1 Racial/ethnic disparities in cardiovascular disease mortality attributable to

2 long-term PM_{2.5} exposure in the United States from 2001 to 2016

- 3 Yiqun Ma, M.Phil.;^{1,2} Emma Zang, Ph.D.;³ Ijeoma Opara, Ph.D., LMSW;⁴ Yuan Lu, Sc.D.;^{5,6}
- 4 Harlan M. Krumholz, M.D.;^{5,6,7} Kai Chen, Ph.D.^{1,2}
- 1 Department of Environmental Health Sciences, Yale School of Public Health, New Haven, CT,
 USA
- 7 2 Yale Center on Climate Change and Health, Yale School of Public Health, New Haven, CT,
- 8 USA
- 9 3 Department of Sociology, Yale University, New Haven, CT, USA
- 4 Department of Social & Behavioral Sciences, Yale School of Public Health, New Haven, CT,
 USA
- 12 5 Center for Outcomes Research and Evaluation, Yale New Haven Hospital, New Haven, CT,13 USA
- 6 Section of Cardiovascular Medicine, Department of Medicine, Yale School of Medicine, NewHaven, CT, USA
- 7 Department of Health Policy and Management, Yale School of Public Health, New Haven, CT,USA
- 18
- 19 Corresponding author:
- 20 Kai Chen, Ph.D., Yale School of Public Health, 60 College Street, New Haven, CT, 06511,
- 21 USA, kai.chen@yale.edu

- 23 Word count: 3457
- 24 Main tables: 2
- 25 Main figures: 4
- 26

27 Abstract

28 Background:

29	The average concentration of fine particulate matter $(PM_{2.5})$ has decreased in the U.S. in recent
30	years. However, the health benefits of this improvement among different racial/ethnic groups are
31	not known. This study aimed to estimate the associations between long-term exposure to ambient
32	PM _{2.5} and cause-specific cardiovascular disease (CVD) mortality rate and assess the PM _{2.5} -
33	attributable CVD deaths in non-Hispanic White, non-Hispanic Black, and Hispanic people across
34	all counties in the contiguous U.S. from 2001 to 2016.
35	Methods:
36	Using nationwide CVD mortality data for all ages obtained from National Center for Health
37	Statistics, this study applied interactive fixed effects models to estimate the associations between
38	12-month moving average of $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations and monthly age-adjusted CVD mortality
39	rates by race/ethnicity, controlling for both measured and unmeasured spatiotemporal
40	confounders. Mortality from major types of CVD (ischemic heart disease [IHD], myocardial
41	infarction [MI], stroke, hypertensive disease, and hypertensive heart disease) was also studied.
42	We then calculated the burden of PM _{2.5} -attributable CVD deaths in different race/ethnicity
43	groups and examined the magnitude of racial/ethnic disparity and its changes over time.
44	Results:
45	A total of 13,289,147 CVD deaths were included in the study. Each $1-\mu g/m^3$ increase in 12-

46 month moving average of $PM_{2.5}$ concentration was associated with increases of 7.16 (95%)

- 47 confidence interval [CI]: 3.81, 10.51) CVD deaths per 1,000,000 Black people per month,
- 48 significantly higher than the estimates for non-Hispanic White people (*P* value: 0.002). The

- 49 higher vulnerability in non-Hispanic Black people was also observed for mortality from IHD,
- 50 MI, and stroke. Long-term PM_{2.5} exposure contributed to approximately 75.47 (95% CI: 40.14,
- 51 110.80) CVD deaths per 1,000,000 non-Hispanic Black people annually, over 3 times higher
- than the estimated rate in non-Hispanic White people (16.89, 95% CI:13.17, 20.62). From 2001
- 53 to 2016, the difference in attributable CVD mortality rate between Black and White people
- reduced by 44.04% (from 75.80 to 42.42 per 1,000,000 people), but the burden in Black people
- 55 was still over 3 times higher compared to White people.

56 **Conclusions:**

- 57 Non-Hispanic Black people have the highest PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden. Although
- the racial/ethnic disparity in this burden was narrowed over time, the gap between racial/ethnic

59 minorities and non-Hispanic White people remains substantial.

61 Introduction

Ambient fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) air pollution is a leading risk factor for mortality in the 62 United States (U.S.), especially for mortality of cardiovascular diseases (CVD).¹ The detrimental 63 effect of PM2.5 on cardiovascular mortality persists even at concentrations below the current air 64 quality standard.²⁻⁵ Over recent decades, PM_{2.5} levels have fallen considerably in the contiguous 65 U.S., as a result of the national Clean Air Act and other regional efforts.^{6,7} This improvement in 66 air quality has yielded substantial benefits to human health.⁸ However, it is unclear whether the 67 68 health benefits of this decreasing trend of PM_{2.5}, especially to cardiovascular health, distributed 69 equitably across different racial/ethnical groups. Most previous studies examined this question focusing only on the PM_{2.5} exposure. 70 Increasing evidence showed an unequal distribution of PM2.5 exposure across communities, with 71 racial/ethnic minorities being exposed to disproportionately high levels of PM_{2.5}.⁹⁻¹⁴ Despite the 72 improvement in air quality during the past years, the disparity in PM_{2.5} exposure remains.^{9, 11, 13,} 73 ¹⁴ In the U.S., physical environment and neighborhoods tend to exhibit the symptoms of, and are 74 shaped by, environmental racism.¹⁵ For example, racial/ethnic minorities in the U.S., such as 75 76 Black and Hispanic people, tend to live in neighborhoods where they have higher exposure to air pollution,^{14, 16} close proximity to waste facilities,¹⁷ and low community green space (e.g. 77 parks).^{18, 19} Such factors can all significantly increase the likelihood of PM_{2.5} exposure. 78 79 However, the racial/ethnic disparities in PM2.5-attributable mortality burden cannot be 80 fully explained by the disparities in PM_{2.5} exposure. Different PM_{2.5}-mortality relationships 81 across racial/ethnic groups also need to be considered. Due to structural racism and its downstream social determinants, including lack of access to equitable healthcare resources and 82

83	chronic racial stressors such as limited employment opportunities, safety concerns, exposure to
84	racial discrimination, or over-policing, ²⁰ Black people may suffer from greater CVD mortality
85	consequences of air pollution than White people, even when they live in the same physical
86	environment. ²¹ Therefore, it is important to use race/ethnicity-specific exposure-response
87	function in health burden assessment. ²²
88	Utilizing the nationwide PM _{2.5} and cardiovascular mortality data, this study aimed to first
89	estimate the associations of long-term exposure to PM _{2.5} with county-level cardiovascular
90	mortality rates by race/ethnicity, and then assess the average annual PM2.5-attributable CVD
91	mortality burden across racial/ethnic groups and how the racial/ethnic disparity in this burden
92	changed over time between 2001 and 2016. Interactive fixed effects (IFE) models, a novel
93	statistical method for causal inference, were applied to estimate the PM _{2.5} -mortality exposure-
94	response function. In addition to the total CVD mortality, we also analyzed mortality from major
95	categories of CVD.

96

97 Methods

98 Study area and population

In total, this study covered 3,103 counties or county equivalents in the contiguous U.S.,
with consistent boundaries over the study period. The cartographic boundary for counties in the
contiguous U.S. was downloaded from the U.S. Census Bureau's TIGER/Line geodatabase.²³
We merged counties with boundary changes from 2001 to 2016 with neighboring counties
(Supplemental Methods 1). County-level population data was collected from the Surveillance,
Epidemiology, and End Results Program, National Cancer Institute.²⁴ We extracted the total

population and population estimates by sex, age, race, and Hispanic origin for each county,2001-2016.

107 Mortality rate

108 Mortality data from 2001 to 2016 was provided by the National Center for Health 109 Statistics, which included the year and month of death, the cause of death (International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems, 10th Revision [ICD-10] 110 codes), and the sex, age, race, and ethnicity of each deceased person. Information about the race 111 and Hispanic origin of a decedent was based on death certificates. The categorization of race and 112 ethnicity followed the national standards "Revisions to the Standards for the Classification of 113 Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity".²⁵ This study focused on CVD mortality (ICD-10 code: I00-114 115 199) and its major categories, including ischemic heart disease (IHD, I20-I25), stroke (I60-I69), 116 and hypertensive diseases (HD, I10-I15). Deaths from more specific causes, myocardial 117 infarction (MI, I21-I23) in IHD and hypertensive heart disease (HHD, I11) in HD, were also 118 analyzed in this study. 119 We calculated the monthly county-level cause-specific mortality rates for male, female,

non-Hispanic White, non-Hispanic Black, and Hispanic population. All mortality rates were age adjusted by direct standardization using the 2000 U.S. Census population as the standard
 population. Mortality data in 2000 was also obtained to calculate the 12-month moving average
 of mortality rates in a sensitivity analysis.

Using anonymized monthly county-level mortality records, this study was determined as
a Not Human Subject research and approved by the Yale Institutional Review Boards (protocol
ID: 2000026808).

Air pollution and temperature

128	Daily PM _{2.5} concentration data from 2000 to 2016 for the contiguous U.S. at a resolution
129	of 1 km was obtained from the NASA Socioeconomic Data and Applications Center. ²⁶ In brief,
130	the $PM_{2.5}$ concentration was estimated by an ensembled model based on neural network, random
131	forest, and gradient boosting, using satellite data, meteorological data, land-use variables,
132	elevation, chemical transport model predictions, and other variables as predictors. ⁶ The 10-fold
133	cross-validated coefficients of determination (R ²) of this model was 0.86 for daily predictions,
134	indicating a strong predictive performance. ⁶
135	The daily $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations were aggregated to monthly county-level to match to the
136	mortality data. For months from January 2001 to December 2016, we calculated the 12-month
137	moving average of $PM_{2.5}$ concentration for each county to represent the average exposure to
138	$PM_{2.5}$ in the previous one year. ^{27, 28} Nitrogen dioxide (NO ₂) and ozone (O ₃) data was downloaded
139	from the same source and processed in the same way as $PM_{2.5}$. ²⁹⁻³²
140	Monthly mean air temperature data at 4 km \times 4 km was obtained from the PRISM
141	Climate Group. ³³ Similar to the air pollution data, we averaged the air temperature data for each
142	county.
143	Statistical analysis
144	We applied IFE models to estimate the associations between long-term exposure to $PM_{2.5}$
145	and cardiovascular mortality rates. The IFE model is an innovative method in economics for
146	causal inference, which is more flexible than the commonly-used traditional two-way fixed
147	effects (TWFE) model. ³⁴ TWFE models can potentially control for both spatial confounders that
148	only vary across counties (time-invariant confounders) and temporal confounders that only vary

by time (county-invariant confounders), either measured or unmeasured.³⁵ However, this approach assumes no unmeasured confounders that display different temporal variations across counties (time-varying individual county effects), which is often violated.³⁶ Therefore, we used an extension of the TWFE model, the novel IFE model, which can potentially account for unmeasured time-varying county-specific confounders.^{34, 36, 37} The IFE approach requires weaker assumptions than TWFE models: it only requires a correct functional form (a relaxed form of strict exogeneity) and the existence of a low-dimensional decomposition.³⁶

In the main IFE model, the outcome variable was the monthly county-level mortality rate and the predictor of interest was the 12-month moving average of $PM_{2.5}$ concentration for each county, each month. Time-invariant and county-invariant confounders were controlled for by indicator variables for each county and month and air temperature was controlled by a flexible natural cubic spline with five degrees of freedom (df). Unmeasured time-varying individual county effect was explicitly modelled by decomposition. Statistical details of the IFE model can

162 be found in **Supplemental Methods 2**.

163 Based on the estimated coefficient of PM_{2.5} (β) for each cause, which can be interpreted as the increase in mortality rate associated with $1-\mu g/m^3$ increase in 12-month moving average of 164 PM_{2.5} per month, we then calculated the PM_{2.5}-attributable number of deaths (AN) in each 165 county in each month by $AN_{i,t} = \beta PM_{2.5_{i,t}} \times Population_{i,t}$, where $PM_{2.5_{i,t}}$ is the moving 166 average of $PM_{2.5}$ concentration of the current and previous 11 months for county *i*, month *t* and 167 *Population*_{*i*,*t*} is the total population in county *i*, month *t*. The reference $PM_{2.5}$ concentration 168 was set as 0, since recent epidemiological evidence suggests that there is no safe level of PM_{2.5}.⁴, 169 5 170

We further estimated the association between long-term exposure to PM_{2.5} and causespecific cardiovascular mortality rates and the attributable mortality burden by race/ethnicity (non-Hispanic White, non-Hispanic Black, and Hispanic people). We also conducted subgroup analysis by sex (male and female) to test sex differences and stratified analysis by urban or rural counties³⁸ to investigate its potential modification effect. We tested the statistical difference in effect estimates between different groups by calculating the z score as $(\hat{Q}_1 - \hat{Q}_2)/$

177
$$\sqrt{(S\hat{E}_1)^2 + (S\hat{E}_2)^2}$$
, where \hat{Q}_1 and \hat{Q}_2 are the estimates, and $S\hat{E}_1$ and $S\hat{E}_2$ are their respective

178 standard errors.³⁹

179 Several sensitivity analyses were performed to test the robustness of our results: (a) 180 counties with population size smaller than 5,000 or larger than 200,000 were excluded 181 (approximately the 10th and 90th percentiles of county-level population size); (b) 12-month 182 moving average of CVD mortality rates were used as the outcome; (c) traditional TWFE model 183 was applied; (d) we additionally adjusted for NO₂ or O₃ in the model; (e) an alternative four or 184 six df was used in the natural cubic spline of air temperature.

185

186 **Results**

187 Description of PM_{2.5} exposure and CVD mortality

A total of 13,289,147 CVD deaths was included in the study. From 2001 to 2016, the mean age-adjusted CVD mortality rate was 232.67 per 1,000,000 people per month in the 3,103 counties in the contiguous U.S. (standard deviation [SD]: 140.97), of which over 70% were from IHD, stroke, and HD. The mean age-adjusted CVD mortality rate was higher in males (278.43, SD: 230.46) than in females (195.85, SD: 166.79), and was the highest in non-Hispanic Black

193	people (294.75, SD: 425.72) among the three studied racial/ethnical groups (Table 1). The mean
194	12-month moving average of $PM_{2.5}$ concentration was 9.12 µg/m ³ (SD: 3.13) (Table 1). The
195	average $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations were in general higher in the eastern U.S. (Figure 1A) and have
196	greatly decreased in most counties in our study period (Figure 1B). Among people of different
197	racial/ethnic groups who died from cardiovascular diseases from 2001 to 2016, although the
198	long-term $PM_{2.5}$ exposure reduced in all three groups (Figure S1), the median concentration of
199	long-term PM _{2.5} exposure was the highest in the non-Hispanic Black group (Figure 1C).
200	Association between long-term PM _{2.5} exposure and cause-specific CVD mortality by
201	race/ethnicity
202	We found that each $1-\mu g/m^3$ increase in the 12-month moving average of PM _{2.5}
203	concentration was significantly associated with 2.01 additional CVD deaths per 1,000,000 people
204	(95% confidence interval [CI]: 1.76, 2.35) per month. Compared to the non-Hispanic White
205	group, the effect estimate was significantly higher in non-Hispanic Black group (P value: 0.002):
206	each 1- μ g/m ³ increase in the 12-month moving average of PM _{2.5} concentration was significantly
207	associated with 7.16 (95% CI: 3.81, 10.51) additional CVD deaths per 1,000,000 non-Hispanic
208	Black people, while was only associated with 1.76 (95% CI: 1.37, 2.15) CVD deaths per
209	1,000,000 non-Hispanic White people (Table 2). No significant difference was observed
210	between males and females (Table S1).
211	For major CVD categories, 1.67 (95% CI: 1.43, 1.91) IHD deaths, 0.22 (95% CI: 0.08,
212	0.36) stroke deaths, and 0.11 (95% CI: 0.11, 0.03, 0.19) HD deaths per 1,000,000 people were
213	linked to a $1-\mu g/m^3$ increase in PM _{2.5} . Higher long-term exposure to PM _{2.5} was also associated
214	with higher mortality rates of MI and HHD. For mortality from IHD and its subtype MI, the
215	effect estimates of the non-Hispanic Black group were the highest among all racial/ethnic groups

216 (IHD: 4.09, 95% CI: 1.80, 6.38; MI: 1.97, 95% CI: 0.68, 3.26). In addition, the association between 217 long-term PM_{2.5} exposure and stroke mortality rate was only significantly positive in the non-218 Hispanic Black group (Table 2).

219 Average annual PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden by race/ethnicity

220 The average annual PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden was in general higher in 221 eastern counties, especially in the Ohio Valley region and the Southeast region, which is consistent with the distribution of $PM_{2.5}$ concentrations (Figure 2A). In total, approximately 222 223 69,675 (95% CI: 57,785, 81,565) CVD deaths were attributable to long-term PM_{2.5} exposure 224 each year from 2001 to 2016, which contributed to about 7.84% of total CVD deaths in the contiguous U.S. (Figure 2B). Among specific causes, approximately 57,889 IHD deaths 225 226 (including 15,634 MI deaths), 7,487 stroke deaths, and 3,882 HD deaths (including 1,192 HHD deaths) were attributable to PM_{2.5} each year (Figure 2B; Table S2). 227 228 Among racial/ethnical groups, the average annual PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality 229 burden was 40,315 (95% CI: 31.426, 49,205) deaths in non-Hispanic White people, 35,136 (95% CI: 18,689, 51,583) deaths in non-Hispanic Black people, and 13,335 (95% CI: -126, 26,795) 230 231 deaths in Hispanic people. Although the absolute number of PM_{2.5}-attributable deaths was the highest in the non-Hispanic White group, non-Hispanic Black people still shouldered the highest 232 233 relative burden: in average, long-term PM_{2.5} exposure contributed to approximately 75.47 (95%) 234 CI: 40.14, 110.80) CVD deaths per 1,000,000 non-Hispanic Black people annually, over 3 times 235 higher than the estimated rate in non-Hispanic White people (16.89, 95% CI:13.17, 20.62) 236 (Figure 2C).

237

Changes in racial/ethnical disparity in PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden over time

238	From 2001 to 2016, the CVD mortality burden attributable to long-term PM _{2.5} exposure
239	has greatly decreased in most U.S. counties, especially the eastern U.S., with the greatest decline
240	in West Virginia and Kentucky (Figure 3A). In total, PM _{2.5} -attributable CVD deaths have
241	decreased by 34.19%, from 82,047 (95% CI: 68,046, 96,048) in 2001 to 53,996 (95% CI: 44,782,
242	63,210) in 2016 (Figure 3B; Table S3).
243	Despite of the overall decreasing trend, the magnitudes of decrease varied across
244	different racial/ethnical groups (Figure 4A). The non-Hispanic Black group experienced the
245	greatest reduction in PM _{2.5} -attributable CVD mortality burden, from 96.90 deaths (95% CI:
246	51.54, 142.25) in 2001 to 54.65 (95% CI: 29.07, 80.23) in 2016, per 1,000,000 Black people. As
247	a result, the racial/ethnic disparity became smaller: comparing to non-Hispanic White people, the
248	PM _{2.5} -attributable CVD mortality rate in non-Hispanic Black people was 75.80 higher in 2001
249	and 42.42 higher in 2016, which reduced by 44.04%; this difference also reduced by 29.62% for
250	the Hispanic group, from 7.90 in 2001 to 5.56 in 2016 (Figure 4B).
251	Effect modification by urban vs. rural counties and sensitivity analyses

We observed a higher coefficient of $PM_{2.5}$ in rural counties compared to urban counties. In rural counties, each $1-\mu g/m^3$ increase in long-term $PM_{2.5}$ exposure was significantly associated with 2.05 CVD deaths per 1,000,000 people (95% CI: 1.54, 2.56) per month, while in urban counties, the effect estimate of $PM_{2.5}$ became smaller (1.00, 95% CI: 0.62, 1.37). Consistent with the findings from our main analyses, in both rural and urban counties, the association between $PM_{2.5}$ exposure and CVD mortality rate was stronger in non-Hispanic Black people compared to non-Hispanic White people (**Table S4**).

259	Sensitivity analyses showed that our results generally remained robust when excluding
260	counties with population size smaller than 5,000 or greater than 200,000, using 12-month
261	moving average of CVD mortality rate as the outcome, applying traditional TWFE, additionally
262	adjusting for NO ₂ or O ₃ in the model, and using alternative numbers of df for air temperature
263	(Table S5). The time-series plot of the monthly CVD mortality rates in counties with population
264	size smaller than 5,000 indicated that the outcome measure was stable even in relatively small
265	counties (Figure S2).

266

267 **Discussion**

This study demonstrates significant racial/ethnic disparities in both vulnerability to and burden of PM_{2.5}-related CVD mortality. First, the association between PM_{2.5} exposure and CVD mortality rate was significantly stronger for non-Hispanic Black people than non-Hispanic White people in the study. Second, non-Hispanic Black people also had the highest average annual PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden. Finally, the racial/ethnic disparities in this burden narrowed over time from 2001 to 2016, but the gap between racial/ethnic minorities and non-Hispanic White people persisted.

We found long-term exposure to ambient $PM_{2.5}$ was associated with a greater increase in CVD mortality rate among non-Hispanic Black people compared to non-Hispanic White people. This finding from our study for all ages is consistent with the finding from a previous study focusing on people 65 years of age or older. A cohort study based on all Medicare beneficiaries reported that Black people had a higher estimated risk of all-cause mortality in association with $PM_{2.5}$ exposure than the general population.²⁷ This higher vulnerability of Black people can be

281 explained by residential segregation and other downstream social determinants of structural racism in the U.S.^{40, 41} For example, Black people in the U.S. tend to have limited access to high-282 quality healthcare, education, credit, and other socioeconomic opportunities due to systemic 283 284 racism. In addition, racism-intersecting and mutually reinforcing societal systems and 285 institutions which foster and perpetuate racial discrimination and structure opportunities 286 inequitably—in the U.S., contribute to higher levels of stress and likelihood of living in neighborhoods that are impacted by environmental racism, resulting in both higher CVD burden 287 and vulnerability to air pollution.^{22, 41} 288

289 In our study, the relative burden of PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality in non-Hispanic 290 Black people was found to be over 3 times greater than the burden in non-Hispanic White 291 people. The disparity in this annual burden between Black and White people (58.6 additional 292 CVD deaths per 1,000,000 people) is of the same magnitude as the contribution of alcohol use to CVD mortality in the whole U.S. population in 2019 (55.3 CVD deaths per 1,000,000 people), 293 according to the estimates from the GBD study.¹ This finding reflects both disproportionally 294 295 higher PM_{2.5} exposure and the aforementioned higher vulnerability of non-Hispanic Black 296 people in the U.S. Multiple studies consistently demonstrated that people of color are typically exposed to higher levels of air pollution than non-Hispanic White people in the U.S.⁹⁻¹² which is 297 298 a pervasive and persistent consequence of redlining, inequitable siting of emission sources (e.g., highways and industrial facilities), and other policies and practices.^{40, 41} 299

Benefited by the improvement of air quality in recent decades in the U.S., the overall PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden was greatly reduced. Among racial/ethnic groups, this burden decreased most among non-Hispanic Black people, thus narrowed the racial/ethnic disparity. However, this reduced disparity found in our study was mainly driven by the high

304	vulnerability of Black people, not by a more equal distribution of air pollution. If we assume the
305	exposure-response function of non-Hispanic Black people is the same as the one of non-Hispanic
306	White people, the decreasing trends of PM _{2.5} -attributable CVD mortality burden in these two
307	groups would become almost parallel (Figure S3). Similarly, relying on a uniform relative risk
308	estimate for the whole population, a recent preprint reported a widened gap between the most
309	and least White communities regarding $PM_{2.5}$ -attributable premature deaths from 2010 to 2019. ⁴²
310	These different results indicate the importance of using race/ethnicity-specific exposure-response
311	function when calculating the $PM_{2.5}$ -attributable mortality burden. ²²
312	Our results suggested an effect modification by urbanization level of residence, with
313	stronger associations between $PM_{2.5}$ and CVD mortality rates in rural counties compared to
314	urban counties. A similar pattern was found for the association between PM_{10} and non-accidental
315	mortality in Italy. ⁴³ One possible explanation of this finding is the different mixture compositions
316	of $PM_{2.5}$ in rural and urban counties, ⁴⁴ which may have different effects on cardiovascular
317	mortality. ^{43, 45}
318	This study revealed the possible public health burden of structural racism through
319	ambient air pollution in the U.S. Our findings could help inform environmental agencies to be
320	more aware of the effects of environmental racism as a social justice issue. In addition, there is a
321	need to better design and inform policies that efficiently reduce environmental inequity and

protect vulnerable population in the pursuit of improving overall air quality. In addition, 322

strategies aiming to reduce chronic racial stressors and ensure equal access to healthcare,

324 education, and other resources are also urgently needed to reduce the racial/ethnic inequities in

health burden attributable to air pollution such as PM_{2.5}. 325

323

To the best of our knowledge, this study is one of the first studies that examined the changes in racial/ethnic disparity in $PM_{2.5}$ -attributable cardiovascular mortality burden over time using race/ethnicity-specific exposure-response function. In addition, we applied IFE model, an innovative causal inference method that controls for both measured and unmeasured timevarying county-level confounders, to estimate the association between long-term $PM_{2.5}$ exposure and mortality from principal CVD types.

332 However, some limitations should be noted. First, this is a county-level ecological study, 333 which is susceptible to ecological fallacy. We were also unable to take selective migration into 334 account. Second, we did not specifically analyze for people of races/ethnicities other than non-335 Hispanic White people, non-Hispanic Black people and Hispanic people. Members of other races 336 such as American Indians, Asians, and Pacific Islanders were not included in the race/ethnicity specific analyses due to lack of statistical power. Third, the potential measurement error in 337 mortality data and misreport in race/ethnic categories may influence our results. Finally, we were 338 339 unable to further explore the potential mechanism of the racial/ethnic disparity in PM_{2.5} 340 attributable burden, which can be examined in depth in future studies.

341

342 Conclusions

In conclusion, our study indicated that non-Hispanic Black people have the highest PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD mortality burden among all racial/ethnical groups. Although the racial/ethnic disparity in this burden was narrowed in recent decades, the gap between people of color and non-Hispanic White people still exists. Policies and practices that aim to reduce both

- 347 exposure and vulnerability to PM_{2.5} for racial/ethnical minorities, in addition to investigating the
- 348 effects of structural racism on health, is needed.

350 Acknowledgements

351	Dr. Zang received support from the National Institute on Aging (R21AG074238-01), the
352	National Institute on Minority Health and Health Disparities (1R01MD017298-01), the Research
353	Education Core of the Claude D. Pepper Older Americans Independence Center at Yale School
354	of Medicine (P30AG021342), and the Institution for Social and Policy Studies at Yale
355	University. Dr. Opara received support from the National Institutes on Health Director's Early
356	Independence Award (DP5OD029636; PI: Ijeoma Opara).
357	Author Contributions
358	Y.M. conducted formal analyses and drafted the manuscript. K.C. conceived of and
359	supervised the conduct of this study and edited the manuscript. E.Z. applied and managed the
360	mortality dataset, supervised the statistical analysis, and revised the manuscript. I.O contributed
361	to the writing and manuscript revision. Y.L. and H.K. contributed to the interpretation of results
362	and manuscript revision. All authors reviewed and approved the final version of this manuscript.
363	Conflict of interests

364 The authors declare no conflict of interests.



366 Figure 1. Distribution of PM_{2.5} concentration in all counties in the contiguous United States







Figure 2. Average annual cardiovascular deaths attributable to PM_{2.5} (2001–2016)

A. Average annual PM_{2.5}-attributable cardiovascular deaths per 1,000,000 individuals from 2001

to 2016 in each county; **B.** Average annual PM_{2.5}-attributable deaths from cardiovascular disease

374 (CVD), ischemic heart disease (IHD), myocardial infarction (MI), stroke, hypertensive disease

- 375 (HD), and hypertensive heart disease (HHD) from 2001 to 2016; C. Average annual PM_{2.5}-
- attributable cardiovascular deaths per 1,000,000 individuals from 2001 to 2016 in each
- 377 racial/ethnic group.







A. Percent change in annual PM_{2.5}-attributable cardiovascular deaths from 2001 to 2016 in each
county; B. Annual PM_{2.5}-attributable deaths from cardiovascular disease (CVD), including
myocardial infarction (MI) and other ischemic heart disease (IHD), stroke, hypertensive heart
disease (HHD) and other hypertensive disease (HD), and other CVD, from 2001 to 2016.



Figure 4. Racial/ethnic disparity in annual cardiovascular mortality rates attributable to PM2.5 from 2001 to 2016

A. Annual PM_{2.5}-attributable cardiovascular disease (CVD) deaths per 1,000,000 people by race/ethnicity from 2001 to 2016; B.
 Racial/ethnic disparity in PM_{2.5}-attributable CVD deaths per 1,000,000 people, using non-Hispanic White people as the reference
 group.

Table 1. Monthly descriptive statistics for	• all 3,103 contiguous	s U.S. counties from 2001
_ to 2016 [*]		

	Mean (SD [†])	Min	Median (IQR [‡])	Max
Environmental factors				
12-month moving average of	0.12(2.12)	1 54	0.22(1.22)	18 70
$PM_{2.5} (\mu g/m^3)$	9.12 (5.15)	1.34	9.25 (4.55)	16.79
Air temperature (°C)	12.70 (9.90)	-20.58	13.57 (15.61)	35.41
Age-adjusted mortality rate (per	1,000,000 individud	als)		
Cardiovascular disease	232.67 (140.97)	0.00	217.52 (140.42)	15,508.56
Ischemic heart disease	111.37 (97.71)	0.00	97.88 (95.61)	15,508.56
Myocardial infarction	47.70 (65.91)	0.00	30.91 (66.48)	4,169.58
Stroke	40.01 (53.16)	0.00	30.48 (56.68)	3,877.14
Hypertensive disease	14.32 (31.09)	0.00	0.00 (18.90)	2,584.76
Hypertensive heart disease	6.89 (21.80)	0.00	0.00 (3.98)	2,584.76
Age-adjusted CVD [§] mortality rate by race/ethnicity (per 1,000,000 individuals)				
Non-Hispanic White	230.19 (158.33)	0.00	213.54 (144.14)	15,508.56
Non-Hispanic Black	294.75 (425.72)	0.00	234.17 (407.62)	44,840.80
Hispanic	134.11 (399.58)	0.00	0.00 (141.02)	22,011.77
Age-adjusted CVD mortality rate by sex (per 1,000,000 individuals)				
Male	278.43 (230.46)	0.00	250.13 (213.63)	15,508.56
Female	195.85 (166.79)	0.00	175.77 (151.65)	15,508.56
*Some neighboring counties were	e combined due to h	istorical b	ooundary changes	
[†] SD: standard deviation				
[‡] IQR: interquartile range				
§CVD: cardiovascular disease				

Cause of death	Race/ethnicity	Estimate (95% CI)*	P value [†]
	Whole population	2.01 (1.67, 2.35)	-
Condiavagoulan digaaga	Non-Hispanic White	1.76 (1.37, 2.15)	reference
Cardiovascular disease	Non-Hispanic Black	7.16 (3.81, 10.51)	0.002
	Hispanic	2.66 (-0.03, 5.35)	0.516
	Whole population	1.67 (1.43, 1.91)	-
Icahamia haart digaaga	Non-Hispanic White	1.64 (1.37, 1.91)	reference
Ischemic heart disease	Non-Hispanic Black	4.09 (1.80, 6.38)	0.038
	Hispanic	1.52 (-0.21, 3.25)	0.893
	Whole population	0.45 (0.29, 0.61)	-
Mars condict infonction	Non-Hispanic White	0.45 (0.26, 0.63)	reference
Myocardial infarction	Non-Hispanic Black	1.97 (0.68, 3.26)	0.022
	Hispanic	0.45 (-0.58, 1.48)	0.999
	Whole population	0.22 (0.08, 0.36)	-
Stroleo	Non-Hispanic White	0.11 (-0.04, 0.26)	reference
Stroke	Non-Hispanic Black	1.76 (0.67, 2.85)	0.003
	Hispanic	0.05 (-1.01, 1.11)	0.916
	Whole population	0.11 (0.03, 0.19)	-
Huportonging diagona	Non-Hispanic White	0.05 (-0.04, 0.14)	reference
Hypertensive disease	Non-Hispanic Black	0.65 (-0.01, 1.31)	0.072
	Hispanic	0.15 (-0.31, 0.61)	0.668
	Whole population	0.03 (-0.02, 0.09)	-
I I and anter a size to a set dia a set	Non-Hispanic White	0.03 (-0.03, 0.09)	reference
nypertensive neart disease	Non-Hispanic Black	0.04 (-0.33, 0.41)	0.944
	Hispanic	-0.15 (-0.41, 0.11)	0.200

Table 2. Deaths per 1,000,000 individuals associated with $1-\mu g/m^3$ increase in 12-month moving average of PM_{2.5} per month by race/ethnicity

*CI: confidence interval

[†]We tested the statistical differences in effect estimates between non-Hispanic Black and non-Hispanic White people and between Hispanic and non-Hispanic White people, based on the z score calculated using the coefficients and standard errors for different groups.

References

396	1. Vos T, Lim SS, Abbafati C, Abbas KM, Abbasi M, Abbasifard M, Abbasi-Kangevari M,
397	Abbastabar H, Abd-Allah F and Abdelalim A. Global burden of 369 diseases and injuries in 204
398	countries and territories, 1990-2019: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease
399	Study 2019. Lancet. 2020;396:1204-1222.
400	2. Brunekreef B, Strak M, Chen J, Andersen ZJ, Atkinson R, Bauwelinck M and al. e.
401	Mortality and Morbidity Effects of Long-Term Exposure to Low-Level PM2.5, BC, NO2, and
402	O3: An Analysis of European Cohorts in the ELAPSE Project. HEI Report Series. 2021.
403	3. Crouse DL, Peters PA, van Donkelaar A, Goldberg MS, Villeneuve PJ, Brion O, Khan S,
404	Atari DO, Jerrett M and Pope III CA. Risk of nonaccidental and cardiovascular mortality in
405	relation to long-term exposure to low concentrations of fine particulate matter: a Canadian
406	national-level cohort study. Environ Health Perspect. 2012;120:708-714.
407	4. Brauer M, Brook JR, Christidis T, Chu Y, Crouse DL, Erickson A, Hystad P, Li C,
408	Martin RV, Meng J, Pappin AJ, Pinault LL, Brauer M, Donkelaar Av, Weagle C, Weichenthal S
409	and Burnett RT. Mortality-Air Pollution Associations in Low-Exposure Environments
410	(MAPLE): Phase 2. HEI Report Series. 2022.
411	5. Dominici F, Zanobetti A, Schwartz J, Braun D, Sabath B and Wu X. Assessing Adverse
412	Health Effects of Long-Term Exposure to Low Levels of Ambient Air Pollution: Implementation
413	of Causal Inference Methods. HEI Report Series. 2022.
414	6. Di Q, Amini H, Shi L, Kloog I, Silvern R, Kelly J, Sabath MB, Choirat C, Koutrakis P,
415	Lyapustin A, Wang Y, Mickley LJ and Schwartz J. An Ensemble-based Model of PM2.5
416	Concentration Across the Contiguous United States with High Spatiotemporal Resolution.
417	Environ Int. 2019;130:104909.

418	7. Hubbell BJ, Crume RV, Evarts DM and Cohen JM. Policy monitor: regulation and		
419	progress under the 1990 Clean Air Act amendments. Rev Environ Econ Policy. 2010;4:122-138.		
420	8. Fann N, Coffman E, Timin B and Kelly JT. The estimated change in the level and		
421	distribution of PM2.5-attributable health impacts in the United States: 2005–2014. Environ Res.		
422	2018;167:506-514.		
423	9. Liu J, Clark LP, Bechle MJ, Hajat A, Kim S-Y, Robinson AL, Sheppard L, Szpiro AA		
424	and Marshall JD. Disparities in air pollution exposure in the United States by race/ethnicity and		
425	income, 1990–2010. Environ Health Perspect. 2021;129:127005.		
426	10. Tessum CW, Paolella DA, Chambliss SE, Apte JS, Hill JD and Marshall JD. PM2.5		
427	polluters disproportionately and systemically affect people of color in the United States. Sci Adv.		
428	2021;7:eabf4491.		
429	11. Jbaily A, Zhou X, Liu J, Lee T-H, Kamareddine L, Verguet S and Dominici F. Air		
430	pollution exposure disparities across US population and income groups. Nature. 2022;601:228-		
431	233.		
432	12. Hajat A, Hsia C and O'Neill MS. Socioeconomic disparities and air pollution exposure: a		
433	global review. Curr Environ Health Rep. 2015;2:440-450.		
434	13. Colmer J, Hardman I, Shimshack J and Voorheis J. Disparities in PM2.5 air pollution in		
435	the United States. Science. 2020;369:575-578.		
436	14. Kravitz-Wirtz N, Crowder K, Hajat A and Sass V. The long-term dynamics of		
437	racial/ethnic inequality in neighborhood air pollution exposure, 1990-2009. Du Bois Rev.		
438	2016;13:237-259.		
439	15. Wright WJ. As above, so below: Anti-Black violence as environmental racism. <i>Antipode</i>		
440	2021;53:791-809.		

441	16.	Woo B, Kravitz-Wirtz N, Sass V, Crowder K, Teixeira S and Takeuchi DT. Residential	
442	segregation and racial/ethnic disparities in ambient air pollution. Race Soc Probl. 2019;11:60-67.		
443	17.	Mascarenhas M, Grattet R and Mege K. Toxic waste and race in twenty-first century	
444	america: neighborhood poverty and racial composition in the siting of hazardous waste facilities.		
445	Environment and Society. 2021;12:108-126.		
446	18.	Rigolon A, Yañez E, Aboelata MJ and Bennett R. "A park is not just a park": Toward	
447	counte	r-narratives to advance equitable green space policy in the United States. Cities.	
448	2022;128:103792.		
449	19.	Rigolon A, Browning MH, McAnirlin O and Yoon H. Green space and health equity: a	
450	systematic review on the potential of green space to reduce health disparities. Int J Environ Res		
451	Public Health. 2021;18:2563.		
452	20.	McLeod MN, Heller D, Manze MG and Echeverria SE. Police interactions and the	
453	mental health of Black Americans: A systematic review. J Racial Ethn Health Disparities.		
454	2020;7:10-27.		
455	21.	Zang E and Kim N. Intergenerational upward mobility and racial differences in mortality	
456	among young adults: Evidence from county-level analyses. Health Place. 2021;70:102628.		
457	22.	Spiller E, Proville J, Roy A and Muller NZ. Mortality risk from PM2.5: a comparison of	
458	modeling approaches to identify disparities across racial/ethnic groups in policy outcomes.		
459	Environ Health Perspect. 2021;129:127004.		
460	23.	United States Census Bureau. Cartographic Boundary Files. 2019.	
461	24.	The SEER Program. U.S. County Population Data - 1969-2020. 2022.	
462	25.	Management Oo and Budget. Revisions to the standards for the classification of federal	
463	data or	n race and ethnicity. Federal Register. 1997;62:58782-58790.	

- 464 26. Di Q, Wei Y, Shtein A, Hultquist C, Xing X, Amini H, Shi L, Kloog I, Silvern R, Kelly
- 465 JT, Sabath MB, Choirat C, Koutrakis P, Lyapustin A, Wang Y and Mickley LJ. Daily and
- 466 Annual PM2.5 Concentrations for the Contiguous United States, 1-km Grids, v1 (2000 2016).
- 467 2021.
- 468 27. Di Q, Wang Y, Zanobetti A, Wang Y, Koutrakis P, Choirat C, Dominici F and Schwartz
- JD. Air pollution and mortality in the Medicare population. *N Engl J Med.* 2017;376:2513-2522.
- 470 28. Wei Y, Wang Y, Wu X, Di Q, Shi L, Koutrakis P, Zanobetti A, Dominici F and Schwartz
- 471 JD. Causal effects of air pollution on mortality rate in Massachusetts. *Am J Epidemiol*.
- 472 2020;189:1316-1323.
- 473 29. Di Q, Amini H, Shi L, Kloog I, Silvern R, Kelly JT, Sabath MB, Choirat C, Koutrakis P,
- 474 Lyapustin A, Wang Y, Mickley LJ and Schwartz J. Assessing NO2 concentration and model
- uncertainty with high spatiotemporal resolution across the contiguous United States. *Environ Sci Technol.* 2019;54:1372-1384.
- 477 30. Di Q, Wei Y, Shtein A, Hultquist C, Xing X, Amini H, Shi L, Kloog I, Silvern R, Kelly
- 478 JT, Sabath MB, Choirat C, Koutrakis P, Lyapustin A, Wang Y and Schwartz J. Daily and Annual
- 479 NO2 Concentrations for the Contiguous United States, 1-km Grids, v1 (2000 2016). 2022.
- 480 31. Requia WJ, Di Q, Silvern R, Kelly JT, Koutrakis P, Mickley LJ, Sulprizio MP, Amini H,
- 481 Shi L and Schwartz J. An Ensemble Learning Approach for Estimating High Spatiotemporal
- 482 Resolution of Ground-level Ozone in the Contiguous U.S. Environ Sci Technol. 2020;54:11037-
- 483 11047.
- 484 32. Requia WJ, Wei Y, Shtein A, Hultquist C, Xing X, Di Q, Silvern R, Kelly JT, Koutrakis
- 485 P, Mickley LJ, Sulprizio MP, Amini H, Shi L and Schwartz J. Daily 8-Hour Maximum and

486 Annual O3 Concentrations for the Contiguous United States, 1-km Grids, v1 (2000 - 2016).

487 2021.

488 33. PRISM Climate Group. PRISM Climate Data Recent Years (Jan 1981 - Jan 2022). 2016.

- 489 34. Bai J. Panel data models with interactive fixed effects. *Econometrica*. 2009;77:1229-
- 490 1279.
- 491 35. Goodman-Bacon A. Difference-in-differences with variation in treatment timing. J
- 492 *Econom*. 2021;225:254-277.

493 36. Liu L, Wang Y and Xu Y. A practical guide to counterfactual estimators for causal

494 inference with time-series cross-sectional data. *Am J Pol Sci.* 2022.

495 37. Xu Y. Generalized synthetic control method: causal inference with interactive fixed
496 effects models. *Polit Anal.* 2017;25:57-76.

497 38. National Center for Health Statistics. NCHS Urban-Rural Classification Scheme for498 Counties. 2017.

499 39. Chen K, Dubrow R, Breitner S, Wolf K, Linseisen J, Schmitz T, Heier M, von Scheidt

500 W, Kuch B, Meisinger C, Peters A, Schwettmann L, Leidl R, Linkohr B, Grallert H, Gieger C,

501 Schneider A and Group KS. Triggering of myocardial infarction by heat exposure is modified by

502 medication intake. *Nat Cardiovasc Res.* 2022;1:727-731.

40. Van Horne YO, Alcala CS, Peltier RE, Quintana PJE, Seto E, Gonzales M, Johnston JE,

- 504 Montoya LD, Quirós-Alcalá L and Beamer PI. An applied environmental justice framework for
- 505 exposure science. J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol. 2022.
- 506 41. Seltenrich N. The one-two-three punch: exposure, susceptibility, and disease burden
- among U.S. populations of color. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2022;130:034001.

- 508 42. Kerr GH, Martin RV, Donkelaar AV, Brauer M, Bukart K, Wozniak S, Goldberg DL and
- 509 Anenberg SC. Increasing disparities in air pollution health burdens in the United States. *Earth*
- 510 *and Space Science Open Archive*. 2022:35.
- 511 43. Renzi M, Forastiere F, Schwartz J, Davoli M, Michelozzi P and Stafoggia M. Long-term
- 512 PM10 exposure and cause-specific mortality in the Latium Region (Italy): a difference-in-
- 513 differences approach. *Environ Health Perspect*. 2019;127:067004.
- 514 44. Götschi T, Hazenkamp-von Arx ME, Heinrich J, Bono R, Burney P, Forsberg B, Jarvis
- 515 D, Maldonado J, Norbäck D and Stern WB. Elemental composition and reflectance of ambient
- 516 fine particles at 21 European locations. *Atmos Environ*. 2005;39:5947-5958.
- 517 45. Atkinson RW, Mills IC, Walton HA and Anderson HR. Fine particle components and
- 518 health—a systematic review and meta-analysis of epidemiological time series studies of daily
- 519 mortality and hospital admissions. *J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol*. 2015;25:208-214.