1 Pyrethroid resistance in Anopheles gambiae not associated with

2 insecticide-treated mosquito net effectiveness across sub-Saharan

3 Africa.

4 David A. Larsen^{1*}, Rachael L. Church¹

5 1. Syracuse University Department of Public Health, Syracuse, New York, USA

6 * Corresponding author.

7 Abstract

8 Background

9 Pyrethroid resistance is a major concern for malaria vector control programs that predominantly
10 rely on insecticide-treated mosquito nets (ITN). Contradictory results of the impact of resistance have
11 been observed in field studies.

12 Methods

13 We combined continent-wide estimates of pyrethroid resistance in *Anopheles gambiae* from

14 2006-2017 with continent-wide survey data to assess the effect of increasing pyrethroid resistance on the

15 effectiveness of ITNs to prevent malaria infections in sub-Saharan Africa. We utilized both a pooled-data

16 approach and meta-regression of survey regions to assess how pyrethroid resistance affects the

17 association between ITN ownership and malaria outcomes in children aged 6-59 months.

18 Findings

19 ITN ownership reduced the risk of malaria outcomes in both pooled and meta-regression

20 approaches. In the pooled analysis, there was no observed interaction between ITN ownership and

21 estimated level of pyrethroid resistance (Likelihood ratio [LR] test = 1.127 for the outcome of rapid

diagnostic test confirmed malaria infection, p = 0.2885; LR test = 0.161 for the outcome of microscopy

23 confirmed malaria infection, p = 0.161; LR test = 0.646 for the outcome of moderate or severe anemia, p

= 0.4215). In the meta-regression approach the level of pyrethroid resistance did not explain any of the

25 variance in subnational estimates of ITN effectiveness for any of the outcomes.

26 Interpretation

ITNs decreased risk of malaria outcomes independent of the levels of pyrethroid resistance in themalaria vector populations.

29 Funding

30 DAL did not receive funding and RC received a SOURCE grant from Syracuse University for31 this project.

32 Introduction

33 Insecticide-treated mosquito nets (ITN) have been one of the most effective public health interventions of the 21st century, preventing millions of deaths from the malaria parasite [1]. Previous to 34 35 their wide-scale deployment, more than 1 million people died annually across sub-Saharan Africa from 36 malaria infections [2], particularly the *Plasmodium falciparum* parasite, and the parasite caused a further 37 500 million cases. Broad scale-up of ITNs and across the continent in the early and mid-2000's [3] 38 contributed to this annual burden being cut in half by 2015 [4]. The 2018 World Malaria Report found 39 that all species of malaria were responsible for 435,000 global deaths and 219 million global cases in 40 2017 [5], a huge reduction from estimates earlier this century. It is worrisome, however, that the 2018 41 World Malaria Report found the first annual increase in global malaria cases since 2005.

42 Mosquito nets provide a personal barrier to prevent infective bites from malaria vectors that 43 predominantly bite at night [6]. An untreated mosquito net will protect the person sleeping beneath from 44 an infective bite of an infected mosquito. However, that infective malaria vector will likely seek a blood 45 meal elsewhere and thus continue malaria transmission. When the mosquito net is treated with insecticide 46 and the mosquito is susceptible, contact with the insecticide kills the mosquito and ends that mosquito's 47 capacity to continue transmitting malaria [7]. The subsequent effect of ITNs on malaria transmission is 48 profound [8]. When a high number of ITNs are used within a community, a mass killing effect from the 49 insecticide provides a community-level protection, sufficiently affecting the malaria vector populations 50 such that people who do not have an ITN are protected in similar ways to those that do have an ITN 51 [9,10].

52 Currently, pyrethroids are the only class of insecticides used on ITNs [11], although combination 53 nets treated with multiple insecticides are in various stages of testing [12–14]. Pyrethroids target the 54 central nervous system to kill mosquitoes and reduce the transmission of malaria by incapacitating the 55 vector [15]. Fears about malaria vectors developing pyrethroid resistance were raised at the inception of 56 ITNs [15], and early studies demonstrated widespread reports of resistance [16,17]. Although alarming, it 57 remains to be seen just how pyrethroid resistance will affect malaria control and malaria trends [18–20]. 58 Linking pyrethroid resistance in malaria vectors to ITN effectiveness to prevent malaria 59 infections and reduce malaria transmission has been more challenging than documenting the spread of 60 resistance. Some studies suggest that in areas with pyrethroid resistance, ITNs are less effective [21,22]. 61 Others find that ITNs are still associated with reduced risk of malaria despite high levels of pyrethroid

62 resistance [23–26]. These studies generally struggle with four separate issues. First, due to the inability to 63 randomly allocate ITN access, these studies suffer from selection bias wherein households with ITN 64 access are more likely to be predisposed to lower risk of malaria transmission than households without 65 ITN access independent of the effect of ITNs [27]. Second, some of these studies do not actually include 66 estimates of ITN effectiveness, and the studies that do utilize ITN use as their measure of effectiveness. 67 ITN use may not be the best measure to understand the impact of pyrethroid resistance on ITN 68 effectiveness. Even if malaria vectors are resistant to the insecticide in the ITN, the mosquito netting still 69 provides a physical barrier and consistent use will decrease mosquito exposure and thus malaria risk [28]. 70 This is evident where in areas of pyrethroid resistance ITNs with holes lose their effectiveness [29]. 71 Third, each of the studies is confined to a particular study site. Investigating phenomena at particular 72 study sites limits the variability of resistance available, as the broad spectrum of resistance prevalence is 73 not incorporated within the study. And fourth, the studies utilize an overly simplistic assessment of 74 insecticide resistance, typically with dichotomized low resistance and high resistance areas that prevent an 75 examination of a dose-response relationship between ITN effectiveness and pyrethroid resistance. 76 Herein we attempt to address these four challenges and better understand how widespread 77 pyrethroid resistance is affecting the ability of ITNs to reduce malaria transmission. We leverage 78 nationally representative surveys across sub-Saharan Africa and recently published near continent-wide 79 estimates of pyrethroid resistance of Anopheles gambiae in sub-Saharan Africa[30] to address the issues 80 of geographic limitation, a limited resistance spectrum, and oversimplification in the statistical measure of 81 insecticide resistance. We further utilize exact matching to minimize the influence of selection bias, and a

82 measure of ITN ownership rather than ITN use to reduce the residual confounding of the effect of

83 mosquito netting as a barrier.

84 Methods

85 Search strategy and selection criteria

86 We utilized data from nationally representative Demographic and Health Surveys (DHS) to assess 87 the relationship between insecticide resistance and the effectiveness of ITNs. All DHS surveys conducted 88 in sub-Saharan Africa between 2006-2017 that were publicly available as of January 15, 2020 were 89 considered for inclusion in the analyses with the following criteria: the survey contained information on 90 an outcome (malaria infection status in children either as measured through rapid-diagnostic test or 91 through microscopy, or anemia status as measured through a hemocue rapid hemoglobin assessment), and 92 the survey contained information on household ITN ownership. We further limited these surveys to those 93 that were conducted in areas with estimated prevalence of pyrethroid resistance [30]. The DHS program is

- 94 funded by USAID and assists lower income countries in conducting nationally-representative surveys
- 95 primarily aimed at measuring trends in child mortality and women's fertility with statistical power at the
- 96 regional (sub-national) level. Additionally, these surveys gather a host of information on numerous
- 97 factors associated with health, including malaria indicators when the survey is conducted in a malaria-
- 98 endemic country.
- 99 Outcome measures

We considered three separate outcome measures in children aged 7-49 months: confirmation of a
malaria infection through rapid diagnostic test, confirmation of a malaria infection through microscopy,
or hemoglobin levels < 10 g/dl (moderate to severe anemia). Anemia is an historical indicator of malaria
transmission, and is also known to be associated with effective malaria control such as ITNs [31].

104 ITN ownership measure

105 We defined the primary exposure of ITN ownership as the child living in a household that owned106 at least one ITN.

107 Exact matching of observations

108 Selection bias presents the largest challenge to validity in assessing ITN effectiveness in 109 observational studies. We followed an exact matching approach similar to the analysis of ITN 110 effectiveness conducted by Lim et al. to minimize this selection bias [32], wherein we matched 111 households on the probability of owning an ITN. Specifically, we matched households within survey 112 datasets on the following covariate pattern: region of the country as per the DHS, wealth categorized as 113 rich or poor, mother's education categorized as any or none, and the house being in an urban or rural 114 location. Matching was done using the MatchIt package [33,34], in R version 3.6.2 [35].

115 Statistical analysis

116 We utilized two separate approaches to assess the influence of pyrethroid resistance on the

- 117 effectiveness of insecticide-treated mosquito nets.
- 118 Pooled analysis approach.

119 We combined all survey data meeting inclusion criteria and exactly matched into a single dataset.

120 We extracted the estimates of resistance, seasonality of malaria transmission from the Mapping Malaria

121 Risk in Africa (MARA) maps [36], estimates of the *Plasmodium falciparum* parasite prevalence rate in

- 122 children aged 2-10 (PfPR) from the Malaria Atlas Project [37], and the relative abundance of the
- 123 Anopheles gambiae vector [38] to the cluster geocoordinates using the Raster package [39] in R version
- 124 3.6.2 [35]. *Pf*PR estimates were only available for the years 2000-2015 from the MalariaAtlas package,
- and so we assigned surveys conducted 2016-2017 *Pf*PR levels of 2015 (n= 14 surveys).

126 We then estimated the relationship between ITN effectiveness and the prevalence of resistance 127 using an interaction term predicting the outcome using a logistic regression approach with the matched 128 group as a random intercept (Equation 1). We adjusted analyses for child's age categorized as years (<1, 129 1, 2, 3, 4), household wealth quintile, mother's education (none, some primary, completed primary or 130 higher), whether the data were collected during the transmission season or not, household location (urban 131 or rural), and *Pf*PR levels (continuous). The three separate outcomes were modeled in the same fashion. 132 one for the outcome of RDT-confirmed malaria infection and the other for the outcome of microscopy-133 confirmed malaria infection. We conducted this analysis for all observations in the dataset, and then 134 limited the analysis to those observations where the relative abundance of An. gambiae was > 0.5. The 135 analyses were conducted using Stata version 15.1. 136 Equation 1: Representation of pooled analysis wherein π_{ijklm} is a dichotomous outcome for child i in

137 household j in cluster k in survey l in matched group m, ITN_j is whether the household has access to any

138 *ITN or not, Res_k is the level of pyrethroid resistance access in the community, C_{ijk} is a vector of child*

139 characteristics, H_j is a vector of household characteristics, S_k is a vector of cluster characteristics, and ζ_m

- 140 *is a random intercept for matched group m that is assumed to be normally distributed with a mean of*
- 141 *zero*.
- 142 $y_{ijklm} | \pi_{ijklm} \sim Binomial(1, \pi_{ijklm})$
- 143 $logit(\pi_{ijklm}) = B_1 ITN_j \times Res_k + \chi C_{ijk} + \delta H_j + \kappa S_k$
- 144 $\zeta_m \sim N(0, \varphi)$
- 145 Meta-regression approach

We parsed all survey data meeting inclusion criteria to DHS region level. We extracted the
estimates of pyrethroid resistance, the *Plasmodium falciparum* parasite prevalence rate in children aged 210 (*Pf*PR) from the Malaria Atlas Project [37], and the relative abundance of the *Anopheles gambiae*vector[38] to the DHS region level using the Raster package [39] in R version 3.6.2 [35]. *Pf*PR estimates
were only available for the years 2000-2015 from the MalariaAtlas package, and so we assigned surveys
conducted 2016-2017 *Pf*PR levels of 2015 (n= 14 surveys).
We then estimated the effectiveness of ITNs for each DHS region as described previously using

equation 1. We conducted a meta-regression of ITN effectiveness within DHS regions using the metafor

- package [40] in R version 3.6.2 [35] with the prevalence of pyrethroid resistance at the region level
- serving as the predictor. We also tested for interactions between pyrethroid resistance and both *Pf*PR as
- 156 well as the abundance of *Anopheles gambiae*.

157 Role of the funding source

DAL was unfunded for this work. RC received a SOURCE grant from Syracuse University. The sponsors had no role in the study design; collection, analysis, and interpretation of the data; in the writing of the report; and in the decision to submit the paper for publication. DAL had full access to all the data in the study and had final responsibility for the decision to submit for publication.

162 Results

163 Data available

We identified 92 survey datasets conducted in sub-Saharan Africa between 2006-2017 publicly 164 available as of January 15, 2020 with information on ITN ownership, malaria infection in children, or 165 166 child's anemia status. Of these 92 surveys, 30 were excluded from any analysis due to the following 167 reasons: 12 surveys contained no information on malaria infection or anemia status, 5 surveys contained 168 no information on household ITN ownership, and 8 surveys could not be matched to resistance estimates 169 (the surveys were conducted in Angola, Sao Tome and Principe, or Madagascar where no resistance 170 estimates were available). A further seven surveys had no cluster geocoordinates and so were excluded 171 from the pooled analysis but included in the meta-regression approach. Figure 1 shows the geographical distribution of 67 surveys included in the analyses. 172

173 Figure 1: Geographic distribution of data included in the analyses



174

175 Variation of pyrethroid resistance

- 176 At the survey cluster level, estimates of pyrethroid resistance within this dataset ranged from
- 177 10.5% to 99.9% with a median level of 89.1% (Figure 2). Pyrethroid resistance was associated with
- decreased levels of *Pf*PR within survey clusters (rho = -0.3061, n = 18,927 clusters) and decreased
- 179 relative abundance of *An. gambiae* (rho = -0.2321, n = 19,588 clusters).
- 180 *Figure 2: Distribution of estimated pyrethroid resistance across datasets included in the analyses.*



182 Effect of pyrethroid resistance on association between ITNs and malaria outcomes –

183 pooled analysis approach

181

184 After exact matching and adjusting for known predictors but without accounting for resistance, 185 ownership of an ITN was associated with a reduction in the risk of a malaria infection as well as having 186 moderate or severe anemia (Table 1). After accounting for resistance, there was no evidence of an 187 interaction between ITN ownership and pyrethroid resistance levels for any of the outcomes (Table 2). 188 ITN ownership was still associated with a reduction in the risk of a malaria infection as well as having 189 moderate or severe anemia. Limiting the analysis to areas with >50% An. gambiae did not change the 190 results. 191 Table 1: Association between ITN ownership and various outcomes without taking pyrethroid resistance 192 into account. Children were matched on probability of ITN ownership. Models were adjusted for

- 192 Into account. Children were matched on probability of 11 N ownership. Models were dajusted for
- 193 urban/rural, child's age, wealth quintile, mother's education, PfPR, malaria transmission season, and
- 194 survey dataset.

| Outcome | Adjusted odds ratio (95% | P-value | N children |
|---------|--------------------------|---------|--------------------|
| | CI) of ITN ownership | | (n matched groups) |

| RDT positivity | 0.90 (0.87 - 0.93) | < 0.001 | 137,943 (4,493) |
|---------------------------|--------------------|---------|-----------------|
| Microscopy positivity | 0.88 (0.84 – 0.91) | < 0.001 | 116,556 (3,643) |
| Moderate or severe anemia | 0.95 (0.92 - 0.97) | < 0.001 | 163,332 (5,486) |

195

196 Table 2: Likelihood ratio test for including an interaction term for pyrethroid resistance and ITN

197 ownership. Children were matched on probability of ITN ownership. Models were adjusted for

198 urban/rural, child's age, wealth quintile, mother's education, PfPR, malaria transmission season, and

199 *survey dataset.*

| Outcome | Likelihood ratio test for interaction between pyrethroid resistance and ITN ownership | P-value | N children (n matched groups) | |
|---------------------------|--|---------|----------------------------------|--|
| RDT positivity | 1.127 | 0.2885 | 137,943 (4,493) | |
| Microscopy positivity | 0.161 | 0.6880 | 116,556 (3,643) | |
| Moderate or severe anemia | 0.646 | 0.4215 | 163,332 (5,486) | |

200

201 Effect of pyrethroid resistance on association between ITNs and malaria outcomes –

202 meta-regression approach

203 Within-DHS region specific estimates of the effectiveness of ITNs were available for 349 regions

204 for the outcome of RDT-confirmed malaria infection, 243 regions for the outcome of microscopy-

205 confirmed malaria infection, and 611 regions for the outcome of moderate or severe anemia. In

206 unadjusted meta-analyses, ITN ownership was associated with a reduced risk of RDT-confirmed malaria

207 infection and microscopy-confirmed malaria infection, but not moderate or severe anemia (Table 3).

208 Pyrethroid resistance did not explain any of the regional variance in the effectiveness of ITN ownership

against the outcomes (Figure 3), nor did any interaction between pyrethroid resistance and either *Pf*PR or

- the abundance of *An. gambiae*.
- 211 Table 3: Results from unadjusted meta-analyses of ITN ownership on the outcomes. DHS data were

212 parsed to region. Children were matched on probability of ITN ownership. Region-specific models were

213 adjusted for urban/rural, child's age, wealth quintile, and mother's education.

| Outcome | Odds ratio (95% Confidence Interval) | P-value | N DHS regions | I-squared |
|---------------------------|---|---------|------------------|-----------|
| RDT positivity | 0.888 (0.833 - 0.947) | < 0.001 | 349 | 0.00% |
| Microscopy positivity | 0.857 (0.795 - 0.925) | < 0.001 | 243 | 0.00% |
| Moderate or severe anemia | 0.965 (0.921 – 1.011) | 0.1330 | 611 | 0.00% |

214

- 215 Figure 3: Bubble plots showing the relationship between pyrethroid resistance at the region level and
- 216 effectiveness of ITN ownership against a) RDT-confirmed malaria infection, b) microscopy-confirmed
- 217 *malaria infection, and c) moderate or severe anemia.*



219 Discussion

220 Key results

These results suggest that the effectiveness of ITNs is not affected by the prevalence of pyrethroid resistance across sub-Saharan Africa. ITN ownership was associated with a reduced risk of a malaria infection (either RDT- or microscopy-confirmed) as well as a reduced risk of moderate or severe anemia. These reductions were modest, just more than 10% for the malaria infection and 5% for moderate severe anemia. Importantly, however, pyrethroid resistance did not modify these reductions in any way. There was also agreement across both the pooled and meta-regression approaches utilized herein.

227 Limitations

228 Selection bias is present in the data, and occurs either as houses owning ITNs are predisposed to 229 less malaria transmission independent of ITN ownership or ITN distribution programs are targeted toward 230 areas of higher malaria transmission and therefore children in houses owning ITNs are predisposed to 231 more malaria transmission independent of ITN ownership. We attempted to mitigate the effects of this 232 selection bias on the analysis using exact matching, as we and others have done in previous analyses of 233 ITN ownership using these data [9,32]. It is possible that some residual bias is still present, and if so we 234 would expect that bias to overinflate the effect of ITN ownership. However, should there be a decrease in 235 ITN effectiveness with increasing pyrethroid resistance we would still expect to see that effect given the 236 limitations in the data.

237 Pyrethroid resistance estimates for these data were quite high, with a median of 89%.

238 Unfortunately, with such high levels of pyrethroid resistance spread across the continent we could not

examine the effectiveness of ITNs across the entire range from 0-100% resistance. Given the large

volume of data we included in our analyses we still had sufficient power to determine that ITN ownership

- reduces the risk of malaria infection even when estimated pyrethroid resistance levels approach 100% of
- the vector population.

243 Interpretation

244 These results are positive news for malaria control program. ITNs remain the primary vector 245 control strategy throughout sub-Saharan Africa, and they appear to be effective even at high levels of pyrethroid resistance. Others have described in detail this resistance paradox, where in laboratory 246 247 experiments pyrethroid resistance confers protection for malaria vectors but in epidemiological studies 248 vector control confers protection against malaria infection [41]. In general two separate hypotheses are 249 present as to how ITNs maintain effectiveness in the face of widespread resistance. The first hypothesis 250 suggests that the same genes that confer pyrethroid resistance alter the ability of the vector to transmit the parasite. A fitness cost to pyrethroid resistance has been documented in the An. gambiae, as evidenced by 251 252 studies showing that non-resistant mosquitoes outcompete resistant mosquitoes [42]. The second 253 hypothesis suggests that the insecticide still functions, just with a different type of effect. One example of 254 this second hypothesis is that pyrethroid-resistant mosquitoes lose their irritancy to the insecticide, thus 255 allowing for increased contact and a higher dose of the insecticide than typical mosquitoes [43]. This 256 increased dose then leads to the mosquito's death. Another example of this second hypothesis is that a 257 dose of pyrethroids results in delayed mortality of pyrethroid-resistant mosquitoes [44], perhaps due to 258 impaired flight or behavioral effects of the insecticide [45]. Whatever the reason, ITNs still appear to be 259 effectively reducing malaria transmission even when pyrethroid resistance approaches 100% in vector 260 populations.

261 Conclusion

Insecticide resistance is a chief concern for malaria control programs. These results confirm the notion that pyrethroid-based ITNs are still working to prevent malaria despite high levels of pyrethroid resistance observed in malaria vector populations.

265 Declaration of interests

266 The authors have no conflict of interests.

267 References

268

| 269 | 1. | Eisele TP, Larsen DA, Walker N, Cibulskis RE, Yukich JO, Zikusooka CM, et al. |
|-----|----|---|
| 270 | | Estimates of child deaths prevented from malaria prevention scale-up in Africa 2001- |
| 271 | | 2010. Malar J. 2012;11: 93. doi:10.1186/1475-2875-11-93 |
| 272 | 2. | Murray CJL, Rosenfeld LC, Lim SS, Andrews KG, Foreman KJ, Haring D, et al. Global |
| 273 | | malaria mortality between 1980 and 2010: a systematic analysis. Lancet. Institute for |
| 274 | | Health Metrics and Evaluation, University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98121, USA.: |
| 275 | | Elsevier; 2012;379: 413-431. Available: |
| 276 | | http://eutils.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/eutils/elink.fcgi?dbfrom=pubmed&id=22305225&ret |
| 277 | | mode=ref&cmd=prlinks |
| 278 | 3. | Bhatt S, Weiss DJ, Mappin B, Dalrymple U, Cameron E, Bisanzio D, et al. Coverage and |
| 279 | | system efficiencies of insecticide-treated nets in Africa from 2000 to 2017. Elife. 2015;4: |
| 280 | | e09672. doi:10.7554/eLife.09672 |
| 281 | 4. | Bhatt S, Weiss DJ, Cameron E, Bisanzio D, Mappin B, Dalrymple U, et al. The effect of |
| 282 | | malaria control on Plasmodium falciparum in Africa between 2000 and 2015. Nature. |
| 283 | | 2015;526: 207-11. doi:10.1038/nature15535 |
| 284 | 5. | World Health Organisation. World Malaria Report. World Malaria Report. 2018. |
| 285 | | doi:ISBN 978 92 4 156483 0 |
| 286 | 6. | Rund SSC, O'Donnell AJ, Gentile JE, Reece SE. Daily rhythms in mosquitoes and their |
| 287 | | consequences for malaria transmission. Insects. 2016;7: 1–20. |
| 288 | | doi:10.3390/insects7020014 |
| 289 | 7. | Sutcliffe JF, Yin S. Behavioural responses of females of two anopheline mosquito species |
| 290 | | to human-occupied, insecticide-treated and untreated bed nets. Malar J. 2014;13: 294. |
| 291 | | doi:10.1186/1475-2875-13-294 |
| 292 | 8. | Lengeler C. Insecticide-treated bed nets and curtains for preventing malaria. Cochrane |
| 293 | | Database Syst Rev. 2004; CD000363. |
| 294 | 9. | Larsen DA, Hutchinson P, Bennett A, Yukich J, Anglewicz P, Keating J, et al. |
| 295 | | Community coverage with insecticide-treated mosquito nets and observed associations |
| 296 | | with all-cause child mortality and malaria parasite infections. Am J Trop Med Hyg. |
| 297 | | 2014;91: 950–958. doi:10.4269/ajtmh.14-0318 |

- Hawley WA, Phillips-Howard PA, Ter Kuile FO, Terlouw DJ, Vulule JM, Ombok M, et
 al. Community-wide effects of permethrin-treated bed nets on child mortality and malaria
 morbidity in western Kenya. Am J Trop Med Hyg. 2003;68: 121–127.
 Ranson H, Lissenden N. Insecticide Resistance in African Anopheles Mosquitoes: A
- Worsening Situation that Needs Urgent Action to Maintain Malaria Control. Trends in
 Parasitology. 2016. pp. 187–196. doi:10.1016/j.pt.2015.11.010
- Cisse MBM, Sangare D, Oxborough RM, Dicko A, Dengela D, Sadou A, et al. A village
 level cluster-randomized entomological evaluation of combination long-lasting
 insecticidal nets containing pyrethroid plus PBO synergist in Southern Mali. Malar J.
 2017;16: 477. doi:10.1186/s12936-017-2124-1
- 308 13. Gleave K, Lissenden N, Richardson M, Choi L, Ranson H. Piperonyl butoxide (PBO)
 309 combined with pyrethroids in insecticide-treated nets to prevent malaria in Africa.
- 310 Cochrane Database Syst Rev. 2018;2018. doi:10.1002/14651858.CD012776.pub2
- 14. Tiono AB, Ouédraogo A, Ouattara D, Bougouma EC, Coulibaly S, Diarra A, et al.
 Efficacy of Olyset Duo, a bednet containing pyriproxyfen and permethrin, versus a
 permethrin-only net against clinical malaria in an area with highly pyrethroid-resistant
 vectors in rural Burkina Faso: a cluster-randomised controlled trial. Lancet. 2018;0.
 doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(18)31711-2
- Hemingway J, Ranson H. Insecticide Resistance in Insect Vectors of Human Disease.
 Annu Rev Entomol. 2000;45: 371–391. doi:10.1146/annurev.ento.45.1.371
- Santolamazza F, Calzetta M, Etang J, Barrese E, Dia I, Caccone A, et al. Distribution of
 knock-down resistance mutations in Anopheles gambiae molecular forms in west and
 west-central Africa. Malar J. 2008;7: 1–8. doi:10.1186/1475-2875-7-74
- 321 17. Ranson H, N'guessan R, Lines J, Moiroux N, Nkuni Z, Corbel V. Pyrethroid resistance in
- 322 African anopheline mosquitoes: what are the implications for malaria control? Trends
- 323 Parasitol. Vector Group, Liverpool School of Tropical Medicine, Pembroke Place,
- 324 Liverpool, UK, L3 5QA.; 2011;27: 91–98. Available:
- http://eutils.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/eutils/elink.fcgi?dbfrom=pubmed&id=20843745&ret
 mode=ref&cmd=prlinks
- 18. Hemingway J, Ranson H, Magill A, Kolaczinski J, Fornadel C, Gimnig J, et al. Averting a
 malaria disaster: Will insecticide resistance derail malaria control? Lancet. 2016;387:

| 329 | 1785–1788. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(15)00417- | 1 |
|-----|---|---|
|-----|---|---|

- Kelly-Hope L, Ranson H, Hemingway J. Lessons from the past: managing insecticide
 resistance in malaria control and eradication programmes. Lancet Infect Dis. 2008;8: 387–
 doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(08)70045-8
- 333 20. Thomas MB, Read AF. The threat (or not) of insecticide resistance for malaria control.
- 334
 Proc Natl Acad Sci. 2016;113: 8900–8902. doi:10.1073/pnas.1609889113
- 335 21. Opondo KO, Weetman D, Jawara M, Diatta M, Fofana A, Crombe F, et al. Does
- insecticide resistance contribute to heterogeneities in malaria transmission in the Gambia?
 Malar J. BioMed Central; 2016;15: 1–10. doi:10.1186/s12936-016-1203-z
- 338 22. Mathanga DP, Mwandama DA, Bauleni A, Chisaka J, Shah MP, Landman KZ, et al. The

339 effectiveness of long-lasting, insecticide-treated nets in a setting of pyrethroid resistance: a

340 case-control study among febrile children 6 to 59 months of age in Machinga District,

341 Malawi. Malar J. BioMed Central; 2015;14: 1–8. doi:10.1186/s12936-015-0961-3

Kleinschmidt I, Bradley J, Knox TB, Mnzava AP, Kafy HT, Mbogo C, et al. Implications
of insecticide resistance for malaria vector control with long-lasting insecticidal nets: a
WHO-coordinated, prospective, international, observational cohort study. Lancet Infect

345 Dis. 2018;18: 640–649. doi:10.1016/S1473-3099(18)30172-5

- Tokponnon FT, Sissinto Y, Ogouyémi AH, Adéothy AA, Adechoubou A, Houansou T, et
 al. Implications of insecticide resistance for malaria vector control with long-lasting
 insecticidal nets: Evidence from health facility data from Benin. Malar J. BioMed Central;
 2019;18: 1–9. doi:10.1186/s12936-019-2656-7
- 350 25. Bradley J, Ogouyèmi-Hounto A, Cornélie S, Fassinou J, De Tove YSS, Adéothy AA, et

al. Insecticide-treated nets provide protection against malaria to children in an area of

insecticide resistance in Southern Benin. Malar J. BioMed Central; 2017;16: 1–5.

353 doi:10.1186/s12936-017-1873-1

26. Eric Ochomo, 1, Mercy Chahilu, 1, Jackie Cook, Teresa Kinyari, Nabie M. Bayoh PW,

355 Luna Kamau, Aggrey Osangale, Maurice Ombok, Kiambo Njagi EM, et al. Insecticide-

- 356 Treated Nets and Protection against Insecticide- Resistant Malaria Vectors in Western
- 357 Kenya. Emerg Infect Dis. 2017;23: 158–764. doi:10.3201/eid2305.161315
- 25. Tusting LS, Bottomley C, Gibson H, Kleinschmidt I, Tatem AJ, Lindsay SW, et al.
- 359 Housing Improvements and Malaria Risk in Sub-Saharan Africa: A Multi-Country

| 360 | | Analysis of Survey Data. PLoS Med. 2017;14: 1-15. doi:10.1371/journal.pmed.1002234 |
|-----|-----|--|
| 361 | 28. | Clarke SE, Bøgh C, Brown RC, Pinder M, Walraven GELL, Lindsay SW, et al. Do |
| 362 | | untreated bednets protect against malaria? Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg. 2001;95: 457-462. |
| 363 | | doi:10.1016/S0035-9203(01)90001-X |
| 364 | 29. | Ochomo EO, Bayoh NM, Walker ED, Abongo BO, Ombok MO, Ouma C, et al. The |
| 365 | | efficacy of long-lasting nets with declining physical integrity may be compromised in |
| 366 | | areas with high levels of pyrethroid resistance. Malar J. 2013;12: 1-10. doi:10.1186/1475- |
| 367 | | 2875-12-368 |
| 368 | 30. | Hancock P, Hendricks C, Tangena J-A, Gibson H, Hemingway J, Coleman M, et al. |
| 369 | | Mapping trends in insecticide resistance phenotypes in African malaria vectors. bioRxiv. |
| 370 | | 2020; |
| 371 | 31. | Korenromp EL, Armstrong-Schellenberg JRM, Williams BG, Nahlen BL, Snow RW. |
| 372 | | Impact of malaria control on childhood anaemia in Africa a quantitative review. Trop |
| 373 | | Med Int Health. World Health Organization, Roll Back Malaria, Geneva, Switzerland. |
| 374 | | korenrompe@who.int; 2004;9: 1050-1065. |
| 375 | 32. | Lim SS, Fullman N, Stokes A, Ravishankar N, Masiye F, Murray CJL, et al. Net Benefits: |
| 376 | | A Multicountry Analysis of Observational Data Examining Associations between |
| 377 | | Insecticide-Treated Mosquito Nets and Health Outcomes. PLoS Med. 2011;8: e1001091. |
| 378 | | Available: http://www.mara.org/ |
| 379 | 33. | Ho D, Imai K, King G, Stuart EA. MatchIt: Nonparametric preprocessing for parametric |
| 380 | | causal inference. Citeseer. 2007; Available: |
| 381 | | http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.138.698&rep=rep1&type=pdf |
| 382 | 34. | Ho DE, Imai K, King G, Stuart EA. Matching as Nonparametric Preprocessing for |
| 383 | | Reducing Model Dependence in Parametric Causal Inference. Polit Anal. 2007;15: 199- |
| 384 | | 236. Available: http://gking.harvard.edu/files/abs/matchp-abs.shtml |
| 385 | 35. | R Core Development Team. R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing. |
| 386 | | http://wwwR-project.org/. R Foundation for Statistical Computing; 2010; |
| 387 | 36. | Craig MH, Snow RW, le Sueur D. A climate-based distribution model of malaria |
| 388 | | transmission in sub-Saharan Africa. Parasitol today (Personal ed). National Malaria |
| 389 | | Research Programme, South African Medical Research Council, PO Box 17120, |
| 390 | | Congella, Durban 4013, South Africa. craigm@mrc.ac.za; 1999;15: 105-111. Available: |

| 391 | | http://eutils.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/eutils/elink.fcgi?dbfrom=pubmed&id=10322323&ret |
|-----|-----|--|
| 392 | | mode=ref&cmd=prlinks |
| 393 | 37. | Gething PW, Patil AP, Smith DL, Guerra CA, Elyazar IRF, Johnston GL, et al. A new |
| 394 | | world malaria map: Plasmodium falciparum endemicity in 2010. Malar J. Spatial Ecology |
| 395 | | and Epidemiology Group, Tinbergen Building, Department of Zoology, University of |
| 396 | | Oxford, South Parks Road, Oxford, UK. peter.gething@zoo.ox.ac.uk: Malaria Journal; |
| 397 | | 2011;10: 378. Available: |
| 398 | | http://eutils.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/entrez/eutils/elink.fcgi?dbfrom=pubmed&id=22185615&ret |
| 399 | | mode=ref&cmd=prlinks |
| 400 | 38. | Sinka ME, Bangs MJ, Manguin S, Coetzee M, Mbogo CM, Patil AP, et al. The dominant |
| 401 | | Anopheles vectors of human malaria in Africa, Europe and the Middle East: occurrence |
| 402 | | data, distribution maps and bionomic précis. Parasit Vectors. 2011;4: 89. |
| 403 | | doi:10.1186/1756-3305-4-89 |
| 404 | 39. | Hijmans RJ. Introduction to the raster package (version 2.0-08). 2012; Available: |
| 405 | | http://probability.ca/cran/web/packages/raster/vignettes/Raster.pdf |
| 406 | 40. | Viechtbauer W. Conducting meta-analyses in R with the metafor package. J Stat Softw. |
| 407 | | 2010;36. Available: http://www.jstatsoft.org/v36/i03/paper |
| 408 | 41. | Alout H, Labbé P, Chandre F, Cohuet A. Malaria Vector Control Still Matters despite |
| 409 | | Insecticide Resistance. Trends Parasitol. Elsevier Ltd; 2017;33: 610-618. |
| 410 | | doi:10.1016/j.pt.2017.04.006 |
| 411 | 42. | Lynd A, Weetman D, Barbosa S, Egyir Yawson A, Mitchell S, Pinto J, et al. Field, |
| 412 | | genetic, and modeling approaches show strong positive selection acting upon an |
| 413 | | insecticide resistance mutation in anopheles gambiae s.s. Mol Biol Evol. 2010;27: 1117- |
| 414 | | 1125. doi:10.1093/molbev/msq002 |
| 415 | 43. | Chandre F, Darriet F, Duchon S, Finot L, Manguin S, Carnevale P, et al. Modifications of |
| 416 | | pyrethroid effects associated with kdr mutation in Anophelos gambiae. Med Vet Entomol. |
| 417 | | 2000;14: 81-88. doi:10.1046/j.1365-2915.2000.00212.x |
| 418 | 44. | Viana M, Hughes A, Matthiopoulos J, Ranson H, Ferguson HM. Delayed mortality effects |
| 419 | | cut the malaria transmission potential of insecticide-resistant mosquitoes. Proc Natl Acad |
| 420 | | Sci. 2016;113: 8975-8980. doi:10.1073/pnas.1603431113 |
| 421 | 45. | Cohnstaedt LW, Allan SA. Effects of sublethal pyrethroid exposure on the host-seeking |

- 422 behavior of female mosquitoes. J Vector Ecol. 2011;36: 395–403. doi:10.1111/j.1948-
- 423 7134.2011.00180.x

424