1	ARTICLE TYPE:	Systematic Review and Meta-analysis
2	TITLE:	School Feeding Programmes and Physical Nutrition Outcomes
3		of Primary School Children in Developing Countries
4	AUTHOR NAMES:	Mustapha Titi Yussif ¹ , Vincent Awuah Adocta ¹ , Charles
5		Apprey ¹ , Reginald Adjetey Annan ¹ , Prosper Galseku ²
6	AUTHOR AFFILIATION	1. Department of Biochemistry and Biotechnology, Faculty of
7		Biosciences, College of Science, Kwame Nkrumah University
8		of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana
9		2. Gushegu Midwifery Training College, Ministry of Health,
10		Ghana
11	CORRESPONDING AUTI	IOR: Mustapha Titi Yussif,
12		Department of Biochemistry and Biotechnology, Faculty
13		of Biosciences, College of Science, Kwame Nkrumah
14		University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana
15		Email:rastiti2009@hotmail.com,
16		mtyussif@st.knust.edu.gh

17 ABSTRACT

18 **Context:** School feeding programmes have been widely implemented and particularly in

19 developing countries with the aim to improve school enrolment and attendance especially of

20 girls and to reduce short term hunger to improve children's performance in school.

21 Beyond the first 1000 days of the lives of children, school feeding programmes remain one of

22 the critical interventions that have used schools as a platform to contribute to the fulfilment of

their nutritional needs though the evidence to this effect is little and mixed.

24 **Objective:** This review focused on assessing the impact of school feeding programmes on

reduction in underweight, thinness, and stunting among primary school children in

26 developing countries.

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

Data sources: Electronic searches were carried out in PUBMED, SCORPUS and Cochrane
library. The WHO clinical trials registry as well as reference lists of relevant articles were
also hand searched.

Data Extraction: Data was extracted from included studies which have been published in the
 past 10 years (2010 – August 2021) from original research where the main intervention was
 the provision of school based meals.

33 Data analysis: Meta-analysis was conducted to determine changes in height-for-age (HAZ),

34 weight-for-age (WAZ) and BMI-for-age (BAZ) z scores. A random effects model was

35 applied to determine the mean difference in all outcomes of interest which were evaluated as

36 continuous variables.

Results: Children aged 3 - 16 years were enrolled in the included studies and the number of

participants ranged between 321 and 2,869 across studies. Of the included studies, the

feeding intervention provided for a minimum of 30% RDA for the age group with the

40 intervention lasting up to a maximum of 34 weeks. The impact of school feeding intervention

41 on HAZ, BAZ and WAZ showed statistically non-significant (p>0.05) mean differences of

42 0.02 (95% CI, -0.06 to 0.10), 0.11 (95% CI, -0.01 to 0.23) and 0.06 (95% CI, -0.04 to 0.16)

43 respectively

44 Conclusion: School feeding interventions have not shown any significant positive effect on
45 the physical nutrition outcomes of primary school children. Short duration of intervention of
46 studies, poor compliance to feeding and substitution of school meals could have accounted
47 for the weak effect sizes.

48

50 INTRODUCTION

51 Background

Poor diet is the leading cause of mortality and morbidity worldwide, exceeding the burdens attributable to many other major global health challenges. According to the 2020 Global Nutrition Report¹, an average of 820 million people worldwide (1 in every 9) are hungry or undernourished, with numbers rising since 2015, especially in Africa, West Asia and Latin America.

57 This situation of poor nutrition and health conditions in these developing regions apart from 58 the most often fatal end, have implications for the later lives of the surviving children. It is 59 known that malnutrition worsens poverty and reduces economic growth and its said to cost 60 many developing nations 2-3% of their GDP every year².

Malnutrition during early childhood results in children achieving less at school during schoolage and their productivity and state of health in adult life becomes seriously affected.

Educational and health outcomes however can still be improved for children during their
school age by using the school as an opportune setting to provide adequate health and
nutrition interventions and services.

School feeding programmes are one of such interventions that have used schools as a
platform to contribute to the fulfilment of the nutritional needs of children beyond the first 2
years of their lives. School feeding programmes are thus interventions that provide food to
school children either as in-school meals where the children are fed at school or given takehome food rations³.

School feeding programmes come in different modalities and are currently being used in over
161 countries providing school meals to over 388 million children⁴ and receiving various

forms and magnitude of support from the World Food Programme and its development
partners. According to the World Food Programme⁴, the number of children receiving school
meals grew by 9 percent globally and 36 percent in low-income countries between 2013 and
2020.

These feeding programmes have been implemented in many developing countries with varying objectives such as the reduction of short term hunger to improve children's performance in school, encourage school enrolment and attendance, retention of girls in school⁵ and also as a means to improve nutritional status of school aged children⁶.

81 **Objectives of the review**

It is estimated that governments invest between US\$41 - US\$43 billion annually on school feeding programs⁴ yet there is a huge controversy over the effectiveness of the school feeding programmes (SFPs). Evidence available show remarkable impact of the SFPs in improving school attendance however evidence for nutritional benefits is little and mixed. A recent meta-analysis⁷ shows impact of feeding programmes in schools on iron deficiency anaemia reduction in developing countries.

Following the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses
(PRISMA) guidelines, this systematic review therefore considered the most recent literature
for new evidence from randomized controlled trials on the impact of the school feeding
programmes on physical nutritional outcomes of primary school children in developing
countries. The review primarily focused on the intervention's impact on reduction in
underweight, thinness, and stunting among primary school children in developing countries.

94

95

96 **METHODS**

97 Eligibility Criteria

98 Type of Studies

99 This review included both experimental and observational studies. The randomized

100 controlled trials that met the eligibility criteria were solely used in the quantitative data

synthesis in the meta-analysis whilst the observational studies were used together with the

102 trials for the qualitative synthesis.

103 Only studies written in English and peer reviewed with full text available were included.

104 Studies with only abstract available and those that were not fully written in English language

105 were excluded.

106 In terms of publication timeframe, this review only included studies which have been

107 published within the past 10 years (from 2010 to August 2021). This was to ensure the review

108 gathered the most current literature in the study area considering new evidence and also not

to merely repeat the findings of earlier systematic reviews (Kristjannson et al.⁸ and Lamis et

110 al.⁹) that had a similar focus.

The review also excluded articles which were written based on review of existing literature (systematic reviews and meta-analysis) and thus only included articles based on original research (primary data). Only original research articles have been included as a measure of avoiding duplicate effect of an article associated with its use as primary literature and also its use in a secondary literature in the same work.

116 **Type of participants**

This review aims to draw conclusions on the impact of school feeding programmes onprimary school children in developing countries hence only studies that were conducted in

developing countries were included. Developing countries were determined using the World
Bank's list of economies¹⁰.

121 The inclusion and exclusion criteria did not segregate between whether the study sample was 122 drawn from an urban, rural, slum or socio-economically disadvantaged areas in as far as the 123 setting is in a low and middle income country.

Studies which were carried out on primary school children were included whiles those that only involved pre-school or high school children were excluded. Inclusion was not narrowed down to any article with sample population of a specific age group but broadly on primary school pupils irrespective of their age or stage.

128 Types of Intervention

Studies were only included if the main intervention was the provision of school based meals through a school feeding programme which includes breakfast or lunch and also snacks including milk and cookies (biscuits) as defined by the World Food Programme³.

In studies where more than one interventions was provided, such studies were included in this review and the results of the intervention that fits the definition of school feeding described above was included in the pooled effect analysis. However if all interventions are school based meals, then the outcomes of all the interventions are included in the analysis.

Studies were excluded if the intervention was not in a school setting. Studies that provided only micronutrient supplementation, take-home food rations, food stamps and stand-alone school nutrition education were excluded as well. Studies with interventions which provide cash transfers to parents of primary school children were also excluded from this review.

140

141

142 Types of Outcome Measures

- 143 Studies that measured changes in physical nutrition outcomes associated with in-school meals
- 144 were included in this review. Outcomes of physical nutritional status that were considered in
- this review were the anthropometric indicators of leanness, chronic and acute malnutrition
- 146 particularly, underweight, stunting and BMI for age.
- 147 The Participants, Interventions, Comparators, Outcomes and Study design (PICOS) criteria
- 148 for inclusion and exclusion are described in Table 1.

149 Table 1: PICOS criteria for inclusion and exclusion of studies

PICOS Criteria	Inclusion	Exclusion
Participants	 Study subjects being primary school children Study participants being from a developing country 	 Pre-school children and high school children Study participants being from a developed country
Interventions	 School feeding – in-school meals provided; breakfast or lunch or snacks 	 Take home food rations School based micronutrient supplementation Food stamps
Comparators	 Articles with an intervention and comparison group/control group Control/comparison group did receive any kind of 	- Control group receiving any form of in-school feeding/micronutrient supplementation
Outcomes	 Primary: studies that measured indicators of iron deficiency anaemia (haemoglobin and serum ferritin concentrations) Secondary: dietary iron consumption from in-school meals 	
Study Design	 Randomized trials Observational studies; to be used for only qualitative synthesis 	- Conference abstracts of randomized trials without sufficient information

152 Sources of Information

- 153 The studies included were identified through the use of electronic database search. The
- databases that were particularly searched were COCHRANE LIBRARY, PUBMED and
- 155 SCORPUS.
- 156 In order to explore grey literature, the World Health Organization (WHO) international
- 157 clinical trials registry platform (http://apps.who.int/trialsearch/) was also searched for studies
- 158 which have been completed but not published in peer review journals.

159 Search Strategy

- 160 The basic search terms that were used were, 'school lunch', 'school feeding', 'mid-day meal',
- 161 'school based feeding', 'school nutrition'. Some additional terms that were used included
- 162 'nutritional status', 'anthropometry', 'stunting', wasting', 'underweight'. The basic search
- terms were either used individually in the search or in combination with the additional search
- terms to generate the articles. Table 2 shows the detailed search strategy as applied in
- 165 COCHRANE LIBRARY, PUBMED and SCORPUS.

166 **Table 2: Search Strategy**

PUBMED

(((school feeding[Title/Abstract]) OR (school meal[Title/Abstract])) OR (school lunch[Title/Abstract])) AND (((((((nutritional status[MeSH Major Topic])) OR (stunting[MeSH Terms])) OR (wasting[MeSH Terms])) OR (underweight[MeSH Terms])) OR (weight[MeSH Terms])) OR (height[MeSH Terms]))

SCORPUS

query : ((TITLE-ABS-KEY(school feeding) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY(school lunch) OR TITLE-ABS-KEY(school meal) AND TITLE-ABS-KEY(nutritional status) AND TITLE-ABS-KEY(stunting, wasting, underweight, weight, height)))

167

168

100

170 Data Collection Process

- 171 Data collection forms were developed a priori using the Covidence software and in a way that
- allowed eligibility to be assessed and that extracted data responded to the research questions.
- 173 There was a pilot-testing of the data extraction forms using two included articles. This was to
- ensure that the data collection forms generated were easy to use and that data extracted was
- 175 consistent, clear and complete. Eligibility assessment was done by two persons independently
- and disagreements resolved by consensus.
- 177 Data was extracted on study characteristics such as year, country of origin, study design,
- sample sizes for intervention and control groups, gender, age and length of intervention.
- 179 Description of the intervention and outcome measurement as well as key findings and data on
- 180 direction of results were also extracted

181 Selection of studies and data synthesis

The results generated from the use of the search terms was filtered using the various inclusionand exclusion criteria described in Table 1 above in each of the electronic databases.

184 The total number of articles retrieved after preliminary search from the three databases were

493. 2 other articles were obtained from the search for grey literature. Upon the removal of

54 duplicate articles, 413 irrelevant articles were further removed through tittle and abstractscreening.

188 Full text reading was done for 28 studies during which an additional 20 articles were

189 excluded with 8 articles remaining which satisfied the inclusion criteria. Of the 8 included

studies, 4 were randomised controlled trials whiles the other 4 were observational studies.

191 Figure 1 details the selection of studies.





237 Summary measures and synthesis of results

- 238 Meta-analysis was conducted using Cochrane Collaboration Review Manager (RevMan
- version 5.4). Predicting an eminent clinical heterogeneity in the studies related to the varying

240 modes of the school feeding intervention, a random effects model was applied in the analysis241 and this was determined a priori.

All the three outcomes of this review; Height-for-age z scores and Weight-for-age z scores as
well as BMI-for-age z scores were evaluated as continuous outcomes using mean differences.
In one of the studies; Neervort et al.¹¹, all the outcome data was presented in prevalence rates
and were thus not used in the meta analysis because the mean and standard deviations could
not be obtained.

For studies that provided standard errors instead of standard deviations, the standard

deviations for the sample means were calculated using $SD = SE \times \sqrt{N}$ where SD is Standard

249 Deviation, SE, Standard error and N, the sample size¹².

250 Assessing Heterogeneity and Publication Bias

251 Clinical heterogeneity was assessed by considering the ages of the participants enrolled in the

study and the type and quality of meals served in the school feeding programmes used in the

various studies. Statistical heterogeneity on the other hand was assessed using visual

inspection of forest plots, I² measures and their respective chi square tests¹³. An I² greater

than 75% was evaluated as considerable heterogeneity¹⁴.

Funnel plots were not considered in the assessment of publication bias due to the few number of studies used in the meta analysis¹⁵. However, publication bias was reduced through the adoption of a robust search strategy which included a thorough hand search of references of included studies as well as searches on the websites of the World Food Programme and the WHO clinical trials registry to identify studies that were not published in peer review journals.

262

264 **RESULTS**

265 Characteristics of included studies

- 266 The review included studies that were conducted in developing countries across three
- 267 continents; Africa, Asia and Latin America. Five of the studies were conducted in Africa, two
- studies in Latin America and One study in Asia.
- 269 Participants enrolled in the studies that were included in the review were all primary school
- pupils aged between 3 and 16 years with number of participants ranging from 321 to 2,869
- across studies. With respect to the number of participants used in the meta analysis to
- evaluate the impact of school feeding programmes on the various physical nutritional
- outcomes, 3955 participants included in the trials was used to evaluate programme impact on
- height-for-age z scores (stunting) whilst 1562 and 3930 included in the trials were used to
- evaluate impact on weight-for-age and BMI-for-age respectively as shown in Table 3.
- 276 The trials that were included in this review administered school feeding interventions that
- 277 provided either snacks or a hot meal for lunch made from local foods. The feeding
- interventions provided for a minimum of 30% of the Recommended Dietary Allowance for
- the age group of the children enrolled with the interventions lasting for a minimum of 13
- 280 weeks to a maximum of 34 weeks.
- 281 Table 3: Effect estimates on outcomes

Outcome or Subgroup	Studies	Participants	Statistical Method	Estimate Effect
1.1 Height-for-age z scores	4	3955	Mean Difference (IV,	0.02 [-0.06, 0.10]
			Random, 95% CI)	
1.2 BMI-for-age z scores	4	3930	Mean Difference (IV,	0.11 [-0.01, 0.23]
			Random, 95% CI)	
1.3 Weight-for-age z scores	3	1562	Mean Difference (IV,	0.06 [-0.04, 0.16]
			Random, 95% CI)	

282

283 Risk of Bias in Included Studies

- For the randomized control trials which have been included in this review, the risk of bias
- judgements have been shown in the 'risk of bias' summary tables and 'risk of bias' graph in
- Figure 2 and Figure 3 respectively.



287

Figure 2: Risk of bias graph: review authors' judgements about each risk of bias item presented as percentages across all included studies

290 All the included trials described random sequence generation and allocation concealment

adequately and thus were rated as low risk of bias.

292 Blinding of participants and personnel was only described by Gelli et al.¹⁶. It was stated that

293 participants and survey enumerators were not blinded to the allocation whiles the remaining

studies were silent on this. Not this withstanding, all the studies were judged to be of low risk

of bias for blinding of participants because the outcomes of interest are not likely to be

- influenced by a lack of blinding.
- 297 For blinding of outcome assessment, all the studies were judged to have an unclear risk of

bias for blinding because none of the studies had reported on it.

All the trials included in this review were judged to have a low risk of bias associated with

300 incomplete outcome data or attrition bias.

- Only Gelli et al.¹⁶ had published the protocol for the study which was then used to confirm that the outcomes that were reported were same as was published in the protocol. Thus a low risk of bias was noted for the study conducted by Gelli et al.¹⁶ whiles the remaining three trials¹⁷⁻¹⁹ were judged to have an unclear risk of risk of reporting bias as their protocols could not be retrieved hence there was no enough information available to serve as basis of judgment.
- 307 On other bias, preference bias was the other potential sources of bias that was evaluated. All

the studies were rated as having a low risk of other bias.



309

- 310 Figure 3: Risk of bias summary: review authors' judgements about each risk of bias item
- 311 for each included study.

312

313

315 Synthesis of School Feeding Programme Impact

316 Height-for-Age z-score

- In order to evaluate the impact of school feeding programmes on height-for-age z scores as a
- marker for stunting, 3 randomized controlled trials with a total of 3,955 participants were
- included in the Meta analysis. One of the studies; Lannotti et al.¹⁷, provided a two arm
- intervention and both arms were used separately in the analysis. 3 of the interventions from
- 321 the trials that were included in this analysis provided snacks while 1 trial provided a hot meal
- 322 lunch. This indicates that the studies that contributed to the pooled effect were very similar
- and as well not statistically heterogeneous (Tau2 = 0.00, chi2 = 5.56, df= 3, p =0.14; I² =
- 324 46%) as indicated in the meta analysis.
- 325 The result of the meta analysis indicates that there is no significant effect (p = 0.65) of school
- feeding programmes on height-for-age z-scores (HAZ) as the intervention only resulted in a
- marginal effect size of 0.02 (95% CI, -0.06 to 0.10) in HAZ among school feeding
- 328 beneficiaries compared to non-beneficiaries.

	School Feeding Control							Mean Difference	Mean Difference		
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% Cl		
Gelli 2019	-1.12	1.37	1165	-1.21	1.28	1020	28.6%	0.09 [-0.02, 0.20]	•		
Lannotti 2015a	-0.99	1.2	314	-0.86	1.16	251	14.1%	-0.13 [-0.33, 0.07]	•		
Lannotti 2015b	-0.74	1.26	332	-0.86	1.16	251	13.9%	0.12 [-0.08, 0.32]	+		
Lannotti 2016	-0.06	0.43	311	-0.05	0.35	311	43.4%	-0.01 [-0.07, 0.05]	•		
Total (95% CI)			2122			1833	100.0%	0.02 [-0.06, 0.10]			
Heterogeneity: Tau ² =	: 0.00; Cł	ni² = 5.:	56, df =	3 (P = 0	0.14); I	² = 46%	b				
Test for overall effect: Z = 0.46 (P = 0.65)								Favours [School Feeding] Favours [control]			

329

- **Figure 4: Forest plot of school feeding vrs control, RCTs, Outcome: Height-for-age z**
- 331 scores (HAZ)

332

334 BMI-for-Age z-score

335	Two sing	gle arm and	l one o	double	arm rand	lomized	control	l trial	s were	inclu	ided	l in 1	the meta
-----	----------	-------------	---------	--------	----------	---------	---------	---------	--------	-------	------	--------	----------

- analysis to evaluate the impact of school feeding programmes on BMI-for-Age z-scores
- among primary school children in developing countries. A total of 3930 participants were
- involved with feeding interventions lasting for an average of 24 weeks where either energy
- dense snacks or a hot meal lunch made from local ingredients were used.
- 340 From the meta analysis, school feeding does not seem to confer any significant impact in
- terms of BAZ on beneficiaries. An insignificant (p = 0.08) mean difference of 0.11(95% CI, -
- 342 0.01 to 0.23) BAZ exists between the school feeding group and the controls. The contribution
- of the various trials to the net effect was fairly homogenous at a Tau2 of 0.01, chi2 = 10.01
- with df= 3, p =0.02; I² = 70% requiring no sub group analysis.



345

Figure 5: Forest plot of school feeding vrs control, RCTs, Outcome: BMI-for-age z scores

- 347 **(BAZ)**
- 348

349 Weight-for-age z-scores

- A total of 1562 participants were included from two trials in the Meta analysis to determine
- the effect of providing school feeding programmes to primary school children on their weight
- for age z scores (WAZ). The two trials of which one had a two arm intervention were both

353 conducted in Latin America where the intervention groups were given snacks that provided
354 165 kcal and 260kcal over an average period of 19 weeks.

The Meta analysis which indicated that heterogeneity among trials that contributed to the pooled effect was at Tau2 of 0.00, chi2 = 4.16 with df= 2, p =0.13; $I^2 = 52\%$ provided no substantial evidence to conclude that the provision of snacks in a school feeding programme to primary school children will improve their WAZ. The children that were provided with the snacks only had a WAZ of 0.06 (95% CI, -0.04 to 0.16) more than their counterparts who did not receive the snacks. This difference has been shown to be statistically insignificant (p =

361 0.27).

School Feeding			Control			Mean Difference		Mean Difference	
Study or Subgroup	Mean	SD	Total	Mean	SD	Total	Weight	IV, Random, 95% CI	IV, Random, 95% Cl
Gelli 2019	0	0	0	0	0	0		Not estimable	
Lannotti 2015a	-0.9	1.08	314	-0.98	0.98	251	23.0%	0.08 [-0.09, 0.25]	+
Lannotti 2015b	-0.81	1.07	332	-0.98	0.98	251	23.6%	0.17 [0.00, 0.34]	•
Lannotti 2016	0.06	0.28	207	0.06	0.25	207	53.4%	0.00 [-0.05, 0.05]	•
Total (95% CI)			853			709	100.0%	0.06 [-0.04, 0.16]	
Heterogeneity: Tau² = 0.00; Chi² = 4.16, df = 2 (F Test for overall effect: Z = 1.11 (P = 0.27)			2 (P = ().13);1	²= 52%	ó		-100 -50 0 50 100 Favours [School Feeding] Favours [control]	

```
363 Figure 6: Forest plot of school feeding vrs control, RCTs, Outcome: Weight-for-age z
```

```
364 scores (WAZ)
```

365

362

366 **DISCUSSION**

Full text screening of 28 articles resulted in the inclusion of 8 studies in this review of which

368 4 studies were randomized controlled trials which were used in the Meta analysis leading to

the main conclusions in this review. The studies were conducted in eight developing

370 countries across Africa, Asia and Latin America where the feeding interventions provided in

the trials were either snacks or lunch made from local recipes.

The meta-analysis of three homogenous randomized controlled trials which included 3,955 primary school children showed that the provision of school feeding programmes does not result in any significant change in height-for-age z-scores and thus does not translate to a reduction in stunting among beneficiaries vis a vis non-beneficiaries.

376 The four observational studies that were included in this review all evaluated programme

377 impact on height-for-age z scores however with mixed results. Two large studies; Wang et

al.²⁰ and Abizari et al.²¹, conducted in China and Ghana respectively found that school

feeding programmes did not influence any significant change in HAZ and stunting

prevalence. In contrast, a study conducted by Kwabla et al.²² in Ghana found prevalence rates

of stunting to be lower (16.2%) among school feeding beneficiaries than non-programme

participants (17.2%). Another study conducted in Ethiopia; Zenebe et al.²³, found HAZ to be

significantly higher (p < 0.001) among school feeding participants with a mean difference of

 $384 \qquad 0.57 \ (95\% \ CI: \ 0.36 - 0.78).$

BMI-for-age z scores is a measure of thinness among children. This review has shown that for primary school children, the provision of meals/snacks in school does not confer any positive impact on their thinness status. The Meta analysis that combined three trials that provided snacks and hot meal lunches to 3930 children in school over an average of 24 weeks period did not find any significant impact on BAZ.

A similar conclusion can be arrived at when the observational studies included in this review are considered. Three out of four observational studies found no significant positive influence of school feeding programmes on BAZ. In fact, one of the three studies; Kwabla et al.²², found that the prevalence of thinness was 2 times higher (9.3%) among children in schools providing school feeding programmes compared to the non-school feeding programme schools (4.6%).

396	Weight-for-age z-scores (WAZ) is one of the commonest indicators of nutritional status
397	among children. It classifies children either as underweight or not and is a composite
398	indicator of co-existence of both chronic and acute malnutrition. From the Meta analysis
399	conducted in this review using two trials with three intervention arms that provided snacks on
400	daily basis to school children for an average period of 19 weeks, the interventions were found
401	not to significantly increase WAZ among beneficiaries. Thus, school feeding programmes
402	that provide snacks to children does not significantly impact on underweight status of
403	children in primary schools.

404 The only observational study in this review that evaluated the impact of school feeding

405 programmes on WAZ; Abizari et al.²¹, found no significant difference in prevalence of

406 underweight between children benefiting from the feeding programme and non-beneficiaries

407 thus affirming the conclusion arrived by the results of the meta analysis.

408 CONCLUSION

This review has demonstrated through the results of the meta analysis of four randomized controlled trials that school feeding programmes do not have any significant impact on physical nutrition outcomes particularly height-for-age z scores, BMI-for-age z scores and weight-for-age z scores. Evidence from observational studies generally support the conclusions of the meta analysis with a little mixed evidence of the impact of school feeding programmes on stunting reduction in primary school children.

Although, the trials that were included in the review were mostly similar and the Meta
analysis results depicted considerable statistical homogeneity in all cases, the average period
of the feeding intervention of 27 weeks may be short and might have resulted in the
insignificant effect sizes.

Also, most of the studies included in the review did not report on how compliance was
monitored or enforced thus, a possible low compliance to the feeding interventions could
have also compromised programme impacts.

422 Another factor that could affect programme impact is substitution; where the home diet may

- 423 be reduced for children who are benefiting from school feeding. Though none of the studies
- 424 in this review provided data on this, other studies have reported it among poor families 24,25 .
- 425 Studies that aim to evaluate the impact of school feeding programmes on the nutritional
- 426 wellbeing of children are of great importance in public health as poor nutrition and health at
- school age is common especially in developing countries and given that malnutrition is an
- 428 intergenerational issue. Such studies are equally vital to inform national governments, global
- 429 food and nutrition stakeholders who invest in these programmes on its effectiveness.
- 430 There is therefore the need for more randomized controlled trials which are of high
- 431 methodological quality to be able to attribute causality and to be eligible to be used in a larger
- 432 meta-analysis to confirm or otherwise reject the evidence produced by this review.

433

434 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

435 Acknowledgment

We wish to acknowledge the support received from the Covidence Team who provided a
waiver of user fees associated with the use of the Covidence Software which was largely used
to manage the systematic review. RevMan, a software from the Cochrane Collaboration was
also used for the quantitative synthesis of the review data.

440 Funding and Sponsorship

441 No funding of any sort was received from any third parties or organizations.

442 **Declaration of Interest**

443 The authors have no relevant interest to declare.

444 LIST OF SUPPORTING INFORMATION

- 1. Summary Table of Included Studies Randomized Controlled Trials
- 446 2. Summary Table of Included Studies Observational Studies

447

448 **REFERENCES**

- 1. Micha, Renata, Mannar, Venkatesh, Afshin, Ashkan, Allemandi, Lorena, Baker,
- 450 Phillip, Battersby, Jane, et al., 2020 Global nutrition report: action on equity to end
- 451 malnutrition. Technical Report. Behrman, Nina, ed. Development Initiatives, Bristol,

452 UK. 2020; ISBN 978-1-9164452-7-7. [Monograph] Official URL:

- 453 https://globalnutritionreport.org/reports/2020-glo...
- 454 2. Horton, Susan, Meera Shekar, Christine McDonald, Ajay Mahal and Jana Krystene
- 455 Brooks. Scaling Up Nutrition: What Will It Cost? World Bank: Washington, DC.

456 2010

- 457 3. World Food Programme. State of School Feeding Worldwide. World Food
 458 Programme; 2013: Italy
- 4. World Food Programme. State of School Feeding Worldwide. World Food
 Programme; Via C.G. Viola, 2020; 68-70, Rome 00148, Italy
- 461 5. Hall A, Hanh TT, Farley K, Quynh TP, Valdivia F. An evaluation of the impact of a
 462 school nutrition programme in Vietnam. Public Health Nutr. 2007 Aug;10(8):819-26.
 463 doi: 10.1017/S1368980007382530. Epub 2007 Mar 8. PMID: 17381906.

464	6.	Adelman, Sarah & Gilligan, Daniel & Lehrer, Kim. The Impact of Alternative Food
465		for Education Programs on Learning Achievement and Cognitive Development in
466		Northern Uganda. 2008
467	7.	Yussif MT, Vong L, Pilkington K. The Impact of School Feeding Programmes in
468		Reducing Iron Deficiency Anaemia among Primary School Children in Developing
469		Countries: A systematic Review and Meta-Analysis of Randomized Controlled Trials.
470		J Hum Nutr. 2020; 4(1): 87 – 105
471	8.	Kristjansson EA, Robinson V, Petticrew M, MacDonald B, Krasevec J, Janzen L,
472		Greenhalgh T, Wells G, MacGowan J, Farmer A, Shea BJ, Mayhew A, Tugwell P.
473		School feeding for improving the physical and psychosocial health of disadvantaged
474		elementary school children. Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2007; 1:CD004676.
475	9.	Jomaa LH, McDonnell E, Probart C. School feeding programs in developing
476		countries: impacts on children's health and educational outcomes. Nutr Rev. 2011;
477		69(2):83-98.
478	10.	World Bank. World Bank List of Economies 2021. World Bank 2021. Available at:
479		https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/906519-world-bank-
480		country-and-lending-groups accessed on17-08-2021
481	11.	Neervoort F, von Rosenstiel I, Bongers K, Demetriades M, Shacola M, Wolffe rs I.
482		Effect of a school feeding programme on nutritional status and anaemia in an urban
483		slum: a preliminary evaluation in Kenya. J Trop Pediatr.2013; 59 (3):165-74.
484	12.	Hozo SP, Djulbegovic B, Hozo I. Estimating the mean and variance from the median,
485		range, and the size of a sample. BMC Medical Research Methodology. 2005; 5: 13.
486	13.	Higgins JP, Thompson SG, Deeks JJ, Altman DG. Measuring inconsistency in meta-
487		analyses. BMJ. 2003 Sep 6;327(7414):557-60. doi: 10.1136/bmj.327.7414.557.
488		PMID: 12958120; PMCID: PMC192859.

489	14. Higgins JM, Thompson SG. Quantifying heterogeneity in a meta-analysis. 2002; 21:
490	1539-1558.

- 491 15. Egger M, Davey Smith G, Schneider M, et al. Bias in meta- analysis detected by a
 492 simple, graphical test. BMJ 1997; 315: 629- 634.
- 493 16. Gelli, A., Aurino, E., Folson, G., Arhinful, D., Adamba, C., Osei-Akoto, I., ...
- 494 Alderman, H. A school meals program implemented at scale in Ghana increases
- height-for-age during midchildhood in girls and in children from poor households: A
- 496 cluster randomized trial. Journal of Nutrition. 2019; 149(8): 1434–1442.
- 497 https://doi.org/10.1093/jn/nxz079
- 498 17. Iannotti LL, Henretty NM, Delnatus JR, Previl W, Stehl T, Vorkoper S, Bodden J,
- 499 Maust A, Smidt R, Nash ML, Tamimie CA, Owen BC, Wolff PB. Ready-to-use
- supplementary food increases fat mass and BMI in Haitian school-aged children. J
- 501 Nutr. 2015 Apr;145(4):813-22. doi: 10.3945/jn.114.203182. Epub 2015 Feb 11.
- 502 PMID: 25833784
- 18. Iannotti LL, Henretty NM, Delnatus JR, Previl W, Stehl T, Vorkoper S, Bodden J,
 Maust A, Smidt R, Nash ML, Tamimie CA, Owen BC, Wolff PB. Ready-to-use
 supplementary food increases fat mass and BMI in Haitian school-aged children. J
- 506Nutr. 2015 Apr;145(4):813-22. doi: 10.3945/jn.114.203182. Epub 2015 Feb 11.
- 507 PMID: 25833784
- 508 19. Lannotti, L., Dulience, S. J., Joseph, S., Cooley, C., Tufte, T., Cox, K., Eaton, J.,
- 509 Delnatus, J. R., & Wolff, P. B. Fortified Snack Reduced Anemia in Rural School-
- 510 Aged Children of Haiti: A Cluster-Randomized, Controlled Trial. PloS one, 2016;
- 511 11(12), e0168121. <u>https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0168121</u>

512	20. Wang, H., Zhao, Q., Boswell, M., & Rozelle, S. Can School Feeding Programs
513	Reduce Malnutrition in Rural China? Journal of School Health, 2020; 90(1): 56-64.
514	https://doi.org/10.1111/josh.12849
515	21. Abizari AR, Buxton C, Kwara L, Mensah-Homiah J, Armar-Klemesu M, Brouwer ID.
516	School feeding contributes to micronutrient adequacy of Ghanaian schoolchildren. Br
517	J Nutr. 2014 Sep 28;112(6):1019-33. doi: 10.1017/S0007114514001585. Epub 2014
518	Jul 3. PMID: 24990068.
519	22. Kwabla, M. P., Gyan, C., & Zotor, F. Nutritional status of in-school children and its
520	associated factors in Denkyembour District, eastern region, Ghana: Comparing
521	schools with feeding and non-school feeding policies. Nutrition Journal. 2018; 17(1).
522	https://doi.org/10.1186/s12937-018-0321-6
523	23. Zenebe, M., Gebremedhin, S., Henry, C. J., & Regassa, N. School feeding program
524	has resulted in improved dietary diversity, nutritional status and class attendance of
525	school children. Italian Journal of Pediatrics. 2018; 44(1).
526	https://doi.org/10.1186/s13052-018-0449-1
527	24. Jacoby E, Cueto S, Pollitt E. Benefits of a school breakfast among Andean children in
528	Huaraz, Peru. Food and Nutrition Bulletin. 1996; 1: 54-64.
529	25. Agarwal DK, Agarwal KN, Upadhyay SK. Effect of mid-day meal programme on
530	physical growth & mental function. Indian Journal of Medical Research. 1989; 90:
531	163-174.
532	
533	TABLE LEGEND
534	Table 1: PICOS criteria for inclusion and exclusion of studies

- 535 Table 2: Search Strategy
- 536 Table 3: Effect estimates on outcomes

537

538 FIGURE LEGEND

- 539 Figure 1: Flow Diagram of Literature Search Process
- 540 Figure 2: Risk of bias graph: review authors' judgements about each risk of bias item presented
- 541 as percentages across all included studies
- 542 Figure 3: Risk of bias summary: review authors' judgements about each risk of bias item for
- 543 each included study.
- Figure 4: Forest plot of school feeding vrs control, RCTs, Outcome: Height-for-age z scores(HAZ)
- Figure 5: Forest plot of school feeding vrs control, RCTs, Outcome: BMI-for-age z scores(BAZ)
- 548 Figure 6: Forest plot of school feeding vrs control, RCTs, Outcome: Weight-for-age z scores
- 549 (WAZ)