (18-49, 50-64, and ≥ 65 years), which were then combined, creating composite excess mortality estimate. The study assessed five three-month periods based on dominant variants in sequence surveillance; July 1-September 30, 2021 (Early Delta), October 1-December 31, 2021 (Late Delta/Early Omicron), January 1-March 31, 2022 (Omicron BA.1), April 1-June 30, 2022 (Omicron BA.2), July 1-September 30, 2022 (Omicron BA.5). For each period and age group, we determined the ten states with the lowest and highest excess mortality. The number of potential excess deaths averted (had all states recorded excess mortality rates observed among the ten with the lowest rates) was computed for each period and age group, and summed for an all-US adult estimate.^{6,7}

Analyses were conducted with R version 4.0.3. This study used publicly available data and was not subject to institutional review approval per HHS regulation 45-CFR-46.101(c).

Results

During the Delta and Omicron periods, the US observed 596,173 (95% CI 514,861-677,486) excess deaths. The ten US states with the highest excess mortality had a combined excess mortality rate over five times the rate of the ten lowest excess mortality states (492.1 versus 93.9 per 100,000, Table). Had all states matched the excess death rate of the ten lowest excess mortality states, an estimated 356,009 excess deaths nationwide could potentially have been averted during the period, representing 60% of the nation's total contemporaneous excess

mortality. Excess deaths per 100,000 were higher during Early Delta (67.9), Late Delta/Early Omicron (61.9), and Omicron BA.1 (62.5) than during Omicron BA.2 (13.3) and Omicron BA.5 (24.7) (Table).

Excess deaths per 100,000 people varied widely among states, from 80.6 per (North Dakota) to 479.8 (West Virginia) overall and within periods (Table). Among states with higher excess mortality than the 10 lowest excess mortality states, the percent of excess deaths that could have potentially been averted ranged from 36% (Maryland) to 78% (West Virginia).

Discussion

There were vast differences in excess mortality across US states during from July 2021-September 2022. By using the top quintile of US states as best-case scenario benchmarks, estimates for deaths potentially averted represent results that would be achievable in other states. Vaccination rates may explain some of the observed differences (Table), but jurisdiction-level policies and other behaviors also likely contributed.

Strengths of this observational study include using excess mortality rather than COVID-19 mortality, which provides better assessments of state-level performance by minimizing coding biases and including all deaths potentially modified by the pandemic. In addition, the focus on excess mortality (i.e., changes from baseline expected deaths), inherently takes existing risk differences across states into account. Study limitations include use of provisional mortality data and lack of information on causality.

References

1. Woolf SH, Chapman DA, Sabo RT, Zimmerman EB. Excess Deaths From COVID-19 and Other Causes in the US, March 1, 2020, to January 2, 2021. *JAMA*. 2021;325(17):1786-1789. doi:10.1001/jama.2021.5199
2. Bilinski A, Thompson K, Emanuel E. COVID-19 and Excess All-Cause Mortality in the US and 20 Comparison Countries, June 2021-March 2022. *JAMA*. 2023;329(1):92-94. doi:10.1001/jama.2022.21795
3. Watson OJ, Barnsley G, Toor J, Hogan AB, Winskill P, Ghani AC. Global impact of the first year of COVID-19 vaccination: a mathematical modelling study. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases*. 2022;0(0). doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(22)00320-6
4. Faust JS, Du C, Liang C, et al. Excess Mortality in Massachusetts During the Delta and Omicron Waves of COVID-19. *JAMA*. 2022;328(1):74-76. doi:10.1001/jama.2022.8045
5. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Provisional Mortality Statistics, CDC WONDER. Accessed December 6, 2022. <https://wonder.cdc.gov/mcd-icd10.html>

6. Bilinski A, Thompson K, Emanuel E. COVID-19 and Excess All-Cause Mortality in the US and 20 Comparison Countries, June 2021-March 2022. *JAMA*. Published online November 18, 2022. doi:10.1001/jama.2022.21795
7. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. COVID Data Tracker. Published March 28, 2020. Accessed December 6, 2022. <https://covid.cdc.gov/covid-data-tracker>

Author Contributions: Dr. Faust and Mr. Renton had full access to all of the data in the study and takes responsibility for the integrity of the data and the accuracy of the data analysis.

Concept and design: Faust, Du, Krumholz, Renton.

Acquisition, analysis, or interpretation of data: All authors.

Drafting of the manuscript: Renton, Faust.

Critical revision of the manuscript for important intellectual content: All authors.

Statistical analysis: Faust, Du, Li, Lin, Renton.

Administrative, technical, or material support: Faust, Du, Lin.

Supervision: Faust, Krumholz.

Data visualization: Renton.

Conflict of Interest Disclosures: Dr. Krumholz reported receiving consulting fees from UnitedHealth, Element Science, Aetna, Reality Labs, F-Prime, and Tesseract/4Catalyst; serving as an expert witness for Martin/Baughman law firm, Arnold and Porter law firm, and Siegfried and Jensen law firm; being a cofounder of Hugo Health, a personal health information platform; being a cofounder of Refactor Health, an enterprise health care, artificial intelligence-augmented data management company; receiving contracts from the Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services through Yale New Haven Hospital to develop and maintain performance measures that are publicly reported; and receiving grants from Johnson & Johnson outside the submitted work. No other disclosures were reported.

Table

State	Percent Fully Vaccinated					Excess Deaths per 100,000					Deaths Averted, Number (%)						
	Early Delta	Late Delta/Early Omicron	Omicron BA.1	Omicron BA.2	Omicron BA.5	Early Delta	Late Delta/Early Omicron	Omicron BA.1	Omicron BA.2	Omicron BA.5	Total	Early Delta	Late Delta/Early Omicron	Omicron BA.1	Omicron BA.2	Omicron BA.5	Total
10 states with highest excess mortality	52	66	68	73	77	141.2	136.9	128	30.2	55.9	492.1	64194 (84%)	25144 (70%)	27213 (60%)	7204 (114%)	14328 (80%)	138082 (76%)
West Virginia	45	48	65	66	67	121.3	164.2	123	26.8	44.6	479.8	1402 (82%)	1762 (76%)	1129 (65%)	438 (136%)	537 (86%)	5268 (78%)
Mississippi	38	54	59	62	63	152.6	55.2	108.6	11.1	40.5	36.8	2993 (87%)	449 (36%)	1604 (65%)	344 (137%)	745 (89%)	6135 (74%)
Oklahoma	49	59	65	68	69	123.8	76.6	111.4	18.5	37.6	36.8	3158 (84%)	1281 (55%)	2277 (67%)	686 (122%)	1007 (88%)	8409 (79%)
New Mexico	67	76	77	80	82	69.7	147.8	94.8	26.7	22	361.1	792 (70%)	1808 (75%)	897 (58%)	490 (110%)	197 (110%)	4184 (73%)
Kentucky	54	64	65	67	68	108.7	94	92.8	24.6	27	347.1	3079 (81%)	2035 (62%)	1917 (59%)	1004 (117%)	778 (82%)	8813 (73%)
Alaska	54	63	68	73	74	93.4	130.5	56.3	28.7	31.2	340.1	414 (80%)	546 (76%)	130 (42%)	179 (114%)	153 (89%)	1422 (76%)
Tennessee	44	56	62	64	65	118.9	76.6	98.8	13	32	339.2	5345 (83%)	2241 (54%)	3335 (62%)	931 (132%)	1491 (85%)	13343 (72%)
Alabama	41	52	58	61	62	139.4	59.1	98.3	10.1	27.3	334.2	4560 (85%)	881 (39%)	2297 (61%)	550 (141%)	861 (82%)	9149 (71%)
Arkansas	43	56	61	64	65	120.5	59.2	84.1	22.4	34	320	2333 (83%)	540 (39%)	1067 (54%)	620 (118%)	677 (89%)	5237 (70%)
Montana	53	59	64	66	67	88.9	134.3	54.4	6.9	33.6	318	578 (76%)	829 (72%)	92 (51%)	104 (126%)	239 (82%)	1841 (74%)
Wyoming	44	52	58	61	61	96.8	131.7	40.2	19.3	24.5	312.5	343 (78%)	429 (72%)	48 (51%)	106 (121%)	86 (77%)	1011 (76%)
South Carolina	48	57	63	66	67	109.8	65.5	79.9	13.9	34	303.2	3683 (81%)	1183 (43%)	1674 (50%)	760 (130%)	1204 (84%)	8504 (67%)
Louisiana	45	56	62	64	65	144.7	38.8	76.1	16.5	26.7	302.8	4423 (86%)	338 (67%)	1385 (51%)	659 (116%)	781 (82%)	7586 (77%)
Arizona	53	62	67	70	72	69.1	110.9	71.9	19	28.6	299.4	2841 (70%)	4400 (67%)	1954 (46%)	1373 (122%)	1386 (81%)	11954 (67%)
Florida	56	68	74	76	78	146	36.2	57.1	14.2	31.3	284.7	21952 (85%)	356 (33%)	2705 (31%)	3321 (130%)	4493 (80%)	32827 (79%)
Ohio	55	61	65	68	68	51.7	123.2	83	5.5	18.9	282.3	2825 (60%)	7947 (70%)	4044 (53%)	575 (170%)	1267 (73%)	16658 (65%)
Maine	72	79	85	87	89	41	107.1	59.2	36.9	37.5	281.7	183 (49%)	740 (62%)	159 (29%)	460 (112%)	345 (83%)	1887 (64%)
Oregon	64	72	76	78	79	83.2	68.6	57.4	31.8	37.9	278.9	2130 (75%)	1105 (47%)	636 (32%)	1231 (113%)	1117 (86%)	6219 (65%)
Georgia	47	56	62	65	66	112.2	52	72.8	14.1	26.2	277.4	7736 (83%)	1594 (37%)	3220 (53%)	1514 (128%)	1888 (86%)	15951 (69%)
Idaho	48	56	62	65	66	84.5	107.7	50.7	4.4	29.8	277.1	909 (76%)	1032 (67%)	174 (26%)	161 (129%)	361 (84%)	2637 (67%)
Nevada	53	62	68	71	72	86.4	74.1	73.6	13.2	19.1	266.4	1653 (77%)	987 (53%)	900 (56%)	433 (131%)	370 (77%)	4343 (68%)
Missouri	49	58	63	65	66	89.4	63	79.8	14.3	19.6	266.1	3291 (77%)	1239 (45%)	1984 (52%)	883 (129%)	649 (67%)	8047 (64%)
Vermont	76	80	85	87	89	70.5	64.8	49	40.4	37.7	262.4	248 (69%)	133 (40%)	50 (47%)	229 (111%)	162 (84%)	822 (69%)
Texas	53	63	69	72	73	101.4	44.3	68.9	13.2	26.6	254.4	18557 (82%)	3009 (30%)	8329 (54%)	3828 (129%)	5273 (88%)	38996 (69%)
Kansas	53	63	68	72	73	59.9	72.6	88.3	8.7	22.5	252	882 (66%)	832 (52%)	1130 (58%)	276 (126%)	434 (79%)	3554 (62%)
Delaware	61	69	75	78	80	40.7	64.8	86.4	30	26.9	248.8	148 (46%)	206 (40%)	352 (51%)	274 (114%)	167 (77%)	1146 (58%)
Michigan	58	63	67	69	70	32.5	114	57	11.6	19.7	234.8	911 (36%)	6104 (68%)	1417 (32%)	1244 (136%)	1148 (74%)	10824 (59%)
Indiana	50	60	63	65	67	58.7	84.7	66.6	0	23.6	233.6	2012 (66%)	2594 (59%)	1501 (50%)	239 (128%)	1004 (76%)	7350 (61%)
United States	57	66	72	75	76	67.9	61.9	62.5	13.3	24.7	230.2	123376 (70%)	69597 (43%)	65907 (41%)	45020 (131%)	52109 (81%)	356009 (60%)
Pennsylvania	60	69	74	77	79	35.9	93.2	66.7	13	19.7	228.5	1601 (47%)	5579 (62%)	2748 (42%)	1978 (120%)	1607 (71%)	13513 (59%)
Virginia	63	72	78	82	83	50.4	64.7	65	17.2	29.9	227.2	2065 (61%)	2043 (47%)	1937 (44%)	1444 (124%)	1734 (85%)	9222 (60%)
North Carolina	52	60	67	69	72	78.5	57.2	48.7	12	29.8	226.2	4895 (74%)	1838 (38%)	778 (46%)	1367 (134%)	2130 (84%)	11008 (66%)
Illinois	57	64	74	77	78	44.2	60.3	69.4	17.7	27.5	219.2	2356 (55%)	2483 (42%)	3162 (47%)	2118 (123%)	2228 (83%)	12346 (58%)
Washington	67	73	79	82	83	60	49.1	42.7	22.8	35.2	209.8	2480 (67%)	945 (33%)	161 (50%)	1655 (117%)	1918 (88%)	7159 (67%)

Colorado	63	71	77	79	80	38.6	83.6	45.6	21.1	20.2	209.1	919 (51%)	2380 (61%)	551 (26%)	1171 (118%)	766 (83%)	5787 (59%)
Iowa	60	66	70	72	73	34	73.4	50.3	9.8	19	186.5	311 (49%)	906 (53%)	279 (23%)	318 (125%)	365 (69%)	2179 (48%)
Nebraska	61	68	72	74	75	36.1	69.1	58	2.1	19	184.2	224 (48%)	503 (50%)	309 (36%)	57 (164%)	210 (75%)	1303 (49%)
Utah	50	65	73	77	78	47.9	53.4	40.7	15.4	17.8	175.2	731 (64%)	547 (49%)	230 (26%)	458 (123%)	359 (83%)	2325 (59%)
New Hampshire	66	71	77	78	80	14.7	60.2	48.3	21.7	24.8	169.6		254 (45%)	91 (17%)	276 (136%)	206 (74%)	827 (52%)
Minnesota	64	70	76	79	80	23.7	76.8	40.6	12.6	15.4	169.1	149 (49%)	1810 (54%)	293 (39%)	731 (133%)	440 (137%)	3423 (65%)
California	61	70	77	81	82	42.9	37.4	46.4	12	28.2	166.9	739 (56%)	884 (37%)	3782 (32%)	4924 (133%)	7533 (86%)	24514 (61%)
Wisconsin	61	68	73	75	76	26.8	75.9	53.1	2	5.4	163.2	302 (30%)	1804 (52%)	642 (26%)	294 (169%)	216 (130%)	3257 (45%)
New York	66	76	83	86	88	25	42.8	51.2	12.8	18.2	150			1916 (30%)	2588 (32%)	1540 (337%)	6044 (64%)
South Dakota	58	65	69	72	74	32	68.8	53.2	-12.5	6.3	147.9	60 (50%)	218 (47%)	58 (45%)	35 (123%)	51 (117%)	423 (54%)
Hawaii	63	69	75	87	88	50.7	25.6	32.4	17.2	20.8	146.7	324 (58%)			238 (118%)	163 (68%)	726 (72%)
Massachusetts	72	79	84	86	88	19.1	40	43.2	18	2.5	145.3		494 (29%)	441 (23%)	1137 (118%)	1041 (77%)	3114 (53%)
Connecticut	72	80	85	87	89	20.3	35.2	51.1	12	9.2	127.7	63 (28%)	50 (15%)	330 (24%)	423 (128%)	145 (149%)	1013 (43%)
Maryland	68	76	81	84	86	20.8	34.1	51.9	1.6	6.6	114.9			631 (28%)	280 (133%)	172 (34%)	1083 (36%)
New Jersey	67	77	82	85	87	17.2	32.8	51.9	3.5	9.1	114.5			979 (28%)	489 (132%)	355 (150%)	1822 (45%)
10 states with lowest excess mortality	68	76	80	81	82	19.5	41.7	31.6	-3.8	6	94.9	Reference	Reference	Reference	Reference	Reference	Reference
Rhode Island	70	79	86	90	92	11.8	49.4	35.4	-9	-3.5	84.1	20 (40%)	64 (35%)	71 (44%)		37 (158%)	192 (46%)
District of Columbia	62	71	77	82	85	25.5	20.2	35.9	4.3	-4.4	81.5	68 (49%)		66 (31%)	63 (111%)		197 (48%)
North Dakota	50	55	64	65	67	13.2	67	20.4	-25.4	5.3	80.6	39 (64%)	193 (49%)	44 (74%)	64 (111%)	74 (110%)	414 (69%)

* Vaccination rates were calculated as the primary series completion rate on the first day of each period.