

My family sold a cow to pay for my Traditional doctor and now there's no money to travel to the HIV clinic: barriers to antiretroviral adherence among rural-Indigenous peoples living with HIV in the Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé, Panamá

Short title:

ART adherence in a rural-Indigenous region of Panama

Amanda Gabster ^{1,2*}	¹ Instituto Conmemorativo Gorgas de Estudios de la Salud, Panamá ² London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, UK agabster@gorgas.gob.pa / Amanda.gabster@lshtm.ac.uk
Eliana Socha ³	³ Community Development Network of the Americas, Panamá
Juan Miguel Pascale ^{1,3}	¹ Instituto Conmemorativo Gorgas de Estudios de la Salud, Panamá ³ Universidad de Panamá, Facultad de Medicina
Gonzalo Cabezas Talavero ³	³ Community Development Network of the Americas, Panamá
Alezander Castrellón ³	³ Community Development Network of the Americas, Panamá
Yaremis Quiel ⁴	⁴ Ministerio de Salud, Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé, Panamá
César Gantes ⁴	⁴ Ministerio de Salud, Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé, Panamá
Philippe Mayaud ²	² London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, UK

*Corresponding author

WC: 3406

Keywords: ART adherence, retention in HIV care, Indigenous peoples, Latin America

Abstract:

Introduction: The Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé (CNB) is an administratively autonomous Indigenous region in Western Panama that is home to over 200,000 individuals of Ngäbe and Buglé ethnicities. The CNB is the most impoverished region in Panama and is relatively isolated from outside influences, with limited roads, electricity, and internet connection. Around 1.5% of all rapid HIV tests are positive, compared to a national prevalence of 0.9%; in CNB, diagnosis tends to be late where 56.3% of individuals had an initial CD4 count of <350 cells/mm³. In this region, antiretroviral treatment (ART) dropout is five times higher than the national average; there is high early mortality due to opportunistic infections. This study aims to describe some of the barriers associated with ART adherence and retention in HIV care among PLHIV the CNB. A better understanding of factors that obstruct adherence could lead to more effective HIV care and prevention in CNB.

Methods: We conducted 21 semi-structured interviews with PLHIV who reside across all three regions of the CNB and who have attended an ART clinic at least once. The interviews took place between November 2018 and December 2019.

Discussion: Psychological health and social support and discrimination acted as both individual-level facilitators and barriers to adherence and retention. Notably, structural barriers included difficult access to ART care due to travel costs, ART shortages, and uncooperative Western/Traditional medical systems. Recommended interventions used in other Low- and Middle-Income settings include increasing peer and family-level support and community knowledge and understanding of HIV infection. Additionally, we suggest structural interventions, including decreasing cost and distance of travel to the ART clinic through decentralization of services and multi-month dispensing, decreasing food scarcity, and increasing collaboration between Western and Traditional providers.

Introduction

The Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé (CNB) is a politically semi-autonomous region in Western Panama, home to over 200,000 people of Ngäbe and Buglé ethnicities, making up 5.4% of the total Panamanian population (1). This Comarca has the highest levels of poverty (defined as <\$1.90/day) and extreme poverty (<\$1.25/day) in Panama: in 2015, it was estimated that between 56 and 78% of households across the CNB lived in extreme poverty(2). In addition, the CNB is relatively isolated from the rest of Panama, with limited roads, electricity, and internet access (3).

In 2018, the HIV prevalence in Panama among 15-49-year-old individuals was 0.9%, whilst in the CNB, 1.5% of tests performed were positive (4). Since 2000, ART has been free to all HIV-positive individuals in Panama (5). Retention is the ongoing participation in HIV care, while adherence, use of ART regularly as a health professional indicates. Together, retention and adherence lead to HIV viral load suppression, reduction of ART resistance, decrease in ongoing HIV transmission (6), and overall survival (7, 8). In the CNB, access to ART and HIV-related care is only available at two of 14 health centers.

This lack of adherence and retention in HIV care may be reflected in epidemiological reports. For example, nationwide in 2018, HIV was the ninth most common cause of death among men and women, while in CNB, HIV was the first cause of death among men and second among women (9). In addition, adherence to ART has been less than optimal in the CNB. In 2019, late diagnosis for HIV was common, where 56.3% (237/421) of all patients had an initial CD4 count at <350 cells/mm³ and 24.7% (104/421) at <200 cells/mm³. That same year, 30.3% (226/747) of patients in CNB abandoned ART and HIV care-- the majority within the first year after their diagnosis-- compared to the national average of 6.5% (1050/16,043) (10). Furthermore, in 2019, viral suppression (<1000 copies/ml) among all patients was reported among only 52.3% (312/589) of men and 49.0% (73/149) of women. Opportunistic infections are also relatively common; 17.2% (22/128) of individuals diagnosed with tuberculosis tested positive for HIV, and 54 patients who attended the ART clinic presented with an opportunistic infection (24.1%

[13/54] and diarrheal disease, 7.4% [4/54] with oral candidiasis, 7.4% [4/54] with histoplasmosis, cerebral toxoplasmosis or HIV-associated pneumonia (10). In 2018, ART shortages occurred for 1-3 months throughout the year in: efavirenz/emtricitabine/tenofovir, Lopinavir/Ritonavir (200/50mg and 80/20mg), and Raltegravir (400mg).

The Social-Ecological Theory for Health has been used previously to describe factors associated with ART adherence (11, 12). Three primary factor levels have been associated with the model: individual, social, and structural levels (13, 14). Individual-level factors include personal attitudes and beliefs; the social-level factors include interpersonal interaction with peers, friends, family, and peers; the structural-level factors include the healthcare system, poverty community organizations, and policy.

Considering the high prevalence and proportion of deaths due to AIDS-related illnesses in CNB, we undertook a qualitative study among HIV-positive individuals to describe the individual, social, structural levels facilitators and barriers to ART adherence and retention in care in CNB. A better understanding of these factors will help in the development of more effective, culturally congruent HIV care for CNB PLHIV.

Methods

Study design and participants

The study design and topics arose during previous research of sexually transmitted infections (STI), including HIV among young people in CNB (15). We conducted interviews among people living with HIV (PLHIV) at the two existing ART clinics in CNB or a private location of their choice in the interviewee's community. Clinicians who provide ART (authors CG and YQ) selected participants from their clinics using purposive sampling based on varying levels of adherence and retention success obtained from clinic charts. The interview schedule (**Table 1**) was piloted among ten non-PLHIV in two CNB communities, non-PLHIV, for language understanding and acceptability before undertaking the study.

Table 1: Interview schedule

People living with HIV	
Key questions and themes	Prompts and sub-questions
Can you tell me a bit about your diagnosis? What happened after?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What was it that motivated you to get treatment? • How were you treated in the health centre or hospital?
Tell me about the treatment you are taking now.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Why did you select this treatment? ¿Por qué elegiste este tipo de tratamiento? Or why did you stop taking treatment or go to the ART clinic? • How do you feel about taking this treatment? • Have you taken <i>botánica</i>? Can you tell me about that?
Tell me a bit about the difficulties you have faced while trying to access ART.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How much does it cost for you to get your ART? • Have you ever had a bad experience in the system? Did this affect your ART use?
What has been the process of adaptation to your diagnosis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How do you feel about your diagnosis? • What plans do you have for your future?
How has your diagnosis changed or affected your relationship with your family or friends?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What have been the reactions of your family and friends? • How do they support you? • How do they treat you differently?
And the rest of your community?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have you felt you were discriminated against? Can you tell me about it? • What are the opinions of your community regarding HIV, and how do these opinions affect you?
What are some things that have affected your wellbeing since you were diagnosed?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is there something that has affected you negatively? What happened, and how did it affect you? • Tell me about your spiritual beliefs and how these affect your diagnosis.
Tell me what you have learned about HIV since you	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What would you like to learn more about?

were diagnosed.	<p>What can the clinic do better?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What kind of orientation do you wish your family received?
-----------------	--

Authors AG, ES, AM conducted the semi-structured interviews in Spanish, which is spoken at a basic level by the majority of people in CNB (16). Interviews took 20-40 minutes and were conducted until saturation of key themes regarding ART adherence. A digital recorder was used to record the interviews. Interview themes and questions are found in **Table 2**.

Table 2. Participant characteristics, Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé, Panama, 2018

<i>Pseudonym</i>	Gender	Age range	Region of CNB
<i>Chäti</i>	Man	31-50	Southern
<i>Icho</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Chilo</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Pancho</i>	Man	18-30	Northern
<i>Chiko</i>	Man	31-50	Northern
<i>Chöli</i>	Man	18-30	Northern
<i>Itoli</i>	Man	31-50	Southern
<i>Jichi</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Cheko</i>	Man	31-50	Southern
<i>Mirono</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Jebi</i>	Woman	31-50	Northern
<i>Cheyeyi</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Chichiko</i>	Man	18-30	Northern
<i>Mechi</i>	Woman	31-50	Southern
<i>Joti</i>	Man	18-30	Northern
<i>Nichi</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Jichi</i>	Man	18-30	Southern
<i>Choi</i>	Man	18-30	Northern
<i>Metiko</i>	Woman	18-30	Northern
<i>Belisi</i>	Woman	31-50	Southern
<i>Kötä</i>	Man	31-50	Northern

Analysis

The interviews were transcribed by authors GCT and AC and then translated from Spanish to English by AG. A research assistant cross-checked the translation. Deductive thematic analysis

was used to uncover themes of individual, social and structural factors related to ART adherence. Interview transcripts were first read, then data were broken into codes using NVIVO12 software (QSR International, Melbourne, Australia). Codes were organised into themes that were part of the original codebook; other themes were allowed to emerge. AG coded interviews; four interviews were checked for interrater reliability with author ES. Contradictions were agreed upon. Saturation of themes and codes was reached within 12 interviews; coding was completed for all interviews.

Ethical approval

The research was approved by the Comité Nacional de Bioética de la Investigación de Panamá (EC-CNBI-20180836). All participants were ≥ 18 years and signed an informed consent prior to initiating the interviews.

Results

Between April and December 2019, 21 semi-structured interviews were conducted with PLHIV, 12 from the Southern mountainous regions of Nedrini and Kādriri, nine from the Northern region of Ñö Kribo. All participants were of Ngābe or Buglé ethnicities, 81% were male (**Table 2**); 13 (62%) had at least two missed clinic visits over the past two years for treatment collection or CD4/viral load testing.

Based on the Social-Ecological model, we discuss the facilitators and barriers to ART adherence and retention in care at the individual, social and structural levels.

Individual and social facilitators

We found individual factors related to ART adherence included three themes: knowing how ART controls the virus, the inclusion of ART in scheduled routines, and good psychological health, which in turn seemed to be influenced by social support received from two social groups: clinic peers, and family.

Chāti, Chiko, Jichi, Ichō, Belisi, Metiko, Mirono, and Jebi mentioned they knew how ART controls the infection but does not cure HIV. Belisi and Jichi similarly stated, “I know there is

no cure; my medicine is to control the virus." In addition, some participants indicated adherence was easier when including their dose as part of their daily routine. For example, Mirono, Chäti, and Metiko and Belisi indicated it was easy for them to remember to take ART because they take their dose every night before bed at the same time.

Good psychological health was found to be directly influenced by social support the participant received from clinic peers and family. For example, Mirono, Cheyei said they found social support and inspiration to maintain adherence and retention in care while talking to other patients at the clinic. In previous years, a social worker organized a temporary peer support group at the southern ART clinic. Cheko, Jichi, Chilo reported the group helped them feel supported, which, they said, translated into better retention and adherence.

Patient social support also came from family members. For example, Chiko, Chichiko, Jebi, Nechi, Mirono, Choi, Kötä, Chöli, and Itoli indicated that family support was crucial for ART adherence. Often, one family member knew of the diagnosis and supported the patient emotionally by checking in; consequently, the individual wanted to continue with ART. For Mirono, Kötä, Chiko and Jebi, family support also impacted retention in care, as family members often gave the patient financial assistance for monthly travel to the ART clinic.

Structural facilitators

Two main structural facilitators were elicited: ART clinic expansion and nutritional supplements. The Ministry of Health provided structural support. The first ART clinic opened in 2010 in the Southern regions Nedrini and Kädriri; in 2017, a second clinic was opened in the Northern region of Ñö Kribo. The new clinics have aided in decreasing travel costs and distance for many patients. Participants also indicated that both clinics supply nutrient enhanced porridge (*crema*) to all patients at ART retrieval. Some patients (Pancho, Jichi, Belisi, and Itoli) notably said that they would not have food at night when they take their dose without the crema.

Individual and social barriers

We found individual barriers to include lifestyle choices and psychological health. Lifestyle choices of an individual such as drinking and partying were found to increase the chances of

unprotected sex (Pancho) and decrease regular adherence (Chöli, Cheyei, Pancho). Chöli said, “When there's a party, and I drink...sometimes I forget to take my medicine.” Despite some mentioning these lifestyle choices, most participants indicated they do not consume alcohol or party.

We found evidence that individual factors, such as the patient's psychological health, influenced feelings of depression and loss of motivation for adherence. In addition, psychological health was founded in discrimination from various aspects of the participant's social circle: family, friends, community members, and religious groups, which in turn impacted the patient's ART retention and adherence.

Family-level discrimination was felt by Chiko, Choi, Cheko, Nichi, Pancho, Jichi, and Itoli. These participants indicated a link between family discrimination and feelings of isolation and depression, which in turn led to apathy towards ART adherence and retention. Chiko, Choi, Cheko, Nichi, Pancho, and Jichi told of being segregated from their family during day-to-day routines, including while cooking, sharing of food, and sleeping spaces. Cheko explained the effects of family-level discrimination on ART adherence: “Your family is your base, if your family rejects you, what kind of strength do you have to live?... then you don't take your medicine and you get an infection and die.”

Other patients feared community status disclosure and community-level discrimination. Mechi, Cheyei and Mirono said they worried community members would raise questions about their whereabouts when they left their community every month on the same date. Mirono, Jebi, Cheyei, Mechi, Joti, Kötä, Metiko, Cheko, Jichi, and Choi said they had felt discrimination from friends and community members. Many indicated this led them to isolate, and not seek further social interaction. Participants, Joti, Icho, Belisi, Jichi, and Choi reported that despite community-level discrimination, the emotional support they received from their family counteracted feelings of isolation; adherence and retention were not affected.

Structural barriers

Structural barriers to ART adherence included four general themes: friction between Western/Traditional systems, food security, medication shortages, difficulties of access due to distance and cost.

Many participants felt they had to choose between Western and Traditional medicine for four reasons: 1) both Traditional and Western providers told them not to use pluralistic treatments simultaneously. For example, Poncho and Kötä indicated Traditional providers told them not to mix treatments because ART would lessen the effects of *botanica* (herbal medicine); Chichiko, Itoli, Chilo, Jebi, Belisi, and Cheko said Western doctors feared unknown side-effects from mixing treatments. 2) Due to the high price of some Traditional providers, Joti, Cheyei, and Jichi were left without traveling money to go to the ART clinic. For example, Joti said, 'my family wanted me to take *botanica*, they sold a cow to pay for it, but then we didn't have more money to travel to the clinic'. 3) Jebi, Nichi, Chilo Pancho, and Chöli reported that Traditional providers offered a cure for HIV. Chilo and Chöli even indicated they had stopped treatment at some time because they believed they could be cured. Participants reported that some Traditional providers told them they could be cured by believing that God and *botanica* would heal them.

A second structural barrier for several patients was food security. Icho, Pancho, Chichiko, Choi, and Kötä said they were told to take their pills with food, but often they did not eat in the evenings. Chichiko notably said, "They told me to eat before I take my pills, but my family doesn't eat at night... So I didn't know if I should take my medicine." To lower side-effects of ART, patients are advised to take medicine at night with food, however traditionally, and perhaps due to poverty, many individuals in CNB eat only one meal a day.

All participants interviewed spoke of having their treatment interrupted at some time due to supply shortage at the ART clinic they attend. Notably, Cheko said, "In 16 years, I've been on treatment, almost yearly the clinic runs out of pills for a while. Sometimes I don't get my pills for a month or three, sometimes they say to come the following week to pick them up, but then I don't have money to travel again... when the pills come in and I can travel, I start taking them again."

The last structural barrier we found is access to the ART clinic due to the distance and the cost of travel. Kötä, for example, explained he walks 8 hours to get to a road where there is a bus down to the clinic. Metiko and Chöli indicated that because of the distance, they could not travel to and from the clinic in one day. Therefore, further costs are incurred with finding where to stay, or more disconcertingly, they may sleep outside the clinic (Pancho). Chilo, Chäti and Jichi said they rely on family for money to travel; however, at times, family members cannot provide for the transport costs; therefore, the patient may miss picking up the treatment that month, or altogether drop out of care. Chäti notably said, “sometimes my father tells me it's too expensive (to keep me in care), so I want to stop taking pills to not be a burden.”

Discussion

The Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé (CNB) is an isolated region of Panama, with poor access to ART and HIV care clinics, with high ART and care drop-out rates, resulting in poor virological control and high HIV-related mortality. However, to our knowledge, there has not been any prior research to elicit the factors that influence adherence to ART in the CNB. Participants reported several individual/social facilitators and individual/social and structural barriers to ART adherence and retention. These facilitators and barriers in care are based within the interaction of individual/social/structural levels, as described in Bronfenbrenner's mesosystem (17).

Individual-level factors were based on psychological health, which was mainly related to social acceptance/discrimination. The association of good mental health with social support at the foundation has been described as the backbone of ART adherence (18) and has been shown to impact interpersonal, psychological and mental health, especially anxiety and depression (19, 20).

We found that not all social exclusion affects the participant's adherence and retention the same. For example, family-level discrimination was detrimental to psychological wellbeing, and therefore to adherence and retention. However, although community-level discrimination

affected participants, simultaneous family support seemed to counteract adverse adherence/retention outcomes. Studies in Thailand and the United States reported the importance of family support in ART retention and adherence, especially for young people (21, 22).

Structurally, we document regular ART shortages in the clinics which deter adherence to ART. Additionally, the existence of two medical systems, one Western the other Traditional, that often do not complement each other but instead often compete for patients. Ngäbe-Buglé individuals often chose the geographically and culturally closer provider, albeit more expensive Traditional providers, and attend Western hospitals when the Traditional medicine fails. The interaction between the two medical systems was detrimental to ART adherence and retention in Western HIV care for some participants. Medical pluralism, the use of multiple medical systems such as Traditional and Western systems together or interchangeably, is especially popular in chronic conditions such as HIV (23). Traditional medicine, widespread across the CNB (24), may be favored by patients because of the focus on comprehensive and culturally congruent care (25). Despite existing plurality, patients reported that both systems asked them not to use simultaneous treatments.

Implications for policy and practice

Families are often overlooked in ART care interventions. However, family systems are central to social functioning in the CNB (26). We found that family support was vital for adherence and retention; interventions with families have been found to support positive HIV outcomes (21, 22). Broader social-network and community-level approaches could increase societal knowledge and support while decreasing stigma, as shown in Kenya and Zimbabwe (27, 28). These interventions could be part of existing HIV care in order not to lose patient continuity. In CNB, some participants mentioned the success of the professionally guided peer-support group; this group should be revived and expanded. In Zimbabwe, the Friendship Bench, a low-cost therapy intervention run by lay healthcare workers, was found to be effective mental-health support for PLHIV (29); in CNB, a similar program could incorporate individuals and family members.

A major structural limitation related to ART access was influenced by cost and distance to travel to the clinic. This limitation was, without a doubt, exasperated by the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020 and 2021, where the *Covidization* of healthcare significantly influenced HIV care (30). We found that patients were expected to retrieve ART monthly and participate in biannual CD4 count/HIV plasma viral load check-ups during our data collection. Although ART in Panama is free (5), monthly clinic trips may be too much of a financial burden to continue treatment, as found in a worldwide review (31). Home-based visits in China, Uganda, and Rwanda have increased adherence and viral suppression (32-35). Task shifting to dispense ART through non-specialized health workers could decrease travel and increase adherence and clinical outcomes, as shown in several studies (35-39). However, newer research has found community-based drug delivery could be costly to the clinics and could force clients to identify as living with HIV (40). Other models of differentiated delivery of ART include fast-track drug refills for 3-6 months. In the CNB, fast-track, multi-month refills and decentralized services to smaller health centers across the country could decrease the time and money spent on monthly pill pick-up.

Food insecurity has been shown in a worldwide review as a limiting factor to ART adherence due to more significant side effects of ART when taken without food and competing for economical use demands when choosing between clinic travel costs or food (41). Despite existing supplemental nutrition in CNB, some still felt food scarcity. Therefore, the provision of other food items should be considered. A study in Honduras found an increase in adherence when a monthly food basket was given at ART retrieval (35, 42).

In CNB, the relationship between Western/Traditional medicine was found to be exclusionary. However, these systems could coexist for successful patient care, as found in South Africa (43). Successful collaborations could decrease potential morbidity and mortality related to potentially unsafe practices and low adherence/retention (43-45). Further complicating these interactions is the promise of cure by some Traditional providers in CNB; similar findings have emerged in Uganda (46) and Tanzania (47). Due to the overwhelming use of Traditional medicine throughout the CNB, despite the high costs, Western medicine could benefit from the trust and cultural closeness by systematically including Traditional providers to help deliver care. Interventions could incorporate Traditional providers for ART promotion and patient home

visits. A study in Malawi found that adherence and retention increased with the inclusion of Traditional providers as community health workers (48). However, in Zambia, despite Western and Traditional providers recognition of the importance of collaboration, institution-based, one-way teaching methods were unsuccessful in promoting collaboration (49).

In this study, we found consistent findings with a diverse group of PLHIV, including adherent/somewhat non-adherent patients. We also included a nearly identical participant sex ratio to CNB clinic statistics, as 82% of PLHIV in CNB are male (50). Additionally, code saturation was reached quickly. However, this study has two main limitations, firstly the interviewers, AG and ES, are ethnically white women, which may have decreased accurate reporting among Indigenous participants. However, HIV status in CNB is generally seen as a sensitive and confidential topic; the fact that the interviewers were markedly from outside the CNB may have increased openness as the risk of divulging serostatus among community members decreased. Secondly, ART clinicians aided in the selection of participants; selection bias may have occurred. Furthermore, we could not contact completely non-adherent participants. However, participants presented with a mixture of adherence levels from adherent to somewhat non-adherent.

Conclusions

This qualitative study among PLHIV focused on a relatively isolated group of Indigenous peoples who live in the CNB in Western Panama. We found that participants' experience in ART adherence and retention in care was strongly influenced by interrelated individual, social, and structural factors. These factors included individual psychological health as well as family and community social support or discrimination. Notably, PLHIV in the CNB have difficulties in deciding between Traditional and Western medicine offers because of distance of travel and cultural closeness. Additionally, poverty and food insecurity made adherence difficult for many, while others were affected by regular ART shortages. We provided several recommendations from other studies in Low- and Middle-income countries, including interventions that impact the social and structural-level barriers to adherence and retention in ART care.

Acknowledgments

We are incredibly grateful to the participants who took the time to meet and talk to us about their lives. We are also grateful to the Ministry of Health and Traditional Doctors of the Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé for supporting and encouraging this study. In addition, JMP is a distinguished member of the SNI of SENACYT.

References

1. Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Censo. Boleín 15. Estimaciones y proyecciones de la población en la república, provincia, comarca indígena por distrito, según sexo y edad; 2010-2020 2019 [cited 2020 August]. Available from: https://www.inec.gob.pa/publicaciones/Default3.aspx?ID_PUBLICACION=499&ID_CATEGORIA=3&ID_SUBCATEGORIA=10.
2. Ministerio de Economía y Finanzas, Banco Mundial. Pobreza y Desigualdad en Panamá online2017 [Available from: <http://www.mef.gob.pa/es/noticias/Documents/Pobreza%20y%20desigualdad%20en%20Panama%20-%20Mapas%202015.pdf>].
3. Grupo para el Desarrollo Empresarial. Plan Estratégico de Desarrollo De La Comarca Ngäbe-Buglé 2008 [cited 2019 October]. Available from: <http://www.libertadciudadana.org/archivos/balance/documentos/Plan%20Estrategico%20de%20la%20Comarca%20ngobe%20bugle%5B1%5D.pdf>.
4. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Panama Country Profile Global HIV and TB 2019 [cited 2020 August]. Available from: <https://www.cdc.gov/globalhivtb/where-we-work/region/westernhemisphere/panama/panama.html>.
5. Oficial G. Ley nº 3 del 5 de enero de 2000. online2000.
6. World Health Organization. Adherence to Long-term Therapies online2003 [cited 2020 October]. Available from: https://www.who.int/chp/knowledge/publications/adherence_full_report.pdf.
7. Rai S, Mahapatra B, Sircar S, Raj PY, Venkatesh S, Shaukat M, et al. Adherence to Antiretroviral Therapy and Its Effect on Survival of HIV-Infected Individuals in Jharkhand, India. PLOS ONE. 2013;8(6):e66860.
8. Neto NBF, Marin LG, de Souza BG, Moro ALD, Nedel WL. HIV treatment non-adherence is associated with ICU mortality in HIV-positive critically ill patients. Journal of the Intensive Care Society. 2020:1751143719898977.
9. Ministerio de Salud. Unpublished National HIV database. 2018.
10. Ministerio de Salud. Recolección de indicadores nacionales e internacionales 2019. Unpublished: Ministerio de Salud; 2020.
11. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. The Social-Ecological Model: A Framework for Prevention online2020 [cited 2020 August]. Available from: <https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/publichealthissue/social-ecologicalmodel.html>.
12. Bronfenbrenner U. The Ecology of Human Development: Experiments by Nature and Design: Harvard University Press; 1979.

13. Castro EM, Santiago LE, Jiménez JC, Dávila-Vargas D, Rosal MC. A Social-Ecological View of Barriers and Facilitators for HIV Treatment Adherence: Interviews with Puerto Rican HIV Patients. *PloS one*. 2015;10(9):e0125582-e.
14. Yakob B, Ncama BP. A socio-ecological perspective of access to and acceptability of HIV/AIDS treatment and care services: a qualitative case study research. *BMC Public Health*. 2016;16(1):155.
15. Gabster A, Pascale JM, Cislighi B, Francis SC, Weiss HA, Martinez A, et al. High prevalence of sexually transmitted infections, and high-risk sexual behaviours among indigenous adolescents of the Comarca Ngäbe-Bugle, Panama. *Sex Transm Dis*. 2019;46(12):780-7.
16. De León RG, Chamorro F, Flores H, Mendoza AI, Martínez LG, Aparicio LE, et al. Encuesta nacional de salud sexual y reproductiva. 2018.
17. Bronfenbrenner U. Toward an experimental ecology of human development. *American Psychologist*. 1977;32(7):513-31.
18. Safren SA, Mayer KH, Ou SS, McCauley M, Grinsztejn B, Hosseinipour MC, et al. Adherence to Early Antiretroviral Therapy: Results From HPTN 052, a Phase III, Multinational Randomized Trial of ART to Prevent HIV-1 Sexual Transmission in Serodiscordant Couples. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr*. 2015;69(2):234-40.
19. McMahon JM, Braksmajer A, Zhang C, Leblanc N, Chen M, Aidala A, et al. Syndemic factors associated with adherence to antiretroviral therapy among HIV-positive adult heterosexual men. *AIDS Research and Therapy*. 2019;16(1):32.
20. Turan B, Hatcher AM, Weiser SD, Johnson MO, Rice WS, Turan JM. Framing Mechanisms Linking HIV-Related Stigma, Adherence to Treatment, and Health Outcomes. *Am J Public Health*. 2017;107(6):863-9.
21. Knodel J, Kespichayawattana J, Saengtienchai C, Wiwatwanich S. The role of parents and family members in ART treatment adherence: Evidence from Thailand. *Res Aging*. 2010;32(1):19-39.
22. Lyon ME, Trexler C, Akpan-Townsend C, Pao M, Selden K, Fletcher J, et al. A family group approach to increasing adherence to therapy in HIV-infected youths: results of a pilot project. *AIDS Patient Care STDS*. 2003;17(6):299-308.
23. Audet CM, Sidat M, Blevins M, Moon TD, Vergara A, Vermund SH. HIV knowledge and health-seeking behavior in Zambézia Province, Mozambique. *Sahara j*. 2012;9(1):41-6.
24. Villalba ED. Promoción de la Medicina y Terapias Indígenas en la Atención Primaria de Salud: El Caso de los Ngöbe0Buglé de Panamá online: PAHO; 2001 [cited 2020 October]. Available from: <https://www.paho.org/hq/dmdocuments/2009/36-Esp%20IND14.pdf>.
25. Audet CM, Ngoben S, Wagner RG. Traditional healer treatment of HIV persists in the era of ART: a mixed-methods study from rural South Africa. *BMC Complement Altern Med*. 2017;17(1):434-.
26. Young PD, Bort JR. The Ngobe of Western Panama. In: Stonich SC, editor. *Endangered peoples of Latin America*: Greenwood; 2001. p. 121-36.
27. Hickey MD, Salmen CR, Omollo D, Mattah B, Fiorella KJ, Geng EH, et al. Implementation and Operational Research: Pulling the Network Together: Quasiexperimental Trial of a Patient-Defined Support Network Intervention for Promoting Engagement in HIV Care and Medication

- Adherence on Mfangano Island, Kenya. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*. 2015;69(4).
28. Campbell C, Skovdal M, Mupambireyi Z, Madanhire C, Nyamukapa C, Gregson S. Building adherence-competent communities: Factors promoting children's adherence to antiretroviral HIV/AIDS treatment in rural Zimbabwe. *Health & Place*. 2012;18(2):123-31.
 29. Chibanda D, Weiss HA, Verhey R, Simms V, Munjoma R, Rusakaniko S, et al. Effect of a Primary Care–Based Psychological Intervention on Symptoms of Common Mental Disorders in Zimbabwe: A Randomized Clinical Trial. *JAMA*. 2016;316(24):2618-26.
 30. Gabster A, Erausquin JT, Michielsen K, Mayaud P, Pascale JM, Pericas C, et al. How did COVID-19 measures impact sexual behaviour and access to HIV/STI services in Panama? Results from a national cross-sectional online survey. *Sexually Transmitted Infections*. 2021:sextrans-2021-054985.
 31. Weiser S, Wolfe W, Bangsberg D, Thior I, Gilbert P, Makhema J, et al. Barriers to antiretroviral adherence for patients living with HIV infection and AIDS in Botswana. *J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr*. 2003;34(3):281-8.
 32. Williams AB, Wang H, Li X, Chen J, Li L, Fennie K. Efficacy of an Evidence-Based ARV Adherence Intervention in China. *AIDS Patient Care and STDs*. 2014;28(8):411-7.
 33. Kipp W, Konde-Lule J, Saunders LD, Alibhai A, Houston S, Rubaale T, et al. Antiretroviral treatment for HIV in rural Uganda: two-year treatment outcomes of a prospective health centre/community-based and hospital-based cohort. *PloS one*. 2012;7(7):e40902.
 34. Franke MF, Kaigamba F, Socci AR, Hakizamungu M, Patel A, Bagiruwigize E, et al. Improved retention associated with community-based accompaniment for antiretroviral therapy delivery in rural Rwanda. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*. 2013;56(9):1319-26.
 35. Ridgeway K, Dulli LS, Murray KR, Silverstein H, Dal Santo L, Olsen P, et al. Interventions to improve antiretroviral therapy adherence among adolescents in low- and middle-income countries: A systematic review of the literature. *PloS one*. 2018;13(1):e0189770-e.
 36. Fairall L, Bachmann MO, Lombard C, Timmerman V, Uebel K, Zwarenstein M, et al. Task shifting of antiretroviral treatment from doctors to primary-care nurses in South Africa (STRETCH): a pragmatic, parallel, cluster-randomised trial. *The Lancet*. 2012;380(9845):889-98.
 37. Kiweewa FM, Wabwire D, Nakibuuka J, Mubiru M, Bagenda D, Musoke P, et al. Noninferiority of a task-shifting HIV care and treatment model using peer counselors and nurses among Ugandan women initiated on ART: evidence from a randomized trial. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*. 2013;63(4):e125-e32.
 38. Selke HM, Kimaiyo S, Sidle JE, Vedanthan R, Tierney WM, Shen C, et al. Task-shifting of antiretroviral delivery from health care workers to persons living with HIV/AIDS: clinical outcomes of a community-based program in Kenya. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes*. 2010;55(4):483-90.
 39. Barnabas RV, Szpiro AA, van Rooyen H, Asiimwe S, Pillay D, Ware NC, et al. Community-based antiretroviral therapy versus standard clinic-based services for HIV in South Africa and Uganda (DO ART): a randomised trial. *The Lancet Global Health*. 2020;8(10):e1305-e15.
 40. Zakumumpa H, Makobu K, Ntawiha W, Maniple E. A mixed-methods evaluation of the uptake of novel differentiated ART delivery models in a national sample of health facilities in Uganda. *PloS one*. 2021;16(7):e0254214.

41. Young S, Wheeler AC, McCoy SI, Weiser SD. A review of the role of food insecurity in adherence to care and treatment among adult and pediatric populations living with HIV and AIDS. *AIDS Behav.* 2014;18 Suppl 5(0 5):S505-S15.
42. Martinez H, Palar K, Linnemayr S, Smith A, Derosé KP, Ramírez B, et al. Tailored nutrition education and food assistance improve adherence to HIV antiretroviral therapy: evidence from Honduras. *AIDS Behav.* 2014;18(5):566-77.
43. Appelbaum Belisle H, Hennink M, Ordóñez CE, John S, Ngubane-Joye E, Hampton J, et al. Concurrent use of traditional medicine and ART: Perspectives of patients, providers and traditional healers in Durban, South Africa. *Glob Public Health.* 2015;10(1):71-87.
44. The challenges of involving traditional healers in HIV/AIDS care. *International Journal of STD & AIDS.* 2006;17(6):360-3.
45. Wanyama JN, Tsui S, Kwok C, Wanyenze RK, Denison JA, Koole O, et al. Persons living with HIV infection on antiretroviral therapy also consulting traditional healers: a study in three African countries. *International Journal of STD & AIDS.* 2017;28(10):1018-27.
46. Wanyama J, Castelnuovo B, Wandera B, Mwebaze P, Kambugu A, Bangsberg DR, et al. Belief in divine healing can be a barrier to antiretroviral therapy adherence in Uganda. *Aids.* 2007;21(11):1486-7.
47. Thielman NM, Ostermann J, Whetten K, Whetten R, Itemba D, Maro V, et al. Reduced Adherence to Antiretroviral Therapy Among HIV-Infected Tanzanians Seeking Cure From the Loliondo Healer. *JAIDS Journal of Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndromes.* 2014;65(3).
48. Audet CM, Salato J, Vermund SH, Amico KR. Adapting an adherence support workers intervention: engaging traditional healers as adherence partners for persons enrolled in HIV care and treatment in rural Mozambique. *Implement Sci.* 2017;12(1):50.
49. Kaboru BB, Falkenberg T, Ndubani P, Höjer B, Vongo R, Brugha R, et al. Can biomedical and traditional health care providers work together? Zambian practitioners' experiences and attitudes towards collaboration in relation to STIs and HIV/AIDS care: a cross-sectional study. *Hum Resour Health.* 2006;4:16-.
50. Ministerio de Salud. Base de Datos Unificado CNB VIH. 2018 ed. Not published: Ministerio de Salud Comarca Ngäbe-Bugle; 2018.

Co-author Contributorship

Contributor Role	Role Definition
Conceptualization	AG, ES, CG, YQ
Data Curation	AG, ES
Formal Analysis	AG, ES
Funding Acquisition	AG, JMP
Investigation	AG, GCT, AC, YQ, CG
Methodology	AG, PM
Project Administration	AG
Resources	GCT, AC, YQ, CG
Software	N/A
Supervision	JMP, PM
Validation	PM
Visualization	AG, PM
Writing – Original Draft Preparation	AG, ES, JMP, GCT, AC, YQ, CG, PM
Writing – Review & Editing	AG, ES, JMP, GCT, AC, YQ, CG, PM