

SARS-CoV-2 seropositivity after infection and antibody response to mRNA-based vaccination

Emily J. Ciccone, MD, MHS¹, Deanna R. Zhu, BA², Rawan Ajeen, BSPH², Bonnie E. Shook-Sa, DrPH³, Ross M. Boyce MD, MSc¹, Allison E. Aiello, PhD, MS^{2*}, and the COVID HCP Study Team

¹Division of Infectious Diseases, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina

²Department of Epidemiology, Gillings School of Global Public Health, University of North Carolina

³Department of Biostatistics, Gillings School of Global Public Health, University of North Carolina

COVID HCP Study Team (alphabetical order):

- Haley Abernathy, BS – Institute for Global Health and Infectious Diseases, University of North Carolina
- Naseem Alavian, MD, MHS – Department of Hospital Medicine, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina
- Cherese Beatty, MPH - Department of Epidemiology, Gillings School of Global Public Health, University of North Carolina
- Christy Chung, BA - Institute for Global Health and Infectious Diseases, University of North Carolina
- Haley E. Garrett, BS - Department of Epidemiology, Gillings School of Global Public Health, University of North Carolina
- Jonathan J. Juliano, MD, MSPH - Division of Infectious Diseases, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina
- Elise King, BA - Institute for Global Health and Infectious Diseases, University of North Carolina
- Evans Lodge, BA, BS- Department of Epidemiology, Gillings School of Global Public Health, University of North Carolina
- Alena J. Markmann, MD, PhD - Division of Infectious Diseases, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina
- Carmen E. Mendoza, BS – Department of Epidemiology, Gillings School of Global Public Health, University of North Carolina
- Raquel Reyes, MD, MPA – Department of Hospital Medicine, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina
- Jasmine L. Taylor, MPH - Institute for Global Health and Infectious Diseases, University of North Carolina
- David J. Weber, MD, MPH - Division of Infectious Diseases, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina

***Corresponding Author Information:**

Gillings School of Global Public Health, CB #7435, Chapel Hill, NC 27599, USA

Email: aaiello@email.unc.edu

Abstract

The effect of SARS-CoV-2 seropositivity on the immune response to mRNA-based SARS-CoV-2 vaccines has not been well-described. Here we report longitudinal SARS-CoV-2-specific antibody responses pre- and post-vaccination among a cohort of healthcare personnel, with and without prior infection, from a large academic medical center. Our results provide preliminary evidence that prior SARS-CoV-2 infection may prime the response to the first mRNA-based SARS-CoV-2 vaccine dose. These findings could have significant impact on the allocation of mRNA-based vaccines and support the need for future research into the effect of prior infection on magnitude and durability of vaccination response.

Introduction

The impact of prior SARS-CoV-2 infection on antibody response to mRNA-based vaccines has not been well-characterized. Early reports suggest that it may prime the immune response to the first vaccine dose, but these reports did not include longitudinal antibody levels before vaccination.¹⁻³ This information is important as the timing of natural infection in relation to vaccination may impact response. The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) recently suggested that individuals with documented immunity might defer vaccination for 90 days to expedite access for those without immunity, but data supporting these guidelines are limited.⁴ Here, we examined longitudinal SARS-CoV-2 antibody responses among healthcare personnel (HCP) with and without prior infection to examine the impact of natural infection on vaccination response.

Methods

We conducted a longitudinal study of HCP at a large medical center that began enrolling in July 2020.⁵ Participants provided blood samples every two weeks for the first 12 weeks and monthly thereafter. mRNA-based SARS-CoV-2 vaccinations (Pfizer-BioNTech [BNT162b2] and Moderna [mRNA-1273]) became available to HCP on December 16, 2020. For all pre- and post-vaccination samples, we measured total immunoglobulin antibodies specific to the receptor binding domain of the SARS-CoV-2 spike protein by ELISA with a positive to negative ratio (P/N) cut-off of 2.57 to ensure 99.5% specificity per CDC guidelines.^{6,7} Exact Wilcoxon rank sum tests were used to compare median P/N between seropositive and seronegative participants and change in P/N for those with paired pre- and post-vaccination measurements.

Results

As of February 2, 2021, the study enrolled 213 HCP with 194 (91%) providing at least one blood sample. One individual was excluded due to co-enrollment in a SARS-CoV-2 treatment trial. Table 1 presents the cohort demographics. Five participants (3%) had antibodies to SARS-CoV-2 at their baseline study visit (prevalent seropositive; Figure 1A). Notably, one demonstrated persistent seropositivity for six months, while another remained seropositive for over three months before reverting to seronegative one month prior to vaccination. Five participants (3%) became seropositive during the study (incident seropositive; Figure 1A); four (80%) reported COVID-19 symptoms at seroconversion.

Most participants (96%, 187/193) received at least one dose of a SARS-CoV-2 mRNA-based vaccine. Antibody measurements after at least one vaccine dose were available for 60% (6/10) of seropositive and 44% (81/183) of seronegative participants. Those who were seropositive at any point developed a two-fold higher antibody response to their first vaccine dose (V1) compared to those who were seronegative (median P/N 13.8 vs. 7.0; $p=0.008$; Figure 1B). Additionally, the post-V1 antibody levels in seropositive participants were similar to those of seronegative participants after the second vaccine dose (13.8 vs. 13.2; $p=0.768$). The magnitude of the increase in antibody levels from pre-vaccination to post-V1 was greater for seropositive than seronegative participants (change in P/N 8.6 vs. 5.4, $p=0.14$).

Discussion

Our findings provide preliminary evidence that prior SARS-CoV-2 infection may prime the primary vaccination response, corroborating recent non-peer-reviewed findings.¹⁻³ Specifically, we observed that the response to one vaccine dose among seropositive individuals was of similar magnitude to that of seronegative individuals to two vaccine doses. Additionally, our results suggest that the magnitude of the increase in antibody levels in response to the first dose of vaccine might be larger for seropositive than seronegative individuals. Future research on the durability of response to the first dose of SARS-CoV-2 vaccine among previously infected

individuals, and the impact of time between infection and vaccination, will help guide the allocation of the limited supply of mRNA-based vaccines. As 27 million Americans have been infected with SARS-CoV-2 to date, the potential ability for some individuals to forgo a second vaccination may have substantial impact on vaccination distribution strategies.

Acknowledgements

We thank the participants for their willingness to contribute to advancing our understanding of the SARS-CoV-2 epidemic and its impact on healthcare personnel, especially during the early and uncertain months of the pandemic. We also appreciate the hard work of the graduate student assistants from the University of North Carolina Gillings School of Global Public Health (Elle Law, BS, Elyse Miller, BA, and Paul Zivich, MPH) and the phlebotomists who contributed to the sample collection, protocols, and day-to-day implementation of the study (these individuals received compensation for their work on the study). We acknowledge Premkumar Lakshmanane, PhD who spearheaded development of the ELISA assay and produced and supplied the necessary antigens for the study through funding from the National Cancer Institute [1U54CA260543]. Finally, we thank Subhashini Sellers, MD, MSc and Meghan Rebuli, PhD (University of North Carolina School of Medicine) and Bailey Fosdick, PhD (Colorado State University Department of Statistics) for their support of this study and its analysis. These contributors did not receive any contribution for their role in the study.

Conflicts of Interest

The authors report no conflicts of interest.

Funding/Support

This project was supported by funds from the following sources:

- 2007 Gillings Gift at the UNC Gillings School of Global Public Health (AEA)
- North Carolina Policy Collaboratory at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill with funding from the North Carolina Coronavirus Relief Fund established and appropriated by the North Carolina General Assembly (EJC, RMB, RA, DRZ)
- UNC School of Medicine (RMB)
- A generous donation to the UNC School of Medicine by an anonymous donor (RMB)
- National Institute of Occupational Safety and Health through Grant Award Number [75D30121P10086 0000HCCK-2021] (AEA, EJC)
- National Science Foundation through Grant Award Number NSF 20-4353 (AEA)
- National Institutes of Health through Grant Award Number R01 EB0225021 (AEA)
- National Center for Advancing Translational Sciences (NCATS), National Institutes of Health, through Grant Award Number UL1TR001111 supported the use of the REDCap database. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the NIH.

In addition, EJC is supported by the National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute through Grant Award Number [5T32HL007106-43], RMB is supported by the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases through Grant Award Number [5K23AI141764-03], and BES is supported by the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill Center for AIDS Research (CFAR), an NIH funded program P30 AI050410.

The funding organizations/sponsors were not involved in the design and conduct of the study; collection, management, analysis, and interpretation of the data; preparation, review, or approval of the manuscript; and the decision to submit the manuscript for publication.

References

1. Krammer F, Srivastava K, Simon V, PARIS team. Robust spike antibody responses and increased reactogenicity in seropositive individuals after a single dose of SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine. *medRxiv*. Published online February 1, 2021. doi:10.1101/2021.01.29.21250653
2. Saadat S, Rikhtegaran-Tehrani Z, Logue J, et al. Single dose vaccination in healthcare workers previously infected with SARS-CoV-2. *medRxiv*. Published online February 1, 2021. doi:10.1101/2021.01.30.21250843
3. Bradley T, Grundberg E, Selvarangan R, CODIEFY study team. Antibody responses boosted in seropositive healthcare workers after single dose of SARS-CoV-2 mRNA vaccine. *medRxiv*. Published online February 5, 2021. doi:10.1101/2021.02.03.21251078
4. Interim Clinical Considerations for Use of mRNA COVID-19 Vaccines. Published January 28, 2021. Accessed February 4, 2021. <https://www.cdc.gov/vaccines/covid-19/info-by-product/clinical-considerations.html>
5. Ciccone EJ, Zivich PN, Lodge EK, et al. SARS-CoV-2 infection in healthcare personnel and their household contacts at a tertiary academic medical center: Protocol for a longitudinal cohort study (preprint). *JMIR Preprints*. Published online November 17, 2020. doi:10.2196/preprints.25410
6. CDC. Interim Guidelines for COVID-19 Antibody Testing. Published November 15, 2020. Accessed January 31, 2021. <https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/lab/resources/antibody-tests-guidelines.html>
7. Premkumar L, Segovia-Chumbez B, Jadi R, et al. The receptor binding domain of the viral spike protein is an immunodominant and highly specific target of antibodies in SARS-CoV-2 patients. *Sci Immunol*. 2020;5(48). doi:10.1126/sciimmunol.abc8413 [preprint]

Table 1. Demographics, serostatus, and vaccinations for the entire cohort and the sub-sample with paired pre- and post-vaccination antibody measurements.

Characteristics	Total study population (n=193)	Participants with pre- and post-vaccine antibody results (n=87)^a
Age (median, IQR)	38.1 (31-44)	38.7 (31.5-44)
Female sex (n (%))	132 (68)	59 (68)
Race/Ethnicity (n (%))		
<i>Non-Hispanic (of any race)</i>	183 (95)	85 (98)
<i>Non-Hispanic White</i>	138 (72)	65 (75)
<i>Non-Hispanic Black</i>	8 (4)	2 (2)
<i>Non-Hispanic Asian</i>	11 (6)	5 (6)
<i>Non-Hispanic Other or 2 or more races</i>	10 (5)	6 (7)
<i>Unidentified/Non-Hispanic Unknown</i>	16 (8)	7 (8)
<i>Hispanic (of any race)</i>	10 (5)	2 (2)
Serostatus prior to vaccination (n (%))		
<i>Seronegative</i>	183 (96)	81 (93)
<i>Seropositive at study enrollment</i>	5 (3)	4 (5)
<i>Incident Seropositive</i>	5 (3)	2 (2)
Vaccinations received to date (n (%))		
<i>None</i>	6 (3)	N/A
<i>1 dose</i>	9 (5)	3 (3)
<i>2 doses</i>	178 (95)	84 (97)

^aPost-vaccine refers to after at least one dose

Figure 1. Antibody levels of healthcare personnel over time (A) and in response to vaccination (B). Panel A demonstrates the change in antibody levels over time in SARS-CoV-2 seronegative and seropositive individuals, including those who were seropositive at the time of enrollment (prevalent seropositive) and those who became seropositive over the study period (incident seropositive). The dotted grey line represents a P/N ratio of 2.57, which is the ELISA cut-off associated with 99.5% specificity (SARS-CoV-2 Ig-positive above the line, Ig-negative below). The x-axis represents the number of days to vaccination, and values occurring after day 0 represent the antibody response post-vaccine dose 1. Panel B shows box plots with the median and interquartile range of P/N ratios for pre-vaccination, post-vaccine dose 1, and post-vaccine dose 2 by serostatus. The upper whisker extends to the largest value no further than $1.5 * IQR$ from the hinge. The lower whisker extends to the smallest value at most $1.5 * IQR$ of the hinge. Data beyond the end of the whiskers are outliers. Seronegative (n(-)) individuals are shown as circles and seropositive (n(+)) individuals as triangles with grey and light blue lines connecting participants over time. For the pre-vaccine time point, the most recent antibody level prior to vaccination (for those who were vaccinated) or most recent antibody level overall (for those who were not vaccinated) is shown. The black numbers next to the triangles in the Post Dose 1 plot indicate the number of days between vaccination and blood sample collection for seropositive individuals (median 9, range 6-20). For seronegative participants, the median time between the first vaccine dose and sample collection was 16 days (range 1 to 34 days).

