1	Le	ssons Learned from Development and Implementation of the National Surgical,
2	Oł	ostetric and Anaesthesia Plan in Ethiopia: a qualitative study
3		
4	Ar	nanuel Belay ¹ , Medhanit Getachew ¹ , Abebe Bekele ^{2,3} , Andualem Deneke Beyene ² , Amezene
5	Та	desse ² , Justine Davies ^{4,5,6} , Andrew JM Leather ⁷ , Charlotte Hanlon ^{1,8*}
6		
7	1.	Centre for Innovative Drug Development and Therapeutic Trials for Africa, Addis Ababa
8		University, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
9	2.	Department of Surgery, School of Medicine, College of Health Sciences, Addis Ababa
10		University, Ethiopia
11	3.	School of Medicine, University of Global Health Equity, Rwanda
12	4.	Institute of Applied Health Research, University of Birmingham, Birmingham, UK
13	5.	Centre for Global Surgery, Department of Global Health, Stellenbosch University, Cape
14		Town
15	6.	Medical Research Council/Wits University Rural Public Health and Health Transitions
16		Research Unit, Faculty of Health Sciences, School of Public Health, University of the
17		Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa
18	7.	King's Centre for Global Health and Health Partnerships, School of Life Course and
19		Population Sciences, King's College London, London, UK
20	8.	Centre for Global Mental Health, Health Service and Population Research Department,
21		Institute of Psychiatry, Psychology and Neuroscience, King's College London, UK
22		

NOTE: This preprint reports new research that has not been certified by peer review and should not be used to guide clinical practice.

23 * Corresponding author

- 24 E-mail: charlotte.hanlon@kcl.ac.uk
- 25 **These authors contributed equally to this work.**
- 26 Funding: The research underpinning the findings presented in this paper was funded by the
- 27 National Institute of Health Research (NIHR) Global Health Research Unit on Health System
- 28 Strengthening in Sub-Saharan Africa (ASSET), King's College London (GHRU 16/136/54)
- 29 using UK aid from the UK Government.
- 30 Competing interests: None
- 31 **Data availability:** Open access.
- 32 Short title: National surgical planning and implementation in Ethiopia
- 33

34 Author contributions

AL, JD and AB conceptualised the overarching research goals and aims, and contributed to
funding acquisition. AL, JD, AB, AD and CH contributed to developing the methodology. MG
conducted the interviews. AB and MG led data analysis, supervised by CH. AB and MG
prepared the first draft. All authors contributed to interpretation of findings, reviewing and
editing drafts to produce the final manuscript. All authors approved the final submitted version
of the manuscript.

41

43 Abstract

44 Background: The Saving Lives Through Safe Surgery (SaLTS) project was launched in 2016 by 45 the Ethiopian Ministry of Health to improve access and quality of surgical and anaesthesia care 46 throughout Ethiopia. A key action of SaLTS was to develop a National Surgical, Obstetric and 47 Anaesthesia Plan (NSOAP). The aim of this study was to explore barriers and facilitators in the 48 development and implementation of this plan in Ethiopia.

49 Methods: We conducted semi-structured interviews with 12 key stakeholders involved in 50 developing and implementing the NSOAP at national and regional level in Ethiopia. Thematic 51 analysis was performed.

52 **Results**: The attention given to safe surgery after the Lancet Commission on Global Surgery that 53 reported in 2015, provided key impetus to commitment from the Ethiopian government to develop 54 an NSOAP. Another important opportunity while drafting the plan was the engagement of relevant 55 and motivated professionals. However, major challenges during development included a lack of 56 consistent leadership, no prior experience to benchmark from, the extended time taken to complete 57 the plan, the lack of exclusively dedicated staff, varying engagement, awareness and commitment 58 of regional bureaus and poor quality of available data to inform the situation analysis. Key 59 facilitators of implementation were ownership of the plan by the government and involvement of 60 a multidisciplinary implementation team. However, this was undermined by poor cost estimation 61 and inadequate commitment of financial resources, the low quality of surgical equipment and 62 supplies, and the lack of dedicated human resources, data management systems, ongoing stakeholder engagement, and government accountability. Recommendations to increase the 63 64 success of future planning and implementation included the need to properly estimate resources 65 and financial impact, carry out a careful baseline assessment, implement checklists for monitoring

66 and evaluation, ensure reasonable resource allocation and involve grassroots regional stakeholders

- 67 from the beginning. Alongside this, countries need to have committed leadership and transparency
- 68 in setting goals to bring about broad stakeholder engagement.

69 Conclusion: Ethiopia showed early commitment to strengthen surgical systems and improve

- surgical care. Lessons learned can help to guide and encourage other countries to develop realistic
- 71 NSOAPs and support their effective implementation on the ground.
- 72 **Keywords:** *surgical plan, obstetric plan, anaesthesia plan, health policy, surgical care,*
- 73 *implementation, Ethiopia*

74 Background

75 Surgical care and anaesthesia services have been recognized by the World Health Assembly 76 (Resolution-68/15) as an important public health investment and a key component of universal 77 health coverage [1]. Nonetheless, it has been estimated that five billion people lack access to safe. 78 affordable surgical and anaesthesia care when needed. This disparity disproportionately affects 79 those living in low- and middle-income countries: an estimated 93% of the population in sub-80 Saharan Africa does not have access to safe, affordable surgical and anaesthesia care compared to 81 3.6% of the population in higher-income regions [2]. In Ethiopia, a country with a population of 82 120 million people, there is an estimated unaddressed need for 5,000,000 surgical procedures per 83 year [3]. To address this gap, a national plan that specifically addresses surgery is essential to 84 ensure that surgical and anaesthesia care are fully integrated into the health system and for proper 85 planning of care delivery, education and research [2]. Developing a national plan is an essential 86 first step for countries to strengthen their surgical systems and improve surgical care [4].

87 The Saving Lives Through Safe Surgery (SaLTS) initiative was launched in 2016 by the Ethiopian 88 Ministry of Health to improve access and quality of surgical and anaesthesia care throughout 89 Ethiopia [3]. Through SaLTS, Ethiopia became one of the first countries to develop a National 90 Surgical, Obstetric and Anesthesia Plan (NSOAP) and emerged as a leader in sub-Saharan Africa 91 in prioritizing surgery as part of a national healthcare strategy [5, 6]. The Lancet Commission on 92 Global Surgery has developed a template for the development of a national surgical plan [2], 93 covering the following six domains aligned with the WHO health service building blocks: 94 infrastructure, workforce, service delivery, financing, information management and governance 95 [7]. At the time of conducting this study, six countries had developed NSOAPs, 10 countries had 96 plans underway and 23 additional countries had shown a commitment to developing an NSOAP 97 [6, 8].

98 The existence of such a national-level plan is not, however, enough in itself to ensure improved 99 access to safe, affordable, surgical and anaesthesia care. Plans need to be implemented and we are 100 only aware of one country (Ethiopia) that has attempted to implement an NSOAP. Although the 101 development and early implementation of the Ethiopian NSOAP have been described previously 102 (5), to the best of our knowledge, there has been no systematic investigation of the barriers and 103 facilitators to the development and implementation of NSOAPs in this or any other low-resource 104 setting. The objective of this study was to explore the NSOAP planning process and the barriers 105 and facilitators to the development and implementation of a national surgical plan in Ethiopia.

106 Methods

107 Design

108 The study design was qualitative, nested within the surgical work package of the ASSET (HeAlth 109 System StrEngThening in sub-Saharan Africa) National Institute of Health Research Global Health 110 Unit [9], a health system strengthening research program working across four sub-Saharan African 111 countries (Ethiopia, Sierra Leone, South Africa, Zimbabwe) and three platforms of care (surgery, 112 primary care and maternal care).

113 Context

The study was carried out in Ethiopia from 27th May 2018 until 23rd January 2020. The SaLTS 114 115 initiative proposed to use a health system approach to improving surgical care through the 116 Ethiopian Hospitals Alliance for Quality (EHAQ) platform to simultaneously tackle activities 117 across eight 'pillars of excellence'. These key strategic pillars are 1) Leadership, management, and 118 governance: a nationally scaled surgical leadership and mentorship program, 2) Infrastructure: 119 operating room construction and oxygen delivery plan, 3) Supplies and logistics: a national 120 essential surgical procedure and equipment list, 4) Human resource development: a Surgical 121 Workforce Expansion Plan and Anaesthesia National Roadmap, 5) Advocacy and partnership: 122 strong Ministry of Health partnerships with international organizations, including General Electric 123 Foundation's safe Surgery 2020 initiative, 6) Innovation: facility-driven identification of problems 124 and solutions, 7) Quality of surgical and anaesthesia care service delivery: a national peri-operative 125 guideline and WHO Surgical Safety Checklist implementation, and 8) Monitoring and evaluation: 126 a comprehensive plan for short-term and long-term assessment of surgical quality and capacity 127 [3].

128 Participants

Informants were purposively selected based on being key stakeholders involved at the national or regional level of plan development and implementation. They included policy-makers, planners, surgeons in leadership positions, individuals with a variety of responsibilities at NGOs and government level consultants.

133 Data collection

A topic guide was developed for in-depth interviews based upon the authors' knowledge of the field and the literature. The interview guide was developed to explore the following topics: the process of developing the plan, main steps taken during the drafting of the plan, opportunities and barriers during the development process, key players in the development process, opportunities and barriers during the implementation of the plan and lessons learned/recommendations for future planning.

The topic guide was first developed in English and translated into Amharic. One experienced
interviewer, fluent in Amharic did all the interviews in Amharic. Interviews were audio-recorded.
Eleven interviews took place in the respondents' office and one was done virtually via the zoom
platform.

144 Analysis

All interviews were transcribed in Amharic, translated into English, and uploaded to OpenCode 4.02 software to facilitate analysis. Thematic analysis was performed. Two members of the research team (AB, MG) read and re-read transcripts to familiarize themselves with the data and independently carried out line-by-line coding of two randomly selected transcripts. AB and MG

149	met twice to compare and refine codes and coding. They developed a common codebook through
150	a discussion of each code definition and assignment. CH reviewed the codebook with AB and MG
151	to identify areas of overlap, inconsistency or possible gaps. AB and MG then independently coded
152	the remaining transcripts based on the codebook. Similar codes were grouped to form themes, and
153	these were compared back to the data and iteratively improved until consensus was reached.
154	Quotes from a range of participants were selected to illustrate these themes.
155	Ethical approval
156	Ethical clearance was obtained from the Institutional Review Board (IRB) of the College of Health
157	Sciences of Addis Ababa University (protocol number 026/18/PSY) and King's College London

158 (protocol number HR-17/18-6144). Written informed consent was obtained from each participant.

159 Confidentiality was ensured by anonymising identifying information and assigning a unique ID

160 code to all interviews.

161 Results

162 Twelve respondents participated, including respondents from the Ministry of Health, a Regional
163 Health Bureau and implementing NGOs. See Table 1 for characteristics. Ten participants were
164 trained as medical doctors, one was a nurse and one had a public health background.

165 **Table 1. Socio-demographic characteristics of participants**

Code	Position	Involvement in the Saving Lives Through Safe Surgery
		(SaLTS) initiative

ID 01	Ministry of	Planning/design and implementation
	Health	
ID 02	Ministry of	Planning/design only
	Health	
ID 03	Implementing	Planning/design and implementation
	NGO	
ID 04	Implementing	Planning/design
	NGO	
ID 05	Implementing	Late stage of the planning/design
	NGO	
ID 06	Surgical clinical	Planning/design
	expert	
ID 07	Regional Health	Piloting stage
	Bureau	
ID 08	Surgical clinical	Planning/design and implementation
	expert	
ID 09	Surgical clinical	Piloting stage
	expert	
ID 10	Surgical clinical	Piloting
	expert	
ID 11	Ministry of	Planning/design and implementation
	Health	

ID 12	Surgical clinical	Planning/design and implementation
	expert	

167

168 Key steps in drafting and developing the NSOAP

Safe surgery as a problem area needing a response started to be given attention in Ethiopia following the publication of the Lancet Commission on Global Surgery in 2015 (Fig 1). The adoption of emergency and essential surgical care and anaesthesia as a component of universal health coverage at the May 2015 World Health Assembly (WHA) was also perceived by respondents as providing important impetus for the Ethiopian Ministry of Health (MoH) to prioritize surgical care and initiate development of the NSOAP.

175 Figure 1. Key steps in the development of the Ethiopian NSOAP

176 The next key step was the MoH engaging with various professional institutions and stakeholders. 177 The idea for SaLTS was presented to senior surgeons, anaesthetists and obstetricians in Ethiopia. 178 Under the medical services directorate of MoH, a team of professionals was formed to provide 179 technical support and develop a concept note for SaLTS. The team members were identified 180 through the Ethiopian Medical Association and Addis Ababa University. To prioritize surgical 181 interventions that are cost-effective for scaling up, an "Ethiopian essential service package for 182 surgery" was developed. During the development process of this package, in addition to using the 183 documents prepared by World Bank and WHO as a baseline, input was obtained from a multi-184 professional team drawn from multiple different surgical disciplines (including Ear, Nose and 185 Throat, and dental).

"... engagement was a critical part but during the engagement process, it was necessary
to engage the responsible professionals. Therefore, senior professionals have engaged not
only once but also repeatedly ... and the other thing we shouldn't have to underestimate
is, technical support, which is a very important thing. There were a team of professionals
that came from different areas who were dedicated to support and advise the ministry of
health." (ID 03)

Another important step in developing the surgical plan was reported to be the time taken to conduct a situational analysis. After a concept note was developed for funding, the situation analysis was carried out. The situation analysis focused on the current status of infrastructure, human resources, equipment in different settings and surgical and anaesthesia services that were being provided across Ethiopia. The data from this situation analysis was used to identify gaps and helped the team to develop the eight pillars for the Plan.

"…… to some extent situational analysis was attempted. This situational analysis, when it
is done, the pillars, for instance, on HR [human resources], how many surgeons are there,
how many obstetricians do we have, how many ophthalmologists do we have, where are
they and the like, these kinds of exercise was done on the analysis. Then, starting from the
situational analysis, after we identify gaps, those eight pillars were made to stand out."
(ID 01)

The planning and implementation of some pillars of the NSOAP were described as being undertaken in parallel. Along with the planning process, anaesthesia, Intensive Care Unit and Operating Room equipment that was needed for implementation was purchased. In addition, residency programmes for training of anaesthetists, surgeons, obstetricians and ophthalmologists

208	were expanded to strengthen the available workforce. Respondents emphasized the importance of
209	piloting aspects of the plan. As part of the implementation, a program on human capacity building,
210	which aimed to strengthen leadership and innovation for surgical and anaesthesia care was piloted
211	in five hospitals located in two regions. The experience from this pilot study was then incorporated
212	into the national plan (SaLTS).
213	" For learning purposes, as the two regions were ready at the time, we conducted pilot
214	studies in five hospitals in Amhara and Tigray regions. Then we took the experience we
215	found and we have tried to incorporate it as input in the SaLTs document." (ID 08)
216	
217	
218	Challenges and opportunities in developing the NSOAP
219	Many of the respondents spoke of the opportunity that arose due to the global attention given to
220	safe surgery and the resulting recognition of surgery as an essential component of care in Ethiopia.
221	"The Lancet Commission publication is a landmark publication on the role of surgery as
222	an essential [part of] universal care. After that, they [Ministry of Health officials] believed
223	that there is a need to have one strategic document for Ethiopia too. So, the minister who
224	was there at that time believed in that and started the initiative and developed the plan
225	together with the experts" (ID 05)
226	The resulting commitments from champions for surgical care in the MoH and the funding made
227	available by various partners were mentioned as important opportunities. The strong engagement

of stakeholders, especially professionals and professional societies, (e.g. the Surgical Society of
Ethiopia) was also seen as vital to drive the process forwards.

An important challenge was that this was the first time an NSOAP had been developed in a low-

- income country. There was no prior experience or benchmark, so this made the process difficult.
- "...at that time, when we did this, no other country had developed their surgical plan so,
 this was I can see the first so, when you are the first, again the problem is there is no one
 you can benchmark or refer to, there was no one we could do that with, so it was not easy

235 ... " (ID 01)

Respondents noted that a lack of consistent leadership and management of the process of developing and implementing the plan was one of the main challenges. As the development process went on, the policymakers were perceived not to have the required understanding and commitment to lead. It was also noted that the leadership did not allow active participation of all key stakeholders or engagement was late, when decisions had already been made. Inconsistent leadership was described by respondents, exacerbated by a high turnover of leadership within the MoH. Friction about who should lead was also present.

243 "First, the leadership at the ministry of health was good in principle. But there was a
244 turnover of the leadership team. There was inability to make priorities most of the times.
245 There was sometimes no strong tendency from the Ministry of Health side to bring all
246 together and communicate in a clear manner and take things forward. So, from the ministry
247 of health side, a deficiency was observed." (ID 08)

Not including a budget allocation plan due to the uncertainties of how much it would cost wasmentioned as the main limitation of the plan.

"But I think the main limitation of the plan was, budget allocation was not done...the
budget allocation was not seen on the plan. But the plan has a big impact on the budget...I
think it is because if the budget is predetermined it might be very high or it might be very
low ...I think that is why the budget is not calculated. We have tried to draft the budget on
another document but if you see the document now, you may not find the exact amount of
money." (ID 06)

The lengthy time for the planning process was emphasized by respondents as the other main challenge. In total, the planning process took about nine months. No staff members were exclusively dedicated to the task; rather the team had to drop other activities, like delivery of surgical care, to engage in the planning process. There were competing priorities of the surgeons that did not allow them to provide timely review and feedback to inform the planning process.

- 261 "The other challenge I would think is you would have competitive priority and like the
 262 team does not do this full time, many of them are physicians, they have to go to their clinic,
 263 they have to go to their patients ..." (SALT 10)
- 264 *"It is as I told you, as the individual didn't engage, it might not be timely reviewed and* 265 *things might not go by the pace you thought, and there were competing priorities. Due to*
- 266 *these reasons, it was late for a certain time.*" (SALT 04)

Furthermore, limited data availability and poor quality of the available baseline data was a barrier to progress. Basic information on essential service packages and the number of practitioners in the country were not readily accessible.

- 270 *"It is difficult to get quality data in our country. We don't even know the burden of surgical*
- 271 *disease; it is not easy to know the number of practitioners in each field. If you want to*
- know how many anaesthetists are actively practising in Ethiopia, you wouldn't find the
- 273 number. So, it is difficult to find such type of background data...it is difficult to find quality
- 274 *data. Thus, if you are thinking to develop the plan based on that data, it will be difficult.*"
- 275 *(ID 05)*

Lack of reporting from the devolved regional health administrations, reflecting both a lack of awareness and involvement, was one of the reasons identified for limited data sources. The variable understanding, commitment and willingness of regional health bureaus to invest in and lead the implementation of the plan was perceived to be an important barrier.

280

281 Implementation Challenges and facilitators (current and foreseen)

Although respondents had some criticisms of the MoH leadership team during the development of the plan, the leadership at all levels and ownership of the program by the government (MoH) was seen as vital for actually getting the plan implemented.

285 "... At its inception, it was Dr Kesete's (the minister at the time) idea, not anyone else's. If
286 we give credit, it should be for him. He identified the funding and he had the idea that the
287 focus area should be on surgery and the country should focus on that. He was consulting

others about this idea... We have repeatedly discussed how we should design the project.
Then his project was written by engaging others in the ministry and surgeons outside the
ministry, then when a partnership was started with GE Foundation, Jhpiego was involved
and then Harvard was engaged, it meant that these all were actively engaged." (ID 12)

Another important facilitator was bringing together professionals from relevant professional associations. The involvement of a multidisciplinary implementation team of surgeons from the Ethiopian Surgical Society, partner NGOs and other professionals (especially anaesthetists) was seen as a strength.

Respondents also mentioned monitoring and evaluation, presentation of findings to higher officials
and stakeholders, follow up, accountability, decentralization of the work to regional health offices,
better resources and infrastructure and detailed planning as important implementation facilitators.

Nonetheless, the success of implementation was greatly affected by limitations in financial resources and surgical supplies. Problems with the systems for purchasing and maintenance of equipment and supplies, as well as low quality of the procured materials, held back implementation.

303 "Supply issues, the sustainability of consumable supplies, anaesthesia and other surgical 304 equipment's whether it is consumable or non-consumable, when we think of the sustained 305 availability of these supplies, not only in our country but also worldwide, some of the 306 supplies are not accessible, they are not affordable as well." (ID 11)

Respondents said that the cost estimation exercise was not sufficiently thorough or accurate which
had consequences for the execution of the plan. In addition, different implementation activities

309	were funded by different donors but the fund was only available for a few selected hospitals,
310	making the broader execution of the plan nationwide unfeasible.
311	As with the development process, changes in the MoH leadership, the lack of a dedicated lead
312	person, limited resources and high turnover rates of professionals at the implementation sites
313	undermined implementation efforts.
314	"What challenged the programme was the leadership change at the Ministry of Health. A
315	project which used to be seen greatly, a project which reports used to be requested weekly
316	by the ministry, which was a regular meeting agenda, a project raised by the minister
317	whenever he travels abroad, it all went down to a cliff as soon as a new minister is
318	appointed," (ID 12)
319	
320	In addition, the prominent involvement of NGOs at the implementation stage made the health
321	professionals consider SaLTS as additional work as opposed to part of the routine work.
322	" the idea of "donor's job" is usually "NGO's job" and that will be a barrier. Thus, as
323	much as possible we need to take that out of our minds. We need to convince them as this
324	is the ministry's job and as it is part of our routine work. Otherwise, it is going to be a
325	barrier. When you are going to do some tasks, if it is NGO's job, people have a different
326	attitude towards that and they might ask for additional payment. So, such kinds of things
327	might happen more than you realize. Because, they may say like, "this is NGO's job and it
328	is not clear to understand" such type of feelings might be a barrier." (ID 05)

Respondents mentioned that the political instability in the country that began just before implementation started was also a huge challenge.

"... right at our entry point, the country went into chaos. Those people that we trained on
SaLTS, they back out, that means they have resigned in regions that means, things that
were there, all people and those who took the orientation and training, those who took the
skill, the people who took it, overall, given the situation that was there in the country, the
economy inflation and the situation in the country, they resigned, so, when you go and ask
them what SaLTS is they talk to you about the salt we put in foods, not this Safe lives
through safe surgery." (ID 02)

The lack of a data management system, ongoing stakeholder engagement and government accountability were also raised as challenges to implementation. A few participants stated that the programme did not consider how surgery fits with other priority programs or the affordability for the community.

342

343 Lessons learned in developing and implementing an NSOAP

There were several recommendations by respondents for other countries that intend to develop and implement national surgical plans. Framing safe surgery as a public health problem and ensuring committed leadership at all levels were the key points mentioned by respondents. It was said that professionals in the sector should stay motivated and give national planning and implementation high priority. To maintain motivation, the MoH or other stakeholders that own the process in the country should decentralize the work to the grassroots level and encourage leadership at all levels.

350 "The first thing is to make either the political leaders or technical leaders own the 351 program. It is important to make them take that as their own job. If we can do this, the 352 leadership at each level will have a responsibility and accountability...and they will 353 allocate resources for the program and they will also evaluate whether the resource is 354 being used properly or not. Therefore, it is important to do this starting from the federal 355 level to the woreda level." (ID 06)

Transparency in setting the national goals and commitment by the governing body would allow the stakeholders at different levels to have similar understandings and strengthen their commitment.

359 "The major thing is to have a clear plan. There has to be a clear plan, the plan should 360 clearly state the implementation process and responsibilities. And there needs to be 361 monitoring and evaluation to follow evaluate the performance of the implementation. But 362 there need to be standards to be followed while doing this." (ID 11)

Another important recommendation was the need for a community baseline assessment to develop a contextualized plan. Such an assessment should include situation analyses of resources and financial impacts of surgical conditions to make the case for the return on investment for making surgical care available.

"It is good to conduct a situational analysis in the whole country. It is important to know
how many hospitals are available, the level of those hospitals, how many health centres
there are, after that it is also necessary to assess the availability of the human resource.
They need to think about the availability of human resources that can implement the
program." (ID 06)

Furthermore, it was recommended that the planning process should be done step by step, ensuring that all required tasks are completed promptly. This will allow partners to take part in steps that require their input. This will additionally allow the process to be comprehensive, for instance, considering all types of surgery, and other tasks needed when planning. Finally having checklists and standards for monitoring and evaluation of the plan and setting ethical standards were highlighted as key points to consider when drafting such a plan.

Changes that the respondents suggested in the planning and design process included engagement of stakeholders at all levels (mainly regional bureau staff) from the beginning to the end. This engagement should be done in the form of teamwork, where both leaders and team members are equally informed and committed. The rationale for this approach was that it would maintain commitment despite a change in the leadership. One respondent suggested that the development of an activity-based strategic plan before a national surgical plan would have given better direction to implementation activities.

385 "The first thing is the leadership commitment has main role. We have to make commitment
386 at Ministry of Health and regional level by all aspects and engage professional societies
387 since they are the one which implement it. So, their engagement have main role ." (ID 04)

388 It was suggested that the pillars of SaLTS should be refined using local experience; for example, 389 to add one pillar on social mobilization and to prioritize fewer pillars to give more focus on details. 390 Developing the plan at the country's regional level and consolidating centrally at a later stage was 391 also recommended as an alternative approach to top-down planning and implementation. Regional 392 planning would need to be supported by adequate budget, facilitation and human resources.

393 "I believe that it is also necessary to work on social mobilization and it might be necessary
394 to add one pillar which can address the social mobilization part. Because it is important
395 to take SALT program from the health professionals and ministry of health and give the
396 ownership to the community." (ID 06)

397 Discussion

398 This paper explored the processes, facilitators and barriers of development and implementation of399 an NSOAP in Ethiopia.

400 The NSOAP was the first of its kind to be developed and implemented in Ethiopia. A major 401 opportunity that supported the development and implementation process was the recognition given 402 to safe surgery and anaesthesia globally, which gave impetus to national recognition of this 403 neglected area of healthcare. The involvement of Ethiopian global surgery experts in the global 404 surgical movement is likely to have facilitated this translation from global to national relevance. 405 There are increasing calls for global health initiatives to be led from the global south [10]. Strong 406 LMIC leadership is likely to increase buy-in by national governments while ensuring contextual 407 relevance and alignment with priorities.

Key identified challenges resulted from the lack of consistent leadership at the highest level, full commitment from stakeholders and the availability of limited resources. The high-level political commitment by the Ministry of Health was the first key step in the development of the NSOAP. Strong ownership by the government and the involvement of expert working groups that included key individuals and organizations involved in surgery and anaesthesia was the next important step in the development of the plan. The Ethiopian Ministry of Health has a strong track record of exercising country ownership of health development [11]. Thus, MoH tends to coordinate

415 resources from partners and donors so that they are directed towards the priorities of the country 416 and avoid fragmentation from vertical planning or undue influence of external agendas. Closely 417 related to the question of political commitment is the imperative of ensuring strong and continuous 418 leadership which, our findings indicate was one of the main challenges in both the development 419 and the implementation of this national plan. Inconsistent or inadequate leadership has been 420 identified as a barrier to implementation of national plans for non-surgical initiatives in other 421 LMICs as well [12]. Even though there was a strong initial engagement of stakeholders in 422 developing the NSOAP, there was a lack of sustained engagement in the implementation of the 423 plan. Systematically identifying and involving relevant stakeholders in developing such a plan and 424 continued engagement of all stakeholders at implementation is necessary [13].

425 A major implementation challenge for the Ethiopia national surgical plan was the inadequacy of 426 available funding. Limited financial resources are a key challenge in implementing health plans in 427 other countries [14, 15]. Not having a budget allocation plan for such a country-wide programme 428 undermines implementation efforts, even when significant financial support is available from 429 partners. Lessons learned from the description of developing and planning to implement the 430 national surgical plan in Tanzania showed that the funding available was sufficient but required 431 dedicated staff to properly manage the programme and allocate funds for the planned activities 432 [16]. This lack of dedicated staff was similarly pointed out as a challenge in our study. Findings 433 from early implementation of the Ethiopia NSOAP had shown that attracting additional financial 434 resources was a challenge [5]. The importance of ensuring sustainable funding for such programs 435 is also backed by the literature [17]. A vital strategy to guaranteeing a budget line for NSOAP 436 implementation is integration of an NSOAP into a country's national health strategy and 437 involvement of the Ministry of Finance from the earliest stages of NSOAP development [4, 18].

Identifying and utilization of domestic funding to be supplemented with funding from international partners is also important [4, 18-20]. Studies show that essential surgical procedures are among the most cost-effective of all health interventions and that investment in surgical services in LMICs is affordable [2, 21]. Without scale-up of surgical care, surgical conditions are estimated to result in losses of up to 2.5% potential annual GDP in LMICs by 2030 [22], making the investment in surgical care compelling from an economic point of view alone.

444 The designing of the Ethiopian NSOAP could have been more effective if it was based on more 445 detailed and better-quality data, as well as more diverse data sources. A baseline situational 446 assessment could also add value to the quality of the plan and inform implementation indicators 447 and targets [4, 7]. Data points for constructing these indicators and the situation should be 448 established from regular collection and reporting of standard metrics [23]. A strong monitoring 449 and evaluation plan is essential for successful NSOAP implementation [24]. Poor and limited data 450 along with inadequate data management infrastructure and capacity were highlighted by our 451 respondents. This was also mentioned in the literature as a key barrier to effective monitoring and 452 evaluation [25, 26].

A limitation of this study is that the only source of our findings were individuals who participated in the planning, designing and piloting of the surgical plan from the ministry of health and NGOs. Individuals working at the regional level and health facilities did not participate in the study and so we may have missed important insights on the implementation of SaLTs. Furthermore, the voices of patients and advocacy groups were not included. It is important for future researchers to ensure that the experiences and priorities of more diverse stakeholders are explored.

In conclusion, country-led planning and the involvement of motivated professionals has been critical for strengthening the surgical and anaesthesia systems and improving surgical care in Ethiopia. Lessons learned from the experience of developing and implementing a surgical plan in Ethiopia can improve ongoing implementation, while also providing important insights to guide other countries to achieve realistic and effective surgical system change.

464

465 Acknowledgments

466 The research underpinning the findings presented in this paper was funded by the National

467 Institute for Health and Care Research (NIHR) Global Health Research Unit on Health System

468 Strengthening in Sub-Saharan Africa (ASSET), King's College London (GHRU 16/136/54)

469 using UK aid from the UK Government. Charlotte Hanlon (CH) receives support through an

470 NIHR RIGHT grant (NIHR200842) and an NIHR global health research group on homelessness

471 and mental health in Africa (HOPE; NIHR134325). The views expressed in this publication are

472 those of the authors and not necessarily those of the NHS, the National Institute for Health and

473 Care Research or the Department of Health and Social Care, England. CH is also funded by the

474 Wellcome Trust through grants 222154/Z20/Z (SCOPE) and 223615/Z/21/Z (PROMISE).

475 For the purposes of open access, the author has applied a Creative Commons Attribution (CC

476 BY) licence to any Accepted Author Manuscript version arising from this submission.

477

478 Conflicts of interest: none

479 References

480 1. Price R, Makasa E, Hollands M. World Health Assembly Resolution WHA68.

481 15:"strengthening emergency and essential surgical care and anesthesia as a component of

482 universal health coverage"—addressing the public health gaps arising from lack of safe,

483 affordable and accessible surgical and anesthetic services. World journal of surgery.

484 2015;39(9):2115-25.

485 2. Meara JG, Leather AJ, Hagander L, Alkire BC, Alonso N, Ameh EA, et al. Global Surgery

486 2030: evidence and solutions for achieving health, welfare, and economic development. The

487 Lancet. 2015;386(9993):569-624. doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1101/2021.01.06.20248468</u>

488 3. FMOH. Federal Ministry of Health of Ethiopia National Safe Surgery Strategic PLAN,

489 Saving Lives Through Safe Surgery (SaLTS) Strategic Plan 2016–2020. Addis Ababa: Federal

490 Ministry of Health of Ethiopia, 2017.

491 4. Peters AW, Roa L, Rwamasirabo E, Ameh E, Ulisubisya MM, Samad L, et al. National

492 Surgical, Obstetric, and Anesthesia Plans Supporting the Vision of Universal Health Coverage.

493 Global Health: Science and Practice. 2020;8(1):1-9.

494 5. Burssa D, Teshome A, Iverson K, Ahearn O, Ashengo T, Barash D, et al. Safe surgery for

495 all: early lessons from implementing a national government-driven surgical plan in Ethiopia.

496 World journal of surgery. 2017;41(12):3038-45.

497 6. Sonderman KA, Citron I, Meara JG. National surgical, obstetric, and anesthesia planning
498 in the context of global surgery: the way forward. Jama Surgery. 2018;153(10):959-60.

499 7. Albutt K, Sonderman K, Citron I, Nthele M, Bekele A, Makasa E, et al. Healthcare Leaders

500 Develop Strategies for Expanding National Surgical, Obstetric, and Anaesthesia Plans in WHO

501 AFRO and EMRO Regions. World J Surg. 2019;43(2):360-7. Epub 2018/10/10. doi:

502 10.1007/s00268-018-4819-z. PubMed PMID: 30298283.

- 503 8. Truché P, Shoman H, Reddy CL, Jumbam DT, Ashby J, Mazhiqi A, et al. Globalization of
- 504 national surgical, obstetric and anesthesia plans: the critical link between health policy and
- 505 action in global surgery. Globalization and Health. 2020;16(1):1-8.
- 506 9. Seward N, Hanlon C, Abdulahi A, Abrams Z, Alem A, Araya R, et al. HeAlth System
- 507 StrEngThening in four sub_Saharan African countries (ASSET) to achieve high-quality, evidence-
- 508 informed surgical, maternal and newborn, and primary care: protocol for pre-implementation
- 509 phase studies. medRxiv. 2021.
- 510 10. Dalglish SL. COVID-19 gives the lie to global health expertise. Lancet (London, England).
- 511 2020;395(10231):1189. Epub 2020/03/31. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(20)30739-x. PubMed
- 512 PMID: 32222159; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC7194526.
- 513 11. Teshome SB, Hoebink P. Aid, ownership, and coordination in the health sector in
- 514 Ethiopia. Development Studies Research. 2018;5(sup1):S40-S55. doi:
- 515 10.1080/21665095.2018.1543549.
- 516 12. Khan F, Owolabi MO, Amatya B, Hamzat TK, Ogunniyi A, Oshinowo H, et al. Challenges
- 517 and barriers for implementation of the World Health Organization Global Disability Action Plan
- 518 in low- and middle- income countries. Journal of rehabilitation medicine. 2018;50(4):367-76.
- 519 Epub 2017/10/06. doi: 10.2340/16501977-2276. PubMed PMID: 28980008.
- 520 13. Mukhopadhyay S, Lin Y, Mwaba P, Kachimba J, Makasa E, Lishimpi K, et al. Implementing
- 521 World Health Assembly Resolution 68.15: National surgical, obstetric, and anesthesia strategic

522 plan development--the Zambian experience. Bulletin of the American College of Surgeons.

523 2017;102(6):28-35. Epub 2017/09/09. PubMed PMID: 28885807.

524 14. Todd G, Mamdani M. Tanzania and the sustainable development goals: has Tanzania

525 prepared to roll-out and domesticate the health SDGs. Ifakara health Institute. 2017.

526 15. Michelo C, Jacobs CN, Munakampe MN, Silumbwe A. Assessing Zambia's Preparedness

527 to implement sustainable development goals on Health. Zambia: African Center for Global

528 Health and Social Transformation. 2017.

529 16. Citron I, Jumbam D, Dahm J, Mukhopadhyay S, Nyberger K, Iverson K, et al. Towards

530 equitable surgical systems: development and outcomes of a national surgical, obstetric and

anaesthesia plan in Tanzania. BMJ global health. 2019;4(2):e001282. Epub 2019/05/30. doi:

532 10.1136/bmjgh-2018-001282. PubMed PMID: 31139445; PubMed Central PMCID:

533 PMCPMC6509614.

534 17. Mghamba JM, Talisuna AO, Suryantoro L, Saguti GE, Muita M, Bakari M, et al.

535 Developing a multisectoral National Action Plan for Health Security (NAPHS) to implement the

536 International Health Regulations (IHR 2005) in Tanzania. BMJ global health. 2018;3(2):e000600.

537 Epub 2018/04/03. doi: 10.1136/bmjgh-2017-000600. PubMed PMID: 29607098; PubMed

538 Central PMCID: PMCPMC5873533.

Albutt K, Citron I, Sonderman K, Nthele M, Bekele A, Maongezi S, et al. National Surgical
Obstetric and Anaesthesia Planning: Process and Consensus Recommendations. Dubai, United
Arab Emirates: 2018.

542 19. Lumumba-Kasongo T, Newman J. 2015 Addis Ababa Action Agenda of the Third

543 International Conference on Financing for Development "Concerning gender inequality, which

- 544 is the most important component of social inequality in African states, the international
- institutions are the most conservative par excellence.". Wagadu. 2015;13.
- 546 20. Yamey G, Shretta R, Binka FN. The 2030 sustainable development goal for health. British
- 547 Medical Journal Publishing Group; 2014.
- 548 21. Mock CN, Donkor P, Gawande A, Jamison DT, Kruk ME, Debas HT. Essential surgery: key
- 549 messages from Disease Control Priorities, 3rd edition. Lancet (London, England).
- 550 2015;385(9983):2209-19. Epub 2015/02/11. doi: 10.1016/s0140-6736(15)60091-5. PubMed
- 551 PMID: 25662414; PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC7004823.
- 552 22. Alkire BC, Shrime MG, Dare AJ, Vincent JR, Meara JG. Global economic consequences of
- selected surgical diseases: a modelling study. The Lancet Global health. 2015;3 Suppl 2(Suppl
- 554 2):S21-7. Epub 2015/05/01. doi: 10.1016/s2214-109x(15)70088-4. PubMed PMID: 25926317;
- 555 PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC4884437.
- 556 23. Davies JI, Gelb AW, Gore-Booth J, Martin J, Mellin-Olsen J, Åkerman C, et al. Global
- 557 surgery, obstetric, and anaesthesia indicator definitions and reporting: An Utstein consensus

558 report. PLoS medicine. 2021;18(8):e1003749. Epub 2021/08/21. doi:

- 559 10.1371/journal.pmed.1003749. PubMed PMID: 34415914; PubMed Central PMCID:
- 560 PMCPMC8415575 following competing interests: Tore Laerdal is Executive Director of the
- 561 Laerdal Foundation, which provided financial support for the meeting. Tore provided practical
- 562 support for the meeting and read and approved the manuscript, but did not input into the
- 563 consensus process or conclusions.
- 564 24. Sonderman KA, Citron I, Mukhopadhyay S, Albutt K, Taylor K, Jumbam D, et al.
- 565 Framework for developing a national surgical, obstetric and anaesthesia plan. BJS open.

- 566 2019;3(5):722-32. Epub 2019/10/09. doi: 10.1002/bjs5.50190. PubMed PMID: 31592517;
- 567 PubMed Central PMCID: PMCPMC6773655.
- 568 25. Najafizada SAM. Policy research institutions and the health SDGs: building momentum
- in South Asia-country report, Afghanistan. 2017.
- 570 26. NPHF. Policy Research Institutions and the Health SDGs: Building Momentum in Nepal -
- 571 Country Report. Kathmandu, Nepal: Nepal Public Health Foundation (NPHF), 2017.



Figure