

1 **Title:** Vitamin D recommendations in nutritional guidelines: Protocol for a systematic
2 review, quality evaluation using AGREE-2 and analysis of potential predictors.

3

4 **Authors:** Fraile-Navarro D, López-García-Franco A, Niño de Guzmán E, Pardo-
5 Hernandez H, Canelo-Aybar C, Kuindersma J, Gich-Saladich I, Alonso-Coello P.

6

7 **Correspondence:** David Fraile Navarro. Address: Australian Institute of Health
8 Innovation, Level 6 75 Talavera Road, Macquarie University, North Ryde 2109
9 Sydney, NSW Australia. Email: david.frailenavarro@hdr.mq.edu.au Telephone: +61
10 (0) 492842669

11

12 **Authors' affiliations:**

13 David Fraile Navarro, MD, MPhil:

14 PhD Candidate, Australian Institute of Health Innovation, Macquarie University,
15 Sydney, Australia.

16 Previously: Health Centre Dr Mendiguchia Carriche, Leganes, Madrid (Spain)

17 Primary Care, Servicio Madrileño de Salud

18

19 Alberto López García-Franco, MD:

20 Health Centre Dr Mendiguchia Carriche, Leganes, Madrid (Spain)

21 Primary Care, Servicio Madrileño de Salud

22

23 Ena Niño de Guzmán, MD:

24 Centro Cochrane Iberoamericano

25 Hospital de Sant Pau i la Santa Creu, Barcelona (Spain)

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

- 26 Hector Pardo Hernandez, PhD:
27 Centro Cochrane Iberoamericano,
28 Hospital de Sant Pau i la Santa Creu, Barcelona (Spain)
29 CIBER Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERESP) (Spain)
30
31 Carlos Canelo Aybar, MD:
32 Centro Cochrane Iberoamericano
33 Hospital de Sant Pau i la Santa Creu, Barcelona (Spain)
34 CIBER Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERESP) (Spain)
35
36 Ignasi Gich Saladich, MD, PhD:
37 Centro Cochrane Iberoamericano
38 Hospital de Sant Pau i la Santa Creu, Barcelona (Spain)
39 Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona (UAB), Bellaterra (Spain)
40 Sant Pau Biomedical Research Institute (IIB Sant Pau), Barcelona (Spain)
41 CIBER Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERESP) (Spain)
42
43 Pablo Alonso-Coello, MD, PhD:
44 Centro Cochrane Iberoamericano
45 Hospital de Sant Pau i la Santa Creu, Barcelona (Spain)
46 Sant Pau Biomedical Research Institute (IIB Sant Pau), Barcelona (Spain)
47 CIBER Epidemiología y Salud Pública (CIBERESP) (Spain)

48 **Abstract**

49

50 **Background**

51 Vitamin D has been widely promoted for bone health through supplementation and
52 fortification of the general population. However, there is growing evidence that does
53 not support these strategies. Our aim is to review the quality and recommendations on
54 vitamin D nutritional and clinical practice guidelines and explore predictive factors for
55 their direction and strength.

56

57 **Methods and analysis**

58 We searched PubMed, EMBASE and CINAHL databases for vitamin D guidelines for
59 the last 10 years. We aim to perform descriptive analysis, a quality appraisal using
60 AGREE II scores (Appraisal of Guidelines Research and Evaluation) and a bivariate
61 analysis evaluating the association recommendations and AGREE II domains' scores
62 and pre-specified characteristics.

63

64 **Ethics and dissemination**

65 This is a systematic review protocol and therefore formal ethical approval is not
66 required, as no primary, identifiable, personal data will be collected. Patients or the
67 public were not involved in the design of our research. However, the findings from this
68 review will be shared with key stakeholders, including patient groups, clinicians and
69 guideline developers. We intend to publish our results in a suitable, peer-reviewed
70 journal.

71

72

73 **Keywords:**

74 Vitamin D, guidelines, quality appraisal, primary care, public health,

75 **Word count:**

76 Abstract: 178 words

77 Manuscript: 929 words

78 **Introduction**

79

80 Vitamin D plays a vital role in several physiological processes(1–4). The best
81 understood of these functions is calcium regulation, counter-regulating parathyroid
82 hormone secretion to maintain calcium serum levels(5) and calcium absorption in the
83 gut. It is predominantly synthesized via direct sunlight (ultraviolet B radiation)
84 exposure(6), as it is limited to only a few natural sources(7) in the human diet. Severe
85 deficiency leads to rickets in children and osteomalacia in adults; its deficit has been
86 associated with low bone mineral density(8), and increased risk of fractures(9).

87 Public health concerns about suboptimal vitamin D intake have led to the
88 development of dietary and supplementation recommendations(10) in nutritional
89 guidelines. However, the link between vitamin D intake and fracture risk is
90 controversial(11). These recommendations were initially addressed to populations at
91 risk of low sun exposure, particularly in northern latitudes(12). Early systematic
92 reviews(13–15) showed a decrease in fractures among older institutionalized women,
93 while more recent ones have demonstrated the absence of beneficial effect(16–22).
94 Of note is the absence of randomized clinical trials in the general population to
95 evaluate outcomes such as fractures, with only surrogate outcomes (e.g. bone mineral
96 density and 25-hydroxycholecalciferol (25-OH-D)(23) being available. Vitamin D
97 supplementation has not shown any effect in preventing cardiovascular disease or
98 cancer(24–26), and high doses paradoxically, have been associated with an increase
99 in falls in the elderly(27).

100 Another subject of debate is what constitutes vitamin D deficiency. While some
101 studies declared epidemic proportions of deficiency(28), others have not confirmed

102 these claims(10). Typically assessed with 25-OH-D serum levels, the threshold to
103 maintain adequate bone health is also disputed(10).

104 Our aim is to review and analyze Vitamin D recommendations present in
105 nutritional and clinical practice guidelines (CPGs) as well as potentially related factors
106 for these recommendations.

107

108 **Methods and analysis**

109

110 **Information sources & Search**

111

112 We searched Medline via PubMed, EMBASE and CINAHL databases. We
113 conducted our search for CPGs published between for the last ten years. The full
114 search strategy can be found in **Supplementary File 1**.

115

116 **Eligibility criteria**

117

118 We will include guideline publications, following the definition of the Institute of
119 Medicine(29). We will include those that formulate recommendations for vitamin D
120 intake, and/or screening for the general, healthy population. We will exclude
121 guidelines only addressed to the pediatric population (to prevent rickets), guidelines
122 on specific conditions (e.g. chronic corticoid users), guidelines addressed to
123 osteoporotic patients exclusively, or for secondary prevention of osteoporotic
124 fractures.

125

126

127 **Data extraction**

128

129 We will collect: year of publication, institution, region, target population,
130 proposed vitamin D levels, calcium advice (if given), sun exposure advice, screening
131 advice, fortification advice, suggested methods for vitamin D obtention, and
132 supplementation recommendations. Four reviewers will conduct screening, data
133 extraction, and quality assessment. We will resolve disagreements through discussion
134 or with the help of another reviewer (PA). We will classify recommendations following
135 the distinction that the Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and
136 Evaluation(GRADE) provides(30) in three categories: “Recommends”, for
137 unequivocal, strong recommendations; “Suggests”, for weak or conditional
138 recommendations; and “Does not recommend”, for guidelines which do not provide
139 advice in favor or recommend against supplementation.

140 We will also collect information concerning the authors’ potential conflicts of
141 interest (COIs) and how these are managed. We will focus on evaluating individual
142 COIs reporting and the potential Institutional COIs in accordance with methodology
143 implemented in previous evaluations(31,32). From each guideline, we will collect
144 information on each one of the categories identified by Hakoum et al. on its
145 methodological survey (32). These categories include not only financial conflicts of
146 interest but other less typically acknowledged categories such as intellectual COIs and
147 institutional financial and advocacy ties. Therefore, we will collect six different
148 dimensions of COIs including whether there is a COI clear process reporting, if the
149 authors reported affiliation, financial and intellectual COIs. We will also collect the type
150 of organization that formulates the recommendations and, if available, the institution’s
151 potential financial or advocacy COIs(32). Two reviewers (DF and CC) will collect this

152 data independently. In case of disagreement, we will resolve it by discussion and the
153 help of a third reviewer (PA). To perform our analysis we will summarize the different
154 potential COIs in three categories. “Detected” for guidelines that we detected potential
155 COIs in different of the aforementioned categories, “Undetected” for guidelines for
156 which we do not have detected potential COIs and “Not reported” for guidelines who
157 do not state at all a COI disclosure.

158

159 **Quality appraisal and risk of bias**

160

161 We will use the AGREE II (Appraisal of Guidelines Research and Evaluation
162 version 2)(33) instrument. This tool evaluates the methodological rigour and
163 transparency with which a guideline is developed. After calibration, four researchers
164 will evaluate publications independently. We will calculate the percentage of the
165 maximum possible score for each domain, and its standardized range (from 0% to
166 100%).

167

168 **Data analysis**

169

170 We will perform a descriptive analysis for each included guideline. We will
171 assess the reproducibility of quantitative measurements made by different observers
172 by calculating the intra-class correlation coefficients (ICC), and the associated 95%
173 confidence intervals (CI) for each AGREE II domain. We will conduct a bivariate
174 analysis to evaluate the potential association between recommendations and AGREE
175 II scores with the following factors: region, type of organization, target population,
176 suggested method to obtain Vitamin D, advice on sun exposure, advice on fortifying

177 strategies, and conflicts of interest. We will include in our logistic regression model the
178 results that remain significant in the bivariate analysis.

179

180 **Patients and Public Involvement**

181

182 Patients or the public were not involved in the design of our research. However, the
183 findings from this review will be shared with key stakeholders, including patient groups,
184 clinicians and guideline developers.

185

186 **List of abbreviations**

187

188 AGREE II: Appraisal of Guidelines Research and Evaluation / Appraisal of Guidelines

189 Research and Evaluation version 2

190 25-OH-D: 25-hydroxycholecalciferol

191 CPGs: Clinical Practice Guidelines

192 G-I-N: Guidelines International Network

193 GRADE: Grading of Recommendations Assessment, Development and Evaluation

194 COI: Conflicts of interest

195 ICC: Intra-class correlation coefficient

196 CI: Confidence interval

197

198 **Declarations**

199

200 **Ethics approval and consent to participate**

201 Not applicable.

202 **Availability and data material**

203

204 All data generated or analyzed during this study will be included in the
205 published article (and its supplementary information files).

206

207 **Competing interests:**

208

209 The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

210

211 **Funding:**

212

213 The project is not funded. Funding for English language editing and publication
214 fees was obtained via an award from the foundation for Biomedical Research and
215 innovation in Primary Care (Fundación para la Investigación e Innovación Biomédica
216 en Atención Primaria). The project have no other sources of funding.

217

218 **Authors' contributions**

219

220 DF contributed to design and developed search strategies and piloted data
221 extraction forms and wrote this protocol. AL and PA collaborated in the design and
222 protocol redaction. EN, EP and CC collaborated in this protocol redaction. IG
223 collaborated in designing data analysis and redacting protocol.

224

225

226 **Bibliography:**

227

228 1. Rosen CJ, Adams JS, Bikle DD, Black DM, Demay MB, Manson JE, et al. The
229 Nonskeletal Effects of Vitamin D: An Endocrine Society Scientific Statement.
230 Endocr Rev [Internet]. 2012 Jun 17;33(3):456–92. Available from:

231 <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3365859/>

232 2. Theodoratou E, Tzoulaki I, Zgaga L, Ioannidis JPA. Vitamin D and multiple
233 health outcomes: umbrella review of systematic reviews and meta-analyses of
234 observational studies and randomised trials. BMJ [Internet]. 2014 Jan
235 1;348(apr01_2):g2035. Available from:

236 <http://www.bmj.com/content/348/bmj.g2035>

237 3. Martineau AR, Jolliffe DA, Hooper RL, Greenberg L, Aloia JF, Bergman P, et
238 al. Vitamin D supplementation to prevent acute respiratory tract infections:
239 systematic review and meta-analysis of individual participant data. BMJ
240 [Internet]. 2017;356. Available from:

241 <http://www.bmj.com/content/356/bmj.i6583>

242 4. Castro M, King TS, Kunselman SJ, Cabana MD, Denlinger L, Holguin F, et al.
243 Effect of Vitamin D₃ on Asthma Treatment Failures in Adults With
244 Symptomatic Asthma and Lower Vitamin D Levels. JAMA [Internet]. 2014 May
245 28;311(20):2083. Available from:

246 <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?doi=10.1001/jama.2014.5052>

247 5. Suda T, Shinki T, Kurokawa K. The mechanisms of regulation of vitamin D
248 metabolism in the kidney. Curr Opin Nephrol Hypertens [Internet]. 1994
249 Jan;3(1):59–64. Available from: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/7850413>

250 6. Webb AR, Engelsens O. Calculated Ultraviolet Exposure Levels for a Healthy

- 251 Vitamin D Status. *Photochem Photobiol* [Internet]. 2006;82(6):1697. Available
252 from: <http://doi.wiley.com/10.1562/2006-09-01-RA-670>
- 253 7. Bischoff-Ferrari HA, Keller U, Burckhardt P, Löttscher KQ, Gerber B, l'Allemand
254 D, et al. Recommandations de la Commission fédérale de l'alimentation
255 concernant l'apport de vitamine D. In: *Forum Med Suisse*. 2012. p. 775–8.
- 256 8. Wacker M, Holick MF. Vitamin D—Effects on Skeletal and Extraskelatal Health
257 and the Need for Supplementation. *Nutrients* [Internet]. 2013 Jan 10;5(1):111–
258 48. Available from: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3571641/>
- 259 9. Cummings SR, Browner WS, Bauer D, Stone K, Ensrud K, Jamal S, et al.
260 Endogenous hormones and the risk of hip and vertebral fractures among older
261 women. *N Engl J Med*. 1998;339(11):733–8.
- 262 10. Ross AC, Taylor CL, Yaktine AL, Del Valle HB. Dietary reference intakes for
263 calcium and vitamin D. National Academies Press; 2011.
- 264 11. Bolland MJ, Leung W, Tai V, Bastin S, Gamble GD, Grey A, et al. Calcium
265 intake and risk of fracture: systematic review. 2015;
- 266 12. Webb AR, Kline L, Holick MF. Influence of Season and Latitude on the
267 Cutaneous Synthesis of Vitamin D₃: Exposure to Winter Sunlight in Boston
268 and Edmonton Will Not Promote Vitamin D₃ Synthesis in Human Skin*. *J Clin*
269 *Endocrinol Metab*. 1988;67(2):373–8.
- 270 13. Chapuy MC, Arlot ME, Duboeuf F, Brun J, Crouzet B, Arnaud S, et al. Vitamin
271 D₃ and calcium to prevent hip fractures in elderly women. *N Engl J Med*.
272 1992;327(23):1637–42.
- 273 14. Tang BMP, Eslick GD, Nowson C, Smith C, Bensoussan A. Use of calcium or
274 calcium in combination with vitamin D supplementation to prevent fractures
275 and bone loss in people aged 50 years and older: a meta-analysis. *Lancet*.

- 276 2007;370(9588):657–66.
- 277 15. Bischoff-Ferrari HA, Dawson-Hughes B, Staehelin HB, Orav JE, Stuck AE,
278 Theiler R, et al. Fall prevention with supplemental and active forms of vitamin
279 D: a meta-analysis of randomised controlled trials. *Bmj*. 2009;339:b3692.
- 280 16. Chung M, Balk EM, Brendel M, Ip S, Lau J, Lee J, et al. Vitamin D and
281 calcium: a systematic review of health outcomes. *Evid Rep Technol Assess*
282 (Full Rep). 2009;183(183):1–420.
- 283 17. Bolland MJ, Grey A, Gamble GD, Reid IR. The effect of vitamin D
284 supplementation on skeletal, vascular, or cancer outcomes: a trial sequential
285 meta-analysis. *lancet Diabetes Endocrinol*. 2014;2(4):307–20.
- 286 18. Chung M, Lee J, Terasawa T, Lau J, Trikalinos TA. Vitamin D with or without
287 calcium supplementation for prevention of cancer and fractures: an updated
288 meta-analysis for the US Preventive Services Task Force. *Ann Intern Med*.
289 2011;155(12):827–38.
- 290 19. Roth DE, Leung M, Mesfin E, Qamar H, Watterworth J, Papp E. Vitamin D
291 supplementation during pregnancy: state of the evidence from a systematic
292 review of randomised trials. *bmj*. 2017;359:j5237.
- 293 20. Zhao J-G, Zeng X-T, Wang J, Liu L. Association Between Calcium or Vitamin
294 D Supplementation and Fracture Incidence in Community-Dwelling Older
295 Adults. *JAMA [Internet]*. 2017 Dec 26;318(24):2466. Available from:
296 <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?doi=10.1001/jama.2017.19344>
- 297 21. Zhao J-G, Zeng X-T, Wang J, Liu L. Association Between Calcium or Vitamin
298 D Supplementation and Fracture Incidence in Community-Dwelling Older
299 Adults. *JAMA [Internet]*. 2017 Dec 26;318(24):2466. Available from:
300 <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/29279934>

- 301 22. Bolland MJ, Grey A, Avenell A. Effects of vitamin D supplementation on
302 musculoskeletal health: a systematic review, meta-analysis, and trial
303 sequential analysis. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol.* 2018;6(11):847–58.
- 304 23. Bischoff-Ferrari HA, Dietrich T, Orav EJ, Dawson-Hughes B. Positive
305 association between 25-hydroxy vitamin D levels and bone mineral density: a
306 population-based study of younger and older adults. *Am J Med.*
307 2004;116(9):634–9.
- 308 24. Scragg R, AW S, Waayer D, al et. Effect of monthly high-dose vitamin d
309 supplementation on cardiovascular disease in the vitamin d assessment study :
310 A randomized clinical trial. *JAMA Cardiol [Internet].* 2017 Apr 5; Available from:
311 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1001/jamacardio.2017.0175>
- 312 25. Manson JE, Bassuk SS, Buring JE, GD G, IR R. Vitamin D, Calcium, and
313 Cancer. *JAMA [Internet].* 2017 Mar 28;317(12):1217. Available from:
314 <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?doi=10.1001/jama.2017.2155>
- 315 26. Lappe J, Watson P, Travers-Gustafson D, Recker R, Garland C, Gorham E, et
316 al. Effect of Vitamin D and Calcium Supplementation on Cancer Incidence in
317 Older Women. *JAMA [Internet].* 2017 Mar 28;317(12):1234. Available from:
318 <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?doi=10.1001/jama.2017.2115>
- 319 27. Sanders KM, Stuart AL, Williamson EJ, Simpson JA, Kotowicz MA, Young D,
320 et al. Annual high-dose oral vitamin D and falls and fractures in older women: a
321 randomized controlled trial. *Jama.* 2010;303(18):1815–22.
- 322 28. Holick MF. High prevalence of vitamin D inadequacy and implications for
323 health. *Mayo Clin Proc [Internet].* 2006 Mar 1;81(3):353–73. Available from:
324 <http://www.mayoclinicproceedings.org/article/S0025619611614651/fulltext>
- 325 29. Guidelines I of M (US) C on S for DTCP, Graham R, Mancher M, Wolman DM,

- 326 Greenfield S, Steinberg E. Clinical Practice Guidelines We Can Trust
327 [Internet]. Clinical Practice Guidelines We Can Trust. National Academies
328 Press (US); 2011. Available from:
329 <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/24983061>
- 330 30. Schünemann H, Brozek J, Oxman A. GRADE handbook for grading quality of
331 evidence and strength of recommendations. Updat Oct. 2013;
- 332 31. Erickson J, Sadeghirad B, Lytvyn L, Slavin J, Johnston BC. The scientific basis
333 of guideline recommendations on sugar intake: A systematic review. *Ann*
334 *Intern Med*. 2017;166(4):257–67.
- 335 32. Hakoum MB, Anouti S, Al-Gibbawi M, Abou-Jaoude EA, Hasbani DJ, Lopes
336 LC, et al. Reporting of financial and non-financial conflicts of interest by
337 authors of systematic reviews: a methodological survey. *BMJ Open*.
338 2016;6(8):e011997.
- 339 33. Brouwers MC, Kho ME, Browman GP, Burgers JS, Cluzeau F, Feder G, et al.
340 AGREE II: advancing guideline development, reporting and evaluation in
341 health care. *CMAJ [Internet]*. 2010 Dec 14;182(18):E839-42. Available from:
342 <http://www.cmaj.ca/content/182/18/E839.short>
343