

1 **Barriers and enablers to improving integrated primary healthcare for non-**
2 **communicable diseases and mental health conditions in Ethiopia: a mixed**
3 **methods study**

4
5 Alemayehu Bekele¹, Atalay Alem², Nadine Seward^{3,4}, Tigist Eshetu¹, Tewodros Haile
6 Gebremariam⁵, Yeneneh Getachew⁸, Wondosen Mengiste⁸, Girmay Medhin^{1,9}, Lara
7 Fairall^{4,6}, Nick Sevdalis¹¹, Martin Prince⁴, Abebaw Fekadu^{1,2,10}, Charlotte Hanlon^{1,2,4,5}

8
9 **Affiliations**

10 ¹Centre for Innovative Drug Development and Therapeutic Trials for Africa (CDT Africa),
11 College of Health Sciences, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

12 ²Department of Psychiatry, WHO Collaborating Centre for Mental Health Research and
13 Capacity Building, School of Medicine, College of Health Sciences, Addis Ababa
14 University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

15 ³Centre for Implementation Science, Health Service and Population Research
16 Department, Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College in
17 London, London, UK

18 ⁴King's Global Health Institute, King's College in London, London, UK

19 ⁵Department of Internal Medicine, School of Medicine, College of Health Sciences,
20 Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

21 ⁶Knowledge Translation Unit, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa

22 ⁷Centre for Global Mental Health, Health Service and Population Research Department,
23 Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College in London,
24 London, UK

25 ⁸Ministry of Health, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

26 ⁹Akililu Lemma Institute of Pathobiology, Addis Ababa University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

27 ¹⁰Global Health & Infection Department, Brighton and Sussex Medical School, Brighton,
28 UK

29 ¹¹Centre for Behavioural and Implementation Science Interventions, National University
30 of Singapore, Singapore, Singapore

31

32 **Email address of corresponding author*

33 alemayehubekele2002@gmail.com

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41 **Abstract**

42 **Background:** The Ethiopian Primary Healthcare Clinical Guidelines (EPHCG) seek to
43 improve quality for people with Non-Communicable Diseases and Mental Health
44 Conditions (NCDs-MHCs) and provide an integrated approach to multi-morbidity. The
45 aim of this study was to identify barriers and enablers to implementation of the EPHCG
46 with a particular focus on NCDs-MHCs.

47 **Methods:** A mixed-methods convergent-parallel design was employed from May, 2019
48 to January, 2020 after implementation of EPHCG in 18 health facilities across four
49 districts and one town administration in southern Ethiopia. Semi-structured interviews
50 were conducted with 10 primary healthcare clinicians and one healthcare administrator
51 to identify barriers and enablers. The Organisational Readiness for Implementing
52 Change (ORIC) questionnaire was self-completed by 124 health workers to identify
53 facility level readiness for change. Determinants from both approaches were mapped to
54 the Consolidated Framework for Implementation Science (CFIR) and the Theoretical
55 Domains Framework (TDF). Expert Recommendations for Implementing Change
56 (ERIC) were employed to select potential implementation strategies to address barriers.

57 **Results:** Four thematic domains, EPHCG training and implementation, awareness and
58 meeting patient needs (demand side), resource constraints/barriers (supply side) and
59 care pathway bottlenecks were identified. The innovative facility-based training to
60 implement the guidelines had a mixed response, especially in busy facilities where
61 teams reported struggling to find protected time to meet. Key barriers to implementation
62 of EPHCG were non-availability of resources (CFIR inner setting), such as reagents for
63 laboratory tests and medications that undermined efforts to follow guideline-based care;

64 the way care was structured and lack of familiarity with providing care for people with
65 NCDs-MHCs. Substantial barriers arose because of interlinked socio-economic
66 problems that were interlined with health but not addressable within the health system
67 (CFIR outer setting). Several behavioural determinants influenced effective
68 implementation of EPHCG (TDF), including low population awareness about
69 NCDs/MHCs and unaffordable diagnostic and treatment services. Implementation
70 strategies were identified. Survey findings indicated high scores of organisational
71 readiness to implement the desired change but were notably more positive than the
72 qualitative data.

73 **Conclusions:** Although perceived as important and necessary, practical
74 implementation of EPHCG was constrained by challenges across domains of
75 internal/external context and behavioural determinants. This was especially marked in
76 relation to expansion of care responsibilities to include NCDs-MHCs. Attention to social
77 determinants of health outcomes, community engagement and awareness-raising are
78 needed to maximize population impact.

79 **Key words:** Barriers; enablers; clinical guidelines; NCDs-MHCs; organisational
80 readiness; primary healthcare.

81

82

83

84

85

86

87 **Introduction**

88 Primary healthcare (PHC) is at the heart of efforts to achieve Universal Health
89 Coverage and has three principal pillars: community empowerment, multisectoral
90 policies and action, and integrated delivery of quality primary care and public health
91 services to people in need (1). For comprehensive realisation of this vision, it is vital for
92 PHC to address the ever-increasing population burden of chronic conditions in low- and
93 middle-income countries (LMICs), especially non-communicable diseases (NCDs) and
94 mental health conditions (MHCs). The burden of NCDs is increasing substantially in
95 Ethiopia, accounting for 39.3% of all deaths and 34% of Disability-Adjusted Life Years
96 (DALYs) in 2016 (2). DALYs due to MHCs were estimated at 2.2% per the projection
97 made by the WHO for Ethiopia (3). Reliance on vertical programmes or centralised
98 models of specialist care has resulted in high treatment gaps for both NCDs (4) and
99 MHCs (5) and a fragmented and inadequate response to co-morbidity or multi-morbidity
100 (6). In response, it has been recommended to integrate care for people with NCDs and
101 MHCs into service packages delivered within PHC (7,8).

102

103 Presently, the Ethiopian Ministry of Health (MoH) is planning to expand access to care
104 for people with NCDs/MHCs through integration in PHC (9). The high co-morbidity and
105 multi-morbidity within and between NCDs/MHCs means that integrated care promises
106 better healthcare outcomes (10,11). In the Chronic Care Model (12), adapted for LMICs
107 as the innovative care for chronic conditions framework (ICCCF)(13), co-ordination of
108 care to respond to the individual's multiple needs and preferences (person-centred

109 care), empowerment of patients to be active partners in care, and systems that support
110 treatment-to-target are associated with better health outcomes. In recognition of this,
111 the Ethiopian MoH localised the South African Practical Approach to Care Kit (PACK)
112 programme to become the Ethiopian Primary Health Care Clinical Guidelines (EPHCG)
113 (14). EPHCG is a set of evidence-aligned guidelines that are designed not just to
114 standardise the care provided at PHC level but also to horizontally integrate care so that
115 PHC workers are prompted to consider co-morbid and multimorbid conditions at every
116 visit. EPHCG furthermore provides guidance for the longitudinal assessment and
117 treatment of care needs. Other innovative implementation approaches of the guidelines
118 include facility-based training involving the whole PHC team using adult learning
119 principles, case based (practical application) and reflection (14).

120 Following localisation of the EPHCG(14) , training was cascaded through master
121 trainers and facility trainers who then convened facility-based, peer-led training in over
122 550 primary care health centers in Ethiopia over a 12-month period. Initial programmatic
123 evaluation indicated that EPHCG was well-received but that impact was undermined by
124 weak leadership at district and health facilities level and lack of PHC workers
125 commitment, shortage of resources, high caseloads, and misperceptions about onsite
126 training (15). Strengths of this implementation included the strong involvement of top
127 leadership, fair budget allocation for implementation, and integration within the existing
128 health system. However, implementation barriers and enablers, including organisational
129 readiness, were not evaluated systematically.

130 Organisational readiness to change is recognised as critical to successful
131 implementation of new initiatives. Organisational readiness is a multi-level, multi-faceted

132 concept referring to a shared commitment of members of an organisation to implement
133 a change and a shared belief in their collective capability to do so (16). Readiness
134 varies as a function of how much organizational members value the change and how
135 favorably they appraise three key determinants of implementation capability: task
136 demands, resource availability, and situational factors (17). As well as overlooking
137 readiness, previous investigations of EPHCG implementation did not examine the
138 specific impact on care for people with NCDs/MHCs.

139 The aim of this study, therefore, was to identify barriers and enablers experienced in the
140 implementation of the EPHCG with particular focus on care for NCDs/MHCs.

141 **Methods**

142 **Study design**

143 A mixed methods convergent parallel design (18) was employed. Qualitative data were
144 collected from EPHCG training participants using key informant interviews of.
145 Quantitative data were obtained from a cross-sectional assessment of organisational
146 readiness administered to all PHC workers in the selected health facilities after
147 completing facility based EPHCG training. The quantitative and qualitative components
148 were conducted contemporaneously. Findings of the two components were analysed
149 independently but integrated through mapping onto two implementation research
150 determinant frameworks: the Consolidated Framework for Implementation Research
151 (CFIR) (19) and the Theoretical Domains Framework (TDF) (20). Implementation
152 strategies for the determinants mapped were also recommended using the Expert
153 Recommendations for Implementing change (ERIC) tool (21).

154

155 **Study period**

156 The EPHCG training at facility level was conducted in 2018 and continued up to April
157 2019 in the study setting. The training in each health facility lasted eight weeks i.e., 1-2
158 hours per week for eight weeks. The training was facility based (onsite), participatory,
159 case based and used adult learning principles (22). The data collection for both
160 qualitative and quantitative assessments were conducted from May 2019 to January
161 2020.

162 **Study setting**

163 The study was conducted as part of the Health System Strengthening in sub-Saharan
164 Africa (ASSET) programme(23).The setting was four districts and one town
165 administration of the Gurage Zone, Southern Nations, Nationalities and People's Region
166 of Ethiopia: Meskan, Misrak Meskan, Sodo and South Sodo districts and Butajira town.
167 These districts are located around 100 to 130km south of the capital city, Addis Ababa,
168 and are predominantly rural (24). The total population size of these districts is estimated
169 to be 404,809 in 2017(25). Health services are provided by one general hospital
170 (Butajira hospital), one primary hospital (Buee hospital), 16 health centres and 94 health
171 posts (26). PHC services are rendered through the PHC Units, comprising a health
172 centre and 3-5 linked health posts. Health centres are staffed by an average of 20
173 health personnel, including nurses and health officers, and provide both preventive and
174 curative services that focus mostly on infectious diseases, maternal and child health
175 conditions and nutritional problems. Health posts are closer to the community and focus
176 on health promotion and illness prevention. They are staffed by two female health
177 extension workers with 1-2 years of basic training. Community based health insurance

178 had been recently initiated at the time of this study. The intention to integrate care for
179 people with MHCs and NCDs into primary health care services has been articulated in
180 national level strategies from the Ministry of Health (7).

181

182 **(1) Qualitative study**

183 **Sampling**

184 We sampled healthcare workers based in health centres where EPHCG training was
185 conducted, purposively selecting respondents in terms of rural versus urban health
186 centres and their professional role within the facility. We additionally sampled healthcare
187 administrators involved in co-ordination of the EPHCG implementation.

188 **Eligibility criteria**

189 Health workers and healthcare managers who completed the EPHCG training and who
190 had been tasked with implementing the guidelines were included.

191 **Data collection and instruments**

192 Semi-structured interviews were conducted using an interview guide that focused on
193 training and use of EPHCG, perceived needs of people with NCDs/MHCs, care
194 pathways and information systems for people with NCDs/MHCs, and possible health
195 system strengthening interventions to address bottlenecks. EPHCG review meeting
196 minutes and field notes were also recorded and used as a data source. Notes and
197 audio-recording were used to capture the interview discussions.

198 **Data analysis**

199 For the qualitative study, interviews and meeting minutes were transcribed in Amharic,
200 translated into English and uploaded to Open Code 4.03 software (27). Thematic
201 analysis was carried out by understanding the data, generating the initial codes,
202 searching for themes, reviewing the themes, defining the themes and producing the
203 results. The data from thematic analyses were then mapped to the theoretical domains.
204 Contextual determinants were mapped to the Consolidated Framework for
205 Implementation Science (CFIR) (19) and potential determinants of behaviours were
206 mapped to the Theoretical Domains Framework (TDF) (20). Potentially relevant
207 implementation strategies were selected using findings from the Expert
208 Recommendations for Implementing Change (ERIC) project (28). ERIC provides a
209 taxonomy of implementation strategies that were developed using a Delphi process.

210 **Cross-sectional study of organisational readiness**

211 **Study population**

212 For the cross-sectional study, we approached all healthcare workers in facilities where
213 EPHCG implementation was underway and district health administration focal persons
214 for the EPHCG implementation.

215 **Sampling and sample size**

216 The target sample size of 200 was based on the estimated total number of health
217 workers 18 health facilities across four districts and one town administration in southern
218 Ethiopia. **Data collection and instruments**

219 The Organisational Readiness of Change (ORIC) questionnaire was used (29). ORIC
220 seeks to identify barriers/enablers (i.e., determinants) to implementation. It is a self-

221 report questionnaire comprising 12 items: 7 items related to ‘change efficacy’ and 5
222 items related to change commitment. Change efficacy refers to the shared belief of
223 members of the organisation in their “collective capabilities to organise and execute the
224 courses of action involved in change implementation” (30). This concept reflects the
225 amount of knowledge available about what to do and how to do it; i.e., it is a function of
226 members’ cognitive appraisal of three aspects of implementation capability: the
227 resources (including time) available, task demands, and the situation the organisation
228 faces. The ability to measure how an organisation’s members perceive these two
229 constructs may, ultimately, be used by health care leaders to develop more effective
230 and efficient change strategies (29). Change commitment can be defined as the
231 mindset that binds an individual to the course of action deemed necessary for the
232 successful implementation of a change initiative (31). Commitment was also described
233 as organisational members’ willingness and motivation to attain the change they need to
234 ultimately solve problems and promote the desired behaviours for change (17). We
235 provided the questionnaires in envelopes with a unique individual identifier and a code
236 to indicate the health facility. Respondents were invited to complete the survey
237 independently and return to the data collector in a sealed envelope.

238 **Data analysis**

239 Descriptive analyses of sociodemographic characteristics and variables were computed.
240 The total scores for the change-efficacy and change-commitment subscales were not
241 normally distributed and the sample size of the study was small. Thus, Kruskal Wallis
242 ranked sum test (32) was used to investigate statistical significance of the median score
243 differences across different factors.

244

245 **Results**

246 **Sociodemographic characteristics**

247 A total of 11 study participants whose age ranged from 23 to 35 years participated in the
248 qualitative study: seven males and four females. Six of the 11 study participants were
249 health officers and the remaining were nurses, non-specialist doctors and healthcare
250 administrator (Table 1).

251 **Table 1: Sociodemographic characteristics of participants for qualitative study**
252 **(N=11)**

Characteristics	Response category	Number
Age (years)	21-25	2
	26-30	7
	31-35	2
Gender	Male	7
	Female	4
Professional category	Health Officer	6
	Nurse	3
	General practitioner	1
	Healthcare administrator	1

253

254 A total of 124 health workers from 14 health centres completed the ORIC questionnaire,
255 of which 67 (54%) were females and two-thirds were nurses. About one-third were aged
256 26–29 years, 42 (46%) had 1-5 years of work experience, and 74 (61%) had received
257 EPHCG training. The majority were diploma nurses providing ambulatory services at
258 health centres (Table 2).

259

260

261 **Table 2: Sociodemographic characteristics of participants in cross-sectional**
 262 **study (n=124)**

Characteristics	Number (%)
Health facility	
Health Centre 1	8 (6.5)
Health Centre 2	6 (4.8)
Health Centre 3	13 (10.5)
Health Centre 4	7 (5.6)
Health Centre 5	8 (6.5)
Health Centre 6	9 (7.3)
Health Centre 7	7 (5.6)
Health Centre 8	11 (8.9)
Health Centre 9	10 (8.1)
Health Centre 10	14 (11.3)
Health Centre 11	4 (3.2)
Health Centre 12	9 (7.3)
Health Centre 13	7 (5.6)
Health Centre 14	11 (8.9)
Sex	
Male	57 (46.0)
Female	67 (54.0)
Profession	
Diploma Nurse	78 (63.9)
BSc Nurse	2 (1.6)
Diploma Midwife	2 (1.6)
Health Officer	34 (27.9)
Medical Doctor	4 (3.3)
BSc Midwife	2 (1.6)
Age in years	
20-23 (First Quartile)	22 (20.4)
24-25 (Second Quartile)	22 (20.4)
26-29 (Third Quartile)	35 (32.4)
>=30 (Fourth Quartile)	29 (26.9)
Work Experience	
< 1 year	23 (25.3)
1-5 years	42 (46.2)
6 years and above	26 (28.6)
EPHCG training received	
Yes	74 (61.2)
No	47 (38.8)
Position/Service delivery point	
Outpatient department clinician	54 (50.9)
Maternal & Child Health nurse or midwife	35 (33)
Emergency room clinician	11 (10.4)
Health Centre Head	6 (5.7)

263

264 **Qualitative findings**

265
266 The findings were grouped into four thematic areas: EPHCG training and
267 implementation, Awareness and meeting patient's needs (demand side), Resource
268 constraints/barriers (supply side), and Care pathway bottlenecks.

269 **EPHCG training and implementation**

270 The EPHCG was reported to have a range of benefits. For instance, the presentation of
271 patients with NCDs and/or MHCs reportedly increased after the introduction of the
272 guidelines. However, the confidence of health workers in identifying NCDs and MHCs
273 was variable. Healthcare workers reported that they could easily identify and manage
274 hypertension and asthma but did not feel confident to identify and manage depression,
275 cardiac problems and diabetes.

276 *"I know about depression from my school education. There is one course on*
277 *psychiatry. What I know about depression is what I have got from that course.*
278 *There is no training here on depression experience or something. I did not take*
279 *training on depression as a professional."*

280 Participant with ID NCD-03

281 The quality of care and confidence of healthcare workers was nonetheless reported to
282 have improved after EPHCG training.

283 *"...It was great. The quality of the work that is being done in that area is*
284 *improving. When we compare how we gave treatments before the training versus*
285 *how we give the treatments now, the result is satisfactory."*

286 Participant with ID NCD-08

287 *“I have better confidence, but the main thing is the standard. If the standard*
288 *orders you to give the treatment here or to refer it, what you do will be based on*
289 *that. If you sometimes miss some things, it will give you better confidence in*
290 *reading the guideline.”*

291 Participant with ID NCD-07

292 The pros and cons of the onsite training approach were raised by participants. One
293 perceived advantage was the greater opportunity for participation when compared to the
294 usual “hotel-based training”.

295 *“The training provided at other places, hotel or at woreda, and training provided*
296 *here are different. You may not be heard or get chance to ask questions on*
297 *training that you will get in other places, or you may not ask what you don’t*
298 *understand as there will be many participants of the training. But here we will*
299 *repeatedly discuss until everyone understand it. To me, other than the payment*
300 *[per diem for off-site training], training provided here is better.”*

301 Participant with ID NCD-10

302 However, there were reflections on the challenges of onsite training. These included a
303 perceived lack of commitment at the health centre level, lack of familiarity with peer
304 learning, difficulty in finding time for training when engaged in their routine work, lack of
305 the financial incentives that accompany off-site training, concerns about the
306 fidelity/quality of peer-led training, and a high turnover of trained trainers and facilitators.
307 Some participants reported being distracted by other tasks:

308 *“... it is better to train somewhere [else] to fully catch up with the book. Because*
309 *here you are on the job and you think of the job. For instance, if you are training*
310 *in the morning you have to go to work in the afternoon, you are at work. In*
311 *addition, you may not see what you have trained today. You are at work; you*
312 *may get tired and sleep. But if you go there, you have taken the training, and*
313 *everything is about it, nothing else will be there.”*

314 Participant with ID NCD-12

315 *“There are also health centers that we cannot initiate the training despite our*
316 *frequent support. We have to support those health centers and take this issue as*
317 *a challenge. The reasons are the health professionals working in that health*
318 *center have thought we will not train unless we get incentives as we work in shift.*
319 *But those health professionals who understand the aim are attending the*
320 *training.”*

321 Participant with ID NCD-14

322 EPHCG implementation was observed and reported to be variable across districts and
323 health centers, partly related to the extent to which PHC workers understood the
324 purpose of EPHCG. Implementation challenges included not feeling comfortable using
325 the guideline during consultation, inadequate support and supervision and lack of
326 awareness about EPHCG across all levels of health systems. Nonetheless, there were
327 health centers which had made EPHCG an integral part of their work, reinforced by
328 meetings and discussions between the health workers.

329 *“Everyone is performing based on the training they took... we see [patient*
330 *medical] cards and discuss the cases to check whether they are managing cases*
331 *based on the discussion we had or not...umm. We discuss cases during the*
332 *morning session and talk about ways on improving them. We are working hard to*
333 *keep the flow of the EPHCG because everyone is applying what they got from*
334 *the training...”*

335 Participant with ID NCD-17

336 **Awareness and patient’s needs (demand side)**

337 Successful implementation of the EPHCG for people with NCDs/MHCs was reported to
338 be affected by low patient and community awareness. Preference for traditional or
339 religious healers and low awareness about the availability of the new services in the
340 health centers contributed to late presentations i.e., after complications manifested.
341 Emotional needs were perceived not to be addressed well. There were also reports that
342 raising expectations of improved quality of PHC led to disappointment from the
343 community due to the poor availability of diagnostic tests and medications.

344 *“It might look like it is an easy thing but the main problem in the community right*
345 *now is not having enough awareness. Lack of awareness makes them use local*
346 *or traditional solutions for problems that could be treated easily with medicine.*
347 *Maybe people will come here after trying traditional medicines for depression and*
348 *psychotic disorders. Maybe they will come here to be treated scientifically after*
349 *the traditional solution failed to do so and education about NCDs should be given*
350 *to the community because you can make a difference on something if you first*
351 *work on the behavioral change of the people. If the way of thinking of the*

352 *community is not changed, there will be no difference and the goal could not be*
353 *met even if you offer the drug because it should be taken properly.”*

354 Participant with ID NCD-17

355 Low awareness of patients, particularly those from rural settings, was found to be a
356 barrier to implementing person-centered care.

357 *“Most of the patients using this health facility are from rural settings, they may not*
358 *understand what we are talking to them. But even if they are rural people, they*
359 *could say they prefer injection while they have to take tablets. Then I would*
360 *explain that the tablet is more important for them instead of the injection and that*
361 *they could come back if they don’t have any progress and to take other*
362 *medication. I explain and convince them and let them take the medication.”*

363 *Participant with ID NCD-09*

364 Respondents reported that there were many people with chronic diseases in the
365 community who could not afford to access the health service. The community-based
366 insurance system was perceived as the good initiative to address this gap.

367 *“Chronic illnesses might not be cured shortly. In relation to the cost, it is now*
368 *better as all of them are using health insurance, they are treated for free. There*
369 *are people who are considered as very poor and cannot pay 200 birr every one*
370 *or two years.....”*

371 Participant with ID NCD-03

372

373 **Resource constraints (supply side)**

374 The supply side of the health service delivery was constrained by many factors. These
375 included the high patient load, shortage of outpatient department (OPD) space, poor
376 availability of laboratory tests for diagnosis, weak systems for monitoring the patients'
377 conditions and unreliable medication supplies.

378 *“There are a lot of patients here and in addition to the shortage of OPDs [out-*
379 *patient department rooms]. There is also a shortage of blood pressure apparatus*
380 *and that is a problem. The laboratories do not have reagents for diagnostic tests.*
381 *There is also a shortage of drugs even if they are supplied every month.*
382 *Sometimes, some medicines for hypertension and diabetes might not be*
383 *available. These are some of the problems here...”*

384 *Participant with ID, NCD-17*

385 The limited number of health professionals to provide the service was another major
386 bottleneck hampering the provision of health services.

387 *“...there is a shortage of professionals at this time compared to the high patient*
388 *flow in the health centre I am working in.... the health centre is operating like a*
389 *hospital. There are lots of patients but limited number of professionals to provide*
390 *the required service. As there is also shortage of budget, we face difficulty to be*
391 *well equipped with the necessary medications.”*

392 *Participant with ID, NCD-08*

393 The other important dimension was lack of space, specifically to provide care for
394 patients with mental health conditions.

395 *“We could get patient with psychiatric problem; we don’t have specific place for*
396 *them. Instead of talking to them in front of other people, it would have been good*
397 *if we have a specific place or room for them to come on their follow up date and*
398 *discuss with us freely without being afraid of other people. The place could also*
399 *help us provide different entertaining things and better counseling service. So, I*
400 *recommend if there is separate room for these patients. If the case of the patient*
401 *is depression, you could take them to other room so that s/he could properly talk*
402 *more about his/her situation. Sometimes they talk low, sometimes they talk loudly*
403 *or slowly. So, in order for them to talk freely, it would have been good to have*
404 *separate room for such cases”*

405 *Participant with ID, NCD-*

406 *09*

407 **Care pathway bottlenecks**

408 Within the care pathway, detection of depression was not perceived to be a problem by
409 one of the respondents, although other health workers lacked confidence to make the
410 diagnosis.

411 *“...I am mental health focal person to this level and I am working on depression.*
412 *As I said before depressed patients come with headache or other symptoms.*
413 *Depression is identified by asking about their symptoms and history in detail.*
414 *When once diagnosed we do not proceed directly to drug treatment. Initially we*
415 *start with advice and will give appointment. If they do not improve, we will start*
416 *drug treatment.”*

417 *Participant with ID, NCD-15*

418 Participants also reported that some elements of self-management and lifestyle
419 changes needed for people with NCDs/MHCs were happening, but that requires the
420 health worker to engage with family support and to develop an ongoing relationship with
421 the patient.

422 *“... And if the patient is old, we ask their caregiver or whoever brings them to us*
423 *if the patient is taking the medication properly or not. In addition, we also ask*
424 *their family, if the patient is properly taking the medication, if he is eating salt or*
425 *not and if he/she is having physical exercise. Since their families could not clearly*
426 *tell us the right thing, we try to ask them like a family. Because, since these*
427 *patients come for follow up every month every two weeks or every week, if we*
428 *treat them as family, they could open up about everything. We create that family*
429 *vibe as much as possible and ask their family member. Then they will be free to*
430 *talk to us and they do not hide any information from us.”*

431 *Participant with ID, NCD-06*

432 Monitoring and support for adherence to medication among patients diagnosed to have
433 NCDs or MHCs was found to be problematic.

434 *“Yes, we don’t usually monitor hypertension and mental health in terms of*
435 *whether they are taking their pills or not. We do monitor for tuberculosis patients*
436 *but not for patients with other conditions.”*

437 *Participant with NCD-09*

438 Concerns about patients being inadequately engaged with care were also expressed.

439 *“You will know if they are properly taking their medicines when the progress is*
440 *good on the adherence. Some patients might come to their follow up a little later,*
441 *after three or four days skipping their medicine also because they run out of it.*
442 *We will refer their adherence to this, there are health extension workers in the*
443 *community.”*

444 *Participant ID with NCD-07*

445 Follow up of patients with chronic conditions was being monitored through a paper-
446 based registry. This was the mechanism through which health workers could see if
447 people dropped out of care and was workable due to the modest number of people
448 enrolled.

449 *“We have registration book. We register patient’s next appointment on both the*
450 *book and paper that is given to the patients. Therefore, we check by looking at*
451 *the registration. We even know each patient.”*

452 *Participant with ID, NCD-06*

453 The role of the health extension workers and the importance of tracing people who
454 dropped out of care was emphasized.

455 *“We specially follow the mental [health] cases. We know if the diabetic patients*
456 *came or didn’t. There are sources of information from the district, they have files*
457 *of the deceased where causes of death are written. Health extension workers are*
458 *the ones that follow up the cases in clinics. However, when it comes to quitting of*
459 *taking medications, besides the mentally ill cases, like I said before, you wouldn’t*
460 *know unless you trace them.”*

461 *Participant with ID, NCD-12*

462 There was little or no experience of ‘treating to target’ i.e., reviewing the patient’s
463 response and adapting the intervention until the target level of improvement had been
464 achieved. No systems were available to make sure this happened. Decisions to
465 escalate care solely relied on individual clinician assessments. The existing health
466 information system (HMIS) does not allow tracking of treatment to target, although there
467 was some interest in improving information use to support clinical care.

468 *“There is an electronic system as a reference guideline. There are some with*
469 *good experience in case of hypertension and also diabetes. So, I think it will be*
470 *good if they are connected through a system and share information. I think it will*
471 *be good if the system enables you to share things and information that are*
472 *sometimes hard for decision making. We can deliver better service to the*
473 *patient.”*

474 *Participant with ID, NCD-08*

475

476 **Organisational readiness to implement EPHCG**

477 All items on the ORIC received high endorsement. With regard to change-efficacy
478 measures, ‘people who work here feel confident that the organisation can get people
479 invested in implementing this change’ and ‘people who work here feel confident that
480 they can manage the politics of implementing this change’ were the items with the
481 highest (94.2%) and the lowest (89.5%) scores, respectively. For the change
482 commitment measures, ‘people who work here are motivated to implement this change

483 and 'people who work here will do whatever it takes to implement this change' were the
484 items with the highest (96%) and the lowest (87.1%) scores respectively (Table 3).

485

486 **Table 3 Distribution of scores of Organisational Readiness to Implement Change**
 487 **(ORIC)**

Characteristics	Number	Mean (standard deviation)	Response	Number (%)
E1. People who work here feel confident that the organisation can get people invested in implementing this change.	119	4.66 (0.82)	Disagree	5 (4.2)
			Neither agree nor disagree	2 (1.7)
			Agree	112 (94.2)
C1. People who work here are committed to implementing this change.*	108	4.69 (0.73)	Disagree	3 (2.8)
			Neither agree nor disagree	2 (1.9)
			Agree	103 (95.4)
E2. People who work here feel confident that they can keep track of progress in implementing this change.	121	4.55 (0.97)	Disagree	8 (6.6)
			Neither agree nor disagree	2 (1.7)
			Agree	111 (91.8)
C2. People who work here will do whatever it takes to implement this change.*	124	4.40+0.99	Disagree	9 (7.2)
			Neither agree nor disagree	7 (5.6)
			Agree	108 (87.1)
E3. People who work here feel confident that the organisation can support people as they adjust to this change.	123	4.55 (0.86)	Disagree	5 (4.1)
			Neither agree nor disagree	3 (2.4)
			Agree	115 (93.5)
C3. People who work here want to implement this change.*	123	4.72 (0.72)	Disagree	3 (2.4)
			Neither agree nor disagree	4 (3.3)
			Agree	116 (94.3)
E4. People who work here feel confident that they can keep the momentum going in implementing this change.	119	4.53 (0.79)	Disagree	4 (3.4)
			Neither agree nor disagree	4 (3.4)
			Agree	111 (93.3)
E5. People who work here feel confident that they can handle the challenges that might arise in implementing this change.	124	4.51 (0.83)	Disagree	4 (3.2)
			Neither agree nor disagree	6 (4.8)
			Agree	114 (91.5)
C4. People who work here are determined to implement this change.*	44	4.59 (0.62)	Disagree	0 (0)
			Neither agree nor disagree	3 (6.8)
			Agree	41 (93.2)
E6. People who work here feel confident that they can coordinate tasks so that implementation goes smoothly.	121	4.51 (0.91)	Disagree	6 (4.9)
			Neither agree nor disagree	4 (3.3)
			Agree	111 (91.8)
C5. People who work here are motivated to implement this change.*	124	4.69 (0.68)	Disagree	2 (1.6)
			Neither agree nor disagree	3 (2.4)

			Agree	119 (96)
E7. People who work here feel confident that they can manage the politics of implementing this change.	124	4.44 (0.90)	Disagree	5 (4)
			Neither agree nor disagree	8 (6.5)
			Agree	111 (89.5)

488

489 **Relationship between ORIC and sociodemographic factors**

490 Readiness to implement EPHCG was significantly associated with attendance at the
 491 EPHCG training (p-value 0.003) but not with any other characteristics of the health
 492 workers and their roles (Table 4).

493 **Table 4: Association of ORIC score with selected background characteristics**

Characteristics	Number (%)	Median and Interquartile range (IQR)	p-value
Gender			0.69
Male	46 (47.9)	53 (48,55)	
Female	50 (52.1)	53.5 (49,55)	
Age (years)			0.98
>=27	37 (45.1)	53 (50,55)	
20-26	45 (54.9)	53 (49,55)	
Profession			0.18
Health Officer/General Practitioner	31 (32.9)	51 (46,55)	
Nurses/Midwives	63 (67.1)	53 (50,55)	
Role at the health centre			0.05
Emergency/OPD	47 (57.3)	51 (46,55)	
Health Centre Head	2 (2.4)	55 (55,55)	
MCH/midwifery	33 (40.3)	54.5 (53,55)	
Health centres by district			0.15
Sodo	62 (64.6)	53.5 (50,55)	
Meskan/Butajira	34 (35.4)	51 (44,55)	
EPHCG training attended			0.003
Yes	57 (60.6)	54 (51,55)	
No	37 (39.4)	51 (44,55)	

494

495 **Synthesising barriers and enablers to implementation of EPHCG**

496 The main contextual barriers and enablers associated with the implementation of
497 EPHCG were mapped onto the CFIR and TDF frameworks and potential
498 implementation strategies identified using the ERIC tool are indicated in Table 5.

499

500 **Discussion**

501 In this study, we investigated barriers and facilitators to the EPHCG health system
502 strengthening initiative to improve quality of primary care and integrate care for people
503 with NCDs/MHCs into the primary healthcare platform. Implementing EPHCG was
504 largely seen as benefitting care quality. However, the success of its implementation
505 varied from one health facility to another. Implementation barriers (inner setting) were
506 largely related to facility-level resources (affecting supply) and PHC workers'
507 competence (impeding care pathways) and community-level awareness (affecting
508 demand); however, organisational readiness to change was promising as a potential
509 enabler.

510

511 Implementation of EPHCG was reported to have positively influenced healthcare
512 delivery in PHC facilities through improving knowledge and skill in detecting and
513 managing the care of people with NCDs and mental health conditions. This is in line
514 with previous programmatic evaluation of EPHCG (14). However, while healthcare
515 providers reported being confident in identifying and managing hypertension and
516 asthma, they did not feel sufficiently competent or confident to manage depression,
517 cardiac problems and diabetes. This is likely to be a reflection of the limited pre-service
518 and in-service training received by primary healthcare workers for those three

519 conditions, which have largely been managed in hospital settings prior to introduction of
520 EPHCG. Previous experience of expanding access to mental health care in Ethiopia
521 through integration in primary health care indicated that clinical placements as part of
522 training, group supervision by a specialist (e.g. psychiatric nurse) and continuing quality
523 improvement activities are needed to embed this model in the health system (33,34).

524 Overall, the EPHCG training model was reported to have been relevant and useful in
525 supporting PHC workers to improve the quality of care (intervention characteristics). A
526 similar experience has been reported from cascading of PACH training tools in PHC
527 facilities in South Africa (35). The study participants reflected that the onsite (facility
528 based) EPHCG training was found to engage the trainees through creating
529 opportunities to discuss the content in a more practical and applied way (intervention
530 characteristics). In contrast to this, the onsite training was not appreciated by some
531 clinicians due to distraction by competing commitments and high workload. This is in
532 line with some of the post-training evaluations of EPHCG conducted by the MoH(15).

533 There were challenges in training and implementing EPHCG in primary health care
534 facilities. The principal reasons for these were lack of commitment at the health centers,
535 lack of familiarity with peer learning, difficulty finding time to train while delivering routine
536 clinical services, lack of financial incentives, concerns about fidelity/quality of training,
537 turnover of trained trainers and facilitators and poor adherence in using the guidelines
538 during consultations by the PHC workers. Inadequate technical support and supervision
539 by the district health officers and poor awareness about EPHCG across all levels of the
540 health system (intervention characteristics) were also barriers to successful
541 implementation, in line with previous work (15). On the other hand, the high

542 endorsement of indicators of organisation readiness (in terms of both change efficacy
543 and change commitment) are potential facilitators for implementation of the changes
544 required for EPHCG. Only attendance at EPHCG training, but no characteristics of
545 health workers, were associated with organisational readiness. This supports the
546 importance of the EPHCG training approach as a system strengthening intervention in
547 its own right, bringing together facility health workers to work collaboratively in the work
548 setting. Similar reports were made on the importance of onsite EPHCG training as
549 documented in the post- training evaluation of EPHCG which was conducted by the
550 health centre reform team, MoH (15).

551 Pertaining to awareness and patient's needs (demand side), the barriers reported were
552 use of traditional medicine and consequent late presentation with complications (outer
553 setting), no support for emotional needs and disappointment with poor availability of
554 diagnostic tests and medications (inner setting). Furthermore, low health literacy,
555 especially in patients from rural settings was found to negatively impact implementation
556 of person-centered care. In the post-training evaluation of EPHCG by MoH, health
557 workers similarly reported that low community awareness undermined achieving
558 person-centred care (15).

559 There were also key findings addressing the supply side. Though there is community-
560 based health insurance system to overcome affordability and accessibility related
561 bottlenecks in providing services, the study participants underscored these problems as
562 a major concern to many patients with chronic diseases (outer setting). This may relate
563 to the high out-of-pocket costs that are not covered by health insurance (e.g., for
564 transport) and the opportunity costs accrued by repeated out-patient consultations.

565 Affordability of care was also identified in a study that reported the challenges and
566 experiences of primary healthcare in 20 LMICs (36). High patient load (outer setting),
567 shortage of space for treating and consultation, especially for mental health conditions,
568 poor availability of laboratory tests and weak monitoring of patients' condition, poor
569 medication supply and shortage of health professionals were the major conditions to
570 constrain the supply side of the EPHCG implementation as perceived by the study
571 participants (inner setting).

572 In relation to the care pathways, detection of NCDs and MHCs were not perceived to be
573 a challenge by the study participants (intentions); however, previous work in this setting
574 has found detection to be a key bottleneck on the depression care pathway, with less
575 than 1% of people with depression detected in primary care (37). Health workers need
576 to promote self-management and family support to enhance lifestyle changes when
577 counseling patients as reported by the study participants. Adherence to drugs among
578 patients with NCDs and mental health conditions was perceived to be unsatisfactory.
579 Follow up of patients is being addressed in some centres through enrolment into a
580 chronic condition registry but tracing patients who disengage from care through linkages
581 to community-based platforms such as the health extension programme is needed.
582 Ensuring good treatment outcome or 'treatment to target' solely relies on individual
583 clinicians and study participants identified that this could be strengthened through
584 electronic data management systems. Findings in relation to indicators of care
585 pathways showed that effective implementation of EPHCG has the potential to improve
586 care continuum including for NCDs. All in all, the findings in all domains, i.e., EPHCG
587 implementation, demand side, supply side and care pathways indicated that

588 implementation of integrated primary healthcare services are still at early stages.
589 Elsewhere, implementations of PAK, have been used across a continuum of health
590 systems strengthening life cycles, sometimes at formative stages to test feasibility and
591 effectiveness of decentralizing chronic disease care to primary care (38); to catalyse
592 and create health systems demand for more comprehensive and integrated primary
593 care (39) and in others to consolidate policy reform and aid implementation of greater
594 task-shared care (40). Its comprehensiveness, team-based and iterative design are all
595 intended to nurture health system strengthening efforts but must be complemented by
596 synergistic efforts to address structural barriers such as medication and diagnostic test
597 supply chains, need for a culture of lifelong learning among health workers and greater
598 attention to community literacy and demand generation.

599 Based on the key findings thus far, we identified a range of recommendations for
600 strengthening EPHCG implementation using the ERIC tool. These include the MoH and
601 regional health bureaus instituting a strong policy directive supporting facility-based or
602 on-site learning, introducing quality improvement cycles, strengthening supportive
603 supervision and removing potential barriers in relation to medication and laboratory test
604 supplies.

605 All stakeholders at different levels need to continuously train PHC workers to develop
606 competencies (e.g., taking a blood pressure appropriately or practising good clinical
607 communication skills). Supplementary training of EPHCG itself on MHCs (e.g. using
608 WHO's mental health Gap Action Programme(41) and some NCDs (diabetes and
609 cardiac diseases) needs to be implemented by the MoH and other stakeholders.
610 Capacity development and mentoring of PHC workers needs a special focus on person

611 centered care and emotional support. Information leaflets and community-based health
612 extension worker need to work on creating awareness about chronic diseases (NCDs
613 and MHCs). Researchers need to conduct further studies with larger samples size to
614 assess organisational readiness to implement similar public health interventions in PHC
615 facilities.

616 The strengths of this study were the study design employed which enabled us to
617 address the study objectives. Analyses of both qualitative and quantitative data were
618 rigorously carried out. The limitations in conducting this study could be the data
619 collection being restricted to ASSET project settings and may subsequently be difficult
620 to transfer the findings to other primary health facilities in Ethiopia. The sample size for
621 the quantitative study was small and there was possible social desirability bias in
622 responding to the ORIC tool.

623

624 **Conclusion**

625 The PHC workers reflected that EPHCG training was useful, created a sound platform
626 for focused case-based discussion, improved knowledge and skill in detecting and
627 managing NCDs and MHCs and was associated with higher scores of organisational
628 readiness to change. However, the onsite training model was threatened by competing
629 workplace pressures. Structural barriers (shortage of medications and tests, high patient
630 caseloads, poorly developed HMIS for chronic care) and poor patient and community
631 literacy constrained its implementation. In response, we developed additional system
632 strengthening interventions (which could be accessed at [32](https://cdt-</p></div><div data-bbox=)

633 africa.org/images/Downloads/Asset/On_Site_Facilitators_Guide_Training_Manual.pdf,
634 <http://repository.iifphc.org/handle/123456789/1630>).

635

636 **References**

- 637 1. Ghebreyesus TA, Fore H, Birtanov Y, Jakab Z. Primary health care for the 21st
638 century, universal health coverage, and the Sustainable Development Goals.
639 Lancet [Internet]. 2018;392(10156):1371–2. Available from:
640 [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736\(18\)32556-X](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(18)32556-X)
- 641 2. Girum T, Mesfin D, Bedewi J, Shewangizaw M. The Burden of Noncommunicable
642 Diseases in Ethiopia, 2000–2016: Analysis of Evidence from Global Burden of
643 Disease Study 2016 and Global Health Estimates 2016. Int J Chronic Dis.
644 2020;2020:1–10.
- 645 3. Organization WH. Mental Health ATLAS 2017 Member State Profile -
646 Bangladesh.pdf. 2017;2016:2018. Available from:
647 https://www.who.int/mental_health/evidence/atlas/profiles-2017/BGD.pdf?ua=1
- 648 4. Pati MK, Swaroop N, Kar A, Aggarwal P, Jayanna K, Van Damme W. A narrative
649 review of gaps in the provision of integrated care for noncommunicable diseases
650 in India. Public Health Rev. 2020;41(1):1–16.
- 651 5. Shidhaye R, Lund C, Chisholm D. Closing the treatment gap for mental,
652 neurological and substance use disorders by strengthening existing health care
653 platforms: Strategies for delivery and integration of evidence-based interventions.
654 Int J Ment Health Syst. 2015;9(1):1–11.

- 655 6. Shiferaw F, Letebo M, Misganaw A, Feleke Y, Gelibo T, Getachew T, et al. Non-
656 communicable Diseases in Ethiopia: Disease burden, gaps in health care delivery
657 and strategic directions. *Ethiop J Heal Dev.* 2018;32(3).
- 658 7. Tadesse Gebremedhin L, Giorgis TW, Gerba H. Policies, delivery models, and
659 lessons learned from integrating mental health and substance abuse services into
660 primary health care in Ethiopia. Vol. 3, *FASEB BioAdvances.* 2021. p. 694–701.
- 661 8. Yifter H, Omer A, Gugsu S, Fekadu A, Kebede A, Gebremariam T, et al. Early
662 detection and management of major non-communicable diseases in urban
663 primary healthcare facilities in Ethiopia: A study protocol for a type-3 hybrid
664 implementation-effectiveness design. *BMJ Open.* 2021;11(1).
- 665 9. Ministry of Health. National Strategic Plan for the Prevention and Control of Major
666 Non-communicable Diseases. 2020;(July):1–49.
- 667 10. World Health Organisation. Addressing comorbidity between mental disorders
668 and major noncommunicable diseases Addressing comorbidity between mental
669 disorders and major noncommunicable diseases [Internet]. 2020. 46 p. Available
670 from: [https://www.euro.who.int/en/publications/abstracts/addressing-comorbidity-](https://www.euro.who.int/en/publications/abstracts/addressing-comorbidity-between-mental-disorders-and-major-noncommunicable-diseases-2017)
671 [between-mental-disorders-and-major-noncommunicable-diseases-2017](https://www.euro.who.int/en/publications/abstracts/addressing-comorbidity-between-mental-disorders-and-major-noncommunicable-diseases-2017)
- 672 11. Stein DJ, Benjet C, Gureje O, Lund C, Scott KM, Poznyak V, et al. Integrating
673 mental health with other non-communicable diseases. *BMJ.* 2019;364:13–6.
- 674 12. Schmittdiel JA, Shortell SM, Rundall TG, Bodenheimer T, Selby J V. Effect of
675 primary health care orientation on chronic care management. *Ann Fam Med.*
676 2006;4(2):117–23.

- 677 13. WHO. Innovative Care for Chronic Conditions: Building Blocks for Action.
678 Geneva: World Health Organization (WHO/MNC/CCH/02.01). Geneva World Heal
679 Organ. 2002;
- 680 14. Feyissa YM, Hanlon C, Emyu S, Cornick RV, Fairall L, Gebremichael D, et al.
681 Using a mentorship model to localise the Practical Approach to Care Kit (PACK):
682 From South Africa to Ethiopia. *BMJ Glob Heal*. 2018;3.
- 683 15. Girma A. Ethiopian Primary health care clinical guideline□: what we have learned
684 from its implementation on 400 Health centers□? 2016;(7):1–11.
- 685 16. Kruk ME, Yamey G, Angell SY, Beith A, Cotlear D, Guanais F, et al. Transforming
686 Global Health by Improving the Science of Scale-Up. *PLoS Biol*. 2016;14(3):1–16.
- 687 17. Weiner BJ. A theory of organizational readiness for change. *Implement Sci*.
688 2009;4(1):1–9.
- 689 18. Demir SB. A convergent parallel mixed-methods study of controversial issues in
690 social studies classes: A clash of ideologies. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Egit Bilim*.
691 2018;18(1):119–49.
- 692 19. Damschroder LJ, Aron DC, Keith RE, Kirsh SR, Alexander JA, Lowery JC.
693 Fostering implementation of health services research findings into practice: A
694 consolidated framework for advancing implementation science. *Implement Sci*.
695 2009;4(1):1–15.
- 696 20. Atkins L, Francis J, Islam R, O’Connor D, Patey A, Ivers N, et al. A guide to using
697 the Theoretical Domains Framework of behaviour change to investigate

- 698 implementation problems. *Implement Sci.* 2017;12(1):1–18.
- 699 21. Waltz TJ, Powell BJ, Chinman MJ, Smith JL, Matthieu MM, Proctor EK, et al.
700 Expert recommendations for implementing change (ERIC): Protocol for a mixed
701 methods study. *Implement Sci.* 2014;9(1):1–12.
- 702 22. McGuire D. Adult learning theories. *Hum Resour Dev Theory Pract.* 2011;(11):64–
703 78.
- 704 23. Seward N, Hanlon C, Abdella A, Abrahams Z, Alem A, Araya R, et al. HeAlth
705 System StrEngThening in four sub-Saharan African countries (ASSET) to achieve
706 high-quality, evidence-informed surgical, maternal and newborn, and primary
707 care: protocol for pre-implementation phase studies. *Glob Health Action* [Internet].
708 2022;15(1). Available from: <https://doi.org/10.1080/16549716.2021.1987044>
- 709 24. Berhane Y, Byass P. Physical Geography of the Butajira DSS Area. *BMC Public*
710 *Health.* 2014;14(97):1471–2458.
- 711 25. Central Statistical Agency. Population Projection of Ethiopia for All Regions At
712 Wereda Level from 2014 – 2017. *J Ethnobiol Ethnomed* [Internet]. 2013;3(1):28.
713 Available from: [http://www.csa.gov.et/images/general/news/pop_pro_wer_2014-](http://www.csa.gov.et/images/general/news/pop_pro_wer_2014-2017_final)
714 [2017_final](http://www.csa.gov.et/images/general/news/pop_pro_wer_2014-2017_final)
- 715 26. Gurage Zone Health Department. distribution of health facilities in four districts
716 and Butajira town. 2021.
- 717 27. ICT Services and System Development and Department of Epidemiology and
718 Global Health. Open Code 4. [Internet]. University of Umeå, Sweden. 2015. p. 3–

- 719 4. Available from: <https://www.umu.se/en/department-of-epidemiology-and-global->
720 [health/research/open-code2/](https://www.umu.se/en/department-of-epidemiology-and-global-health/research/open-code2/)
- 721 28. Powell BJ, Waltz TJ, Chinman MJ, Damschroder LJ, Smith JL, Matthieu MM, et
722 al. A refined compilation of implementation strategies: Results from the Expert
723 Recommendations for Implementing Change (ERIC) project. *Implement Sci.*
724 2015;10(1):1–14.
- 725 29. Shea CM, Jacobs SR, Esserman DA, Bruce K, Weiner BJ. Organizational
726 readiness for implementing change: A psychometric assessment of a new
727 measure. *Implement Sci.* 2014;9(1):1–15.
- 728 30. Li C. Self-efficacy theory. *Routledge Handb Adapt Phys Educ.* 2020;313–25.
- 729 31. Meyer JP, Stanley DJ, Herscovitch L, Topolnytsky L. Affective, continuance, and
730 normative commitment to the organization: A meta-analysis of antecedents,
731 correlates, and consequences. *J Vocat Behav.* 2002;61(1):20–52.
- 732 32. Fletcher J. Non-parametric tests. *Bmj.* 2009;338:1–33.
- 733 33. Petersen I, van Rensburg A, Kigozi F, Semrau M, Hanlon C, Abdulmalik J, et al.
734 Scaling up integrated primary mental health in six low- and middle-income
735 countries: obstacles, synergies and implications for systems reform. *BJPsych*
736 *Open.* 2019;5(5):1–8.
- 737 34. Fekadu A, Hanlon C, Medhin G, Alem A, Selamu M, Giorgis TW, et al.
738 Development of a scalable mental healthcare plan for a rural district in Ethiopia.
739 *Br J Psychiatry.* 2016;208(October):s4–12.

- 740 35. Simelane ML, Georgeu-Pepper D, Ras CJ, Anderson L, Pascoe M, Faris G, et al.
741 The Practical Approach to Care Kit (PACK) training programme: Scaling up and
742 sustaining support for health workers to improve primary care. *BMJ Glob Heal.*
743 2018;3:1–10.
- 744 36. Langlois E V., McKenzie A, Schneider H, Mecaskey JW. Measures to strengthen
745 primary health-care systems in low-and middle-income countries. *Bull World*
746 *Health Organ.* 2020;98(11):781–91.
- 747 37. Fekadu A, Medhin G, Selamu M, Giorgis TW, Lund C, Alem A, et al. Recognition
748 of depression by primary care clinicians in rural Ethiopia. *BMC Fam Pract.*
749 2017;18(1):1–10.
- 750 38. Fairall LR, Folb N, Timmerman V, Lombard C, Steyn K, Bachmann MO, et al.
751 Educational Outreach with an Integrated Clinical Tool for Nurse-Led Non-
752 communicable Chronic Disease Management in Primary Care in South Africa: A
753 Pragmatic Cluster Randomised Controlled Trial. *PLoS Med.* 2016;13(11).
- 754 39. Awotiwon A, Sword C, Eastman T, Ras CJ, Ana P, Cornick RV, et al. Using a
755 mentorship model to localise the Practical Approach to Care Kit (PACK): From
756 South Africa to Nigeria. *BMJ Glob Heal.* 2018;3:1–8.
- 757 40. Bachmann MO, Bateman ED, Stelmach R, Cruz AA, Pacheco De Andrade M,
758 Zonta R, et al. Effects of PACK guide training on the management of asthma and
759 chronic obstructive pulmonary disease by primary care clinicians: A pragmatic
760 cluster randomised controlled trial in Florianópolis, Brazil. *BMJ Glob Heal.*
761 2019;4(6).

762 41. World Health Organization. Mental Health Gap Action Programme - Scaling up
 763 care for mental, neurological, and substance use disorders. World Heal Organ.
 764 2008;44.
 765

Table 5: Barriers and enablers to the implementation of EPHCG identified using the Theoretical Domains Framework (TDF) and the Consolidated Framework for Implementation Research (CFIR) and implementation strategies identified using Expert Recommendations for Implementing Change (ERIC) tool

Domain and determinant in relevant framework	Description	Implementation strategy identified using the ERIC) tool
CFIR framework		
Intervention characteristics (evidence strength and quality, relative advantage)	PHC workers found the training offered for the EPHCG useful. The mode of workplace-based training for EPHCG was appreciated by some respondents as allowing more relevant and comprehensive discussion, but others preferred off-site training due to distractions and workplace pressures.	Introduce strong policy directive supporting facility-based learning. Share best practices with other health facilities. Consider provision of training in two shifts to avoid workplace pressures and distractions.
Inner setting (readiness for implementation, available resources)	Critical shortage of diagnostic tests and medication which undermined efforts to follow the guideline, high patient load which made it difficult to consult the guidance and deliver comprehensive care, pressure on space and high turnover of staff. There was a promising organisational readiness when assessed in terms of change efficacy and change commitment indicators.	Focus for Quality Improvement cycles
Implementation coverage	The EPHCG implementation was initiated in some primary healthcare facilities but not in others despite the conduct of cascade of training of trainers.	Strengthen supportive supervision and remove potential barriers
Outer setting (patient needs and resources to access the health services)	The involvement of patients in making decisions about treatment options (person-centred care) was not commonly practiced by PHC workers. Patients' financial capacity to afford for the services (diagnostic and treatment) they received was weak The number of patients seeking for health services is high compared to the health workers and service delivery points available.	Train PHC workers to develop competencies to enhance basic health literacy through imparting basic information and skill on basic lifestyle modifications, risk reduction and treatment adherence to patients, family members and the community Community based health

High patient flow		<p>insurance needs to be strengthened to improve affordability of services.</p> <p>Increase the number of health workers and service delivery points</p>
Theoretical Domains Framework (TDF)		
Knowledge	<p>After training, knowledge PHC workers had improved knowledge post training that was reflected in ability to detect NCDs and MHCs.</p> <p>Post training, PHC workers still felt inadequately equipped to manage depression, diabetes mellitus and cardiac diseases.</p> <p>Patients and the wider community had low awareness about NCDs/MHCs which meant people presented late, with more severe illness, and were less engaged in self-management.</p>	<p>Supplementary training and mentoring in mental health conditions – WHO’s mental health Gap Action Programme</p> <p>Provide training on quality improvement and clinical communication skills and clinical monitoring or audit</p> <p>Equip PHC workers with basic knowledge and skills on detection of chronic diseases and strengthen referral linkage for complex conditions including cardiac diseases.</p>
Skills	<p>Emotional support was not sufficiently provided to patients in need due to lack of skills among PHC workers</p>	<p>Train PHC workers to develop basic clinical communication competencies</p>
Confidence	<p>PHC workers had improved confidence post training in managing hypertension and asthma.</p> <p>PHC workers felt inadequately equipped to manage depression, diabetes mellitus, and cardiac diseases</p>	<p>Information leaflets and community-based health extension worker detection of hypertension / awareness - raising</p>
Intentions	<p>Detection of NCDs and MHCs was not perceived to be a challenge. However, PHC clinicians reported that they were not proactive in managing care and monitoring adherence.</p>	<p>Train PHC workers to develop basic competencies on how to detect, manage, follow up and refer patients with NCDs and MHCs</p>
Follow up	<p>Gaps in timely follow-up or tracking of patients were recognised and shortage of resources to use electronic devices for the tracking</p>	<p>Capacity development and mentoring support to PHC workers on health information system to strengthen follow up of patients with chronic diseases</p> <p>Consider introduction of electronic data management system in health facilities</p>

766

767

768 **Declaration section**

769 **Ethical approval and consent to participate:** The data collection methods were
770 designed in line with the guidelines of research ethics principles. Ethical approval for
771 this study was obtained from the Institutional Review Board of Addis Ababa University,
772 College of Health Sciences, and King's College London. Informed consent to participate
773 in the study was obtained from all study participants.

774 **Availability of data and materials:** All the materials are owned by the authors of this
775 manuscript and there is none that belongs to the third party.

776 **Consent to publish:** Not Applicable.

777 **Funding:** The data collection underpinning the findings presented in this paper was
778 funded by the National Institute of Health and Care Research (NIHR) Global Health
779 Research Unit on Health System Strengthening in Sub-Saharan Africa (ASSET), King's
780 College London (GHRU 16/136/54) using UK aid from the UK Government. Charlotte
781 Hanlon (C.H.) receives support through an NIHR RIGHT grant (NIHR200842) and an
782 NIHR global health research group on homelessness and mental health in Africa
783 (HOPE; NIHR134325). The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors
784 and not necessarily those of the NHS, the National Institute for Health and Care
785 Research or the Department of Health and Social Care, England. C.H. is also funded by
786 the Wellcome Trust through grants 222154/Z20/Z (SCOPE) and 223615/Z/21/Z
787 (PROMISE).

788 **Conflict of interest:** None of the authors has conflict of interest.

789 **Authors' contribution:** A.B. wrote the main manuscript and did both qualitative and
790 quantitative analyses. A.A. reviewed the manuscript. N.Sew. reviewed the manuscript.
791 T.E. facilitated the data collection and organised the data set. T.G. reviewed the
792 manuscript. Y.G. reviewed the manuscript. W.M. reviewed the manuscript. G.M
793 reviewed the manuscript. L.F. reviewed the manuscript. N.Sev. reviewed the
794 manuscript. M.P. reviewed the manuscript. A.F. reviewed the manuscript. C.H. reviewed
795 the manuscript and supported the data management and analyses

796 **Acknowledgment:** The authors would like to acknowledge NIHR, King's College
797 London, Wellcome Trust for funding the study. We also would like to appreciate C.H. for
798 her outstanding contribution in facilitating the fund request and realising the conduct of
799 the study. The qualitative study findings of this study on implementation of primary
800 healthcare clinical guidelines (Oral-Poster) were presented at the scientific conference
801 of implementation science which was organized by the King's College in London.