

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

COVID-19 vaccine equity and the right to health for displaced Venezuelans in Latin America

David C. Hill^{1*}, Zafiro Andrade-Romo¹, Karla Solari², Ellithia Adams¹, Lisa Forman¹, Daniel Grace¹, Alfonso Silva-Santisteban², Amaya Perez-Brumer¹

¹ Social and Behavioural Health Sciences Division, Dalla Lana School of Public Health, the University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada

² Unit of Health, Sexuality, and Human Development, Universidad Peruana Cayetano Heredia, Lima, Peru

*Corresponding author

Email: davidc.hill@mail.utoronto.ca

25 **Abstract**

26 Given the magnitude of Venezuelan displacement in Latin America, there is a need to assess how
27 migrants were, and will continue to be, addressed in COVID-19 vaccination policies. To explore
28 migration status as a dimension of vaccine equity in Latin America and in relation to
29 international human rights, we assessed national vaccination plans, peer-reviewed, and gray
30 literature published between January 2020 and June 2021. Three key rights-related concerns
31 were found to restrict the health rights of migrants in the region: 1) lack of prioritization of
32 migrants in vaccine distribution; 2) onerous documentation requirements to be eligible for
33 COVID-19 vaccination; and (3) how pervasive anti-migrant discrimination limited equitable
34 health care access. While international human rights law prohibits against discrimination based
35 on migration status, few countries analyzed realized their obligations to provide equal access to
36 COVID-19 vaccines to non-citizens, including displaced Venezuelans. Especially for migrants
37 and displaced people, effective and sustainable vaccination strategies for COVID-19 and future
38 pandemics in Latin America must be guided not only by epidemiological risk but also seek to
39 align with human rights obligations. To achieve this, States must also take special measures to
40 facilitate vaccine access for communities facing systemic discrimination, exclusion, and
41 marginalization.

42

44 **Introduction**

45 In January 2021, Dr. Tedros Adhanom Ghebreyesus, Director-General of the World Health
46 Organization (WHO), described the hoarding of COVID-19 vaccines by wealthy nations as a
47 “catastrophic moral failure” that would “only prolong the pandemic, the restrictions needed to
48 contain it, and human and economic suffering” [1]. Yet despite repeated calls for an equitable,
49 globally coordinated approach to COVID-19 vaccination, vaccine apartheid has been
50 unaddressed; as of March 2021, 78% of the 447 million doses were deployed in just ten countries
51 [2]. By August 2021, over half of all people were fully vaccinated in Canada, the United States,
52 the United Kingdom, and other Western countries, compared with just 11% in Latin America and
53 the Caribbean [3–6]. These gross disparities are poised to deepen as third and fourth doses are
54 increasingly recommended by governments and public health officials across North America and
55 Europe [7]. Within countries already at the end of the line for doses, marginalized communities
56 face additional barriers to access COVID-19 vaccines [8]. On both a global and a national scale,
57 policymakers are grappling with how to prioritize COVID-19 vaccination to slow pandemic
58 spread and protect the most vulnerable, including migrants.

59 Greater attention to migration status as a determinant of COVID-19 vaccine equity is urgently
60 needed. COVID-19 vaccine access has repeatedly been denied to migrants, particularly those
61 with irregular migration status, or those who entered a country without authorization or required
62 documentation and therefore lack access to basic rights, including health care [9,10]. By May
63 2022, out of 180 countries evaluated globally by the United Nations International Organization
64 for Migration, 39 countries excluded migrants with an irregular status from COVID-19
65 vaccination plans [11]. Yet, exclusion based on migration status violates international human
66 rights prohibitions against “discrimination of any kind”, including nationality or migration status,

67 raising important concerns regarding the health rights of migrants amid public health
68 emergencies [12]. Indeed, in 2000 the Committee on Economic, Cultural, and Social Rights
69 affirmed that “States are under the obligation to respect the right to health by, inter alia,
70 refraining from denying or limiting equal access for all persons, including prisoners or detainees,
71 minorities, asylum seekers and illegal immigrants, to preventive, curative and palliative health
72 services” [13].

73

74 By December 2021, more than 6 million Venezuelans fled the country due to political,
75 economic, and social turmoil, making it the second largest international displacement in
76 contemporary history, behind only Syria’s refugee crisis [14]. Most Venezuelans remain in South
77 America, placing severe socioeconomic strains on countries such as Argentina, Brazil, Chile,
78 Colombia, Ecuador, and Peru, which collectively host over four million Venezuelans. While both
79 regular and irregular migrants face stigmatization, discrimination, and health care access barriers,
80 lack of documentation can make these issues particularly salient for irregular migrants. For many
81 countries, government-issued identification documents (IDs) are required to access COVID-19
82 vaccinations. ID requirements coupled with heightened xenophobia and ongoing human rights
83 violations may negatively impact how Venezuelan migrants are included in host country
84 vaccination policies [15].

85

86 While the Latin American region has been significantly impacted by Venezuelan mass
87 migration, limited research has assessed the sociopolitical climates shaping COVID-19 vaccine
88 access for displaced Venezuelans. Thus, there is an urgent need to understand how rising
89 numbers of displaced Venezuelans will be addressed in country-level COVID-19 vaccination

90 policies. Addressing this gap, we examine the bioethical and human rights dimensions of
91 country-level COVID-19 vaccination policies for migrants. We aim to better understand
92 migration status (i.e. regular and irregular) as a dimension of vaccine equity through country-
93 level vaccination plans and in relation to international human rights obligations and the “WHO
94 SAGE values framework for the allocation and prioritization of COVID-19 vaccines”, which
95 provides guidelines to promote equity within global and national prioritization of vaccination.
96

97 **COVID-19 vaccination facilities and equity frameworks**

98 In recognition of underlining inequities pervasive in emergency vaccine administration, the
99 “WHO SAGE values framework for the allocation and prioritization of COVID-19 vaccines”
100 (hereafter referred to as the WHO/SAGE framework) was developed “for COVID-19 vaccines to
101 contribute significantly to the equitable protection and promotion of human well-being among all
102 people of the world” [16]. The WHO/SAGE framework is guided by a bioethical approach
103 emphasizing that social vulnerabilities (including citizenship status) should be considered when
104 prioritizing COVID-19 vaccination. However, as Sekalala and colleagues note, while the
105 WHO/SAGE framework mentions human rights principles and references State obligations to
106 promote ‘global equity’, it falls short of human rights obligations to hold States accountable to
107 ensure equity in access to vaccines [17].
108

109 Second, the need for international collaboration led to the creation of COVID-19 Vaccines
110 Global Access (COVAX) to support vaccine research and development and promote global
111 equity in vaccine distribution [18]. COVAX contains a small “humanitarian buffer” (around 5
112 percent of doses), which includes doses for migrants and refugees who otherwise do not have

113 access through national vaccination campaigns. Yet, the number of doses available through
114 COVAX is wholly inadequate given the magnitude of the Venezuelan migration crisis and other
115 migration crises [19]. COVAX does not specify how national prioritization of vaccination should
116 proceed, leaving governments to define priority groups for COVID-19 vaccination.

117
118 Existing COVID-19 vaccination facilities and equity frameworks may not adequately account for
119 the unique vulnerabilities facing migrants amid COVID-19. For example, the WHO/SAGE
120 framework, which is meant to guide State actors, lacks accountability in upholding the health
121 rights of non-citizens. Scholars have thus argued that COVID-19 vaccination frameworks can be
122 strengthened by aligning with international human rights obligations that define health rights;
123 this can create legally enforceable frameworks that can be used to hold States accountable for
124 protecting rights, particularly amid emergencies such as COVID-19 [17]. Indeed, international
125 human rights treaties (including the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the
126 International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights) are ratified and legally binding
127 in most countries globally. The United Nations Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural
128 Rights has emphasized that access to COVID-19 vaccines is “an essential component of the right
129 of everyone to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health and
130 the right of everyone to enjoy the benefits of scientific progress and its applications” [20]. The
131 Committee also underscores the obligation of States “as a matter of priority and to the maximum
132 of their available resources, to guarantee all persons access to vaccines against COVID-19,
133 without any discrimination” [20]. The integration of human rights into existing vaccination
134 frameworks would transform ethical imperatives into obligations and rights, which can be

135 mobilized in legal and political strategies by civil society and social actors to hold States
136 accountable for ensuring health rights are fulfilled [17].

137

138 **Methods**

139 Data are derived from a scoping review conducted between April and June 2021 evaluating the
140 inclusion of Venezuelan migrants in COVID-19 vaccination policies in Latin America. Complete
141 scoping review methods have been previously published [21]. The original scoping review
142 broadly assessed COVID-19 vaccine access for displaced Venezuelans, while this secondary
143 analysis explored the human rights dimensions of COVID-19 vaccination for displaced
144 Venezuelans. For this analysis, country-level vaccination plans and statements from government
145 officials were examined alongside international human rights obligations and the WHO/SAGE
146 framework to explore how bioethical and human rights dimensions of COVID-19 vaccination
147 were framed for Venezuelan migrants.

148

149 Four team members contributed to data extraction with at least one full text reviewer per data
150 source. A search of peer-reviewed literature published between January 2020 and June 2021
151 yielded 142 results and 13 articles included in analysis; gray literature screening included 74
152 materials for full text review and 37 included in analysis, including publications and reports by
153 nongovernmental organizations, multilateral agencies, and news media; and country-level
154 documents were reviewed for 18 countries across Latin America and the Caribbean, with in-
155 depth analysis for the six countries hosting most Venezuelans (Argentina, Brazil, Chile,
156 Colombia, Ecuador, and Peru). Two team members reviewed Ministry of Health websites,
157 policies, documents, and media related to COVID-19 vaccination plans.

158
159 Data were collected in English, Spanish, and Portuguese through a variety of online platforms for
160 screening and data extraction (Covidence, Google Forms, Zotero, and Excel). Data extraction
161 was divided by data source (peer-reviewed, country-level government policies, gray literature)
162 with at least one full-text reviewer and data extractor per publication. Summative content
163 analysis guided this analytic process to assess both what is explicit as well as implicit with
164 regards to mechanisms for COVID-19 vaccine access based on migration status [22,23].
165 Research team coded sections of the documents into overarching interpretative themes and
166 subthemes related to how migrants were explicitly described or implied in the sources and, in
167 some cases, excluded from vaccination strategies. Codes were used to generate key themes
168 across extracted documents and yielded summaries relevant to law, policy, and institutional
169 practices for migrants. Emergent themes were discussed across the full team (6 members) who
170 met twice weekly throughout the six-week study period to review extraction procedures and to
171 compare, discuss, and interpret data.

172

173 **Results**

174 Across the analysis, three key rights-related concerns were found to restrict the right to health for
175 migrants in Latin America amid COVID-19: 1) lack of prioritization of migrants in vaccine
176 distribution; 2) onerous documentation requirements to be eligible for COVID-19 vaccination;
177 and 3) how pervasive anti-migrant discrimination limited equitable health care access. A detailed
178 analysis of country-level vaccination plans, phases of vaccination, and ID requirements for
179 vaccination is presented in Table 1, and Fig 1, in the Discussion, provides recommendations

180 based on results for integrating human rights into existing COVID-19 vaccination facilities and
181 frameworks (i.e. WHO SAGE/values).

182

183 **Lack of prioritization of migrants in vaccine distribution**

184 Of the six countries reviewed in-depth, only Argentina and Ecuador identified migrants as
185 priority groups for vaccination. In Argentina, migrants were prioritized after adults 60 and over,
186 adults with comorbidities, military personnel, armed forces, prison staff, teachers, and school
187 staff [24]. Similarly, in Ecuador, migrants were listed as a priority group for Phase 3 of the
188 vaccination plan. While vaccination plans in both Argentina and Ecuador clarified that migrants
189 may be eligible alongside citizens if they were part of other priority groups, these were defined
190 by epidemiological risk factors with limited attention to structural factors such as overcrowded
191 housing, precarious employment, and migration status. The first two phases of Ecuador's
192 vaccination plan, "we save lives" and "we take care", prioritized adults 50 years and older, adults
193 with comorbidities, and workers in strategic sectors [25]. Phase 3, which explicitly included
194 migrants, was referred to as "limit contagion", reinforcing stereotypes of migrants as disease
195 vectors. Even when migrants were explicitly named as priority groups for vaccination, this was
196 framed in terms of reducing risk for citizens.

197

198 Meanwhile, review of the gray literature revealed a rapidly shifting policy landscape that at times
199 explicitly excluded migrants from vaccination efforts. In Chile, although the Constitution
200 recognizes migrants' right to health, the Minister of Foreign Affairs stated in February 2021 that
201 irregular migrants would not be vaccinated against COVID-19 [26]. The decision was criticized
202 by the Chilean Medical College, who argued that restricting COVID-19 vaccination based on

203 migration status would disproportionately affect the most vulnerable [27]. In response, the
204 Chilean government updated the policy to only restrict tourists from COVID-19 vaccination
205 [28]. Similarly, in December 2020, Colombia sought to exclude irregular migrants from
206 vaccination plans, including an estimated one million displaced Venezuelans with irregular
207 migratory status [29]. The announcement triggered international outrage, leading President
208 Duque to backtrack in February 2021 and announce a Temporary Protection Status (TPS)
209 program that would allow migrants to formalize their status and thus access health care,
210 including vaccination [29]. The discrimination evidenced in statements from government
211 officials clearly juxtaposed human rights approaches that prohibit denying or limiting access to
212 COVID-19 vaccines based on nationality or migration status.

213
214 While migrants may be eligible for vaccination based on age or occupation, country-level
215 vaccination plans were often unclear if, how, and when non-citizens, particularly those without
216 IDs, can access vaccines. Table 1 illustrates how reviewed countries allocated their limited
217 COVID-19 vaccines to “at-risk” groups according to age, occupation, and co-morbidities, with
218 limited information on how migrants and non-citizens can access COVID-19 vaccinations within
219 these classifications.

220
221 Table 1. Phases of COVID-19 vaccination, ID requirements, and inclusion of Venezuelan
222 migrants in six host countries as of June 2021

Country	Phases of Vaccination	ID requirements	(How) are migrants included in vaccination plan?
----------------	------------------------------	------------------------	---

<p>Argentina^a [30]</p>	<p>Phase 1: Adults over 70 years and adults in long-term care residences Phase 2: Adults over 60 years Phase 3: Military personnel, armed forces, and prison staff Phase 4: Adults 18-59 years in “high risk” groups (diabetes, obesity, cardiovascular disease, cancer, etc.) Phase 5: Teachers and school staff Phase 6: Other priority populations to be defined by jurisdictions, including based on social vulnerability such as migration status^b</p>	<p>No ID required for vaccination</p>	<p>Phase 6 prioritizes vaccination based on social vulnerability, including migration status.</p>
<p>Brazil [31]</p>	<p>Priority groups 1-2: Long-term care residents Group 3: Indigenous people on Indigenous lands Group 4: Health workers Groups 5-8: Adults 75 years and older Groups 9-10: Indigenous communities (Ribeirinhas and Quilombola) Groups 11-13: Adults 65-74 years Groups 14-15: Adults with co-morbidities or disabilities Group 16: People experiencing homelessness Groups 17-18: Prison inmates and staff Groups 19-20: Teachers Groups 21-22: Armed forces and first responders Groups 23-29: Industry workers (public transportation, truck drivers, construction, etc.) Group 30: General population 18 years and older</p>	<p>“Cadastro de Pessoas Físicas” [Natural Persons Register] or “Cartão Nacional de Saúde” [National Health Card] required for vaccination</p>	<p>Migrants are not explicitly mentioned in vaccination plans.</p>
<p>Chile [32]</p>	<p>Phase 1: a) Clinical and administrative health personnel, including students in direct contact with patients; b) People residing in long-stay centers, mental health institutions, adults over 70 years c) Government employees, armed forces, first responders d) Adults 60-69 years e) Adults 18-59 years old with comorbidities or with severe disabilities f) Firefighters, personnel in essential services, such as electricity, water, gas, power generation, fuel, telecommunications, waste collection,</p>	<p>ID required for vaccination (e.g., ID document from their place of origin, passport from place of origin, health card). Migrants can self-report to the police to obtain documentation granting access to vaccines.</p>	<p>Migrants are not explicitly mentioned in vaccination plans.</p>

	landfills, foreign trade, public transportation, teachers and childcare providers; prison inmates and staff; Phase 2: General population 18 years and older		
Colombia [33,34]	Step 1: Adults over 80 years, health care staff working with COVID-19 patients Step 2: Adults 60-79, all other health workers, medical students, traditional healers Step 3: Adults 50-59, people 16-59 with comorbidities, teachers and educational staff, military personnel, police, Indigenous guard Step 4: Adults 40-49, populations at risk of outbreaks (inmates and prison staff, firefighters, first responders, etc.) Step 5: General population 16 years and older	Resident migrants can access vaccines through the <i>Sistema General de Seguridad Social en Salud</i> . Irregular migrants must be approved for temporary protection status.	Vaccination plan includes regular migrants but describes the vaccination of irregular migrants is an “ongoing challenge”.
Ecuador [35]	Phase 1: "We save lives": Adults over 65 years, Adults 50-64 with comorbidities or disabilities, health workers, people who live/work in high-risk settings Phase 2: "We take care": Adults 50-64, people aged 16-49 with co-morbidities or disabilities, people who work in strategic sectors Phase 3: "Less contagion": People aged 16-49 years, mobile populations including irregular migrants Phase 4: "We reactivate": all those previously unvaccinated	ID is not required. Resident migrants must complete an electronic form for vaccination clinic referral based on place of residence and level of risk. Migrants that are part of other priority groups (based on age, occupation, etc.) can attend mass vaccination clinics without pre-registering.	Phase 3 targets mobile populations including irregular migrants.
Peru [36]	Phase 1: Health care workers and hospital/clinic staff Phase 2: Adults over 60 years, adults with comorbidities, Indigenous communities, prisoners, and correctional staff Phase 3: Adults 18-59 years	Those without Peruvian ID or regular migration status are instructed to register with the National Registry of Identification and Civil Status, which accepts ID documents from country of origin.	Plan states that vaccination will proceed according to priority group regardless of migration status.

223 ^a Vaccination plans vary by province; Buenos Aires was selected as a representative case.

224 ^b Bolded text indicates where migrants are named as priority groups for vaccination

225
226 In contrast with Argentina and Ecuador, which explicitly name migrants as priority groups, plans
227 in Brazil, Chile, Colombia, and Peru were more ambiguous regarding access for migrants. Chile
228 and Colombia defined priority groups predominantly by risk of morbidity and mortality (age and
229 co-morbidities), as well as by occupation (health care and other “essential” workers). Yet, while
230 migrants may be eligible based on age, occupation, or comorbidities, vaccination plans were
231 often unclear regarding when and how migrants not eligible based on individual-level risk could
232 access vaccines. Colombia’s plan indicated that while regular migrants could access vaccines
233 alongside citizens, vaccination of irregular migrants was described as an “ongoing challenge”
234 [33]. Some country-level approaches considered group vulnerability when, for instance,
235 prioritizing vaccination in mental health institutions (Chile) and inmates and prison staff
236 (Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, Chile, and Peru).

237
238 Findings from peer-reviewed and gray literature reveal how unstable housing, precarious
239 employment, discrimination, and health care access barriers represent intersectional structural-
240 level factors that constrain access to social protections for made-vulnerable communities. In
241 Brazil and Peru, COVID-19 vaccination plans addressed structural factors that place Indigenous
242 communities at increased vulnerability. For example, Brazil’s national plan notes collective ways
243 of living coupled with long distances from health centers as factors that place Indigenous
244 Quilombola and Ribeirinhas communities at increased vulnerability to COVID-19, and thus
245 prioritizing these communities for COVID-19 vaccination [31]. Yet despite crowded living
246 conditions, health care access barriers, language barriers, and precarious employment, which
247 increase vulnerability to COVID-19 for many displaced Venezuelans in Brazil, migrants as a
248 specific group are not prioritized within Brazil’s vaccination plan [37].

249

250 **Onerous documentation requirements to be eligible for COVID-19**
251 **vaccination?**

252 While some vaccination plans included flexibility surrounding ID requirements for non-citizens
253 or the acceptance of expired IDs, documentation requirements were noted as a recurrent
254 vaccination barrier, particularly for migrants with irregular status [38]. As of March 2021, over
255 65 percent of Venezuelans in Colombia reported a lack of documentation as a health care access
256 barrier [14]. In Colombia, while regular migrants can access vaccines with a residency permit,
257 irregular migrants must apply for Temporary Protection Status (TPS). Yet, TPS applications are
258 costly and can take months to process, further constraining or delaying COVID-19 vaccination
259 [29]. Additional TPS eligibility criteria excluded migrants that arrived after January 31st, 2021
260 and those with a criminal record [14]. Zard et al. documented how relying on regularization
261 processes as a route to vaccination delayed and constrained COVID-19 vaccine access for
262 migrants and refugees [8]. To access vaccines in Colombia, Chile, and Brazil, displaced
263 Venezuelans needed a passport, proof of legal status, or proof of enrolment in health care
264 systems [31,33]. Registration for COVID-19 vaccination also often required booking an
265 appointment online and uploading documentation, which the International Organization for
266 Migration (IOM) has identified as a barrier for migrants who may lack computer access or
267 internet connectivity [38]. Several support mechanisms were identified in the gray literature to
268 reduce vaccination barriers, such as United Nations agencies in Brazil assisting with
269 regularization applications, and temporary, transitory, or precarious residency permits being
270 automatically extended in Argentina [39].

271

272 **How did pervasive anti-migrant discrimination limit equitable**
273 **health care access?**

274 Another crucial COVID-19 vaccination barrier evidenced across the peer-reviewed and gray
275 literature was migrants' distrust in health care systems, in part due to fear of deportation. The
276 "UN joint guidance note on equitable access to COVID-19 vaccines for all migrants" calls on
277 States to establish firewalls between health services and immigration authorities to prevent
278 detention or deportation due to accessing health care services [40]. While an important call,
279 limited accountability can further harm those most vulnerable. For example, in Chile, to access
280 COVID-19 vaccines, displaced Venezuelans must self-report to police and disclose their
281 irregular migration status [27]. Policies requiring disclosure of migration status can perpetuate
282 the stigmatization of migrants, particularly as more than 100 migrants, mostly Venezuelans, were
283 deported from Chile in February 2021. Then, in April 2021, another 55 migrants were deported
284 as a part of the "Colchane plan" which sought to deport 1,800 migrants and increase border
285 controls [10]. Similarly, in Peru, irregular migrants must register with the National Registry of
286 Identification and Civil Status, and Brazil requests migrants register with the *Cadastro de*
287 *Pessoas Físicas* (Naturalized Persons Registry) [36,41]. Amnesty International has called on
288 States to "explicitly guarantee that vaccination will not be linked to legal status including
289 ensuring that personal data gathered...for vaccination purposes will not be shared with law-
290 enforcement agencies and used for immigration enforcement" [29]. Amid the fears and
291 uncertainties following mass deportations, migrants may avoid registering and declaring their
292 irregular migration status, thus limiting vaccine access.

293
294 Meanwhile, in 2021, amid increasing numbers of Venezuelans seeking to return to Venezuela in
295 response to discrimination, xenophobia, and violence in host countries, Venezuelan President

296 Maduro blamed returning migrants for upsurges in COVID-19 cases [42]. Indeed, the Office of
297 the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights writes that “in situations of fear and
298 uncertainty, such as the current pandemic, migrants can be particularly vulnerable to attitudes
299 and behaviors that stigmatize and scapegoat them” [40]. Colombian President Duque justified
300 the exclusion of Venezuelans from vaccination campaigns for fear that it would lead to a
301 “stampede” of migrants rushing the border [43]. A senior government official in Venezuela even
302 referred to migrants entering the country illegally as “biological weapons” [44]. Both across
303 country-level policies and related gray literature, our review demonstrates that amid extreme
304 resource constraints facing Latin American countries due to COVID-19 and Venezuelan mass
305 migration, stigmatization and scapegoating can result in discriminatory policies that constrict
306 migrants’ right to the highest attainable standard of health.

307
308 In addition to COVID-19 vaccine access specifically, results revealed health care access barriers
309 more broadly for displaced Venezuelans. A report by the Mixed Migration Centre noted that 75
310 percent of displaced Venezuelans in Peru and 39 percent in Colombia believed they would not be
311 able to access health care if they became ill with COVID-19 [45]. Similarly, compared with
312 citizens, displaced Venezuelans in Chile were 7.5 times less likely to have access to health care
313 [26]. Despite calls from the Pan American Health Organization for “health services [to] be
314 inclusive and responsive to the needs of migrants” and to “[eliminate] geographical, economic,
315 and cultural barriers”, our review revealed that displaced Venezuelans lacking formal
316 documentation were disproportionately affected by health care access barriers [46]. While the
317 integration of displaced Venezuelans into COVID-19 vaccination plans is an important step

318 towards health equity, reviewed literature reinforce the need to address social and structural
319 disparities that limit the right to health for migrants.

320

321 **Discussion**

322 These findings advance understandings of migration status as a determinant of COVID-19
323 vaccine equity by presenting a regional analysis of how country-level COVID-19 vaccination
324 policies in Latin America facilitate access for migrants and displaced people. While the scale and
325 impact of Venezuelan mass migration were underscored in the peer-reviewed and gray literature
326 reviewed, government plans and policies highlighted that States' provided limited safeguards for
327 non-citizens. Our results underscore the imperative to not only recognize but also address
328 protections for non-citizens in Latin America. International human rights principles reinforce the
329 obligations of States to ensure equity for all in access to COVID-19 vaccines, regardless of
330 citizenship or migration status.

331

332 The potential impact of our results not only help underscore how existing gaps in COVID-19
333 vaccination could have been addressed by human rights approaches, but also advance
334 understandings of how future public health interventions can better integrate human rights
335 principles to complement strategies informed by epidemiological risk. Existing and pervasive
336 disparities highlight how COVID-19 vaccines, no matter how effective at preventing infection or
337 severe illness, cannot reach their full promise without the integration of context-specific
338 sociopolitical factors in their rollout. Human rights-related concerns surrounding COVID-19
339 vaccine access for displaced Venezuelans include: lack of prioritization of migrants in vaccine
340 distribution; onerous documentation requirements to be eligible for COVID-19 vaccination; and

341 how pervasive anti-migrant discrimination limited equitable health care access. These findings
342 align with reports from the United Nations International Organization for Migration and WHO
343 that country-level vaccination plans often lack clarity regarding the inclusion of migrants and fail
344 to address underlying health care access barriers, particularly for migrants with irregular status
345 [47].

346
347 This research builds on existing literature urging the integration of human rights perspectives in
348 responses to COVID-19 to ensure health equity for migrants [47]. We have identified key
349 priorities when designing and implementing COVID-19 vaccination plans to ensure equity for
350 migrants and/or displaced people in the Latin American region. Paralleling literature detailing
351 the urgency of incorporating human rights perspectives into vaccine deployment, planning and
352 coordination mechanisms must account for non-citizens, particularly those with irregular
353 migration status [47]. More broadly, mechanisms need to be adopted to address pervasive
354 discrimination and ensure secure and safe access to public health systems for migrants.

355 Assessment of priority groups within country-level vaccination policies alongside gray and peer-
356 reviewed literature allows for an examination of how governments ‘see’ migrants and can foster
357 mechanisms to improve vaccine access. Fig 1 situates five of the principles guiding the
358 allocation and prioritization of COVID-19 vaccination as described by the WHO/SAGE
359 framework alongside recommendations for how existing gaps could have been addressed
360 through the integration of human rights.

361 Fig 1. Integrating human rights into a modified WHO/SAGE framework to address the unmet
362 COVID-19 needs of migrants

363 (A) Summary of select principles in the WHO/SAGE framework. (B) Integrating human
364 rights with WHO/SAGE to promote equitable access to COVID-19 vaccines for
365 migrants.

366 Recommendations based on this review build on the WHO/SAGE framework which outlines six
367 principles guiding COVID-19 vaccine prioritization, and underscores how social vulnerabilities
368 (including migration status) should inform national vaccination policies. These include: (1)
369 human wellbeing; (2) equal respect; (3) global equity; (4) national equity; (5) reciprocity; and (6)
370 legitimacy. The WHO/SAGE framework calls for migrants to be prioritized in COVID-19
371 vaccination plans given their increased social vulnerabilities and existing barriers in accessing
372 health services. For example, the principle of “national equity” advocates for the prioritization of
373 vulnerable communities, such as people living in poverty, refugees, and internally displaced
374 persons, those affected by humanitarian emergencies, and irregular migrants. Recognizing their
375 increased risk of COVID-19 acquisition and severe illness, the WHO/SAGE framework
376 underscores why migrants *should* be named as priority groups for COVID-19 vaccination. Yet,
377 as evidenced in our review, scant attention was paid to accountability in implementation of
378 country-level vaccination plans, resulting in States prioritizing the vaccination of citizens over
379 non-citizens.

380

381 Fig 1 builds on a modified WHO/SAGE Framework to present how COVID-19 vaccine
382 allocation and prioritization can better consider the health rights of migrants and non-citizens.
383 For example, while the existing WHO/SAGE framework suggests that all people should be
384 treated with equal respect, human rights obligations hold States accountable for ensuring dignity
385 and equal respect for all. Similarly, while the WHO calls for “a transparent consultation process”

386 in decisions surrounding COVID-19 vaccine policies, a rights-based approach necessitates that
387 made-vulnerable communities participate actively in decision-making processes. Finally,
388 extraterritorial obligations underscore the responsibility of States to uphold the health rights of
389 all people, not just those residing within their national borders. Reciprocity is a principle of
390 narrower scope compared to the other five as it specifically addresses those within society “who
391 bear substantial additional risks and burdens of COVID-19 response for the benefit of society”
392 [16]. While many migrants are trained as health care workers and/or first responders, they are
393 often unable to work in these fields given challenges with documentation, and thus do not qualify
394 under this principle. Assessment of policies related to whether migrants and other displaced
395 people can provide COVID-19 care irrelevant of documents was outside of the scope of our
396 review, and thus reciprocity is not presented in Fig 1. Nonetheless, future research is needed to
397 better understand how the principle of reciprocity can be interpreted and applied to migrants and
398 other displaced people especially given known shortages of healthcare workers in the Latin
399 American region [48].

400
401 While the WHO/SAGE framework underscores the need to consider social vulnerabilities, our
402 review revealed that country-level vaccination plans rarely accounted for the structural inequities
403 driving increased exposure to COVID-19 for marginalized communities. These findings support
404 literature evidencing how unstable housing, precarious employment, discrimination, and health
405 care access barriers represent intersectional structural-level factors that constrain access to social
406 protections not only for migrants, but also for other marginalized groups [49]. Prioritizing
407 vaccination based solely on epidemiological risk groups serves to individualize risk and
408 invisibilize the structural-level factors that produce group vulnerabilities. As argued by Sekalala

409 and colleagues, “international human rights law requires that ‘vulnerability’, if used as a criterion
410 for priority access to COVID-19 vaccines, must include social vulnerability (e.g. socioeconomic
411 status) in addition to medical vulnerability (e.g. comorbidities), and attend to intersectionalities”
412 [17]. In this way, prioritization of COVID-19 vaccination must be informed not only by
413 epidemiological risk of morbidity and mortality; a human rights perspective would also require
414 social vulnerabilities be considered when defining vaccine priority groups. As shown by Freier et
415 al., this position has been adopted by the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights and the
416 Inter-American Court of Human Rights, who established that the human rights principles of
417 equality and non-discrimination requires States to not only prohibit discrimination based on
418 migration status, but also to take special measures to address and reverse structural and systemic
419 discrimination, exclusion, and vulnerability faced by migrants [50]. In countries where migrants
420 already faced high rates of discrimination, xenophobia, criminalization, poverty, exploitation,
421 and violence, COVID-19 exacerbated inequities in employment, health, and access to social
422 services [51].

423
424 Findings underscore that sustained attention must be paid to the structural inequities described
425 above that are not new, but rather pervasive consequences of neoliberal globalization. This call
426 to center vulnerability seeks to underscore the broader systemic oppressions that make certain
427 communities in Latin America particularly vulnerable to COVID-19 and other epidemics. It
428 demands attention to be paid to imperialist structural adjustment policies that have left public
429 health systems underfunded and ill-equipped to deal simultaneously with mass migration and a
430 pandemic. Indeed, in response to the emerging debt crisis in the 1980s, countries across Latin
431 America accepted loans from the World Bank and International Monetary Fund; conditions of

432 these loans included mandates to privatize state assets, cut government spending, devalue
433 currencies, and liberalize trade [52]. These large-scale cuts to government spending on social
434 services widened health inequities as health care became increasingly unaffordable for the most
435 vulnerable, including migrants [52]. The prioritization of COVID-19 vaccines in Latin America
436 must be situated within ongoing neoliberal reforms yielding chronically underfunded social
437 systems, including health care [53]. In sum, COVID-19 has repeatedly revealed the porousness
438 of borders, yet responses continue to neglect the globalized and interconnected nature of the
439 pandemic.

440
441 Caution should be observed in the interpretation of these results as findings are inherently limited
442 by dynamic changes in approaches to COVID-19 vaccination that have occurred since this
443 scoping review was conducted between April and June 2021. Indeed, review of country-level
444 vaccination plans revealed at times daily shifts in vaccine prioritization and allocation, as well as
445 migrants' eligibility for vaccination, underscoring how rights claims were contested, mediated,
446 and resolved across the study period. That said, given the scope of our three-month data
447 collection period, it was not possible to fully assess how COVID-19 vaccination policies shifted
448 across time. Additionally, vaccination data published across Ministry of Health websites did not
449 disaggregate based on migration status, so the effects of COVID-19 vaccination policies on
450 access to vaccines in practice could not be assessed. Further attention is also needed to the
451 phases of vaccination, as well as definition of priority groups across different settings, not only
452 in initial doses, but in the administration of booster doses also. Nonetheless, this review
453 underscores ongoing gaps in COVID-19 vaccination plans as well as the crucial need to uphold
454 international human rights obligations and consider the unique social vulnerabilities of displaced

455 Venezuelans. As Peru and Brazil have done for Indigenous communities, this could be
456 accomplished through an approach to vaccination that considers not just individual-level risk
457 factors but also intersectional, structural-level factors that place displaced Venezuelans at
458 increased risk for COVID-19. Ensuring equitable access to COVID-19 vaccines is thus a first -
459 and an essential - step to respond to COVID-19 more equitably and prepare for future public
460 health crises in the context of displaced populations.

461

462 **Conclusion**

463 Amid rapidly evolving COVID-19 vaccination plans, findings presented here highlight how anti-
464 migrant discrimination can be reinforced by governments and health systems when the human
465 rights of migrants are not accounted for in vaccination policies across Latin America. Countries
466 across the region prioritized the allocation of limited vaccines to ‘at-risk’ groups as defined by
467 countries and guided by primarily epidemiological factors (age, occupation, co-morbidities, etc.).
468 Limited attention to social vulnerabilities (such as housing instability, economic precarity), and
469 global forces driving the migration crisis (such as imperialism and neoliberalism), has
470 exacerbated deep-rooted structural inequities faced by those abandoned by social safety nets,
471 such as migrants. Keen attention and deeper inquiry are needed to the unique barriers faced by
472 Venezuelan migrants with irregular status, defined as those who entered a country without the
473 necessary authorization or documentation. Requirements for identification and other
474 government-issued documentation to access vaccines creates critical access barriers (e.g. fear of
475 deportation and xenophobic harassment, lost/expired documents), particularly for migrants with
476 irregular status. Meanwhile, issues of cost, lack of familiarity with health care systems, and
477 stigma and discrimination are intersectional issues that may be more salient among irregular

478 migrants, particularly amid COVID-19 and future pandemics [54]. Stigmatization and
479 scapegoating can result in discriminatory policies that further limit the ability of migrants to
480 achieve the “highest attainable standard of health”. The integration of human rights, rooted in
481 legally binding treaties that can be used in litigation and advocacy, into public health responses is
482 a key strategy to improve accountability within implementation and uphold the health rights of
483 marginalized and made-vulnerable communities. To ensure health equity for migrants and
484 displaced people, future COVID-19 vaccination strategies in Latin America must be informed
485 not just by epidemiological approaches, but also by international human rights.

486 **Acknowledgements**

487 This work was supported by the Canadian Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council
488 (SSHRC), Insight Development Grant.

489 **References**

- 490 1. World Health Organization. WHO Director-General’s opening remarks at 148th session of
491 the Executive Board [Internet]. 2021. Available from: [https://www.who.int/director-](https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-148th-session-of-the-executive-board)
492 [general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-148th-session-of-the-](https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-148th-session-of-the-executive-board)
493 [executive-board](https://www.who.int/director-general/speeches/detail/who-director-general-s-opening-remarks-at-148th-session-of-the-executive-board)
- 494 2. Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. UN expert says global
495 coordination and more equitable sharing of COVID-19 vaccines key to recovery [Internet].
496 2021 [cited 2021 Aug 26]. Available from:
497 [https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=26683&LangI](https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=26683&LangID=E)
498 [D=E](https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=26683&LangID=E)
- 499 3. Government of the United Kingdom. Vaccinations in the UK | Coronavirus in the UK
500 [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2021 Aug 27]. Available from:
501 <https://coronavirus.data.gov.uk/details/vaccinations>
- 502 4. CDC. COVID Data Tracker [Internet]. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. 2020
503 [cited 2021 Aug 27]. Available from: <https://covid.cdc.gov/covid-data-tracker>
- 504 5. Government of Canada. Vaccines for COVID-19 [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2021 Aug 27].
505 Available from: [https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/diseases/coronavirus-](https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/diseases/coronavirus-disease-covid-19/vaccines.html)
506 [disease-covid-19/vaccines.html](https://www.canada.ca/en/public-health/services/diseases/coronavirus-disease-covid-19/vaccines.html)
- 507 6. The Lancet. COVID-19 in Latin America—emergency and opportunity. *The Lancet*. 2021
508 Jul;398(10295):93.
- 509 7. John T. The definition of “fully vaccinated” is changing to three covid-19 doses [Internet].
510 CNN. 2021 [cited 2021 Dec 6]. Available from:
511 <https://www.cnn.com/2021/11/17/world/coronavirus-newsletter-intl-17-11-21/index.html>
- 512 8. Zard M, Lau LS, Bowser DM, Fouad FM, Lucumí DI, Samari G, et al. Leave no one behind:
513 ensuring access to COVID-19 vaccines for refugee and displaced populations. *Nat Med*
514 [Internet]. 2021 Apr 19 [cited 2021 May 13]; Available from:
515 <http://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-021-01328-3>
- 516 9. International Organization for Migration. Glossary on Migration [Internet]. 2011 [cited 2021
517 Dec 6]. Available from: https://publications.iom.int/system/files/pdf/iml25_1.pdf
- 518 10. R4V. Situation report of the activities implemented in January and February 2021 by the
519 members of the R4V Venezuela situation coordination platform in Chile. [Internet]. 2021.
520 Available from: <https://data2.unhcr.org/es/documents/details/85832>
- 521 11. International Organization for Migration. Migration inclusion in COVID-19 vaccination
522 deployment [Internet]. 2022 Mar [cited 2022 Oct 10]. Available from:
523 [https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our_work/DMM/Migration-Health/IOM-](https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our_work/DMM/Migration-Health/IOM-Vaccine-Inclusion-Mapping-17-May-2021-global.pdf)
524 [Vaccine-Inclusion-Mapping-17-May-2021-global.pdf](https://www.iom.int/sites/g/files/tmzbd1486/files/our_work/DMM/Migration-Health/IOM-Vaccine-Inclusion-Mapping-17-May-2021-global.pdf)

- 525 12. International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights (ICESCR). G.A. Res.
526 2200A (XXI). 1966.
- 527 13. United Nations Committee on Economic, Cultural, and Social Rights. General Comment No.
528 14: The right to the highest attainable standard of health (Art.12). 2000.
- 529 14. Quarterly Mixed Migration Update [Internet]. Mixed Migration Centre. 2021 [cited 2021
530 May 28]. Available from: [https://mixedmigration.org/resource/quarterly-mixed-migration-
531 update-lac-q1-2021/](https://mixedmigration.org/resource/quarterly-mixed-migration-update-lac-q1-2021/)
- 532 15. Human Rights Watch. Brazil: Events of 2020. In: World Report 2021 [Internet]. 2020 [cited
533 2021 Nov 17]. Available from: [https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2021/country-
534 chapters/brazil](https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2021/country-chapters/brazil)
- 535 16. World Health Organization. WHO SAGE values framework for the allocation and
536 prioritization of COVID-19 vaccination [Internet]. 2020 Sep [cited 2021 Sep 16]. Available
537 from: [https://apps-who-
538 int.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/334299/WHO-2019-nCoV-
539 SAGE_Framework-Allocation_and_prioritization-2020.1-eng.pdf?ua=1](https://apps-who-int.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/334299/WHO-2019-nCoV-SAGE_Framework-Allocation_and_prioritization-2020.1-eng.pdf?ua=1)
- 540 17. Sekalala S, Perehudoff K, Parker M, Forman L, Rawson B, Smith M. An intersectional
541 human rights approach to prioritising access to COVID-19 vaccines. *BMJ Global Health*.
542 2021 Feb 1;6(2):e004462.
- 543 18. World Health Organization. COVAX: Working for global equitable access to COVID-19
544 vaccines. [Internet]. [cited 2021 Aug 31]. Available from:
545 <https://www.who.int/initiatives/act-accelerator/covax>
- 546 19. Berkley S. COVAX explained [Internet]. GAVI The Vaccine Alliance. 2020 [cited 2021
547 May 25]. Available from: <https://www.gavi.org/vaccineswork/covax-explained>
- 548 20. United Nations Committee on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights. Statement on universal
549 affordable vaccination against coronavirus disease (COVID-19), international cooperation
550 and intellectual property. [Internet]. 2021. Available from:
551 <https://digitallibrary.un.org/record/3921880?ln=en#record-files-collapse-header>
- 552 21. Perez-Brumer A, Hill D, Andrade-Romo Z, Solari K, Adams E, Logie C, et al. Vaccines for
553 all? A rapid scoping review of COVID-19 vaccine access for Venezuelan migrants in Latin
554 America. *Journal of Migration and Health*. 2021 Jan 1;4:100072.
- 555 22. Hsieh HF, Shannon SE. Three Approaches to Qualitative Content Analysis. *Qual Health Res*.
556 2005 Nov;15(9):1277–88.
- 557 23. Schaaf M, Boydell V, Topp SM, Iyer A, Sen G, Askew I. A summative content analysis of
558 how programmes to improve the right to sexual and reproductive health address power.
559 *BMJ Glob Health*. 2022 Apr;7(4):e008438.

- 560 24. Ministerio de Salud. Resolución 2883/2020 [Internet]. Buenos Aires, Argentina; 2020.
561 Available from: <https://www.argentina.gob.ar/normativa/nacional/disposici%C3%B3n-1904-2020-336399/texto>
562
- 563 25. Ministerio de Salud Pública. Plan de vacunacion 9 100, Respuestas a inquietudes ciudadanas
564 sobre el plan de vacunacion 9/100 [Internet]. 2021. Available from:
565 https://www.salud.gob.ec/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/31-05-2021_-_Preguntas-y-Respuestas_Plan-de-Vacunacion-9100_validado.pdf
566
- 567 26. Cabieses B, Oyarte M. Acceso a salud en inmigrantes: identificando brechas para la
568 protección social en salud. Rev Saude Publica. 54(20):1–13.
- 569 27. Andina AP de N. Covid-19: Chile da marcha atrás y aclara que vacunación incluye a
570 extranjeros irregulares [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2021 Jun 2]. Available from:
571 <https://andina.pe/agencia/noticia-covid19-chile-da-marcha-atras-y-aclara-vacunacion-incluye-a-extranjeros-irregulares-833441.aspx>
572
- 573 28. Vargas F. Minsal recalca que solo extranjeros que realizan turismo no pueden vacunarse
574 contra el covid-19 | Emol.com [Internet]. Emol. 2021 [cited 2021 Jun 2]. Available from:
575 <https://www.emol.com/noticias/Nacional/2021/05/31/1022465/Minsal-Vacunacion-Extranjeros.html>
576
- 577 29. Rahhal N. Refugees and COVID-19 Vaccinations: Part of the Solution but Not Always Part
578 of the Plan. Amnesty International. 2021 May 12;4.
- 579 30. Gobierno de la Provincia de Buenos Aires. Plan provincial público, gratuito y optativo contra
580 COVID-19 [Internet]. Vacunarnos es cuidarnos entre todos. 2021. Available from:
581 <https://vacunatepba.gba.gob.ar/>
- 582 31. Ministério da Saúde, Secretaria de Vigilância em Saúde. NOTA TÉCNICA Nº 155/2021-
583 CGPNI/DEIDT/SVS/M [Internet]. Brazil: Ministério da Saúde; N/A [cited 2021 Oct 23] p.
584 6. Available from: https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/media/pdf/2021/marco/16/nt_155-2021-cgpn_i_priorizacao_grupos.pdf
585
- 586 32. Gobierno de Chile. Grupos objetivos para la vacunación contra SARS-CoV-2 según el
587 suministro de vacunas [Internet]. 2021. Available from: <https://www.minsal.cl/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/GRUPOS-OBJETIVOS-3-marzo-2021.pdf>
588
- 589 33. Ministerio de Salud y Protección Social. Plan Nacional de Vacunación contra el Covid-19
590 [Internet]. Bogotá; 2021 Feb. Report No.: 2. Available from:
591 <https://mivacuna.sispro.gov.co/MiVacuna?v1>
- 592 34. Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores. Decreto 216 Por medio del cual se adopta el Estatuto
593 Temporal de Protección para Migrantes Venezolanos [Internet]. Bogotá D.C., Colombia;
594 2021. Available from: <https://www.migracioncolombia.gov.co/normas/por-medio-del-cual-se-adopta-el-estatuto-temporal-de-proteccion-para-migrantes-venezolanos-decreto-216-del-1-de-marzo-de-2021>
595
596

- 597 35. Jumbo B. Acnur y el gobierno de Ecuador definen el mecanismo para vacunar a los
598 extranjeros en condición de movilidad como venezolanos y colombianos [Internet]. El
599 Comercio. 2021 [cited 2021 Jun 17]. Available from:
600 [https://www.elcomercio.com/actualidad/ecuador/vacunacion-extranjeros-venezolanos-](https://www.elcomercio.com/actualidad/ecuador/vacunacion-extranjeros-venezolanos-covid-ecuador.html)
601 [covid-ecuador.html](https://www.elcomercio.com/actualidad/ecuador/vacunacion-extranjeros-venezolanos-covid-ecuador.html)
- 602 36. Gobierno de Perú. Resolución ministerial no 488: Plan nacional actualizado de vacunación
603 contra la covid-19 [Internet]. 2020. Available from:
604 [https://cdn.www.gob.pe/uploads/document/file/1805113/Plan%20Nacional%20Actualizado](https://cdn.www.gob.pe/uploads/document/file/1805113/Plan%20Nacional%20Actualizado%20contra%20la%20COVID-19.pdf)
605 [%20contra%20la%20COVID-19.pdf](https://cdn.www.gob.pe/uploads/document/file/1805113/Plan%20Nacional%20Actualizado%20contra%20la%20COVID-19.pdf)
- 606 37. Integration of Venezuelan Refugees and Migrants in Brazil - Brazil [Internet]. ReliefWeb.
607 2021 [cited 2021 May 25]. Available from: [https://reliefweb.int/report/brazil/integration-](https://reliefweb.int/report/brazil/integration-venezuelan-refugees-and-migrants-brazil)
608 [venezuelan-refugees-and-migrants-brazil](https://reliefweb.int/report/brazil/integration-venezuelan-refugees-and-migrants-brazil)
- 609 38. International Organization for Migration. Migrant inclusion in COVID-19 vaccination
610 Campaigns [Internet]. 2021 May [cited 2021 Jun 11] p. 1–20. Available from:
611 [https://www.iom.int/sites/default/files/our_work/DMM/Migration-Health/iom-vaccine-](https://www.iom.int/sites/default/files/our_work/DMM/Migration-Health/iom-vaccine-inclusion-mapping-17-may-2021-global.pdf)
612 [inclusion-mapping-17-may-2021-global.pdf](https://www.iom.int/sites/default/files/our_work/DMM/Migration-Health/iom-vaccine-inclusion-mapping-17-may-2021-global.pdf)
- 613 39. Peduzzi P. Operación Acogida ya reubicó a 50.000 refugiados venezolanos [Internet].
614 Agência Brasil. 2021 [cited 2021 Jun 7]. Available from:
615 [https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/es/direitos-humanos/noticia/2021-04/operacion-acogida-](https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/es/direitos-humanos/noticia/2021-04/operacion-acogida-ya-reubico-50000-refugiados-venezolanos)
616 [ya-reubico-50000-refugiados-venezolanos](https://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/es/direitos-humanos/noticia/2021-04/operacion-acogida-ya-reubico-50000-refugiados-venezolanos)
- 617 40. Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. Joint guidance note on
618 Equitable Access to COVID-19 Vaccinations for All Migrants. 2021. Available from:
619 [https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Migration/JointGuidanceNoteCOVID-19-](https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Migration/JointGuidanceNoteCOVID-19-Vaccines-for-Migrants.pdf)
620 [Vaccines-for-Migrants.pdf](https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Migration/JointGuidanceNoteCOVID-19-Vaccines-for-Migrants.pdf)
- 621 41. Ministério da Saúde, Governo do Brazil. Perguntas e respostas [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2022
622 Oct 4]. Available from: <https://www.gov.br/saude/pt-br/coronavirus/perguntas-e-respostas>
- 623 42. Standley CJ, Chu E, Kathawala E, Ventura D, Sorrell EM. Data and cooperation required for
624 Venezuela’s refugee crisis during COVID-19. *Globalization and Health*. 2020 Oct
625 22;16(1):103.
- 626 43. Parkin Daniels J. Alarm at Colombia plan to exclude migrants from coronavirus vaccine
627 [Internet]. *the Guardian*. 2020 [cited 2021 Jun 28]. Available from:
628 [http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2020/dec/22/colombia-coronavirus-](http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2020/dec/22/colombia-coronavirus-vaccine-migrants-venezuela-ivan-duque)
629 [vaccine-migrants-venezuela-ivan-duque](http://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2020/dec/22/colombia-coronavirus-vaccine-migrants-venezuela-ivan-duque)
- 630 44. Washington Post. As coronavirus explodes in Venezuela, Maduro’s government blames
631 ‘biological weapon’: the country’s returning refugees. [Internet]. [cited 2021 Nov 9];
632 Available from: [https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/the_americas/coronavirus-](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/the_americas/coronavirus-venezuela-migrant-maduro/2020/07/19/582c659c-c518-11ea-a99f-3bbdff1af38_story.html)
633 [venezuela-migrant-maduro/2020/07/19/582c659c-c518-11ea-a99f-3bbdff1af38_story.html](https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/the_americas/coronavirus-venezuela-migrant-maduro/2020/07/19/582c659c-c518-11ea-a99f-3bbdff1af38_story.html)

- 634 45. Mixed Migration Centre. Access to health services for Venezuelans in Colombia and Peru
635 during the COVID-19 pandemic [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2021 May 28]. Available from:
636 [https://mixedmigration.org/resource/4mi-snapshot-access-to-health-services-for-](https://mixedmigration.org/resource/4mi-snapshot-access-to-health-services-for-venezuelans-in-colombia-and-peru-during-the-covid-19-pandemic/)
637 [venezuelans-in-colombia-and-peru-during-the-covid-19-pandemic/](https://mixedmigration.org/resource/4mi-snapshot-access-to-health-services-for-venezuelans-in-colombia-and-peru-during-the-covid-19-pandemic/)
- 638 46. Pan American Health Organization. Resolution CD55/11, Rev 1. Health of migrants
639 [Internet]. [cited 2021 May 24]. Available from:
640 <https://www.paho.org/en/documents/cd5511-rev-1-health-migrants>
- 641 47. World Health Organization. COVID-19 immunization in refugees and migrants: principles
642 and key consideration [Internet]. 2021 Aug [cited 2022 Jul 17]. Available from:
643 [https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/covid-19-immunization-in-refugees-and-migrants-](https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/covid-19-immunization-in-refugees-and-migrants-principles-and-key-considerations-interim-guidance-31-august-2021)
644 [principles-and-key-considerations-interim-guidance-31-august-2021](https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/covid-19-immunization-in-refugees-and-migrants-principles-and-key-considerations-interim-guidance-31-august-2021)
- 645 48. Institute for Health Metrics and Evaluation. Worldwide shortage of health workers threatens
646 effective health coverage [Internet]. [cited 2022 Aug 15]. Available from:
647 [https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/worldwide-shortage-of-health-workers-](https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/worldwide-shortage-of-health-workers-threatens-effective-health-coverage-301553411.html)
648 [threatens-effective-health-coverage-301553411.html](https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/worldwide-shortage-of-health-workers-threatens-effective-health-coverage-301553411.html)
- 649 49. Homan P, Brown TH, King B. Structural intersectionality as a new direction for health
650 disparities research. *Journal of Health and Social Behavior*. 2021 Sep 1;62(3):350–70.
- 651 50. Freier LF, Aron Said V, Quesada Nicoli D. Non-discrimination and special protection for
652 migrants and refugees. *International Journal of Discrimination and the Law*. 2022 Aug
653 5;13582291221115538.
- 654 51. Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. A pandemic of
655 exclusion: The impact of COVID-19 on the human rights of migrants in Libya [Internet].
656 2021. Available from:
657 https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Migration/A_pandemic_of_exclusion.pdf
- 658 52. Birn AE, Nervi L, Siqueira E. Neoliberalism redux: The global health policy agenda and the
659 politics of cooptation in Latin America and beyond: Debate: The cooptation of global
660 health in Latin America. *Development and Change*. 2016 Jul;47(4):734–59.
- 661 53. Vasquez EE, Perez-Brumer A, Parker RG, editors. Social inequities and contemporary
662 struggles for collective health in Latin America. *Global Public Health*. 2019;14(6–7).
- 663 54. Maestriperi L. The COVID-19 pandemics: why intersectionality matters. *Frontiers in*
664 *Sociology* [Internet]. 2021 [cited 2022 Mar 10];6. Available from:
665 <https://www.frontiersin.org/article/10.3389/fsoc.2021.642662>
- 666



Figure