

Reasons underlying the intention to vaccinate children aged 5-11 against COVID-19: A cross-sectional study of parents in Israel, November 2021

Authors:

Nicole G. Morozov¹, Amiel A. Dror^{2,3*}, Amani Daoud^{2,3}; Netanel Eisenbach^{2,3}; Edward Kaykov^{3,4}; Masad Barhoum^{3,5}; Tsvi Sheleg^{3,5}; Michael Edelstein³

*Morozov and Dror are equal first authors

¹Tel Aviv University, Tel Aviv, Israel

²Department of Otolaryngology, Head and Neck Surgery, Galilee Medical Center, Nahariya, Israel

³The Azrieli Faculty of Medicine, Bar-Ilan University, Safed, Israel

⁴Geriatric Medicine Department, Galilee Medical Center, Nahariya, Israel

⁵Galilee Medical Center, Nahariya, Israel

*Corresponding author: Amiel A. Dror, Department of Otolaryngology, Head and Neck Surgery, Galilee Medical Center, Nahariya, Israel; Azrieli Faculty of Medicine, Bar-Ilan University, Safed, Israel Tel: +972544530534; email: amieldror@gmail.com

Abstract

Background

Vaccination is a key tool to mitigate the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. In Israel, COVID-19 vaccines became available to adults in December 2020 and to 5–11-year-old children in November 2021. Ahead of the vaccine roll-out in children, we aimed to determine whether parents intended to vaccinate their children and describe reasons for their intentions.

Methods

We recruited parents on social media and collected information on parental socio-demographic characteristics, COVID-19 vaccine history, intention to vaccinate their children against COVID-19, and reasons for parental decisions, using an anonymous online survey. We identified associations between parental characteristics and intention to vaccinate children using a logistic regression model and described reasons for intentions to vaccinate or not using proportions together with 95% confidence intervals (CI).

Results

1837 parents participated. Parental non-vaccination and having experienced major vaccination side effects were strongly associated with non-intention to vaccinate their children (OR 0.09 and 0.18 respectively, $p < 0.001$). Compared with others, parents who were younger, lived in the socio-economically deprived periphery, and belonged to the Arab population had lower intentions to vaccinate their children. Commonly stated reasons for non-intention to vaccinate included vaccine safety and efficacy (53%, 95%CI 50-56) and the belief that COVID-19 was a

mild disease (73%, 95%CI 73-79). The most frequently mentioned motives for intending to vaccine children was returning to normal social and educational life (89%, 95%CI 87-91).

Conclusion

Parental socio-demographic background and their own vaccination experience was associated with intention to vaccinate their children aged 5-11. Intention to vaccinate was mainly for social and economic reasons rather than health, whereas non-intention to vaccinate mainly stemmed from health concerns. Understanding rationales for COVID-19 vaccine rejection or acceptance, as well as parental demographic data, can pave the way for intentional educational campaigns to encourage not only vaccination against COVID-19, but also regular childhood vaccine programming.

Keywords: COVID-19; vaccine hesitancy; childhood vaccines; parental vaccine hesitancy

Highlights

- Parental intention to vaccinate 5-11 children is much lower than vaccine coverage in parental age groups
- Being unvaccinated and having experienced side effects following vaccination were the greatest negative predictors in parents of intention to vaccinate their children
- Parents were more likely to accept a COVID-19 vaccine for their children to allow them to return to daily social life and to ensure economic security in the family
- Parents were more likely to reject a COVID-19 vaccination for health reasons such as safety concerns or due the belief that COVID-19 was a mild disease in children

Introduction

The rapid, global spread of COVID-19, an infection caused by the SARS-CoV-2 virus, spurred the expeditious development of several vaccines and the eventual implementation of vaccine programs at record speeds. In Israel, COVID-19 vaccines became available in December 2020 for adults and eligibility gradually extended to younger ages. Teenagers aged 12-15 became eligible in June 2021 and children aged 5-11 in November 2021. Most high-income countries now offer teenage vaccination, but vaccination of younger children is less common despite evidence of its safety and effectiveness [1]. Outside of Israel, the United States' (USA) Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) recommends vaccination in the 5-11 age group while the European Centre for Disease prevention and Control has also recommended considering universal vaccination in this demographic [2, 3].

The short period between the pandemic's onset and vaccine availability has added additional challenges for vaccine acceptance among the public [4]. Almost two years after the onset of the pandemic and one year after the first administration of COVID-19 vaccines in adults, the USA's Food and Drug Administration (FDA) approved the Pfizer/BioNTech mRNA vaccine for 5- to 11-year-old children [1, 5]. Studies conducted in the UK, USA, and Canada suggest that many parents remain concerned about the vaccine's side effects and safety, leading parents to be hesitant to administer the COVID-19 vaccine to their children [6-8]. Research has not yet examined the reasons why parents would be motivated or hesitant to vaccinate their children in Israel.

Demographic criteria which have been associated with higher rates of vaccine refusal for children include younger parental age, non-white or minority ethnicity, lower education level, history of vaccination non-compliance to recommended childhood vaccinations, and lower income [7, 9-11]. Parents concerned about future finances were more likely to accept a vaccination for their offspring [11]. Attitudes and behaviors towards vaccination also tend to be specific to the vaccine in question and to each country [12]. Compared with most high-income countries, Israel typically achieves high coverage for routine childhood vaccines. The 2020 national coverage for the first MMR dose among 24-month-olds was 99% in Israel vs 91% in the United States and in the UK [13]. In addition, Israel's largest ethnic minority typically achieves higher coverage for routine childhood vaccines compared with the general population [14]. It is, therefore, important to understand and document attitudes to COVID-19 vaccination in different contexts due to the implications for public health interventions.

We aimed to investigate the intentions of parents in Israel to vaccinate their 5-11-year-old children against COVID-19 and the underlying reasons for their intentions. We sought to determine what common reasons parents listed for accepting or rejecting vaccinating their children. Our survey was initiated two weeks before children in this age group became eligible for COVID-19 vaccination.

Methods

Study design

This study was designed as a cross sectional survey to understand the general populations' willingness to vaccinate their children against COVID-19 and the reasons for their acceptance or refusal of the vaccine using an online questionnaire in Hebrew and Arabic and distributed through social media channels (Facebook and Twitter). Informed consent was requested on the introductory page of the online questionnaire, prior to survey enrollment. The anonymous web-based survey followed the American Association for Public Opinion Research (AAPOR) reporting guidelines [15]. The survey was anonymous and no identifiable information was collected. Participants were permitted to terminate participation at will. Approval of this study was granted by the Research Ethics Committee of the Galilee Medical Center. The questionnaire was designed and distributed using Qualtrics (Qualtrics, Provo, UT, United States of America).

Data collection

The survey had two sections: The first part included nine questions about socio-demographic characteristics of the participating parents including parental age, gender, area of residence, household composition, number of children, ethnicity, parental education, parental COVID-19 vaccination status, and self-reported side effects from the vaccine (major, mild, or no symptoms), and one question on intention to vaccinate their child(ren) against COVID-19.

In the second section, responders who indicated they were not intending to vaccinate their children against COVID-19 were asked to state their reasons from a list of predefined explanations, and those who indicated intention to vaccinate were also asked to affirm why from a list of potential reasons. A free text answer was also provided.

139
140 The full questionnaire is available in Appendix 1. The estimated answering time for completing
141 the survey was under two minutes.

142
143 **Statistical analysis**
144
145 We calculated the proportion of parents intending to vaccinate their children together with 95%
146 confidence intervals, overall and in each stratum. We compared parents who intended to
147 vaccinate their children to those who did not in terms of all socio-demographic factors recorded
148 in the questionnaire using a univariate logistic regression model. In order to determine the extent
149 to which each factor was an independent predictor, we conducted a multivariate logistic
150 regression analysis adjusting for all other factors found to be statistically significant (at the
151 $\alpha=0.05$ level) in the univariate analysis. We also calculated the proportion of parents giving
152 each reason for intending or not intending to vaccinate together with 95% confidence intervals.

153
154 Data were prepared using Microsoft Excel and analyzed using STATA 15.

155 156 **Results**

157
158 We received 1837 responses to our survey between November 1-14, 2021. Of those, 1514
159 (82.4%) completed the survey in its entirety. The distribution of responders according to age,
160 sex, ethnicity, education level, and other demographic criteria is described in Table 1. Overall
161 intention to vaccinate was 44% (95% CI 41.3-45.9).

Female parents and parents above the age of 35 were more likely to vaccinate than male parents and parents aged 35 and younger (47% vs. 40%, $p<0.002$; 45% vs. 39%, $p<0.02$, Table 1). Compared with non-Arab Israeli parents, Israeli Arab parents reported a lower intention to vaccinate their children (34% vs. 47%, $p<0.001$, Table 1). Other parental factors significantly associated with a lower intention to vaccinate included having a single child, living in the periphery (Northern or Southern, socioeconomically depressed regions of the country), having received fewer than three doses of a COVID-19 vaccine and having experienced major side effects of COVID-19 vaccination. After adjusting for other factors, being male, living in the periphery, belonging to the Arab population, reception of fewer than three doses of the COVID-19 vaccine and having experienced major side effects following COVID-19 vaccination all remained significantly associated with a lower intention to vaccinate children (Table 1). Being completely unvaccinated and having suffered major side effects were associated with the largest reduction in intention to vaccinate children (-91% and -81% respectively, $p<0.001$).

Of 801 parents intending to vaccinate their children, 93% were COVID-19 vaccinated at least once. Intention to vaccinate their children increased with the number of doses the parents had received; while only 13% of unvaccinated parents intended to vaccinate their children against COVID-19, 32% of parents vaccinated with one dose, 48% of parents vaccinated with two doses, and 62% of parents vaccinated with three doses were willing to vaccinate their children ($p<0.001$, Table 1).

The most often cited reason for choosing to vaccinate their children was to allow their children to return to everyday social, educational, and financial life, followed by protecting other family members from COVID-19 infection (89 and 77.9% respectively, Table 2). The protection of the children against viral COVID-19 infection followed by vaccine safety were the least often mentioned explanations for parents who intended to vaccinate their children (37.9%).

The most frequently mentioned explanation for not vaccinating their children is the belief that COVID-19 leads to mild or asymptomatic disease in children (76.1%, Table 2). Concerns of the parents regarding vaccine safety were ordered second in their consideration not to vaccinate their children (53.1%, Table 2).

Discussion

Routine childhood vaccination offers the prospect of protection against a transmissible and infectious, but preventable, threat to health. In most settings, there is no ongoing endemic transmission of poliovirus, measles, or diphtheria infections due to effective global vaccination campaigns [16-18]. However, COVID-19 is unique in several ways: first, the pandemic is continuing to develop and therefore vaccine protection is against an immediate and tangible threat; second, the COVID-19 pandemic is the only instance in recent history that a mass vaccination campaign concurrently targets children and their parents for initiating vaccination; third, the volume and availability of information around COVID-19 vaccines, offering arguments both for and against vaccination with very few verification pathways for parents to assess the accuracy of the information they are accessing, is an unprecedented phenomenon; fourth, the speed

at which COVID-19 vaccines were developed have raised some concerns about safety among the general public [19, 20]

We found that the intention to vaccinate children aged 5-11 was low, overall. Less than half of parents intended to vaccinate their 5-11 children, and as of February 2022 just over 20% had vaccinated their offspring[21]. Even among parents who had received three doses of the vaccine, intention to vaccinate was only 62%. This is consistent with experience from other countries where vaccinated parents did not intend to vaccination their children [22]. Parental experience was clearly a key factor in the decision, with unvaccinated parents and those who experienced perceived severe side effects very unlikely to vaccinate their children. Parents with higher education were not more likely to vaccinate than others.

Our study has highlighted that the main reasons for intending to vaccinate their children were not biomedical. Our study suggests that, for COVID-19, the traditional perception of vaccination benefits such as protection against illness and abolishing the spread of infection has been superseded by indirect benefits such as returning to regular societal life and education institutions, as well as assuring financial resilience for the family. While this finding is not surprising considering the severe disruption to normal life caused by the COVID-19 pandemic, it is not clear whether this perception of the societal utility of vaccines will continue to impact the perception of other vaccines beyond the pandemic.

Groups who may be targets for intersectional outreach include minorities, parents with a lower educational level, and families in lower financial brackets as these parents have been highlighted

as more likely to be vaccine hesitant [10, 23]. Our research found that Arab parents were less likely to vaccinate their children as compared to other parents, consistent with research finding a higher rate of COVID-19 vaccine hesitancy among minority communities in other countries, as well as in Israel's Arab and Ultra-Orthodox communities [7, 24, 25].

Our study has identified that key factors within Israeli society associated with an increased intention to vaccinate children against COVID-19 include the parent's desire for the child to return to normal social and educational life along with secondary motives such as the parent's desire to maintain job security. The main drivers against intention to vaccinate are much more biomedical, encompassing beliefs that COVID-19 causes a mild disease course in children and concerns about vaccine safety. These findings have implications for health promotion and communication campaigns; ensuring parents' confidence in the safety of the vaccine and highlighting the sociocultural benefits of vaccination may be key in guiding communities to higher levels of vaccine uptake.

Limitations of our investigation include the self-selection of participants in answering the questionnaire and the participants' self-identification of socio-demographic characteristics. Potentially, individuals who have stronger opinions either for or against vaccinating their children for COVID-19 may be more likely to complete a questionnaire about the topic. It must be noted that the age, sex, and geographical distribution of participants suggest that all segments of the population were represented.

It is not clear to what extent our findings are generalizable to other countries. Globally, there are wide discrepancies in vaccine uptake from one country to another with some countries enjoying remarkably low levels of vaccine hesitancy among parents [9, 11]. Understanding what factors enable childhood COVID-19 vaccination in countries with high parental intent and transferring this knowledge to other contexts could help countries struggling with COVID-19 childhood vaccination programs. Because a growing number of individuals, including parents, are seeking health and vaccine information online or through peers, the availability of trustworthy sources and early educational campaigns cannot be overstated [26].

Conclusion

The availability of COVID-19 vaccines and licensing of these vaccinations for use in children aged five to 11 is not a guarantee that parents will inoculate their children. Our study showed that intention to vaccinate 5- to 11-year-old children was low even among fully vaccinated parents, with socio-cultural factors, as well as vaccination experience in parents, being associated with intention to vaccinate their children. Our study showed that indirect benefits of vaccination such as returning to regular societal activities, including educational institutions and personal economic stability, were bigger motivators than direct protection against the virus, while the most common reasons for intending not to vaccinate children against COVID-19 were classical biomedical concerns such disease severity and vaccine safety. These findings are important for health authorities to shape educational and communication campaigns: focusing on the message that vaccines protect against COVID-19 may not be as effective as messages stating that

vaccines will allow children to go to school and adults to work. Different messaging campaigns should be implemented and evaluated to test this possibility.

Conflicts of interest: The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Attestation: All authors attest they meet the ICMJE criteria for authorship

Citations

1. Walter EB, Talaat KR, Sabharwal C, Gurtman A, Lockhart S, Paulsen GC, et al. Evaluation of the BNT162b2 Covid-19 Vaccine in Children 5 to 11 Years of Age. New England Journal of Medicine. 2021.10.1056/NEJMoa2116298
2. CDC. COVID-19 Vaccination for Children 5-11 Years Old [Internet]. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. 2022 [cited 2022 Feb 19]. Available from: <https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/covid-19/planning/children.html>
3. Interim public health considerations for COVID-19 vaccination of children aged 5-11 years [Internet]. European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. 2021 [cited 2022 Feb 19]. Available from: <https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/interim-public-health-considerations-covid-19-vaccination-children-aged-5-1>
4. Soares P, Rocha JV, Moniz M, Gama A, Laires PA, Pedro AR, et al. Factors Associated with COVID-19 Vaccine Hesitancy. 2021;9(3):300
5. Woodworth KR, Moulia D, Collins JP, Hadler SC, Jones JM, Reddy SC, et al. The Advisory Committee on Immunization Practices' Interim Recommendation for Use of Pfizer-

297 BioNTech COVID-19 Vaccine in Children Aged 5-11 Years - United States, November 2021.
 298 MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep. 2021;70(45):1579-83.10.15585/mmwr.mm7045e1

299 6. Ruggiero KM, Wong J, Sweeney CF, Avola A, Auger A, Macaluso M, et al. Parents'
 300 Intentions to Vaccinate Their Children Against COVID-19. Journal of Pediatric Health Care.
 301 2021;35(5):509-17.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pedhc.2021.04.005>

302 7. Bell S, Clarke R, Mounier-Jack S, Walker JL, Paterson P. Parents' and guardians' views
 303 on the acceptability of a future COVID-19 vaccine: A multi-methods study in England. Vaccine.
 304 2020;38(49):7789-98.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2020.10.027>

305 8. Humble RM, Sell H, Dubé E, MacDonald NE, Robinson J, Driedger SM, et al. Canadian
 306 parents' perceptions of COVID-19 vaccination and intention to vaccinate their children: Results
 307 from a cross-sectional national survey. Vaccine. 2021;39(52):7669-
 308 76.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2021.10.002>

309 9. Bagateli LE, Saeki EY, Fadda M, Agostoni C, Marchisio P, Milani GP. COVID-19
 310 Vaccine Hesitancy among Parents of Children and Adolescents Living in Brazil. Vaccines.
 311 2021;9(10).10.3390/vaccines9101115

312 10. McKinnon B, Quach C, Dubé È, Tuong Nguyen C, Zinszer K. Social inequalities in
 313 COVID-19 vaccine acceptance and uptake for children and adolescents in Montreal, Canada.
 314 Vaccine. 2021;39(49):7140-5.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2021.10.077>

315 11. Goldman RD, Krupik D, Ali S, Mater A, Hall JE, Bone JN, et al. Caregiver Willingness
 316 to Vaccinate Their Children against COVID-19 after Adult Vaccine Approval. International
 317 Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health. 2021;18(19).10.3390/ijerph181910224

- 318 12. Larson HJ, de Figueiredo A, Xiaohong Z, Schulz WS, Verger P, Johnston IG, et al. The
319 State of Vaccine Confidence 2016: Global Insights Through a 67-Country Survey.
320 EBioMedicine. 2016;12:295-301.10.1016/j.ebiom.2016.08.042
- 321 13. Measles vaccination coverage [Internet]. World Health Organization Available from:
322 <https://immunizationdata.who.int/pages/coverage/mcv.html?CODE=ISR+GBR+USA&ANTIGE>
323 [N=MCV1&YEAR=.](https://immunizationdata.who.int/pages/coverage/mcv.html?CODE=ISR+GBR+USA&ANTIGE)
- 324 14. Stein-Zamir C, Israeli A. Timeliness and completeness of routine childhood vaccinations
325 in young children residing in a district with recurrent vaccine-preventable disease outbreaks,
326 Jerusalem, Israel. Euro surveillance : bulletin Europeen sur les maladies transmissibles =
327 European communicable disease bulletin. 2019;24(6).10.2807/1560-7917.Es.2019.24.6.1800004
- 328 15. Transparency Initiative Disclosure Elements. American Association for Public Opinion
329 Research; 2021
- 330 16. Obregón R, Chitnis K, Morry C, Feek W, Bates J, Galway M, et al. Achieving polio
331 eradication: a review of health communication evidence and lessons learned in India and
332 Pakistan. Bulletin of the World Health Organization. 2009;87(8):624-30.10.2471/blt.08.060863
- 333 17. Clarke KEN, MacNeil A, Hadler S, Scott C, Tiwari TSP, Cherian T. Global
334 Epidemiology of Diphtheria, 2000-2017(1). Emerging infectious diseases. 2019;25(10):1834-
335 42.10.3201/eid2510.190271
- 336 18. Holzmann H, Hengel H, Tenbusch M, Doerr HW. Eradication of measles: remaining
337 challenges. Medical microbiology and immunology. 2016;205(3):201-8.10.1007/s00430-016-
338 0451-4
- 339 19. The Lancet Infectious D. The COVID-19 infodemic. The Lancet Infectious diseases.
340 2020;20(8):875.10.1016/s1473-3099(20)30565-x

- 341 20. Salerno L, Craxì L, Amodio E, Lo Coco G. Factors Affecting Hesitancy to mRNA and
342 Viral Vector COVID-19 Vaccines among College Students in Italy. *Vaccines*.
343 2021;9(8):10.3390/vaccines9080927
- 344 21. Health IMo. Coronavirus in Israel - general situation 2022. p.
345 <https://datadashboard.health.gov.il/COVID-19/general>
- 346 22. Horiuchi S, Sakamoto H, Abe SK, Shinohara R, Kushima M, Otawa S, et al. Factors of
347 parental COVID-19 vaccine hesitancy: A cross sectional study in Japan. *PloS one*.
348 2021;16(12):e0261121.10.1371/journal.pone.0261121
- 349 23. Alfieri NL, Kusma JD, Heard-Garris N, Davis MM, Golbeck E, Barrera L, et al. Parental
350 COVID-19 vaccine hesitancy for children: vulnerability in an urban hotspot. *BMC Public*
351 *Health*. 2021;21(1):1662.10.1186/s12889-021-11725-5
- 352 24. Robinson E, Jones A, Lesser I, Daly M. International estimates of intended uptake and
353 refusal of COVID-19 vaccines: A rapid systematic review and meta-analysis of large nationally
354 representative samples. *Vaccine*. 2021;39(15):2024-
355 34.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2021.02.005>
- 356 25. Gorelik Y, Anis E, Edelstein M. Inequalities in initiation of COVID19 vaccination by age
357 and population group in Israel- December 2020-July 2021. *The Lancet regional health Europe*.
358 2022;12:100234.10.1016/j.lanepe.2021.100234
- 359 26. Rhodes ME, Sundstrom B, Ritter E, McKeever BW, McKeever R. Preparing for A
360 COVID-19 Vaccine: A Mixed Methods Study of Vaccine Hesitant Parents. *Journal of Health*
361 *Communication*. 2020;25(10):831-7.10.1080/10810730.2021.1871986
- 362
- 363

