Applying a Prospective Space-Time Scan Statistic to Examine the Evolution of COVID 10 Clusters in the State of São Poulo, Progil

- 2 Evolution of COVID-19 Clusters in the State of São Paulo, Brazil.
- 3 Authors & Affiliations: Ferreira, R.V.¹, Martines, M. R², Toppa, R. H.³, Assunção, L.
- 4 M.⁴, Desjardins, M.R.⁵ & Delmelle, E.M.⁶
- ¹Department of Geography, Federal University of Triângulo Mineiro, Uberaba Campus,
- 6 State of Minas Gerais, Brazil Research Group: Center for Studies in Landscape Feelogy and Conservation
- 7 Ecology and Conservation. 2 D
- ² Department of Geography, Tourism and Humanities, Federal University of São Carlos,
- 9 Sorocaba, SP, Brazil Research Group: Center for Studies in Landscape Ecology and
 10 Conservation.
- ³Department of Environmental Sciences, Federal University of São Carlos, Sorocaba,
- 12 SP, Brazil Research Group: Center for Studies in Landscape Ecology and
- 13 Conservation.
- ⁴Faculty of Law, State University of Minas Gerais, Ituiutaba Campus, Brazil.
- ⁵Department of Epidemiology, Spatial Science for Public Health Center, Johns Hopkins
- 16 Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, USA, 21205
- ⁶Department of Geography and Earth Sciences, Center for Applied Geographic
- 18 Information Science, University of North Carolina at Charlotte, Charlotte, NC, USA,
- 19 28223
- 20

21 Abstract

- 22 We present the first geographic study that uses space-time statistics to monitor COVID-
- 19 in Brazil. The first cases of COVID-19 were confirmed in December 2019 in Wuhan,
- 24 China, caused by the contamination of the SARS-CoV-2 virus, and quickly turned into a
- 25 pandemic. In Brazil, the first case occurred on January 23rd, 2020 but was officially
- reported by the Brazilian Ministry of Health on February 25th. Since then, the number
- of deaths and people infected by COVID-19 in Brazil have been steadily increasing.
- 28 Despite the underreporting of coronavirus cases by government agencies across the
- 29 country, the State of São Paulo has the highest rate among all Brazilian States. Thus, it
- 30 is essential to detect which areas contain the highest concentration of COVID-19 to
- 31 implement public policies, to mitigate the spread of the epidemic. To identify these
- 32 critical areas, we utilized daily confirmed case data from the Brasil.IO website between
- 33 February 25th, 2020 to May 5th, 2020; which were aggregated to the municipality level.
- 34 A prospective space-time scan statistic was applied to evaluate possible active clusters
- in three different time periods. The results visualize the space-time evolution and
- 36 dynamics of COVID-19 clusters in the State of São Paulo. Since the first study period,
- 37 the results highlight approximately 4.6 times the number of municipalities belonging to
- a significant cluster with a RR>1 on May 5^{th} . These results can inform health
- authorities and public management to take the necessary measures to minimize the
 transmission of COVID-19 and track the evolution of significant space-time clusters
- transmission of COVID-19 and track the evolution of significant space-time clusters.
- 41 Keywords: Relative risk, Space-time statistics, COVID-19, Geographic Information
- 42 Systems, Disease surveillance
- 43 **Funding**: The authors received no specific funding for this work.
- 44

45 HIGHLIGHTS

46	•	Prospective space-time statistics can improve COVID-19 surveillance in Brazil
47	•	All statistically significant clusters are located near São Paulo Municipality
48	•	There are municipalities with relative risk highest than one in the countryside
49	•	4.6 times the number of municipalities belong to a significant cluster on May 5th
50		
51		
52		
53		
54		
55		
56		
57		
58		
59		
60		
61		
62		
63		
64		
65		
66		
67		
68		
69		
70		
71		
72		
73		
74		

75 Introduction

76	After five months of the novel coronavirus disease's (COVID-19) first
77	identification in Wuhan city (Hubei province, China) in December of 2019, a new
78	research reports the virus was already spreading late December 2019 in Paris, in a
79	patient that not visited Wuhan, indicating that the epidemic started earlier (Deslandes, et
80	al. 2020). The World Health Organization (WHO) declared COVID-19 as a pandemic
81	on March 11th, 2020 (WHO, 2020). As of May 14th, 2020, there are over 4.3 million
82	confirmed cases and almost 300,000 deaths, globally (Dong et al. 2020). The
83	asymptomatic rate of may be between 40%-60% (He et al. 2020; Nishiura et al. 2020),
84	essentially indicating that a large proportion of infected individuals are "silent carriers".
85	Furthermore, the basic reproductive number (R_0) is estimated between 1.4 and 6.49,
86	making the SARS-CoV-2 virus substantially more contagious than influenza and other
87	coronaviruses like MERS-CoV and SARS-CoV (Liu et al. 2020). Symptomatic cases
88	are mostly mild (approximately 80%), while severe cases include clinical manifestations
89	such as pneumonia, multi-organ failure, and death (Ruan et al. 2020; Mahase 2020).
90	The highest proportion of deaths occur in the elderly, immunocompromised
91	populations, and those with preexisting conditions such as heart disease and
92	hypertension (Wu and McGoogan 2020). Conversely, severe outcomes and deaths have
93	also been reported in children, (Deyà-Martínez et al. 2020; Fabre et al. 2020; Jones et al.
94	2020). Furthermore, there is currently no known level of immunity to SARS-CoV-2
95	(Osman et al. 2020), therefore, spatiotemporal surveillance of COVID-19 can be a
96	powerful tool to mitigate transmission risk (Yang et al. 2020). In this study, we focus
97	our efforts on the State of São Paulo, Brazil.
98	Brazil reported the first case on January 23rd 2020, in São Paulo Municipality,
99	but the precise time in which the virus began to spread locally is currently unknown, but
100	probably started to spread locally before the date set by the government (Delatorre et. al.

101	2020). However, the Brazilian Ministry of Health reported officially that the first case
102	occurred on February 25th, 2020, in São Paulo State (Brasil, 2020a). The World Health
103	Organization (WHO) declared COVID-19 a pandemic on March 11th, 2020 (WHO,
104	2020). In Brazil on May 11th, 2020, there were 162,622 confirmed cases, 11,123
105	confirmed deaths, and a lethality rate of 6.8% (Brasil, 2020b). However, a high
106	underreporting of deaths is expected due to testing lags and lack of testing resources and
107	utilization (Alonso et al. 2020). Even more critical is that Brazil exhibits one of the
108	highest transmission rate among the 48 countries surveyed by the Imperial College of
109	London (BHATIA, 2020). Large cities such as São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro are
110	emerging as the main epicenters of the epidemic (The Lancet Editorial, 2020). There are
111	indications of faster spreading within the State of São Paulo (FIOCRUZ, 2020), where
112	smaller population municipalities have limited access to hospital care.
113	Monitoring the spread of COVID-19 is essential to develop health strategies,
114	such as making tests and hospital beds available. The prospective space-time scan
115	statistic (Kulldorff, 1997) is a powerful exploratory approach for detecting active and
116	emerging clusters of disease, identifying locations that are currently experiencing excess
117	incidence of cases on the most recent time period in a dataset. The statistic determines
118	if the observed space-time patterns of disease are randomly distributed or exhibit
119	statistically significant clustering. It utilizes cylindrical scanning windows of different
120	spatial and temporal dimensions to systematically scan the study area and period for
121	excess incidence of disease cases (e.g. more observed than expected cases given
122	baseline conditions). The prospective version of the scan statistic will disregard clusters
123	that may have previously existed and only detect clusters that are an active and
124	emerging public health threat (Kuldorff 2001). This is different than the retrospective
125	space-time scan statistic, which detects clusters at any point during the study period,

regardless when the clusters "disappear" (Desjardins et al. 2018; Owusu et al. 2019;

127 Whiteman et al. 2019).

128	Regarding COVID-19 surveillance, the prospective space-time scan statistic has
129	been applied to daily case data at the municipality level in the United States, analyzing a
130	65-day period as well as active and emerging clusters (Desjardins et al., 2020). This
131	approach could inform decision makers to improve resource allocation and justify
132	continued social distancing and stay-at-home orders. It is essential to clarify that this
133	type of study can be repeated when more data is available, as to support the COVID-19
134	surveillance (Desjardins et al., 2020). In Brazil, as the State Health Secretariats (SHS)
135	are updating the data daily and making them public, researchers will be able to locate
136	new emerging clusters, as well as indicate the areas in which the COVID-19's
137	transmission has decreased.
138	Regarding COVID-19 surveillance efforts in Brazil, the Ministry of Health
139	reports daily confirmed cases and deaths; while also developing a COVID-19 app and
140	WhatsApp channel (de Oliveira et al. 2020). Tarrataca et al. (2020) applied a
141	susceptible, exposed, infected, removed (SEIR) model and developed several lockdown
142	scenarios and lack thereof. Another study in Brazil estimated the number of
143	underreported cases and deaths (Riberio and Bernardes 2020). However, there is
144	currently a lack of spatially explicit studies in Brazil, especially space-time cluster
145	detection of the known burden of COVID-19 across the country at the municipality
146	level.
147	In this research we by the abovementioned app by analyzing the State of São
148	Paulo, the most affected by COVID-19 in Brazil, that registered 43,131 cases (25.6%)
149	of the 168,331 on May 12th, 2020, (Brasil, 2020b). Utilizing a prospective space-time
150	scan statistic, our objective was to detect new emerging clusters of COVID-19 in the

151	State of São Paulo's municipalities, considering three periods of analysis: (1) February
152	25th – March 24nth, 2020; (2) February 25th – April 15th, 2020; and (3) February 25th
153	- May 5th, 2020. Examining these three periods, we intend to demonstrate the evolution
154	of the relative risk in different regions and municipalities in the State of São Paulo.
155	Data and Methods
156	On March 1st, 2020, the Health Surveillance Secretary of the Ministry of Health
157	of Brazil stated that a COVID-19 case is defined as confirmed if tested in a laboratory
158	with a positive result in real-time with Reverse-Transcriptase Polymerase Chain
159	Reaction (RT-PCR) test, following the protocol of the University Charité (Berlin,
160	Germany). Real time RT-PCR is a nuclear-derived method for detecting the presence of
161	specific genetic material from any pathogen, including a virus - scientists can see the
162	results almost immediately while the process is still ongoing; conventional RT-PCR
163	only provides results at the end. In Brazil, the notification system is decentralized, and
164	the municipalities can proceed with tests in private or public laboratories. Then, the
165	results are notified to the State Health System, which in turn notifies the national
166	Government.
167	The State of São Paulo has approximately 45.9 million inhabitants and an area
168	of 95.8 square miles. On March 24th, the Governor of São Paulo decreed social
169	distancing to prevent the spread of the novel coronavirus. As the incubation period for
170	the novel coronavirus disease (COVID-19) is well supported by evidence to be around
171	14 days (Lauer, et. al. 2020), we selected three separate space-time analyses: from
172	February 25th to March 24th, from February 25th to April 15th, and from February 25th
173	to May 5th, 2020 – which includes five incubation periods of onset of the most current
174	COVID-19 case in the dataset (Figure 1).

175	We utilized confirmed daily case data at the municipality level in the State
176	Health Secretary of São Paulo's freely available on its official page (São Paulo, 2020a).
177	The data contains information on 645 municipalities of the State of São Paulo and is
178	updated daily, although we only use records between February 25th, 2020 and May 5th,
179	2020. We used a Geographic Information System to geocode the locations of COVID-
180	19 cases and aggregated them to the available municipalities. The municipality-level
181	GIS files were retrieved from the Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia e Estatística (IBGE);
182	English – The Brazilian Institute of Geography and Statistics.
183	The detection of active clusters was performed using the Poisson space-time
184	scan statistic method (Kuldorff, 2001). Analyses were done using SaTScan, a free
185	software developed for cluster detection. The prospective space-time statistic detects
186	active clusters of disease, i.e. excess incidence of cases during the last time period of
187	analysis (Jones et. al, 2006). The statistic systematically implements moving cylinders
188	to scan the study area. The cylinders are centered on the centroid of the municipalities,
189	the base of the cylinder is the spatial scanning window, and the height represents the
190	temporal scanning window. The cylinders are expanded until a maximum spatial and
191	temporal upper bound is reached. We defined the upper bounds to have a maximum
192	spatial and temporal scanning window size of 10% of the population at-risk to avoid
193	extremely large clusters; and 50% of the study period, respectively. Each cluster's
194	duration was set to a minimum of 2 days and a cluster must contain a minimum of five
195	confirmed cases of COVID-19 (Desjardins et al. 2020).
196	We used a prospective Poisson model to detect space-time clusters that are still
197	occurring or active on the last day of analysis (Kulldorff, 2001; Kulldorff et al., 1998;
198	Desjardins et al. 2020). We assume that the COVID-19 cases in our study area follow a
199	Poisson distribution. While the null hypothesis states that the model reflects a constant

risk (i.e. no anomalous clustering of COVID-19). The alternative hypothesis states that
the number of observed cases exceed the number of expected cases derived from the
null model. The expected cases are calculated by multiplying the population in the
cylinder by the total COVID-19 rate in the cylinder (i.e. p * C/p). We assume that the
population is static for time period.
Next, a maximum likelihood ratio test identifies cylinders with an elevated risk

206 for COVID-19. The cylinder has an elevated risk when the likelihood ratio is greater 207 than one; where the rate of cases in the cylinder is greater than the rate outside of the 208 cylinder. To derive statistical significance, 999 Monte Carlo simulations are computed, 209 while we report clusters at the 95% confidence level (i.e. p < 0.05). Therefore, 999 210 likelihood ratios are computed for each cylinder, where each are a potential cluster. To circumvent the issue of assuming the municipalities belonging to a cluster 211 212 are homogenous, we also report and map the relative risk for each municipality in each 213 study period. The relative risk is defined the estimated risk of COVID-19 within a 214 municipality divided by the risk outside of the municipality (i.e. everywhere else). As the pandemic continues, new data can be added the prospective space-time scan statistic 215 216 to monitor active clusters and identify areas that no longer are experiencing excess incidence based on available confirmed cases (i.e. areas that no longer have an excess 217 218 public health risk).

219



Figure 1. Logarithmic graph of cumulative number of COVID-19 cases in the State of São Paulo between February 25th and May 5th, 2020 (used for the statistical analysis)

223 **Results**

220

224 First period of analysis – February 25th – March 24th, 2020

225 We did not detect any statistically significant emerging space-time clusters of

226 COVID-19 between the first period of analysis – 28 days, two incubation periods –

- 227 (Figure 2A). However, we observed five municipalities with a RR>1 outside the cluster
- for this first period, that is, with more observed than expected cases (Table 1). São
- 229 *Paulo* Municipality has the highest relative risk (RR = 28.03), followed by *São Caetano*

230 do Sul (
$$RR = 3.42$$
), Jaguariúna ($RR = 2.38$), Santana de Parnaíba ($RR = 1.97$) and

- 231 *Cotia* (RR = 1.1).
- 232
- 233
- 234
- 235
- 236

- Table 1. Municipalities of São Paulo State, Brazil, with relative risk (RR) >1,
- 238 observed/expected cases and population, within the time period between February 25th
- and March 24th, 2020.

Municipality	Population	Observed cases	Expected cases	RR
São Paulo	12,252,023	306	89.65	28.03
São Caetano do Sul	161,127	4	1.18	3.42
Jaguariúna	57,488	1	0.42	2.38
Santana de Parnaíba	139,447	2	1.02	1.97
Cotia	249,210	2	1.82	1.1

240

241 Second period of analysis – February 25th – April 15th, 2020

242 We detected seven statistically significant emerging space-time clusters of

243 COVID-19 in São Paulo State for this second period of analysis (50 days,

approximately three incubation periods), which included 353 municipalities. In this

second period there were two observed clusters with a RR>1 (cluster 1 - RR=3.29; and

cluster 3 – RR=2.64), including 11 and 17 municipalities, respectively (Table 2). Both

are located in the East region of São Paulo State, near São Paulo Municipality (Figure

248 2B).

249 Cluster 1 has 943 observed cases, and *São Caetano do Sul* Municipality has the

highest relative risk (RR = 2.23) with 85 observed cases for 38.34 expected cases,

followed by Santos Municipality (RR=2.12 with 216 observed cases for 103.11

252 expected cases). São Bernardo do Campo Municipality is also in cluster 1 (RR=1.16),

and Santo André Municipality (RR=1.09) with RR>1. Cluster 3 contains 17

254 municipalities including six municipalities with a RR>1 and 641 observed cases (Table

255 2). Caieiras Municipality has the highest relative risk (RR=1.74), followed by Taboão

- 256 da Serra (RR=1.34), Santana de Parnaíba (RR=1.24), Cotia (RR=1.18), Franco da
- 257 *Rocha* (RR=1.12), and *Osasco* (RR=1.04).
- 258
- 259
- 260

- 261 Table 2. Emerging space-time clusters of COVID-19 from February 25th April 15th,
- 262 2020 show the relative risks (RR) for the clusters identified in the São Paulo State,
- 263 Brazil.

Cluster	Duration	Р	Observed cases	Expected cases	RR	# of municip alities	Population	# of municip alities with RR>1
1	3/30- 4/15	< 0.001	943	305.05	3.3	11	3,845,800	4
2	3/22- 4/15	< 0.001	118	522.04	0.2	203	4,475,331	2
3	3/31-4/15	< 0.001	641	252.45	2.6	17	3,381,536	6
4	3/22- 4/15	< 0.001	86	421.67	0.2	61	3,614,906	0
5	3/22-4/15	< 0.001	22	168.99	0.1	33	1,448,732	0
6	3/22-4/15	< 0.001	36	127.66	0.3	9	1,094,410	0
7	3/22-4/15	< 0.001	21	96.37	0.2	19	826,174	0

264

265 Third period of analysis – February 25th – May 5th, 2020

266 We detected seven statistically significant emerging space-time clusters of

267 COVID-19, in our third period of our analysis (70 days, five incubation periods),

covering 513 municipalities of the São Paulo State. Clusters 1, 2, and 5 show the

highest relative risks (Table 3) with a RR=3.71, RR=3.12, and RR=2.68, respectively.

270 All of them are located near São Paulo Municipality, in the East region of the State

271 (Figure 2C).

272 Cluster 1 includes 11 municipalities with a RR>1 and the highest relative risk

273 observed is *Barueri* Municipality (RR=2.03). Cluster 2 has five municipalities with a

274 RR>1 and *São Caetano do Sul* Municipality has the highest relative risk (RR=1.84).

275 Cluster 5 has two municipalities with a RR>1 and *Igaratá* Municipality is the highest

relative risk (RR=1.84). All the previously mentioned municipalities border with *São*

277 Paulo Municipality, such as Barueri and São Caetano do Sul, with the exception of

278 Igaratá Municipality, which is located nearly 100 kilometers away from São Paulo by

279 road.

Cluster	Duration	Р	Observed cases	Expected cases	RR	# of municip alities	Population	# of municip alities with RR>1
1	4/15-5/5	< 0.001	2,598	741.98	3.7	17	3,381,536	11
2	5/15-5/5	< 0.001	2,899	985.48	3.1	14	4,491,304	5
3	5/1-5/5	< 0.001	534	1,641.67	0.3	87	4,489,123	0
4	4-1-5/5	< 0.001	583	1,660.57	0.3	263	4,540,784	2
5	4-24-5/5	< 0.001	1,118	425.91	2.7	15	3,396,868	2
6	4-1-5/5	< 0.001	758	1,635.26	0.4	85	4,471,575	3
7	4/1-5/5	< 0.001	108	485.36	0.2	32	1,327,200	0

280 Table 3. Emerging space-time clusters of COVID-19 from February 25th – May 5th,

281 2020 show the relative risk (RR) for the clusters detected in São Paulo State, Brazil.

282



283

Figure 1. Spatial distribution of emerging space-time clusters of COVID-19 for the

- 285 municipalities of São Paulo State, Brazil. A First period of analysis February 25th –
- 286 March 24th, 2020 (28 days). B Second period of analysis February 25th April
- 287 15th, 2020 (50 days; C1 RR=3.29; C3=2.64; the other clusters did not show a RR>1).
- $288 \qquad C Third period of analysis February 25th May 5th, 2020 (70 days; C1 RR=3.71;$
- 289 C2 RR=3.12; C5 RR=2.68; the other clusters did not show a RR>1).

290

292

293 **Discussion**

294	In this paper, we adapted the methodology used by Desjardins et al. (2020),
295	using three periods to detected emerging clusters of COVID-19 in São Paulo State,
296	Brazil, utilizing confirmed case data by the Brazil IO (Brasil IO, 2020). It is important
297	to highlight that the relative risk throughout the São Paulo State increased during the
298	three periods analyzed. In the first period (February 25^{th} – March 24^{th} , 2020) within 28
299	days from the first recorded case, we detected only five municipalities with a RR>1 and
300	in the third period (February 25^{th} – May 5^{th} , 2020), within 70 days from the first
301	recorded case, we detected 23 municipalities with a RR>1. These results show that
302	within our study period, there are 4.6 times more municipalities with more observed
303	than expected cases for São Paulo State. Our results show that São Paulo Municipality
304	is a hotspot of COVID-19 and this is highlighted by the location of the clusters with a
305	RR>1 in the second and third periods. However, after 70 days of virus dispersion in the
306	State of São Paulo, we observed municipalities with a RR>1 in almost all of the
307	emerging clusters.
308	In the first period analyzed (February 25 th – March 24 th , 2020), twenty
309	municipalities had level of relative risk of COVID-19, but no clusters were detected;
310	while all municipalities with reported COVID-19 incidence have a population greater
311	than 50,000 inhabitants. In the second period (February 25 th - April 15 th , 2020) and third
312	period (February 25 th - May 5 th , 2020), clusters with a RR> 1 were located around the
313	municipality of São Paulo. However, in the second period, 25 municipalities with a

- population less than 50,000 inhabitants started to exhibit COVID-19 incidence. In the
- third period, the number of municipalities with reported COVID-19 incidence increased
- to 117, showing the spread to the countryside of the State. This reinforces a recent
- 317 discovery by the Fundação Instituto Oswaldo Cruz (FIOCRUZ), where COVID-19 is

318 arriving rapidly in medium-sized municipalities (20 to 50 thousand inhabitants), tending 319 to generate the growth of transmission cycles for small cities. This is worrisome 320 because health services are not prepared for this demand, leading to their burden on 321 urban centers of reference in São Paulo State (FIOCRUZ, 2020). Despite the contributions of our study, there are a few limitations that are worth 322 323 pointing out. First, the cylindrical shapes of the cluster detection are likely not the true 324 shape of the COVID-19 clusters. Second, we utilized lab confirmed case data, which does not capture the true burden of the epidemic in São Paulo State. We encourage 325 326 researchers to examine our results and future work can understand the transmission 327 dynamics of COVID-19 in the State and identify predictors of the epidemic. Third, 328 future work can adjust for significant predictors of COVID-19 when computing the space-time scan statistic Finally, we used a prospective space-time statistical model, so 329 330 we disregard clusters that "disappeared" during the study period and were not active on May 5th, 2020. 331 Conclusions 332 This research presented an analysis of the dynamics of the expansion of 333 334 COVID-19 based on the number of daily cases available in Brasil.IO's database, with 335 the intent of identifying emerging space-time clusters active in the municipalities of the 336 State of São Paulo in three different time periods. We detected three significant active 337 clusters in the State of São Paulo on May 5, 2020. Therefore, this space-time approach

to map emerging clusters will allow decision-makers to identify statistically significant

hotspots of COVID-19 cases. Regional Health Departments (DRS) of the State of São

340 Paulo are responsible for coordinating the activities in regional level. These departments

341 can use the results to optimize intersectoral coordination and organization of health care

342 needs, specifically in relation to bed availability and pulmonary mechanical ventilator.

343 In turn, this can improve the management of resources in the State of São Paulo. These

- 344 results coupled with stay-home-orders orders (social confinement) can inform
- authorities on the impact of such measures to limit the propagation of COVID19 cases.
- 346 As such, our results can support restrictive measures of social distancing that can be
- 347 taken to minimize viral transmission.

374 **References**

- Alonso W.J., Schuck-Paim C., Freitas A.R.R., Kupek E., Wuerzius C.R., Negro-
- Calduch E., et al. Covid-19 in context: comparison with monthly mortality from
- respiratory causes in each Brazilian state. InterAm J. Med Health 2020
- 378 (https://iajmh.com/iajmh/article/view/93/107).
- Bhatia, S. et al. (2020, May, 12). Short-term forecasts of COVID-19 deaths in multiple countries.
- 380 Retrieved from <u>https://mrc-ide.github.io/covid19-short-term-forecasts/index.html</u>
- 381 Brasil, Ministry of Health (2020a), available in:
- 382 <u>https://www.saude.gov.br/noticias/agencia-saude/46435-brasil-confirma-primeiro-caso-</u>
- 383 <u>de-novo-coronavirus</u>. (accessed in May, 12, 2020).
- Brasil, Ministry of Health (2020b). <u>https://covid.saude.gov.br/</u> (accessed in May, 12, 2020).
- Brasil.IO: COVID-19 epidemiological bulletins by municipality per day (2020),
- available in: <u>https://brasil.io/dataset/covid19/</u> (last actualization: May, 05, 2020,
- accessed in May 05, 2020).
- 389 Delatorre E, Mir D, Gräf T, Bello G. Tracking the onset date of the community spread
- 390 of SARS-CoV-2 in Western Countries [Submitted]. **Mem Inst Oswaldo Cruz** E-pub:
- 391 24 Apr 2020. DOI: <u>10.1590/0074-02760200183</u>.
- 392 Desjardins M.R., Hohl A., Delmelle E.M. Rapid surveillance of COVID-19 in the
- 393 United States using a prospective space-time scan statistic: Detecting and evaluating
- emerging clusters. **Applied Geography**. Volume 118, May 2020, 102202.
- 395 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apgeog.2020.102202</u>.
- 396 Desjardins, M. R., Whiteman, A., Casas, I., & Delmelle, E. (2018). Space-time clusters
- and co-occurrence of chikungunya and dengue fever in Colombia from 2015 to 2016.
- **398** Acta tropica, 185, 77-85.
- 399 Deslandes A., Berti V., Tandjaoui-Lambott Y., Chakib Alloui, et al. 2020. SARS-CoV-
- 400 2 was already spreading in France in late December 2019. International Journal of
- 401 Antimicrobial Agents. Available online 3 May 2020, 106006.
- 402 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijantimicag.2020.106006.
- 403 Deyà-Martínez, A., Gordón, Y., Molina-Anguita, C., Vlagea, A., Piquer, M., Juan, M.,
- 404 ... & Plaza, A. M. (2020). Single-cycle rituximab-induced immunologic changes in
- 405 children: Enhanced in neuroimmunologic disease?. *Neurology-Neuroimmunology*
- 406 *Neuroinflammation*, 7(4).
- 407 Dong, E., Du, H., & Gardner, L. (2020). An interactive web-based dashboard to track
 408 COVID-19 in real time. *The Lancet Infectious Diseases*.
- 409
- 410 Fabre, A., Morand, A., & Urbina, D. (2020). COVID-19 and Kawasaki Like Disease:
- 411 The Known-Known, the Unknown-Known and the Unknown-Unknown.
- 412
- 413 He, X., Lau, E. H., Wu, P., Deng, X., Wang, J., Hao, X., ... & Mo, X. (2020). Temporal
- 414 dynamics in viral shedding and transmissibility of COVID-19. *Nature medicine*, 1-4.

- 416 Jones R.C., Liberatore M., Fernandez J.R., Gerber S.I. Use of a prospective space- time
- 417 scan statistic to prioritize shigellosis case investigations in an urban jurisdiction. Public
- 418 **Health Reports**, 121 (2) (2006), pp. 133-139.
- 419 <u>https://doi.org/10.1177/003335490612100206</u>.
- 420 Jones, V. G., Mills, M., Suarez, D., Hogan, C. A., Yeh, D., Segal, J. B., ... & Mathew,
- 421 R. (2020). COVID-19 and Kawasaki disease: novel virus and novel case. *Hospital*
- 422 *Pediatrics*, hpeds-2020.
- 423 Kulldorff, M. 1997. A spatial scan statistic. **Communications In Statistics Theory**
- 424 and Methods, 26 (6) (1997), pp. 1481-1496. <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-985X.00186</u>.
- 425 Kulldorff, M. Prospective time periodic geographical disease surveillance using a scan
- 426 statistic Journal of the Royal Statistical Society: Series A, 164 (1) (2001), pp. 61-72.
 427 <u>https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-985X.00186</u>
- M. Kulldorff, M. SaTScanTM user guide for version 9.6. https://www.satscan.org/
 (2018)
- 430 Lauer S.A., Grantz, K.H., Bi Q., Jones F.K., Zheng Q., Meredith H.R., Azman A.S.,
- 431 Reich N.G., Lessler J. The Incubation Period of Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19)
- 432 From Publicly Reported Confirmed Cases: Estimation and Application. **Ann Intern**
- 433 Med 2020; 172:577-582. <u>https://www.acpjournals.org/doi/10.7326/M20-0504</u>.
- Liu, Y., Gayle, A. A., Wilder-Smith, A., & Rocklöv, J. (2020). The reproductive
- number of COVID-19 is higher compared to SARS coronavirus. *Journal of travelmedicine*.
- Mahase, E. (2020). Coronavirus: covid-19 has killed more people than SARS and
 MERS combined, despite lower case fatality rate. *BMJ*, *368*.
- 439 Nishiura, H., Kobayashi, T., Miyama, T., Suzuki, A., Jung, S., Hayashi, K., ... & Linton,
- N. M. (2020). Estimation of the asymptomatic ratio of novel coronavirus infections
 (COVID-19). *medRxiv*.
- de Oliveira, W.K., Duarte, E., de França, G.V.A., & Garcia, L.P. (2020). How Brazil
 can hold back COVID-19. *Epidemiologia e Serviços de Saúde*, 29(2): 1-8.
- 444 Osman, E. E. A., Toogood, P. L., & Neamati, N. (2020). COVID-19: Living through
 445 Another Pandemic. ACS Infectious Diseases.
- 446 Owusu, C., Desjardins, M. R., Baker, K. M., & Delmelle, E. (2019). Residential
- 447 mobility impacts relative risk estimates of space-time clusters of chlamydia in
- Kalamazoo Municipality, Michigan. Geospatial health, 14(2).
- Ribeiro, L. C., & Bernardes, A. T. (2020). Estimate of underreporting of COVID-19 in
- 450 Brazil by Acute Respiratory Syndrome hospitalization reports. *Nota Técnica. Cedeplar,*
- 451 UFMG, Belo Horizonte, MG.
- 452 Ruan, Q., Yang, K., Wang, W., Jiang, L., & Song, J. (2020). Clinical predictors of
- 453 mortality due to COVID-19 based on an analysis of data of 150 patients from Wuhan,
- 454 China. Intensive Care Medicine, 1-3.

- 455 São Paulo (2020a). Situação Epidemiológica. Retrieved from
- 456 http://www.saude.sp.gov.br/cve-centro-de-vigilancia-epidemiologica-prof.-alexandre-
- 457 vranjac/areas-de-vigilancia/doencas-de-transmissao-respiratoria/coronavirus-covid-
- 458 19/situacao-epidemiologica.
- 459 São Paulo (2020b). Adesão ao isolamento social em SP. Retrieved from
- 460 https://www.saopaulo.sp.gov.br/coronavirus/isolamento/
- 461 Tarrataca, L., Dias, C. M., Haddad, D. B., & Arruda, E. F. (2020). Flattening the curves:
- on-off lock-down strategies for COVID-19 with an application to Brazi. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2004.06916*.
- The Lancet Editorial. COVID-19 in Brazil: "So what?" The Lancet. vol. 395: May 9,
 2020, 1461. <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(20)31095-3</u>.
- 466 Whiteman, A., Desjardins, M.R., Eskildsen, G.A., & Loaiza, J.R. (2019) Integrating
- vector surveillance data to improve space-time risk estimation of dengue fever in
- 468 Panama. PLOS Neglected Tropical Diseases, 13(9): e0007266.
- 469 Wu, Z., & McGoogan, J. M. (2020). Characteristics of and important lessons from the
- 470 coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) outbreak in China: summary of a report of 72
- 471 314 cases from the Chinese Center for Disease Control and Prevention. *Jama*.
- 472 Yang et al. (2020). Taking the pulse of COVID-19: A spatiotemporal perspective. *arXiv*
- 473 *preprint arXiv*: 2005.04224v1.
- 474