

14 **Abstract**

15 *Background:* The world is threatened by the outbreak of coronavirus disease 19 (COVID-19)
16 since December 2019. The number of cases and deaths increased dramatically in some
17 countries from March 2020. The objective of our study was to examine potential associated
18 factors with country-variation in COVID-19 morbidity and mortality in the world.

19 *Methods:* We performed a retrospective geographic study including all countries with the
20 most recent available data on free access on the web. We analyzed univariate and
21 multivariable correlation between both the number of reported cases and deaths by country
22 and demographic, socioeconomic characteristics, lockdown as major control measure, average
23 annual temperature and relative humidity. We performed simple linear regression,
24 independent t test and ANOVA test for univariate analyses and negative binomial regression
25 model for multivariable analyses.

26 *Results:* We analyzed data of 186 countries from all world regions. As of 13th April 2020, a
27 total of 1 804 302 COVID-19 cases and 113 444 deaths were reported. The reported number
28 of COVID-19 cases and deaths by countries was associated with the number of days between
29 the first case and lockdown, the number of cases at lockdown, life expectancy at birth,
30 average annual temperature and the socio-economic level. Countries which never
31 implemented BCG vaccination reported higher mortality than others.

32 *Conclusions:* The pandemic is still ongoing and poses a global health threat as there is no
33 effective antiviral treatment or vaccines. Thus, timing of control measure implementation is a
34 crucial factor in determining the spread of the epidemic. It should be a lesson for this
35 pandemic and for the future.

36 **Key words:** COVID-19, morbidity, mortality, country-variation

37

38 **1. Introduction**

39 The outbreak of a novel coronavirus (COVID-19) since the end of December has posed a
40 significant threat to international health and the world economy. Almost the whole world is
41 under lockdown for several weeks to contain the COVID-19 outbreak (1). As there is no
42 vaccine, no effective specific treatment, the level of transmission reduction is crucial. Thus,
43 interventions to mitigate the epidemic including social distancing by either localized or
44 national lockdown were implemented by many countries (2).

45 Since the beginning of March, many countries have been hit particularly hard by COVID-19
46 including Europe and the United States of America. However, there are major country
47 differences in both the spread of the infection and the mortality due to the coronavirus. Few
48 univariable (3) and national (4,5) studies tried to explain the reasons of these observed
49 differences. Socioeconomic, demography, health system and climate environment could be
50 important in understanding the dramatically increased number of cases and deaths in some
51 countries.

52 The aim of our study was to examine country-variation in COVID-19 morbidity and mortality
53 in the world by analyzing 1) demographic, socioeconomic characteristics, 2) restrictions and
54 time between the first case reported and restrictions decision 3) climate environment.

55 **2. Methods**

56 **2.1. Study design**

57 We performed a retrospective geographic study including all countries with the most recent
58 available data on free access on the web. We analyzed univariate and multivariable
59 correlation between both the number of cases and deaths by country and demographic,
60 socioeconomic characteristics, lockdown as major control measure and climate environment.

61 **2.2. Data collection**

62 Data about all countries was collected from different sources. We downloaded the geographic
63 distribution of cases and deaths worldwide data as of April, 13th from the ECDC website (6).

64 We aggregated data by country calculating the total reported cases and deaths for each
65 country.

66 We collected population density, infant mortality rate 2015-2020 per 1000 inhabitant, the
67 proportion of male/female, the proportion of people aged 65 years and over and the life
68 expectancy at birth from the United Nations Website (7).

69 Human development index (HDI) for 2018-2019 was introduced into data from the report of
70 the United Nations (8). We collected information on Universal BCG vaccination policy by
71 countries from the BCG World Atlas (9).

72 We included the 2019 socioeconomic level classification for each country from the World
73 Bank (10).

74 Information on lockdown was found on the BBC website (1) and was completed from other
75 sources for the non-available information (11). We calculated the number of days between the
76 first case and the lockdown and the total number of cases at lockdown from the above source
77 and the geographic distribution of cases data which includes the daily number of cases and
78 deaths by country.

79 We collected average yearly temperature in °C for 2019 for all countries from (12) and 2019
80 average annual relative humidity [2 m] in percentage from (13).

81 **2.3. Data analyses**

82 The dependent variables were the number of cases and the number of deaths by country. The
83 independent variables by country were the population size, the population density, the infant
84 mortality rate 2015-2020, the percentage of male/female, the percentage of people aged 65
85 years and over, the life expectancy at birth, human development index, socioeconomic
86 classification (low income, middle income, high income), Universal BCG vaccination policy
87 (yes/no), lockdown (none, localized or national lockdown), number of days between the first
88 case and lockdown and the number of cases at lockdown.

89 We performed simple linear regression with exponential function, independent t test and
90 ANOVA test for univariate analyses. We used generalized linear models with negative
91 binomial distribution for multivariable analyses. We included into the model all significant
92 associated variables from the univariate analyses, we introduced interaction terms and we
93 adjusted for the population size. The significant level of all tests was set at $p \text{ value} \leq 0.05$. We
94 analyzed all data with SPSS Software.

95 **3. Results**

96 We analyzed data of 186 countries from all world regions. As of 13th April 2020, a total of
97 1 804 302 COVID-19 cases and 113 444 deaths were reported. The United States of America
98 reported the highest number of cases and deaths (557 571 cases and 22 108 deaths), Spain
99 reported the second highest number of cases (166 019) and Italy reported the second highest
100 number of deaths (19 901) (figures 1 & 2).

101 **Figure 1:** distribution of the number of COVID-19 cases by country, as of April 13th 2020

102 **Figure 2:** distribution of the number of COVID-19 deaths by country, as of April 13th 2020

103

104 **Morbidity (Number of cases by country)**

105 The number of COVID-19 cases in this first univariate analysis was positively correlated to
106 the number of cases at lockdown and the number of days between the first case and
107 lockdown; correlation coefficient $r=0.627$, $p \text{ value} < 10^{-3}$ and $r=0.562$, $p \text{ value} < 10^{-3}$
108 respectively. The number of reported cases was higher for countries with the highest number
109 of reported cases at lockdown (figure 3) and the large time between the reported first case and
110 lockdown (figure 4).

111 **Figure 3:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the number of cases at
112 lockdown

113 **Figure 4:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the number of days
114 between the first case and lockdown

115

116 Infant mortality was negatively correlated with the number of COVID-19 cases ($r=-0.548$, p
117 $value < 10^{-3}$). The number of COVID-19 infection was higher among countries with low infant
118 mortality rate (figure 5).

119 **Figure 5:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the infant mortality rate

120 We also observed positive correlation with HDI ($r=0.670$, $p < 10^{-3}$), life expectancy at birth
121 ($r=0.600$, $p < 10^{-3}$) and percentage of people aged 65 years and over ($r=0.578$, $p < 10^{-3}$) (figures
122 6, 7 & 8).

123 **Figure 6:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the HDI

124 **Figure 7:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the life expectancy at
125 birth

126 **Figure 8:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the proportion of people
127 aged 65 years and over

128 A negative correlation was observed between the average annual temperature and the number
129 of COVID-19 cases ($r=-0.504$, $p < 10^{-3}$). The number of reported COVID-19 cases was higher
130 in countries with low average yearly temperature (figure 9).

131 **Figure 9:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 cases and the average annual
132 temperature

133

134 The average number of cases in high income countries was 23 001.40, 3 782.65 in middle
135 income countries and 114.27 in low income countries, the difference was significant p
136 $value=0.018$. The average number of reported cases in countries with and without universal
137 BCG vaccination policy was respectively 2930.70 and 69 203.95; p $value=0.04$ for the global

138 population. After stratification by socioeconomic level, the difference was significant only for
 139 high income countries; p value=0.041.

140 There was no significant correlation between the number of cases and lockdown, population
 141 density, average annual relative humidity and percentage of male/female.

142 The final negative binomial regression model, indicated that the number of days between the
 143 first case and lockdown, the number of cases at lockdown, life expectancy at birth, average
 144 annual temperature and the economic level were independently associated with the reported
 145 number of COVID-19 cases by countries (table 1).

146 **Table 1:** Factors associated with country-variation in COVID-19 morbidity

Factor	RR _a *	95% CI**	p value
Number of cases at lockdown	1.001	1.000-1.001	<10 ⁻³
Number of days between the first case and lockdown	1.031	1.012-1.049	0.001
Life expectancy at birth	1.158	1.122-1.196	<10 ⁻³
Socioeconomic level	0.189	0.114-0.313	<10 ⁻³
Average annual temperature	0.928	0.901-0.956	<10 ⁻³

147 *Adjusted Risk Ratio; **95% Confidence Interval

148

149 **Mortality (Number of deaths by country)**

150 Univariate analysis showed that the number of COVID-19 deaths was positively correlated
 151 to the number of cases at lockdown and the number of days between the first case and
 152 lockdown; correlation coefficient $r=0.906$, $p \text{ value} < 10^{-3}$ and $r=0.445$, $p \text{ value} < 10^{-3}$
 153 respectively. The number of reported deaths was higher for countries with the highest number
 154 of reported cases at lockdown (figure 10) and the large time between the reported first case
 155 and lockdown (figure 11).

156 **Figure 10:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the number of cases at
 157 lockdown

158 **Figure 11:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the number of days
159 between the first case and lockdown

160

161 Infant mortality was negatively correlated with the number of COVID-19 deaths ($r=-0.184$, p
162 $value=0.014$). The number of COVID-19 deaths was higher among countries with low infant
163 mortality rate (figure 12).

164 **Figure 12:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the infant mortality rate
165 We also observed positive correlation with HDI ($r=0.257$, $p=0.001$), life expectancy at birth
166 ($r=0.257$, $p<10^{-3}$) and percentage of people aged 65 years and over ($r=0.308$, $p<10^{-3}$) (figures
167 13, 14 & 15).

168 **Figure 13:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the HDI

169 **Figure 14:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the life expectancy at
170 birth

171 **Figure 15:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the proportion of
172 people aged 65 years and over

173

174 A negative correlation was observed between the average annual temperature and the number
175 of COVID-19 deaths ($r=-0.199$, $p=0.199$). The number of reported COVID-19 deaths was
176 higher in countries with low average yearly temperature (figure 16).

177 **Figure 16:** Correlation between the number of COVID-19 deaths and the average annual
178 temperature

179 The average number of deaths in high income countries was 1 569.95, 155.5 in middle
180 income countries and 3.9 in low income countries, the difference was significant p
181 $value=0.004$. The average number of reported deaths in countries with and without universal
182 BCG vaccination policy was respectively 104.31 and 5 053.89; p $value=0.011$ for the global

183 population. After stratification by socioeconomic level, the difference was significant only for
184 high income countries; p value=0.010.

185 There was no significant correlation between the number of deaths and lockdown, population
186 density, average annual relative humidity and percentage of male/female.

187 Multivariable analyses using negative binomial regression model found that the number of
188 days between the first case and lockdown, the number of cases at lockdown, life expectancy at
189 birth, average annual temperature, the economic level and the universal BCG vaccination
190 policy were independently associated with the reported number of COVID-19 deaths by
191 countries (table 2).

192 **Table 2:** Factors associated with country-variation in COVID-19 mortality

Factor	RR_a*	95% CI**	p value
Number of cases at lockdown	1.001	1.001-1.001	<10 ⁻³
Number of days between the first case and lockdown	1.031	1.014-1.050	0.001
Life expectancy at birth	1.213	1.169-1.259	<10 ⁻³
Socioeconomic level	0.125	0.072-0.216	<10 ⁻³
Average annual temperature	0.967	0.937-0.997	0.032
Universal BCG vaccination policy	2.779	1.443-5.353	0.002

193 *Adjusted Risk Ratio; **95% Confidence Interval

194

195 **4. Discussion**

196 In this study we investigated the potential factors that can explain the country-variation in
197 COVID-19 reported cases and deaths worldwide. We included the maximum of variables
198 which are already known to make differences between countries in terms of infectious
199 morbidity and mortality; such as the performance of the health system, population
200 sociodemographic characteristics, socioeconomic level and climate variability. Infant

201 mortality rate and life expectancy at birth are related to the performance of country health
202 system (14). Population sociodemographic characteristics include human development index,
203 the proportion of male/female, the proportion of people aged 65 years and over and the
204 population density and size. These indicators were used mainly to adjust for confounders.
205 Temperature and relative humidity are already known as important factors of survival and
206 transmission of SRAS and MERS coronaviruses (15–19). Control measures and their timeline
207 of application may also be different between countries; we explored the lockdown and the
208 time of its implementation regarding the ongoing epidemic as a major intervention. We
209 included the universal BCG vaccination policy to assess its effect on the number of cases and
210 deaths.

211 Our study showed that the differences between countries in COVID-19 transmission and
212 mortality could be partially explained by the early decision of lockdown, life expectancy at
213 birth, average annual temperature and the economic level. The universal BCG vaccination
214 policy was only associated with deaths; countries which never implemented BCG vaccination
215 reported higher mortality than others.

216 We observed that countries that implemented BCG vaccination in their national immunization
217 schedule reported less deaths due to COVID-19. This finding suggests that BCG vaccination
218 doesn't protect against COVID-19 infection susceptibility but might decrease the severity and
219 consequently reducing mortality by COVID-19. A study (20) carried out in Guinea-Bissau
220 concluded that BCG vaccine has protective effect on acute lower respiratory tract infection.
221 Another research (21) conducted in Spain concluded that BCG vaccination at birth may
222 decrease respiratory infection and sepsis hospitalization. Similarly, Niobey et al (22) found an
223 association between BCG immunization and a reduced risk of pneumonia mortality in
224 children in Brazil. The mechanism of this effect is not clearly explained, but it seems to be
225 related to the reinforcement of the nonspecific immune response (23).

226 The situation of lockdown was not associated with the morbidity and the mortality by the
227 COVID-19. In fact, the majority of countries took the decision to shut down all their activities
228 in time of the ongoing epidemic. However, this study concluded that the time of the
229 nationwide lockdown and consequently, the number of cases reported in the country when the
230 lockdown was implemented, were strongly associated with COVID-19 mortality and
231 morbidity. The high number of cases at lockdown and the large number of days between the
232 first case reported in the country and the lockdown results in more reported cases and deaths.
233 This finding is rational, an epidemic follow the natural growth pattern: the more infected, the
234 more infections. The Basic Reproduction Number R_0 is the expected number of secondary
235 cases generated by one infected subject. It depends on the transmissibility, the average rate of
236 contact between susceptible and infected individuals, and the duration of infectiousness
237 (24,25).

238 It suggests that the early decision of maximum containment measures (Stay at home
239 recommendations) decrease the transmission in the community, reduce the burden of the
240 disease to hospitals and improve the prognosis resulting in less mortality (26). Early
241 implementation of control measures assume that the transmission can occur from
242 asymptomatic COVID-19 carriers to the community since asymptomatic COVID-19 infection
243 is possible (27,28) or before and at the beginning of symptoms onset (29).

244 Tian et al (30) found that control measures were strongly associated with the containment of
245 COVID-19 avoiding hundreds of thousands incident cases.

246 Carlo Signorelli et al (31) confirmed that the timing of mitigation measures is of high
247 importance in reducing the transmission in Italy. The containment measures are most effective
248 if they are decided and implemented at an early stage of the epidemic and on large areas.

249 Another study in Italy (32) indicated that a stronger effect on the epidemic growth was
250 obtained when the lockdown was enforced earlier. In Spain and Italy (33), implementation of

251 more restrictive measures resulted in a change in the trend slopes in daily incident cases and
252 intensive care unit admissions. Several works (34–39) concluded that the effect of community
253 mitigation measures and potential impacts on community mobility, depends greatly on the
254 choice of date, early implementation of the most restrictive measures may be more effective.
255 It has a strong potential to reduce the magnitude of the epidemic which is particularly
256 important, as this reduces the acute pressure on the health-care system and improve the
257 prognosis of severe cases.

258 Our work indicated that the average annual temperature is negatively associated with the
259 COVID-19 morbidity and mortality. It suggests that a difference of 1°C in temperature,
260 decrease the number of reported COVID-19 cases and deaths of 7.2% and 3.3% respectively.

261 The effect of average temperature on the COVID-19 morbidity and mortality was consistent
262 with that found in other country level studies (40,41). The differences with our results can be
263 related to the use of different outcome measures and methods and to the number of variables
264 included into the analysis, we adjusted for more variables that are basically known to have
265 relationship mainly with death and which vary from one country to another.

266 The negative association of average temperature with COVID-9 infection was observed in
267 many other studies (4,42–47). It seems that high temperature shortens the period of survival in
268 the environment of the coronavirus resulting in the decrease of the potential transmissibility.

269 Our study indicated that countries from the group “high income” had less COVID-19 cases
270 and death comparing with middle/low income countries. This finding can be explained by the
271 differences in both educational level and lifestyle factors (48,49).

272 We observed that the indicator of « life expectancy at birth » was positively associated with
273 COVID-19 mortality more than morbidity. An increase of one year raises the number of death
274 by 21.3% and the number of cases by 15.8%. This result suggests that if people are expected
275 to live for a long time, they will be more susceptible to develop severe infections and to die.

276 Our work had several limitations. First, we carried out an observational geographic study. Our
277 results cannot prove causality, they just suggest an association. However, in such pandemic
278 situation due to emerging pathogen, these results are useful because data are immediately
279 available and could help predicting the spread of the epidemic and guide control measures in
280 the absence of effective treatment and vaccine to tackle the epidemic. Second, we used
281 general indicators by countries such as average annual temperature and relative humidity; the
282 data could be not very precise. But it might not affect the analysis since the objective was to
283 compare outcomes between countries once we used the same variable and the same source for
284 all countries. Third, we didn't take into account the difference in population rate change in
285 behaviors (50), societal and social psychological factors (51) and the real application and
286 respect for total containment, that's why our work explained only a part of country-variation
287 on COVID-19 morbidity and mortality.

288 **5. Conclusions**

289 Despite these limitations, our study highlights the importance of early and efficient
290 implementation of control measures to curb the epidemic by reducing the transmission, new
291 incident cases and deaths. If the BCG vaccine can boost the non-specific immune response, it
292 can be used to lessen the severity of COVID-19 infection, particularly in high risk groups in
293 order to decrease the number of severe cases, hospitalization and death. Association between
294 high temperature and the COVID-19 morbidity and mortality should be interpreted with
295 caution. At least, it can help authorities to decide for when and how to lift lockdown, mainly
296 for developing countries with socio-economic difficulties.

297

298 **Declaration of competing interest**

299 The authors declare that they have no competing interests related to this work.

300 **Funding:** This work didn't need any funding source.

301

302 **6. References**

- 303 1. The world in lockdown in maps and charts. BBC News [Internet]. 2020 Apr 7 [cited 2020 Apr
304 21]; Available from: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-52103747>
- 305 2. Ferguson N, Laydon D, Nedjati Gilani G, Imai N, Ainslie K, Baguelin M, et al. Report 9: Impact of
306 non-pharmaceutical interventions (NPIs) to reduce COVID19 mortality and healthcare demand
307 [Internet]. Imperial College London; 2020 Mar [cited 2020 Apr 21]. Available from:
308 <http://spiral.imperial.ac.uk/handle/10044/1/77482>
- 309 3. Miller A, Reandelar MJ, Fasciglione K, Roumenova V, Li Y, Otazu GH. Correlation between
310 universal BCG vaccination policy and reduced morbidity and mortality for COVID-19: an
311 epidemiological study [Internet]. Epidemiology; 2020 Mar [cited 2020 Apr 21]. Available from:
312 <http://medrxiv.org/lookup/doi/10.1101/2020.03.24.20042937>
- 313 4. Shi P, Dong Y, Yan H, Zhao C, Li X, Liu W, et al. Impact of temperature on the dynamics of the
314 COVID-19 outbreak in China. Sci Total Environ [Internet]. 2020 Aug 1 [cited 2020 Apr
315 28];728:138890. Available from:
316 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969720324074>
- 317 5. Xie J, Zhu Y. Association between ambient temperature and COVID-19 infection in 122 cities
318 from China. Sci Total Environ [Internet]. 2020 Jul 1 [cited 2020 May 4];724:138201. Available
319 from: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969720317149>
- 320 6. Download today's data on the geographic distribution of COVID-19 cases worldwide [Internet].
321 European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. 2020 [cited 2020 Apr 21]. Available from:
322 [https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/download-todays-data-geographic-](https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/download-todays-data-geographic-distribution-covid-19-cases-worldwide)
323 [distribution-covid-19-cases-worldwide](https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/publications-data/download-todays-data-geographic-distribution-covid-19-cases-worldwide)
- 324 7. World Population Prospects - Population Division - United Nations [Internet]. [cited 2020 Apr
325 21]. Available from: <https://population.un.org/wpp/Download/Standard/Mortality/>

- 326 8. 2018_human_development_statistical_update_fr.pdf [Internet]. Available from:
327 http://hdr.undp.org/sites/default/files/2018_human_development_statistical_update_fr.pdf
- 328 9. BCG World Atlas [Internet]. [cited 2020 Apr 21]. Available from:
329 <http://www.bcgatlas.org/index.php>
- 330 10. World Bank Country and Lending Groups – World Bank Data Help Desk [Internet]. Available
331 from: [https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/906519-world-bank-](https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/906519-world-bank-country-and-lending-groups)
332 [country-and-lending-groups](https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/906519-world-bank-country-and-lending-groups)
- 333 11. Güner R, Hasanoğlu I, Aktaş F. COVID-19: Prevention and control measures in community. Turk
334 J Med Sci. 2020 21;50(SI-1):571–7.
- 335 12. Average Yearly Temperature by Country [Internet]. [cited 2020 Apr 21]. Available from:
336 https://statpedia.com/stat/Average_Yearly_Temperature_by_Country/HJd7OcGK
- 337 13. ERA5 download Basel [Internet]. meteoblue. [cited 2020 May 4]. Available from:
338 https://www.meteoblue.com/en/weather/archive/era5/basel_switzerland_2661604
- 339 14. Braithwaite J, Hibbert P, Blakely B, Plumb J, Hannaford N, Long JC, et al. Health system
340 frameworks and performance indicators in eight countries: A comparative international
341 analysis. SAGE Open Med [Internet]. 2017 Jan 4 [cited 2020 May 4];5. Available from:
342 <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5308535/>
- 343 15. Bi P, Wang J, Hiller JE. Weather: driving force behind the transmission of severe acute
344 respiratory syndrome in China? Intern Med J [Internet]. 2007 [cited 2020 May 4];37(8):550–4.
345 Available from: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/j.1445-5994.2007.01358.x>
- 346 16. Casanova LM, Jeon S, Rutala WA, Weber DJ, Sobsey MD. Effects of Air Temperature and
347 Relative Humidity on Coronavirus Survival on Surfaces. Appl Environ Microbiol [Internet]. 2010
348 May [cited 2020 May 4];76(9):2712–7. Available from:
349 <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC2863430/>
- 350 17. Chan KH, Peiris JSM, Lam SY, Poon LLM, Yuen KY, Seto WH. The Effects of Temperature and
351 Relative Humidity on the Viability of the SARS Coronavirus [Internet]. Vol. 2011, Advances in

- 352 Virology. Hindawi; 2011 [cited 2020 May 4]. p. e734690. Available from:
- 353 <https://www.hindawi.com/journals/av/2011/734690/>
- 354 18. Tan J, Mu L, Huang J, Yu S, Chen B, Yin J. An initial investigation of the association between the
- 355 SARS outbreak and weather: with the view of the environmental temperature and its variation.
- 356 J Epidemiol Community Health [Internet]. 2005 Mar 1 [cited 2020 May 4];59(3):186–92.
- 357 Available from: <https://jech.bmj.com/content/59/3/186>
- 358 19. Doremalen N van, Bushmaker T, Munster VJ. Stability of Middle East respiratory syndrome
- 359 coronavirus (MERS-CoV) under different environmental conditions. Eurosurveillance [Internet].
- 360 2013 Sep 19 [cited 2020 May 4];18(38):20590. Available from:
- 361 <https://www.eurosurveillance.org/content/10.2807/1560-7917.ES2013.18.38.20590>
- 362 20. Stensballe LG, Nante E, Jensen IP, Kofoed P-E, Poulsen A, Jensen H, et al. Acute lower
- 363 respiratory tract infections and respiratory syncytial virus in infants in Guinea-Bissau: a
- 364 beneficial effect of BCG vaccination for girls: Community based case–control study. Vaccine
- 365 [Internet]. 2005 Jan 26 [cited 2020 Apr 4];23(10):1251–7. Available from:
- 366 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0264410X04006747>
- 367 21. de Castro MJ, Pardo-Seco J, Martínón-Torres F. Nonspecific (Heterologous) Protection of
- 368 Neonatal BCG Vaccination Against Hospitalization Due to Respiratory Infection and Sepsis. Clin
- 369 Infect Dis [Internet]. 2015 Jun 1 [cited 2020 May 4];60(11):1611–9. Available from:
- 370 <https://academic.oup.com/cid/article/60/11/1611/356084>
- 371 22. Niobey FM, Duchiae MP, Vasconcelos AG, de Carvalho ML, Leal M do C, Valente JG. [Risk
- 372 factors for death caused by pneumonia in children younger than 1 year old in a metropolitan
- 373 region of southeastern Brazil. A case- control study]. Rev Saude Publica. 1992 Aug;26(4):229–
- 374 38.
- 375 23. Kleinnijenhuis J, Quintin J, Preijers F, Joosten LAB, Ifrim DC, Saeed S, et al. Bacille Calmette-
- 376 Guerin induces NOD2-dependent nonspecific protection from reinfection via epigenetic

- 377 reprogramming of monocytes. Proc Natl Acad Sci [Internet]. 2012 Oct 23 [cited 2020 Apr
378 4];109(43):17537–42. Available from: <http://www.pnas.org/cgi/doi/10.1073/pnas.1202870109>
- 379 24. van den Driessche P, Watmough J. Further Notes on the Basic Reproduction Number. In: Brauer
380 F, van den Driessche P, Wu J, editors. Mathematical Epidemiology [Internet]. Berlin, Heidelberg:
381 Springer; 2008 [cited 2020 May 4]. p. 159–78. (Lecture Notes in Mathematics). Available from:
382 https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-540-78911-6_6
- 383 25. James Holland Jones *. Notes On R0. In. Available from:
384 <https://web.stanford.edu/~jhj1/teachingdocs/Jones-on-R0.pdf>
- 385 26. Considerations relating to social distancing measures in response to COVID-19 – second update
386 23 March 2020 [Internet]. Available from:
387 [https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/covid-19-social-distancing-](https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/covid-19-social-distancing-measuresg-guide-second-update.pdf)
388 [measuresg-guide-second-update.pdf](https://www.ecdc.europa.eu/sites/default/files/documents/covid-19-social-distancing-measuresg-guide-second-update.pdf)
- 389 27. Yu X, Yang R. COVID-19 transmission through asymptomatic carriers is a challenge to
390 containment. Influenza Other Respir Viruses [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 4];n/a(n/a). Available
391 from: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1111/irv.12743>
- 392 28. Privacy Policy. You can manage your preferences in ‘Manage Cookies’. Loading web-font
393 TeX/Size2/Regular Skip to main content Thank you for visiting nature.com. You are using a
394 browser version with limited support for CSS. To obtain the best experience, we recommend
395 you use a more up to date browser (or turn off compatibility mode in Internet Explorer). In the
396 meantime, to ensure continued support, we are displaying the site without styles and
397 JavaScript. naturenature medicinebrief communicationsarticle A Nature Research Journal
398 Menu Nature MedicineNature Medicine Search E-alert Submit Login Brief Communication
399 Published: 15 April 2020 Temporal dynamics in viral shedding and transmissibility of COVID-19
400 Xi He, Eric H. Y. Lau, Peng Wu, Xilong Deng, Jian Wang, Xinxin Hao, Yiu Chung Lau, Jessica Y.
401 Wong, Yujuan Guan, Xinghua Tan, Xiaoneng Mo, Yanqing Chen, Baolin Liao, Weilie Chen,
402 Fengyu Hu, Qing Zhang, Mingqiu Zhong, Yanrong Wu, Lingzhai Zhao, Fuchun Zhang, Benjamin J.

- 403 Cowling, Fang Li & Gabriel M. Leung. Temporal dynamics in viral shedding and transmissibility
404 of COVID-19 | Nature Medicine [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 4]. Available from:
405 <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-020-0869-5>
- 406 29. Cheng H-Y, Jian S-W, Liu D-P, Ng T-C, Huang W-T, Lin H-H. Contact Tracing Assessment of
407 COVID-19 Transmission Dynamics in Taiwan and Risk at Different Exposure Periods Before and
408 After Symptom Onset. JAMA Intern Med [Internet]. 2020 May 1 [cited 2020 May 4]; Available
409 from: <https://jamanetwork.com/journals/jamainternalmedicine/fullarticle/2765641>
- 410 30. Huaiyu Tian, Yonghong Liu, Yidan Li, Chieh-Hsi Wu, Bin Chen, Moritz U. G. Kraemer, Bingying Li
411 Jun Cai. An investigation of transmission control measures during the first 50 days of the
412 COVID-19 epidemic in China | Science [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 4]. Available from:
413 <https://science.sciencemag.org/content/early/2020/03/30/science.abb6105>
- 414 31. Signorelli C, Scognamiglio T, Odone A. COVID-19 in Italy: impact of containment measures and
415 prevalence estimates of infection in the general population. Acta Bio-Medica Atenei Parm. 2020
416 10;91(3-S):175–9.
- 417 32. Giordano G, Blanchini F, Bruno R, Colaneri P, Di Filippo A, Di Matteo A, et al. Modelling the
418 COVID-19 epidemic and implementation of population-wide interventions in Italy. Nat Med
419 [Internet]. 2020 Apr 22 [cited 2020 May 4];1–6. Available from:
420 <https://www.nature.com/articles/s41591-020-0883-7>
- 421 33. Tobías A. Evaluation of the lockdowns for the SARS-CoV-2 epidemic in Italy and Spain after one
422 month follow up. Sci Total Environ [Internet]. 2020 Jul 10 [cited 2020 Apr 21];725:138539.
423 Available from: <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969720320520>
- 424 34. Liu K, Ai S, Song S, Zhu G, Tian F, Li H, et al. Population movement, city closure in Wuhan and
425 geographical expansion of the 2019-nCoV pneumonia infection in China in January 2020. Clin
426 Infect Dis Off Publ Infect Dis Soc Am. 2020 Apr 17;
- 427 35. Lasry A. Timing of Community Mitigation and Changes in Reported COVID-19 and Community
428 Mobility — Four U.S. Metropolitan Areas, February 26–April 1, 2020. MMWR Morb Mortal

- 429 Wkly Rep [Internet]. 2020 [cited 2020 May 4];69. Available from:
430 <https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/volumes/69/wr/mm6915e2.htm>
- 431 36. Lau H, Khosrawipour V, Kocbach P, Mikolajczyk A, Schubert J, Bania J, et al. The positive impact
432 of lockdown in Wuhan on containing the COVID-19 outbreak in China. *J Travel Med*. 2020 Mar
433 17;
- 434 37. Prem K, Liu Y, Russell TW, Kucharski AJ, Eggo RM, Davies N, et al. The effect of control strategies
435 to reduce social mixing on outcomes of the COVID-19 epidemic in Wuhan, China: a modelling
436 study. *Lancet Public Health* [Internet]. 2020 Mar 25 [cited 2020 May 4];0(0). Available from:
437 [https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lanpub/article/PIIS2468-2667\(20\)30073-6/abstract](https://www.thelancet.com/journals/lanpub/article/PIIS2468-2667(20)30073-6/abstract)
- 438 38. Li C, Romagnani P, von Brunn A, Anders H-J. SARS-CoV-2 and Europe: timing of containment
439 measures for outbreak control. *Infection* [Internet]. 2020 Apr 9 [cited 2020 May 4];1-4.
440 Available from: <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC7142270/>
- 441 39. Quarantine alone or in combination with other public health measures to control COVID-19: a
442 rapid review - Nussbaumer-Streit, B - 2020 | Cochrane Library [Internet]. [cited 2020 May 4].
443 Available from: <https://www.cochranelibrary.com/cdsr/doi/10.1002/14651858.CD013574/full>
- 444 40. Sobral MFF, Duarte GB, da Penha Sobral AIG, Marinho MLM, de Souza Melo A. Association
445 between climate variables and global transmission of SARS-CoV-2. *Sci Total Environ* [Internet].
446 2020 Aug 10 [cited 2020 May 4];729:138997. Available from:
447 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969720325146>
- 448 41. Wu Y, Jing W, Liu J, Ma Q, Yuan J, Wang Y, et al. Effects of temperature and humidity on the
449 daily new cases and new deaths of COVID-19 in 166 countries. *Sci Total Environ* [Internet]. 2020
450 Aug 10 [cited 2020 May 4];729:139051. Available from:
451 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969720325687>
- 452 42. Do weather conditions influence the transmission of the coronavirus (SARS-CoV-2)? [Internet].
453 CEBM. [cited 2020 May 4]. Available from: <https://www.cebm.net/covid-19/do-weather-conditions-influence-the-transmission-of-the-coronavirus-sars-cov-2/>
- 454

- 455 43. Wang J, Tang K, Feng K, Lv W. High Temperature and High Humidity Reduce the Transmission of
456 COVID-19 [Internet]. Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network; 2020 Mar [cited 2020
457 May 4]. Report No.: ID 3551767. Available from: <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=3551767>
- 458 44. Liu J, Zhou J, Yao J, Zhang X, Li L, Xu X, et al. Impact of meteorological factors on the COVID-19
459 transmission: A multi-city study in China. *Sci Total Environ* [Internet]. 2020 Jul 15 [cited 2020
460 Apr 21];726:138513. Available from:
461 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S004896972032026X>
- 462 45. Şahin M. Impact of weather on COVID-19 pandemic in Turkey. *Sci Total Environ* [Internet]. 2020
463 Aug 1 [cited 2020 May 4];728:138810. Available from:
464 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969720323275>
- 465 46. Tobías A, Molina T. Is temperature reducing the transmission of COVID-19? *Environ Res*
466 [Internet]. 2020 Jul 1 [cited 2020 Apr 27];186:109553. Available from:
467 <http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0013935120304461>
- 468 47. Sajadi MM, Habibzadeh P, Vintzileos A, Shokouhi S, Miralles-Wilhelm F, Amoroso A.
469 Temperature, Humidity and Latitude Analysis to Predict Potential Spread and Seasonality for
470 COVID-19 [Internet]. Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network; 2020 Mar [cited 2020
471 May 4]. Report No.: ID 3550308. Available from: <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=3550308>
- 472 48. Lund Jensen N, Pedersen HS, Vestergaard M, Mercer SW, Glümer C, Prior A. The impact of
473 socioeconomic status and multimorbidity on mortality: a population-based cohort study. *Clin*
474 *Epidemiol* [Internet]. 2017 May 10 [cited 2020 May 4];9:279–89. Available from:
475 <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5436773/>
- 476 49. Saydah SH, Imperatore G, Beckles GL. Socioeconomic Status and Mortality. *Diabetes Care*
477 [Internet]. 2013 Jan [cited 2020 May 4];36(1):49–55. Available from:
478 <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3526248/>
- 479 50. Kim S, Seo YB, Jung E. Prediction of COVID-19 transmission dynamics using a mathematical
480 model considering behavior changes. *Epidemiol Health*. 2020 Apr 13;e2020026.

- 481 51. Oksanen A, Kaakinen M, Latikka R, Savolainen I, Savela N, Koivula A. Regulation and Trust: 3-
482 Month Follow-up Study on COVID-19 Mortality in 25 European Countries. JMIR Public Health
483 Surveill. 2020 24;6(2):e19218.
484





























