

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Active arts engagement and depression in older adults in the United States: Longitudinal evidence from the Health and Retirement Study

*Jessica K Bone, PhD^a

Feifei Bu, PhD^a

Meg Fluharty, PhD^a

Elise Paul, PhD^a

Jill K Sonke, MSc^b

Daisy Fancourt, PhD^a

^a Research Department of Behavioural Science and Health, Institute of Epidemiology & Health Care, University College London, London, UK

^b Center for Arts in Medicine, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida, US

*Corresponding author

UCL Research Department of Behavioural Science and Health, 1-19 Torrington Place, London WC1E 7HB

Acknowledgements

We thank Shanae Burch, thought leader on work at the intersections of the arts, equity, and public health in the US, for her comments on this manuscript. We also gratefully acknowledge the contribution of the HRS study participants.

Funding

The EpiArts Lab, a National Endowment for the Arts Research Lab at the University of Florida, is supported in part by an award from the National Endowment for the Arts (1862896-38-C-20). The opinions expressed are those of the authors and do not represent the views of the National Endowment for the Arts Office of Research & Analysis or the National Endowment for the Arts. The National Endowment for the Arts does not guarantee the accuracy or completeness of the information included in this material and is not responsible for any consequences of its use. The EpiArts Lab is also supported by the University of Florida, the Pabst Steinmetz Foundation, and Bloomberg Philanthropies. This work was also supported by an award from Arts Council England (INVF-00404365). DF is supported by the Wellcome Trust [205407/Z/16/Z].

Author contributions

JKB, FB, and DF designed the study. JKB and FB conducted the analysis and JKB drafted the manuscript. JKB, FB, MF, EP, JKS, and DF contributed to the writing, made critical revisions, and approved the final manuscript.

Declaration of interest

No authors report any conflicts of interest.

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Abstract

Objectives: Receptive cultural engagement, such as going to the theater and museums, has been shown to reduce depression in older adults. However, whether more active engagement in artistic and creative activities is associated with lower rates of depression remains unknown. We aimed to test whether active arts engagement was associated with concurrent and subsequent depression

Methods: Using longitudinal data from 19,134 participants aged over 50 in the Health and Retirement Study, arts engagement was measured every four years, and depression every two years, between 2008 and 2016. A score of three or more on the Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale indicated depression. We fitted population-averaged panel data models using generalized estimating equations with a logit link.

Results: Engaging in artistic and creative activities, such as clubs, hobbies, and baking/cooking was associated with reduced depression, independent of confounders. Concurrently, spending time on hobbies (monthly OR=0.80, 95% CI=0.72-0.88; weekly OR=0.81, 95% CI=0.73-0.89) and clubs (monthly OR=0.85, 95% CI=0.77-0.94; weekly OR=0.78, 95% CI=0.69-0.88) was associated with lower odds of depression versus not engaging. Longitudinally, the odds of depression two years later were reduced amongst people engaging in weekly baking/cooking (OR=0.85, 95% CI=0.75-0.95), hobbies (OR=0.81, 95% CI=0.71-0.92), and clubs (OR=0.82, 95% CI=0.71-0.94). Writing, reading, sewing, and attending non-religious organizations were not consistently associated with depression.

Discussion: Active engagement in artistic and creative activities is associated with reduced odds of depression. We should consider how older adults can be supported to actively engage in the arts as a health-promoting behavior.

Keywords: arts, culture, hobbies, creative activities, depression, aging, older adults

Introduction

In the United States (US), there is currently unprecedented growth in the number of older adults. By 2060, adults aged 65 and above are projected to form 23% of the American population (Vespa et al., 2020). Among this aging population, depression is one of the most common mental health problems, with point prevalence estimates ranging from 11% to 15% (Steffens et al., 2009; Zivin et al., 2010). Identifying ways to reduce or prevent depression is particularly important in older age, when close social ties may be lost, people are more likely living alone, many have low income, and progressive age-related health problems may limit people's activities (World Health Organization, 2015).

Engagement in the arts can provide a number of benefits which may reduce or prevent depression in older adults. Arts engagement incorporates a wide range of activities, from actively participating in the arts (e.g. singing, reading) to more receptive cultural engagement (e.g. going to the theatre, performances, exhibits; Fancourt & Finn, 2019). It can also encompass broader creative activities that, whilst not always labelled as 'arts', share similar properties of creative skill and imagination (e.g. cooking, hobbies; Fancourt et al., 2021). All of these forms of arts engagement involve a number of active ingredients that are known to be health promoting, including providing opportunities for creative expression, aesthetic pleasure, cognitive stimulation, sensory activation, evocation of emotion, and social interaction (Dunphy et al., 2019; Fancourt & Finn, 2019). These ingredients have, in turn, been shown to activate a range of mechanisms of action that are related to mental health, including psychological processes (e.g. improving self-esteem and mood), biological processes (e.g. reducing levels of stress hormones and inflammation), social processes (e.g. reducing loneliness and improving communication), and behavioral processes (e.g. enhancing agency and motivation to engage in other health behaviours; Fancourt et al., 2021).

There is currently good evidence on using arts engagement to improve wellbeing, reduce physical decline, and support cognition in older adults, but there is a lack of evidence on the effect of arts on mental health problems such as depression (Fancourt, Warran, et al., 2020). Previous studies have demonstrated mainly positive effects of creative arts interventions, such as using art, dance movement, drama, or music, for older adults experiencing depression (Dunphy et al., 2019). However, some findings have been inconsistent, as not all studies have found evidence that these interventions reduce depression (Curtis et al., 2018; Dunphy et al., 2019; Fancourt, Opher, et al., 2020). This may be because intervention studies are limited by the use of small samples, short follow-up periods, and a focus on engagement with one specific activity or group, rather than ongoing engagement in everyday life. Epidemiological studies have provided more evidence in this field. A systematic review identified six large observational studies, five of which found evidence that arts engagement was associated with decreased odds of depression in adults (Elsden & Roe, 2020). However, these studies were all European, and only two longitudinally tested the associations between arts engagement and subsequent depression specifically in older adults (Fancourt & Steptoe, 2019; Fancourt & Tymoszuk, 2019). Additionally, all six studies focused on receptive cultural engagement, such as going to the theatre and museums.

For older adults living in the community, attending cultural events may be subject to more socioeconomic barriers than active engagement in the arts (Bone et al., 2021), and inequalities in access to cultural events may increase with age (Fluharty et al., 2021). More than one in three older adults in the US have reported some difficulty attending cultural events, with many stating that they could not attend due to inaccessibility (Rajan & Rajan, 2017). These difficulties may also relate to cultural equity and relevance (Bone et al., 2021). By contrast, active arts engagement includes a wide range of activities, many of which are inexpensive or free, and can be done in the home, such as reading, writing, making music, and creating art. Despite these activities being more accessible than cultural events for people not living in nursing homes, there is less evidence on the associations between these activities and depression in older adults. One longitudinal study found evidence that active arts participation, but not cultural attendance, was associated with better mental health in adults aged 16 to 101 years (Wang et al., 2020). There is also longitudinal evidence that

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

engagement in hobbies is associated with reductions in subsequent depression in older adults (Fancourt, Opher, et al., 2020). However, both these studies included predominantly White British samples, making transferability or generalizability across different nationalities and/or races and ethnicities difficult. Additionally, only one indicator of engagement in hobbies was used, meaning different types of active arts engagement could not be compared.

In this study, we used a large nationally representative cohort of older adults in the US (the Health and Retirement Study; Sonnega et al., 2014) to explore associations between frequency of engagement in a range of activities and both concurrent and subsequent depression. We measured activities that are commonly done by older adults and could include artistic or creative engagement (reading, writing, sewing, baking/cooking, hobbies, clubs, non-religious organizations). As these activities share similar properties of creative skill and imagination with the arts, we refer to them all as arts activities. We hypothesized that more frequent engagement in arts activities would be associated with lower odds of concurrent and subsequent depression.

Methods

Sample

Participants were drawn from the Health and Retirement Study (HRS); a nationally representative study of more than 37,000 individuals over the age of 50 in the United States (Sonnega et al., 2014). The initial HRS cohort was interviewed for the first time in 1992 and followed-up every two years. Other studies have been merged with the initial cohort and the sample is replenished with younger cohorts every six years (Sonnega et al., 2014). Further details on study design are reported elsewhere (Sonnega et al., 2014). In this study, we combined several HRS public use datasets (RAND HRS Longitudinal File 2016 (V2); RAND HRS Detailed Imputations File 2016 (V2); RAND HRS 2008-2016 Fat Files).

We used data from HRS waves at which the frequency of arts engagement was consistently measured (2008-2016). Within each wave, a rotating random 50% subsample of participants were invited to an enhanced interview. Following this interview, the Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire was left behind for participants to complete and return by mail, which included questions on frequency of arts engagement. Participants were eligible to complete this questionnaire either in 2008, 2012, and 2016 or in 2010 and 2014. In 2008, 8,296 participants were invited to complete this questionnaire, and 7,073 (85%) returned it. In 2010, 11,213 were eligible and 8,332 (74%) participated. In 2012, 10,079 were eligible and 7,412 (74%) participated. In 2014, 9,549 were eligible and 7,541 (79%) participated. In 2016, 10,238 were eligible and 6370 (62%) participated. This longitudinal sample consisted of 20,643 unique individuals, who completed an average of 1.8 waves (range 1-4). We then restricted the sample to participants with complete data on both depression and the Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire in at least one wave. This produced a final sample size of 19,134 participants and 33,880 observations (1.8 repeated measures per person, range 1-3).

All participants gave informed consent and this study has Institutional Review Board approval from the University of Florida (IRB201901792) and ethical approval from University College London Research Ethics Committee (project 18839/001).

Outcome

Depression was measured at every wave with the modified eight-item Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale (CES-D; Steffick, 2000; Turvey et al., 1999). This is a widely used self-report measure which can identify people at risk of developing depression in the general population. It has comparable psychometric properties to the full twenty-item CES-D (Turvey et al., 1999). Each item asks for a binary (yes/no) response, meaning total possible score ranges from 0 to 8, with higher scores indicating more severe symptoms. We used a cut-off of three or more to indicate the presence of depression (Steffick, 2000; Turvey et al., 1999).

Exposures

Engagement in seven types of activities was measured in the Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire. Participants were asked how often they: 1) read books, magazines, or newspapers; 2) do writing; 3) bake or cook something special; 4) make clothes, knit, embroider, etc. (referred to as sewing); 5) work on a hobby or project; 6) go to a sport, social, or other club; and 7) attend meetings of non-religious organizations (political, community, or other interest groups). Responses were recorded on a seven-point frequency scale, ranging from never to daily. We collapsed these responses into three categories, representing no engagement (never/not in the last month), monthly engagement (once a month/several times a month), and weekly engagement (once a week/several times a week/daily). Participants received these questions once every two waves, as part of the rotating random 50% subsample invited to complete the Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire. Activity engagement was thus measured for each participant in 2008, 2012, and 2016 or 2010 and 2014.

Confounders

We included demographic, socioeconomic, and health-related potential confounders. Demographic confounders were age (50-59, 60-69, 70-79, ≥ 89 years), gender (men, women), race/ethnicity (White [including Caucasian], Black [including African American], Other [including American Indian, Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander, Hispanic, Other]). In the public HRS data, more detailed information on race/ethnicity was collapsed to protect participant confidentiality, and this variable indicated the race/ethnicity as which participants primarily identified. Participants who were living with a partner were categorized as married, and those separated, divorced, widowed, or never married were classified as unmarried.

Socioeconomic confounders were educational attainment (none, high school, college, postgraduate), employment status (employed, not working, retired), total household income in quartiles (<\$19,000, \$19,000-\$39,999, \$40,000-\$79,999, \geq \$80,000), neighborhood safety (excellent/good, fair/poor), and social network composition (less diverse, more diverse). For employment status, those who were unemployed, temporarily laid off, disabled, or homemakers were grouped as not working due to small group sizes. Retired was kept separate as the majority of the sample reported being retired, and associations between arts engagement and depression may differ in retirees to those unable to work. Social network composition was measured by asking participants if they had a spouse/partner, children, other immediate family, or friends, with those responding yes to all of these questions categorized as part of a more diverse social network. Participants who did not have all of these social contacts were categorized as part of a less diverse social network (Smith et al., 2017).

Health-related confounders included difficulties relating to activities of daily living (ADLs). Participants were asked whether, because of a health or memory problem, they had any difficulty with bathing or showering; eating (such as cutting up food); getting in or out of bed; and walking across a room. A summary score was created to indicate whether participants had difficulty with any of these activities (no difficulties, difficulty with one or more activity; Bugliari et al., 2020). We also measured difficulties relating to instrumental activities of daily living (IADLs; no difficulties, difficulty with one or more activity). Participants were asked whether they had any difficulty with: making phone calls; managing money (such as paying bills and keeping track of expenses); taking medications; shopping for groceries; and preparing hot meals. A variable describing long-term physical health conditions (none, one or more) indicated whether participants reported having diabetes, lung disease, cancer, heart conditions, high blood pressure, arthritis, complications from stroke, or other medical conditions. Finally, we included a measure of cognition, which was a summary of performance on immediate and delayed recall tests (Bugliari et al., 2020). This score was split into quartiles (0-7, 8-10, 11-12, 13-20), with higher quartiles indicating better cognition.

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Three confounders (gender, ethnicity, and education) were time-invariant, so a consistent value was assigned to participants across all waves. The remaining time-varying confounders were included for each wave in which participants completed the Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire.

Statistical analyses

We first explored the sociodemographic characteristics of the sample at baseline. As only 50% of the HRS sample completed the Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire at each wave, baseline descriptive statistics were combined across 2008 and 2010, with wave dependent on the subsample that participants were in.

We then investigated whether frequency of arts engagement was associated with both concurrent and subsequent depression. Concurrent models included arts engagement and depression measured simultaneously, with estimates averaged across all waves (2008-2016). Longitudinal models tested the association between arts engagement in one wave with depressive symptoms in the subsequent wave. Exposures (arts engagement) were included from 2008 to 2014, with the outcome (depression) included from 2010 to 2016. In this model, we were able to adjust for depression in the previous wave (2008-2014), taking into account that depression at follow-up is not only related to arts engagement, but also to depression at the previous wave. This longitudinal model thus estimated the associations between arts engagement and change in depression two years later.

We fitted population-averaged panel data models by using generalized estimating equations (GEE). This allowed us to include repeated measures, with waves clustered within individual. We used an exchangeable correlation matrix as the simplest available structure to optimize model power and efficiency, although GEE is relatively robust to the choice of correlation structure (Twisk, 2003). We modelled depression with a binomial distribution, logit link, and robust standard errors. All models are presented before and after adjustment for confounders.

For participants with missing data on exposures and confounders, we imputed data using multiple imputation by chained equations (MICE; White et al., 2011). We used logistic, ordinal, and multinomial regression according to variable type, generating 20 imputed data sets (missing data ranged from 0% to 18%). The imputation model included all variables used in analyses. The results of analyses did not vary between complete cases and imputed data sets (Supplementary Tables 1-3), so findings from the imputed models are reported. All analyses were weighted to account for non-response to the Psychosocial and Lifestyle questionnaire, age, gender, and race/ethnicity, making the sample representative of all non-institutionalized individuals in the US population in the age-eligible range (Ofstedal et al., 2011; Smith et al., 2017). All analyses were performed using Stata 16 (StataCorp, 2019).

Sensitivity analyses

We investigated whether the associations between arts engagement and depression differed according to gender or age group. We first included an interaction term between each arts activity and gender in the concurrent and longitudinal models. Where there was evidence for an interaction, we examined the association between arts engagement separately for men and women. After collapsing age into three categories (50-59, 60-69, ≥ 70 years), we then repeated this analysis for age group.

We used a cut-off of three or more on the CES-D to indicate depression, but a cut-off of four or more has also been used (Steffick, 2000). In addition to the CES-D, HRS included the Short Form Composite International Diagnostic Interview (CIDI-SF), which can be used to determine a probable diagnosis of a major depressive episode according to DSM criteria (Nelson et al., 1998; Steffick, 2000). We therefore repeated analyses using the alternative threshold for the CES-D and a cut-off of three or more on the CIDI-SF (Supplementary Tables 4-5). Finally, we repeated analyses with the addition of preliminary (early release) data from the HRS 2018 wave (Supplementary Table 6).

Results

In total, 19,134 participants provided data on arts engagement and depression in at least one wave of HRS. At baseline (after weighting), 55% of participants were women, 85% were White/Caucasian, 62% were married, and 47% were retired (Table 1). As white people have represented less than 80% of the US population since 1990 (Gibson & Jung, 2002), this is an overrepresentation of white people and underrepresentation of other groups. Frequency of engagement differed considerably across activities at baseline (Table 2). For example, 85% of participants read weekly, whereas only 4% attended meetings of non-religious organizations weekly. After reading, the most common activities were baking/cooking something special (41%), working on a hobby/project (32%), and writing (19%). Overall, 20% of the sample met diagnostic criteria for depression.

Concurrent associations

Before adjusting for confounders, we found evidence that engaging more frequently in reading, baking/cooking, hobbies, and clubs were all associated with lower odds of depression (Table 3). In contrast, more frequent engagement in sewing and non-religious organizations were associated with increased odds of depression. After adjustment for confounders, there was only evidence that the frequency of engaging in hobbies and clubs were associated with depression. Compared to participants who did not spend time on a hobby/project, those doing hobbies monthly had 20% (OR=0.80, 95% CI=0.72-0.88) lower odds of depression. This association was very similar for those who reported doing hobbies weekly (OR=0.81, 95% CI=0.73-0.89). Engagement in sport, social, or other clubs showed more of a dose-response relationship with depression. Monthly attendance was associated with a 15% (OR=0.85, 95% CI=0.77-0.94) reduction in odds of depression and weekly attendance was associated with a 22% (OR=0.78, 95% CI=0.69-0.88) reduction in odds compared to not attending clubs.

Longitudinal associations

In the unadjusted model, we found evidence that more frequent engagement in reading, baking/cooking, hobbies, and clubs were associated with lower odds of depression two years later, with the relationship for all activities apart from reading preserved in the adjusted model (Table 4). Participants who baked/cooked weekly had 15% (OR=0.85, 95% CI=0.75-0.95) lower odds of depression two years later and participants who did hobbies weekly had 19% (OR=0.81, 95% CI=0.71-0.92) lower odds of subsequent depression. Both weekly and monthly club attendance were associated with a 18% (monthly OR=0.82, 95% CI=0.73-0.93; weekly OR=0.82, 95% CI=0.71-0.94) reduction in the odds of depression two years later.

As in the unadjusted concurrent model, more frequent sewing was associated with higher odds of subsequent depression in the unadjusted model. Monthly attendance at non-religious organizations was associated with lower odds of subsequent depression than no attendance, but participants who attended organizations weekly did not show this association. After adjusting for confounders and previous depression, these associations were attenuated, although there was weak evidence that monthly (but not weekly) organization attendance was associated with lower odds of subsequent depression (OR=0.86, 95% CI=0.75-0.99).

Sensitivity analyses

Moderation by gender

In both unadjusted concurrent and longitudinal models, there was only evidence that the association between frequency of baking/cooking something special and depression differed according to gender. Concurrently, in women, both baking/cooking monthly (OR=0.68, 95% CI=0.61-0.76) and baking/cooking weekly (OR=0.58, 95% CI=0.51-0.65) were associated with lower odds of depression than not baking/cooking. However, in men, there was no association between baking/cooking frequency and concurrent depression (monthly OR=1.03, 95% CI=0.89-1.19; weekly OR=1.01, 95% CI=0.87-1.17).

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Longitudinal associations were very similar. In women, both baking/cooking monthly (OR=0.73, 95% CI=0.64-0.84) and baking/cooking weekly (OR=0.63, 95% CI=0.55-0.72) were associated with lower odds of subsequent depression than not baking/cooking. For men, frequency of baking/cooking was not associated with subsequent depression (monthly OR=0.88, 95% CI=0.74-1.04; weekly OR=0.88, 95% CI=0.75-1.04). However, after adjusting for confounders, there was no evidence for these interactions between frequency of baking/cooking and gender on concurrent or subsequent depression.

Moderation by age group

There was no evidence that the associations between frequency of engagement in any activities and concurrent depression differed according to age group. In longitudinal models, before adjustment for confounders and depression at the previous wave, there was only evidence that the association between frequency of writing and odds of subsequent depression differed according to age group. However, when examining this association separately by age group, there was no evidence that writing monthly or weekly was associated with depression in any age group, and the evidence for the interaction was attenuated after adjustment for confounders. In the fully adjusted model, there was only evidence for an interaction between frequency of baking/cooking something special and age group on subsequent odds of depression. Baking/cooking weekly was associated with 30% (OR=0.70, 95% CI=0.56-0.87) lower odds of subsequent depression compared to not baking/cooking in those aged 50-59 years, although there was no evidence that baking/cooking monthly lowered the odds of depression (OR=0.89, 95% CI=0.71-1.11). There was no evidence that frequency of baking/cooking was associated with subsequent depression in the two older age groups.

Further sensitivity analyses

Using the alternative threshold for the CES-D and repeating analyses using the CIDI-SF did not substantially alter our findings (Supplementary Tables 4-5). Including the preliminary (early release) data from the HRS 2018 wave did not substantially alter most of the findings, although there was some additional evidence that both monthly and weekly reading and weekly baking/cooking were associated with lower odds of concurrent depression after adjustment for confounders (Supplementary Table 6). Longitudinally, there was also additional evidence that weekly reading was associated with lower odds of subsequent depression, although all other findings remained similar. Differences in findings may be a result of missing confounders in the 2018 data (these analyses could not be adjusted for difficulties with ADLs and IADLs or cognition) or biases in sample selection (only participants with complete data in a previous year could be included; see Supplement).

Discussion

In this study, we explored associations between frequency of active arts engagement, including a range of activities that share similar properties of creative skill and imagination with the arts, and concurrent and subsequent depression in a large nationally representative cohort of older adults in the US. Attending a sport, social, or other club was most consistently associated with depression; both weekly and monthly attendance at a sport, social, or other club were associated with reduced odds of concurrent and subsequent depression. Spending time on a hobby weekly was also associated with lower odds of both concurrent and subsequent depression, but for monthly engagement this association was only seen concurrently, not longitudinally. Although baking/cooking something special was not associated with concurrent depression, weekly baking/cooking was associated with reduced odds of depression two years later. Writing, reading, sewing, and attending non-religious organizations were not consistently associated with concurrent or subsequent depression after adjusting for potential confounders. We found no evidence that the association between hobbies, clubs, and depression varied according to gender or age group. However, more frequent baking/cooking was only associated with lower subsequent depression in those aged 50-59, and not those 60 or older.

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Previous research has shown that attending cultural events is associated with a reduced risk of subsequent depression in older adults (Fancourt & Steptoe, 2019; Fancourt & Tymoszuk, 2019). We provide evidence that engagement in activities that involve creative skill and imagination may also have the potential to reduce depression in older adults in the US. These associations were independent of a range of demographic, socioeconomic, and health-related confounders and previous depression. Our findings are consistent with existing evidence showing that engagement in hobbies is associated with lower odds of depression in older adults (Fancourt, Opher, et al., 2020; Hirosaki et al., 2009). In addition, we have demonstrated that specific forms of arts engagement may be differentially associated with depression.

To understand why we found such strong associations between attending sports, social, or other clubs and depression, we can consider the active ingredients involved in attending these clubs, which may activate causal mechanisms that act to reduce depression (Fancourt et al., 2021). For example, one active ingredient of clubs (and hobbies if engaged in as part of a group) is the provision of social resources that can be used in the development of a social identity (Haslam et al., 2009). Social identity theory states that individuals build a sense of who they are based on their group membership (Hogg, 2006), and there is evidence that individuals with stronger social identities have lower rates of depression (Cruwys et al., 2014; Haslam et al., 2009; Postmes et al., 2019). A range of social interventions, which aim to facilitate interaction and ties among groups, are also effective in reducing depressive symptoms (Nagy & Moore, 2017).

Although attending a club was most consistently associated with depression, there were still associations between hobbies, baking/cooking, and depression after accounting for the association between clubs and depression, suggesting that hobbies and baking/cooking provide additional active ingredients. For example, by providing cognitive stimulation, these activities could activate cognitive mechanisms including enhanced cognitive restructuring (identifying problematic cognitions and rationalising and rebutting these thoughts; Fancourt et al., 2021). This is a key element of interventions such as cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT) for depression and is effective in reducing depressive symptoms (Clark, 2013). Additionally, we did not find evidence that writing, reading, or sewing were associated with depression. These are more sedentary ways of engaging in the arts, indicating that another important mechanism could be the physical activity involved in clubs, hobbies, and baking/cooking (Dunphy et al., 2019; Fancourt et al., 2021). Increased physical activity is protective against developing depression in older adults (Schuch et al., 2018) and physical fitness is associated with lower rates of depression (Kandola et al., 2019, 2020). There may also be other active ingredients of clubs, hobbies, and baking/cooking, leading to further mechanisms that reduce depression, which may interact and operate cyclically (Fancourt et al., 2021). These mechanisms should be explored further in longitudinal population-based studies.

In contrast to some previous evidence for gender-dependent associations between arts engagement and depression in working age adults (Cuyppers et al., 2012), we found no evidence that engagement in clubs, hobbies, and baking/cooking differentially affected depression in men and women. This is promising as these types of activities may be equally beneficial across genders, even if there are gender differences in the frequency of engaging in them. We did not expect to find age differences in the association between baking/cooking something special and depression. It is possible that adults aged 50-59 were more likely to bake or cook for friends or family, and thus more frequent engagement in this activity was an indicator of more frequent social interactions in this age group, which were then associated with reduced odds of subsequent depression (Kawachi & Berkman, 2001). However, adjusting for social network composition did not attenuate this association.

This study has a number of strengths. HRS is a large nationally representative cohort of older adults in the US. The longitudinal data allowed us to investigate population-averaged concurrent and longitudinal associations between arts engagement and depression, whilst controlling for previous depression and a broad range of confounders. We were able to use alternative indicators of depression in sensitivity analyses, which did not alter our findings. However, we were also limited by the measures used in HRS. The way in

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

which questions were asked limits investigation of demographic factors and makes the extent of arts engagement unclear. Both attending a sport, social or other club and meetings of a non-religious organization could have involved arts engagement or could have been unrelated to the arts. The social nature of activities (alone or with others) was not recorded, so it remains to be explored whether more social activities have a stronger association with depression in older adults. We also could not analyze effects of antidepressant use, but previous research has demonstrated that medication did not alter time spent on active leisure activities such as hobbies, suggesting that medication would not be a confounder (Barge-Schaapveld et al., 1995).

Additionally, we recognize that gender is not a binary construct and that, due to the way in which the data was collected, we had to treat it as such. There is a need for research that acknowledges the wider range of genders. Further, as HRS combined a range of races/ethnicities into the Other race/ethnicity category, we were not able to investigate the influence of race identities, and associated racism and cultural caste systems, on the relationship between arts engagement and depression. Further research should investigate the nature of structural racism in research instruments, methods of data collection, analysis and translation. Our study explored the associations between arts engagement and depression at a population level, which conflates experiences across people, so future research should give particular attention to unique patterns and needs of different racial/ethnic groups, who may experience distinctive stressors and outcomes (Fernando, 1984; Williams, 2018).

Our findings indicate that active forms of engagement in arts and creative activities, which may be more accessible to older adults than attending cultural events, are independently associated with reduced odds of depression. These associations may occur through the activation of mechanisms such as increased social identity, cognitive stimulation, creativity and self-expression, and physical activity. Associations persist across genders and age groups, holding promise for many older adults in the US. The potential of these home-based activities to reduce depression is particularly important in the wake of COVID-19 with the closure of many arts venues. It is possible that an individual's own choices of activities, be it clubs, hobbies, or baking/cooking, are more beneficial for their mental health than creative arts interventions that often only provide the opportunity to engage in a specific activity (Curtis et al., 2018; Dunphy et al., 2019). Policy makers should consider how older adults across demographic groups can be encouraged and supported to engage in activities of their choice, which may help to prevent or reduce depression as they age. For example, in the United Kingdom, social prescribing systems allow practitioners in primary care settings to connect older adults to community groups (such as arts activities and cooking), which may improve health and wellbeing (Drinkwater et al., 2019). Similar systems could be tested to establish whether they have the potential to reduce the risk of depression in older adults in the US.

References

- Barge-Schaapveld, D. Q. C. M., Nicolson, N. A., van der Hoop, R. G., & DeVries, M. W. (1995). Changes in daily life experience associated with clinical improvement in depression. *Journal of Affective Disorders*, *34*(2), 139–154. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0327\(95\)00012-C](https://doi.org/10.1016/0165-0327(95)00012-C)
- Bone, J. K., Bu, F., Fluharty, M., Paul, E., Sonke, J. K., & Fancourt, D. (2021). Who engages in the arts in the United States? A comparison of three types of engagement using data from the General Social Survey. *In Preparation*.
- Bugliari, D., Carroll, J., Hayden, O., Hayes, J., Hurd, M., Karabatakis, A., Main, R., Marks, J., McCullough, C., Meijer, E., Moldoff, M., Pantoja, P., Rohwedder, S., & St.Clair, P. (2020). *RAND HRS Longitudinal File 2016 (V2) Documentation*.
- Clark, D. A. (2013). Cognitive Restructuring. *The Wiley Handbook of Cognitive Behavioral Therapy*, *1*, 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781118528563.wbcbt02>
- Cruwys, T., Haslam, S. A., Dingle, G. A., Haslam, C., & Jetten, J. (2014). Depression and Social Identity: An Integrative Review. *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, *18*(3), 215–238. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1088868314523839>
- Curtis, A., Gibson, L., O'Brien, M., & Roe, B. (2018). Systematic review of the impact of arts for health activities on health, wellbeing and quality of life of older people living in care homes. *Dementia*, *17*(6), 645–669. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1471301217740960>
- Cuyppers, K., Krokstad, S., Holmen, T. L., Knudtsen, M. S., Bygren, L. O., & Holmen, J. (2012). Patterns of receptive and creative cultural activities and their association with perceived health, anxiety, depression and satisfaction with life among adults: The HUNT study, Norway. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, *66*(8), 698–703. <https://doi.org/10.1136/jech.2010.113571>
- Drinkwater, C., Wildman, J., & Moffatt, S. (2019). Social prescribing. *BMJ*, *364*(March), 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.l1285>
- Dunphy, K., Baker, F. A., Dumaresq, E., Carroll-Haskins, K., Eickholt, J., Ercole, M., Kaimal, G., Meyer, K., Sajjani, N., Shamir, O. Y., & Wosch, T. (2019). Creative arts interventions to address depression in older adults: A systematic review of outcomes, processes, and mechanisms. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *9*(JAN). <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2018.02655>
- Elsden, E., & Roe, B. (2020). Does arts engagement and cultural participation impact depression outcomes in adults: a narrative descriptive systematic review of observational studies. *Journal of Public Mental Health*. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JPMH-06-2020-0060>
- Fancourt, D., Aughterson, H., Finn, S., Walker, E., & Steptoe, A. (2021). How leisure activities affect health: A review and multi-level theoretical framework of mechanisms of action using the lens of complex adaptive systems science. *The Lancet Psychiatry*. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2215-0366\(20\)30384-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2215-0366(20)30384-9)
- Fancourt, D., & Finn, S. (2019). *What is the evidence on the role of the arts in improving health and well-being? A scoping review*.
- Fancourt, D., Opher, S., & De Oliveira, C. (2020). Fixed-Effects Analyses of Time-Varying Associations between Hobbies and Depression in a Longitudinal Cohort Study: Support for Social Prescribing? *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics*, *89*(2), 111–113. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000503571>
- Fancourt, D., & Steptoe, A. (2019). Cultural engagement and mental health: Does socio-economic status explain the association? *Social Science and Medicine*, *236*(February), 112425. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2019.112425>
- Fancourt, D., & Tymoszuk, U. (2019). Cultural engagement and incident depression in older adults: Evidence from the English Longitudinal Study of Ageing. *British Journal of Psychiatry*, *214*(4), 225–229. <https://doi.org/10.1192/bjp.2018.267>
- Fancourt, D., Warran, K., & Aughterson, H. (2020). *Evidence Summary for Policy: The role of the arts in improving health & wellbeing*.
- Fernando, S. (1984). Racism as a cause of depression. *International Journal of Social Psychiatry*, *30*(1–2), 41–49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/002076408403000107>
- Fluharty, M., Paul, E., Bone, J. K., Bu, F., Sonke, J. K., & Fancourt, D. (2021). Differences in predictors and

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

- barriers to arts and cultural engagement with age in the United States: A cross-sectional analysis using the Health and Retirement Study. *In Preparation*.
- Gibson, C., & Jung, K. (2002). *Historical Census Statistics on Population Totals by Race, 1790 to 1990, and by Hispanic Origin, 1970 to 1990, for the United States, Regions, Divisions, and States*.
- Haslam, S. A., Jetten, J., Postmes, T., & Haslam, C. (2009). Social identity, health and well-being: An emerging agenda for applied psychology. *Applied Psychology, 58*(1), 1–23. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1464-0597.2008.00379.x>
- Hirosaki, M., Ishimoto, Y., Kasahara, Y., Kimura, Y., Konno, A., Sakamoto, R., Nakatsuka, M., Ishine, M., Wada, T., Okumiya, K., Fujisawa, M., Otsuka, K., & Matsubayashi, K. (2009). *Community-dwelling elderly Japanese people with hobbies are healthier than those lacking hobbies. 57*(6), 1132–1134. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1532-5415.2009.02291.x>
- Hogg, M. A. (2006). Social identity theory. In P. J. Burke (Ed.), *Contemporary Social Psychological Theories*. Stanford University Press.
- Kandola, A., Ashdown-Franks, G., Stubbs, B., Osborn, D. P. J., & Hayes, J. F. (2019). The association between cardiorespiratory fitness and the incidence of common mental health disorders: A systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Affective Disorders, 257*(July), 748–757. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2019.07.088>
- Kandola, A., Osborn, D. P. J., Stubbs, B., Choi, K. W., & Hayes, J. F. (2020). Individual and combined associations between cardiorespiratory fitness and grip strength with common mental disorders: a prospective cohort study in the UK Biobank. *BMC Medicine, 18*(1), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12916-020-01782-9>
- Kawachi, I., & Berkman, L. F. (2001). Social ties and mental health. *Journal of Urban Health, 78*(3), 458–467. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jurban/78.3.458>
- Nagy, E., & Moore, S. (2017). Social interventions: An effective approach to reduce adult depression? *Journal of Affective Disorders, 218*(September 2016), 131–152. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jad.2017.04.043>
- Nelson, C. B., Kessler, R. C., & Mroczek, D. (1998). *Scoring the World Health Organization's composite international diagnostic interview short form (CIDI-SF; v1. 0 NOV98)*.
- Ofstedal, M. B., Weir, D. R., Kuang-Tsung, C., & Wagner, J. (2011). Updates to HRS Sample Weights. *HRS Documentation Report, June, 24*. <http://hrsonline.isr.umich.edu/sitedocs/userg/dr-013.pdf>
- Postmes, T., Wichmann, L. J., van Valkengoed, A. M., & van der Hoef, H. (2019). Social identification and depression: A meta-analysis. *European Journal of Social Psychology, 49*(1), 110–126. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ejsp.2508>
- Rajan, K. B., & Rajan, R. S. (2017). *Staying engaged: Health patterns of older Americans who participate in the arts, an analysis based on the Health and Retirement Study*. <https://www.arts.gov/partnerships/task-force>
- Schuch, F. B., Vancampfort, D., Firth, J., Rosenbaum, S., Ward, P. B., Silva, E. S., Hallgren, M., De Leon, A. P., Dunn, A. L., Deslandes, A. C., Fleck, M. P., Carvalho, A. F., & Stubbs, B. (2018). Physical activity and incident depression: A meta-analysis of prospective cohort studies. *American Journal of Psychiatry, 175*(7), 631–648. <https://doi.org/10.1176/appi.ajp.2018.17111194>
- Smith, J., Ryan, L., Fisher, G. G., Sonnega, A., & Weir, D. (2017). *Psychosocial and Lifestyle Questionnaire 2006 - 2016*. <https://hrs.isr.umich.edu/publications/biblio/9066>
- Sonnega, A., Faul, J. D., Ofstedal, M. B., Langa, K. M., Phillips, J. W. R., & Weir, D. R. (2014). Cohort profile: The Health and Retirement Study (HRS). *International Journal of Epidemiology, 43*(2), 576–585. <https://doi.org/10.1093/ije/dyu067>
- StataCorp. (2019). *Stata Statistical Software: Release 16*. StataCorp LP.
- Steffens, D. C., Fisher, G. G., Langa, K. M., Potter, G. G., & Plassman, B. L. (2009). Prevalence of depression among older Americans: The aging, demographics and memory study. *International Psychogeriatrics, 21*(5), 879–888. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1041610209990044>
- Steffick, D. E. (2000). *Documentation of Affective Functioning Measures in the Health and Retirement Study*. hrsonline.isr.umich.edu/sitedocs/userg/dr-009.pdf
- Turvey, C. L., Wallace, R. B., & Herzog, R. (1999). A revised CES-D measure of depressive symptoms and a

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

- DSM-based measure of major depressive episodes in the elderly. *International Psychogeriatrics*, 11(2), 139–148. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1041610299005694>
- Twisk, J. W. R. (2003). *Applied Longitudinal Data Analysis for Epidemiology: A Practical Guide*. Cambridge University Press.
- Vespa, J., Medina, L., & Armstrong, D. (2020). Demographic turning points for the United States: Population projections for 2020 to 2060. In *Current Population Reports*. <https://census.gov/programs-surveys/popproj.html>
- Wang, S., Mak, H. W., & Fancourt, D. (2020). Arts, mental distress, mental health functioning & life satisfaction: Fixed-effects analyses of a nationally-representative panel study. *BMC Public Health*, 20(1), 1–18. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-019-8109-y>
- White, I. R., Royston, P., & Wood, A. M. (2011). Multiple imputation using chained equations: Issues and guidance for practice. *Statistics in Medicine*, 30(4), 377–399. <https://doi.org/10.1002/sim.4067>
- Williams, D. R. (2018). Stress and the Mental Health of Populations of Color: Advancing Our Understanding of Race-related Stressors. *Journal of Health and Social Behavior*, 59(4), 466–485. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022146518814251>
- World Health Organization. (2015). *World Report on Ageing and Health*.
- Zivin, K., Llewellyn, D. J., Lang, I. A., Vijan, S., Kabeto, M. U., Miller, E. M., & Langa, K. M. (2010). Depression among older adults in the United States and England. *American Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*, 18(11), 1036–1044. <https://doi.org/10.1097/JGP.0b013e3181dba6d2>

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Table 1. Demographic characteristics of the sample at baseline and percentage of the sample with depression at baseline according to demographic characteristics.

	Overall	Depression	
		No	Yes
Overall	-	80%	20%
Gender			
Women	55%	77%	23%
Men	45%	83%	17%
Race/ethnicity			
White	85%	81%	19%
Black	10%	71%	29%
Other	5%	70%	30%
Education			
None	16%	65%	35%
High School	53%	79%	21%
College	20%	87%	13%
Postgraduate	11%	90%	10%
Age			
50-59	35%	78%	22%
60-69	33%	83%	17%
70-79	19%	79%	21%
≥80	13%	75%	25%
Marital status			
Married	62%	85%	15%
Unmarried	38%	71%	29%
Employment status			
Employed	40%	87%	13%
Not working	13%	61%	39%
Retired	47%	78%	22%
Household income			
<\$19,000	21%	63%	37%
\$19,000-\$39,999	23%	76%	24%
\$40,000-\$79,999	28%	84%	16%
≥\$80,000	28%	90%	10%
Neighborhood safety			
Excellent/good	91%	81%	19%
Fair/poor	9%	60%	40%
Social network			
Less diverse	47%	73%	27%
More diverse	53%	85%	15%
Difficulty with ADLs			
None	84%	85%	15%
One or more	16%	50%	50%
Difficulty with IADLs			
None	86%	85%	15%
One or more	14%	47%	53%
Long-term conditions			
None	14%	88%	12%
One or more	86%	78%	22%
Cognition (quartiles)			
0	22%	69%	31%
1	33%	78%	22%
2	23%	84%	16%
3	22%	86%	14%

Note. N=14,255. Results weighted and based on 20 multiply imputed data sets. The Other race/ethnicity category included people who identified as American Indian, Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander, Hispanic, and Other ethnicities.

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Table 2. *Frequency of arts engagement at baseline.*

	Reading	Writing	Baking/cooking	Sewing	Hobby	Club	Organization
None	6%	61%	31%	86%	43%	64%	81%
Monthly	9%	20%	28%	7%	25%	22%	15%
Weekly	85%	19%	41%	7%	32%	14%	4%

Note. N=14,255. Results weighted and based on 20 multiply imputed data sets.

Table 3. *Concurrent models testing associations between frequency of arts engagement and the odds of depression.*

	Model 1: Unadjusted			Model 2: Adjusted		
	OR	95% CI	p value	OR	95% CI	p value
Reading						
Monthly	0.72	0.62-0.83	<0.001	1.00	0.85-1.17	0.959
Weekly	0.55	0.49-0.62	<0.001	0.92	0.80-1.05	0.206
Writing						
Monthly	1.07	0.98-1.17	0.123	1.03	0.93-1.14	0.531
Weekly	0.98	0.89-1.08	0.714	0.98	0.88-1.09	0.725
Baking/cooking						
Monthly	0.93	0.85-1.01	0.103	0.98	0.89-1.08	0.689
Weekly	0.84	0.77-0.92	<0.001	0.91	0.82-1.01	0.084
Sewing						
Monthly	1.09	0.94-1.26	0.242	0.92	0.79-1.08	0.314
Weekly	1.34	1.16-1.54	<0.001	1.05	0.89-1.23	0.586
Hobby						
Monthly	0.62	0.57-0.68	<0.001	0.80	0.72-0.88	<0.001
Weekly	0.62	0.57-0.68	<0.001	0.81	0.73-0.89	<0.001
Club						
Monthly	0.68	0.62-0.74	<0.001	0.85	0.77-0.94	0.001
Weekly	0.61	0.54-0.68	<0.001	0.78	0.69-0.88	<0.001
Organization						
Monthly	0.91	0.81-1.01	0.086	0.98	0.87-1.10	0.716
Weekly	1.21	1.01-1.44	0.034	1.20	0.98-1.46	0.073

Note. N=19,276. For all activities, no engagement was the reference category. Model 2 was adjusted for gender, race/ethnicity, education, age, marital status, employment status, household income, neighborhood safety, social network, difficulty with ADLs and IADLs, long-term conditions, and cognition. Results weighted and based on 20 multiply imputed data sets.

This manuscript is a preprint which has not been peer reviewed.

Table 4. Longitudinal models testing associations between frequency of arts engagement and the odds of depression in the subsequent wave (two years later).

	Model 1: Unadjusted			Model 2: Adjusted		
	OR	95% CI	p value	OR	95% CI	p value
Reading						
Monthly	0.72	0.61-0.86	<0.001	1.03	0.83-1.26	0.811
Weekly	0.51	0.44-0.59	<0.001	0.85	0.71-1.02	0.074
Writing						
Monthly	0.97	0.88-1.08	0.577	0.89	0.79-1.01	0.063
Weekly	1.01	0.91-1.13	0.857	1.00	0.88-1.14	0.980
Baking/cooking						
Monthly	0.94	0.85-1.03	0.193	0.90	0.80-1.02	0.100
Weekly	0.87	0.78-0.96	0.004	0.85	0.75-0.95	0.005
Sewing						
Monthly	1.25	1.07-1.46	0.005	1.02	0.85-1.23	0.796
Weekly	1.25	1.06-1.47	0.007	0.89	0.74-1.06	0.196
Hobby						
Monthly	0.73	0.66-0.81	<0.001	1.01	0.90-1.14	0.877
Weekly	0.59	0.53-0.65	<0.001	0.81	0.71-0.92	0.001
Club						
Monthly	0.67	0.61-0.74	<0.001	0.82	0.73-0.93	0.001
Weekly	0.61	0.54-0.69	<0.001	0.82	0.71-0.94	0.005
Organization						
Monthly	0.84	0.75-0.95	0.005	0.86	0.75-0.99	0.041
Weekly	1.15	0.94-1.4	0.166	1.09	0.87-1.38	0.442

Note. N=16,043. For all activities, no engagement was the reference category. Model 2 was adjusted for depression at the previous wave, gender, race/ethnicity, education, age, marital status, employment status, household income, neighborhood safety, social network, difficulty with ADLs and IADLs, long-term conditions, and cognition. Results weighted and based on 20 multiply imputed data sets.