

1 **Construction and application of a revised satisfaction index model for Chinese urban**

2 **and rural residents basic medical insurance**

3

4

5 Wenwei Cheng^{1¶}, Jin Cheng^{1¶}, Xiaofang Liu¹, Yanyan Wu¹, Weichu Sun², Xiaofang Yan¹, Liai

6 Peng¹, Xiaoli Liu¹, Qi Wang¹, Mingming Luo¹, Tingting Sha¹, Jingcheng Shi^{1*}, Fang Yang^{1*}

7

8

9

10 ¹Department of Epidemiology and Medical Statistics, Central South University, Changsha,

11 Hunan, China.

12 ²Department of Orthopedics, University of South China, Hengyang, Hunan, China

13

14

15 *Corresponding author

16 E-mail: shijch@csu.edu.cn(JS), yangfang2010@csu.edu.cn(FY)

17

18

19 [¶]These Authors contributed equally to this work.

20

21 **Abstract**

22 **Background:** Quality is the most important factor of satisfaction. However, the existing
23 URRBMI index model lacks the decomposition of the connotation of perceived quality and
24 cannot provide a reference for quality improvement and satisfaction promotion.

25 **Objective:** This study aims to construct a Satisfaction Index Model for Chinese Urban and
26 Rural Residents Basic Medical Insurance (SIM-URRBMI) with accurate and detailed
27 measurement of perceived quality and give a feasible and scientific suggestion for URRBMI
28 or insurance for other countries in the world.

29 **Methods:** Based on the theoretical framework of The American Customer Satisfaction Index
30 (ACSI), the connotation of perceived quality was refined by literature review and expert
31 consultation to form a pool of alternative measurement variables. A three-stage randomized
32 stratified cluster sampling was adopted to select the main decision makers for pupils'
33 URRBMI in 8 primary schools from Changsha City. Both Classic Test Theory (CTT) and
34 Item Response Theory (IRT) were used for selection of the measurement variables. The
35 model's reliability and validity were tested using partial least square (PLS) related methods.

36 **Results:** A total of 1909 respondents who had insurance for their children were investigated
37 with the initial questionnaire. The revised SIM-URRBMI consists of 11 latent variables and
38 28 measurement variables with good reliability and validity. Among the three explanatory
39 variables of public satisfaction, perceived quality had the largest total effect (0.737). The
40 variable with greatest effect among the five first-order latent variables on perceived quality
41 was quality of the medical insurance policy (0.472).

42 **Conclusions:** The revised SIM-URRBMI consists of 11 latent variables and 28 measurement

43 variables with good reliability and validity. It provides accurate assessment of perceived
44 quality, which will greatly help performance improvement. Perceived quality is crucial to
45 public satisfaction, especially, the most important aspects are policies regarding medical
46 insurance reimbursement (basic coverage scope, coinsurance, deductible).

47 **Keywords:** Satisfaction index model; Basic Medical Insurance for Urban and Rural Residents;
48 PLS-SEM; reliability; validity

49 **Introduction**

50 According to the 2015 World Health Organization (WHO) report, 6% of people in low-
51 and middle-income countries are forced into extreme poverty because of medical
52 expenditures. The Chinese government has been trying to establish a multilevel medical
53 security system that is mainly based on the social basic medical insurance (BMI) schemes so
54 as to protect the finances of individuals and households affected by illness and injury to some
55 extent. In order to improve equity, sustainability, and efficiency, China has taken an initial
56 step to integrate new cooperative medical scheme (NCMS) and urban resident-based basic
57 medical insurance (URBMI) into the urban and rural residents' basic medical insurance
58 scheme (URRBMI) [1-2].

59 Voluntary enrollment is a principle of URRBMI in China [3]. The enrollee's satisfaction
60 and loyalty are crucial for the scheme's effective implementation and sustained development.
61 Moreover, analyzing the enrollee's satisfaction with their health insurance and its influencing
62 factors can help to shed light on current and future policy decision making [0, 4-4]. ACSI is
63 one of the most widely used and representative quantitative measurement scales that shows
64 the cause-and-effect relationship linking the casual variables of customer satisfaction to their
65 consequent effect variable (customer loyalty) [6]. The model construction theory of ACSI
66 provides an important reference for assessing the attitude and major improvement direction of
67 the URRBMI from the perspective of insured participants. Using the ACSI as a basis and
68 considering the Chinese social and cultural backgrounds, Peng et al. constructed a satisfaction
69 index model for URRBMI that demonstrated good reliability and validity for satisfaction
70 measurement [7-8]. There has been sufficient literature supporting the notion that perceived

71 quality may be the most worthwhile topic in service area satisfaction research, and
72 satisfaction is mainly determined by perceived quality [6, 9-10]. However, Peng's model only
73 adopted a few indicators to assess perceived quality, such as the overall quality assessment
74 question, "how much help does the URRBMI bring to your child?". The lack of
75 comprehensive and detailed aspects of URRBMI quality measurement greatly limit its further
76 use in health reform [7-8].

77 In addition, since significant variation in economic and cultural backgrounds,
78 accessibility of health services, and reimbursement policies existed between rural and urban
79 residents before the URRBMI integration, it is necessary to consider the modeling
80 heterogeneity from a theoretical and practical perspective to learn about the differences
81 between groups of the insured (rural VS urban) [11].

82 The aims of this study are to revise and validate the SIM-URRBMI and identify the main
83 quality aspects needed to be improved in order to provide a valid, reliable, and practical
84 satisfaction measurement tool for URRBMI. In addition, using heterogeneity analysis, we aim
85 to explore the differences in satisfaction mechanism between rural and urban participants.

86 **Materials and Methods**

87 **Participants and Sampling**

88 This study was conducted in Changsha, the capital city of the Chinese Province of Hunan,
89 which completed the integration of NCMS and URBMI in 2011. A three-stage randomized
90 stratified cluster sampling method was used to ensure a representative sample. The first stage
91 was to randomly select two districts/counties from the nine districts/counties of Changsha
92 City. The second stage was to randomly select two primary schools for each selected
93 district/county. Finally, for each selected school, six classes (one class from each grade) were
94 randomly selected, and questionnaires were sent home; the main family decision maker
95 responsible for the pupils' URRBMI was instructed to fill out the questionnaires. The
96 inclusion criteria were: a) had insurance for their children in 2017-2018; b) were inhabitants
97 of a city or village in Changsha; c) were the main decision maker for pupils' URRBMI in their
98 family. Both the students in the selected classes and the main family decision makers
99 responsible for the pupils' URRBMI were subjects of investigation.

100 This study used a graded response model (GRM) to identify the measurement variables.
101 In order to make the estimated parameters more accurate, a sample size of at least 500 cases is
102 suitable. The selected samples of measurement variables included in this paper are 574 cases,
103 which meet the requirements[13]. The sample size for model evaluation was calculated by the
104 following formula, $n \geq 50r^2 - 450r + 1100$ (r is the ratio of measurement variables to latent
105 variables), which was based on the structural equation model research conducted by Westland
106 et al. A minimum sample size of 216 was estimated. However, considering the need for
107 subgroup analysis, a sample size of 1335 was obtained for model evaluation, which met the

108 estimated requirements [13-14].

109 **Ethical approval**

110 The study protocol was reviewed and approved by the Medical Ethics Committee at Xiang
111 -ya School of Public Health, Central South University. Written informed consent was obtai
112 ned for each participant who was the medical insurance decision maker of the family.

113 **Model construction**

114 **Phase 1**

115 The programmed decision process, a method to simultaneously develop a scale by
116 nominal group (including pupils and their family members, local medical insurance
117 management and service officers, experts of social medicine, health management, primary
118 health care, health statistics, and epidemiology et al.) and focus group (1 project leader, 1
119 professor of epidemiology and health statistics, 1 health insurance administration, and 4
120 graduate students), was used to construct the model. With reference to the literature, we
121 refined the "perceived quality" variable to five first-order latent variables, namely, overall
122 quality, information quality, service quality, policy quality, and institution quality. The draft
123 model consisted of 11 latent variables, including public expectations (PE), perceived quality
124 (PQ) (which was a second-order latent variable and consisted of the five first-order latent
125 variables), perceived value (PV), public satisfaction (PS), public complaints (PC), and public
126 trust (PT). Public expectation, perceived quality, and perceived value were the explanatory
127 variables of public satisfaction, while public complaints and public trust were the outcome
128 variables of public satisfaction. Consistent with Peng's research, we used the term "public" as
129 an alternative of the term "customer" and changed "customer loyalty" to "public trust". Then,
130 an initial draft variable pool (29 variables) was generated (see Table 1). Since the path of

131 public complaints on public trust was not significant according to Peng’s research, this path

132 was not set in the initial draft SIM-URRBMI.

133

134

135

136 **Table 1** The latent and measurement variables of the initial SIM_URRBMI

Latent variable	First-order latent variable	Measurement variables
Public Expectation		Overall expectations (PE1)
		Expectations of URRBMI to ensure basic medical needs (PE2)
		Expectations of URRBMI to ensure personalization medical needs (PE3)
Perceived Quality	Overall quality	Overall evaluation of quality (PQ1)
	Information quality	Availability of related information (PQ2)
		The convenience of obtaining relevant information (PQ3)
	Service quality	Service attitude of staff (PQ4)
		Clarity of staff’s interpretation of relevant policies (PQ5)
		Degree to meet the basic health insurance needs (PQ6)
	Policy quality	Degree to meet the personalized health insurance needs (PQ7)
		Satisfaction with the payment level (PQ8)
		Satisfaction with the scope of reimbursement (PQ9)
		Satisfaction with the reimbursement proportion (PQ10)
		Satisfaction with the deductible level (PQ11)
	Quality of institutions	Satisfaction with the capitation (PQ12)
		Service quality of community or village committees for enrollment (PQ13)
Quality of payment bank or online payment platform (PQ14)		
Service quality of authorized medical institution (PQ15)		
Service quality of reimbursement in medical institution (PQ16)		
Service quality of authorized pharmacy (PQ17)		
Perceived Value		Quality according to the payment (PV1)
		Payment according to the quality (PV2)
Public Satisfaction		Overall satisfaction (PS1)
		Service satisfaction to meets expectations (PS2)

	Distance close to the ideal medical insurance (PS3)
Public Complaint	Complained informally about URRBMI (PC1)
	Complained formally about URRBMI (PC2)
Public Trust	Willingness to positively evaluate (PT1)
	Willingness to recommend (PT2)

137

138 Based on expert consultation and literature review, the following path hypotheses were

139 established in the study (Fig 1):

140 **Fig1 The initial draft of SIM_URRBMI**

141 Hypothesis 1: Public expectation has a direct positive impact on perceived quality,

142 perceived value, and public satisfaction;

143 Hypothesis 2: Perceived quality has a direct positive impact on perceived value and

144 public satisfaction;

145 Hypothesis 3: Perceived value has a direct positive impact on public satisfaction;

146 Hypothesis 4: Public satisfaction has a direct positive impact on public trust;

147 Hypothesis 5: Public satisfaction has a direct negative impact on public complaints.

148 **Phase 2**

149 Classic Test Theory (CTT) combined with Item Response Theory (IRT) was applied for

150 the measurement variable selection. If a measurement variable reached 3 or more deletion

151 criteria, it was considered for deletion. CTT is based on the true score model (true score plus

152 error), and its selection methods and criteria are shown in Table 2. The basic idea of IRT is to

153 use a mathematical function to characterize the relationship between the test response; in this

154 study, θ refers to subject satisfaction with URRBMI. For the graded response model (GRM)

155 in this study, the discrimination parameter (a), Threshold Parameter (b), and Item Information

156 Function (*IIF*) were used to evaluate the quality of measurement variables. In addition, the
157 Test Information Function (*TIF*) is a linear cumulative measurement of each item *IIF*; that is,
158 the test information function on the θ value is equal to the sum of its *IIFs*. It is generally
159 considered that the quality of the model is good when the total of the information function is
160 greater than 25, while the quality is considered poor when the information function is less
161 than 16[15-16]. Since the initial draft of the SIM-URRBMI contains a total of 29
162 measurement variables, the average information function amount of each measurement
163 variable required (\bar{I}) ≥ 0.55 (16 / 29). The deletion criteria based on IRT are as follows: (1) *a*
164 is less than 0.3; (2) *b* is out of range of (-4,4); and (3) \bar{I} is less than 0.55.

165

Table 2 Item selection methods and criteria based on CTT

Methods	Criteria	Main test aspects
Floor effect	If 20% or more individuals choose the lowest score value, then delete it.	Sensitivity
Ceiling effect	If 20% or more individuals choose the highest score value, then delete it.	Sensitivity
<i>t</i> -test	The measurement variables with no statistically significant difference were deleted ($\alpha=0.05$) between 27% of the individual groups with the highest and lowest satisfaction scores.	Sensitivity or discrimination
Cronbach's α coefficient	If there is a large increase in the Cronbach's α of the dimension after the removal of an observed variable, then delete it.	Internal consistency
Correlation analysis 1	If the Pearson correlation coefficient of each measurement variable score and its corresponding dimension score is less than 0.6, then delete it.	Sensitivity or representation
Correlation analysis 2	If the Pearson correlation coefficient of each observed variable score and the initial model total score is less than 0.4, then delete it.	Representation
Stepwise regression	Using the total score of each latent variable as the dependent variable, the stepwise regression analysis is performed with candidate measurement variables as independent variables ($sl_e = 0.05$, $sl_s = 0.10$). The measurement variable excluded from the model will be deleted.	Importance
Factor analysis	Measurement variables with a factor load less than 0.4 will be deleted.	Independence

166

167 **Model validation**

168 The model validation includes two parts. The major reliability and validity tests were
 169 used to evaluate the measurement model. The value of Cronbach's α coefficient and the
 170 composite reliability coefficient were greater than 0.7. It is considered to indicate good
 171 reliability, and higher values indicate greater homogeneity. Outer loading (≥ 0.708) and
 172 Average Variance Extraction (AVE) (≥ 0.5) were used to assess the convergence validity, while
 173 the Cross Loading and Fornell-Larcker criteria were used to assess discriminant validity.

174 Good discriminant validity means that the outer loading of a measurement variable on its
175 corresponding latent variable is greater than its cross loadings on other latent variables, or the
176 square root of the *AVE* of each latent variable is greater than its linear correlation coefficients
177 with any other latent variables. Path analysis of the latent variables and model prediction were
178 used to evaluate the structural model [11]. The relationship between latent variables was
179 evaluated by estimating direct effect, indirect effect, and total effect. The model prediction
180 assessment indicators were the adjusted coefficient of determination (R_{adj}^2) (In general, R_{adj}^2
181 values of 0.25, 0.50, and 0.75 for target constructs are considered weak, medium, and
182 substantial, respectively.), the effect size (f^2) (Results of 0.02, 0.15, and 0.35 are interpreted
183 as small, medium, and large f^2 effect sizes, respectively.), and the predictive relevance (Q^2)
184 (The path model has predictive relevance for a selected endogenous construct if the Q^2 value
185 is above zero).

186 **Statistical analysis**

187 Second-order Partial Least Squares Structural Equation Model (PLS-SEM) was used to
188 test the model's reliability and validity, and PLS-SEM Multigroup Analysis (PLS-MGA) was
189 used to explore the heterogeneity between rural and urban participants. A two-tailed $P \leq 0.05$
190 was considered statistically significant. To be consistent with the international customer
191 satisfaction index, a one hundred percentage point system was used to express the public
192 satisfaction index (*PSI*).

193 The descriptive statistics and CTT analyses were conducted using SPSS 18.0. IRT
194 analysis was performed using Mplus version 7.0. PLS-SEM and PLS-MGA analyses were
195 conducted with SmartPLS 3.0.

196 **Results**

197 **Samples**

198 A total of 1909 participants who had insurance for their children were included in the
 199 primary data analysis. Table 3 shows the sociodemographic information of pupils and main
 200 decision makers for the model construction group and model validation group separately. For
 201 pupils, the mean age was 9.26±1.75, and the frequency of male (945, 49.89%) and female
 202 students (949, 50.11%) were similar. For the main decision makers, the mean age was
 203 37.13±5.90 years; most of decision makers were parents of pupils (1845, 96.95%), especially
 204 mothers (1196, 62.85%). Table 3 also indicates that there were no significant differences
 205 between the two groups for both pupils and main decision makers , suggesting that the two
 206 groups were homogenous. The measurement scores and comparative analysis between the
 207 two groups are shown in S1 Table .

208 **Table 3 Sociodemographic information of the pupils and the main decision makers for**
 209 **their BMI**

Variables	Model construction group (n=574)	Model validation group (n=1335)	All (n=1909)	Statistics	P
Pupils					
Age, Mean ± SD	9.26±1.78	9.27±1.74	9.26±1.75	0.553	0.580
Sex, n (%)				2.610	0.106
male	299 (52.73%)	646 (48.68%)	945 (49.89%)		
female	268 (47.27%)	681 (51.32%)	949 (50.11%)		
Sum	567 (100.00%)	1327 (100.00%)	1894 (100.00%)		
Health condition ^a , n (%)				0.957	0.339
Very good	323 (56.77%)	728 (54.99%)	1051 (55.52%)		
Good	222 (39.01%)	529 (39.95%)	751 (39.67%)		
General	24 (4.22%)	67 (5.06%)	91 (4.81%)		
Sum	569 (100.00%)	1324 (100.00%)	1893 (100.00%)		
Main decision maker					

Age, Mean ± SD	37.24±5.79	37.07±5.88	37.13±5.90	0.121	0.904
Relationship with pupils, n (%)				1.968	0.579
Father	192 (33.62%)	457 (34.31%)	649 (34.10%)		
Mother	360 (63.05%)	836 (62.76%)	1196 (62.85%)		
Others	19 (3.33%)	39 (3.93%)	58 (3.05%)		
Sum	571 (100.00%)	1332 (100.00%)	1903 (100.00%)		
Sex, n (%)				0.055	0.815
male	200 (35.03%)	474 (35.59%)	674 (35.42%)		
female	371 (64.97%)	858 (64.41%)	1229 (64.58%)		
Sum	571 (100.00%)	1332 (100.00%)	1903 (100.00%)		
Marital status^b, n (%)				—	0.764
Married	552 (97.01%)	1275 (96.37%)	1827 (96.56%)		
Divorced	16 (2.81%)	40 (3.03%)	56 (2.96%)		
Never Married	0 (0.00%)	4 (0.30%)	4 (0.22%)		
Others	1 (0.18%)	4 (0.30%)	5 (0.26%)		
Sum	569 (100.00%)	1323 (100.00%)	1892 (100.00%)		
Education^a, n (%)				3.230	0.520
Junior high school and below	163 (29.00%)	372 (28.38%)	535 (28.56%)		
High or technical secondary school	239 (42.53%)	583 (44.47%)	822 (43.89%)		
Junior college	94 (16.73%)	187 (14.26%)	281 (15.00%)		
Bachelor	57 (10.14%)	153 (11.67%)	210 (11.22%)		
Master or above	9 (1.60%)	16 (1.22%)	25 (1.33%)		
Sum	562 (100.00%)	1311 (100.00%)	1873 (100.00%)		

210 ^a Kruskal-Wallis H test ^b Fisher's exact test

211 **Model construction**

212 S2 Table provided GRM estimations of the discrimination (a) and threshold parameters

213 (b_1 - b_9) as well as their standard errors (SE). Table 4 shows the results of measurement

214 variable selection with the CTT and IRT methods. Using these methods, the ceiling effect

215 selected 5 variables (PQ1, PQ14, PE2, PT1 and PT2), Cronbach's α coefficient selected 1

216 variable (PS3), a selected 1 variable (PC1), b selected 9 variables (PQ9-PQ12, PQ16, PV1,

217 PV2, PS1 and PS2), and \bar{I} selected 4 variables (PQ1, PQ2, PC1, and PC2).

218

219 **Table 4 The results of measurement variable selection with the methods of CTT and IRT**

Variables	CTT							IRT			Selecte d	
	Floor effect	Ceiling effect	<i>t-test</i>	Correlation analysis 1	Correlation analysis 2	Cronbach's α coefficient	Stepwise regression	Factor analysis	<i>a</i>	<i>b</i>		\bar{I}
PQ1		x									x	2
PQ2											x	1
PQ3												0
PQ4												0
PQ5												0
PQ6												0
PQ7												0
PQ8												0
PQ9											x	1
PQ10											x	1
PQ11											x	1
PQ12											x	1
PQ13												0
PQ14		x										1
PQ15												0
PQ16											x	1
PQ17												0
PE1												0
PE2		x										1
PE3												0
PV1											x	1
PV2											x	1
PS1											x	1
PS2											x	1

PS3					x					1
PC1	—	—						x	x	2
PC2	—	—							x	1
PT1			x							1
PT2			x							1

220 x Suggested deletion

221 Overall, no item reached deletion criteria 3 or more times. However, it can be seen that
 222 the \bar{I} of PC2 is 0.005, suggesting that its contribution to the model is near 0, and its
 223 discrimination is also low (a is 0.351). In addition, with China's social and cultural
 224 backgrounds, most enrollees will not formally complain even if they are dissatisfied. Thus,
 225 the PC2 was deleted, and the remaining 28 variables were used to construct the
 226 SIM-URRBMI (Fig 2).

227 **Fig2 The final version of SIM_URRBMI**

228 Model validation

229 Reliability

230 The Cronbach's α coefficient for each of the latent variables ranged from 0.772 to 1.000,
 231 and the composite reliability coefficients ranged from 0.897 to 1.000, both of which are
 232 greater than 0.7, providing evidence that the revised SIM-URRBMI is reliable (see Table 5).

233 **Table 5 The reliability of the SIM-URRBMI**

Latent variables	Cronbach's α coefficient	Composite reliability coefficient
PQ	0.956	0.960
PE	0.918	0.948
PV	0.895	0.950
PS	0.867	0.919
PC	1.000	1.000
PT	0.772	0.897
PQ_overall	1.000	1.000
PQ_information	0.796	0.907

PQ_service	0.845	0.928
PQ_policy	0.933	0.946
PQ_institution	0.926	0.944

234 **Validity**

235 The results of the convergent and discriminant validity of the revised SIM-URRBMI are
236 summarized in Tables 6 - 8. The *AVEs* of all latent variables were greater than 0.5, and the
237 outer factor loadings of all the measurement variables ranged from 0.726 to 1.000, except
238 that the second-order external factor loadings for the PQ1, PQ2, and PQ3 variables (0.692,
239 0.595 and 0.684, respectively) was slightly below the critical value of 0.7, showing good
240 convergent validity. All of the outer loadings of the measurement variables on their
241 corresponding latent variable were greater than their cross loadings on the other latent
242 variables. The square roots of the *AVEs* for each latent variable were greater than the linear
243 correlation of the latent variable with the other structures, except for the perceived quality
244 variable, which has a slightly higher correlation with perceived value and public
245 satisfaction (Table 8). The results indicate good discriminant validity. All but one of the paths
246 were statistically significant and positive; the effect of public satisfaction on the public
247 complaints was negative, which is in line with the model theory framework. Table 9 and S3
248 Table show the result of the direct effects and the collinearity assessment of the
249 SIM-URRBMI. Furthermore, the greatest effect of the five first-order latent variables on
250 perceived quality was medical insurance policy quality (0.472) followed by institution quality
251 (0.354) (see Table 9). All variance inflation factor (*VIF*) values are clearly below the threshold
252 of 5. Therefore, collinearity among the predictor constructs is not an issue in the structural
253 model. The two paths with the greatest direct effect were perceived quality on perceived value
254 (0.676) and public satisfaction on public trust (0.634). S4 Table indicates the indirect effects

255 of the revised SIM-URBBI.

Table 6 The convergent validity of the SIM-URRBMI

Latent variables	Measurement variables	Outer factor loadings	Outer factor loadings (second order)	AVE
PQ	—	—	—	0.590
PQ_overall	PQ1	1.000	0.692	1.000
PQ_information	PQ2	0.898	0.595	0.830
	PQ3	0.924	0.684	
PQ_service	PQ4	0.930	0.756	0.866
	PQ5	0.931	0.761	
	PQ6	0.788	0.757	
PQ_policy	PQ7	0.783	0.731	0.716
	PQ8	0.796	0.750	
	PQ9	0.901	0.833	
PQ_policy	PQ10	0.903	0.836	0.759
	PQ11	0.884	0.832	
	PQ12	0.859	0.801	
	PQ13	0.856	0.783	
	PQ14	0.836	0.726	
PQ_institution	PQ15	0.912	0.839	0.759
	PQ16	0.920	0.844	
	PQ17	0.869	0.794	
PE	PE1	0.921	—	0.859
	PE2	0.943	—	
	PE3	0.916	—	
PV	PV1	0.951	—	0.905
	PV2	0.952	—	
PS	PS1	0.925	—	0.791
	PS2	0.928	—	
	PS3	0.811	—	
PC	PC1	1.000	—	1.000
PT	PT1	0.887	—	0.813
	PT2	0.916	—	

257

Table 7 Outer factor loadings and cross loadings of measurement variables for

258

theSIM-URBBI

Variables	PQ _{overall}	PQ _{information}	PQ _{service}	PQ _{policy}	PQ _{institution}	PQ _(second order)	PE	PV	PS	PC	PT
PQ1	1.000	0.499	0.582	0.586	0.597	0.692	0.427	0.561	0.584	-0.224	0.474
PQ2	0.428	0.898	0.496	0.515	0.439	0.595	0.287	0.444	0.460	-0.118	0.305
PQ3	0.479	0.924	0.619	0.588	0.529	0.684	0.333	0.482	0.515	-0.132	0.375
PQ4	0.577	0.544	0.930	0.595	0.703	0.756	0.440	0.565	0.597	-0.216	0.467
PQ5	0.507	0.603	0.931	0.645	0.645	0.761	0.434	0.568	0.604	-0.204	0.416
PQ6	0.533	0.546	0.610	0.788	0.584	0.757	0.448	0.596	0.624	-0.196	0.439
PQ7	0.442	0.537	0.566	0.783	0.556	0.731	0.389	0.540	0.591	-0.190	0.392
PQ8	0.505	0.478	0.514	0.796	0.612	0.750	0.455	0.671	0.633	-0.267	0.524
PQ9	0.521	0.516	0.578	0.901	0.666	0.833	0.394	0.674	0.698	-0.260	0.476
PQ10	0.512	0.500	0.565	0.903	0.681	0.836	0.421	0.680	0.708	-0.238	0.520
PQ11	0.494	0.522	0.570	0.884	0.690	0.832	0.409	0.681	0.684	-0.262	0.504
PQ12	0.463	0.502	0.544	0.859	0.658	0.801	0.366	0.652	0.672	-0.280	0.481
PQ13	0.490	0.456	0.675	0.644	0.856	0.783	0.493	0.590	0.650	-0.213	0.517
PQ14	0.507	0.418	0.583	0.573	0.836	0.726	0.478	0.565	0.597	-0.193	0.503
PQ15	0.546	0.505	0.653	0.706	0.912	0.839	0.521	0.678	0.735	-0.237	0.568
PQ16	0.553	0.507	0.663	0.706	0.920	0.844	0.534	0.693	0.747	-0.255	0.575
PQ17	0.526	0.458	0.608	0.671	0.869	0.794	0.535	0.629	0.671	-0.207	0.539
PE1	0.397	0.332	0.449	0.448	0.559	0.534	0.921	0.537	0.546	-0.083	0.486
PE2	0.391	0.297	0.444	0.437	0.542	0.517	0.943	0.547	0.541	-0.074	0.491
PE3	0.400	0.322	0.411	0.468	0.520	0.524	0.916	0.544	0.531	-0.052	0.454
PV1	0.540	0.484	0.577	0.726	0.685	0.755	0.556	0.951	0.795	-0.293	0.601
PV2	0.528	0.485	0.581	0.721	0.684	0.752	0.557	0.952	0.807	-0.264	0.589
PS1	0.581	0.493	0.629	0.741	0.754	0.797	0.559	0.831	0.925	-0.297	0.598
PS2	0.544	0.513	0.616	0.743	0.729	0.787	0.528	0.791	0.928	-0.276	0.563
PS3	0.419	0.420	0.462	0.583	0.571	0.615	0.461	0.604	0.811	-0.212	0.526
PC1	-0.275	-0.169	-0.277	-0.351	-0.310	-0.351	-0.093	-0.359	-0.364	1.000	-0.251
PT1	0.389	0.298	0.390	0.472	0.520	0.520	0.456	0.509	0.530	-0.142	0.887
PT2	0.462	0.376	0.461	0.542	0.587	0.600	0.472	0.613	0.607	-0.223	0.916

259

The bold number in the table is the external factor loadings of the measurement variable on its

260

corresponding latent variable, and the rest are the cross loadings.

261

Table 8 The Fornell-Larcker standard for the SIM-URRBMI

	PQ	PQ_ overall 1	PQ_ information	PQ_ service	PQ_ policy	PQ_ institution	PE	PV	PS	PC	PT
PQ	0.768										
PQ_ overall	0.692	1.000									
PQ_ Information	0.705	0.499	0.911								
PQ_ service	0.815	0.582	0.616	0.931							
PQ_ policy	0.937	0.586	0.608	0.666	0.846						
PQ_ institution	0.908	0.597	0.534	0.724	0.753	0.879					
PE	0.567	0.427	0.342	0.470	0.486	0.583	0.927				
PV	0.792	0.561	0.510	0.609	0.760	0.720	0.585	0.951			
PS	0.830	0.584	0.536	0.646	0.780	0.776	0.582	0.842	0.890		
PC	-0.286	-0.224	-0.138	-0.226	-0.286	-0.252	-0.076	-0.293	-0.297	1.000	
PT	0.623	0.474	0.376	0.475	0.565	0.616	0.515	0.625	0.633	-0.205	0.902

262 The bolded numbers in the diagonal of the table are the square roots of AVE for each latent
 263 variable

264

Table 9 The direct effects in the SIM-URRBMI

Direct path	Coefficient	SE	t	P	95%CI	
					Lower	Upper
PE→PQ	0.568	—	—	—	—	—
PE→PV	0.204	0.027	7.372	<0.001	0.145	0.253
PE→PS	0.070	0.021	3.362	0.001	0.034	0.119
PQ→PV	0.676	0.021	31.964	<0.001	0.639	0.720
PQ→PS	0.421	0.028	14.960	<0.001	0.361	0.474
PV→PS	0.467	0.032	14.698	<0.001	0.404	0.528
PS→PC	-0.243	0.020	11.847	<0.001	-0.280	-0.202
PS→PT	0.634	0.020	31.305	<0.001	0.596	0.674
PE→PQ_overall	0.428	0.027	15.651	<0.001	0.373	0.477
PE→PQ_information	0.344	0.026	12.981	<0.001	0.290	0.393
PE→PQ_service	0.471	0.026	18.247	<0.001	0.413	0.518
PE→PQ_policy	0.487	0.025	19.415	<0.001	0.437	0.534
PE→PQ_institution	0.584	0.023	25.431	<0.001	0.534	0.624
PQ_overall→PQ	0.069	0.002	36.692	<0.001	0.066	0.073
PQ_information→PQ	0.110	0.003	31.786	<0.001	0.103	0.117
PQ_service→PQ	0.135	0.003	47.898	<0.001	0.130	0.142
PQ_policy→PQ	0.472	0.006	76.267	<0.001	0.462	0.485
PQ_institution→PQ	0.354	0.005	64.894	<0.001	0.343	0.364

265 The total effect of the 14 paths of the SIM-URRBMI were statistically significant,
 266 showing that the model was constructed properly (see Table 10). The three strongest paths
 267 were (1) perceived quality on public satisfaction (with a total effect of 0.737, a direct effect of
 268 0.421 and an indirect effect of 0.316); (2) perceived quality on perceived value (with a total
 269 effect of 0.676); and (3) public satisfaction on public trust (with a total effect of 0.634). The
 270 largest total effect of the five explanatory variables of public trust was calculated for public
 271 satisfaction (0.634), followed by perceived quality (0.467). Among the three explanatory
 272 variables of public satisfaction, the greatest total effect was from perceived quality (0.737).

273 **Table 10 The results of the total effect analysis for the SIM-URRBMI**

Total path	Coefficient	SE	t	P	95%CI	
					Lower	Upper
PE→PQ ^a	0.568	0.022	25.377	<0.001	0.519	0.609
PE→PQ	0.588	0.025	23.122	<0.001	0.535	0.637
PE→PS	0.584	0.024	23.953	<0.001	0.535	0.630
PE→PC ^b	-0.142	0.013	10.963	<0.001	-0.168	-0.116
PE→PT ^b	0.371	0.023	16.142	<0.001	0.322	0.409
PQ→PV ^a	0.676	0.021	31.964	<0.001	0.639	0.720
PQ→PS	0.737	0.018	41.270	<0.001	0.699	0.771
PQ→PC ^b	-0.179	0.016	10.870	<0.001	-0.210	-0.143
PQ→PT ^b	0.467	0.018	25.732	<0.001	0.430	0.502
PV→PS ^a	0.467	0.032	14.698	<0.001	0.404	0.528
PV→PC ^b	-0.113	0.013	9.010	<0.001	-0.139	-0.090
PV→PT ^b	0.297	0.023	13.161	<0.001	0.252	0.336
PS→PC ^a	-0.243	0.020	11.847	<0.001	-0.280	-0.202
PS→PT	0.634	0.020	31.305	<0.001	0.596	0.674

274 ^a indicates that only the direct path was set, ^b indicates that only the indirect path was set

275

276 The adjusted coefficients of determination (R_{adj}^2) of each endogenous latent variable
 277 ranged from 0.088 to 1.000. The R_{adj}^2 values were 0.783 and 0.400 for public satisfaction
 278 and public trust, respectively, indicating a strong and moderate prediction. The effect size (f^2)

279 ranged from 0.014 to 0.903; the f^2 values for perceived quality on predicted perceived value,
 280 the perceived value on predicted public satisfaction, and public satisfaction on predicted
 281 public trust were 0.903, 0.351 and 0.667, respectively; all were greater than 0.35 indicating a
 282 strong predictive effect. The predictive relevance (Q^2) of all endogenous latent variables was
 283 greater than 0, ranging from 0.105 to 0.585, showing a certain predictive relevance for all five
 284 endogenous latent variables (see Table 11).

285 **Table 11 The results of predictive ability evaluation for the SIM-URRBMI**

		PE	PQ	PV	PS	PC	PT
	R_{adj}^2	—	1.000	0.654	0.783	0.088	0.400
	The predictive correlation (Q^2)	—	0.550	0.567	0.585	0.105	0.311
	PE	—	—	0.080	0.014	—	—
	PQ	—	—	0.903	0.290	—	—
The effect	PV	—	—	—	0.351	—	—
scale (f^2)	PS	—	—	—	—	0.097	0.667
	PC	—	—	—	—	—	—
	PT	—	—	—	—	—	—

286 **Model application**

287 The SIM-URRBMI satisfaction index scores were 57.29 and 58.17 for rural and urban
 288 participants, respectively. PLS-MGA showed that the total effect of public expectation on
 289 public satisfaction and public complaints was higher for citizens than for rural residents
 290 (0.627 vs 0.534, $P=0.037$; -0.166 vs -0.114, $P=0.042$). The total effect of perceived quality on
 291 public trust for citizens was lower than that of rural residents (0.429 vs 0.514, $P=0.023$) (see
 292 Table 12).

293
 294
 295

296 **Table12** Comparison of total effects between urban and rural residents' among latent variables

Total path	Rural areas		Urban areas		Rural vs Urban		
	$p^{(1)}$	$se(p^{(1)})$	$p^{(2)}$	$se(p^{(2)})$	$ p^{(1)} - p^{(2)} $	t	P
PE→PQ	0.548	0.034	0.588	0.028	0.042	0.954	0.340
PE→PQ	0.568	0.036	0.610	0.032	0.040	0.834	0.404
PE→PS	0.534	0.036	0.627	0.029	0.095	2.087	0.037
PE→PC	-0.114	0.016	-0.166	0.020	0.052	2.034	0.042
PE→PT	0.360	0.033	0.378	0.029	0.019	0.442	0.659
PQ→PV	0.697	0.032	0.662	0.030	0.032	0.724	0.469
PQ→PS	0.762	0.025	0.714	0.025	0.048	1.380	0.168
PQ→PC	-0.164	0.024	-0.189	0.023	0.026	0.773	0.440
PQ→PT	0.514	0.027	0.429	0.025	0.083	2.277	0.023
PV→PS	0.499	0.042	0.448	0.043	0.056	0.920	0.358
PV→PC	-0.107	0.018	-0.119	0.017	0.011	0.442	0.659
PV→PT	0.336	0.032	0.270	0.030	0.069	1.589	0.112
PS→PC	-0.214	0.029	-0.265	0.029	0.051	1.229	0.219
PS→PT	0.674	0.028	0.602	0.029	0.071	1.741	0.082

297

298 **Discussion**

299 China's medical reform has entered a critical period, there is an urgent need to understand
300 participants' satisfaction with BMI and to determine the main aspects that need improvement.
301 This work will provide important evidence for the performance improvement of the insurance
302 schemes and provide a critical reference for reform [4]. After more than 60 years of reform
303 and construction, China has finally established a basic medical insurance system that covers
304 the entire population for basic medicine. To meet participants' growing basic need for a better
305 life, it is necessary to continuously improve the quality of universal medical insurance from
306 the perspective of the insured [17].

307 Moreover, the quality of medical insurance determines the satisfaction of the insured to a
308 large extent. The original SIM-URRBMI developed by Peng et al has provide a standard
309 measurement of satisfaction, but could not provide detailed information for the diagnosis of
310 poor quality as there were few detailed quality items. This study constructed the perceived
311 quality variable as a second-order latent variable based on the literature review and expert
312 consultation. The second-order SEM can not only reduce the number of structural model
313 relationships but also make the model path more concise and easier to understand. Most
314 importantly, it can measure the quality perception of URRBMI participants more accurately.
315 This characteristic will greatly help identify the aspects of URRBMI that are in urgent need of
316 improvement [18]. The results of the predictive ability evaluation showed that the R_{adj}^2 of
317 PS was 0.783, which is larger than the R^2 of PS in the original version of SIM-URRBMI
318 constructed by Peng et al. (0.63). From this point of view, it appears that the construction of
319 PQ as a second-order latent variable in this study increased the predictive power of public

320 satisfaction. This also verifies our hypothesis that the quality-refined model can measure PS
321 more accurately.

322 Additionally, this study also tested the path effect differences between rural and urban
323 participants; thus, it can not only reveal population heterogeneity in structural models but also
324 help identify the preferred path for quality and satisfaction improvement in a certain subgroup
325 population.

326 The measurement variables selection is a key step in model construction. CTT and IRT
327 complementary each other, combining both methods in measurement variable selection will
328 provide more stable and reliable choices and benefits for model construction. The result of
329 measurement variable selection revealed that the measurement variable PC2 (formal
330 complaint) had poor performance. It is consistent with Chinese cultural backgrounds that the
331 public seldom choose this method to express their dissatisfaction with public services.
332 Deletion of PC2 suggested that this study had a good rationale for its measurement variable
333 selection methods [19].

334 The Cronbach's α coefficients and composite reliability coefficients for all latent
335 variables were greater than 0.7, suggesting good internal consistency. except for the
336 perceived quality variable, which was slightly less than the linear correlation coefficient
337 between the perceived value and public satisfaction variables (One possible reason is that the
338 second-order external factor loadings for the PQ1-PQ3 variables were less than 0.7), all the
339 other results indicate that the model has good convergent validity and discriminant
340 validity. The total effect of perceived quality on public satisfaction is 0.737, which has the
341 largest total effect among all latent variables, indicating that PQ is the most important factor

342 affecting public satisfaction, which is consistent with the research conducted by Lang Xu and
343 Fornell C in the medical insurance field and Johnson MD in other research fields [20-21].
344 First, from the results of the path coefficients between perceived quality and its first-order
345 latent variables, it was seen that the quality of medical insurance policy had the greatest
346 impact on PQ with a total effect of 0.472, suggesting that medical insurance policy had the
347 greatest impact on public satisfaction. Second, PQ9 (basic coverage scope), PQ10
348 (coinsurance), PQ11 (deductible) and PQ12 (capitation) had larger second-order factor
349 loadings on PQ. Moreover, PQ9-PQ12 had larger discrimination parameters (2.4-2.8) from
350 the IRT *IIF* results. According to Juxiang Qin's point of view, the discrimination parameter
351 reflects the sensitivity, which can distinguish the sensitivity of all the participants' responses
352 to the question (that is, whether the project is a concern shared by everyone), and the *IIF*
353 result reflects that the insured residents are more concerned about the policies related to
354 reimbursement [22]. Therefore, reimbursement policy for URRBMI has the greatest impact
355 on the satisfaction of the insured residents, suggesting that the improvement of quality,
356 especially the medical insurance reimbursement policy quality, is crucial to improving
357 satisfaction with URRBMI.

358 The SIM-URRBMI satisfaction index score of the main family decision makers for the
359 pupils' BMI in Changsha was 57.59, which was lower than the satisfaction scores of the
360 insured farmers on the NCMS in 2014 (66.33) and the US federal government satisfaction
361 index scores (69.70) in 2017 [21, 23]. The satisfaction index score can also be used as a
362 vertical comparison tool for the satisfaction research for URRBMI assessment. The
363 satisfaction index scores were 57.29 and 58.17 in the rural and urban areas, respectively,

364 indicating that the urban residents had a slightly higher satisfaction level of URRBMI in
365 Changsha, which is consistent with the research conducted by Fan Yan et al.[24]. The
366 PLS-MGA result showed that, compared to the rural residents, urban participants had a higher
367 total effect of PE on both PS and PC, while having a lower total effect of PQ on PT. PE is a
368 kind of expectation for future medical insurance policies based on past consumption
369 experiences. The urban residents had better policy welfare than the rural residents before the
370 consolidation. Thus, urban residents had higher expectations for URRBMI, and whether the
371 expectation is close or far from the actual situation, they may have, accordingly, had higher
372 positive effects (satisfaction) or negative effects (complaints) than rural residents.

373 There are also some limitations of this research. First, the sample population was the
374 main family decision makers for pupils' URRBMI and did not involve the other URRBMI
375 participants in the family (such as college students). The conclusion is limited to the entire
376 insured population. It is hoped that different insured populations can be included in future
377 stages to expand the applicability of the model. Second, this study is a cross-sectional study
378 that did not collect longitudinal data and, thus, could not estimate trends in URRBMI
379 satisfaction in the sample area.

380 **Conclusions**

381 The final version of the SIM-URRBMI consists of 28 measurement variables and 11
382 latent variables. It is a reliable and valid satisfaction measurement tool with good prediction
383 ability for public satisfaction and public trust. In addition, the model provides accurate
384 assessment for perceived quality of URRBMI, which will greatly help for performance
385 improvement.

386 **Acknowledgements**

387 The authors would like to thank all the participants, teachers, and leaders in the selected
388 8 primary schools, Liuyang City Center For Disease Control and Prevention and Tianxin
389 District Education Bureau.

390 **References:**

- 391 1. Jing LM, Chen R, Jing L, Qiao Y. Development and enrollee satisfaction with basic
392 medical insurance in China: A systematic review and stratified cluster sampling survey.
393 Int J Health Plann Manage. 2017;32(3):285-298.
- 394 2. Pan XF, Xu J, Meng Q. Integrating social health insurance systems in China. Lancet
395 2016;387(10025):1274-1275.
- 396 3. Zhu K, Zhang L, Yuan S, Zhang X, Zhang Z. Health financing and integration of urban
397 and rural residents' basic medical insurance systems in China. Int J Equity Health.
398 2017;16(1):194.
- 399 4. Mohammed S, Sambo MN, Dong HJ. Understanding client satisfaction with a health
400 insurance scheme in Nigeria: factors and enrollees experiences. Health Res Policy Syst.
401 2011;9(1):1-8.

- 402 5. Duan JM. [Research on Satisfaction of Medical Insurance in Rural Immigrant
403 Community in Guazhou County]. Gansu Agricultural University; 2016.Chinese.
- 404 6. Fornell C, Johnson M, Anderson EW, Cha J, Bryant BE. The American Customer
405 Satisfaction Index: Nature, Purpose, and Findings. *J Mark.* 1996;60(4):7-18.
- 406 7. Wang Q, Mo XK, Peng LA. [Evaluation of a Satisfaction Index Model for Pupils with
407 Basic Medical Insurance for rural and Urban residents]. *Chinese Journal of Health
408 Statistics* 2015;32(1):37-40. Chinese.
- 409 8. Peng LA, Mo XK, Shi JC, Lei SY. [Construction of a Satisfaction Index Model for Pupils
410 with Basic Medical Insurance for rural and Urban residents: Model Item Selection].
411 *Chinese Journal of Health Statistics* 2013;30(1):532-535+539. Chinese.
- 412 9. Fornell C National Customer Satisfaction Barometer: The Swedish Experience. *J Mark.*
413 1992;56(1):6-21.
- 414 10. Choi KS, Cho WH, Lee S, Lee H, Kim C. The relationships among quality, value,
415 satisfaction and behavioral intention in health care provider choice: A South Korean
416 study. *J Bus Res.* 2004;57(8):913-921.
- 417 11. Hair JF, Hult GTM, Ringle CM, Sarstedt M. A Primer on Partial Least Squares Structural
418 Equation Modeling (PLS-SEM). 2nd Ed ed: Thousand Oaks: SAGE; 2016.
- 419 12. Embretson B S E, Reise S P. Item response theory for psychologists. Mahwah: Lawrence
420 Erlbaum, 2000.
- 421 13. Westland JC. Lower Bounds on Sample Size in Structural Equation Modeling. *Electron
422 Commer Res Appl.* 2012;9(6):476-487.
- 423 14. Vinzi VE, Chin WW, Henseler J, Wang H. Handbook of Partial Least Squares: Concepts,

- 424 Methods and Applications. Berlin, Heidelberg, Springer; 2010.
- 425 15. Dani VV. Measuring Customer Satisfaction for F&B Chains in Pune Using ACSI Model.
- 426 Procedia Soc Behav Sci. 2014;133:465-472.
- 427 16. Qi SQ, Dai HQ. [Item Response Theory and Its Application Research]. Nanjing: Press of
- 428 Jiangxi education; 1992. Chinese.
- 429 17. Wang ZF. [Functional Positioning and Governance Mechanism of Medical
- 430 Insurance—Thoughts on Establishing National Medical Security Bureau]. Chin Heal
- 431 Insur. 2018(04):13-17. Chinese.
- 432 18. Ketchen, David J. A Primer on partial least squares structural equation modeling
- 433 (pls-sem). Long Range Plann. 2014;46(s1-2):184-185.
- 434 19. Sun ZQ, Xu YY. [Medical Statistics]. Fourth Edition ed. Beijing: People's Medical
- 435 Publishing House; 2014. Chinese.
- 436 20. Jonhson M, Gustafsson A, Andreassen TW, Lervik L, Cha J. The evolution and future of
- 437 national customer satisfaction index models. J Econ Psychol. 2001;22(2):217-245.
- 438 21. Xu L, Wang SL, Cao L. [Research on Satisfaction of new rural cooperative medical
- 439 system of farmers in Jiaozuo City of Henan Province]. Journal of Zhejiang Agricultural
- 440 Sciences. 2014(10):1643-1648. Chinese.
- 441 22. Qin JX. [Studies of Happiness Based on Item Response Theory]. Southwest University;
- 442 2016. Chinese.
- 443 23. ACSI 2017. ACSI Federal Government Report 2017 [Internet]. USA; 2017[cited 2
- 444 019 Mar 20]. Available from: [https://www.theacsi.org/news-and-resources/customer-s](https://www.theacsi.org/news-and-resources/customer-satisfaction-reports/report-archive/acsi-federal-government-report-2017)
- 445 [atisfaction-reports/report-archive/acsi-federal-government-report-2017](https://www.theacsi.org/news-and-resources/customer-satisfaction-reports/report-archive/acsi-federal-government-report-2017).

446 24. Yan F, Ma GD, Pan JJ, Xu N, Gu Y, Sun YF. [Investigation on satisfaction of overall
447 urban and rural residents after participating basic medical insurance]. St Sci Health.
448 2018;32(01):39-41. Chinese.

449 **Supporting information**

450 **S1 Table. The measurement scores and comparative analysis between two groups of the**

451 **initial draft of SIM_URRBMI.**

452 **S2 Table. Item parameter estimation from the GRM.**

453 **S3 Table. The result of the collinearity assessment in the revised SIM_URRBMI.**

454 **S4 Table. The indirect effects in the revised SIM_URRBMI.**

455 **Funding**

456 This work was supported by the project of "13th five year plan" of Hunan Education

457 Science in 2019 (XJK19BGD003) , the China Community Health Services & Health

458 Education Program (2014CC03), and education and teaching reform research project of

459 Central South University in 2019 (2019jy146).



