Implementation strategies to increase human papillomavirus vaccination uptake for adolescent girls in sub-Saharan Africa: A scoping review protocol

3 Mwansa Ketty Lubeya^{1,2,3}, Mulindi Mwanahamuntu^{1,2}, Carla Chibwesha⁴, Moses Mukosha⁵,

4 Mercy Monde Wamunyima⁶, Mary Kawonga³

5 Affiliations

⁶ ¹Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, School of Medicine, The University of Zambia,

7 Lusaka, Zambia

8 ²Women and Newborn Hospital, University Teaching Hospitals, Lusaka, Zambia

9 ³School of public health, Faculty of Health Sciences, University of the Witwatersrand,

10 Johannesburg, South Africa

⁴Clinical HIV Research Unit, Helen Joseph Hospital, Johannesburg, South Africa

⁵Department of Pharmacy, School of Health Sciences, University of Zambia, Lusaka, Zambia

⁶School of Medicine Library, The University of Zambia, Lusaka, Zambia

14 Corresponding author: Mwansa Ketty Lubeya <u>ketty.lubeya@unza.zm</u>

15 Abstract

16 Introduction: The human papillomavirus (HPV) is sexually transmitted and infects 17 approximately 75% of sexually active people early in their sexual life. Persistent infection with 18 oncogenic HPVtypes can lead to malignant conditions such as cervical cancer. In 2006, the 19 World Health Organisation approved the use of efficacious HPV vaccine for girls aged 9 to 14 20 years to prevent HPV related conditions. Despite the HPV vaccine having been available for 21 completion remains at 53% in sub-Saharan Africa for countries about 15 years, dose 22 implementing the vaccination program. A fraught of barriers to implementation exist which 23 prevent adequate coverage. Achieving success for HPV vaccination in real-world settings 24 requires enacted implementation strategies to overcome implementation bottlenecks. Therefore, 25 a better understanding and mapping of the implementation strategies used in sub-Saharan Africa 26 to increase HPV vaccination uptake is critical. This review aims to identify implementation

strategies to increase HPV vaccination uptake for adolescent girls in sub-Saharan Africa and
provide a basis for policy and future research including systematic reviews to evaluate effective
strategies as we accelerate the elimination of cervical cancer.

30 Materials and Methods: This review will consider studies that pertain to implementation 31 strategies used to increase HPV vaccination uptake for adolescent girls in sub-Saharan Africa. 32 Studies targeted at different stakeholders to increase adolescent vaccine uptake will be included. 33 Studies using interventions not fitting the definition of implementation strategies as defined by 34 the refined compilation of implementation strategies from the Expert Recommendations for 35 Implementing Change project will be excluded. MEDLINE (via PubMed), Embase, CINAHL 36 (via EBSCO), Scopus and Google scholar will be searched. Two independent reviewers will 37 screen titles and abstracts for studies that meet the review's inclusion criteria, and the full text of 38 eligible studies will be reviewed. Data will be extracted from eligible studies using data charting 39 table developed by this team for inclusion by two independent reviewers and presented in table 40 and graphical form with a narrative summary.

41 Keywords

42 cervical cancer elimination; immunisation; adolescent girls; acceptability; vaccine hesitancy,
43 HPV vaccine.

44 Introduction

45 The human papillomavirus (HPV) is sexually transmitted and affects approximately 75% of sexually active people early in their sexual life [1,2]. There are more than 200 species of HPVs 46 47 categorized into low risk (causing warts) and high-risk types (causing cancers) [3]. The point 48 prevalence of HPV infection is estimated at 11-12% globally and 22-24% for sub-Sahara Africa 49 (SSA) [4-7]. HPV infection is mainly asymptomatic and transient, with approximately 90% 50 cleared in immunocompetent people but persists in about 10-20 % [2]. Immunocompromised 51 people, such as those living with HIV, are more likely to have persistent HPV infections, which 52 usually progress more rapidly to pre-cancers and cancers than in the general population [8]. 53 Cancers caused by HPV include the anal-genital and the head and neck regions, with the highest 54 burden in sub-Saharan Africa [5].

In 2006, the World Health Organisation (WHO) approved the use of HPV vaccines for 55 56 prepubertal girls aged 9 to 14 years, naive to sexual intercourse to prevent HPV related 57 conditions [2]. There are currently four licensed HPV vaccines classified as bivalent, 58 quadrivalent and nonavalent based on the number of targeted HPV strains [9]. From 2006 to 59 2014, three doses were recommended to complete the vaccination schedule; however, evolving 60 evidence has shown that two doses are effective, leading WHO to recommend two doses for girls 61 below the age of 15 [10], with ongoing studies showing promise for an efficacious and costeffective single-dose HPV vaccine [11]. The three-dose schedule is now reserved for girls older 62 63 than 15 years or those who are immunocompromised, including those who are HIV positive [9]. The reduced number of doses is envisioned to boost vaccine coverage and reduce barriers to 64 65 vaccination such as multiple visits to the health facility, human resource demand and cost of the 66 vaccine [12-15].

Barriers to HPV vaccination have been identified within sub-Sahara Africa (SSA), and the implementation of national programs remains a challenge at both initiation and sustainability levels [16]. Some of the identified barriers to HPV vaccine uptake include individual, structural, economic and community/social, cultural issues [14,17]. There is a dire need at the global level to increase HPV vaccine uptake with the accelerated global strategy for cervical cancer elimination whose target is to have 90% of girls aged 15 should be fully vaccinated by 2030 [18].

73 The impact of HPV vaccination in reducing HPV related diseases is evident in high-income 74 countries which introduced national immunization programs earlier. For example, a meta-75 analysis of fourteen high-income countries implementing the HPV vaccination program reported 76 a reduction in the prevalence of HPV 16 and 18 by 83% among girls aged 13-19 years and by 77 66% among women aged 20-24 years with significant cross-protection from HPV 31, 33 and 45 78 [19]. Furthermore, emerging data from the UK has shown that ten years after implementing the 79 HPV vaccination to adolescent girls aged 12-13 years, cervical cancer has almost been 80 eliminated [20]. However, many SSA countries are still trailing behind in implementing the 81 national HPV vaccination in a backdrop of low uptake in countries that have already 82 implemented the program despite having the highest HPV related morbidity and mortality 83 [12,21].

3

84 The point of the HPV vaccination programme is to get vaccines to those who need to receive 85 them and mitigate future preventable diseases such as cervical cancer. For interventions such as 86 the HPV vaccination to achieve success (intervention effectiveness) in a real-world setting, they have to be implemented well and in ways that can reach the target groups. This often requires 87 88 implementation strategies that are enacted to overcome any implementation bottlenecks [22]. 89 According to Powel and others, an implementation strategy is defined as "a systematic 90 intervention process to adopt and integrate evidence-based health innovations into usual care" 91 [22]. Therefore, to successfully implement the HPV vaccine and harness the benefits, 92 implementation strategies should be tailored to a real-life situation. For example, a study 93 conducted by Chigbu et al [23] in Nigeria used educational intervention [implementation 94 strategy] to increase HPV vaccine uptake for adolescent girls from 0.9% to 33.2% in a pre and 95 post design method. Another study done in South Africa used multiple implementation strategies 96 such as building a coalition, conducting educational meetings, conducting educational outreach 97 visits, developing educational materials, distributing educational materials, mandate change, 98 obtaining and using consumers feedback and saw adolescent HPV vaccine uptake of up to 87% 99 [24].

100 There is a consensus among researchers that implementation strategies that work in one region 101 may not necessarily work in another; therefore, implementation strategies should be tailored 102 according to the context in which they will be implemented in a real-life context [22]. Therefore, 103 it is urgent to have evidence from SSA, one of the regions with the highest burden of HPV 104 infection and align with the global strategy for elimination of cervical cancer [18]. Therefore, 105 this scoping review aims to identify implementation strategies used in SSA to increase HPV 106 vaccine uptake for adolescent girls. The findings of this review will provide a basis for policy 107 and future research including systematic reviews to understand which implementation strategies are effective in SSA in tandem with the recommendations by the WHO Africa region leadership 108 109 [16].

110 A preliminary review of the literature was conducted in December 2021 in PROSPERO, 111 PubMed, Scopus, Google scholar, JBI evidence synthesis database; no similar scoping review 112 has been done or is underway in the context of SSA. Even though a narrative review was 113 conducted on HPV vaccine in SSA in 2020 focusing on a 10 year period of HPV vaccination

research in Tanzania, a narrative review uses an implicit process to compile evidence hence has weaknesses such as a lack of systematic selection of studies and is likely to reinforce authors' own preconceived ideas and experiences leading to bias [26]. On the other hand, our scoping review will be comprehensive with a clear inclusion and exclusion criteria, and will transparently

118 synthesise the available evidence to minimize similar limitations.

119 **Review question**

120 What implementation strategies have increased the uptake of HPV vaccination for adolescent

121 girls in sub-Saharan Africa?

122 **Objective**

To identify implementation strategies to increase HPV vaccination uptake for adolescent girls in sub-Saharan Africa and provide a basis for future systematic reviews to evaluate effective strategies.

126 Materials and Methods

127 The proposed scoping review will be conducted following the Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI)
128 updated methodology for scoping reviews [27]. This scoping review is registered in Open
129 Science Framework projects-https://osf.io/gfd7s/.

130 Inclusion criteria

131 Participants: Participants will include all stakeholders involved in the cascade of HPV 132 vaccination such as studies on adolescent girls aged 9-14 years as the primary recipients and 133 those aged 15-19 years old who may be eligible for subsequent doses. This scoping review will 134 also include studies that focus on parents/guardians of adolescent girls as they are involved in the 135 consent process for the vaccination of their daughters. Further, studies involving healthcare 136 workers will also be included considering that healthcare providers play a crucial role in 137 recommending and administering the vaccine to eligible. Studies involving teachers and other 138 community leaders will also be considered.

139 **Concept:** We will include studies that used at least one of the implementation strategies as 140 defined by the refined compilation of implementation strategies from the Expert 141 Recommendations for Implementing Change (ERIC) project [28], to increase uptake of HPV 142 vaccination. The ERIC expert panel achieved consensus on 73 discrete implementation 143 strategies, including their definitions [28]. Some examples of these implementations strategies 144 include; i) conduct educational meetings defined as "hold meetings targeted toward different 145 stakeholder groups to teach them about the clinical innovation," ii) build a coalition defined as 146 "recruit and cultivate relationships with parteners in the implementation effort," iii) access new 147 funding defined as "access new or existing money to facilitate the implementation" [25].

Considering that not all interventions may be reported as implementation strategies, we will read through all the studies mentioning interventions to check which ones meet the definitions by the ERIC project and classify them during data charting.Studies including interventions other than those based on the refined compilation of implementation strategies from the ERIC project will be excluded.

153 Context: This review will consider studies done in sub-Saharan Africa aimed at improving the154 uptake of the HPV vaccine among adolescent girls.

155 **Types of sources**

This scoping review will consider experimental and quasi-experimental study designs, including randomized controlled trials, non-randomized controlled trials, before and after studies and interrupted time-series studies. In addition, analytical observational studies including prospective and retrospective cohort studies, case-control studies and analytical cross-sectional studies will be considered for inclusion. We will also consider descriptive observational study designs and qualitative studies. In addition, systematic reviews that meet the inclusion criteria will also be considered, depending on the research question. Text and opinion papers will also be considered.

163 Search strategy

An initial limited search of MEDLINE (PubMed), EMBASE and Scopus was undertaken to identify articles on the topic. The text words contained in the titles and abstracts of relevant articles and the index terms used to describe the articles were used to develop a full search

167 strategy for MEDLINE (PubMed) (S1 Appendix 1). The search strategy will aim to locate both 168 published and unpublished studies. The search strategy, including all identified keywords and 169 index terms, will be adapted for each included database and information source. The reference 170 list of included sources of evidence will be screened for additional studies. The section for 171 similar articles will also be searched on MEDLINE (PubMed).

Studies published in any other language apart from English will not be included as the teams' competence does not go beyond the English language. Studies published starting in 2006 will be included as this was when WHO approved the use of the HPV vaccine among prepubertal girls, the search will include studies published until December 31st 2021.

The databases to be searched include MEDLINE (via PubMed), EMBASE, CINAHL (Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature) (EBSCO) and Scopus. Grey literature citations (unpublished, nonpeer review data sources including conference proceedings, abstracts and dissertations) indexed by any of the databases searched will be reviewed with other peer-reviewed publications using the same inclusion and exclusion criteria. Further, the first 50 hits from the Google scholar search engine will be reviewed for possible inclusion. A medical librarian/ information specialist will guide the search.

183 Following the search, all identified studies will be collated and uploaded into Endnote X9 184 (Clarivate Analytics, USA) and duplicates removed after which they will be imported into the 185 Joanna Briggs Institute System for the Unified Management, Assessment and Review of 186 Information (JBI SUMARI) [29]. Two independent reviewers will screen titles and abstracts for 187 assessment against the inclusion criteria for the review and potentially relevant studies will be 188 retrieved in full and their citation details in JBI SUMARI. The full text of selected citations will 189 be assessed in detail against the inclusion criteria by two independent reviewers. The scoping 190 review will record and report reasons for the exclusion of full-text studies that do not meet the 191 inclusion criteria. Any disagreements that arise between the reviewers at each stage of the study 192 selection process will be resolved through discussion or with a third reviewer if consensus is not reached. The search is planned to start on 31st May 2022. The search results will be reported in 193 194 full in the final scoping review and presented in a Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic 195 Reviews and Meta-analyses extension for scoping reviews (PRISMA-ScR) flow diagram [30].

196

197

198 **Data extraction**

199 Data will be extracted from papers included in the scoping review by two independent reviewers 200 using a data extraction chart developed by the reviewers (SI 2 Appendix II). The data extracted 201 will include; first author, year of study, year of publication, country, the title of the article, article 202 type, study design (where applicable), sample size, implementation strategy(ies), targeted 203 stakeholders, type of program (national program/demonstration/subpopulation, funding source, 204 HPV vaccine coverage/uptake, limitations and strengths. The draft extraction chart will be 205 piloted on 5 included pieces of evidence and revisions made if necessary. The draft data 206 extraction tool will further be modified and revised as necessary during the process of data 207 charting from each included evidence source. Modifications will be detailed in the scoping 208 review. Authors of papers will be contacted to request missing or additional data, where 209 required, if no response will be received within two weeks, available data will be used in the best 210 possible way.

211 Data presentation

The scoping review reporting will align with the PRISMA-ScR [30]. The extracted data will be presented in table or graphical form to align with the study objectives. These will be accompanied by a narrative summary of how the findings relate to the research question and objectives.

216 Patient and public involvement statement

217 Patients and the public were not involved in the design of this study.

218 **Discussion**

- 219 A narrative summary of findings will be provided and discussed.
- 220 Limitations

This scoping review will only focus on studies done in English hence may miss other important research done in other languages. Further, only implementation strategies focusing on uptake of the vaccine for girls will be considered, yet there could be other unique and successful interventions used to increase HPV vaccine uptake among boys. However, these maybe few as most countries in SSA are currently implementing girls only programmes.

226 **Ethics and Dissemination plans**

- 227 Ethical approval is not applicable since no primary data will be collected. Dissemination of
- results will be through publications, conferences and stakeholder meetings. In case of any
- amendments to the protocol following its publication, amendments and rationale will be
- 230 described in future publications arising from this protocol.

Author contributions: MKL: Conceptualised and drafted the initial manuscript, MMW & conducted the pilot search in Pubmed, all authors revised subsequent manuscript drafts and approved the final draft for publication.

234 Acknowledgements

- 235 We would like to acknowledge the support from the University of Zambia-University of North
- 236 Carolina at ChapelHill and Witwatersrand University consortium PhD fellowship program.

237 **References**

- Loke AY, Kwan ML, Wong YT, Wong AKY The Uptake of Human Papillomavirus
 Vaccination and Its Associated Factors Among Adolescents: A Systematic Review. J prim care
 community health. 2017;8(4):349-62.
- 241 2. World Health Organization. (2009). Weekly Epidemiological Record, 2009, vol. 84, 22 [full
 242 issue]. Weekly Epidemiological Record = Relevé épidémiologique hebdomadaire, 84 (22), 197 –
 243 212. Accessed from: https://apps.who.int/iris/handle/10665/241342
- 3. Schiffman M, Doorbar J, Wentzensen N, de Sanjosé S, Fakhry C, Monk BJ, et al.
 Carcinogenic human papillomavirus infection. Nat Rev Dis Primers. 2016;2:16086.
- 4. Forman D, de Martel C, Lacey CJ, Soerjomataram I, Lortet-Tieulent J, Bruni L, et al. Global
 burden of human papillomavirus and related diseases. Vaccine. 2012;30 Suppl 5:F12-23.

5. De Vuyst H, Alemany L, Lacey C, Chibwesha CJ, Sahasrabuddhe V, Banura C, et al. The

- burden of human papillomavirus infections and related diseases in sub-Saharan Africa. Vaccine.
 2013;31 Suppl 5(0 5):F32-46.
- 6. Bruni L, Diaz M, Castellsagué M, Ferrer E, Bosch FX, de Sanjosé S. Cervical Human
 Papillomavirus Prevalence in 5 Continents: Meta-Analysis of 1 Million Women with Normal
 Cytological Findings. The Journal of Infectious Diseases. 2010;202(12):1789-99.
- 7. De Sanjosé S, Diaz M, Castellsagué X, Clifford G, Bruni L, Muñoz N, et al. Worldwide
 prevalence and genotype distribution of cervical human papillomavirus DNA in women with
 normal cytology: a meta-analysis. The Lancet Infectious Diseases. 2007;7(7):453-9.
- 8. Kelly H, Weiss HA, Benavente Y, de Sanjose S, Mayaud P. Association of antiretroviral
 therapy with high-risk human papillomavirus, cervical intraepithelial neoplasia, and invasive
 cervical cancer in women living with HIV: a systematic review and meta-analysis. The Lancet
 HIV. 2018;5(1):e45-e58.
- 9. World Health Organization (WHO). Human papillomavirus vaccines: WHO position paper,
 October 2014. Wkly Epidemiol Rec. 2014;89(43):465–92 [cited on 2020 July 10] Available
 from: http://www.who.int/wer/2014/wer8943.pdf
- 10. World Health Organization. Evidence-based recommendations on Human Papilloma Virus
 (HPV) vaccines schedules: Background paper for SAGE discussions. March 11, 2014.[cited on
 2020July10]Available
- https://www.who.int/immunization/sage/meetings/2014/april/1_HPV_Evidence_based_recomme
 ndationsWHO_with_Appendices2_3.pdf
- 11. Burger EA, Campos NG, Sy S, Regan C, Kim JJ. Health and economic benefits of singledose HPV vaccination in a Gavi-eligible country. Vaccine. 2018;36(32, Part A):4823-9.
- 12. Kisaakye E, Namakula J, Kihembo C, Kisakye A, Nsubuga P, Babirye JN. Level and factors
 associated with uptake of human papillomavirus infection vaccine among female adolescents in
 Lira District, Uganda. The Pan African medical journal. 2018;31:184.
- 13. Pugliese-Garcia M, Heyerdahl LW, Mwamba C, Nkwemu S, Chilengi R, Demolis R, et al.
 Factors influencing vaccine acceptance and hesitancy in three informal settlements in Lusaka,
 Zambia. Vaccine. 2018;36(37):5617-24.
- 14. Wigle J, Coast E, Watson-Jones D. Human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccine implementation in
 low and middle-income countries (LMICs): health system experiences and prospects. Vaccine.
 2013;31(37):3811-7.
- 280 15. Sankaranarayanan R, Anorlu R, Sangwa-Lugoma G, Denny LA. Infrastructure Requirements
- 281 for Human Papillomavirus Vaccination and Cervical Cancer Screening in Sub-Saharan Africa.
- 282 Vaccine. 2013;31:F47-F52.
- 16. Framework for the implementation of the global strategy to accelerate the elimination ofcervical cancer as a public health problem in the who african region. 2021 Report AFR/RC71/9

285 [cited on 2022 April 7] Available from: https://www.afro.who.int/about-286 us/governance/sessions/seventy-first-session-who-regional-committee-africa

17. World Health Organization global strategy to accelerate the elimination of cervical cancer as
a public health problem. 2020. Report No.: ISBN 978-92-4-001410-7.[cited on 2021 March 17]
Available from: https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240014107

- 18. Drolet M, Bénard É, Pérez N, Brisson M. Population-level impact and herd effects following
 the introduction of human papillomavirus vaccination programmes: updated systematic review
 and meta-analysis. Lancet (London, England). 2019;394(10197):497-509.
- 19. Falcaro M, Castañon A, Ndlela B, Checchi M, Soldan K, Lopez-Bernal J, et al. The effects of
 the national HPV vaccination programme in England, UK, on cervical cancer and grade 3
 cervical intraepithelial neoplasia incidence: a register-based observational study. The Lancet.
 2021;398(10316):2084-92.
- 20. Dorji T, Nopsopon T, Tamang ST, Pongpirul K. Human papillomavirus vaccination uptake
 in low-and middle-income countries: a meta-analysis. EClinical medicine. 2021;34:100836.
- 21. Rujumba J, Akugizibwe M, Basta NE, Banura C. Why don't adolescent girls in a rural
 Uganda district initiate or complete routine 2-dose HPV vaccine series: Perspectives of
 adolescent girls, their caregivers, healthcare workers, community health workers and teachers.
 PloS one. 2021;16(6):e0253735.
- 22. Powell BJ, McMillen JC, Proctor EK, Carpenter CR, Griffey RT, Bunger AC, et al. A
 compilation of strategies for implementing clinical innovations in health and mental health. Med
 Care Res Rev. 2012;69(2):123-57.
- 23. Chigbu CO, Onyebuchi AK, Onyeka TC, Odugu BU, Dim CC. The impact of community
 health educators on uptake of cervical and breast cancer prevention services in Nigeria. Int J
 Gynaecol Obstet. 2017 Jun;137(3):319-324. doi: 10.1002/ijgo.12150. Epub 2017 Mar 31. PMID:
 28295268.
- 24. Delany-Moretlwe S, Kelley KF, James S, Scorgie F, Subedar H, Dlamini NR, Pillay Y,
 Naidoo N, Chikandiwa A, Rees H. Human Papillomavirus Vaccine Introduction in South Africa:
 Implementation Lessons From an Evaluation of the National School-Based Vaccination
 Campaign. Glob Health Sci Pract. 2018 Oct 4;6(3):425-438. doi: 10.9745/GHSP-D-18-00090.
 PMID: 30143561; PMCID: PMC6172125.
- 25. Whitworth H, Changalucha J, Baisley K, Watson-Jones D. Adolescent Health Series: HPV
 infection and vaccination in sub-Saharan Africa: 10 years of research in Tanzanian female
 adolescents narrative review. Trop Med Int Health. 2021 Nov;26(11):1345-1355. doi:
 10.1111/tmi.13660. Epub 2021 Sep 1. PMID: 34310816.
- 319 26. Garg AX, Hackam D, Tonelli M. Systematic review and meta-analysis: when one study is
 320 just not enough. Clin J Am Soc Nephrol. 2008 Jan;3(1):253-60. doi: 10.2215/CJN.01430307.
 321 PMID: 18178786.

27. Peters MDJ, Marnie C, Tricco AC, Pollock D, Munn Z, Alexander L, et al. Updated
methodological guidance for the conduct of scoping reviews. JBI Evidence Synthesis.
2020;18(10):2119-26.

28. Powell BJ, Waltz TJ, Chinman MJ, Damschroder LJ, Smith JL, Matthieu MM, et al. A
 refined compilation of implementation strategies: results from the Expert Recommendations for
 Implementing Change (ERIC) project. Implementation Science. 2015;10(1):21.

328 29. Munn Z, Aromataris E, Tufanaru C, Stern C, Porritt K, Farrow J, et al. The development of

329 software to support multiple systematic review types: the Joanna Briggs Institute System for the

330 Unified Management, Assessment and Review of Information (JBI SUMARI). Int J Evid Based

331 Healthc. 2019 Mar;17(1):36-43. doi: 10.1097/XEB.00000000000152. PMID: 30239357.

332 30. Tricco AC, Lillie E, Zarin W, O'Brien KK, Colquhoun H, Levac D, et al. PRISMA

333 Extension for Scoping Reviews (PRISMA-ScR): Checklist and Explanation. Ann Intern Med.

334 2018;169(7):467-73.

335

336