All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

1 Development and validation of a methodology to

2 measure exhaled carbon dioxide (CO₂) and control

3 indoor air renewal

4 Marta Baselga ¹, Juan J. Alba ^{1,2}, and Alberto J. Schuhmacher ^{1,3,*}

¹ Institute for Health Research Aragon (IIS Aragón), 50009 Zaragoza Spain; ² Department of Mechanical En-

6 gineering, University of Zaragoza, 50018 Zaragoza, Spain; ³ Fundación Agencia Aragonesa para la Investi-

7 gación y el Desarrollo (ARAID), 50018 Zaragoza, Spain. * Correspondence: ajimenez@iisaragon.es

8 **Abstract:**

9 The measurement of CO_2 has positioned itself as a low-cost and straightforward technique to indirectly control indoor air quality, allowing the reduction of the 10 11 concentration of potentially pathogen-loaded aerosols to which we are exposed. 12 However, on numerous occasions, bad practice limits the technique for CO₂ level 13 interpreting and does not apply methodologies that guarantee air renewal. This work 14 proposes a new methodology for measuring and controlling CO₂ levels for indoor air in 15 shared spaces. The proposed methodology is based on three stages: diagnosis, correction protocols, and monitoring/control/surveillance (MCS). The procedure is 16 17 explained using a cultural center as an actual base case study. Additionally, the 18 procedure was validated by implementing 40 voluntary commercial spaces in Zaragoza 19 (Spain). Standardization of methods is suggested so that the measurement of CO_2 20 becomes an effective strategy to control the airborne transmission of pathogens and 21 thus prevent future Covid-19 outbreaks and novel pandemics.

22 Keywords

23 Carbon dioxide; CO₂; infectious diseases; environmental engineering; covid-19; airborne

24 **1. Introduction**

Since the global acceptance of the transmission of COVID-19 by aerosols,¹ numerous 25 strategies have been developed to prevent air quality degradation by different means. It is 26 27 possible to differentiate between air renewal and air purification strategies. On the one 28 hand, renewal techniques evaluate and optimize air renewal in closed spaces. On the other 29 hand, purification methods are varied and struggle to eliminate potential airborne 30 pathogens. Although both strategies share the common goal of reducing the airborne spreading of respiratory diseases, air purification is seriously handicapped because it 31 32 usually requires higher economic investments (e.g., bipolar ionization systems, UV-C 33 radiation devices), and its efficacy has been poorly tested against SARS-CoV-2. As an exception, high-efficiency portable air cleaners (e.g., HEPA filters) are presented as an 34 35 affordable, high-performance method that can filter up to 99.9% of submicron particles and reduce SARS-CoV-2 aerial viral viral viral load up to 80%.^{2,3} However, in actual operating 36 37 conditions, it is necessary to consider the workflow of the equipment and its location to take 38 advantage of its performance.

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

39 Ideally, measuring aerosols would allow knowing the quality of the air and estimating the 40 risk of contagion. Nevertheless, the direct measurement of aerosols is highly complex and expensive since it requires specialized equipment. To overcome these hurdles, the carbon 41 42 dioxide (CO_2) measurement has been suggested as an indirect indicator of the risk of 43 respiratory infectious diseases transmission.⁴ The measure of exhaled CO₂ was proposed 44 before the pandemic to control the airborne spread of diseases since it represents a greater 45 probability of breathing air previously inhaled by other people.⁵ Consequently, the indoor CO₂ measurement is suggested as a reasonable ventilation proxy. It is possible to determine 46 47 what percentage of the exhaled air by another individual (y) according to the expression $y = C_e x + C_a(1 - x)$. Where, C_e corresponds to the concentration of CO₂ in exhaled air 48 (estimated at 40,000 ppm), C_a to the ambient CO₂ concentration and x to the fraction of 49 50 exhaled air. For instance, assuming a basal value of 440 ppm (fresh air outdoors), which 51 increases indoors up to 2,000 ppm, the approximate percentage of air that those individuals 52 have already breathed will be 3.9 %.

53 One of the significant limitations of CO₂ level measurement is that it cannot be directly 54 related to the concentration of aerosols in the environment since the generation of 55 bioaerosols depends on the type of respiratory activity.⁶ For example, aerosols generated during sustained vocalization (e.g., singing) are not comparable to those generated during 56 silent breathing.⁷⁻¹⁰ Nevertheless, CO₂ concentration limits have been proposed to reduce 57 58 COVID-19 transmission, usually between 700 and 1,000 ppm, regardless of the event.^{11,12}

59 SARS-CoV-2 is mainly spread over time and distance. An average of 3.1 ± 2.9 copies/L of air viral load average is deduced from a total of 313 samples.^{13–35} It has been established that 60 close contact transmission is predominant, while fomites and aerosols explain special 61 62 propagation events in punctual events, according to CDC guidelines.³⁶ The massive 63 infections associated with superspreading represent a scenario of complex epidemiological management. To date, superspreading events have only been reported indoors.^{28,37-55} Due 64 to the difficulty of discriminating between superspreaders and non-spreaders,^{28,56} it is 65 66 imperative to improve air quality in public and shared spaces. By implementing the proper 67 measures, it is possible to reduce cases of respiratory diseases in the community and 68 prevent future pandemics with devastating effects.

69 Many countries have implemented CO₂ measurement as a standard in different spaces, such as shopping centers,⁵⁷ collective transport,⁵⁸⁻⁶¹ workspaces,⁶² or university and school 70 classrooms.⁶²⁻⁶⁷ Beyond research projects, some governments have decided to bet on 71 72 scientific criteria and invest resources to mitigate contagion among the population. For 73 example, the U.K. government distributed more than 300,000 CO₂ meters in its schools to optimize air renewal during classes.⁶⁸ In Germany, a global approach was also carried out, 74 investing more than €17M to guarantee the presence of meters in schools.⁶⁹ An investment 75 76 of \$350 billion for state and local governments has recently been reported and \$122 billion 77 for schools, which can support making ventilation and air filtration upgrades in the U.S. to 78 reduce the respiratory pathogens spreading.⁷⁰

79 However, there are still no standardized methodologies for measuring and controlling CO₂. "Aireamos" (in Spanish, it refers to "renewing air"),^{71,72} as an international independent 80 81 scientific working group, has been a pioneer in developing the bases for measurement,

perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

82 making available to the population a set of valuable tools and resources to control the renewal of indoor air. However, there is still no straightforward procedure for intervening 83 84 in public and shared spaces. Before the pandemic, CO₂ measurement was mainly explored 85 in school settings. Numerous investigations pointed to an improvement in the pupil's concentration in well-ventilated classrooms.73-75 86

87 This article proposes a new methodology for effectively measuring and controlling CO₂ in 88 closed and shared spaces. The methodology is based on three stages: diagnosis, correction, 89 and controlled monitoring. The methodology allows us to interpret the air renewal patterns 90 and estimate if the renewal is appropriate to the activity and type of space. Additionally, this

- 91 method has been validated as a pilot project in a 3-floors building with multiple teaching
- 92 rooms and cultural activities and a subset of 40 local businesses in Zaragoza (Spain).
- 2. Materials and Methods 93
- 94 2.1. General description of the methodology

95 A methodology based on three standard stages with specific goals was developed. They 96 enumerate as follows:

97 a) Diagnosis. It is intended to acquire detailed knowledge on how CO_2 concentration 98 levels vary within the physical limits of the shared space and what is its time evolution 99 as a function of specific activities carried out in the shared space. The initial diagnosis 100 includes a description of the space indicating the measures of the shared space (e.g., 101 size, volume, and architectural geometry), other CO_2 sources (e.g., gas stove), the 102 presence and ubication of windows and doors, as well as the availability of Heating, Ventilation, and Air Conditioning (HVAC) systems and hoods. During this process, it is 103 104 necessary to identify the "person in charge" and perform minimal instruction about 105 the project and concepts such as air renewal, ventilation, metabolic CO₂ and how to 106 measure it.

- 107 b) Correction. According to the acquired knowledge in the diagnosis stage, it is possible 108 to proceed with the design of customized protocols and procedures to improve the air 109 renovation that will imply variations in the CO_2 concentration. The CO_2 levels will be 110 monitored with a CO₂ meter to avoid trespassing a defined threshold considered as a 111 low-risk level by the scientific community.
- 112 c) Monitoring, control, and surveillance (MCS): Continuous monitoring of CO₂ 113 concentration is performed to guarantee that the shared space is always kept at low-114 risk levels. In case of the CO₂ concentration levels reach the maximum level, an alert is 115 issued so that people in charge of the shared space activate the protocols and 116 procedures defined in the previous stage to fix the situation.

117 For each stage, achieving the primary goals depends on specific characteristics of the 118 shared space, such as main business or social activity, geometrical properties, number and 119 location of windows and doors, or a maximum number of people sharing the room at the 120 same time. A case study and a practical application is presented in this article to explain this 121 methodology.

122 2.2. Measurement of metabolic CO₂

- 123 Any time measuring metabolic CO₂ levels is required, Aranet CO₂ meters (Aranet Wireless
- 124 Solutions España SL, Spain) and Signos CO₂ meters (Signos.io, Spain) will be used. The tech-
- nical characteristics of these measuring devices are shown in Table 1.
- 126
- 127

Table 1. Technical characteristics of Aranet and Signos SIO₂ CO₂ meters.

Characteristics	Aranet 4 Pro	Signos (SiO2)	
CO ₂ measurement	< 9,999 ppm	< 5,000 ppm	
Temperature measurement	0 – 50 ^o C	-60 – 80 ^o C	
Humidity measurement	0 - 85 %	0 – 95 %	
Atmospheric pressure	0.3 – 1.1 atm	0.3 – 1.1 atm	
Sensor	N-DIR	N-DIR	
Sampling frequency	1 min	11 min	
Transmission	Bluetooth (-12–4 dBm)	LoRa	
Precision	± 50 ppm	± 50 ppm	
Dimensions / weight	70x70x24 mm / 104 g	100x100x23 mm / 170 g	

128

129 2.3. The methodology explained in a case study

130 As a case study, the methodology for improving air quality was applied in a cultural center.

131 The building has 1,200 m² divided in three floors (Figure 1a). A 132 m² room located in the 132 basement was selected (Classroom 1, see Figure 1b).

- 133a) Diagnosis: The shared spaces were analyzed for four days (February 24th to 27th, 2021)134by placing 10 CO2 meters (Aranet 4) in strategic locations, as shown in Figure 1a. A CO2135measuring device was placed outdoors so that it was possible to calculate the increase136in CO2 (ΔCO_2) associated with human activity according to Equation 1; where (CO2)ext137corresponds to CO2 outside and (CO2)ind to CO2 indoors.
- 138 $\Delta CO_2 = (CO_2)_{ind} - (CO_2)_{out}$ (Equation 1) 139 In the first approach, the data showed frequent high CO₂ concentration levels probably 140 linked to specific activities. Subsequently, the shared spaces were carefully monitored 141 for six more days (February 27th to March 5th, 2021) to confirm the hypotheses that 142 could be made after the initial analysis. This process makes it possible to characterize 143 the air renewal patterns in each space based on activity and capacity. At least one CO_2 144 meter was placed every 20 m² at a minimum height of 1.5 m. Ideally, they will be placed 145 near exhaust fans (to measure a significant air sample) and/or in locations where air 146 turnover is poor (e.g. corners), and far from windows and doors.

b) Correction: Based on the obtained results, an attempt was made to reduce the level of
metabolic CO₂ below 800 ppm. One of the classrooms in the basement of the building
(Classroom 1) showed inefficient ventilation patterns. Dry ice was used to saturate the
room with CO₂ and find effective strategies to improve air renewal. According to Figure
151 1b, 10 CO₂ meters (Aranet 4) were placed in the classroom to analyze the improvement
of changes in the HVAC and natural ventilation (through doors and windows opening
or closing).

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.22280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

- c) MCS: This stage was performed until May 15th, 2022 using 10 CO₂ meters (Signos). 154
- Whenever the cultural center exceeds the 800 ppm level for more than 30 minutes, it 155
- 156 receives a telematic alert or phone call to ask the "person in charge" to correct the
- 157 situation.



158 159 Figure 1. (a) General distribution of CO_2 meters in the education building and (b) classroom 1 detail.

160 2.4. Broader validation in commercial spaces

161 Subsequently, the method was applied to 40 businesses / retail stores spaces located in 162 Zaragoza's city center (Spain). These included: one optician, twelve clothing stores, two 163 kids' clothing stores, five shoe stores, two jewelry stores, four food stores, two restaurants, 164 five home stores, two consultancies, two dietary and health centers, and two florists. The selection of commercial spaces was made to cover different typologies. For example, 165 166 customers spend long periods in restaurants, while their exposure to indoor air in flower 167 retailers is minor. Two CO₂ meters were placed in each establishment, except for a kid's 168 clothing store, where only one was placed, and another children's clothing store, where three were placed. 169

170 Interventions in shared spaces were carried out following the three phases: diagnosis, 171 correction, and MCS.

172 Diagnostic. Two CO_2 meters (Aranet 4) devices were placed at strategic points for 2 a) 173 or 3 days in each business. These meters were chosen because they record the CO_2 174 level every minute. The CO₂ curves were analyzed during the business hours of each establishment. This phase allowed us to know if the sensors took representative 175 176 measurements of the total space and have a global image of the air quality in the 177 volume area. The diagnostic process might include the use of risk calculators or medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.22280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

methods for simulating disease propagation via aerosols based on the standard
 Wells-Riley model for infectious respiratory disease transmission by airborne
 particles.^{71,72,76}

- b) Correction. In spaces where it was necessary (typically presenting CO₂ levels >1,000
- 182 ppm for more than 30 minutes), a correction phase was carried out where preventive
- 183 measures were implemented to improve indoor air renewal. In most cases, this phase
- 184 was superimposed on monitoring to determine the advantage obtained at the time.
- 185 c) MCS. The monitoring stage occurred during January and February 2022. For this
 186 stage, CO2 (Signos) meters were installed in each establishment. These CO₂ meters,
 187 include IoT technology, enabled remote access to streaming data.

188 **3. Results**

189 3.1. The diagnostic stage to allow detection of inefficient air renewals

The diagnosis must be performed on a long enough time interval to cover the specific and regular casuistry of the establishment. For example, in the base case study (cultural center), the classrooms usually are occupied for daily classes. Therefore, a selection of days where the classrooms are occupied is sufficient. In this case, four days were used for the preliminary analysis of the space. Assuming a proper maximum CO₂ level of 800 ppm, a maximum increase of 400-450 ppm compared to fresh outdoor air was considered acceptable.



197 198

Figure 2. Increment of CO₂ values recorded in the diagnostic period.

199 As shown in Figure 2, there are peaks in the increment of CO_2 associated with the activity of 200 each room. Knowing the activity and the number of occupants is essential to interpret the 201 CO₂ measurements. Determining the ppm/person ratio can be helpful, as we proposed in 202 previous work (see ⁶¹). This value incorporates the occupancy variable and allows a more 203 precise definition of the efficiency of air renewal, although it assumes homogeneity in 204 exhalation between individuals. In addition, it is crucial to request the usual activity in the 205 space. Those responsible must not consciously increase ventilation (e.g., opening windows) 206 to avoid underestimating CO_2 measurements. A typical table with essential information is 207 shown in Table 2. The method to fill in the table must be explained in the training phase 208 since it is of utmost importance to interpret the data properly later. In the base case, the 209 room had no open windows, except for the Hall and the Art Classroom. In contrast, all doors 210 were open during diagnostic measurements.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.22280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in

perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

Table 2. Example of a data sheet for CO₂ measurements interpretation.

211

Duration	Activity	Occupation	Location	Mean ∆CO₂	Max ∆CO₂	Mean ppm/person	Max ppm/per- son
1:30 h	English class	8 pax	Auditorium	106 ppm	196 ppm	13.3 ppm	24.5 ppm
2:00 h	History class	15 pax	Auditorium	164 ppm	234 ppm	11.0 ppm	15.6 ppm
2:00 h	English class	9 pax	Auditorium	116 ppm	170 ppm	12.9 ppm	18.9 ppm
1:30 h	English class	10 pax	Classroom 1	89 ppm	153 ppm	8.9 ppm	15.3 ppm
2:00 h	English class	8 pax	Classroom 1	76 ppm	140 ppm	9.5 ppm	17.5 ppm
2:30 h	English exam	18 pax	Classroom 1	219 ppm	312 ppm	12.2 ppm	17.3 ppm
4:00 h	English exam	7 pax	Informatics	328 ppm	751 ppm	46.9 ppm	107.3 ppm
3:00 h	Art class	6 pax	Art classroom	68 ppm	121 ppm	11.3 ppm	20.2 ppm
1:30 h	Art class	6 pax	Art classroom	34 ppm	125 ppm	5.8 ppm	20.8 ppm
3:00 h	Art class	6 pax	Art classroom	79 ppm	243 ppm	13.2 ppm	40.5 ppm
2:30 h	Art class	4 pax	Art classroom	58 ppm	118 ppm	9.7 ppm	19.7 ppm
2:30 h	English class	7 pax	Multi. hall	163 ppm	263 ppm	23.3 ppm	37.6 ppm
1:00 h	English class	10 pax	Multi. hall	181 ppm	213 ppm	18.1 ppm	21.3 ppm
2:30 h	English class	8 pax	Multi. hall	177 ppm	279 ppm	22.2 ppm	34.9 ppm
	Duration 1:30 h 2:00 h 2:00 h 1:30 h 2:00 h 2:30 h 4:00 h 3:00 h 1:30 h 3:00 h 2:30 h 2:30 h 2:30 h 2:30 h 2:30 h	DurationActivity1:30 hEnglish class2:00 hHistory class2:00 hEnglish class2:00 hEnglish class2:00 hEnglish class2:00 hEnglish class2:30 hEnglish class2:30 hEnglish class2:30 hEnglish class3:00 hArt class3:00 hArt class3:00 hArt class2:30 hEnglish class2:30 hEnglish class2:30 hEnglish class1:00 hEnglish class2:30 hEnglish class	DurationActivityOccupation1:30 hEnglish class8 pax2:00 hHistory class15 pax2:00 hEnglish class9 pax1:30 hEnglish class10 pax2:00 hEnglish class10 pax2:00 hEnglish class8 pax2:30 hEnglish exam7 pax3:00 hArt class6 pax1:30 hArt class6 pax3:00 hArt class6 pax2:30 hArt class7 pax2:30 hEnglish class7 pax1:00 hEnglish class10 pax2:30 hEnglish class8 pax	DurationActivityOccupationLocation1:30 hEnglish class8 paxAuditorium2:00 hHistory class15 paxAuditorium2:00 hEnglish class9 paxAuditorium1:30 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 12:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 12:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 12:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 12:00 hEnglish exam18 paxClassroom 12:30 hEnglish exam7 paxInformatics3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom1:30 hArt class6 paxArt classroom3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom2:30 hArt class7 paxMulti. hall1:00 hEnglish class7 paxMulti. hall2:30 hEnglish class10 paxMulti. hall2:30 hEnglish class8 paxMulti. hall	DurationActivityOccupationLocationMean ΔCO21:30 hEnglish class8 paxAuditorium106 ppm2:00 hHistory class15 paxAuditorium164 ppm2:00 hEnglish class9 paxAuditorium116 ppm2:00 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 189 ppm2:00 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 1219 ppm1:30 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 1219 ppm2:00 hEnglish exam7 paxInformatics328 ppm2:30 hEnglish exam7 paxInformatics328 ppm3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom34 ppm3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom58 ppm2:30 hEnglish class7 paxMulti. hall163 ppm2:30 hEnglish class10 paxMulti. hall181 ppm2:30 hEnglish class8 paxMulti. hall177 ppm	DurationActivityOccupationLocationMean ΔCO_2 Max ΔCO_2 1:30 hEnglish class8 paxAuditorium106 ppm196 ppm2:00 hHistory class15 paxAuditorium164 ppm234 ppm2:00 hEnglish class9 paxAuditorium116 ppm170 ppm1:30 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 189 ppm153 ppm2:00 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 189 ppm153 ppm2:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 1219 ppm312 ppm2:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 1219 ppm312 ppm2:00 hEnglish class6 paxArt classroom 1219 ppm312 ppm3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom68 ppm121 ppm1:30 hArt class6 paxArt classroom34 ppm125 ppm3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom58 ppm118 ppm2:30 hEnglish class7 paxMulti. hall163 ppm263 ppm2:30 hEnglish class10 paxMulti. hall181 ppm213 ppm2:30 hEnglish class8 paxMulti. hall177 ppm279 ppm	DurationActivityOccupationLocationMean ΔCO2Max ΔCO2Mean ppm/person1:30 hEnglish class8 paxAuditorium106 ppm196 ppm13.3 ppm2:00 hHistory class15 paxAuditorium164 ppm234 ppm11.0 ppm2:00 hEnglish class9 paxAuditorium116 ppm170 ppm12.9 ppm1:30 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 189 ppm153 ppm8.9 ppm2:00 hEnglish class10 paxClassroom 176 ppm140 ppm9.5 ppm2:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 1219 ppm312 ppm12.2 ppm2:00 hEnglish class8 paxClassroom 1219 ppm312 ppm12.2 ppm2:00 hEnglish class6 paxArt classroom 1219 ppm312 ppm12.2 ppm2:30 hEnglish exam7 paxInformatics328 ppm751 ppm46.9 ppm3:00 hArt class6 paxArt classroom68 ppm121 ppm11.3 ppm1:30 hArt class6 paxArt classroom79 ppm243 ppm13.2 ppm2:30 hArt class7 paxMulti. hall163 ppm263 ppm23.3 ppm2:30 hEnglish class10 paxMulti. hall181 ppm213 ppm18.1 ppm2:30 hEnglish class10 paxMulti. hall177 ppm279 ppm22.2 ppm2:30 hEnglish class8 paxMulti. hall177 ppm

212 Comparing the ppm/person indicator in similar activities in different spaces makes it 213 possible to determine the relative efficiency of air renewal in each space. For instance, in 214 English classes (not oral), 9.2 ± 16.4 , 13.1 ± 21.7 , and 18.1 ± 21.3 ppm/person were achieved 215 in Classroom 1, the Auditorium, and the Multipurpose Room, respectively. It indicates that 216 air renewal is similar in all rooms, although slightly improved in Classroom 1. On the contrary, disparate ratios were obtained in the Cambridge exams in Classroom 1 and the 217 218 Informatics Classroom. While in Classroom 1, the ratio was $12.2 \pm 17.3 \text{ ppm/person}$, in the 219 Informatics Classroom, a 46.9 ± 107.3 ppm/person was found. Again, this indicates more 220 efficient air renewal inside the basement room.

221 Some gaps may go unnoticed during the diagnostic phase. Due to the atmospheric 222 conditions or the activity during the diagnosis, the CO_2 levels may be decreased. Although 223 we recommend analyzing 3-4 critical days, subsequent days (e.g., 5-6 days) should be closely monitored to ensure representative results. For example, in the base case, on the 224 225 monitoring days after diagnosis, higher CO₂ concentrations were recorded in Classroom 1 than in other areas, even in similar conditions of capacity and activity. 226

227 3.2. Interpretation of CO_2 measurements, methods to correct gaps, and 228 monitoring

229 After detecting spaces that can be improved, it is necessary to implement efficient corrective 230 measures that guarantee adequate air renewal. First, it is crucial to interpret the 231 measurements and begin to rule out possibilities. In the case of Classroom 1, the following 232 hypotheses were prepared:

233 Hypothesis 1. The activities studied in the initial diagnosis were not representative, 234 and the high activity in the classroom, so more CO_2 is exhaled. Then, the following 235 12 English classes in Classroom 1, comprising the months of April to June, were 236 analyzed. In the studied activities, no significant increase in CO₂ was observed, medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.2280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

except for the classes held in June, where an increase of 522 ppm was reached.
Figure 3 shows the evolution of average CO₂ from April to June, showing an increase
in concentration in the latter month. However, CO₂ exhalation in the records studied
is similar, so this hypothesis is ruled out.

600 500 400 300 200



242 243

241

Figure 3. Evolution of average $\triangle CO_2$ in English classes from April to June.

244 Hypothesis 2. The weather conditions of the initial diagnosis were favorable for air 245 renewal ratios. The weather influence on the ventilation ratios was evaluated by 246 analyzing the incidences (values above 800 ppm for more than 30 minutes) recorded from April to July (regardless of the activity carried out). Of the 13 247 incidences found, 46 % (6) came from July, while 31 % (4) came from June, and the 248 249 remaining 23% (3) from May. The climatic variation has affected the ventilation 250 performance of the space. Working on days with less favorable weather will be 251 necessary to test the corrective measures.

252 Testing corrective measures. An experiment where the space was saturated with • 253 CO_2 using dry ice was conducted, stabilized as a function of the amount evaporated. 254 Two scenarios were evaluated with an activated HVAC system: with and without 255 opening doors. Figure 4 shows the results obtained. With doors closed, it takes 256 ~1,600 ppm ~37 minutes to reduce the CO_2 concentration to ~800 ppm, at 22 257 ppm/minute. While, with doors open, the reduction from ~1,600 ppm to ~800 ppm 258 occurs in ~17 minutes, at 47 ppm/minute. The opening of doors with the HVAC 259 system active supposes a remarkable improvement of the ventilation in this 260 classroom.

In addition, this method helps calculate actual air changes per hour (ACH) in space. The HVAC flow in Classroom 1 is 750 m³/s. For a volume of 363 m³ corresponding to the space, a theoretical ACH of 2.06 (door closed) is estimated. An ACH of 4.42 (with opened doors) and 2.03 (closed doors) has been determined by dry ice tests. It suggests that the tests have been carried out correctly and that the opening of the doors represents a considerable improvement in air renewal compared to the closed space.

Sometimes, the subsequent monitoring phase can be used to assess the benefit of
 the corrective actions imposed. In the base case, opening doors in Classroom 1 was
 enough to achieve adequate air renewal, even in the summer months. Ideally,
 during monitoring, it would be necessary to implement a system that alerts those

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.2280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

272 responsible for the space if the established CO₂ limits are exceeded. This strategy

273 allows for preventing possible incidents and correcting CO_2 levels exceeded in

274 streaming, thus, guaranteeing adequate air quality.

275



276 277

278

279 3.3. Applying and validating the method in local businesses

To perform a broader application of the methodology to diagnose, correct, and monitor CO₂ we performed a study in 40 retail stores. To this end we modified the phases to meet the pre-established requirements, and the absolute CO₂ concentration was measured (instead of the outdoor-indoor CO₂ increase). In addition, the ppm/person indicator could not be used since the businesses could not provide a continuous record of the occupancy.

Initially, a preliminary characterization (diagnosis) of the participant businesses was conducted. 23 businesses with CO_2 values above the maximum recommended (800 ppm) were identified. Eight of them did not require specific follow-up interventions as they were minimal and discrete increases. The other 15 participants were subjected to an exhaustive evaluation that served to design and implement a series of prevention measures that had to be implemented to improve air recirculation in the commercial spaces.

The implementation of corrective measures was modified from the original approach. Instead of *in-situ* experimenting, it was decided to assess the improvement of the proposed measures throughout the MCS stages. Thus, we evaluate the air renewal patterns from week to week. In our case, it was enough to agree on the terms with each person in charge through fortnight reports and phone calls. The presented strategy allowed us to reduce the costs of the project and to be able to evaluate several stores at the same time.

In the period studied (January-February 2022), the average CO_2 of all businesses was 547 ± 87 ppm in the first fortnight of January, 559 ± 86 ppm in the second fortnight of January, 531 ± 82 ppm in the first fortnight of February, and 529 ± 89 in the second half of January (Figure 5a). Substantial differences were observed according to the type of store, as shown in Figure 5b. Specifically, the highest CO_2 peaks were observed in Kids' clothing stores (691 ± 209 ppm with maximums of 2,297 ppm). It may be associated with a limited opening of doors or windows to maintain the thermal comfort of the children. In contrast, florists reported the medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.2280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

304 lowest CO_2 levels (mean of 466 ± 47 ppm with a maximum of 874 ppm), possibly due to

305 customers' reduced time during service.

306





Figure 5. (a) Mean of CO₂ value (inbox) of all businesses based on the fortnight and (b) mean of CO₂
 and maximum measurement depending on the type of business where the mean value (blue) and
 the maximum values (pink label) are shown.

311

312 A total of 15 businesses were selected for exhaustive monitoring. Among them, only five 313 agreed to implement the corrective measures. The following sections describe the evolution

- 314 of 3 establishments under the three typical scenarios:
- Retail stores with good starting air quality. Initially, 17 shops showed a renewal of
 the air appropriate to the architecture of the space and the type of activity carried
 out. Three cases are shown below as an example.
- 318 *Example 1*) In a shoe store, the limit of 800 ppm was not exceeded during the 319 recorded period (Figure 6a). Specifically, it obtained an average CO_2 value of 441 ± 320 42 ppm, reaching a maximum value of 776 ppm.
- *Example 2*) A food store was kept below 800 ppm (Figure 6b). Despite the large influx
 of customers, the levels maintained an average of 454 ± 39 ppm, reaching a
 maximum value of 782 ppm
- *Example 3*) In one of the clothing stores, the maximum established by the scientific
 community of 800 ppm was not exceeded (Figure 6c). On average, it reached a value
 of 469 ± 33 ppm, reaching a maximum value of 783 ppm.
- 327 2. Businesses with improvable air quality that did not implement corrective actions. 328 Of the 23 stores that showed levels above 800 ppm during the first week, only 15 of 329 them did so continuously and with values above 900 ppm. The remaining eight 330 stores were recommended to maximize the frequency of opening doors and 331 windows. This section shows the evolution of CO_2 in a business that refused to 332 establish the proposed corrective measures.
- *Example 1*) On average, a clothing store reached a value of 709 ± 295 ppm, reaching
 a maximum of 2956 ppm (Figure 6d).
- *Example 2*) A restaurant establishment reached an average value of 589 ± 139 ppm,
 reaching a maximum value of 1976 ppm (Figure 6e).
- 337 *Example 3)* The mean of CO_2 in a children's clothing store was 762 ± 229 ppm, 338 reaching a maximum of 2297 ppm (Figure 6f).

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.22280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

- 339
 3. Spaces with improvable air quality that implemented corrective actions. After
 implementing the prevention measures (especially the reinforcement of natural
 ventilation), the reduction of CO₂ in the establishments was substantial. Three cases
 are described below. The values of the first weeks concerning the final weeks are
 comparable, given that similar trends and averages are observed in the previous
- 344 section.
- 345 *Example 1*) In a clothing shop, the mean of CO_2 was reduced from 605 ± 78 ppm 346 (maximum of 1100 ppm) to 529 ± 78 ppm (745 ppm) after trying different measures.
- The increase in the frequency of door opening (Figure 6g) was more effective in the fourth fortnight. In this period, no values over 800 ppm were registered.
- 349*Example 2*) CO2 levels on average were reduced from 536 ± 89 ppm (maximum of3501001 ppm) to 485 ± 51 ppm (714 ppm) from the third fortnight in a food store, as351shown in Figure 6h.
- 352 Example 3) In a shoe store, the mean of CO_2 was reduced from 528 ± 67 ppm
- 353 (maximum of 946 ppm) to 473 ± 45 ppm (764 ppm). Although, at one point, 800 ppm



Figure 6. Evolution of CO₂ levels in the monitoring period (January-February 2022) in (a-c) businesses with good starting air quality, (d-f) businesses with improvable air quality that did not implement corrective measures, and (g-i) businesses with improvable air quality that implemented corrective actions. The pink dots indicate the CO₂ curves of stores with poor air renewal, while the blue dots represent CO₂ curves of establishments with good air renewal.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.22280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

4. Conclusions 361

362 This work presents and discusses a new methodology for measuring CO₂ in shared spaces 363 based on diagnosis, correction, and MCS (monitoring-control and surveillance phases). This methodology was validated in a subset of 40 local businesses in Zaragoza (Spain). The 364 365 COVID-19 pandemic has pointed to the need to rethink the epidemiological control techniques. In particular, the increasing knowledge on airborne transmission of diseases makes 366 it imperative to implement new public health strategies that guarantee that air guality fol-367 368 lows specific standards. If the incorporation of these strategies proves effective, it will be 369 possible to prevent numerous respiratory affections and potential new pandemics.

- 370 Briefly, the methodology can be sequenced in three stages:
- 371 1. Diagnosing. After training the responsible person, the diagnostic phase was carried 372 out. A first assessment of the shared space is made by placing CO_2 meters for a time 373 interval long enough to address the maximum possible casuistry. Usually, 3 or 4 busi-374 ness days is enough. Ideally, placing more than 1 CO_2 meter will let us know if the 375 measurement represents the space. Additionally, it will bring preliminary -but no de-376 finitive- information about how the air renewal occurs in the shared space. After an 377 in-depth analysis of the evolution of CO_2 levels in the diagnosis phase, it is necessary 378 to follow up in subsequent days (typically 6 or 7 days) to ensure that the diagnosis is 379 representative of the space.
- 380 2. Correcting. Poor air renewal must be identified once an exhaustive analysis of the space has been carried out. Based on current scientific knowledge, a criterion of not 381 382 exceeding 800 ppm for more than 20-30 minutes may be valuable. After detecting 383 these incidences, it is necessary to look for the cause of the problem. It is helpful to 384 raise possible hypotheses and try to rule them out to propose efficient corrective 385 measures. Ideally, these proposed measures can be validated by conducting experiments (e.g., saturating with CO₂ and analyzing the advantage of each one) or carrying 386 387 out a detailed follow-up in the monitoring phase. Note that this phase can be performed linearly (e.g., after diagnosis), or it can also be implemented during monitor-388 389 ing if necessary.
- 390 3. MCS. A monitoring and follow-up phase is crucial to warn of any incident where the 391 CO₂ limit is exceeded. It is the only strategy that guarantees that good indoor air 392 quality. It is possible that, in spaces where natural ventilation influences the space air 393 renewal, the CO₂ concentration fluctuates depending on the weather. In these cases, 394 it may be necessary to re-implement the correction phase to maintain an adequate 395 air renewal. Ideally, an alert system can be valuable for the monitored center, allow-396 ing it to prevent the accumulation of CO_2 or modulate the capacity and, ultimately, 397 correct the situation.

398 The results obtained from the validation in 40 retail stores in the center of Zaragoza (Spain) 399 suggest that it is possible to implement measures that favor the renewal of shared air 400 quickly. Opening doors and windows is one of the most straightforward and immediate 401 methods applied in almost any situation. We have shown that the methodology is practical 402 and can reduce the risk of transmission of respiratory diseases by aerosols by increasing air 403 renovation. We hope this work contributes to laving the methodological foundations for 404 CO₂ measurement to become a valuable, standardized, and guaranteed tool.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.22280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity.

All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

405 Acknowledgments

406 We would like to express our gratitude to "Fundación Ibercaja" and "Federación de 407 Empresarios de Comercio y Servicios de Zaragoza (ECOS Zaragoza)" for supporting this 408 research and their invaluable collaboration. We thank Signos.io for help and support with 409 the CO₂ meters. We also would like to thank "Ayuntamiento de Zaragoza" and "Instituto de

410 Investigación Sanitaria Aragón" for the received support.

411 Conflict of Interest

412 The authors declare no competing financial interest.

413 **References**

- 414 1. Lewis BD. Why the WHO took two years to say COVID is airborne. *Nature*. 2022;604:26–31.
- 4152.Rodríguez M, Palop ML, Seseña S, Rodríguez A. Are the Portable Air Cleaners (PAC) really effective to416terminate airborne SARS-CoV-2? Sci Total Environ. 2021;785:147300. 2021.417https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.147300.
- 4183.Liu DT, Philips KM, Speth MM, Besser G, Mueller CA, Sedaghat AR. Portable HEPA Purifiers to419Eliminate Airborne SARS-CoV-2: A Systematic Review. Otolaryngol Head Neck Surg (United States).4202021:1-8.
- 4214.Peng Z, Jimenez JL. Exhaled CO2as a COVID-19 infection risk proxy for different indoor environments422and activities. *Environ Sci Technol Lett.* 2021;8:392–397.
- 4235.Rudnick S, Milton D. Risk of indoor airborne infection transmission estimated from carbon dioxide424concentration. *Indoor Air*. 2003;13:237-45.
- 4256.Kappelt N, Russell HS, Kwiatkowski S, Afshari A, Johnson MS. Correlation of respiratory aerosols and426metabolic carbon dioxide. Sustain. 2021;13:1–11.
- 4277.Shao S, Zhou D, He R, et al. Risk assessment of airborne transmission of COVID-19 by asymptomatic428individuals under different practical settings. J Aerosol Sci. 2021;151:105661. 2021.429https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaerosci.2020.105661.
- 4308.Fabian P, Brain J, Houseman E, Gern J, Milton D. Origin of exhaled breath particles from healthy and431human rhinovirus-infected subjects. J Aerosol Med Pulm Drug Deliv. 2011;24:137–47.
- 432 9. Wang CC, Prather KA, Sznitman J, et al. Airborne transmission of respiratory viruses. *Science (80-)*.
 433 2021;373:eabd9149.
- 43410.Johnson GR, Morawska L, Ristovski ZD, et al. Modality of human expired aerosol size distributions. J435Aerosol Sci. 2011;42:839–851.
- 43611.Ingenieros Industriales de Aragón y la Rioja C, Ayuntamiento de Zaragoza A. *Guía de Referencia*437*Covid.*; 2021. Available on: http://www.zaragoza.es/contenidos/coronavirus/guia-referencia-438covid.gdf (accessed on June 11th 2022).
- 43912.Cheng SY, Wang CJ, Shen ACT, Chang SC. How to Safely Reopen Colleges and Universities During440COVID-19: Experiences From Taiwan. Ann Intern Med. 2020;173:638-641.
- 44113.Liu Y, Ning Z, Chen Y, et al. Aerodynamic analysis of SARS-CoV-2 in two Wuhan hospitals. Nature.4422020;582:557-560.
- 44314.Stern RA, Koutrakis P, Martins MAG, et al. Characterization of hospital airborne SARS-CoV-2. *Respir*444*Res.* 2021;22:1–8. 2021. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12931-021-01637-8.
- Department of Infectious Disease, Imperial College London, London, UK W 1PG. EVALUATION OF
 SARS-C o V-2 AIR CONTAMINATION IN HOSPITALS WITH CORIOLIS μ AIR SAMPLER / CONTEXT /
 PROTOCOL / RESULTS / CUSTOMER / CONCLUSION. 2020. Available on: https://www.bertininstruments.com/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/CORM-026-039-B-SARS-CoV-2-in-hospitals-1.pdf
 (accessed on June 11th 2022)
- 450 16. Mallach G, Kasloff SB, Kovesi T, et al. Aerosol SARS-CoV-2 in hospitals and long-term care homes

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.2280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

451 452		during the COVID-19 pandemic. <i>PLoS One</i> . 2021;16:1–17. 2021. http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0258151.
453 454	17.	Winslow RL, Zhou J, Windle E.F., et al. SARS-CoV-2 environmental contamination from hospitalised COVID-19 patients receiving aerosol generating procedures. <i>Thorax</i> . 2021:thoraxjnl-2021-218035.
455 456	18.	Kenarkoohi A, Noorimotlagh Z, Falahi S, Amarloei A, Abbas S. Hospital indoor air quality monitoring for the detection of SARS-CoV-2 (COVID-19) virus. <i>Sci Total Envionment</i> . 2020;748:141324.
457 458	19.	Ma J, Qi X, Chen H, et al. Exhaled breath is a significant source of SARS-CoV-2 emission. <i>medRxiv</i> . 2020: https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.05.31.20115154.
459 460 461 462	20.	Styczynski A, Hemlock C, Hoque KI, et al. Ventilation and detection of airborne SARS-CoV-2:elucidating high-risk spaces in naturally ventilated healthcare settings. <i>medRxiv</i> .2021:2021.06.30.21258984.https://www.medrxiv.org/content/10.1101/2021.06.30.21258984v1.
463 464 465	21.	Moore G, Rickard H, Stevenson D, et al. Detection of SARS-CoV-2 within the healthcare environment: a multi-centre study conducted during the first wave of the COVID-19 outbreak in England. <i>J Hosp Infect</i> . 2021;108:189–196. 2021. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhin.2020.11.024.
466 467	22.	Dumont-Leblond N, Veillette M, Mubareka S, et al. Low incidence of airborne SARS-CoV-2 in acute care hospital rooms with optimized ventilation. <i>Emerg Microbes Infect</i> . 2020;9:2597–2605.
468 469 470	23.	Song ZG, Chen YM, Wu F, et al. Identifying the Risk of SARS-CoV-2 Infection and Environmental Monitoring in Airborne Infectious Isolation Rooms (AIIRs). <i>Virol Sin</i> . 2020;35:785–792. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12250-020-00301-7.
471 472	24.	Nissen K, Krambrich J, Akaberi D, et al. Long-distance airborne dispersal of SARS-CoV-2 in COVID-19 wards. <i>Sci Rep</i> . 2020;10:1–9. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-76442-2.
473 474 475	25.	Ding Z, Qian H, Xu B, et al. Toilets dominate environmental detection of severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 in a hospital. <i>Sci Total Environ</i> . 2021;753:141710. 2021. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.141710.
476 477	26.	Moreno T, Pintó RM, Bosch A, et al. Tracing surface and airborne SARS-CoV-2 RNA inside public buses and subway trains. <i>Environ Int</i> . 2021;147:106326.
478 479 480	27.	Barbieri P, Zupin L, Licen S, et al. Molecular detection of SARS-CoV-2 from indoor air samples in environmental monitoring needs adequate temporal coverage and infectivity assessment. <i>Environ Res.</i> 2021;198:111200.
481 482	28.	Baselga M, Güemes A, Alba JJ, Schuhmacher AJ. SARS-CoV-2 Droplet and Airborne Transmission Heterogeneity. <i>J Clin Med</i> . 2022;11:2607.
483 484 485	29.	Lednicky J, Shankar S, Elbadry M, et al. Collection of SARS-CoV-2 Virus from the Air of a Clinic Within a University Student Health Care Center and Analyses of the Viral Genomic Sequence. <i>Aerosol Air Qual Res.</i> 2020;20:1167–71.
486 487	30.	Chia PY, Coleman KK, Tan YK, et al. Detection of air and surface contamination by SARS-CoV-2 in hospital rooms of infected patients. <i>Nat Commun</i> . 2020;11:2800.
488 489 490	31.	Chen GM, J.I. J.J., Jiang S, et al. Detecting Environmental Contamination of Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) in Isolation Wards and Fever Clinics*. <i>Biomed Environ Sci.</i> 2020;33:943–947.
491 492 493	32.	Santarpia JL, Rivera DN, Herrera VL, et al. Aerosol and surface contamination of SARS-CoV-2 observed in quarantine and isolation care. <i>Sci Rep.</i> 2020;10:1–8. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-020-69286-3.
494 495 496	33.	Zhou AJ, Otter JA, Price J.R., et al. Investigating SARS-CoV-2 surface and air contamination in an acute healthcare 2 setting during the peak of the COVID-19 pandemic in London. <i>Clin Infect Dis</i> . 2021:73:7:e1870-e1877.
497 498	34.	Lei H, Ye F, Liu X, et al. SARS-CoV-2 Environmental Contamination Associated with Persistently Infected COVID-19 Patients. <i>Influenza Other Respir Viruses.</i> 2020. 14:6:688-699.
499 500	35.	Gomes P, Gonçalves J, Isabel A, et al. Evidence of Air and Surface Contamination with SARS-CoV-2 in a Major Hospital in Portugal. 2022.
501	36.	Centers for Disease Control and Prevention C. Scientific Brief: SARS-CoV-2 Transmission. Available

502 503		on: https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/more/scientific-brief- sars-cov-2.html e- briefs%2Fscientific-brief-sars-cov-2.html (accessed June 11 2022).
504 505	37.	Shim E, Tariq A, Choi W, Lee Y, Chowell G. Transmission potential and severity of COVID-19 in South Korea. <i>Int J Infect Dis</i> . 2020;93:339–344. 2020. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2020.03.031.
506 507	38.	Park SY, Kim YM, Yi S, et al. Coronavirus disease outbreak in call center, South Korea. <i>Emerg Infect Dis</i> . 2020;26:1666–1670.
508 509	39.	Fontanet A, Tondeur L, Madec Y, et al. Cluster of COVID-19 in Northern France: A Retrospective Closed Cohort Study. <i>SSRN Electron J</i> . 2020:1–22.
510 511 512 513	40.	MOH.NewsHighlights.Availableon:http://web.archive.org/web/20200420074230/https://www.moh.gov.sg/news-highlights/details/16-more-cases-discharged-35-new-cases-of-covid-19-infection-confirmedi(accessed June 11th 2022).iii
514 515	41.	Cai J, Sun W, Huang J, Gamber M, Wu J, He G. Indirect Virus Transmission in Cluster of COVID-19 Cases, Wenzhou, China, 2020. <i>Emerg Infect Dis</i> . 2020;26:1343–1345.
516 517	42.	Chu J, Yang N, Wei Y, et al. Clinical characteristics of 54 medical staff with COVID-19: A retrospective study in a single center in Wuhan, China. <i>J Med Virol</i> . 2020;92:807–813.
518 519 520	43.	Sim W. Japan identifies 15 clusters as Covid-19 cases. <i>The Straits Times</i> . Available on: http://web.archive.org/web/20200420073241/https://www.straitstimes.com/asia/east-asia/japan-identifies-15-clusters-as-covid-19-cases-mount (accessed June 11th 2022).
521 522 523	44.	Aljazeera. After one infected 16 at Berlin nightclub, coronavirus fears grow. Available on: http://web.archive.org/web/20200420071353/https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2020/03/infected-16-berlin-nightclub-coronavirus-fears-grow-200310132859234.html (accessed on June 11th 2022).
524 525 526	45.	Marcelo P, O'brien M. Cluster of coronavirus cases tied to U.S. Biotech Meeting. Available on: http://web.archive.org/web/20200401222019/https://time.com/5801554/coronavirus-cluster-biotech-biogen-boston-cambridge/ (accessed on June 11th 2022).
527 528 529	46.	Orban A. 26 passengers tested positive for Covid-19 on an Emirates flight to Hong Kong. <i>Aviation 24.</i> Available on: https://www.aviation24.be/airlines/emirates-airline/26-passengers-tested-positive-on-an-emirates-flight-to-hong-kong/ (accessed June 11th 2022).
530 531	47.	Shen Y, Li C, Dong H, et al. Community Outbreak Investigation of SARS-CoV-2 Transmission among Bus Riders in Eastern China. <i>JAMA Intern Med</i> . 2020;180:1665–1671.
532 533 534 535 536	48.	Zauzmer J. 'Take it very seriously': Pastor at Arkansas church where 34 people came down with coronavirus sends a warning. <i>The Washington Post.</i> Available on: http://web.archive.org/web/20200420073657/https://www.washingtonpost. com/religion/2020/03/24/pastor-arkansas-church-coronavirus-warning-greers-ferry/ (accessed June 11th 2022)
537 538 539	49.	McKie R. Did singing together spread coronavirus to four choirs? <i>The Guardian</i> . Available on: https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/may/17/did-singing-together-spread-coronavirus-to-four-choirs (accessed June 11th 2022).
540 541 542	50.	Dashboard of the COVID-19 Virus Outbreak in Singapore. Available on: http://web.archive.org/web/20200420073524/https://www.againstcovid19.com/singapore?start=2 1-01-2020&end=20-04-2020 (accessed June 11th 2022)
543 544	51.	Adam DC, Wu P, Wong JY, et al. Clustering and superspreading potential of SARS-CoV-2 infections in Hong Kong. <i>Nat Med</i> . 2020;26:1714–1719. 2020. http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/s41591-020-1092-0.
545 546 547	52.	D.W. Coronavirus: German slaughterhouse outbreak crosses. Available on: https://www.dw.com/en/coronavirus-german-slaughterhouse-outbreak-crosses-1000/a-53883372 (accessed on June 11th 2022).
548 549 550 551	53.	Cannon A. Spike in COVID-19 cases in Iowa packing plants a big part of 389 new cases, state's largestsingle-dayincrease.DesMoinesRegister.Availableon:https://eu.desmoinesregister.com/story/news/2020/04/19/coronavirus-iowa-largest-single-day-increase-iowa-covid-19-cases-tied-meatpacking-plants/5162127002/ (accessed June 11th 2022).
552	54.	Adebayo B. A Worker Infected 533 Others With Coronavirus at a Factory in Ghana, President Says.

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.2280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

553 554		Available on: https://edition.cnn.com/2020/05/11/africa/ghana-factory-coronavirus-infection-intl/index.html (accessed June 11th 2022).
555 556 557	55.	Halliday J. Over 450 Covid-19 cases reported at food factories in England and Wales. The Guardian.Availableon:https://www.theguardian.com/uk-news/2020/jun/25/over-450-covid-19-cases-reported-at-food-factories-in-england-and-wales (accessed June 11th 2022).
558 559	56.	Sneppen K, Taylor RJ, Simonsen L. Impact of superspreaders on dissemination and mitigation of COVID-19. <i>Proc Natl Acad Sci</i> . 2020. https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.05.17.20104745.
560 561 562 563	57.	Ryukyu A, Haebaru H, Ono K. Providing Visualized Information on "Safety and Security" Installation of CO 2 Concentration Monitors for Customers at Aeon Stores. 2021. Available online: https://www.aeondelight.co.jp/english/news/20210901_installation-of-co2-concentration-monitors-for-customers-at-aeon-stores.pdf (accessed on 27 May 2022).
564	58.	Querol X, Alastuey A, Moreno N, et al. How can ventilation be improved on public transportation
565		buses? Insights from CO2 measurements. <i>Environ Res</i> . 2022;205:112451.
566 567	59.	Woodward H, Fan S, Bhagat RK, et al. Air flow experiments on a train carriage—Towards understanding the risk of airborne transmission. <i>Atmosphere (Basel)</i> . 2021;12:1267.
568 569 570	60.	Salthammer T, Fauck C, Omelan A, Wientzek S, Uhde E. Time and spatially resolved tracking of the air quality in local public transport. <i>Sci Rep</i> . 2022;12:1–9. 2022. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-022-07290-5.
571 572	61.	Baselga M, Alba JJ, Schuhmacher AJ. The Control of Metabolic CO2 in Public Transport as a Strategy to Reduce the Transmission of Respiratory Infectious Diseases. 2022:1–20.
573 574	62.	Bazant MZ, Kodio O, Cohen AE, Khan K, Gu Z, Bush JWM. Monitoring carbon dioxide to quantify the risk of indoor airborne transmission of COVID-19. <i>Flow</i> . 2021;1:1–18.
575 576 577	63.	Chillon SA, Millan M, Aramendia I, Fernandez-Gamiz U, Zulueta E, Mendaza-Sagastizabal X. Natural ventilation characterization in a classroom under different scenarios. <i>Int J Environ Res Public Health</i> . 2021;18.
578 579	64.	Zhang D, Ding E, Bluyssen PM. Guidance to assess ventilation performance of a classroom based on CO2 monitoring. <i>Indoor Built Environ</i> . 2022;31:4:1107-1126.
580 581	65.	McNeill VF, Corsi R, Huffman JA, et al. Room-level ventilation in schools and universities. <i>Atmos Environ X</i> . 2022;13.
582 583	66.	Avella F, Gupta A, Peretti C, et al. Low-Invasive CO2-based visual alerting systems to manage natural ventilation and improve IAQ in historic school buildings. <i>Heritage</i> . 2021;4:3442–3468.
584 585	67.	Zivelonghi A, Lai M. Mitigating aerosol infection risk in school buildings: the role of natural ventilation, volume, occupancy and CO2 monitoring. <i>Build Environ</i> . 2021;204:29:108139.
586 587 588	68.	GOV.UK. All schools to receive carbon dioxide monitors. Available on: https://www.gov.uk/government/news/all-schools-to-receive-carbon-dioxide-monitors (accessed June 11th 2022).
589 590 591	69.	Dutch News. All classrooms to get a CO2 meter as part of ventilation package. Available on: https://www.dutchnews.nl/news/2022/02/all-classrooms-to-get-a-co2-meter-as-part-of-ventilation-package/ (accessed June 11th 2022).
592 593 594 595	70.	The Withe House. Biden Administration Launches Effort to Improve Ventilation and Reduce the Spread of COVID-19 in Buildings. Available on: https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2022/03/17/fact-sheet-biden-administration-launches-effort-to-improve-ventilation-and-reduce-the-spread-of-covid-19-in-buildings/ (accessed June 11 th 2022).
596	71.	Aireamos. Aireamos Home. Available on: www.aireamos.org (accessed June 11th 2022).
597 598	72.	Aireamos Covid Risk Airborne. Available on: https://www.aireamos.org/herramienta/ (accessed June 11th 2022).
599 600	73.	Bogdanovica S, Zemitis J, Bogdanovics R. The effect of CO2 concentration on children's well-being during the process of learning. <i>Energies</i> . 2020;13:6099.
601 602	74.	Bartyzel J, Zieba D, Necki J, Zimnoch M. Assessment of ventilation efficiency in school classrooms based on indoor-outdoor particulate matter and carbon dioxide measurements. <i>Sustain</i> .

medRxiv preprint doi: https://doi.org/10.1101/2022.09.22.2280262; this version posted September 27, 2022. The copyright holder for this preprint (which was not certified by peer review) is the author/funder, who has granted medRxiv a license to display the preprint in perpetuity. All rights reserved. No reuse allowed without permission.

603		2020;12:5600.
604 605	75.	Muelas Á, Remacha P, Pina A, et al. Analysis of different ventilation strategies and CO2 distribution in a naturally ventilated classroom. <i>Atmos Environ</i> . 2022;283:119176.
606 607	76.	Wells WF. Airborne Contagion and Air Hygiene; an Ecological Study of Droplet Infections. <i>JAMA</i> . 1955:159:90.
<00		

608