

1 **Comparison of antibody responses to SARS-CoV-2 variants in Australian children**

2 *Zheng Quan Toh^{1,2}, *Nadia Mazarakis¹, Jill Nguyen¹, Rachel A. Higgins¹, Jeremy

3 Anderson^{1,2}, Lien Anh Ha Do^{1,2}, David P. Burgner^{1,2,3}, Nigel Curtis^{1,2,3}, Andrew C. Steer^{1,2,3},

4 Kim Mulholland^{1,2,4} Nigel W. Crawford^{1,2,3}, ^Shidan Tosif^{1,2,3}, and ^Paul V Licciardi^{1,2}

5

6 ¹ Infection and Immunity, Murdoch Children's Research Institute, Parkville, Australia

7 ² Department of Paediatrics, The University of Melbourne, Parkville, Australia

8 ³ Department of General Medicine, The Royal Children's Hospital, Parkville, Australia

9 ⁴ Faculty of Epidemiology and Public Health, London School of Hygiene and Tropical
10 Medicine, London, UK

11

12 *co-first author

13 ^co-last author

14

15 Author for correspondence:

16 Paul V Licciardi

17 Murdoch Children's Research Institute

18 Royal Children's Hospital

19 Flemington Road, Parkville, Victoria 3052 Australia

20 Email: paul.licciardi@mcri.edu.au

21 ***Abstract***

22 There is limited understanding of antibody responses in children across different SARS-CoV-
23 2 variants. As part of an ongoing household cohort study, we assessed the antibody response
24 among unvaccinated children infected with Wuhan, Delta or Omicron variants, as well as
25 vaccinated children with breakthrough Omicron infection, using a SARS-CoV-2 S1-specific
26 IgG assay and surrogate virus neutralisation test (sVNT). Most children infected with Delta
27 (100%, 35/35) or Omicron (81.3%, 13/16) variants seroconverted by one month following
28 infection. In contrast, 37.5% (21/56) children infected with Wuhan seroconverted, as
29 previously reported. However, Omicron-infected children (GMC 46.4 BAU/ml; sVNT %
30 inhibition: 16.3%) mounted a significantly lower antibody response than Delta (435.5
31 BAU/mL, sVNT=76.9%) or Wuhan (359.0 BAU/mL, sVNT=74.0%). Vaccinated children
32 with breakthrough Omicron infection mounted the highest antibody response (2856 BAU/mL,
33 sVNT=96.5%). Our findings suggest that despite a high seroconversion rate, Omicron infection
34 in children results in lower antibody levels and function compared with Wuhan or Delta
35 infection or with vaccinated children with breakthrough Omicron infection. Our data have
36 important implications for public health measures and vaccination strategies to protect
37 children.

38

39 ***Main text***

40 Children have been less likely to be infected and develop severe disease by the original
41 SARS-CoV-2 (Wuhan) strain compared to adults¹⁻³. However, the combination of increased
42 transmissibility of SARS-CoV-2 Delta and Omicron variants, increased population movement
43 due to easing of COVID-19 restrictions, and a higher vaccination rate in adults compared with
44 children have resulted in rising COVID-19 cases among children^{4,5}. Despite this, SARS-CoV-
45 2 infections in children are mostly mild or asymptomatic.

46 In Australia, there have been three epidemic waves of COVID-19, caused respectively
47 by the original Wuhan strain (first infection documented in March 2020), the Delta variant
48 (May 2021) and the Omicron variant (November 2021)⁶. Australian children aged 5-11 years
49 were eligible for COVID-19 vaccination from December 2021, with uptake of two doses
50 estimated at 40.6% as of 7th August 2022⁵.

51 The Omicron variant BA.1/BA.2 is associated with reduced clinical severity and risk
52 of hospitalization compared to the Delta variant in both children and adults⁷⁻¹⁰. Adults mount
53 strong Omicron-specific humoral responses¹¹, but limited data are available in children. We
54 previously reported that only 37.5% of children infected with the Wuhan strain seroconverted
55 compared with 76.2% of adults¹². It is unknown if a similar pattern occurs following Delta or
56 Omicron infection in children. We therefore aimed to compare seroconversion rates and
57 antibody responses in children across the three SARS-CoV-2 waves in Melbourne, Australia.

58 In this household cohort study, suspected SARS-CoV-2 cases and household members
59 of suspected cases were tested by RT-PCR on nasopharyngeal (NP) swabs at The Royal
60 Children's Hospital or by nasal rapid antigen test (RAT) at home. Confirmed SARS-CoV-2
61 cases and household members were invited to participate. Blood samples were collected
62 approximately one month following PCR/RAT diagnosis. Written informed consent and assent
63 were obtained from adults/parents and children, respectively. The study was conducted with
64 the approval of the Royal Children's Hospital Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC):
65 HREC/63666/RCHM-2019. A SARS-CoV-2 S1 in-house ELISA and surrogate virus
66 neutralization test (sVNT) were used to measure IgG and neutralising antibody responses using
67 Wuhan and variant-specific S1 antigens. Detailed methodology, including description of
68 epidemic waves, ELISA and sVNT assays and statistical analyses, are provided in the
69 Supplementary material.

70 Between March 2020 and July 2022, a total of 580 adults and children were enrolled.
71 Participants aged between 6 months to 17 years with COVID-19 confirmed by SARS-CoV-2
72 PCR or RAT on nasopharyngeal swab who had not received any COVID-19 vaccine were
73 included in this analysis (n=107). We also included children who had received at least one dose
74 of a COVID-19 vaccine but experienced a breakthrough Omicron infection (n=24, extended
75 data, Figure 1 and Table 1). Unvaccinated children infected with Omicron were younger than
76 children infected with Wuhan or Delta variant

77 Among the 56 children infected with the Wuhan strain, 21 (37.5%) seroconverted by
78 day 36¹², while all 35 children infected with Delta (P<0.0001), and 13 of 16 (81%) infected
79 with Omicron (P=0.004) variants seroconverted (Figure 1A). Two out of three children infected
80 with Omicron were seronegative based on testing using the Wuhan S1 antigen but were
81 seropositive when tested using the Omicron S1 antigen.

82 Among children who seroconverted, S1-specific IgG concentrations to Omicron
83 infection (GMC: 46.4 BAU/ml, 95% CI: 18.9, 113.8) were 7.7- and 9.4-fold lower than Wuhan
84 (GMC: 359 BAU/ml, 95% CI: 221.2, 582.5, P=0.0002) or Delta infections (GMC: 435.5
85 BAU/ml, 95% CI: 296.9, 638.9, P<0.0001), respectively (Figure 1B). Vaccinated children with
86 Omicron breakthrough infection had 61.6-fold higher IgG GMC than unvaccinated Omicron-
87 infected children. Similarly, lower neutralizing antibody responses based on the Wuhan-
88 antigen-based sVNT were observed among unvaccinated Omicron-infected children (only one
89 out of the 13 children who seroconverted had a positive neutralising antibody response)
90 compared with children who seroconverted following Wuhan or Delta infection or who were
91 previously vaccinated (19 of 21, 35 of 35 and 24 of 24 had high neutralising antibody responses
92 respectively, P<0.0001 for all comparisons, Figure 1C). This lower response to Omicron was
93 not associated with younger age when we stratified the analysis based on 5-17 years and <5
94 years for Wuhan and Delta (extended data, Figure 2). When we used variant-specific S1

95 antigens, we observed higher IgG concentrations for Omicron but not Delta (extended data,
96 Figure 3). Omicron-specific neutralizing antibody responses were detected in nine out of 13
97 children when measured using the Omicron-specific sVNT for the Omicron cohort (geometric
98 mean % inhibition: 47.7%, 95% CI 35.4%, 64.2%), but the responses were still significantly
99 lower compared with vaccinated children with Omicron breakthrough 78.8% (95% CI 68.7%,
100 90.4%, $P=0.009$, Figure 1D). Children infected with Wuhan or Omicron, but not Delta, had
101 significantly lower IgG concentrations than adults (2.1-fold and 89.1-fold, respectively),
102 although the number of unvaccinated adults in the Omicron cohort was small due to high
103 vaccine coverage among adults in the cohort (extended data, Figure 4). The neutralizing
104 antibody response against Omicron was consistent with the IgG response (extended data,
105 Figure 4).

106 Our findings indicate that almost all children seroconverted following Omicron
107 infection. However, these children mounted a lower antibody response compared to the Wuhan
108 strain or the Delta variant, which contrasts with observations in adults¹¹. How this relates to
109 protection against re-infection and disease is unknown. The role of other immune factors (i.e.
110 cellular and mucosal immunity) in protection against Omicron re-infection, particularly BA.4/5
111 subvariants among unvaccinated and vaccinated children remains to be determined. Vaccinated
112 children with breakthrough Omicron infection mounted the highest antibody responses in our
113 study, suggesting that vaccination may help overcome the low antibody response following
114 Omicron variant infection in children. We also found that the antibody response against
115 Omicron may be substantially underestimated when measured using Wuhan antigen, with
116 implications for seroprevalence studies and estimating protective antibody titres against
117 Omicron infection. On 3rd August 2022, Australia authorities recommended the use of the
118 mRNA-1273 (Moderna[®]) vaccine for high-risk children aged from 6 months to < 5 years¹³.
119 Ongoing serological studies to monitor immunogenicity against SARS-CoV-2 variants of

120 concern remains crucial. Furthermore, new formulations of vaccine(s) are under review by
121 international regulators, including bivalent Ancestral/Omicron vaccines¹⁴, and our household
122 cohort study will continue to monitor immunological responses when these new-generation
123 vaccines become available to the paediatric population. Limitations of the study include the
124 small sample size, particularly for the Omicron cohort and the young age group (<5 years) in
125 the Omicron cohort, since most children in our cohort were ≥ 5 years and had received at least
126 one dose of COVID-19 vaccine. We also did not have data on viral loads and information on
127 the infecting strain. However, we believe our assumptions about the infecting variant in each
128 cohort were correct based on available local epidemiological and sequence data⁶.

129 In summary, the immune response to SARS-CoV-2 infection among children varies
130 between the variants. While most unvaccinated children infected with Delta or Omicron
131 seroconvert, antibody responses to Omicron were much lower. This might lead to an increased
132 risk of repeated re-infection of children, which would in-turn have serious implications for their
133 long-term health. The much stronger antibody responses observed among vaccinated children
134 supports vaccination of children to induce greater protective immunity.

135

136 *Acknowledgments*

137 We thank the study participants and families for their involvement in this study. We
138 also acknowledge the SAEFVIC Research Team (Alissa McMinn, Hayley Giuliano, Kate
139 Hession, Belle Overmars, Chelsea Bartel). We also acknowledge the Murdoch Children's
140 Research Institute (MCRI) Biobanking service for their help in processing the samples.
141 Funding for the recruitment of participants was provided by the Royal Children's Hospital
142 Foundation and the MCRI Infection and Immunity Theme, grants from the DHB Foundation
143 and the Victorian Department of Jobs, Precincts and Regions. This work is supported by
144 Victorian Government's Medical Research Operational Infrastructure Support Program.

145 MCRI. PVL is supported by NHMRC Career Development Fellowship. DB, ACS and NC are
146 supported by NHMRC Investigator Grants. ACS is supported by a Viertel Senior Medical
147 Research Fellowship. ST is supported by a MCRI Clinician Scientist Fellowship. ZQT is
148 supported by an MCRI Early Career Fellowship. NWC received funding from the National
149 Institute of Health for influenza and COVID-19 research. All other authors reported no
150 conflicts of interests.

151

152 **References**

- 153 1 Dawood, F. S. *et al.* Observations of the global epidemiology of COVID-19 from the
154 prepandemic period using web-based surveillance: a cross-sectional analysis. *Lancet*
155 *Infect Dis* **20**, 1255-1262, doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(20)30581-8 (2020).
- 156 2 Viner, R. M. *et al.* Susceptibility to SARS-CoV-2 Infection Among Children and
157 Adolescents Compared With Adults: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *JAMA*
158 *Pediatr*, doi:10.1001/jamapediatrics.2020.4573 (2020).
- 159 3 Zimmermann, P. & Curtis, N. Why Does the Severity of COVID-19 Differ With
160 Age?: Understanding the Mechanisms Underlying the Age Gradient in Outcome
161 Following SARS-CoV-2 Infection. *Pediatr Infect Dis J* **41**, e36-e45,
162 doi:10.1097/INF.0000000000003413 (2022).
- 163 4 Alteri, C. *et al.* Epidemiological characterization of SARS-CoV-2 variants in children
164 over the four COVID-19 waves and correlation with clinical presentation. *Sci Rep* **12**,
165 10194, doi:10.1038/s41598-022-14426-0 (2022).
- 166 5 Australia Department of Health. COVID-19 vaccine rollout update – 7 August 2022.
167 ([https://www.health.gov.au/sites/default/files/documents/2022/08/covid-19-vaccine-](https://www.health.gov.au/sites/default/files/documents/2022/08/covid-19-vaccine-rollout-update-9-august-2022.pdf)
168 [rollout-update-9-august-2022.pdf](https://www.health.gov.au/sites/default/files/documents/2022/08/covid-19-vaccine-rollout-update-9-august-2022.pdf), 2022).

- 169 6 Hadfield, J. *et al.* Nextstrain: real-time tracking of pathogen evolution. *Bioinformatics*
170 **34**, 4121-4123, doi:10.1093/bioinformatics/bty407 (2018).
- 171 7 Bager, P. *et al.* Risk of hospitalisation associated with infection with SARS-CoV-2
172 omicron variant versus delta variant in Denmark: an observational cohort study.
173 *Lancet Infect Dis* **22**, 967-976, doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(22)00154-2 (2022).
- 174 8 Sheikh, A. *et al.* Severity of omicron variant of concern and effectiveness of vaccine
175 boosters against symptomatic disease in Scotland (EAVE II): a national cohort study
176 with nested test-negative design. *Lancet Infect Dis* **22**, 959-966, doi:10.1016/S1473-
177 3099(22)00141-4 (2022).
- 178 9 Wolter, N. *et al.* Early assessment of the clinical severity of the SARS-CoV-2
179 omicron variant in South Africa: a data linkage study. *Lancet* **399**, 437-446,
180 doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(22)00017-4 (2022).
- 181 10 Levy, N. *et al.* Severity and Incidence of Multisystem Inflammatory Syndrome in
182 Children During 3 SARS-CoV-2 Pandemic Waves in Israel. *JAMA* **327**, 2452-2454,
183 doi:10.1001/jama.2022.8025 (2022).
- 184 11 Suryawanshi, R. K. *et al.* Limited cross-variant immunity from SARS-CoV-2
185 Omicron without vaccination. *Nature*, doi:10.1038/s41586-022-04865-0 (2022).
- 186 12 Toh, Z. Q. *et al.* Comparison of Seroconversion in Children and Adults With Mild
187 COVID-19. *JAMA Netw Open* **5**, e221313, doi:10.1001/jamanetworkopen.2022.1313
188 (2022).
- 189 13 Australian Technical Advisory Group on Immunisation. *ATAGI recommendations on*
190 *COVID-19 vaccine use in children aged 6 months to <5 years*, (2022).
- 191 14 Australia Therapeutic Goods Administration. *TGA grants provisional determination*
192 *for the Moderna bivalent COVID-19 vaccine "SPIKEVAX Bivalent Zero/Omicron"*,
193 2022).

194 **Figure legends**

195 **Figure 1: SARS-CoV-2 antibody responses in children infected with Wuhan, Delta or**
196 **Omicron variant and children previously vaccinated and then infected with Omicron.**

197 (A) SARS-CoV-2 Immunoglobulin G (IgG) Seropositivity Rate at Day 36 post-infection.

198 Among children who seroconverted at Day 36 post-infection, (B) SARS-CoV-2 IgG

199 concentrations, (C) SARS-CoV-2 neutralising antibodies as measured by surrogate virus

200 neutralisation test. (D) SARS-CoV-2 neutralising antibodies as measured by surrogate virus

201 neutralisation test using Wuhan- or Omicron-specific antigen. Dotted lines indicate

202 seropositivity cut-off. Each data point represents an individual participant. Data presented as

203 geometric mean concentrations \pm 95% confidence intervals. BAU, binding antibody units.

204

205 **Extended data, Figure 1: Overview of the cohort by age and their date of SARS-CoV-2**

206 **infection.** Each dot represents a child. N=131.

207

208 **Extended data, Figure 2: SARS-CoV-2 antibody responses in children infected with**

209 **Wuhan, Delta or Omicron strain stratified by age.** Each data point represents an

210 individual participant. Data presented as geometric mean concentrations \pm 95% confidence

211 intervals. BAU, binding antibody units.

212

213 **Extended data, Figure 3: SARS-CoV-2 antibody responses in children infected with**

214 **Wuhan, Delta or Omicron strain measured using Wuhan or variant-specific S1 antigen**

215 **(Ag).** SARS-CoV-2 IgG concentrations measured by ELISA assay. Dotted lines indicate

216 seropositivity cut-off. Each data point represents an individual participant. Data presented as

217 geometric mean concentrations \pm 95% confidence intervals. BAU, binding antibody units.

218

219 **Extended data, Figure 4: Comparison of SARS-CoV-2 antibody responses between**
220 **children and adults.** (A) SARS-CoV-2 IgG concentration in children (C) or adults (A)
221 infected with Wuhan, Delta or Omicron strain. (B) Neutralising antibodies of unvaccinated
222 children or adults infected with Omicron measured by SARS-CoV-2 surrogate virus
223 neutralisation assay using Wuhan or Omicron antigen (Ag). Each data point represents an
224 individual participant. Dotted lines indicate seropositivity cut-off. Data presented as
225 geometric mean concentrations \pm 95% confidence intervals. BAU, binding antibody units.

Figure 1

